

FIRST EDITION *June 1909*
Reprinted *December 1911*

WISDOM OF THE EAST

THE SPLENDOUR OF GOD

BEING EXTRACTS FROM THE
SACRED WRITINGS OF THE BAHÁ'IS

WITH INTRODUCTION BY ERIC HAMMOND



LONDON
JOHN MURRAY, ALBEMARLE STREET W
1911

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

CONTENTS

A GLIMPSE THROUGH THE GATE	PAGE 9
THE BAB THE FORETELLER	18
BAHA'U'LLAH THE ONE FORETOLD	25
ABBAS EFFENDI 'THE SERVANT OF GOD '	41
THE SEVEN VALLEYS	52
TEXTS FROM THE TABLETS	85
HIDDEN WORDS	91

THE BENEDICTION OF ABBAS EFFENDI THE PROPHET OF
THE BAHAI RELIGION TO THE AUTHOR OF THIS BOOK

"O God, bring this Servant of thine near to the Divine Threshold give him life through the breath of the Holy Spirit. Open his eyes loosen his tongue and cause him to walk in the path of the Kingdom. Confirm him in Thy service. Grant him eloquent speech and a fluent pen. Make him beloved in both worlds. If Thou wilt grant him such bounties he will be acceptable to the people of knowledge and will become world-renowned. Thou art the Powerful the Mighty "

EDITORIAL NOTE

THE object of the Editors of this series is a very definite one. They desire above all things that, in their humble way, these books shall be the ambassadors of good-will and understanding between East and West—the old world of Thought and the new of Action. In this endeavour, and in their own sphere, they are but followers of the highest example in the land. They are confident that a deeper knowledge of the great ideals and lofty philosophy of Oriental thought may help to a revival of that true spirit of Charity which neither despises nor fears the nation of another creed and colour

L. CRANMER-BYNG
S. A. KAPADIA.

NORTHBROOK SOCIETY,
21, CROMWELL ROAD,
KENSINGTON, S W.

THE SPLENDOUR OF GOD

A GLIMPSE THROUGH THE GATE

IN the Beginning was the Word and the Word was God

To trace the Word back to the beginning of things if that were possible would be to lead back also to the heart of things to the soul of religion the light that has illumined all human efforts towards the construction of some external evidence some symbolic representation of the spiritual potentiality in mankind

It is alleged that creeds tend inevitably to ossification, that the vitality of religions is apt to lose itself in their development that the embroideries of ritual serve, finally only to obscure the light which they profess to adorn and magnify

Nothing throughout history, has been more painfully demonstrated than the barriers to brotherhood built up by the rivalry of religions a rivalry often more fully emphasised than softened by missionary zeal

Yet the Source of Spirituality must be one, even as God is one, and the differing languages and systems by means of which spirituality strives to assert itself, although they go far in the direction of perpetuating division between races and men, have, after all, a common origin lying dim and only partially realisable in the shadow of the bygone

Bahais claim not only the acknowledgment of the spiritual relationship of all men, but its practical endorsement. Visitors to Abbas Effendi, at his home in Acca, are of many tongues and many nations. He has ardent adherents in America, England, France, and Germany, besides thousands of disciples Eastern in education and in temperament. Men of opposing peoples and professions eat at his table together, and the Master himself waits upon his guests in sacred service.

This much has certainly been brought about

Bahais claim, too, the adhesion of at least a third of the Persian people. They assure us also that the Light, from Acca, has expelled the darkness of division from minds schooled in distrust, if not in hatred, of other minds. More, they claim that Baháism has, and holds aloft in the light of men, the Light of Love, a light that cannot fail to rend asunder the veil of separation, and enable man to see and love man, notwithstanding any divergence of nation or origin, of colour, caste, or creed.

The shining of this light of love shows man to man as he is for its rays penetrate the concealing folds of ignorance and suspicion consequent to ignorance

Wherever Bahais meet they meet on common ground. Throwing aside all the accumulated antagonisms of the past they rejoice unreservedly in the glad communion of the present of the day of their Lord

If Acca or Rangoon Paris London or New York be their centre of resort no question of theological theories is permitted to strike a discordant note Brotherhood among them is not merely a 'may be' it is a visible actual fact Buddhist and Mohammedan Hindu and Zoroastrian Jew and Christian sit at one board in amity eat of one dish and offer united thanksgiving to one Giver This most remarkable perception and practice of unity is the result of the light of The glory of the glory of God

Illumined by this light men are no longer blinded by fear of one another fear is utterly cast out by this light of love Fear of violence of overreaching of any evil-doing fear,—is transformed into fraternity

The Light 'that lighteth every man that cometh into this world' finds its opportunity open This is the light towards which Bahaism bids all men turn Luminosity creates love Before it darkness and shadows flee away, and

12 A GLIMPSE THROUGH THE GATE

doubt, born of darkness, dies. It is the design of Baháism that men shall not look for evil in one another, but for good. The utterance of Asoka, in his memorable charge to missionaries, is re-uttered by Baháism to-day —“Remember that everywhere you will find some sort of faith and righteousness. See that you foster this, and do not destroy”, and the new utterance is accentuated by inalienable faith in the efficiency of the Light.

In a Talk given by the Master, Abbas Effendi, in Acca, he said

“Our spiritual perception, our inward sight must be opened, so that we see the signs and traces of God’s Spirit in everything. Everything can speak to us of God, everything can reflect to us the Light of the Spirit. When we look at people, we must look at them for the spirit that is in them. we must see them in their relation to God,—that they are His creatures and belonging to Him. We must not look at the faults and imperfections of people, but at the spirit within which causes them to live. Therefore when we look at a man, and love and praise him, the praise is for the signs of God upon him. We must always strive to have a heart clear and pure, so that the Light of the Spirit may be reflected from it in all its fulness.”

Differences and distinctions created by creeds are obliterated by the light which shines glowing and undisturbed from the one source of all religious impulse and all religious life. Bahaism affirms that all the great prophets and seers inspirers of great religious movements were manifestations of the One Divine Light the One Holy Spirit of God and that the inspiration is essentially one notwithstanding divergences induced by racial or climatic or sacerdotal influence.

The Master Abbas Effendi has declared

'O People! the Doors of the Kingdom are opened the Sun of Truth is shining upon the world the Greatest and Most Glorious Light is now manifest to illumine the hearts of men. The Light of Knowledge hath appeared before which the darkness of every superstitious fancy will be annihilated.'

Invited to enquire into the motif and the bearing of the Bahais we are immediately notified that the secret the impulse the performance of the underlying principle of unity is indubitably with them. We find in them a consistency a harmony commanding reverential consideration. Their attitude towards men of all lands and all languages their philosophic and practical acceptance of the oneness of real religion compel our studious recognition.

This pronouncement of Baha'u'llah is as lucid as it is steadfast :

“ O ye discerning ones of the people !
Verily the words which have descended from
the Heaven of the Will of God are the source
of Unity and Harmony for the world Close
your eyes to racial differences Welcome all
with the light of oneness Be the cause of
the comfort and the advancement of human-
ity This handful of dust, the world, is one
home, let it be in unity. Forsake pride
it is a cause of discord. Follow that which
leads to harmony.”

The spiritual unification of the race is the great aim of Bahaism. It does not propose the wholesale disintegration of creeds and cults, but, looking through these, discerns the shining of the light, behind, beyond It recognises the truth in each religious phase, but decries any attempt of any phase to pose as sole interpretation of the truth.

It regards the Kingdom of God as universal rather than particular in the range of its realm Each prophet, each seer, had his message to deliver, and the burden of that message, rightly interpreted, was “ The Lord our God is one God ”, not “ The Lord our God is for one people.”

“ These supreme, holy souls ” (the prophets or manifestations) “ are God-like in their

attributes. The garments in which they appear are different but the attributes are the same. In their real and intrinsic power they show forth the Perfection of God. The reality of God in them never varies only the garment in which the Primal Reality is clothed is different according to the time and place of their appearance and declaration to the world. One day it is the garment of Abraham then Moses then Jesus then Baha u'llah. Knowledge of this oneness is true enlightenment. Some see the garment only and worship the Personality, some see the reality and worship in spirit and in truth. Some of the Hebrews admired the embroidered beauty of the garment of Abraham, but were blind to the Real Light which shone upon the darkness of the world through him. Moses was denied. Jesus was denied crucified. All have been denied and persecuted for this reason. Men see the garment and are blind to the reality. worship the Personality and do not know the Truth the Light itself. Some worship the Tree of Life but do not eat of the blessed Fruit of the Tree. Therefore differences and disagreements arise in religious belief. If all men ate of the Fruit itself they could never disagree. Terms are of no importance. The Fruits of the Tree should be our desire.

16 A GLIMPSE THROUGH THE GATE

These are the spiritual 'grapes.' Find the Light itself, and there will be no difference of opinion or belief as to the Personality or Degree of the Manifestations of God "

To Jesus the Christ this question was put by His disciples "Tell us, What is the Sign of Thy Presence ? " Our Lord replied, "As the lightning doth come forth from the East and doth appear unto the West, so shall be also the Presence of the Son of Man " The manifestation that instructs Baháism to-day says

"The greatest proof of a manifestation is the Manifestation Himself

We do not have to prove the existence of the sun The sun is independent of proof He who has sight can see the sun and prove it for himself . . . The sun's light is indispensable

God with all his qualities is independent of all His creatures Look at the Christ He was a youth of Israel, not a great and honoured man, but from a poor family He was so poor that He was born in a manger , yet He changed the conditions of the whole world What proof could be greater than this that He was from God ?

Without this Light the world could not grow spiritually

THE PREVALENCE OF THE LIGHT 17

The Blessed Perfection (Baha u llah) came from Persia which is not a prominent nation.

The great Prophets did not enter school to be taught of men , yet so many things did they manifest that at last we must admit that the world is not able to destroy the wisdom of the Prophets or grow without them How the Truth in Christ spread all over the world ! The Light of God will shine must shine The Blessed Perfection during His own lifetime, had one thousand followers who believed in Him Only one proved ungrateful yet he did not deny Baha u llah Many were martyred with His Name upon their lips ”

Here in small compass lies the assumption and the promise of Bahalism the aspiration of Abbas Effendi of Acca and the sure and certain hope of all those who serve under his standard to-day

THE BAB : THE FORETELLER

THREE phases of Baháism have to be considered

First, that of *The Bab*, then that of *Bahá'u'llah*, lastly that of *Abdul Baha*, usually designated *Abbas Effendi*, the recognised head and heart of Baháism as it is known to-day

The Bab The Foreteller

(arose in Shiraz, May 1844 Executed in Tabriz, July 1850)

Sixty-four years have passed since he whom many believers rejoiced in hailing "The Bab," "The Door," began, in Persia, his singular and successful career

As One said, ages ago, "I am The Way," so Mirza Ali Mohammed said, "I am The Door"

That One also declared that He came "not to destroy, but to fulfil" So came Mirza Ali Mohammed, not attempting in any degree to uproot the teachings and doctrines of the creator of the Koran, but to urge a complete whole-hearted performance of the Prophet's commandments

'The Bab —for as such he was acknowledged and will be reverently remembered—believed emphatically this that in the past whenever there was need God raised up a Prophet on the earth bearing a book containing a Divine Revelation and He will do the same in the future whenever there is need

He believed every whit as emphatically that he in his own person was inspired by God as the Prophet for his time That belief that inspiration compelled him to put implicit confidence in the continuity of God's dealings with mankind a continuity which always at requisite intervals proclaims the Divine Message through prophetic lips That Message should practically be one and the same though the lips that proclaimed it might employ varying words and languages might even perchance direct seekers after God to pursue apparently antagonistic methods

The Book of The Bab was entitled The Bayan and taken generally it constituted a new rendering of much that the Prophet of Islam had written spoken and enforced

Steadfast as his belief in himself was he believed also as steadfastly that while he held open the Door of the Courtyard of God another, greater than he should come after him He realised, he foretold the arrival of a later Prophet whose mission must excel his own in the power of its purpose in its fuller acceptance in its far

wider claims upon the minds of men. For him, Persia was the centre of his action, its regeneration and reformation, his immediate and ultimate desire.

To his successor, the whole world lay open, to be subdued by the strength of the sweetness of the Love of God

His own gracious pleadings with his own people were not made in vain. Historic records of the rejection of prophecy by the powers that be were enlarged by another, bitter, chapter. The endeavour of Persian people to put into practice, at his instigation, a deeper, nobler conception of religion, was misinterpreted.

The priesthood fought for prestige and privilege, for this fearless lover of the light spoke straight to the hearts of his hearers without priestly intervention or clerical approval.

Where the priests were faulty in their duties or in their example, The Bab spoke of the love of God and bade men directly worship and obey Him.

Priestcraft, backed by governmental action, accused prophet and people of a design to attempt the overthrow of religion and order. Fear entered into the thought of those who, having and misusing the authority of the State, could not, or would not, comprehend these men who looked and longed for the authority of God.

These latter sought an entrance into heaven,

the former suspected them of endeavouring to set up their own will in defiance of the Shah and of Islam

Discourtesy was followed by abuse abuse by persecution persecution by spoliation and execution

After enduring the confinement of a prison The Bab was shot to death publicly in Tabriz

During two years The Bab had wrought and taught The theme of his teaching was always fitness for God. Purity of life righteousness of conduct perfect honesty and honour formed variations of that theme It was one which commending itself to those who truly sought to serve and reign with the Creator caused the pharisaical and the proud to blaspheme against the speaker

Clerical and constituted authority opposed him vehemently He was accused—no difficult task in such a country and under such circumstances Next came imprisonment lasting four years Throughout this period, notwithstanding anxiety for his many friends—impelled partly perhaps by that anxiety certainly impelled by the inspiration to work for the people while life lasted,—he wrote a large number of epistles and exhortations

His care for his flock concerned their daily doings as well as their eternal welfare He was literally their Father in God taking into account all their environment and all their diffi

culties and directing them so to live in this world as to prepare themselves fully for the endless life to come

Some of the epistles reached one country and some another, and while their author was in prison for conscience' sake, his words made their way far and wide. Readers of most lands had, even then, known something of the work of this earnest and devoted reformer.

His institution of a "group" did much to strengthen and enlarge his influence. It comprised eighteen of his earliest disciples. He described them—including himself as "The Point"—"The Nineteen Letters of the Living." These chosen persons were carefully instructed how to instruct others, and how to control and advance the reform of soul and of conduct which The Bab endeavoured to induce among his beloved Persians. He especially bade these eighteen to prepare the way for, and be always ready to receive, One who was about to appear, One whom God would "make manifest." The time of the coming of this Appointed One was given. That He should surely come, The Bab never doubted at all. When He came, He could not fail to be recognised as a "Great Teacher," who would "show signs of divine power and strength", more, "through His teachings the divine unity of mankind would be established."

Scarcely, perhaps, can too much stress be laid

on The Bab's insistence upon the coming of One who should open up and augment the way and the end of his pious design

The Bab's own personal message was so to speak, intended for the immediate requirements of his time. The Light that should enlighten not only Persians but the sons of men generally would inaugurate a new order of things regenerating all

Anticipating this Arrival The Bab endured wrote and taught until his accusers charged him with heresy

Confiscation of property was as might have been expected of the persecutors of that country and period, remarkable for its thoroughness. Poverty want sickness were patiently and uncomplainingly borne. After enduring the strain and confinement of a prison The Bab was shot to death publicly in Tabriz, in July 1850. His imprisonment and martyrdom of The Bab were followed up by a wholesale raid upon his followers. We are told that over twenty thousand of these willingly gave up their property families and lives rather than recant their faith.

The extraordinary personality and influence of The Bab cannot be gainsaid. His spirituality his contempt for worldly and material things his masterful grasp of religious and philosophical points his vast love for and understanding of the people and their deepest needs, all these substantiated his position and supported his claim

He had exhorted his pupils to "endure all" for the sake of God and their faith and his.

They obeyed. They went to prison rejoicing in the certain triumph of the truth that they adored, the truth that freed them from the fetters of the world. Torture could not wring expressions of regret from their parched but smiling lips.

Life, eternal life, fulness of joy in the perpetual presence of God, had been promised, and, in the conviction that that glorious certainty must be fulfilled in their own experience, they trampled fear of death under foot. Death had, for them, verily lost its sting. This not for a little time, but for year after year. Indeed it is noted that these persecutions continued down to the beginning of the new century.

In 1901 "there were one hundred and seventy martyrs at one time in the city of Yeza"¹

¹ "Their spirit of self-devotion and love is well exemplified in the manner in which Mirza Kurban Ali, one of seven executed together in Teheran in September 1850, met his death. When he was brought to the foot of the execution-pole, the headsman raised his sword and smote him from behind. The blow only wounded the old man's neck and cast his turban upon the ground. He raised his head and exclaimed 'Oh, happy that intoxicated lover who, at the foot of his Beloved, knoweth not whether it be his head or his turban which he casteth'"—PROFESSOR E. G. BROWNE, *A Traveller's Narrative*

BAHA'U'LLAH THE ONE FORETOLD

CHRISTIANS were first so called at Antioch

Bahaism received its earliest momentous impulse at Adrianople. Mention of "over twenty thousand" leads to the supposition that the followers of The Bab had attained to a notable number as well as finality of decision. His views had been disseminated throughout Persia and to an appreciable extent, beyond its boundaries.

Preachers of the new form of the old faith travelled far afield, undeterred by suspicion or surveillance and, in their journeying sowed the seeds of belief in many comforted hearts.

One or other of these preachers had been heard with avidity by a youth of high lineage—Mirza Hussein Ali—who drawn by the grace and perfection of the message became not only a willing adherent but a zealous and powerful advocate. All the energy he possessed—bodily mental spiritual—he threw into the service of God and of The Bab.

Persian by birth and breeding a native of Teheran he came there into this world in 1817 his father we learn being a Vizier his grandfather Grand Vizier. An aristocrat among aristocrats

he knew little or nothing of the education of Scribes or the philosophies of Pharisees. Born in the rank of those who ruled, he had neither opportunity to seek the learning of the schools nor desire to cope on equal terms with the Mullahs, with Mohammedan specialists. To pose as a priest-in-ordinary was out of his power. The lore of the sacerdotalist was outside the scope of his station. Unable to rely on knowledge acquired by man, he had, perforce, to trust implicitly to inspiration, and inspiration supported him to a marvel.

He was something short of thirty when he attached himself to the Babís and became their unfaltering teacher and leader.

Like Francis of Assisi, he chose poverty and vilification with the followers of the faith above the state and luxury of his peers in high places. Like Paul of Tarsus, he "preferred affliction with the people of God." Like Gautama the Buddha, he, quietly yet gloriously, shared in the Great Renunciation. Like the Hebrew Psalmist, he might have sung, "I had rather be a doorkeeper in the House of my God, than dwell in the tents of wickedness."

He speedily acquired a position of admiration and reverence. His kindly, straightforward character, his profound devotion to The Bab and his principles, were appreciated long before he declared himself to be The One whom, according to his predecessor, "God would make manifest."

The persecution and martyrdom of The Bab and the persistent maltreatment of the Babis resulted in an even closer clinging to the Prophet's revelations. This again seems strictly in accordance with the history of religion. "The blood of the martyrs is the seed of the Church."

It must be recorded that his message and his mission were alike peaceful.

No element of antagonism to rule or ruler found place in his scheme of things for that scheme being based on spirituality and working entirely on the spiritual plane had no space in it for the upsetting of recognised authority. It aimed at persuasion it condemned coercion.

The central design of Baha'ullah was peace, peace internal, external universal, and such peace he knew could not in any wise become an accomplished fact unless it were the flower of the soul resulting in the fruition of Divine Love.

We must note too in this connection, that The Bab had specifically prophesied the advent of One whose words and wisdom would substantiate his position as Godhead made manifest. His character would be akin to The Light of the World radiating penetrating informing spreading near and far the beams of a Sun of Righteousness.

As we have seen no seeds of discord were cast on the political field but in this drama of the incoming of a novel representation of eternal faith insinuation and denunciation had play and

place. No violent outcry against him he had any part in Baha'u'llah's pro We are forced to record the fact that could not, or would not, bear the a Light In agreement with history persecution followed—fierce, fanatic humanly cruel

Imprisonment, confiscation, and to impart firmer faith Within a Bab's unrighteous execution, a n people were confined, Baha'u'llah ,

Teheran, which bore him in a p'l noblest born in prison He was and his wealth appropriated F' , vast and remunerative (there were, fewer than five of these), were , authority " Finally he, with his exiled to Baghdad

Still he taught , still his influence in greater affection and devotion centre

Retreat into the wilderness , pas pray , retirement from men, in c Vision of God may be apprehen Prophet or Seer prophesied or seen ,

Baha'u'llah spent two years alo mountains hard by Baghdad, praying dwelling there with God

After this came the time of the pr His declaration of Himself as the the Foreteller's prophecy, the " N "

God was apparently at first made at a period of anxiety and distress to a few of the elect

The public proclamation did not occur for four or five years when being uttered it was forthwith accepted by the great majority of the Babis. The Bab's adherents as of divine origin Baha'u'llah was now the generally recognised chief of the movement. Disciples formerly calling themselves Babis¹ adopted the title Bahais.

The main motive of Baha'u'llah's mission was that of establishing peace and religious unity¹ in the world.

Baha'u'llah declared Himself in 1863. Having journeyed with them to Baghdad we must accompany him and his people farther still. Fear took hold upon the Mohammedan Mullahs. Unfeigned fear of the Prophet's predominance. Were all in the land living in love and peace and unity what might become of the priestly power and purse? The Mullahs sent to Constantinople for official interference and assistance and their petition was answered. The Bahais were summoned to the capital.

Banishment to Adrianople—so ran the unalterable decree. To Adrianople our persecuted religionists were bidden.

¹ "He called to men of every creed and race to come under the standard of Unity which he had upraised, and assist him in establishing the Kingdom of God and the Brotherhood of Man upon the earth."—S. SPRAGUE.

During his residence there, Baha'u'llah found time to address the Pope and the monarchs of Europe in epistles urging the establishment of unity, the abandonment of injustice, and the abolition of warlike practices. Adrianople was not permitted to contain him long. He and his friends were finally sentenced to exile at Acca (Acre) in Syria, actually a penal colony north of Mount Carmel,¹ a place dreaded for its pestilential atmosphere and its inaccessibility. The thought that fever might speedily attack and slay the Prophet bred a hopeful joy in his persecutors' minds. They arranged, with considerable cruelty, that "the faithful few" should exist as best they could in a couple of rooms in the barracks of the town. There were some seventy confined so for two years.

The indictment leading to this severity comprised many misdemeanours. These God-fearing, God-seeking souls were accused as murderers and thieves. They were branded as Nihilists.² Liberty, freedom of any sort, was forbidden them. Of a truth they "endured hardships, as good soldiers" of the Cause that was, for them, far

¹ "Here in the land of Zion and Carmel, where 'the coming' in this latter day has been told of all the prophets, Baha'u'llah lived and taught, many travelling from great distances to hear him, while others received teaching from his writings"—C M RÉMEY

² "The charge to the Governor stated that they were . . . Nihilists"—ETHEL J ROSENBERG

more captivating than bodily captivity they still rejoiced in the Light that led

Among the seven suffered Baha'u'llah's brother, to whom death brought release. Such was the insecurity of the roof of the place that while he sought purer air than that of the room below and greater quiet for reflection on the things of God" it gave way. He who prayed fell through the roof and so died. Despite the close confinement the absence of any comfort the unhealthiness of their condition the prisoners conducted themselves with unflinching courtesy and gentleness. They found grace in the eyes of the governor of their gaol who probably touched by the death of his brother gave Baha'u'llah leave to hire a house within the town. Even here he was obliged to live and move and have his being' in one apartment only and this for seven years. One governor left another came. Each before his term expired or for some end he was withdrawn learned that respect and reverence were due to these kindly uncomplaining folk. A most welcome extension of privileges came with later years and the Prophet at length found himself allowed to wander within a radius of eighteen miles.

So persecuted but not forsaken ' Baha'u'llah dwelt on sacred soil working on teaching on never dreaming of despair. Captivity lasting forty years had surely weakened if not destroyed

both hope and faith in an ordinary mind. Equally surely, the strengthening and growth of hope and faith with each year as it came and went, furnishes emphatic testimony to Baha'u'llah's claim that his spiritual support and sustenance were divine. He remained mentally vigorous until, in 1892, when seventy-five years old, he was called to the nearer Light.

It is at least an interesting coincidence, that from the very quarter of the East from which "A Great Light" shone twenty centuries ago, Baha'u'llah should have been compelled to dwell, "Baha'u'llah"—"The Glory of God"—and that thence his Light should have also shone, illuminating Jew and Gentile, Moslem and infidel. Here, at Acca, he who at Teheran was for his goodness and benevolence called "The Father of the Poor," possessed his soul in patience, in poverty and degradation; yet lived to dispense the Light. Imprisonment and ignominy failed to darken the rays that penetrated far beyond the walls of Acca. That obscure town, by sheltering the Prophet, became the Lantern of the Light.

By word and pen he had prepared men for the reception of illumination. He wrote "tablets" to friends and enquirers at home and abroad, abundantly explaining the why and the wherefore of his mission on earth.

He did not profess the creation of a new creed

or to plant the roots of a new religion. On the contrary he taught that all religions sprang from the Divine Root. He desired rather to revive the utterance of those divinely appointed ones on whose words and authority the religions of the world were based. This new utterance was indispensable to the welfare of the world for people had become careless and given over to laxity of thought and life. Every man was bidden to remain in alliance with that form of faith in which he found himself but to break through the encrustations that had hidden its power and beauty. The true spirit of the founder of the faith would then again become recognised and the believer was urged to follow and obey that spirit in sincerity. The truth had so Baha'u'llah taught been revealed by those Inspired Ones after whom the great religious bodies were named. These had appeared at different historic stages in diverse places during various eras in the progress of humanity but the essence of their message had been one and the same. Its expression only had differed in order to accommodate it to the requirements of time and place.

Baha'u'llah's gracious persistence in this inner truth, the life-giving element in every religion worthy of the name had a notably unifying effect upon those who heard and hearing saw. Their attitude towards one another when they were of differing outward belief underwent a holy trans-

formation Men of one creed grasped the hands of those of another creed Religious fraternity, experienced in the heart, became visibly manifest in the life The head followed where the heart led¹

Under the holy influence of Baha'u'llah, his followers rejoiced in putting the Brotherhood of the race into everyday practice In all circumstances, whether of kindness or cruelty, of courtesy or of disfavour, the Bahai employed the soft answer that turneth away wrath Through each chapter of the volume of life the theme of Baha'u'llah's message passes, leaving in its wake the power of his personality, the sweetness of his soul Swayed by his gospel, Bahais believe in and employ perfect amity towards all men; unswerving toleration towards the perceptions and principles of others than themselves

Manifold "tablets" and treatises of instruction fell from Baha'u'llah's pen One treatise, entitled *The Book of Laws*, contains text upon text of commandments invaluable not to Bahais alone but to "all the men of all the world" In it he orders the sword to be set aside for ever, to be

¹ "I found that this faith" (Bahaism) "does not expend itself in beautiful and unfruitful theories, but has a vital and effective power to mould life towards the very highest ideal of human character"—PROFESSOR G. GRANVILLE BROWNE, M.A.

"This spirit of love and service to fellow-men was exemplified in an Indian Bahai actually giving his life to save mine, and 'Greater love hath no man than this'"—SYDNEY SPRAGUE

replaced by the Word. He inculcates the settlement of national differences by arbitration. He enjoins the acquirement of One Universal Language to be taught to all children in all schools so that 'the whole world may become one home land'. Boys and girls are to be educated alike and the education must be the best possible participated in by the children of the poor as well as those of the wealthy. Progress is impossible while ignorance spreads its roots. So eager was he in this connection that he wrote

He who educates his own son or the son of another, it is as though he educated the Son of God. That work is prayer' he taught decisively. The highest act of prayer and worship consists in the acquirement of some profession or handicraft and using it thoroughly and conscientiously. By the advancement of art and science he set great store. Disapproving of celibacy he advocated marriage. Objecting to asceticism he advised his followers to mix freely with all people and on all occasions to exhibit signs of a glad and joyous but practically righteous life. Naturally therefore intemperance and gambling are forbidden together with the use of opium. Naturally also questions of hygienic and sanitary sort receive all possible attention and use.

Practical charity, practical goodwill and kindness to all and sundry including the lower animal world. Baha'u'llah insisted upon

History has a perhaps unwholesome habit of repeating itself Religions in the past were instituted, religious reformations realised, by devout men divinely inspired, who, certain of the source of their inspiration, refused worship themselves in any form More, they definitely, in remarkable instances, forbade such worship while they dwelt on earth or after their departure in body from the world Announcements to the effect that "I am of Paul" or "I am of Apollos" were interdicted Temple-building and altar-raising in adoring memory of prophets and preachers set in, usually, nevertheless Within measurable distance of the prophet's ascension, temples have arisen, worship made compulsory to adhesion

Baha'u'llah declared himself utterly opposed to priesthood He built no church "made with hands" Teachers of his Gospel of The Light may not take fees or stipends for their teaching The necessities of living must be earned by them, even as St Paul wrought at sail-making for food

This lofty impression of spiritual practice presents an ideal worthy of profound consideration, of cordial imitation That it passes beyond the ideal by having been, and being, the rule of life among the Bahais, is an accredited fact

That this Religion of The Light is the need of the world throughout, that his mission, and that of his successor, was to illumine the dark places

of the earth Baha'u'llah knew The world awaited him and he had come The Light enkindled must regenerate man In far-seeing faith he wrote

O Children of Baha! Associate with all the people of the world with men of all religions in concord and harmony in the spirit of perfect joy and fragrance

Remind them also of that which is for the benefit of all but beware lest ye make the Word of God the cause of opposition and stumbling or the source of hatred among you

If ye have a word or an essence among you which another has not say it to him with the tongue of love and kindness if it be accepted and impressed the end is attained if not leave him to himself and pray for him but do not molest him

The tongue of kindness is attractive to the heart and it is the sword of the spirit it furnishes the true relation of thought to utterance it is as the horizon for the arising of the sun of wisdom and knowledge

Creatures were created through love let them live in peace and amity'

The Light of Love is the living lamp of Baháism No man's religion may be ridiculed or opposed but all men must be urged to be that which his religion at its best and fullest—at the instant of

its initiation—bade him to be Baha'u'llah saw that "God is to every human being as great as the individual mental capacity permits one to see Him" Is there, then, any wonder that he prayed, "Open Thou their eyes that all men may see the Light?" Is there any wonder that his faith in the Light was supreme?

Its rays flashed from the torches upheld by the great Prophets of the great creeds Obscured by veiling accumulations, The Light still shines, and its shining must become visible when veiling curtains are drawn aside.

Distrust of fellow-men, intemperance of speech or action, love of wealth, above all, disunion—these are strenuously disapproved of by Baháism.

A tablet, revealed by The Blessed Perfection, as his disciples delight to call him, contains these texts

"In wealth, fear is concealed and peril is hidden

There is no continuance in the riches of this world, that which is subject to mortality and undergoeth a change, hath never been and is not worth regarding

As is well known, the purpose of this Oppressed One in enduring these adversities and calamities has been to quench the fire of hatred and animosity, so that, perchance, the horizons of the minds of the

people of this world may shine with the light of concord and attain the real tranquillity

O people of the world ! I enjoin ye to that which is the means of the elevation of your station Hold to the virtue of God and grasp the hem of that which is just

Verily, I say the tongue is for mentioning that which is good pollute it not with evil speech God hath forgiven ye that which is past hereafter ye must all speak that which is besitting

Avoid execration reviling and that which is aggravating to man

The station of man is high

The station of man is great if he holds to reality and truth and if he be firm and steadfast in the commands

The true man appeareth before the Merciful One like unto the heavens his sight and hearing are the sun and moon his bright and shining qualities are the stars his station is the highest one

O people of the world ! The Creed of God is for love and union make it not to be a cause of discord and disunion

He hath forbidden strife and dispute with an absolute prohibition in the Book (Kitba el Akdas)

This is the command of God in His greatest

manifestation, and He hath preserved it from any order of annulment and hath adorned it with the ornament of confirmation

Verily, He is the All-knowing and the All-wise

O My Branches ! In this Existent Being the greatest strength and the most perfect power is hidden and concealed

Look towards It and gaze in the direction of Its union, and not at Its seeming differences.

This is the Testament of God, that the Branches, Twigs, and Relations must each and every one look to the Greatest Branch ”

To disarm prejudice by pure piety , to bid men believe in the One Source of the religious idea rather than struggle for a sacerdotal or prohibitive form , to affirm himself as the unveiler of the truth in all creeds, the Bond of Union between all good men who differ because of external ritual , to proclaim the coming of Another through whom the peoples of the world should exist together in harmonious relationship under the banner of perpetual peace , this was the mission of Baha'u'llah

His mission terminated in 1892.

It remained for his appointed successor to inaugurate another and larger presentation of the principle of Universal Peace and of the Divine Unity which The Bab and Baha'u'llah had preached and prayed for.

ABDUL BAHA "THE SERVANT OF GOD"

ABBAS EFFENDI

THAT the Bahais should not be left unshepherded was fore-ordained.

Baha u'llah with unerring insight recognised the undoubted fitness of his eldest son for the leadership of his fast increasing flock.

This son known now as Abbas Effendi was born on May 23 1844 the day on which The Bab began his ministry¹

Not only had he eagerly assimilated the instructions of The Bab he had also perceived and rejoiced in the fulfilment in his Father's person of The Bab's prophecy that God would become Manifest

His acquiescence in and joyous acceptance of Baha'u'llah was complete He called him Lord as well as Father

Used to the existence of the exiled accustomed to all the details and requirements of the

¹ "From childhood his father fitted him and trained him to become the centre of the movement."—O. M. RÉMY

position, filled with unalterable faith in The Bab's message,—his Father's mission,—his own standing as "The Chosen One", he took upon himself the burdensome yoke, the onerous duties, of "The Servant of God"

His knowledge of the sufferings of his people was personal and profound, he had shared in their sacrifice. His conviction that, through Baháism, East and West would be, in God's good time, brought together in the Divine Unity, enabled him to take up bravely the burden imposed upon him by his Father

Very wisely, as well as very bravely, has he borne that burden.

Abdul Baha, Abbas Effendi, exhibits to perfection the force and sweetness of what we call personality. We have noticed that he addressed his parent sometimes as "Father," sometimes as "Lord" This beautiful appreciation of a beautiful character is repeated in the home of Abbas Effendi, whose daughters employ the same expressions. He who is their Father according to the flesh, is also their Lord according to the spirit. They recognise in him the ideal blending of attributes human and divine; and, in this connection, it must be remembered that it is a man's family who know him most intimately. He who is both loved and revered by his own children has a "personality" which survives, and is exalted by, criticism.

Men of various nationalities, rightly proud of intimate acquaintance with him, speak enthusiastically of him as a living example of the practice in everyday life of the highest and at the same time most endearing qualities. An English woman, after eight months' residence under his roof, expressed herself as having found her esteem and admiration of Abbas Effendi increase day by day. Known as 'The Servant of God,' the fitness of that description is proved and recognised by his service to man. His method of life has been and continues to be a luminous example of the fact that here and now, despite all the surroundings of struggle for fame and wealth and material mastery, an existence guided and guarded by the Light of the Spirit is a possible actual thing. Those who pray for the coming of the Kingdom of God on earth may see in Abbas Effendi one who dwells in that Kingdom consciously, and creates an environment pulsating with the Peace that passeth ordinary understanding.

Heeding, obeying the supreme Voice of God sounding within, he converts to those who come in contact with him the sense of the nearness of God. He inspires them so completely with that immanence that they are impelled to imitate him in accepting the dictates of that divine being. He who becomes assured of the indwelling God cannot be perverted from living in the light of God. Their light, too, must be seen of men.

Is there, then, any wonder that the kindness of heart and head and hand shown by Abbas Effendi creates corresponding kindness in his adherents? Is there any wonder that his vast love for humanity obliges man to love man? To those whose inner eyes are opened, the kingdom of God is on earth, for "the Kingdom of Heaven is within" them.

In himself, his everyday bearing, his ways and words, Abbas Effendi furnishes the modern world with a living object-lesson of the transforming energy of The Light of Love. He has said, "All beside love is but words." In his own person he conveys the proof of his own prophecy that the religion of Bahaism is a religion of deeds, vocalising itself not in syllables but in active signs of The Light in the life. The author of the Fourth Gospel wrote, "The life was the light of men."

He bids his followers to recognise the rays of The Light wherever they may appear, in any country, in the professors of any creed. The Light, the unifying influence, should draw men of all classes and conditions together, by dissolving clouds of difference that tend to separation.

He assures his people that the world has received enlightenment through divinely inspired seers who, from time to time, have appeared. Every religion that has arisen in the world owed its rise to these. Thus every religion is of divine origin. Prophets have proclaimed truth, teachers

have unfolded the will of the Highest each prophet each teacher of any religious school has fulfilled the function of a lamp through which The Light has shone upon men

The history of belief has in it many chapters concerning the rise and progress of religions and has been compelled to add many other chapters bearing upon the fact that the value of each religion from a spiritual point of view has lessened and dwindled because of the growth around it of the fungi of superstition and the frequently deadening effect of reverence for ritual These inevitably shade the shining of The Light and prevent its irradiance Thus life created and moved by light becomes dull in sympathy with the dimness of The Light Then at such periods a new lamp is necessary a new prophet passes into being and the world once again rejoices in One who is made manifest by reason of the luminosity of The Light with which He is privileged to move among men

By virtue of the light borne by himself he would lead men on the Path of Peace His light shines full upon the oneness of man with God

If climatic and geographical considerations have produced antagonism it is certain that a creed in one quarter has created a crux in another Men a vision obscured by films that have imposed themselves upon faith, could not deserv hope in one another's outlook Spiritual perception re-

quired, in these latter days, a fresh and lustrous exposition of The Eternal Light. Hence the coming of The Bab, the succession of Baha'u'llah, the culminating influence of Abbas Effendi, who spends himself making clear to men the solidarity of the race as one with each other and with God. His life is his lesson. He lops off no limb of religion from the body of mankind. He urges men to be true to that aspect of the highest that appeals to them, for the core of each creed is truth, the seed of each religion was sown by the Lord.

That Baha'u'llah acted wisely and well in proclaiming his son Abbas Effendi his successor, events have plentifully proved.

Courteous, kindly, dignified, his personality fascinates and compels towards goodness.

Honourable and just, he so disarms prejudice that "his jailers have become his friends." That the people of Acca esteem him and look to him for sympathy and justice might be supposed, but it is a remarkable and noteworthy fact to record that equal esteem is evinced for him by successive governors of the city and by military officers in authority there.

Nearly forty years he has dwelt, imprisoned, in that little city of Acca, a familiar figure, a marked man. Familiarity has not bred contempt, but sincerest admiration and reverence.

Those who have visited him—when the powers

that were permitted such visits—have found their love and respect for him increase day by day, even month by month. Prolonged intimacy is the severest of all tests but tried by this test Abbas Effendi is throughout the gainer.

Always under surveillance frequently under suspicion (of political or other inimical intent) his courage has disarmed espionage and his untiring faculty for forgiving has rendered suspicion foolish.

His devotion and attention to his people have increased rather than lessened during the years of a busy harassed life. Through persecution, misapprehension, and many misrepresentations he has proved true to his ideal unswerving in the pursuance of his purpose.

His liberality relative to varying creeds is equalled by his generosity to friends and foes. Poverty and suffering exist he considers in order to be relieved at any personal cost and inconvenience. Those who have vehemently opposed and strenuously fought to hinder him, have participated in much material benefit at his hands. Intolerance is in the rule of the Bahai the one impossible word.

In dealing with conflicting opinions and rituals Abbas Effendi's method is that of acute intelligence and spiritual perception. He exercises his fine insight into the minds of others an insight as sympathetic as it is immediate. Thus he

treats any theme under discussion from the point of view of the religion professed by the enquirer, selecting, as arguments, texts from the Scripture sacred to that religion

All that is evil or untoward in a man's or a country's condition, he comprehends, deplores, forthwith strives to remedy

His advanced scientific and hygienic principles have aided him, prisoner and poor, to redeem Acca, at least in part, from its notorious insalubrity

In signs and miracles he deals not at all Gifted to no small extent with healing powers—largely the result of education and experience in suffering—he firmly deprecates any imputation of the supernatural

"If men's minds are fixed on miracles, which prove nothing in themselves, they will be less open to the reception of truth, or be closed entirely to the Divine Message"

How far the sweetness and light of that message as delivered by The Bab, the enlightening revelations of Baha'u'llah, and the Gospel according to Abbas Effendi, have permeated the Persian conscience or penetrated into other Oriental castes, concerns our present purpose but little The last named of these, however, rejoices with exceeding joy in the promised, and promising, Constitutions of Eastern countries "For the first

time during seven years writes a devoted friend from Acca in the autumn of 1908 "our Lord has been allowed to visit the tomb of Baha'u'llah. With him I saw the tomb and was permitted to share in his freedom and that of his people."

The chains of the captivity are released. Freedom to live here or to live there. Freedom to speak and write tidings of goodwill. Freedom—the word the thing—cannot be entered into by men who have been born and who have lived free. It cannot be adequately put into any language. It can only be enjoyed to the uttermost by those to whom liberty has been a lifelong hope, a lifelong sacred dream which the Infinite One in His infinite goodness might make real. It can only become real to those who like the Bahais have "suffered and are strong" because of a supreme faith in a supreme cause.

Freedom, liberty, light—not for one tribe or worshippers in one temple but for all the sons of men and of God—these are the one desire of Abdul Baha Abbas Effendi. His acute apprehension of man's soul urges him to preach that no people are so distrustful of others as those who isolated and self-contained know little, and care less of contact with other folk. It is their natural tendency to become more and more satisfied with their limitations and indeed to believe at last that material and spiritual salvation can only be acquired within those limits.

Upheavals are essential The advent of a prophet is a necessity, first, perhaps, to be despised, doubted, but, in the end, to cause a vital current of opinion to flow in the direction of charitable speculation It is true that the parochialist in religion usually uplifts his voice clamorously against the prophet and the prophecy It is true, too, that when a master-mind frames truth in a new setting, or boldly breaks away incrustations which have longtime concealed truth, and been adored in mistake for truth, a storm of disapproval attempts to drown the missionary's voice and mar his message. Limitations, too frequently the accumulation of custom, convention, or superstition, have, on requisite occasion, to be shattered, with all courtesy, with all generosity, but with unyielding decision It is essential to the welfare of the world that seers should arise to utter the truth that has existed from the beginning; the truth that has always, to less extent or more, been uttered in the East

Out of the East, Abbas Effendi's humanising, spiritualising influence is spreading near and far. In the Eastern firmament a Star has again arisen and its beams are shedding light upon the dark places of the earth.

Each philosophy has many facets Diamond-wise, the philosophy of Baháism has been skilfully wrought by experts in prayer and practice

For example, —Abbas Effendi has been entitled

'His Highness the Master' he prefers to be known as 'The Servant' and day by day, holds himself in readiness to serve Customary Mohammedan observances are maintained for the sake of peace and to avoid the imputation of social innovation' Constant generosity is enjoined These are facets of jewels shining in the Bahai crown.

Monogamy is advised and Abbas Effendi's example is respected and admired

Differences of religious opinion should be disregarded most of all when charity (alms-giving) is concerned

Each Bahai should have good working knowledge of some useful trade or profession Industry is expected of all The emancipation of woman and the equal education of girls and boys is Abbas Effendi's desire and prophecy Cleanliness of body and mind practical thrift personal action towards universal Brotherhood —these are parts of the clauses in the holy ordinance

THE SEVEN VALLEYS

THE written word of Baha'u'llah is possessed of much direct instruction, conveyed very beautifully, having always a helpful and inspiring note

Let us wander, if you will, for a little time, with him in "The Seven Valleys," seven stations, so to speak, on the Divine Way. We shall find these stations in a veritable Garden of the Soul. They are described in the form of answers to questions put by a mystic Sufi, a Mohammedan named Sheik Abdur Rahman. Our gleanings from these answers, or tablets, will be gathered from Ali Kuli Khan's translation, issued by the Bahai Publishing Society in 1906. We will note that these answers are further described as "revealed", that, naturally, they are presented with a glowing and ornate Oriental wealth of imagery. Much of this we must leave ungarnered, contenting ourselves with enough of the real fineness of the work to give us a clear conception of the thought behind it.

It begins thus

*'In the Name of God the Compassionate
the Merciful*

Praise be unto God who caused existence to appear from non-existence inscribed the mysteries of the existence on the tablet of Man and taught him the explanation of that which he knoweth not I mention unto thee holy brilliant allusions from the Stations of Glory so that they may attract thee unto the court of holiness nearness and beauty and draw thee unto a state wherein thou shalt see naught in existence but the countenance of His Highness thy Beloved One That is the station of which the nightingale of unity hath sung viz. And there shall appear upon the tablet of thine heart the traces of the subtle mysteries of fear God and God will instruct you May it do good unto me unto thee unto whomsoever may ascend to the heaven of knowledge and to him whose heart is fascinated by the zephyr of assurance wafting upon the garden of his innate heart, from the Sheba of the Merciful

Peace be unto those who follow guidance '

It must be remarked that 'the stages of the journey of travellers from the earthly dwelling to the Divine House have been designated to be Seven, some have spoken of these as Seven

Valleys ' and they have said, ' Not until the traveller migrates from self and accomplishes these journeys, will he arrive at the sea of nearness and union '

The First Valley .

THE VALLEY OF SEARCH

The steed upon which to journey through this valley is Patience

In this journey the traveller will reach no destination without patience, nor will he attain to his aim . He must never be dejected.

Were he to endeavour for a hundred thousand years, and see not the beauty of the Friend, he must not be downhearted

It is conditional upon these servants to purify their hearts—which are the source of the Divine Treasury—from every blemish, to turn away from blind imitation which is a trace of forefathers and ancestors , and to close the doors of friendship and enmity with all the peoples of the earth

In this journey the seeker reaches such a station that he finds all the existing beings bewildered in search of the Friend

Many a Jacob he sees wandering in quest of Joseph . A world of friends he beholds, who are running in search of the Desired One, and a universe of lovers he finds, who are journeying after the Beloved One

At every moment he perceives a new matter and at every hour he becomes informed of a mystery for he has lifted his heart from both worlds and intended to attain the Kaaba (the goal) of the Beloved

At every step the assistance of the Invisible surrounds him and the ardour of his search increases

As illustrating the thoroughness of seeking requisite for attainment in the First Valley a story is given prefaced by the statement

Search should be measured by the deed of the Majnoon of love

Majnoon our translator tells us signifies "insane" and was the name by which a celebrated lover belonging to the old Arabian nomadic tribes was known His object was Laila the daughter of an Arab prince The story is symbolical of pure human love in its highest degree and has been the theme of many Persian poets Nizami's poem on this love story is the master piece

"It is related that one day Majnoon was seen sifting the dust and shedding tears They said What art thou doing? He said I am searching for Laila! They said Woo unto thee! Laila is from the pure spirit and thou art seeking her in the earth! He said I exert myself in her search *everywhere* perchance I may find her somewhere!

“ Although seeking the Lord of Lords in the dust is contemptible to the wise, yet it is evidence of utmost endeavour and search ‘ Whoso seeks with diligence shall surely find ’

A sincere seeker finds naught save union with the Desired One, and a lover has no aim but to attain to the beloved

A seeker cannot obtain this (spirit of) search, except by the sacrifice of all that exists, that is, he must annihilate all that he has seen, heard, or understood, with the negation ‘ no,’ so that he may reach the city of the Spirit, which is the city of ‘ but ’ ”

Here our translator reminds us that “ There is no God but God ” is the formula of faith in the Divine Unity “ There is *no* God ” is denial and negation, while “ *but* God ” is faith and affirmation

“ An effort is needed that we may exert ourselves in search for Him, and an endeavour that we may taste of the honey of union with Him. If we drink of this cup we shall forget the whole world

In this journey the traveller sits on every soil and dwells in every land, and seeks the beauty of the Friend in every face

He searches for the Beloved One in every country, he joins every multitude . perchance he may discover the mystery of the Beloved One

in some head or behold the beauty of the Desired
One in some visage

If through the assistance of God he find in
this journey a trace of the Traceless Friend
he will immediately step into the Valley of Love
and become melted with the fire of love

The Second Valley

THE VALLEY OF LOVE

In this valley the heaven of attraction is lifted
up the world illuminating sun of longing dawns
forth and the fire of love becomes ablaze

And when the fire of love is become ablaze the
harvest of reason will be wholly consumed

At this time the traveller is unconscious both
of himself and of aught else save himself

He knows neither knowledge nor ignorance
neither doubt nor certainty neither does he recog-
nise the morn of guidance nor the eve of error

He avoids both infidelity and faith

Thus it is said by Attar (one of the great in-
spired Sufi leaders poets and philosophers of the
middle ages of Islam) Leave infidelity to the
infidel and faith to the faithful a single particle of
pain in thy love is enough for the heart of Attar

The steed of this valley is Pain

Without pain this journey will never be accom-
plished

In this stage the lover has no thought but of

the Beloved One, and seeks no shelter but the Desired One At every moment he freely gives a hundred lives in the path of the Beloved, and at every step he throws a thousand at the feet of the Friend

‘O my brother! not until thou enterest the Egypt of the Spirit wilt thou attain to the Joseph of the beauty of the Friend, not until thou, like Jacob, give up thine outward eye, wilt thou open thine inward eye, and not until thou art ablaze with the fire of love wilt thou associate with the Friend of Ecstasy

A lover fears nothing, and no loss can do him harm

Thou wilt see him cool in fire, and find him dry even in the sea

Love accepts not any existence, nor wishes any life, he finds life in death, and glory in shame

Much wit is needed to make one worthy of the ardour of love, and many a head is required to be fit for the noose of the Friend Blessed is the neck which falleth into His noose, and happy is the head which is dropped on the dust in the path of His love

Be alien to thyself, that thou mayest find thy way to the Incomparable One

Abandon the mortal earth, that thou mayest take residence in the Divine Nest

Nothingness is needed until thou mayest kindle the fire of existence and become acceptable in the

path of love 'Love does not accept a soul alive
(to material things) a falcon preys not on a
dead mouse

At every moment Love consumes a world
and in whatever land he hoists his banner he
makes it desolate

Existence has no being in his realm and men
of reason have no foothold in his dominion

The whale of love swallows up the erudite in
reason and destroys the prudent in knowledge
It quaffs the 'Seven Seas' and yet the thirst
of its heart is not allayed and still it says 'Is
there yet any more ?

It becomes alien to self and shuns all that
is in the world

Therefore the veils of the Satanic ego must
needs be consumed with the fire of love so that
the spirit may become clean and purified for
comprehending the grades of the Lord of 'but
for thee' [Here the reader must be referred to
the translator's note 'But for thee' — a tradi-
tion relating the words of God to the Prophet
(Mohammed) *But for thee* I would not have
created the spheres! (traditional)] Kindle thou
a fire of love and consume all possessions (or Self)
then lift thy foot and step into the mountain of
the lovers' [Here our translator informs us that
Baha'u'llah is quoting from one of his own odes]

If by the assistance of the Creator the lover
is released in safety from the claws of the falcon

of Love, he will then arrive at the realm of the Valley of *Divine Knowledge*.

The Third Valley .

THE VALLEY OF DIVINE KNOWLEDGE

He will be led from doubt to certainty and directed from the darkness of the error of worldly desire to the light of guidance of piety

His inner eye will be opened, and he will engage in close communion with his Beloved

He will open the portal of truth and devotion and close the doors of superficiality

In this state he will yield to the Divine Decree, will see war as peace, find the Significances of life in death, perceive the mysteries of the "other world" in the regions of creation with the outward and inward eye, and, with a spiritual heart he will behold the Eternal Wisdom in the infinite manifestations of God

In an ocean he will see a drop, and in a drop he will detect the mysteries of an ocean.

'The core of whatever mote thou mayest split, therein thou wilt find a sun'

In this valley, through absolute vision, a traveller does not see in God's creation any difference or contradiction, and at every moment he will say, 'Thou canst not see, in the creation of the Most Merciful One, any difference Turn thou thine eyes whether thou can see any flaws!' (Koran).

He will see justice in injustice and witness grace in justice—he will find many a knowledge concealed in ignorance

He will break the cage of body and desire and be attached to the spirit of the people of immortality. He will ascend on ideal ladders and hasten to the heaven of Significances

If he experience any oppression he will endure it with patience and if he see any wrath he will show forth affection

The people of the valley beyond this see the beginning and the end as one—nay rather they see no beginning and no end—without beginning, without end

As it is said—A perfect realisation of Divine Unity is to strip it from all attributes

Hence in this connection Khaji Abd Allah has set forth a subtle point and consummation in his interpretation of the verse—Direct us in the Right Way (Koran) and it is this—Point unto us the right way that is—bless us with Love thine Essence—so that becoming free from all regard for ourselves and for all else save Thee we may be wholly captivated by Thee so as to know none but Thee to see naught save Thee to think of naught beside Thee' (Khaji Abd 'Allah was adds Ali Kuli Khan a high mystic Sufi leader of the house of Ansar in the middle ages of Islam. His tomb is situated in Herat 'Ansar' literally means 'helpers'—hence a

term denominating those people of Medina who first believed in Mohammed)

Nay, they pass even beyond this station, as it is said, 'Love is a screen between the lover and the Beloved' .

At this time the morn of knowledge hath dawned, and the lamps of travelling and wayfaring are put out "

At this point we are bidden to note that "travelling and wayfaring after truth, under the direction of the Sufi leaders, are of the characteristics of mystic Sufis. These leaders, Sufis call 'lights,' whereby to find the truth But the appearance of the manifestations of God is that of the Sun of Truth itself Hence it is said by Ali, 'Quench the light (lamp) when the Sun hath already dawned' Here Baha'u'llah teaches that in these days men must depend on the Sun of Truth which has become manifest

If thou art a man of prayer and supplication, fly on the wings of saintly effort, so that thou mayest see the mysteries of the Friend, and attain to the light of the Beloved

'We are God's, and unto Him shall we surely return'

After journeying through the Valley of Knowledge, which is the last station of limitation, the traveller reaches the first stage of the Valley of Divine Unity.

The Fourth Valley

THE VALLEY OF DIVINE UNITY

He (the traveller) drinks from the cup of abstraction and gazes on the manifestations of singleness

At this station he rends asunder the veils of plurality flies away from the worlds of lust and ascends to the Heaven of Oneness

He hears with Divine ears and beholds the mysteries of the creation of the Eternal One with God like eyes He steps into the retreat of the Friend and becomes an intimate in the pavilion of the Beloved

He sees no commendation name or dignity of himself he sees his own commendation in the commendation of the True One and beholds the Name of the True One in his own name He will know all voices to be from the King and hear all the melodies from Him

He will be established on the throne of— Say all is from God ' and rest on the carpet of— There is no power nor might but through God alone

He will look upon things with the vision of oneness and see the light of unity manifest and present in all the existent things All the differences which the traveller sees in the world of Being during the various stages of his journey are due to the view of the traveller himself We bring an illustration in order that this fact may become thoroughly evident

Consider the phenomenal sun which shines forth on all beings with the same effulgence .

But its appearance in every place and the light it sheds thereon, is in accord with the degree of the capacity of that place . In a mirror it reflects . it creates fire in the crystal . it develops everything according to the capacity of that thing , by the command of the Causer of effects

Colours also appear in accord with (the nature of) the place , even as in a yellow glass the splendour is yellow, in a white one the ray is white, and in a red one it is red . These differences are due to the place and not to the effulgence of light , and if the place is confronted by an obstacle, such as walls or ceiling, that place is bereft of the splendour of the sun

Some weak souls, having enclosed the ground of knowledge within the wall of self and desire, and within the veil of heedlessness and blindness, are therefore screened from the effulgence of the Sun of Significances and the mysteries of the Eternal Beloved One , are kept from the Gems of Wisdom . . deprived of Beauty, and separated from the Ka'aba (sanctum) of Glory .

An agreeable odour is unpleasant to the beetle, and a fragrant perfume has no effect upon one afflicted with a cold

Hence, for the guidance of the multitude, it has been said, ' Remove the cold from thy head and

brain, so that the Fragrance of God may fill thy nostrils '.

The difference of place is now made clear

When the gaze of the traveller is restricted when he looks through glasses (of different colours) he sees yellow red or white

It is due to such a view of things that conflict is stirred up and a gloomy dust rising from men of limitations has enveloped the world

Some extend their gaze to the *effulgence* of the light and others drink from the wine of Oneness and therefore see nothing but the sun itself

Because of journeying in these different stations travellers differ in their understanding and explanation of things

That is why the sign of difference is manifest in the world for some dwell on the plane of oneness and speak of the world of oneness some stand in the worlds of limitation, others in the stages of self and still others are absolutely veiled

The ignorant who have gained no portion from the splendour of the Beautiful One speak in certain (unreasonable) words and in every time and age they inflict upon the people of Unity that which is only worthy of and befits their own selves

If God should punish men for their iniquity He would not leave (on the earth) any moving thing but He giveth them respite unto an appointed time (Koran)

A pure heart is like unto a mirror, purify it with the polish of Love, and severance from all save God, until the Ideal Sun may reflect therein, and the Eternal Morn may dawn

Then wilt thou find clear and manifest the meaning of—‘Neither doth My earth nor heaven occupy Me, but the heart of My faithful servant occupieth Me’—and wilt take thy life in thy hands and sacrifice it, with a thousand longings, to the new Beloved

When the lights of the splendour of the King of Oneness are seated on the throne of the heart and soul, His light becomes manifest in all the parts and members

Then will the mystery of the (following) tradition emerge from the veil of obscurity

‘A servant always draws near Me with prayers, until I respond unto him And when I have responded to him, then I become his ear wherewith he heareth’

For (in this case) the Owner of the house becomes manifest in His Own House (*i e* the heart), and the pillars of the house are all illuminative and radiative through His light

The action and effect of the Light is from the Giver of Light, this is why all move through Him, and arise by His Desire

This is that Fountain wherefrom drink those

near unto God as it is said 'A Fountain wherof those shall drink who are near (unto God)'

Let no one suppose these explanations to be redolent of anthropomorphism or indicative of a degrading or restricting of the worlds (or states) of the True One to the planes of the creatures for God in His Essence is sanctified above ascent or descent entrance or exit He has been and will be everlastingly independent of (or free from) the attributes of the creatures.

No one has known Him and no soul has found out His substance

All the sages are bewildered in the Valley of His Knowledge and all the saints are perplexed (in their endeavours to) comprehend His Essence He is purified from being comprehended by all men of comprehension and is exalted above the knowing of men of knowledge

'The road (to His Essence) is barred and search (therefor) is rejected.

His evidence is His Sign and His Being is His proof

Thus the lovers of the Face of the Beloved One have said 'O Thou whose essence alone bears evidence of the Essence of Him who is sanctified beyond homogeneity with His creatures

How can a mortal shadow compare with the Immortal Sun ?

Yea such mentions as are made concerning the stages of knowledge concern only the knowledge

of the splendour of that Sun of Truth which becomes manifest in the mirrors (i.e. prophets, manifestations)

The reflection of that Light is within the hearts, but it is veiled through sensual coverings and accidental conditions, as is the case with a light enclosed within an iron lantern. When the lantern is removed the radiance of the light will appear.

Likewise, when one rends asunder the illusive veils from the face of the heart, the light of oneness will dwell therein.

Wherefore it is known that even for the Splendour (of the Sun of Divine Essence) there is no entrance nor exit, how much less for that Essence of Beings and that Mystery of the Desired One

Reflect upon these stations with verification, and not with blind imitation.

The repellent 'avaunt' of words cannot repulse the traveller (after Truth), nor can the terror of allusions impede him.

'What veil can stand between the lover and the Beloved? The Wall of Alexander itself can be no obstacle or screen.'

Mysteries are many, and strangers are countless.

Books are not sufficient for the Mystery of the Beloved, nor can it be exhausted in these Tablets, although it is no more than one word, and but one allegory.

'Knowledge is but one point, but the ignorant have multiplied it.'

I do not wish to mention much of the former sayings for to speak of the sayings of others would be an evidence of acquired learning (i.e. mediate knowledge) and not of the Divine Gift (i.e. immediate knowledge)

Moreover such explanations are beyond the limits of this treatise

My forbearing to speak of the sayings of others is not due to pride but because of a showing forth of Wisdom and a manifesting of the Gift

This servant accounts himself as nothing even in the court of one of the beloved of God (i.e. believers) how much more so in the presence of the Holy Ones ?

Praise be unto my Lord, the Supreme

Although a short illustration has already been given as to the beginning and end of the relative or dependent (not absolute) world (or plane) yet again we set another example so that all of the meanings may become manifest in the garment of illustration

For instance consider how you are the first in relation to your son and the last in relation to your father how outwardly (i.e. according to the soul) (you bear evidence) of the inward mysteries which as a Divine Gift are deposited within you

Consequently being the first the last the manifest the hidden becomes true of you in the sense set forth above, so that in these four

grades bestowed on you, you may comprehend the (corresponding) grades of the Divine, .
' Verily ' He is the First and the Last, the Manifest and the Hidden ' '

The First is identical with the Last, and the Last is the same as the First

' Enkindle a fire with the Love of the Beloved One, and consume therewith every thought and pious work '

Consider thine own self ; if thou hadst not become a father nor seen a son, thou wouldest not have heard even these words

Now, therefore, forget all these, so that thou mayest learn in the School of Unity, before the Instructor of Love, and come back from the stage—' Verily, we are (from God) '—unto (' and to Him) we return '

Thus thou mayest abandon the abode of Unreality, and attain into thine own real station, and abide in the shade of the Tree of Knowledge

Impoverish thyself so that thou mayest arrive at the Court of Affluence

Humiliate the body, so that thou mayest drink from the River of Glory, and attain unto all the meanings of the poems which thou hast questioned

It is evident that these states depend upon the view of the traveller

In every city he sees a world , in every valley he comes upon a fountain , in every desert he hears a melody.

Peace be on whomsoever accomplisheth this
supreme journey and followeth the True One
through the Lights of Guidance

The Fifth Valley

THE VALLEY OF CONTENTMENT

In this valley he (the traveller) discovers the
breezes of Divine Contentment which waft from
the desert of the Spirit and consume the veils
of poverty

There he witnesses the day wherein God will
make all independent out of His abundance

(He will witness this day) with his outward
and inward eye in the visible and invisible parts
of things He passes from sadness to joy and
he changes depression and dejection into gladness
and cheerfulness

Though the travellers in this valley outwardly
dwell on the earth yet inwardly they recline on
the high couch of Significances, and they partake
of ideal imperishable benefits and quaff pure,
spiritual wines

The tongue is unable to give an account of
these three (last) valleys and utterance falls
exceeding short The pen cannot stop into this
court and the ink gives no result but blackness

Concerning these states the nightingale of the
heart has other melodies and mysteries which set
the heart in agitation and the spirit in uproar

But this enigma of Significances must be only revealed from heart to heart, and confided from breast to breast

Heart alone can communicate to heart the state of the knower (of divine secrets), this is not the work of a messenger, nor can this be contained in letters. On many points I keep silent because of my inability, to state them is beyond speech, and if I say them my words would be insufficient.

Not until thou reachest the garden of these Significances wilt thou taste of the immortal wine of this valley. If thou tastest thereof thou wilt close thine eyes to all strangers, and drink from the wine of contentment. Thou wilt sever thyself from all, and become united with Him, give up thy life in His Way, and pour out thy soul freely, —although there is no stranger in this station, that thou shouldest close thine eyes,—‘There was but God, but there was nothing with Him.’ Because, in this stage, the traveller beholds the beauty of the Friend in everything.

In fire he sees the Face of the Beloved, in unreality perceives the sign of the Reality, and through the attributes he witnesses the Mystery of the Divine Substance (or Essence), for he has consumed the veils with a mere sigh, and removed the coverings with a single gaze.

He looks upon the new creation with a discerning sight, and comprehends subtle signs with a pure heart,

At that Day we will make thy sight discerning —is an evidence of this saying and is sufficient for this instance '

[The Valley of Contentment is sometimes translated as the Valley of Richness]

After traversing the Valley of Pure Contentment the traveller reaches the Valley of Astonishment

The Sixth Valley :

THE VALLEY OF ASTONISHMENT

He plunges in the sea of grandeur and at every moment his amazement increases

Now he sees the body of affluence as indigence itself and the essence of independence as impotence Now he becomes astonished at the beauty of the All glorious and now he loathes his own being

Many are the trees of Significances uprooted by the blast of astonishment and many are the souls it exhausted.

For this valley sets the traveller in agitation

But such appearances are highly beloved and esteemed in the eye of one who has attained

At every moment he witnesses a wonderful world and a New Creation he adds astonishment upon astonishment and he becomes dazed at the new creation of the King of Oneness

If we reflect upon any of the creations we shall

behold a hundred thousand consummate wisdoms, and learn a hundred thousand knowledges.

One of these is that of Sleep (or dreams) consider what mysteries are deposited therein, what wisdoms are stored therein

Consider You sleep in a certain house, the doors of which are closed

Suddenly you find yourself in a remote city ; you enter it without motion of the feet or exhaustion of the body , you see without troubling the eyes , you hear without distressing the ears , and you speak without the use of the tongue.

There are times when it happens that—ten years thereafter—you will witness outwardly in the world what thou hast seen at this night in a dream.

Now there are many wisdoms visible in this dream , but others than the people of this valley cannot comprehend them as they are

First , what is that world, wherein, without eye, ear, hand or tongue, one realises the purpose of these senses ?

Secondly , this day thou seest in the world of reality the effect of a dream which thou hast experienced years ago in the world of dreams

Reflect upon the differences of these two worlds, and the mysteries deposited therein , so that thou mayest attain unto the confirmations and revelations of the Glorified One, and enter into the World of Holiness

God, the Exalted, has placed these signs within

the creatures so that philosophers may not deny the mysteries of the After Life and not make light of that whereunto they have been promised.

For some have clung to reason and deny whatever cannot be grasped by reason although the feeble reason can never comprehend these same aforesaid conditions but only the Universal Supreme Reason (can do so)

'How can finite reason comprehend the Koran? How can a spider hunt a Simurgh?' "

[A Simurgh'—a griffin a fabulous bird the conception of the largest and rarest of birds mythologically conceived as inhabiting the lofty peaks of Mount Caucasus]

All these worlds (i.e. conditions) will present themselves in the Valley of Astonishment and at every moment the traveller seeks for an increase of such without becoming exhausted

Hence the Lord of those gone by and those who are to come has said concerning the grades of reflection and the declaration of astonishment—

O Lord! Increase my astonishment in Thee!

Likewise ponder over the completeness of the creation of man all these worlds and all these grades are enveloped and concealed in him.

Dost thou think thy body a small thing while in thee is enfolded the universe?

Then an effort is needed that we annihilate the animal condition in order that the meaning of the human may become manifest

Likewise Lokman, who drank from the fount of Wisdom and tasted of the sea of Mercy, in demonstrating the states of resurrection to his son Nathan, gave the dream (or sleep) as a proof, and applied it as an illustration.

We speak of it in this place, so that this humble servant may leave here a mention of that youth of the school of Unity, who was aged in the stages of instruction and abstraction

He said 'O Son' if thou be not able to sleep, thou wilt not be able to die, and if thou canst manage to not awake from sleep, thou canst manage to not resurrect after death'

The heart is a store of divine mysteries

Make it not a receptacle for mortal thoughts, and consume not the capital of the precious life by occupying yourself with this evanescent world
Thou art of the World of Holiness, attach not thy heart unto the earth

Thou art a denizen of the Court of Nearness, choose not an earthly home

In fine, there is no end to mentioning these grades, and this servant has no composure on account of the injuries done by the people of the world

'Thus speech remained unfinished and incomplete I am disheartened and downcast—O forbear!'

The pen laments and the ink weeps, and the river of the heart rolls with waves of blood,

Naught shall befall us save that which God hath decreed unto us !

Peace be upon those who follow Guidance

(The Valley of Astonishment is sometimes translated as The Valley of Perplexity)

After ascending to the lofty heights of Astonishment the traveller arrives at the Valley of Absolute Poverty and Annihilation

The Seventh Valley

THE VALLEY OF ABSOLUTE POVERTY AND
ANNIHILATION

This is the station of dying from self and living through God of being poor of one's self and rich in the Desired One

In this station poverty is mentioned as meaning one's indigence in all that is of the world of creation and one's affluence in all that is of the worlds of Truth.

For when a sincere lover and agreeable friend attains to the meeting of the beloved and desired one, a fire is enkindled from the radiance of the beauty of the beloved and the heat of the heart of the lover which consumes all coverings and veils

Nay whatever is with him even marrow and skin, will thereby be burnt and naught remain except the friend

‘ When the attributes of the Ancient One became manifest, then the Interlocutor (Moses) consumed the attributes of all things accidental ’

In this station the one who has attained is sanctified from all that pertaineth to the world

If, therefore, those who have attained to the Sea of Union do not possess any of the limited things of this mortal world be these things of material belongings or of selfish thoughts there is no harm in that

For whatever is possessed by men is confined within its own limits, whereas that which is God’s is sanctified (from all limitations)

Much reflection should be bestowed on this explanation in order that the end may become manifest

This station is that of Poverty, of which it is said, ‘ Poverty is my glory ’ (Mohammed)

Many are the meanings and grades of the outward and inward poverty, which I do not deem appropriate to be mentioned in this place, and which I therefore reserve for some other time, if God will, and the Divine Decree may ordain

It is in this stage that the traces of all things are destroyed in the traveller, and the Beauty of the Face unveils itself from the Orient of the Eternal World, and the meaning of ‘ Everything is mortal save the Face of God ’ becomes manifest

Hearken to the melodies of the Spirit with all

thy heart and soul, and preserve them as the sight of thine eyes for the Divine Enlightenments will not always flow like the vernal rain upon the soil of human hearts

Although the bounty of the Bountiful One is continual and free from interruption yet for every time and age a certain portion is determined and a certain benefit is ordained and these are bestowed (on men) according to a certain quantity and measure

There is no thing but the storehouses thereof are in Our Hands and we distribute not the same save in a determinate measure' (Koran)

The cloud of the Mercy of the Beloved One will pour down only on the Garden of the Soul, and it will not bestow this bounty except in times of Spring

Other seasons have no portion of this mightiest Grace and barren soils have no share in this Favour

Not every sea has pearls not every branch brings forth flowers, nor doth the nightingale sing thereon

Therefore so long as the nightingale of the spiritual planting hath not returned to the Divine Rose-Garden and the Lights of the Spiritual Dawn have not returned to the Sun of Reality — make an effort

Perchance in this mortal land thou mayest inhale a fragrance from the Immortal Rose-

Garden, and rest for ever under the shade of the people of this valley (city)

When thou hast reached this lofty, exalted grade and attained to this great station, then wilt thou see the Friend, and forget strangers (*i e* all else save Him)

‘The Friend, unveiled, is manifest from every door and wall (everywhere), O ye possessors of Sight!’

Then thou hast abandoned the drop of life and reached the ocean of the Beloved One

This is the goal which thou hast demanded, God willing, thou mayest attain thereunto

In this Valley even the veils of Light are rent asunder and vanish

‘To His Beauty there are no veils but Light, and His Face has no covering save manifestation’

How wonderful that the Well-Beloved is manifest as the sun, while strangers are in search of vanities and riches

Yea! He is concealed by the intensity of manifestation, and He is hidden by the ardour of Emanation

‘The True One hath become manifest, like unto the shining sun. Pity that He hath come in the city of the blind!’

In this valley the traveller journeys through the stages of ‘Oneness of Existence’ and of Appearance, and will attain to a Oneness which is sanctified above both these stations.”

[“The mystic doctrine of the Oneness of Existence” is outlined from this formula— *Only God exists He is in all things and all things are in Him* —NOTE by TRANSLATOR]

(The condition of) Ecstasy can penetrate this saying but not controversy nor conflict

He who hath chosen an abode in this Meeting or discovered a breeze from this Garden knoweth what I say

¹ In all these journeys the traveller must not deviate but must cling to the hem of obedience to the (Divine) Commandments and lay firm hold of the rope of shunning things forbidden by the Law

Although these journeys have no visible termination in the world of time yet if the Invisible Assistance vouchsafe a devoted traveller (let one severed from all else save God) and if the Guardian of the Command (i.e. the manifestation of God) help him he will traverse these seven stages in only seven steps nay in seven breaths nay, even in one breath (a moment) if God will or desire.

This is through His Bounty to whomsoever He willeth.

Those who soar in the sky of Oneness and who have attained to the Sea of Abstraction have accounted this station which is the station in this city of Immortality in God to be the ultimate destination of the Arif—(one who is intimate with

¹ See Note at end.

highest mystic thought)—and the ultimate home of the Lovers

But, to this humble one of the Sea of Significances, this station is only the first city-wall of the heart, that is, the first arrival of man at the City of the Heart

Four stages have been assigned to the heart, of which we will make mention. There will be found those who are intimate with such mysteries

‘When the pen reached the point of describing this state, the pen broke and the paper was torn’

This gazelle of the desert of Oneness is chased by many hounds, and this nightingale of the Garden of Eternity is followed by many beaks, the crow of oppression is lain in ambush for this bird of the Sky of Divinity, and this prey of the Wilderness of Love is pursued by the hunter of jealousy

Make an effort, perchance it may, as a globe, protect this lamp from contrary winds, although it is the hope of this lamp to shine in the Divine Glass and to be ablaze in the Ideal Niche

For a neck which is lifted in the Love of God, will certainly be severed by a sword, a head which is raised in Love will assuredly be blown by the winds, and the heart which is linked to the commemoration of the Beloved will certainly be full of grief.

How well it is said (by the poet)

'Live on free (from love) for the
very repose of love is distress
Its beginning is pain and its end
is death

Peace be upon those who follow Guidance

If thou hearest the melodies of this mortal bird, thou wilt seek after the Immortal Everlasting Chalice, and abandon the mortal and transient cups

Peace be upon those who follow Guidance

Here is the End of the Seven Valleys ' '

Before we leave them for this present time we will transcribe a note which runs

"The three stages of Sufi life are as follows

I. Shariat : e Religious Laws or religious life

II Tari-Kat : e Travelling in Search of Truth by finding the Perfect Man who embodies it and guides men to it. This stage also includes hermit life

III Hakarat : e. Truth to attain to which according to Sufis depends upon passing through the two preceding stages

Here Baha'u'llah teaches that contrary to what some Sufis teach or believe, the laws of religion

must be the guide even when man has attained the Truth , for Truth itself is embodied in the laws of religion To abandon the laws in any stage of development would be sheer antinomianism and therefore a great error ”

(This note refers to the text above, concerning the error of deviation from commandment)

Here, too (since they are added to the script of “ The Seven Valleys ”), we may appropriately place these sayings

“ Empty thyself from that which is caused by thy desire (or lust) , then advance towards thy Master

Purify thyself from all else save Him, so that thou mayest sacrifice thy soul in His Love

Abstain from the Presence of the True One, if the attributes of the world still remain in thee

Thank thy Lord on His earth, so that He may thank (bless) thee in His Heaven , although, in the world of Oneness, Heaven is identical with His earth

Renounce from thyself the limited veils, so that thou mayest know that which thou hast not known of the Stations of Sanctity ”

Peace be upon those who follow Guidance.

TEXTS FROM THE TABLETS OF BAHA'U'LLAH

ASSOCIATION (intercourse) is always conducive to union and harmony, and union and harmony are the cause of the order of the world and the life of nations

Forbearance and Benevolence are as two lights for the darkness of the world and as two teachers to lead nations to knowledge

Good character is verily the best mantle for men on the part of God

Gaze towards Justice and Equity under all circumstances

Trustworthiness is the door of tranquillity to all the world the best garment for your temples and the most splendid crown for your heads

Make not light of any matter but speak in Truthfulness and Sincerity

86 TEXTS FROM THE TABLETS

Refuse not to discharge the due reward of any one , respect possessors of talent , stain not tongues with slander

Knowledge is one of the greatest benefits of God. To acquire knowledge is incumbent on all
Tablet of Tarazet

O people of God ! Be not occupied with yourselves Be intent on the betterment of the world and the training of nations

Glory is not his who loves his native land , but glory is his who loves his kind

Courtesy is the lord of all the virtues

The deniers and contradictors hold to four words

First Destroying men's lives

Second Burning the Books

Third Shunning other nations

Fourth Exterminating other communities

Now, by the Grace and Authority of the Word of God, these four great barriers have been demolished and God hath changed brutal manners into spiritual qualities

Certain laws and principles are necessary and indispensable for Persia , but it is suitable that these should be accomplished in accord with the wish of the Shah, the eminent doctors and the great State authorities

The fear of God is the real guardian and the ideal protector. Flee from that which is redolent of corruption (or sedition)

Tablet of the World

Those souls (mystic Sufis) have affirmed concerning the stages of Divine Unity that which is the greatest cause of idleness and superstition. They have indeed removed the distinction and have imagined themselves to be God. The True One is sanctified above all (but) His Signs are manifest in all things. The Signs are from Him—not He Himself.

Consider the rays of the sun. Its lights have encompassed the world but those splendours are from it and from its manifestations. They are through itself but are not itself.

Schools must first train the children in the principles of Religion so that the Promise and the Threat recorded in the Books of God may prevent them from the things forbidden and adorn them with the mantle of the Commandments but this in such a measure that it may not injure the children by resulting in ignorant fanaticism and bigotry.

The trustees (members) of the House of Justice must consult upon the ordinances as they are outwardly revealed in the Book and then enforce of these whatever prove agreeable to them.

Moderation is desirable in every affair

Consider the civilisation of the people of the Occident—how it has occasioned commotion and agitation . . . There has appeared an infernal instrument, and atrocity is displayed in the destruction of life. It is impossible to reform these violent evils, except the peoples of the world become united in affairs, or in one Religion.

Praise be to God. A wonderful thing is perceived, the lightning (electricity) and similar forces are subdued by a conductor and act by his command. Exalted is the Mighty One who hath made manifest that which He desired, through His absolute Invincible Command.

Each one of the revealed Commands is a strong fortress for the (protection of the) world.

A solitary life and severe discipline do not meet God's approval. The possessors of perception and knowledge should look to the means which are conducive to joy and fragrance.

Deprive not yourselves of that which is created for you.

Charity is beloved and acceptable before God, and is accounted the chief among all good deeds.

The Reflective Faculty (or the Mind) is the depository of crafts, arts and sciences. Exert

yourselves so that the gems of knowledge and wisdom may proceed from this ideal mine and conduce to the tranquillity and union of the different nations of the world

Under all circumstances whether in adversity
or comfort in glory or affliction show forth
love and affection compassion and union
Words of Paradise

All the former and later Books of God are adorned with His commemoration and speak His praise Through Him the standard of knowledge is planted in the world and the Banner of Unity is hoisted among nations

Knowledge is like unto wings for the being (of man) and is as a ladder for ascending The possessors of sciences and arts have a great right among the people of the world Whereunto testifies the Mother of Divine Utterance in the Day of Return Joy unto those that hear

Knowledge is the means of honour prosperity joy gladness happiness and exultation

He (The Bab) says in description of He-whom God-shall-manifest — 'Verily He is the One who shall utter in all grades ' Verily I am God. There is no God but Me the Lord of all things and all besides Me is created by Me! O ye My

creatures ' Ye are to worship Me ' ' ' ' Likewise, in another place, speaking of ' He-whom-God-shall-manifest,' he says, ' Verily, I (The Bab) am the first one of those who worship Him '

Now, man must reflect upon the ' Worshipper ' (The Bab), and the ' Worshipped One ' (Baha 'u'llah), perchance the people of the earth may attain to a drop of the Sea of Knowledge, and comprehend the Station of this Manifestation Verily, He hath appeared, and hath spoken in Truth Blessed is he who confesses and acknowledges, and woe unto every remote denier "

The Tablet of Tazalleyat

Revealed by Baha 'u'llah, at Akka
Translated by Ali Kuli Khan

" As to the meaning of the Cause of Baha 'u'llah know that whatever there is which has to do with the Universal Good, is divine—and whatever is divine is, certainly, for the universal good If it is true, it is for all ; if not, it is for no one Therefore a Divine Cause of Universal Good cannot be limited either to the East or to the West , for the radiance of the Sun of Truth illumines both the East and the West, and it makes its heat felt in the South as in the North , there is no difference between one pole and the other "

*From The Tablet of Ishrakat
Baha 'u'llah*

SOME HIDDEN WORDS AND WORDS OF WISDOM

FROM 'THE SUPREME PEN' OF BAHÁ' ULLAH¹

He is the Glory of the Most Glorious!

This is that which descended from the Source of Majesty, through the tongue of Power and Strength upon the prophets of the past.

We have taken its essence and clothed it with the garment of brevity as a favour to the beloved that they may fulfil the Covenant of God—that they may perform in themselves that which He has entrusted to them and attain the victory by virtue of devotion in the land of the Spirit.

OF THE LIGHT

O Son of Existence! My lamp thou art and My Light is in thee. Therefore be illumined by it and seek no one but Me—for I have created thee rich and upon thee have I showered abundant grace.

By the Hands of Power I have made thee and

¹ From the Arabic and Persian. Mirza Asseem U Fareed.

by the Fingers of Strength have I created thee
I have placed in thee the essence of My Light

Therefore depend upon It, and upon nothing else, for My Action is perfect and My Command has effect Doubt this not, and have no uncertainty therein

O Son of Light ! Forget all else save Me, and be comforted by My Spirit This is from the essence of My Command , therefore direct thyself to it

Thou art My Possession, and My Possession shall never be destroyed. Why art thou in fear of thy destruction ?

Thou art My Light, and My Light shall never become extinct Why dost thou dread extinction ?

Thou art My Glory, and My Glory shall not be veiled Thou art My Garment, and My Garment shall never be outworn Therefore abide in thy love to Me, that thou mayest find Me in the Highest Horizon

My Right to thee is great and cannot be denied
My Mercy for thee is ample and cannot be ignored
My Love in thee exists and cannot be concealed
My Light to thee is manifest and cannot be obscured

O Son of Spirit ! The Gospel of Light I herald to thee , rejoice in it And to the state of Holiness I call thee , Abide in it, that thou mayest be in peace for ever and ever

O Son of Man ! Magnify My Command, that

I may reveal to thee the secrets of greatness and illumine thee with the Light of Eternity

O Son of Man! My Calamity is My Providence In appearance it is fire and vengeance in reality it is Light and Mercy Therefore approach it that thou mayest become an Eternal Light and an Immortal Spirit This is My Command know thou It

O Son of Man! Days have passed by thee and thou hast occupied thyself with thy fanciful imaginations How long wilt thou thus sleep upon thy bed? Lift up thy head from slumber for the sun has climbed to the zenith that He may illumine thee with the Lights of Beauty

The Light has shone upon thee from the horizon of the Mount and the Spirit of Purity has breathed in the Smell of thy heart

Therefore empty thyself of doubts and fancies then enter into this Mansion that thou mayest be prepared for the Eternal Life and ready to meet Me Herein there is no death, no trouble nor burden

O Children of Men! Do ye know why We have created ye from one clay? That no one should glorify himself over the other Be ye ever mindful of how ye were created

Since We created ye all from the same substance ye must be as one soul, walking with the same feet eating with one mouth and living in one land, that ye may manifest with your being

and by your deeds and actions, the signs of unity and the spirit of Oneness

This is My Counsel to ye, O People of Light ! Therefore follow it, that ye may attain the fruits of Holiness from the Tree of Might and Power

O Son of Man ! On the tablet of the Spirit write all We have uttered to thee, with the ink of Light , and, if thou canst not do this, then make the ink of the essence of thy heart , and, if thou art still unable, then write with the red ink shed in My Path. Verily this is more precious to Me than all else , for this Radiance shall last for ever

O Stranger to The Friend ! The candle of thy mind is lighted by the hand of My Power , extinguish it not with the contrary winds of desires and passions The healer of all thy troubles is remembrance of Me ; forget it not Make My Love thy Capital, and cherish it as the spirit of thine eye

O My Friends ! Extinguish the lamp of ignorance, and kindle the Ever-burning Torch of guidance in the heart and mind For in a short while the Assayers of Being shall accept naught but pure virtue in the portico of the Presence of the Adored One, and will receive none but holy deeds

O Children of Imagination ! Know ye that when the Radiant Morn dawns from the eternal horizon of Holiness, then all the Satanic secrets and deeds, which have been committed in the

dark night shall become manifest to the people of the world.

The Sun of Truth is the Word of God upon which depends the training of the people of the country of thought

It is the Spirit of Reality and the Water of Life All things owe their existence to it Its manifestation is ever according to the capacity and colouring of the mirror which reflects it For example Its Light when cast on the mirrors of the wise gives expression to wisdom when reflected from the minds of artists it produces manifestations of new and beautiful arts when it shines through the minds of students it reveals knowledge and unfolds mysteries

All things of the world arise through man and are manifest in him through whom they find life and development and man is dependent for his (Spiritual) existence upon the Sun of the Word of God.

All the good names and lofty qualities are of the Word. The Word is the Fire of God which glowing in the hearts of people burns away all things that are not of God The minds of the Lovers of Light are ever aflame with this fire It is the essence of water which has manifested itself in the form of fire

Outwardly it is the burning fire while inwardly it is calm light This is the water which giveth life to all things.

We beg of God that we may partake of this Life-giving Water of Heaven, and quaff from the Spiritual Chalice of Rest, and thus be free from all that tends to withhold us from approaching His love

In this day he who seeks the Light of the Sun of Truth must free his mind from the tales of the past, must adorn his head with the crown of severance, and his temple with the drapery of virtue. Then shall he arrive at the ocean of Oneness and enter the presence of singleness

The heart must become free from the fire of superstitions, that it may receive the Light of Assurance, and that it may perceive the Glory of God

The people of Baha must serve the Lord with wisdom, teach others by their lives, and manifest the Light of God in their deeds. The effect of deeds is in truth more powerful than that of words

OF DIVINE HUMANITY

O Son of Man ! In My Ancient Entity and in My Eternal Being, was I hidden. I knew My Love in thee, therefore I created thee, upon thee I laid My Image, and to thee revealed My Beauty

O Son of Man ! I loved thy creation, therefore I created thee. Wherefore love Me, that I may

acknowledge thee and in the Spirit of Life confirm thee

O Son of Existence ! Thy paradise is My Love thy heaven is My Nearness therefore enter thou and tarry not This was ordained for thee from Our Supreme Kingdom and exalted Majesty

O Son of Humanity ! If thou lovest Me turn away from thyself If My Will thou seekest regard not thine own that thou mayest die in Me and I live in thee

O Son of Perception ! My Fort thou art Enter in that thou mayest be safe My Love is in thee Seek and thou wilt find Me near

O Son of Spirit ! I have created thee rich ! Why dost thou make thyself poor ! Noble have I made thee ! Why dost thou degrade thyself ! Of the essence of knowledge have I manifested thee ! Why searchest thou for another than Me ! From the clay of Love I have kneaded thee ! Why seekest thou another !

Turn thy sight unto thyself that thou mayest find Me standing within thee, Powerful Mighty and Supreme

O Son of Perception ! Look thou to My Face and turn from all save Me for My Authority is eternal and shall never cease My Kingdom is lasting and shall not be overthrown

If thou seekest another than Me yea if thou searchest the universe for evermore yet shall thy search be in vain

O Son of the Highest Sight ! I have placed within thee a spirit from Me, that thou mightest be My Lover ! Why hast thou forsaken Me and sought to love another ?

O Son of Spirit ! I created thee sublime, but thou hast degraded thyself Therefore ascend to that for which thou wast created

O Son of Man ! Clothe thyself with My Beautiful Garment , and forfeit not thy portion from My Living Fountain, that thou mayest not thirst for ever

O Son of Existence ! Remember Me in My earth, that I may remember thee in My Heaven , thus may our eyes delight therein

O Son of the Throne ! Thy hearing is My Hearing , hear thou with it Thy sight is My Sight , see thou with it

Thus mayest thou attest within thyself My Holiness , that I may attest within Myself a place of Exaltation for thee

O Son of Humanity ! The temple of being is My Throne ! Purge it of everything, that I may descend therein to reign over it

O Son of Existence ! Thy heart is My Home ; purify it for My Descent Thy spirit is My Outlook , prepare it for My Manifestation

O Son of Man ! Put thy hand into My Treasury ! Then will I lift My Head radiant above thy treasures

O Son of Man ! My Greatness is My Bounty

to thee My Majesty is My Mercy to thee but that which is due to Me none can realise or comprehend. Verily I have treasured it in the stores of My Secrets in the treasury of My Command — as a favour to My servants and a mercy to My people

O Children of the Spirit ! Ye are My treasures for in ye have I treasured the pearls of My Mysteries and the gems of My Knowledge

O Son of Him who stood by His Own Entity in the Kingdom of Himself ! Know that I have sent unto thee the fragrances of Holiness have accomplished the Word in thee have fulfilled the Bounty through thee and have willed for thee what I have willed for Myself Therefore be content in Me and thankful to Me

OF JUSTICE

Justice is loved above all Neglect it not if thou dearest Me

By it thou wilt be strengthened to perceive things with thine own eyes and not by the eyes of men to know them by thine own knowledge and not by the knowledge of any in the world Meditate on this—how thou oughtest to be

Justice is of My Bounty to thee and of My Providence over thee therefore keep it ever before thy sight

O Son of Man ! Wert thou to observe Mercy,

We test the gold, and with gold We try the servants

Thou desirest gold, and We desire the separation from it Thou hast realised therein the riches of thyself, while I realise thy wealth to consist in thy freedom from it By My Life ' This is My Knowledge, while that is thine imagining, how can My Thought agree with Thine ?

Distribute My possessions among My poor, that in Heaven thou mayest receive from the boundless treasures of Glory and from the stores of Eternal Bliss

Let the rich learn the midnight sighing of the poor, lest negligence destroy them and they be deprived of their portion of the tree of wealth

Giving and generosity are qualities of Mine Happy is he who adorns himself with My Virtues

Greed must be abandoned, that thou mayest find content, for the greedy has ever been deprived, while the contented has ever been loved and esteemed

Let not poverty trouble thee, nor rest assured in wealth All poverty is succeeded by wealth, and all wealth is followed by poverty

To be poor in all save God is a great blessing, make it not small, for, in the end, it will make thee rich in God

Know ye that wealth is a strong barrier between the seeker and the Desired One, between

the lover and the Beloved Never shall the rich arrive at the abode of Nearness nor enter into the city of contentment and resignation save only a few

God is the state of that wealthy one whose wealth preventeth him not from the Everlasting Kingdom and depriveth him not of the Eternal Possessions

Verily I declare by the Greatest Name that the light of that wealthy one shall illumine the people of Heaven as the sun shines upon the people of the earth.

O ye who are wealthy on earth! The poor among ye are My Trust Therefore guard My Trust and be not wholly occupied with your own ease

Purge thyself from the dross of wealth and with perfect peace step into the paradise of poverty thus shalt thou drink the wine of Immortality from the fountain of death

Rejoice not if fortune smile upon thee and if humility overtake thee —mourn not because of it for in their time they both shall cease and be no more

Wert thou to see the Immortal Kingdom, verily thou wouldest abandon the mortal possessions of earth yet there is a wisdom in the former being concealed and in the latter being manifest and this is known only to hearts that are pure

OF WORK AND FRUITFULNESS

Ye are the trees of My Garden , ye must bear fresh and beautiful fruits, that ye and others may be profited by them. Therefore it is necessary for ye to engage in arts and business

This, O possessors of intellect, is the means of attaining wealth. Affairs depend upon means, and the blessing of God will appear therein and will enrich ye. Fruitless trees have been and will be only fit for fire.

O My Servant ! The lowest of men are those who bear no fruit upon the earth , they are indeed counted as dead. Nay, the dead are preferred in the Presence of God before those who are indolent and negligent.

O My Servant ! The best of people are they who gain by work, and spend for themselves and their kindred in the love of God, the Lord of the creatures.

The principle of faith is to lessen words and to increase deeds. He whose words exceed his acts, know verily, that his non-being is better than his being, and death better than his life.

OF OBEDIENCE

The principle of religion is to acknowledge what is revealed by God, and to obey the laws established in His Book.

The source of all good is trust in God obedience to His Command and satisfaction in His Will

O Son of Existence ! Keep My Commands for love of Me and deny thyself thine own desires if thou wishest My Pleasure

Neglect not My Laws if thou lovest My Beauty and forget not My Counsels if thou art hopeful to attain My Will

O Son of Man ! If thou run through all immensity and speed through the space of Heaven thou shalt find no rest save in obedience to Our Command and in devotion before Our Face

Magnify My Command that I may reveal to thee the secrets of greatness and illumine thee with the Lights of Eternity

Be submissive to Me that I may descend to thee and serve My Cause that thou mayest be victorious in Me

Ponder over thy condition and be thoughtful in action Dost thou prefer to die upon thy bed, or to be martyred in My Path upon the dust to be a Manifestation of My Command and an expression of My Light in the Highest Paradise ? Discern justly O My Servant

OF PRIDE

Divest yourselves from the garment of pride and lay aside the robe of haughtiness

I declare by My Beauty that I have created

ye all from the dust, and to dust shall I turn ye again

O Sons of Pride ! For a few days' mortal reign ye have rejected My Immortal Dominion, and are arraying yourselves in robes of scarlet and gold and boasting of this I declare by My Beauty that I will bring ye all together under the uncoloured tent of dust, and will efface the colours of all , save those who choose My Colour, which is pure from all colour

Verily, man is uplifted to the heaven of glory and power through Meekness , again, through Pride is he degraded to the lowest station

OF COMPANIONSHIP

The company of the wicked increaseth sorrow , and the fellowship of the righteous removeth the rust of the mind

He who desires to associate with God, let him associate with His Beloved , and he who desires to hear the Word of God, let him hear the words of His chosen ones

Walk not with the wicked and confederate not with him , for the companionship of the wicked changeth the Light of Life into fire of remorse

If thou seekest the attainment of the Holy Spirit, be a companion of the noble , for the righteous have quaffed from the Chalice of Immortality passed by the hand of the Cup-Bearer

of Eternity and they quicken and illumine the hearts of the dead as doth the true morn

O Friend! In the garden of the heart plant only flowers of Love Esteem the friendship of the just but withdraw both mind and hand from the company of the wicked

OF THE BELOVED AND HIS BEAUTY

What lover seeks to dwell save in the Home of The Beloved? What seeker can repose far from the Deared One?

A sincere lover finds life in the presence of The Beloved and dies in separation His breast is void of patience and his heart is beyond endurance He forsakes a hundred thousand lives and hastens to the Mount of The Beloved

Only one step separates thee from the plane of Nearness and the Exalted Tree of Love Plant the first foot and, with the other step into the Kingdom of Eternity and enter the Pavilion of Immortality Then hearken to what has descended from the Sea of Glory

Pass by the low degrees of fancy and soar to the heights of Certainty Open the eye of Truth that thou mayest behold the Radiant Beauty and say Blessed be God the Most Excellent of Creators!

Listen truly Mortal eye shall never perceive the Everlasting Beauty and the dead mind

delights only in lifeless clay , for like sees like
and has affinity with its own kind

Be blind, that thou mayest behold My Beauty.
Be deaf, that thou mayest hear My Sweet Melody
and Voice Be ignorant, that thou mayest enjoy
a portion from My Knowledge Be poor, that
thou mayest obtain an everlasting share from
the sea of My Eternal Wealth

Be blind, that is, to all save My Beauty Be
deaf, that is, to all except My Word Be ignorant,
that is, of all but My Knowledge Thus shalt
thou enter My Holy Presence with pure eyes,
keen ears, and a mind undimmed

Close one eye and open the other Close the
one to the world and all that is therein , and
open the other to the Holy Beauty of The
Beloved

Be not satisfied with the beauty that is mortal ,
discarding the Eternal Beauty , and attach not
thyself to the world of clay.

O Son of Passion ! The people of wisdom and
insight struggled for years, and failed to attain
to the meeting of the Exalted One , while thou
hast arrived at home without hastening, and
hast attained the goal without searching

Yet, after gaining these, thou wert so veiled
with thyself that thine eyes did not behold the
Beauty of The Beloved, and thy hand did not
reach to the Hem of the Friend's garment
Marvel at this, O possessors of insight

O My Friend by Word! Reflect a little! Hast thou ever heard of the beloved and the stranger dwelling in the same heart? Therefore send away the stranger so that The Beloved may enter His Home

If thou desirest Me desire no other than Me If thou seekest My Beauty withdraw thy glance from the people of the world for My Will and the will of another are like fire and water which cannot be contained in the same mind and heart

Break the cage and like unto the bird of love soar into the atmosphere of holiness, leave the self and rest with heavenly souls upon the sacred plain of God.

Walk ye in the path of the good pleasure of The Friend. His good pleasure is ever in His creatures That is —a friend should not enter the home of his friend without his good pleasure nor interfere with his possessions nor prefer his desire to that of his friend nor seek preference in any condition. Consider this, O ye people of thought

Alas! Alas! O Lovers of Passion! With the swiftness of lightning ye have left the Spiritual Beloved, and to Satanic thoughts have ye attached your minds Ye worship fancy and call it a fact ye are gazing at a thorn and call it a flower

Not an unselfish breath have ye breathed, nor hath a breeze of self-denial come from the garden of your hearts.

Ye have cast to the winds the merciful Counsels of The Beloved, have effaced them from the tablet of your minds, and have become as low animals feasting in the pastures of lust and desire

Why are ye heedless of the remembrance of The Beloved ? and why are ye far from the Presence of The Friend ? The Absolute Beauty is established upon the Throne of Glory, under the Peerless Canopy, while ye are engaged in contention according to your own desire

The fragrances of holiness are wafted, and the breezes of generosity are blowing, but ye have lost the power of scent, and are bereft of them all. Alas for you, and for them who follow in your steps and walk after your ways !

O Heedless Ones ! Think not that the mysteries of hearts are concealed, nay, rather know with certainty that they are inscribed in clear type, and are openly manifest in The Presence.

Truly, I say, all that ye have concealed in your hearts is before Us, clear, manifest and open as the day, but the cause of concealment is from Our Generosity and Mercy, not from your merit

O Son of Man ! I have shed a dew from the past Ocean of My Mercy upon the dwellers of the world, and have found none approaching, because all have attached themselves to the impure water of wine, and have left the immortal, delicate Wine of Unity, they have turned from the Chalice of the Immortal Beauty, and have

been content with the mortal cup "Evil is that with which they are contented!"

Close not thine eye to the peerless Wine of the Eternal Beloved and open not thine eye to the turbid and mortal wine

Take immortal cups from the hand of the Cup-bearer of Oneness and thou shalt become all consciousness and hear the inaudible Utterance of Reality Say O worthless ones! Why have ye turned from My Eternal, Holy Wine to mortal water?

How is it that thou wilt not touch thine own garment with hands soiled by sugar while with thy mind soiled by the filth of passion and lust thou seekest companionship with Me and desirest to be directed to the dominions of My Holiness? Alas! alas! for that which ye have desired!

Thou art like a jewelled sword concealed in a dark sheath, by reason of which its value is unknown to the jewellers Come forth from the sheath of self and desire that thy jewels may become open and manifest before the world.

Guidance hath ever been by words but, at this time it is by deeds That is all pure deeds must appear from the temple of man, because all are partners in words but pure and holy deeds belong especially to Our friends Strive with your life to be distinguished among all people by deeds Thus we exhort ye

O Son of Desire! How long fliest thou in the

atmosphere of self ? I have granted thee wings that thou mightest soar in the holy atmosphere of realities, and not in the air of Satanic fancies I favoured thee with a comb, that thou mightest comb the locks of My Head and not to wound My Throat

The bride of wonderful Significances, who was concealed behind the veils of words, hath appeared through Divine Providence and Heavenly Bounties, like unto the radiance of the Beauty of The Beloved

I testify, O Friends, that the Bounty has become complete, the Evidence is accomplished, the Argument manifested, and the Reason affirmed

What will your endeavours show forth from the degrees of devotion ?

The source of Love is to advance to The Beloved and to abandon all else save Him, and to have no hope save His will

No peace is ordained for thee save by departing from thyself and coming to Me ! Verily, thy glory should be in My Name, not in thy name, thy trust upon My Countenance, not upon thine own, for I will to be loved above all that is

My Love is My Fortress Who enters therein is rescued and safe, whoever turns away from it is led astray and perishes

God, singly and alone, abideth in His Own Place, which is Holy above space and time,

mention and utterance sign description and definition height and depth

O my God! O my God! Adorn the heads of Thy chosen ones with the crown of Love and their temples with the garniture of virtue

(Supplication) O my God! Make Thy Beauty to be my food and let Thy Presence be my drink. Let my trust be in Thy Will and my deeds according to Thy Command

Let my service be acceptable to Thee and my action a praise to Thee Let my help come only from Thee and ordain my home to be Thy Mansion, boundless and holy

Thou art the Precious the Ever Present the Loving O Thou My Beloved! Grant unto me Thy Sign of Assurance to guard me from the doubts of the wandering Thou art my Helper the Powerful the Mighty

OF KNOWLEDGE

The root of all knowledge is the knowledge of God Glory be to Him! Knowledge is impossible save through His Manifestation

O My Brother! Hear My Beautiful Words from My Sweet Tongue and drink the Water of Life from the Fountain of My Lips Sow the seeds of My Innate Wisdom in the pure ground of the heart and water it with conviction then the flower of My Knowledge and Wisdom shall

spring up verdantly in the holy sanctuary of the heart

Sow the seeds of knowledge and wisdom in the fertile grounds of the mind, and conceal them there until the hyacinth of Divine Wisdom springs up in the heart and not in the clay

Drink the wine of Significancies from the Lips of the Merciful, and behold the radiance of the light of the Sun of Explanation, without veil or cover, from the Dawning-Place of the Word of God

Spread the seeds of My Immediate Wisdom in the fertile soil of the heart and water it with the water of certainty, thus shall the hyacinths of My Knowledge and Wisdom spring up and flourish

The progress of man depends upon faithfulness, wisdom, chastity, intelligence, and action. He is ever degraded by ignorance, lack of faith, untruth and selfishness

Verily, man is not called man until he be imbued with the attributes of The Merciful. He is not man because of wealth and adornment, learning and refinement. Blessed is he who is free, seeking the shore of the Sea of Purity and loving the melody of the dove of Virtue

In this day all must serve God with purity and virtue. The effect of the word spoken by the teacher depends upon his purity of purpose. Some are content with words, but the truth of

words is tested by deeds and dependent upon life

Deeds reveal the station of the man The words must be according to what has proceeded from the Mouth of the Will of God.

O my God ! O my God ! Unite the hearts of Thy servants and reveal to them Thy Great Purpose May they follow Thy Commandments and abide in Thy Law Help them O God in their endeavour and grant them strength to serve Thee O God leave them not to themselves but guide their steps by the light of knowledge and cheer their hearts by Thy Love

OF ONENESS

My Eternity is My creation. I have created it for thee My Oneness is My design I have designed it for thee therefore clothe thyself with it Thus thou mayest be a star of My Omnipresence for ever

Alas ! that a hundred thousand ideal languages are spoken by One Tongue and that a hundred thousand hidden meanings are unfolded in One Melody and there is no ear to hearken nor any heart to perceive a single letter !

Let the people of Certainty know that a new Garden has appeared in the Open Court of Holiness and that all the people of the Heights and the temples of the Exalted Heaven are around it

Endeavour to reach that station and discover the truths of the mystery of Love from its blossoms, and unveil abundant knowledge of the Oneness from its eternal fruits. Radiant are the eyes of him who has entered therein with trust.

O Dead Men on the Bed of Negligence ! Centuries have passed, and ye have ended your precious lives, yet not a single breath of purity hath ever come from ye to Our Holy Presence. Ye are drowned in the sea of polytheism while talking of Oneness.

Oneness, in its true significance, means that God alone should be realised as the One Power which animates and dominates all things, which are but manifestations of its energy.

FROM THE BOOK OF THE COVENANT

“ In wealth fear is concealed and peril is hidden. Behold, and then reflect upon that which The Merciful One hath revealed in the Koran, — “ Woe unto every maligner and backbiter who heapeth up riches and counteth them over ” There is no continuance in the riches of this world, that which is subject to mortality and undergoeth a change, hath never been and is not worth regarding.

O People of the World ! I enjoin ye to that which is the means of the elevation of your station. Hold to the virtue of God, and grasp the hem of that which is just.

Verily I say the tongue is for mentioning that which is good pollute it not with evil speech God hath forgiven ye that which is past hereafter ye must all speak that which is befitting avoid execration reviling and that which is aggravating to man The station of man is high

The station of man is great if he holds to reality and truth and if he be firm and steadfast in the Commands The true man appeareth before the Merciful One like unto the heavens his sight and hearing are the sun and moon his bright and shining qualities are the stars his station is the highest one his traces are the educators of existence

Every believer who hath found the Perfume of the Garment in this day and turneth with a pure heart towards the Supreme Horizon he is mentioned as one of the followers of Baha on the Red Page (the Red Page means the station of martyrdom and is the highest)

O People of the World! The Creed of God is for love and union make it not to be a cause of discord and disunion In the sight of the men of discernment and those who are holding to the Manifestation that which is the means of preservation and the cause of the ease and tranquillity of the Servants is revealed from the Supreme Pen but the ignorant of the earth who are fostered in ambition and lust are heedless of the matured Wisdom of the True Wise One,

and are speaking and working in imaginations and fancies

O Saints of God and His Loyal Ones ! Kings are the appearances of power and the daysprings of the Might and Wealth of the True One Pray on their behalf, for the government of the earth is ordained to those souls, but the hearts He hath appointed for Himself

He hath forbidden dispute and strife, with an absolute prohibition This is the Command of God, in this greatest Manifestation, and He hath preserved it from any order of annulment and hath adorned it with the ornament of confirmation. Verily, He is the All-Knowing and the All-Wise

It is incumbent upon all to aid those souls who are the daysprings of authority and the dawning-points of command, and who are adorned with the ornament of equity and justice Blessings be upon the princes and the learned ones These are My trusted ones amongst My Servants ; these are the rising-points of My Commandments amongst My creatures Upon them be My Glory, My Mercy, and My Grace, which have surrounded all existence

O Servants ! Make not the causes of order to be the causes of confusion, and make not the reason of union to be the occasion of dispute This exalted Word resembles water for extinguishing the fire of hatred and animosity, which is deposited in all minds and hearts.

The different creeds will attain the Light of real Union through the simple Word. Verily He saveth the Truth and guideth in the Path and He is the Powerful the Mighty and the Wonderful.

TRUE BELIEF

The Guidance of God is that which will always guide people in the right way.

All human beings are earthly their hearts are connected with this world Day and night their thoughts and occupations are earthly all belong to this world They think about the honour of this world or about the riches and wealth of this world or of name and fame in this world Their days and nights pass in this way.

The Guidance of God makes it evident and plain when the Way of the Kingdom the Divine Path is opened that this is the road of the Kingdom.

It is not sufficient only to distinguish the Way of the Kingdom—only to discover the Heavenly Way—you must travel upon it until the end is reached For example—that a man discovers the way to America is not sufficient He must travel in it that he may reach that country otherwise if he remain for years discovering more about the way and does not travel by it he will never arrive.

It is not sufficient for a child to know where the school is, he must study in it, that he may gain knowledge. Faith is not merely to know which is the school, and to recognise the teacher; but one must acquire knowledge in this school. If one does not gain knowledge, it is useless to know of the school.

This is what Christ said: "Ye shall know the tree by its fruits."

If you see one who is truthful, who really believes and is just, who is attracted to the kingdom and whose will is annihilated in the Way of God, then you will know that he is a tree of the Kingdom, if he shows forth all these qualities.

If you see one whose heart is attached to this world, and in whom there is no truthfulness or detachment, or turning to God, one who is not occupied in praising and speaking of God, or in attraction to the Love of God—then you will know that he is a tree of darkness.

True belief is not only to acknowledge the Oneness of God. By belief we mean that the reality of a man will be characterised by Divine characteristics. If his reality is dark, he will become enlightened. If he is heedless he will become conscious, if he is sleeping, he will be awakened, if he is earthly, he will become heavenly, if he is Satanic, he will become Divine. This is the meaning of true belief.

Therefore, I say that man must travel in the

Way of God Day and night he must endeavour to become better his belief must increase and become firmer his good qualities and his turning to God must be greater the fire of his love must flame more brightly Then day by day he will make progress

For to stop advancing is the means of going back The bird when he flies soars over higher and higher All the time he endeavours to mount higher for as soon as he stops flying he will come down

Every day in the morning when arising you should compare to-day with yesterday and see in what condition you are If you see your belief is stronger, and your heart more occupied with God and your love increased and your freedom from the world greater then thank God and ask for the increase of these qualities You must pray and repent for all that you have done which is wrong and you must implore and ask for help and assistance that you may be better than yesterday so that you may continue to make progress

Do not let the desires of the self find a place within you for it is certain that even when you reach the highest state of spirituality one worldly desire can cause your downfall

The spirit is like a bird when it flies in the air it is always mounting, but the self is like the hunter who is thinking how to catch the

bird You will see that by one arrow, one shot, it will be brought low

This arrow is the connection with this world , the occupations of this world , the desires of this world , the honours of this world

In many ways the hunter will stop the spirit from ascending That is why you must ask and implore and entreat, " O God ' protect me from myself ' "

ABDUL-BAHA ABBAS

THE COMMANDS OF THE BLESSED MASTER ABDUL-BAHA

AS REVEALED IN TABLETS AND INSTRUCTIONS
FOR THE BELOVED IN AMERICA

" To live the life

To be no cause of grief to any one

To love each other fully

To be kind to all people and to love them with a pure spirit

Should opposition or injury happen, we must bear it and be kind, and, through all, we must love the people Should calamity exist in the greatest degree, we must rejoice, for these things are the Gifts and Favours of God

To be silent concerning the faults of others , to pray for them , and help them, through kindness, to correct their faults.

To look always at the good and not at the bad. If a man has ten good qualities and one bad one we must look at the ten and forget the one. And if a man has ten bad qualities and one good one we must look at the one and forget the ten.

To never allow ourselves to speak one unkind word about another even though that other be our enemy. To rebuke those who speak to us of the faults of others.

All of our deeds must be done in kindness.

To be occupied in spreading the Teachings for only through obedience to this Command our Master has said will we receive the power and confirmation of the Spirit and that whosoever is granted this power and confirmation of the Spirit is under the favour of God but otherwise he is as a lamp without light. The Master has also said that "I very soon cast in this great and magnificent period will be cultivated by God and produce plants through the abundance of the clouds of His Mercy."

To cut our hearts from ourselves and from the world.

To be humble.

To be servants of each other and to know that we are less than any one else.

To be as one soul in many bodies for the more we love each other the nearer we shall be to God but that our love our unity our

obedience, must not be by confession but of reality

To act with caution and wisdom,

To be truthful

To be hospitable

To be reverent

To be a cause of healing for every sick one , a comforter for every sorrowful one , a pleasant water for every thirsty one , a Heavenly Table for every hungry one , a guide for every seeker , rain for cultivation , a star to every horizon , a light for every lamp , a herald to every yearning one for the Kingdom of God.

Our Blessed Master said

‘ By these things you know the faithful servant of God ’ ”,

THE WISDOM OF THE EAST SERIES

Edited by L. CRANMER BYNG and Dr S. A. KAPADIA



THE SERIES AND ITS PURPOSE

THE object of the Editors of this Series is a very definite one. They desire above all things that, in their humble way, these books shall be the ambassadors of good will and understanding between East and West—the old world of Thought and the new of Action. In this endeavour and in their own sphere they are but followers of the highest example in the land. They are confident that a deeper knowledge of the great ideals and lofty philosophy of Oriental thought may help to a revival of that true spirit of Charity which neither despises nor fears the nations of another creed and colour.

NEW VOLUMES

In the Press

TAOIST TEACHINGS From the Mystical Philosophy of Leib
T'ai. Translated by LAUREL CHUNG, M. A. 1 set.

Just Out

ANCIENT JEWISH PROVERBS Compiled and Classified
by A. COHEN, late Scholar of Emmanuel College, Cambridge. 1 set.

THE FLIGHT OF THE DRAGON As I say on the Theory
and Practice of Art in China and Japan, based on Original Sources. By
LARRY CH. BRIDON. 1 set.

(Cont. and so)

LEGENDS OF INDIAN BUDDHISM Translated from
"L'Introduction à l'Histoire du Bouddhisme Indien" of Eugène Burnouf,
with an Introduction by WINIFRED STEPHENS 2/- net

THE BUSTÂN OF SADI From the Persian Translated
with Introduction by A HART EDWARDS. 2/- net

THE RUBÁ'YÁT OF HÁFIZ Translated with Introduction
by SYED ABDUL MAJID, LL D Rendered into English Verse by
L CRANMER BYNG 1/- net

THE ALCHEMY OF HAPPINESS By AI GHAZZALI
Rendered into English by CLAUD FIELD 2/- net

THE SINGING CARAVAN. Some Echoes of Arabian Poetry
By HENRY BAERLEIN 2/- net

THE WISDOM OF THE APOCRYPHA With an Intro-
duction by C E LAWRENCE, Author of "Pilgrimage," etc 2/- net

THE BURDEN OF ISIS Being the Laments of Isis and
Nephthys Translated from the Egyptian with an Introduction by JAMES
TEACKLE DENNIS 1/- net

THE MASTER-SINGERS OF JAPAN. Being Verse Trans-
lations from the Japanese Poets By CLARA A WALSH 2/- net

THE PATH OF LIGHT Rendered for the first time into
English from the Bodhi-charyāvatāra of Śānti Deva. A Manual of
Mahā-yāna Buddhism By L. D Barnett, M A, Litt D 2/- net

THE SPLENDOUR OF GOD Being Extracts from the Sacred
Writings of the Bahais With Introduction by ERIC HAMMOND 2/- net.

A LUTE OF JADE Being Selections from the Classical Poets of
China Rendered with an Introduction by L CRANMER BYNG 2/- net

THE CONFESSIONS OF AL GHAZZALI Translated for
the first time into English by CLAUD FIELD, M A 1/- net

THE HEART OF INDIA. Sketches in the History of Hindu
Religion and Morals. By L D BARNETT, M A, Litt D, Professor of
Sanskrit at University College, London 2/- net

THE BOOK OF FILIAL DUTY Translated from the Chinese of the Hsiao Ching by IVAN CRUX First Secretary to the Chinese Legation. 1/- net.

THE DIWAN OF ABUL ALA. By HENRY BAERLEIN
1/- net.

BRAHMA KNOWLEDGE; An Outline of the Philosophy of the Vedānta. As set forth by the Upanishads and by Sankara. By L. D. BARNETT M.A., Litt.D. Professor of Sanskrit at University College, London. 2/- net.

THE CONDUCT OF LIFE; or The Universal Order of Confucius. A translation of one of the four Confucian Books, hitherto known as the Doctrine of the Mean. By KU HUNG MIRO M.A. (Edin.). 1/- net.

THE TEACHINGS OF ZOROASTER Translated with Introduction by Dr S. A. KAPADIA, Lecturer University College London. 2/- net.

THE PERSIAN MYSTICS.

I. Jalālū d-dīn Rūmī. By F. HADLAND DAVIS. 2/- net.

II Jāmī By F. HADLAND DAVIS. 1/- net.

THE WAY OF THE BUDDHA. Selections from the Buddhist texts, together with the original Pali, with Introduction by HERBERT BAYNES, M.R.A.S. 2/- net.

THE SAYINGS OF CONFUCIUS A new Translation of the greater part of the Confucian Analects, with Introduction and Notes by LEONEL GILES, M.A. (Oxon.), Assistant in the Department of Oriental Books and Manuscripts of the British Museum. 2/- net.

MUSINGS OF A CHINESE MYSTIC. Selections from the Philosophy of Chuang Tzū. With Introduction by LEONEL GILES, M.A. (Oxon.), Assistant at the British Museum. 2/- net.

THE AWAKENING OF THE SOUL. From the Arabic of ISM TUVAİL. Translated with Introduction by P. UL BRÄNCKLE, Ph.D. 1/6 net.

THE RELIGION OF THE KORAN. With Introduction by
SIR ARTHUR N WOLLASTON, K C I E 1/- net

THE WISDOM OF ISRAEL Being Extracts from the
Babylonian Talmud and Midrash Rabbah. Translated
from the Aramaic with an Introduction by EDWIN COLLINS 1/- net

SA'DI'S SCROLL OF WISDOM By SHAIKH SA'DI. With
Introduction by Sir ARTHUR N WOLLASTON, K C I E 1/- net
With Persian Script added 2/- net

**THE INSTRUCTION OF PTAH-HOTEP AND THE
INSTRUCTION OF KE'GEMNI.** The Oldest Books in
the World Translated from the Egyptian with Introduction and
Appendix by BATTISCOMBE G GUNN 1/- net

THE ROSE GARDEN OF SA'DI. Selected and Rendered
from the Persian with Introduction by L. CRANMER BYNG 1/- net

THE CLASSICS OF CONFUCIUS

I The Book of History (Shu-King).
By W GORN OLD 1/- net

II The Book of Odes (Shi-King)
By L CRANMER BYNG 1/- net

THE SAYINGS OF LAO TZŪ From the Chinese Trans
lated with Introduction by LIONEL GILES, of the British Museum 1/- net

WOMEN AND WISDOM OF JAPAN With Introduction
by S TARAISHI 1/- net

ARABIAN WISDOM Selections and Translations from the
Arabic by JOHN WORTABET, M D 1/- net

THE DUTIES OF THE HEART. By RABBI BACHYE.
Translated from the Hebrew with Introduction by EDWIN COLLINS
Hollier Hebrew Scholar, U C L 1/- net

LONDON

JOHN MURRAY, ALBEMARLE STREET, W

BANERJEE RAVANESWAR—*contd* —BANERJEE SASI SEKHAR—BANERJEE
SUDHANSUKUMAR

- (b) Poverty of the students and in consequence want of sufficient and substantial food
- (c) Naturally weak state of health inc. publ. of bearing the strain
- (d) The strain is certainly not only great for those who are not robust but is telling badly on the robust ones also
- (e) Want of sufficient physical exercise to balance the mental labour

The following remedies are suggested —

- (i) There should be regular medical inspection of students both with regard to their physical defects as well as to their fitness for the strain imposed
- (ii) Hygiene should be made a compulsory course
- (iii) Taking the students at times to local hospitals wherever possible with a view to impress upon their minds what simple causes apparently negligible lead to what disastrous results
- (iv) Provision for proper and compulsory physical exercise under proper supervision.

BANERJEE SASI SEKHAR

The health and physical development of students are interfered with during their university career in Bengal. I have in my answer to question 18 mentioned some of the causes

Yes the present system of university education imposes a great strain upon the mind and body of students. The chief causes are as follows —

- (a) Bengali boys leave everything to be done at the last moment
- (b) They conserve their energy as if it were at other times to be used at the time of examinations
- (c) It is then that they keep unusually late hours and spend whatever time they have in reading alone at the sacrifice of their health.
- (d) The diversity of subjects of simultaneous study requiring equal concentration on each also demands an undue expenditure of energy
- (e) To these may be added the lengthiness or heaviness of some of the courses as for instance in mathematics at the intermediate and history, mathematics and philosophy at the degree stage
- (f) Some of the courses are so lengthy that a student of average intellect will take nearly three years to prepare

The first defect may be remedied by insisting upon regular hours in hostels. Rules may be framed that all students must rise from bed at a fixed hour in the morning say 6 A.M. and go to bed not later than half past ten at night. Steps should be taken for the enforcement of such rules by providing punishment for any infringement thereof. With regard to the second examination by compartments may be instituted at the degree stage and the third may be remedied by reducing the syllabus to a certain extent.

BANERJEE SUDHANSUKUMAR

Most of the students in Bengal neglect physical exercise during their university career. There is no reason for thinking that the present system imposes an undue mental and physical strain upon students who are not exceptionally robust. The reason why some of the students are physically weak must be attributed to the neglect of physical exercise and in some cases to residence in unhealthy quarters. To improve the health of such students better arrangements should be made for residence and physical exercise. The gymnasium attached to each institution requires a considerable amount of expansion and more than one instructor in physical exercise should be appointed for each institution. Arrangements should also be made for the instruction of elementary hygiene at the secondary school stage as suggested in reply to Question 17.

BANERJEE, UPENDRA NATH—BANERJI, The Hon'ble Justice SIR PRAMADA CHARAN—
BANERJI, UMACHARAN—BARDALOI, N. C.—BASU, P.

BANERJEE, UPENDRA NATH.

As regards the physical exercise of boys, it may be noticed here that gymnastic exercises which may sometimes lead even to accidents of a serious nature or to over-exhaustion ought to be avoided, if possible, and military drill substituted in its place. Mofussil students may follow Sandow's system with advantage to themselves.

School authorities, however, both in the mofussil and presidency towns, should, for the benefit of students, make ample provision for such first-class exercises as rowing, riding, running, swimming, cycling, etc., exercises, tending to develop most of the muscles of their body.

Periodical examinations ought to be held in these subjects to test the special skill of the boys in exercises, sports, and games, and prizes given accordingly for their encouragement.

Unseen passages given for explanation set in the matriculation and other examinations must not be too many in number or too difficult to explain.

BANERJI, The Hon'ble Justice SIR PRAMADA CHARAN.

My belief is that students in Bengal suffer in health during their university career and that there is too much strain on their delicate constitutions. I fear too much is required from them and they do not get time for physical exercise and manly sports.

BANERJI, UMACHARAN.

My experience as to the health and physical development of students during their university career in Bengal is really very sad. I have every reason for thinking that the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students who are not exceptionally robust. In addition to the remedies suggested in my answer to question 17, the following may be mentioned—

- (a) The pressure of text-books prescribed for various university examinations should be somewhat relaxed without lowering the standard both of teaching, as well as examinations.
- (b) Cram should be strongly discouraged by the adoption of better methods of instruction and examination, as pointed out in my answers to questions 5, 9, 10, 11, etc.

BARDALOI, N. C.

Calcutta is responsible for the dyspepsia of students on account of its adulterated foodstuffs and sweets. More than that, the erratic hard work for three months before the examination tells upon their health.

Change in the timing and method of examinations will remedy this defect to some extent.

BASU, P.

The health and physical development of students during their university career in Bengal suffer more from the bad diet and the insanitary surroundings than from the strain of university life. Under the present system, the strain during the university career may be materially reduced without reducing the standard of efficiency or introducing any radical change. If the examination that is held at the end of a two years' course be split up into two, and the more general portion of the course be selected for examination at the end of the first year and the rest of it examined at

BASI P—could—BASU SATYENDRA NATH—Bengal Landholders Association Calcutta—
Bethune College Calcutta

the end of the second I think the strain on the mind and body of the student would be materially reduced. On the whole the student would be in possession of the same knowledge as now but the test by examination being divided the severity of work at each examination would be considerably reduced. At Cambridge Part I and Part II examinations are so divided. This system would make students work moderately throughout the two years instead of compelling them to put in their supremest effort towards the end of the second year only.

Again if a student fails to secure the pass marks in any one subject he is compelled to appear in all the subjects at the next examination no matter how high may be his marks obtained in them. This is unfair and entails an unnecessary strain on the student. This may be easily evaded by compelling him to appear in those subjects only at the next examination in which he has failed to secure a fixed number of marks which latter however ought to be a little higher than the ordinary pass marks. Thus if a student is efficient in any subject securing something more than the pass marks he would be exempt from appearing at the same.

Such supplementary examinations may be held more than once a year to avoid undue waste of time in mere waiting and thus prolonging unnecessarily the length of one's university career.

BASU SATYENDRA NATH

The health of the students is generally in an unsatisfactory condition—the reason apparently being insufficient food and the mental strain caused by a rigid system of examinations.

Bengal Landholders Association Calcutta

The present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon our student who are not exceptionally robust. The percentage of attendance at lectures is absurd. Having regard to the malarial condition of the country long class hours ought also to be discouraged.

At one time those who distinguished themselves at examinations used to be known by their wearing glasses and because of their physical weakness. There has been a change. The present generation of students are sturdier due to greater attention now being paid to physical exercise.

Bethune College Calcutta

All I have to add to question 17 is that the women students of the Bethune College admit the fact that every year of college life makes them weaker physically. In their opinion a girl studying for the matriculation is stronger than a girl in any subsequent year at college. From what I have so far noticed I think there is only too much truth in their estimation of the physical strength of the girl under graduate.

Such a state of things compares so unfavourably with the healthy happy strong woman under graduate of western lands that some immediate change is necessary.

I suggest the following as remedies—

- (a) Wider opportunities for outdoor exercise
- (b) Wider opportunities for intellectual intercourse with mature minds
- (c) A syllabus of examination and a method of examination which makes study a pleasure and an ever increasing delight as we find it in western lands.

This will only be obtained when the examination syllabus is radically altered as suggested above and is also based on Indian methods of thought and on Indian vernacular teaching with only such an admixture of western thought and methods as may enrich them.

BHANDARKAR, SH R G —BHATTACHARJEE MOHINI MOHAN

BHANDARKAR, Sir R. G.

I do not think that the health and physical development of students are injuriously affected by the strain that their studies impose upon them in the Bombay Presidency. There may be a few cases of weakly youths who have to give up their studies or put a stop to them prematurely. But the effect on the generality of students is not harmful

BHATTACHARJEE MOHINI MOHAN

It is almost everybody's experience in this country that university students suffer from ill-health, and it is generally believed that it is the unusual mental strain necessary for passing examinations that undermines the health of Bengali students. This belief has such a hold on people that sound health and a successful academic career cannot, in their opinion go hand in hand. I do not think that the university courses are too difficult for an average student or that unusually hard labour is necessary to cope with them. On the contrary, under the new regulations the courses for the intermediate and matriculation examinations have been considerably curtailed. The candidate for the first arts examination had to study about seven or eight subjects, while the I A or I Sc candidate has now got to study only five subjects. From the old matriculation syllabus also a good deal of difficult matter has been removed. The entrance students had to get up English text-books, but now-a-days there are no fixed text-books, and questions on grammar, translation, and composition alone are set. The present matriculation or intermediate course cannot, therefore, be said to be too difficult for the average student. I am rather of opinion that they have been rendered much easier by the new regulations and the high percentage of passes in recent years also shows this. Under the new regulations three papers are set in every subject in the B A examination instead of two papers under the older system, but students have now a wide choice, and alternative questions too, are set as a rule. The M A course is now more extensive than it was under the older system, but it is a two-years' course now-a-days, while, formerly, students used to appear at this examination after eighteen months', or, occasionally, after six months' preparation. The proportion of success in both these examinations, however, shows that the courses do not subject the candidates to any unusual mental strain.

While it is true that the courses are not too difficult for a student of average abilities, the fact still remains that very many students lose their health during their university career. The cause of this unfortunate phenomenon must be sought elsewhere. In my answer to question 1 I have said how students of this country work hard in preparing for examinations. This practice is almost universal amongst our students. They neglect their studies throughout the year and work almost day and night two or three months before their examination. Fifteen or sixteen hours' work is very common. There are students who stimulate their nerves with drugs and intoxicants and sit up almost the whole night. The multiplication of examinations in our university is an aggravation of this evil.

The question naturally arises why students are unmindful of their work except at the time of the examination. My experience is that they are not trained to regular, systematic, and intelligent work. The home-life of the ordinary middle-class gentleman of this country does not produce regular habits, and there is nothing in the college to create such habits in students by example or by advice. The staff of almost all colleges is small and the time of the lecturer and the principal is fully taken up with their daily teaching work. There are no tutors to look after students outside the class-room. Want of tutors is also responsible for the unsatisfactory progress of students in their subjects of study throughout the year. Many students cannot follow the lectures and experience great difficulties. But there are none to clear them up and help on their progress. The difficulties thus go on accumulating till they seem formidable, and students try to remove

BHATTACHARJEE MOHINI MOHAN—*contd*—BHATTACHARYA BRINDABAN C —
BHATTACHARYA BAIKUNTHA NATH—BHATTACHARYA HARIDAS

them all with one heroic effort just before the examination. If arrangements could be made for giving tutorial assistance to students and if the number of tests and university examinations could be diminished the strain on the nerves of students would grow less. Weekly exercises ought to be given and a record kept of the quality of these exercises. This would train up students into habits of regular and systematic study and prevent the accumulation of arrears.

BHATTACHARYA BRINDABAN C

Students living in hostels and boarding houses very frequently suffer from dyspepsia, liver complaints and various other internal disorders with which is also connected malaria. The reason for all this is to be found in the ill cooked food which they have to take owing to lack of supervision and the irresponsible and dirty cooks and also in their unchecked craving for bazaar sweets and delicacies as a result of the restriction or want of healthy outdoor exercise.

BHATTACHARYA BAIKUNTHA NATH

The health and physical development of students during their university career are generally satisfactory.

- (a) There should be a medical test for entrance into the University.
- (b) Arrangements should be made for periodical medical inspections of colleges and for applying remedies as suggested by the medical officer.
- (c) The courses of studies in some subjects should be reduced.
- (d) Physical exercises and games should be largely encouraged and if possible made compulsory.
- (e) The system of trying simultaneously for two post graduate degrees e.g. M.A. and B.L. should be abolished.

BHATTACHARYA HARIDAS

My impression is that a great majority manage to keep their health intact, but do not develop physically to any appreciable extent during their university career. This is due to the fact that the present system of university education totally neglects all physical considerations. I should suggest the following remedies—

- (a) An increased emphasis upon weekly and monthly records and the discontinuance of the test examination system except for those whose regular records are unsatisfactory.
- (b) Adoption of the *coir e system* up to the degree stage and the institution of optional examinations at the end of the first and the third years.
- (c) Exemption of students from further examination in a subject in which they have passed or at least secured a certain percentage of total marks.
- (d) The formation of a gymnasium in every college for non-boarders and the compulsory fitting up of a gymnasium in every attached hostel and mess for boarders.
- (e) Surprise visits to messes and hostels during mealtimes to test the quantity and quality of food given to boarders.
- (f) Insistence upon at least three meals every day in all hostels and messes.
- (g) A recurrent grant for inter-collegiate athletic sports.
- (h) Formation of a university volunteer corps.
- (i) Decentralisation of college education up to the intermediate standard and the foundation of a multiplicity of colleges in healthy districts.

BHATTACHARYYA, HARIDAS—*contd* —BHATTACHARYYA, Mahamahopadhyaya KALIPRASANNA—BHOWAL, GOVINDA CHANDRA—BISVAS, Rai DINANATH, Bahadur

- (j) *The establishment of a central child-welfare institute, with branches all over the province, to test school and college students physically and mentally and to advise guardians about the most advisable study or occupation for their wards. The physical test should be made at the beginning of every session and no student ought to be allowed to proceed to the University unless he can satisfy the institute about his physical fitness. The medical examination of college students might be done in collaboration with the doctors attached to the various college hostels.*
- (k) Periodical outings and excursions
- (l) Formation of swimming and rowing clubs in the various tanks of Calcutta
- (m) The modification of the present examination system which is too protracted in some cases
- (n) *The abolition of June examinations*—Examinations should not advance further into summer than April. If it be impossible to avoid June examinations the duration must not be more than four days. This will involve a division of the M. A. course as in the Allahabad University. I should personally prefer, however, the continuance of the present M. A. examination system (viz., eight papers at the end of the sixth year) and advocate an April examination.
- (o) *The foundation of a central infirmary for college students where cases would be treated free*
- (p) Each college should have a segregation ward for infectious cases among boarders, if possible, each hostel should have a segregation room

BHATTACHARYYA, Mahamahopadhyaya KALIPRASANNA

The health and physical development of students are not, generally speaking, good. They should have more leisure for healthy exercises, such as sports, walk, in the open air, etc.

BHOWAL, GOVINDA CHANDRA.

The present system does impose an undue physical or mental strain. The health and physical development of students are also affected because they are ill-fed in consequence of poverty. Some times they eat food which they ought not to eat and cannot get food which they ought to eat, as, for instance, milk. Neglect of physical exercise is, to a great extent, responsible for it. Neglect of studies for the rest of the year and too much strain at the time of the examination is also a cause.

BISVAS, Rai DINANATH, Bahadur.

My experience as to the health and physical development of students during their university career in Bengal is that they are deteriorating on account of the present system imposing an undue physical and mental strain upon those who are not exceptionally robust.

Physical training should be compulsory in schools and colleges and there should be compulsory examinations in physical exercises. Exemptions should be made in case of those students who are of delicate constitution and who are medically unfit.

These remedies, in conjunction with the slackening of the rigidity of examinations, will, I believe, go a great way to improve the physique and remove the undue mental strain of the students.

BOROOAH JNANADABHIRAM—BOSE B C—BOSE RAI CHUNILAL Bahadur

BOROOAH JNANADABHIRAM

I have no reason for thinking that the present system imposes an undue physical or mental strain upon students. On the other hand I have found the students under me to be cheerful willing and fairly strong physically. Most of them are sportsmen. They should, however, be given good food—they must not take bad food simply because it is cheap. The medical superintendent (it is presumed that there is one) should personally inspect the food occasionally.

BOSE B C

The health and physical development of the average Bengali student is indeed poor. And the present system does occasionally impose an undue strain on him.

Remedies may be found in reducing the strain and improving the health.

As to the former *a reasonable method of examining* (as hinted in my answer to question 9) would be found helpful both physically and mentally as obviating useless and unhealthy efforts at memorising.

As to the latter the following methods might be suggested —

- (a) *Amelioration of the sanitary condition of the province* which has of late become very sad and is largely responsible for the unsatisfactory physique of students. Efficient combating of malaria in particular would greatly help the situation.
- (b) *Provision of adequate wholesome diet* the lack of which has been steadily and awfully sapping the vitality of the people and especially of those engaged in brain work. Vigorous attempts I submit must be made to ensure a sufficient supply at a low price of *pure milk and milk preparations* (by preventing adulteration protecting the cows improving their breed etc.) and *the staple food of the people* (by preventing the slaughter and deterioration of ploughing bullocks by encouraging and helping scientific methods of agriculture by levying prohibitive duties to control the export of rice wheat etc. and so forth).
- (c) *Encouragement of physical exercise* drilling sports gymnastics etc. among student. Prizes for proficiency in these respects should be instituted and moreover these ought to be included among the optional subjects for the university examinations the marks secured being taken into account in determining the class or division of each examinee and in awarding scholarships.

NOTE—Many of the aforesaid measures are no doubt quite beyond the powers of the University itself—but they can surely be adopted on its behalf by Government if actuated by a spirit of warm support as suggested in my answer to question 14.

BOSE RAI CHUNILAL Bahadur

The health and physical development of Bengali students during their university career are generally poor. Their growth seems to be retarded during this period as has been found by actual investigation by Major McCay I.M.S. of the Calcutta Medical College. This is partly due to their food containing an insufficient proportion of protein elements partly to their aversion to take physical exercise in the open air and partly to their overwork for university examinations.

The present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain on our students. The remedy I would suggest is that there should be fewer university examinations.

BOSE, Rai CHUNILAL, Bahadur—*contd.* BOSE, G. C. BOSE, HARAKANTA BOSE, KHUDI
RAM—BOSE, Miss MRINALINI

I would do away with the intermediate examination in the case of both arts and science, and I would be satisfied with two examinations only for the medical, engineering, and law degrees, respectively, and, wherever possible, examinations should be by 'compartments.'

BOSE, G. C.

My experience is that the health and physical development of students during their university career are deteriorating owing to undue mental strain upon them. The remedies that suggest themselves to me are—

- (a) Reduction of the working period in colleges
- (b) Replacement of the mechanical system of teaching, which imposes undue strain upon the mind, especially on the memory, by a more intelligent system which appeals less to the memory and more to the intelligence
- (c) Assigning to examination its natural position as an instrument of education, thereby dethroning it from the dominant position which it has usurped.
- (d) Changing the medium of instruction from English to the vernacular of the province

BOSE, HARAKANTA

The health and physical development of many a student in Bengal are anything but satisfactory. The present system of university education imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon the generality of the students. Some remedy might be obtained by reducing the rigidity of the examination system, as suggested before, and by making suitable provision for healthy recreation.

BOSE, KHUDI RAM

Undue physical and mental strain is, undoubtedly, imposed by the annually or biennially recurring university tests upon our students, with their shattered health, particularly in the malaria-ridden districts of Lower Bengal. A potent antidote to this great evil is, to my mind, the relaxation of the rigidity of the university examinations by the very salutary provision of re-examining unsuccessful candidates only on those subjects of their study in which they happened to have been ploughed. Any educational reform, however, which would necessitate the detention of our boys or young men in the prime of their lives, for a number of years, in their country schools amidst most unhealthy surroundings (every Bengal village, and even town, being a hot-bed of malarial fever), cannot but be taken to be a suicidal move for obvious reasons. Their early migration to Calcutta and other healthy municipal districts or towns in overwhelming numbers unquestionably makes for "the greatest good of the greatest number." To stem the tide of this migration by arbitrary academic legislation, shall have the effect of decimating the poverty-stricken middle class families of Lower Bengal, at any rate, of their prospective props and mainstays in life. Education in the country districts of Lower Bengal, has to proceed *pari passu* with their sanitation in the interests of life and health.

BOSE, Miss MRINALINI F.

Physical exercise should be made compulsory for all as far as practicable.

BOSE RADHIKANATH

BOSE RADHIKANATH

The physical deterioration of the generality of students in Bengal during their university career is a subject of almost universal complaint and I believe there will be no difference of opinion among our educators on this point. During my ten years' service in the Education Department I have not found a large number of students enjoying perfectly sound health throughout their academic life. This may be due in some measure to the unhealthy climate of most of the villages and towns in the *mussoos* where our educational institutions are located. But the present system of education appears to be mainly in fault. The students' inordinate love of text and cram books, their excessive mental anxiety to pass the university examination, and their neglect of physical exercise are undoubtedly responsible to a large extent for their poor physique. We find as a matter of fact that the students who do best in their examinations are generally the weakest and most sickly.

The following are the remedies I have to suggest —

- (a) The introduction of the vernaculars as the media of instruction and examination in some subjects of study is likely to prove beneficial to the health of the student inasmuch as it will relieve them of a considerable amount of brain work which the present artificial system of forcing them to read and write in a foreign tongue necessarily involves.
- (b) The excessive mental strain at present imposed upon our young students may also be substantially reduced by reducing the rigidity of the examination system up to the intermediate stage of the University. My suggestion is that the University should undertake a formal examination of the matriculation and intermediate candidates in only some of the prescribed subjects—their proficiency in the others being judged by all-round school or college work. Before a candidate is admitted to the matriculation or intermediate examination the University may satisfy itself from his results in the weekly or *monthly examinations of his school or college that he has attained a certain standard of progress in those subjects in which no formal examination is to be held.*
- (c) Greater attention should be paid in our schools and colleges to the physical development of students. It is not enough to give them mere lectures on the benefits of physical exercise, but practical steps must be taken to ensure that every student regularly takes some form of physical exercise that may be congenial to him or specially suited to his constitution. What these steps should be is the problem for us to solve. There will of course be no difficulty in making physical exercise compulsory for those boys who reside in hostels under the immediate supervision of their teachers, but what are we to do in the case of the large number of students who live with their parents or guardians and over whose actions outside school hours the teachers have practically no control? There are many guardians in Bengal so far as my knowledge goes who do not attach due importance to the physical side of education and do not like that their boys should waste away much of their time in play. Since the guardians themselves are often so blind I think it is the duty of the University and Government to move in the matter and penalise the neglect of physical exercise on the part of students. I would suggest that the University should require the heads of all schools and colleges (at least up to the intermediate stage) to form a number of centres conveniently situated within the locality in which their students reside where the boys are to meet in the morning or evening and receive training under expert teachers in some specified kinds of sports and physical exercises *e.g.*

- (i) Swimming
- (ii) Rowing
- (iii) Gymnastics
- (iv) Football

BOSE, RADHIKANATH—*contd.*—BROWN, Rev A E—CHAKRAVARTI, BRAJALAL—
CHAKRAVARTI, CHINTAHARAN

- (v) Lawn-tennis
- (vi) Badminton
- (vii) Cricket
- (viii) Hockey
- (ix) Sandow's dumb-bell exercises
- (x) Running
- (xi) Riding
- (xii) Wrestling
- (xiii) Drill

Attendance at these classes should be compulsory, and there should be regular annual tests as in the case of other subjects. In order to be eligible for admission to a university examination every student should be required to produce a certificate from his head master or principal that he has passed the school or college tests in at least *two* of these courses. Government also should encourage physical exercise by making it known to the young men, as well as to their guardians that proficiency in athletics and sports will be specially taken into consideration in judging the claims of candidates for employment in every branch of public service.

I would earnestly invite the attention of the authorities to the necessity of adopting some such measures for the purpose of ensuring the physical development of our students which is now so sadly neglected.

BROWN, Rev A E.

We consider that the present system is too severe a mental and physical strain on a great number of students, involving as it does the memorising of practically the whole course. We believe that the change in the medium of instruction will be the most complete and satisfactory remedy.

CHAKRAVARTI, BRAJALAL

The present system injuriously affects the health and physical development of students. It is due to some extent to the mental strain caused by the present system and that can be relieved by introducing the vernacular as the medium of instruction, by improving the mode of teaching, and by reducing the number and the rigour of examinations. Other causes leading to physical deterioration are insufficiency of nutrition due to the poverty of the majority of students and absence of proper physical exercise, these latter can be avoided by providing suitable manual work which, while giving to students healthy exercise, may help them to secure the necessary subsistence.

CHAKRAVARTI, CHINTAHARAN

The present system of education and arrangements of school and college hours tell upon the health of students. They generally take a hasty meal and run to school and college to work in the midday heat. There they have to strain their nerves to pick up things through the medium of a language which they do not speak at home. It would do much good to the health of students, if they could work at school for three hours in the morning, return home to eat and digest their midday meal which is the main meal of the day, and resume their school work after three or four hours' rest. Under such an arrangement of school hours physical exercise might be made compulsory. These changes would, perhaps, considerably retard the spread of dyspepsia so largely complained of in Bengal now a-days. If the vernacular of students were the medium of instruction they would be relieved of a good deal of mental strain.

CHAKRAVARTI CHINTA HARAN—CHAKRAVARTI RAI MON MOHAN Bahadur—
CHAKRAVARTI VANAMALI

CHAKRAVARTI CHINTA HARAN

The health and physical development of students is more or less undermined during their university career owing to their severe mental strain neglect of physical exercise and insufficient food. Inattention to the ordinary laws of health is also an important cause. Physical exercise of some sort should be made compulsory. There should be a medical examination of students at the time of their admission to the college to ascertain their physical fitness and capacity to endure the strain of a college career. The heads of colleges, superintendents of hostels and messes and university inspectors should in consultation with guardians and medical officers insist on remedial measures in individual cases.

CHAKRAVARTI RAI MON MOHAN Bahadur

Bengal suffer largely from malarial and connected complaints. Consequently attention to health and physical development of students is vitally necessary. The present system of teaching and examination impose to some extent an undue mental strain. I would suggest that to allow some time after breakfast college classes should not begin before 11 A.M. and that they should be so arranged that after three continuous hours there may be a rest of half an hour or so.

Physical deterioration may be brought in about by want of sufficient nourishing food, of sufficient clothing in winter and of sufficient exercise or by the use of smoky badly lighted lamps. For exercise the college authorities should insist on every student joining in some sport or physical training class. The other causes are connected with poverty and can be remedied only by improvements in the home or mess life.

CHAKRAVARTI VANAMALI

The health and physical development of students generally do deteriorate during their university career. The university examinations impose too great a strain. I myself dream even now of the matriculation (entrance) examination in which I appeared twenty five years ago. It is a most unfortunate thing that monthly and weekly and even daily examinations are creeping into many colleges under the specious name of tutorial work.

The remedy is manifold.

- (a) Abolish the multiplicity of examinations. Many advocate the abolition of the intermediate examination for this reason.
- (b) Compel every student unless declared medically unfit to undergo physical training. No college should be affiliated to the University which has not got a properly equipped gymnasium and extensive playgrounds and a teacher of gymnastics and drill. The college authorities should be reminded that what is wanted is not expert players of football, hockey, etc. but that all students should take part in some college game or other. Football, hockey, cricket and *ha doo doo* should all be properly supervised and encouraged. It is desirable that professors who play these games should be in charge of game for which they might be given an additional allowance (like the hostel allowance given to superintendents of hostel).

There should be an annual exhibition of *sports* and *strength* by students of all colleges brought together for the purpose (inter collegiate tournament). The awarding of prizes and medals to successful teams and individuals and the cost of supervision, etc. should form a charge upon university revenues. These might be held alternately in Calcutta and in Dacca at present.

CHAKRAVARTI, VANAMATI *contd*—CHANDA, The Hon'ble Mr KAMINI KUMAR—
CHATTERJEE The Hon'ble Mr A C

The Calcutta colleges are the worst sinners as far as physical culture is concerned. The University should provide the colleges of Calcutta with half a dozen teachers of gymnastics and a well-furnished central gymnasium, where 3,000 people could have their exercise together. The University Institute might form the nucleus of such a gymnasium.

The Presidency College and such other Calcutta colleges as could afford to remove to the suburbs should immediately do so to provide for better opportunities of physical culture to students. The Presidency College buildings might then provide much needed room to the University for its higher work. The Madhab Babu's *bazar* grounds which already belong to the University might, in that case, furnish good courts for tennis, *hâ doo doo*, etc., to university students.

An immense number of students could not apply for enlistment in the Indian Defence Force for defective physical development, especially chest measurement. It should be the duty of the University to see that its students are not rendered physically unfit to defend their country and fight for the liberties of the Empire for want of physical culture.

Besides the inter-collegiate tournament advocated above there ought to be prizes in every college for proficiency in games and for possession of strength, *provided* such prizes be not given to any student who fails to pass his annual college or university examination.

- (c) The school and college classes should be held in the morning and in the evening and not at noon as at present. The principal meal of the day is taken in Bengal at about noon and as boys have to run to school with loaded stomachs, they lose health and often feel sleepy in school and college hours.
- (d) There should be a department under the University for the medical inspection of students. Lots of students are short-sighted, most of them are dyspeptics. The best doctors ought to be employed to find out a remedy. These doctors should be asked to point out real defects and not try to whitewash the existing system.
- (e) Underfeeding is one cause of ill-health. How to remedy it almost passes my comprehension. Simple, but substantial, food should be provided. Could not some colleges be established in areas where milk, *ghee* and meat might be had better and cheaper than in Calcutta?

CHANDA, The Hon'ble Mr. KAMINI KUMAR

The health of students is undermined and defective eyesight seems to be the rule.

Yes, it is a common belief that it is the present system which is the cause of the breakdown of the health of boys. Examinations should be simplified and subjects and books should be judiciously selected so as not to put a severe strain on them.

CHATTERJEE, The Hon'ble Mr A C

I believe that conditions are better now than when I was a student at Calcutta over twenty-five years ago. More attention is given to physique and to outdoor exercises. But there is plenty of room for improvement. If a good hostel system is organised students would live in healthier buildings and eat more nutritious food. I am of opinion that students in Calcutta "messes" often live on exceedingly poor diet.

The stress that is now laid on examinations, combined with the unsatisfactory method of teaching, leads to a student concentrating his labour during the three months just preceding an examination. This has always a deleterious effect on his physique and frequently leads to a permanent breakdown. If the examinations were more sensibly conducted, i.e., were directed to ascertaining power of thought, investigation, and expression, instead of merely testing the knowledge of the student, the latter would be compelled to work steadily all the year round and would not suffer either physically or mentally.

CHATTERJEE Rai LALITMOHAN Bahadur—CHATTERJEE RAMANANDA—CHATTERJEE Rai Bahadur SARAT CHANDRA—CHATTERJEE SATIS CHANDRA—CHATTERJEE SUNITI KUMAR

CHATTERJEE Rai LALITMOHAN Bahadur

The health and physical development of students in Bengal are generally below the mark. But they bring their physical inferiority with them when they enter college. It is not caused by the strain of studies. Only there is very little in their life at college which is calculated to make them robust. The best remedy is to reduce the rigidity of examination on the one hand and to make physical exercise compulsory on the other. The organising of a university corps which every student should be compelled to join is the best remedy that can be suggested for many of the evils and defects of modern student life in Bengal.

CHATTERJEE RAMANANDA

The present system does impose an undue physical and mental strain upon students who are not exceptionally robust. Some of the remedies have been suggested in the course of replies relating to examinations, courses of study, etc. Students should have more of the open air life. In many mofussil colleges it should be possible to hold open air classes during the dry months of the year. There should be a regular periodical medical inspection of school and college students and remedies suggested by the medical inspectors should be adopted. Games are good, but as only a small minority take part in them, all students should have other physical exercises according to their strength and needs.

Malnutrition and the use of adulterated foods undermine the health of students.

There should be inexpensive sanatoria for students in Darjeeling and other elevated places to which they can resort during the summer holidays.

The number of examinations should be reduced, e.g. in law and medicine. College examinations to test the fitness of candidates to appear at university examinations should be done away with. The record of class work suggested before to be kept in all colleges should enable the heads of colleges to judge of the fitness of their students.

CHATTERJEE Rai Bahadur SARAT CHANDRA

Not satisfactory but improving. The work for examinations is concentrated during certain months of the year and students slack during the rest. A more sensible arrangement for examinations which would be spread over the different parts of the year and a better system of teaching ought to remedy the defects.

University companies should be formed to join the defence forces. It will not only serve to improve the health of students but will also teach them the value of discipline and order.

CHATTERJEE SATIS CHANDRA

I do not think that the present system imposes an undue physical or mental strain upon all but exceptionally robust students. A student who possesses good health only may avoid undue mental strain by being regular in his studies and by taking daily physical exercise. Many students do indeed feel undue physical and mental strain but that is due more to the bad health and habits of the students themselves than to the course of studies prescribed for them.

CHATTERJEE SUNITI KUMAR

A student will ordinarily suffer by comparison with a young man whose avocation is other than purely intellectual because the strain on the mind of the former is bound

CHATTERJEE, SUNITI KUMAR—*contd* —CHATTERJI, MOHINI MOHAN—CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Justice SH ASUTOSH—CHAUDHURI, BHUBAN MOHAN

to be greater. In western universities this is compensated by ample provision for open air recreation, for physical exercise and by attempts to reduce the mental strain by all possible means. It is generally admitted that, student or no student, the health of the Bengali youth is deteriorating. The reasons are mainly economic, and nothing short of economic revolution will improve the hygienic condition of the country and its youth. The existing system of university education is not wholly bad as a system, but, placed as it is under many adverse circumstances, it does, in some cases impose an undue physical and mental strain. But I would not agree to a lowering of the standard or a general increase of the age-limit as a remedy. I think the remedy lies

- (a) In affording greater facilities for open-air recreation
- (b) In making some sort of physical exercise compulsory. The introduction of military drill and the system of cadet corps will go a great way to awake an interest in, and enthusiasm for, physical culture
- (c) In instituting examination by parts
- (d) In reducing considerably the obligatory percentage of attendance at lectures
- (e) In a better organised tutorial system which will make a student a steady worker and will do away with the necessity of going through extra strain in preparing for examinations
- (f) In a wider use of the vernaculars as a medium of instruction and examination. This would prevent the habit of cram in students who do not understand, and yet want to pass, their examinations

CHATTERJI, MOHINI MOHAN

I am not aware that the descendants of those who have already passed through the university suffer in health or physical development during their university career. Those coming from homes uninfluenced by higher education feel the strain of a marked change of environment, food, clothing, etc., especially when they have to support themselves or contribute materially towards their support by coaching students or by other similar occupations. The result is the same when they lodge in the houses of friends and relatives as dependants, with insufficient or unsuitable food and subject to other deleterious conditions. The principal remedy will be the separation of the employment question from university education and a prohibition of remunerative occupation by university students.

CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Justice SH ASUTOSH.

The present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon our students, who are not exceptionally robust. The percentage of attendance at lectures is absurd. Having regard to the malarial condition of the country long class hours ought also to be discouraged.

When I was a student those who distinguished themselves at examinations used to be known by their wearing glasses and because of their physical weakness. There has been a change. The present students are sturdier, due to greater attention now being paid to physical exercise.

CHAUDHURI, BHUBAN MOHAN

There is no doubt that the present system tells very seriously on the health of students, so much so that university graduates are so many physical and intellectual wrecks, the reason being that the scope of the subjects above the matriculation stage has been unusually widened and that students are to learn the subjects through a foreign language. The number and scope of the subjects should be such that they may be mastered in two years and some of the subjects should be taught and studied in the vernacular.

CHAUDHURY HEM CHANDRA RAY—CHAUDHURY The Hon ble Babu BROJENDRA KISHORE ROY—CHAUDHURY The Hon ble Nawab SYED NAWABALI Khan Bahadur—CHAUDHURY RAJ YATINDRA NATH

CHAUDHURY HEM CHANDRA RAY

A large section of students suffer from myopia dyspepsia and other ailments
Yes for remedies kindly see my answer to question 10

CHAUDHURY The Hon ble Babu BROJENDRA KISHORE ROY

Students in Bengal do not ordinarily enjoy strong health the causes seem to be the following —

- (a) The climate of Bengal perhaps is not very invigorating and there is no proper language and the necessity for learning too many unnecessary matters imposed by the long courses and multiplicity of subjects of study and the mode enforcing observance thereof either at homes or in boarding houses or schools
- (b) The necessity for learning everything through the medium of a foreign language and the necessity for learning too many unnecessary matters imposed by the long courses and multiplicity of subjects of study and the mode of the university examinations and the general poverty of our students all combine to put a strain upon our boys under which the health of those who do not enjoy robust physique breaks down very often before they finish their university careers

One of the main causes of the ruin of the health of our students is the departure from the old practice of holding classes in the morning At present students attend their classes during the hot hours of the day they go to their classes just after they have eaten a hasty meal which by custom is the principal meal of the day

The remedy lies in the removal of the above remediable defects and in encouraging healthy physical exercise and physical development under methods suited to our climate and to the natural health of individual students and in the adoption of modes of living suggested in reply to question 17 The medical inspection of students is a great necessity

CHAUDHURY The Hon ble Nawab SYED NAWABALI Khan Bahadur

A large percentage of students in Bengal have weak health during their university career This is due to the present system which imposes an undue mental strain on them—to the unsatisfactory features of which such as inadequate teaching the university degrees being considered as passports to Government service and the consequent nervous cramming of the students sitting late into the night and neglecting their health for examination purposes and others attention has been drawn in the answers to the foregoing questions The remedy lies in the examinations being made tests of general proficiency and not of memorising faculty Also I may suggest in this connection that there should be a change in the time of work in schools and colleges To hold classes as at present soon after breakfast in the mornings and after lunch in the afternoons not infrequently interferes with the digestive system of the students and consequently renders them dyspeptic I would therefore recommend that the colleges and schools at least those situated in places where the student population remains in close vicinity to the institutions should hold their classes from 7 to 10 A M and from 2 30 to 4 30 P M

CHAUDHURY RAJ YATINDRA NATH

The present system to a great extent destroys the health and physical development of our students I ascribe this to the following two main causes —

- (a) Multiplicity of examinations

CHAUDHURI, Rai YATINDRA NATH—*contd*—CHOWDHURI, DHIRENDRANATH—CROHAN,
Rev Father F—CULLIS, Dr C E—DAS, Rai BHUPATINATH, Bahadur—DAS,
BHUSAN CHANDRA, and RAY, BAIKUNTHA CHANDRA

- (b) The language difficulty imposed upon our students, because they are required to master a very difficult foreign language to learn practically everything which they wish to learn.

Remove these two difficulties and I am sure that as day follows night the health of our students will improve and they will no longer be so many physical wrecks when they leave their colleges

CHOWDHURI, DHIRENDRANATH

I have every reason to think that the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon average students as they aim at the passing of the examination, and not the accumulation of real knowledge. Moreover, those who do not want knowledge are forced into it as the realisation of the object they aim at lies through it. If the paths were bifurcated the question of strain would not arise. At least the strain would be minimised to a large extent.

CROHAN, Rev Father F

The existing evils are, in some measure, due to the poverty of students. Hence, higher fees would help to minimise them while better scholarships would, in some measure, remove the dangers in the case of such poor students as can profit by university studies.

CULLIS, Dr C E

When I was stationed at the Sibpur Engineering College, which is a residential college just outside Calcutta, I noticed a very marked improvement in the physique of the Indian students during their college career, notwithstanding the unhealthiness of the site. This is not to be seen amongst students in Calcutta. Generally speaking, one does not notice any decided deterioration, but certainly not the improvement which there should be.

The advanced examinations, undoubtedly, impose a very great strain on students, which is often excessive when they are not particularly strong. It seems necessary that this should be borne. The only remedy is to make the curricula much less extensive, concentrating attention on the training of the faculties. To cover the same ground it would then be necessary to divide the present subjects into sections, spreading them over a greater number of years.

DAS, Rai BHUPATINATH, Bahadur

I do not think the present system ought to impose a heavy physical strain on students. Students get plenty of holidays and vacations. If they work regularly during the whole of the course they may get it up easily, but I think the majority of students neglect their studies at other times and work very hard before examinations. The strain imposed on them becomes heavy on this account.

DAS, BHUSAN CHANDRA, and RAY, BAIKUNTHA CHANDRA

We have seen the health of many students impaired by their university career.

- (a) Care should be taken that nutritious food is given at the hostels.

DAS BHUBAN CHANDRA and RAI BAIJUNTHA CHANDRA—*contd*—DAS DR KEDARNATH
—DAS SARADAPRASANNA—DAS GUPTA KARUNA KANTA—DAS GUPTA SUPENDRA
NATH

- (c) No student should be allowed to work unusually hard at any time during his college life
- (d) Some kind of physical exercise will be made compulsory
- (e) Examinations generally cause a great mental strain

DAS DR KEDARNATH

The health and physical development of students during their university career in Bengal has certainly been bad due to the fact that they take the examinations too seriously and therefore overwork themselves while at the same time they are badly fed and badly housed owing to the inherent poverty of the majority of them. Perhaps the present system has no direct influence in imposing an undue physical or mental strain upon students but indirectly it does so for the reasons stated above. Parents and guardians do not realise the evil influence of overstraining and encourage rather than discourage overstraining on the part of their wards by expecting them to pass an examination even at the sacrifice of their health and constitution. The remedy is to remove the cause or causes.

DAS SARADAPRASANNA

The present system imposes an undue physical strain upon students.

The remedy is to simplify the B A and B Sc courses and to disallow the present practice of simultaneous study for the M A (or M Sc) and the B L degrees. The course for the B A (or B Sc) honours degree should consist of one honour subject (six papers), one subsidiary pass subject (one paper), English (two papers) and vernacular composition (one paper).

DAS GUPTA KARUNA KANTA

Very little is at present being done to foster or encourage physical training. Merely possession of a playground by a school or a college for the purpose of games in which only a limited number of sports-loving students do participate does not conduce to the proper physical development of students in general unless daily physical exercise on approved scientific lines be made compulsory. There are now too many shirkers and too many of our students therefore sink almost to the verge of physical collapse for want of proper and regular bodily exercise. Formal compulsory physical training must be placed in the hands of such educated men as understand the purpose of the exercises which they teach and have real appreciation of the principles underlying their work.

DAS GUPTA SURINDRANATH

The reasons why the present system of administration of education has an injurious effect upon the health of the students may be classified as follows—

- (a) The strain of examinations and their frequency in the shape of periodicals, circles, tests, half-yearly and annual. Their importance and frequency should be diminished.
- (b) The present system of delivering lectures just after the midday meal is the cause of at least half the cases of dyspepsia and other diseases. I should like that the hours of study be regulated as was the case with the old Hindu system of training, i.e. a few hours in the morning and a few hours in the afternoon. The number of lectures should be further diminished so as to give students a little more freedom. This can however be arranged only in a residential scheme.

DAS GUPTA, SURENDRANATH—*contd* —DATTA, BIBHUTIBHUSON—DE, HAR MOHUN—DE, SATISCHANDRA

- (c) Insufficient provision of games and exercises in our colleges, thus, in most of the colleges, there is no such arrangement that all students may have the sort of physical exercise that they like
- (d) There is no arrangement for boys to take their tiffin in the college and they are compelled group by group to attend the gymnastic classes or other games when exhausted and hungry after the day's work, when they are physically unfit for such things
- (e) When proper facilities for games of different kinds to suit the health and inclination of all the boys are made they should be forced to take certain exercises for a fixed time. With the organisation of matches and other incentives the boys will very soon begin to take a proper interest in them and there will be no need for obligatory rules after a short time. So long, however, as the scare of examinations is not withdrawn these can hardly be attractive

DATTA, BIBHUTIBHUSON

The health of students is bad, the reasons being —

- (a) *Insufficient nourishment* —The expense of English education is so heavy that an Indian father can hardly save a single farthing for the proper nourishment of his sons, many students do not even take a little tiffin in the afternoon after five hours' hard work in the college or the school
- (b) *Heavy strain in learning through a foreign language* —The student has to labour thrice as much in mastering his lessons through English as would have been required in mastering them through his mother tongue.
 'English is a very difficult language for a foreigner, especially for a Bengali, to learn, because English and Bengali differ so widely, not only in their vocabularies, but also in their grammatical structures and idioms. And this difficulty is really so great that it not only *overtaxes the energy of our students, but also cramps their thought*. The scheme of imparting knowledge, so far as practicable, through the medium of the vernaculars will lighten the labour of students and make the acquisition of knowledge more speedy and more direct'*
- (c) *Want of proper and sufficient physical exercise* —Students can ill afford to spend anything for the expensive English games which generally prevail and are encouraged in schools and colleges, nor can they take cheap Indian games as the authorities make no provision, hence, they have recourse to idle gossip or other sedentary games
- (d) *The present system of holding classes at hot noon*

DE, HAR MOHUN

The physical development of students is very poor. This is due to more deep-seated causes than to the mental strain imposed by the system of examination. The country is very poor. Most of the students are ill-fed and ill-clad. So, even the ordinary strain proves too much for such students. The only remedy that strikes me is to dignify manual labour and spread industrial institutions all over the country

DE, SATISCHANDRA

Yes, the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students who are not robust. Therefore, the number of text books should be decreased

* Sir Gooroo Dass Banerjee's speech at the inaugural ceremony of the Bengal National College and School, the 14th August, 1906

DE SATISCHANDRA—*contd*—DE SUSHIL KUMAR—DEY BARODA PROSAUD—DEY N N

The time thus saved should be utilised in giving students tutorial assistance and improving their composition. Under the present system there is hardly any time left for paying them individual attention. Almost the whole of the two sessions is taken up by lectures on text books. Many students cannot read all their text books for want of time and hence have to rely solely on notes, model questions and answers and catechisms. Thus cramming is encouraged.

DE SUSHIL KUMAR

On this subject I should like to make one or two suggestions —

- (a) The pressure of examinations ought to be reduced. I have already spoken on this topic while dealing with the question relating to the examination system.
- (b) Hours of class work ought to be reduced both in the school and in the college. Five continuous hours of school work from 10 A.M. to 4 P.M. with an interval of only half an hour thrown in between certainly puts a great strain both physical and mental on boys of comparatively tender years. The number of working hours should be reduced and intervals should be judiciously adjusted between the hours. In the college too our students are made to work for a larger number of hours than they do in many western universities. Over lecturing and overwork should be discouraged as much as possible. Four or five hours continuous work in a close room in a hot country like Bengal certainly puts a great physical and mental strain and reacts upon the health of students.
- (c) Greater facilities and opportunities ought to be given for proper physical training. It is only recently that the attention of the University has been directed to wards this matter and it is hoped that the efforts which it is making to improve the condition of physical training in the individual colleges and schools should be continued on a larger and more vigorous scale. Interest in sports should be created, college sports should be encouraged and the University should insist upon each college or school having a playground and a gymnasium of its own. In this matter arrangement can be better made by the colleges and schools than by the University itself and if the colleges and schools do their duty the work of the University in this direction can be lightened. At the same time the University should insist upon colleges and schools giving better facilities for physical training and sports and see that this duty is properly done.

DEY BARODA PROSAUD

Students are great sufferers as to their health and physical development during their university career. The present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students generally. But the evil begins much earlier even in primary schools. The whole system should be recast from the beginning.

DEY N N

The present university system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students and ruins the health and physical development of many of them. The examination system is mainly responsible for this. Students work most strenuously during the several months previous to the university examination and as success in that examination is their only goal some of them bring about their physical ruin by excessive strain.

DEY, N. N —*contd* —DHAR, SASINDRA CHANDRA—D'SOUZA, P G —DUKE, W V —
DUTT, BAMAPADA—DUTT, REBATI RAMAN

If the periodical records of the student's work be demanded, and considered side by side with examination, the evil may be lessened. Too high a value is placed on a pass in all the departments of activity and the place of a candidate in an examination is also talked of very highly and this leads promising students to work enormously hard for places, not uncommonly ruining their health. The publication of the list of successful candidates in alphabetical order, and not in order of merit, may also minimise to some extent the evil.

DHAR, SASINDRA CHANDRA

The health and the physical development of students in Bengal are very lamentable.

Yes, the present system imposes an undue mental strain upon students and I would suggest the following remedies —

- (a) Shortening the course of study in the under-graduate stage or making the medium of instruction and of examination in the vernaculars or Anglo-vernaculars, where there is any special difficulty
- (b) Compulsory drill and physical exercise
- (c) Making class promotion depend on a good report from the gymnastic or drill master

D'SOUZA, P G

The problem of physical education is quite different in the case of Indian students from what it is in English universities. It is very necessary to organise systematic physical education suited to the needs of Indian students in the universities, and proper arrangements should also be made for medical inspection and treatment.

DUKE, W V

I do think that the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain on students. I think this is due to the attempt to memorise text-books word for word by sheer amount of repetition and, therefore, expenditure of time and energy. The abolition of text-books in favour of a syllabus would do much to remove this evil.

DUTT, BAMAPADA

The health and physical development of students during their university career in Bengal is generally unsatisfactory. The present system does really impose undue physical and mental strain on students who are not exceptionally robust. This could be remedied to a certain extent if the students are impressed with the benefits of open-air exercises and persuaded to have recourse to them. Greater attention should also be paid to the dietary of students.

DUTT, REBATI RAMAN

The present system of examinations does prove a heavy strain upon the mental and physical health of many a boy and I have, therefore, proposed the inauguration of examinations by compartments in the university course from the Matriculation upwards, except in the M A, and the absolute removal of all rigidity of text books and examinations in the lower classes of a high English school.

DUTTA PROMODE CHANDRA—GANGULI SURENDRA MOHAN—GANGULI SYAMACHARAN—
GEDDES PATRICK

DUTTA PROMODE CHANDRA

The health and longevity of Bengalis have considerably declined. A very earnest effort should be made to improve matters. Every affiliated school and college must have a well furnished gymnasium and every student should be compelled to devote two hours a day to physical culture (morning and evening). This is the *sine qua non* of all good work. Half the students in a class cannot fully benefit by the lectures not because their knowledge of English is inadequate but because they have an empty stomach and an aching head and perhaps a feverish body and a dyspeptic system.

The present system imposes an undue physical strain on school and college students. The remedy lies in teaching through the vernaculars and in making physical culture compulsory.

GANGULI SURENDRA MOHAN

The condition of health and physical development of students during their university career is not at all satisfactory. The present system of education and of examination imposes an undue strain both physical and mental upon students. With a view to secure better results in examinations students often work very hard careless of their health. The result is that they become permanent invalids throughout their lives.

Remedies suggested in answer to questions 10 and 17

GANGULI SYAMACHARAN

My experience is that many students do not sufficiently care for their health. I know that a first arts (old name for intermediate) student gave himself for months no more than three hours sleep a night. The present system does impose I think undue physical and mental strain on the majority of students. The only remedy I can think of is a little lightening of the courses of study. But this is a hard matter to settle.

GEDDES, PATRICK

A single example of this. As a student of sex problems I have come to the serious conviction that the present curricula of uncongenial and non vital knowledge with which most begin continue and end is very definitely and directly correlated with sexual temptations and thus the irregularities and evils which follow. As the simplest illustration of what would require a paper in itself let me recall the Latin grammar which begins with the enfeebling *penna* a pen upon *mensa* a table (instead of with *Roma* or *Pater Noster* or *Gaudeamus*) and thence draggles on to *amo* *amas* which the schoolboy jingles into more or less obscene rhymes. I hold this case to be typical and to continue throughout the curriculum though its problems present details without number and are usually more or less sub conscious as not altogether in the above case.

Conversely all noble literature and vital science—and above all practical responsibilities—are moralising.

Students of Freud's theories may here find matter for fresh enquiry in the line of criticism suggested above.

I believe this line of enquiry will be found fruitful in explaining also the very frequent and serious moral deterioration and social degradation which the present examination system inflicts upon its multitudinous failures and which I believe to be one of the most serious social grounds for its replacement by estimation in course of that general university renewal to which we are all looking forward.

GHOSA, PRATAPCANDRA GHOSE, SH RASH BEHARY—GHOSH, DR B. N—GHOSH, BIMAL CHANDRA

GHOSA, PRATAPCANDRA

Yes, the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students of tender age

The only simple remedy which suggests itself is to change the age limit for matriculation and make the minimum limit say twenty years. Sixteen is too tender an age for such a strain on the nerves

GHOSE, SIR RASH BEHARY

I consider the present system imposes an undue strain, physical and mental, upon many students who are not exceptionally robust

I would advocate a simplification of the courses (e.g., the present I A course in history) with a view to lightening the burden

GHOSH, DR. B. N.

Certainly the strain is too much for students, but, if the examination system becomes a bit lenient, then probably the whole question will be solved.

GHOSH, BIMAL CHANDRA

There is not the slightest doubt that the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students—robust or not. Robust students break down at the end of the six years or a few years after. Many a bright youth of eighteen in the intermediate classes breaks down in the fourth year and some drop out altogether. If such students are conscientious—i.e., attend lectures regularly (and not by proxy) and prepare for class examinations regularly—they suffer all the more. That graduates of Indian universities seem to 'fade' after their academic successes is due to this strain. Students, on the other hand, who do not scruple to attend by proxy and adopt dishonest means at class examinations get on better in health and even shine later on in the course. There has been a slight improvement during the last few years as sports are more encouraged and colleges close frequently for sporting competitions. Unhygienic surroundings, poor, adulterated food, irregular hours for meals at messes and hostels make the student quite unfit for even what would be considered a normal strain in better surroundings. Members of the medical profession prominent in the University and trained under the old system have been heard to say that medical students did not require to engage in sports. Such is the potency of the old system.

Some of the remedies that can be suggested are —

- (a) Shorter hours of work—less frequent examinations, more freedom of study
- (b) Encouragement of sports and travelling during vacations
- (c) More universities and colleges in the provinces
- (d) Work under more sympathetic and cheerful conditions
- (e) No candidates for examination should sit for two papers in the same day—papers not to exceed three hours
- (f) Inclusion of sanitation and hygiene as a subject in secondary schools
- (g) Lectures on sanitation and hygiene at students' clubs
- (h) Appointment of medical men of experience to advise and guide students—one doctor to every 300 students
- (i) Closer supervision of the food supplied to students' messes and hostels

GHOSH DEVAPRASAD—GHOSH RAI HARI NATH Bahadur—GHOSH JYANCHANDRA—
GHOSH RAI Bahadur NISI KANTA—GOSWAMI BHAGABAT KUMAR Sastri—GOSWAMI
RAI Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN

GHOSH DEVAPRASAD

It is not the strain of the university career which is responsible for the general ill health of the young men of Bengal the university courses are not so abnormally heavy nor is college work so very strenuous that an ordinary constitution cannot bear them the real cause of the chronic ill health and delicacy of constitution that affect students and non students alike is the insalubrious climate of certain portions of Bengal the most serious features of which are malaria in villages and the mofussil generally and tuberculosis in crowded towns The Bengali youth as a body cannot be very greatly improved in health and constitution unless and until some headway is made against these fell diseases

Still much can and ought to be obviously done by the colleges and the University There should be gymnasias and playgrounds attached to every college some facilities for physical exercise in the college hostels and so on which will go a great way towards promoting physical culture among the student population

And finally Government should revise its attitude towards physical culture associations

GHOSH RAI HARI NATH Bahadur

Health and physical development are not satisfactory there is undue physical and mental strain especially on youngsters of school going age

GHOSH JYANCHANDRA

I think the present system imposes some physical and mental strain upon students This can be avoided if the courses which are in many subjects too long be somewhat simplified and if vernaculars be widely used

GHOSH RAI Bahadur NISI KANTA

The health and physical development of Indian students are generally bad I do not consider that the present system of university education has much to do with the deterioration or that undue strain is placed on students (case of sickly constituted students being always excepted)

But the deterioration is due to the want of physical exercise and to excessive study during the few months immediately preceding examination the rest of the year having been spent in pleasure and pastimes The students invariably do nothing during the long summer vacation *Dussehra* and other holidays which together come to more a quarter of an year Were they more assiduous throughout the year utilising the long vacation in profitable studies and taking plenty of physical exercise then they would doubtless be more healthy and sprightly

GOSWAMI BHAGABAT KUMAR Sastri

The system is less to blame than the poverty of the country

GOSWAMI RAI Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN

The health and physical development of students in Bengal during their university career do not in many instances present a hopeful and bright picture To relieve an undue strain on their minds the syllabus of study may be reduced But to me it seems that the present mode of college life is not suited to a tropical climate At present

GOSWAMI, Rai Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN—*contd* —GOSWAMY, HARIDAS—GRAY, Dr. J HENRY
—GUHA JITES CHANDRA

students have to finish hastily their morning meals (not often nutritious) and without any rest have to run to their colleges for securing the percentage of attendance, then they have to attend lectures for five or six hours, cooped up in crowded class-rooms, and finally, at the close of the day, when hunger is almost eating them up, have to undergo some physical exercise. Such a course of life cannot but undermine the health of even a robust student. To remedy this undesirable state of things the practice of holding classes twice a day in the morning and afternoon, with a gap of at least four hours between for meals and rest, may be tried.

GOSWAMY, HARIDAS

The university career under present conditions in quite a large number of cases affects the health and physical development of students.

Yes, the present system of examinations under which an undue, or a wholly disproportionate, stress is laid upon intellectual development to the neglect of other activities takes away much from the life of students.

I would suggest the following remedies —

- (a) Examinations should be reformed
- (b) Undue attention should be diverted from success at the examinations
- (c) The curricula should be revised
- (d) Physical education should be provided in a larger measure than now

GRAY, Dr J HENRY

My observation, belief, and experience, so far as it goes, is that the health and physical development of a large majority of students during their university career become steadily poorer, that the men of the entering class, as a whole, are better than the men in the B A class or better than they will be again during their university career. It is unfortunate that actual statistics are not available, but when the request to make such an investigation was presented I was given to understand that public opinion would not approve of such an examination of students and the matter was dropped.

I believe that the importance placed upon the passing of the final examination and the fear of failure results through fear and worry in placing an undue physical and mental strain on students not exceptionally robust.

Possible remedies are —

- (a) The placing of less emphasis on the examination
- (b) Requiring a thorough physical and medical examination of all students, either at entrance or periodically, and the giving of sane and friendly advice to those needing it, by some one such as the University physician, suggested in my reply to question 17
- (c) The inauguration of a health department

GUHA, JITES CHANDRA

Our boys are generally of delicate health and the college authorities do not take any care of their health. There are many colleges which do not possess a gymnasium and an athletic master. Physical exercise ought to be made compulsory from the age of twelve to twenty-two. There ought to be an attendance register for the gymnastic classes. Delinquents in this respect ought to be debarred from university examinations. The hostels must be large-sized, well-ventilated, and very neat, and kept under the charge of experienced and aged teachers. To avoid undue mental strain I think that the introduction of examination by compartments, as has been done in the case of law studies, will be highly beneficial. It is monstrous that a student who passes in all subjects except one should be required to attend his former class for

GUHA JITES CHANDRA—*contl*—GUHA RAJANIKANTA—GUPTA UMES CHANDRA—
HAIDAR UMES CHANDRA—HAQ Khan Sahib Maulvi KAZI ZAHIRAL

a full one year and then appear at the same examination in all the subjects. The boy should rather be allowed to appear at an examination in the subject in which he has failed at the end of six months only.

GUHA RAJANIKANTA

The present generation of students appear to be weaker in health than their predecessors. Hundreds of them have pale cheeks and lack lustrous eyes. Short sightedness is rapidly increasing among our young men. I do not mean to suggest that university education is alone or mainly responsible for it. In a large number of cases poverty is perhaps the root cause, but the fact is undeniable that the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon those who are not robust.

One remedy for this is the relaxation of the rigidity of the examinations. A second examinations in compartments for unsuccessful candidates. It should also be carefully considered whether or not the number of examinations might be reduced. Prof. or Paulsen rightly says—We must be on our guard against multiplying examinations beyond the point of necessity. An unnecessary examination is an evil. Other remedies might be suggested but they are connected with the social system which may not be touched upon here.

GUPTA UMES CHANDRA

In my experience I do not find any deterioration of health and physical development in any appreciable degree amongst the student community of Bengal. Insufficient nutritious food because of high prices tells somewhat upon the health of students but it is common to other people in other spheres of life. Generally speaking there is no deterioration in the health of the student community of Bengal.

As to the middle part of the question my answer is No.

As to the latter part of the question no answer is necessary for it does not arise in view of my replies given to the first portion of the question.

HAIDAR UMES CHANDRA

The majority of the students during their university career in Bengal have their health undermined so that when they enter the world they generally suffer from dyspepsia, loss of eyesight and other diseases which disable them from doing any service to Government and their mother country. This is due to the following—

- (a) The want of proper provision for physical exercise. Adequate provision for outdoor exercise should be made by the authorities.
- (b) Undue mental strain just after meals. After taking a hasty meal boys have to hurry to their colleges and schools which generally begin at 10 or 10.30 A.M.
- (c) They take unwholesome bazar sweets and their tiffin.

School and college authorities and superintendents of hostels should make satisfactory arrangements for tiffin. It is a matter for serious consideration whether schools and colleges may be held both in the morning and afternoon.

HAQ Khan Sahib Maulvi KAZI ZAHIRAL

As regards the health and physical development of students conditions have improved a little in recent years but much more is necessary. The present system is certainly partly responsible for this drawback for cramming is still the rule and students having very little freedom in the choice of a career are often compelled to travel over uncongenial paths but I think the chief cause of their physical deterioration lies in the fact that many of them are thrown into a bad atmosphere without any proper control.

HARLEY, A H—HAZRA, JOGENDRA NATH—HOLLAND, Rev W E S—HOLMES,
Rev W H G

HARLEY, A H

Students in India are more liable to dysentery and fevers than are students in the West, but then health generally does not seem to be deleteriously affected by their courses of study, the lack of physical exercise is responsible for many of the ailments which students suffer from. In the few fatal cases known to me the illnesses were contracted in the home village during vacation and terminated fatally on the return of the student here. On the whole, I am disposed to believe that students leave Calcutta in better condition physically than on their first coming to it from the mofussil.

HAZRA, JOGENDRA NATH

The present system of university study affects the health of students and puts an undue strain upon the body and mind of students. In some cases, the courses of studies are long and difficult. Most of the university students enter the University with a very defective knowledge of English literature and with an imperfect command of English. They find their work in colleges uncongenial and difficult. Finding no other way out of the difficulty they are compelled to have recourse to cramming and hard work. The following remedies may be suggested—

- (a) To improve the training boys receive in high schools, especially in English.
- (b) To reduce the courses of study.
- (c) To arrange for regular physical exercise and other forms of recreation.

There is a large number of poor students who cannot pay for healthy living. Some of them depend upon private tuition and have to work very hard. There should be a number of scholarships and free studentships to help them.

HOLLAND, Rev W E S

I have lived for thirteen years among students in Allahabad and for five years among students in Bengal. I have been much impressed by the deplorable inferiority in physique of the Calcutta student. Bengali students in Allahabad were much more robust. The difference in health conditions is even more striking. Illness was uncommon, serious illness very rare, in our Allahabad hostel of 100 students. Here there is seldom a day on which half a dozen students, generally many more, are not absent from our college through fever.

Healthier dwellings, regular medical inspection and assistance, playing fields and compulsory athletics, a much better diet, the discouraging of cramming, and a more elastic and rational system of examination seem to me the chief remedies. To particularise on two points. I wish the University would require regular medical inspection of all students, and the raising of the mess fee in all college hostels by at least 50 per cent. It would be useful if a senior medical student would reside in each hostel to look after the nursing of the sick and render petty aid in the absence of the doctor.

The spread of consumption among students is alarming.

HOLMES, Rev W H G

Students who come from villages to Calcutta, comparatively robust, after a year or two in Calcutta become frail, anæmic, dull, and listless. Ninety per cent take no milk at all in Calcutta, whilst in their villages most of them drink daily a seer of milk or so. They increase in weight rapidly during the vacation when they are out of Calcutta. The chief complaints they suffer from are dyspepsia, pulmonary phthisis (often of the galloping type), melancholia, due to constant worry, and general depression of body and

HOLMES Pev W. H. G.—*contd*—Huzq Th Hon'ble Maulvi A. K. FUZZUL—HUQUR KAZI IMDADUL

mind. Addressing the Calcutta Medical Club the late Dr I. M. Mullick whose practice was largely among students said—

The majority are melancholic pessimistic never enjoy life properly both from actual want in many ways as well as from imaginary evils. He goes on to say

They get fatigued by the least bodily exertion but what indefatigable workers they are in mental work! It is near the last few days of examination that they become untidy both in body and mind probably owing to excessive anxiety over an uncertain cruel and irrational examination. Again he says

The reckless waste of energy of our boys during the period of arduous and elaborate theoretical examination is the cause of their exhausted and effortless prostration in the field of life a world and their bad health early breakdown and death. This fact is little known outside their circle.

The only possible remedy would be that no college should be allowed to take students who a life it could not supervise and for whom it could not provide sanitary and suitable accommodation. This would certainly mean that no college in Calcutta would have more than 200 to 250 students.

Under the present system by which 10,000 students are concentrated in Calcutta no remedy is possible.

Huzq, The Hon'ble Maulvi A. K. FUZZUL

My own experience is that the strain of a university life tells heavily on the health and physical development of students in Bengal. I believe that the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students who are not exceptionally robust. The remedy lies once again in providing for residential boarding houses and hostels with proper arrangements and fuller opportunities for physical exercise and training. Instruction should also so far as may be conveyed to students more in the form of verbal lectures by trained and competent professors rather than through the system of cram.

HUQUE KAZI IMDADUL

The health and physical development of students undoubtedly suffer during their university career. First the mental strain upon students is great because in most cases they get very little direct assistance in learning their subjects from the teachers or professors. In fact they have to cram more than they can learn—mostly an unintelligent mechanical work, which causes undue strain. Their real powers lie inactive and that causes additional strain. Further being left without guidance they are generally very irregular in their studies so that immediately before the examination they labour very hard and thus undermine their own health. In fact it seems unnecessary to work throughout the year because what they cram now they will be likely to forget at the time of examination. It is therefore that they have to concentrate their efforts just before the examination time.

Secondly the physical strain upon the students of Bengal is of a twofold nature. On the one hand the congestion in messes, indifferent food and unfavourable times in college and on the other either a total want of regular exercise or over exercise (in football etc.) tells seriously upon their health.

I would suggest the following remedies—

- (a) Greater incentive and opportunities of regular study. This may be effected by placing students more in touch with their teachers and by remodelling the examination system.
- (b) Location of hostels in healthy environment, provision of enough space for each student to live in and of wholesome food in sufficient quantities.
- (c) Holding of classes before the midday meal and after it allowing enough time for rest after the meal.

HUQUI, KAZI IMDADUL—*contd*—HUSAIN, The Hon'ble MIAN MUHAMMAD FAZLI, Khan Bahadur—HYDARI, M A N JALIL, ABDUL—KAR SITI'S CHANDRA

- (d) Provision of scope for the regular physical exercise of every student and the regulation of exercises by expert medical advice, prescribing suitable forms of exercises for individuals according to their constitution

Harder games, such as football, hockey, etc., ought to be regulated by reducing the time

Other games requiring less space ought to be introduced and country games remodelled and encouraged

Exercises of practical utility in life, such as long distance walking, cross-country races, swimming, etc., ought to be organised, and in all schools (and also in colleges to a certain extent) 'boy scout' organisations should be started

HUSAIN, The Hon'ble MIAN MUHAMMAD FAZLI, Khan Bahadur

I believe a large number of the students are not fit to take the course prescribed by the University, and this leads to cram and overexertion, leading to physical, and even mental, breakdown. Enthusiastic university men, in their efforts to raise the standard forget that knowledge, unless digested deserves but little. I think the remedy lies in dividing the post-intermediate university course into two honours and pass. The strain of a higher course will only be on those who can bear it, while the pressure will be removed from those who are not strong enough to bear it, and they will get only such knowledge as they can assimilate.

HYDARI, M A N

Yes one of the remedies is suggested in question 17 above. Another is in answer to question 9 above, in which I have recommended that permission should be given to use books in the examinations, which would do away with cramming, also I would insist upon a certificate of physical training as a *sine qua non* for admission to the examinations. The words 'physical training' are here used in a very elastic sense, it does not necessarily imply going through a prescribed and rigid system of gymnastic exercises

JALIL, ABDUL

In all Indian universities, under the present system, the physical development of students is sacrificed. The present training imposes an undue strain upon students in general

The following remedies are suggested —

- (a) As far as possible, every student at the University should be required to take some exercise and play games
- (b) The system of examination should not be advantageous to a crammer, but should pay any student who attends lectures regularly and makes an intelligent study of the subject
- (c) Inter collegiate tournaments and sports should be encouraged
- (d) Exercises adapted to the Indian climate and customs should be patronised

KAR, SITI'S CHANDRA

The health and physical development of our students during their university career leave a good deal to be desired. The practice of any kind of game is limited. As remedies I would suggest an encouragement of sports and the provision of facilities thereof. I do not think the present system really imposes any undue strain—mental or physical—on students

KARIM Maulvi ABDUL-KARVE, D K—KHAN ABUL HASHEM—KO TAW SEIN

KARIM Maulvi ABDUL

The health and physical development of students during their university career cannot be said to be satisfactory. The present system I am afraid imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students who are not exceptionally robust. Multiplicity of subjects and books prescribed for the university examination being the chief cause of the strain this burden should be lightened as far as possible.

A system of periodical medical examination of students at different stages of instruction should be introduced and cessation from studies and non participation in games insisted upon in the case of those who are not in a position to stand such strain. That physical exercise is as necessary as over exercise is injurious should be well impressed upon students. Boys of weak constitution should not be permitted to take part in hard games such as football and hockey. In selecting games for boys their physical strength, the nutritive quality of their food and the climatic condition of the country should be taken into consideration.

From what I have seen and heard I have no doubt that the eyesight of our students is perceptibly deteriorating. Special care should be taken to check this deterioration.

KARVE, D K

I think the present system of education imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students who are not exceptionally robust. In the first place students have to learn all subjects through a foreign tongue. This strain is for some time inevitable. But this strain becomes all the more exhausting as students in order to pass a university examination have to appear at one and the same time for all papers and have to pass in all of them at the same time. If instead of this rigid rule examination by compartments was allowed it would lessen the strain upon students considerably. For instance if a student fails in one or two subjects only at an examination he should be allowed to appear in those papers only say after six months. Similarly a student might be allowed to appear for a portion of the examination at one time. Both the reforms would lighten the burden upon students and would lead to a sounder study of subjects. At present students have to make up so many subjects within a specified period and hence they cannot study leisurely and concentrate attention upon a few subjects but have to get up all subjects hurriedly. This is more applicable to the intermediate examination of the University and not so much to the B A examination. However examination by compartments is to my mind an urgent reform in our university system.

KHAN, ABUL HASHEM

There is a perceptible improvement in the health and physical development of late years. I do not think that the present system imposes any undue physical or mental strain upon students.

KO, TAW SEIN

The present system does impose an undue physical and mental strain upon all classes of students. The enervating influence of the Indian climate has to be considered. A curriculum suited to a good northern climate is out of place in India. If it is adopted without such a consideration the pressure on the brain is so great that the organs of the body as the heart, lungs, liver and kidneys are likely to be affected. It is remarkable that the male Indians who pass through English schools and colleges contract dyspepsia and diabetes while Indian females are comparatively free from such ailments.

Ko, TAW SEIN—*contd*—KUNDU, RAJ BEJOY NARAYAN, Bahadur—KUNDU, PURNACHANDRA—LAHIRI, BECHARAM—LAHIRI, GOPAL CHANDRA

and it is noticeable that leading prominent Indians, who are acquainted with English, die of diabetes or weak heart, between the ages of 40 and 50, while they are still in their prime. The curriculum, therefore, should be pruned down, more exercise should be taken, debates, lectures, and readings should be held for the mental recreation of students. The hostels should be licensed and periodically inspected.

KUNDU, RAJ BEJOY NARAYAN, Bahadur

The health and physical development of students suffer materially during their university career. I know students who after finishing their university career come with their health shattered. Under the present system, students have to go through a large number of subjects and a large number of books and appear at numerous examinations, which continue for a long time. As great importance is attached to success in an examination students have no other alternative, but to take to cramming. They find no time to take physical exercise and cannot give undivided attention to any particular subject and so an undue mental strain is put upon them and it is difficult for them to come out of the University with their health unimpaired.

KUNDU, PURNACHANDRA.

I do not think that the health and physical condition of students suffer in the least on account of the present system of university education, excepting in the case of those students who sleep through the course and force themselves up by excessive hard work at the time of examination. The remedy lies with the teachers who ought to and should be given the opportunity to see that their students do their work regularly and systematically all through the course, and with the University which should so alter the system of examination as to make easy passes by cramming difficult, and to compel students to satisfy the teachers by diligent and systematic work throughout the course. (*Vide* my answer to question 10)

LAHIRI, BECHARAM

The Health is miserable

Yes

The insanitary condition of the places. Malaria, want of good and nourishing food, and inadequate feeding.

I would suggest regular physical exercise, manly sports and games. Military drill, better food. Provision of free lunch in schools and colleges as is introduced in Baroda.

LAHIRI, GOPAL CHANDRA

Very little attention is paid to the improvement of physique in the university career of students in Bengal. They are entirely left to their option as to physical culture, while their studies impose upon them compulsory mental strain. As a consequence, health is deteriorating. Very many students suffer from dyspepsia and shortsight and some from consumption also.

Gymnasiums and athletic sports should be amply provided for and inter-college and inter-hostel competitions arranged.

Service under Government should be made conditional on a certificate of athletic habits.

LAHRY PANOJIT CHANDRA—MAHTAB The Hon ble Sir BIJAY CHAND—MAITRA GOPAL CHANDRA—MAJUMDAR BIRAJ MOHAN

LAHRY PANOJIT CHANDRA

The health and physical development of the students are being hampered by their university career. This is due partly to undue physical and mental strain and partly to the fact that they have to strain their body and mind immediately after their midday meals. This strain may be removed by the periods of recreation and study being alternately mixed together. Amongst the students there are some who are too much devoted to games and others who do not take any part in physical exercises. The mean course is always the best. Students often lose sight of the truth that only so much physical exercise is to be taken as is conducive to the health. Overexhaustion for the sake of the pleasure of games is always to be avoided.

MAHTAB The Hon ble Sir BIJAY CHAND

The students one meets are very often of poor physique. This is primarily due in many cases of course to the neglect of physical exercise and the unhealthy mode of living in messes. The undue importance attached to the mere passing of the university examination and the ever condemned but still surviving system of cramming the numerous courses especially in the first few years of school life have also a good deal to do with the feeble looking dyspeptic and nervous students one meets in Bengal. I have suggested the remedies in my answer to question 17. Serious attention to the subject of physical exercise and a radical change in the mode of living in messes are necessary and the number of text books in the lower classes of schools must be greatly reduced.

MAITRA GOPAL CHANDRA

There are reasons to fear that the present system imposes an unduly heavy strain on students. The substitution of the vernacular as the medium of examination in some of the subjects will go a great way to relieve their burden.

The natural weakness of the constitution of the Bengalis requires that the physical training of students should receive from the University greater attention than it seems to have done. An expert to assist the colleges with his advice and guidance in matters of physical exercise and training will be a desirable addition to the university staff.

MAJUMDAR BIRAJ MOHAN

The health of students in a crowded place like Calcutta must necessarily be affected as hardly any adequate provision can be made by the colleges for the physical development of the numerous students who often dwell in unhealthy surroundings. No college in Calcutta has extensive playgrounds and it is very rare indeed to find the finest intellects possessing robust constitutions. Moreover the frequent examination and the consequent heavy mental strain tell upon their health to a considerable extent. The remedies are to diminish the congestion in the Calcutta colleges as much as possible and this can only be done if in every centre of education in the mofussil, at least second grade colleges be opened and to remove all the Calcutta colleges from the overcrowded quarters to the suburbs where extensive plots of land may be easily secured. But it is doubtful whether under the existing condition specially when Government and the University have spent such large amounts in lands and buildings in Calcutta such a scheme as this is possible.

MAJUMDAR, NARINDRAKUMAR—MAJUMDAR C H — MITRA, The Hon'ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA, Bahadur—MITRA RAM CHARAN—MOHAMMAD, Dr WALI

MAJUMDAR, NARINDRAKUMAR

Bad health and stunted development are the inevitable effects of the present system, which certainly imposes an undue strain

The remedies will be found in the direction of —

- (a) Reducing the rigidity of the examinations
- (b) Using the vernacular as the medium of education
- (c) Emphasising traditional rules and observances relating to personal hygiene, purity, food, and general conduct of life
- (d) Adapting traditional physical exercises to modern requirements
- (e) Improving the existing system of dietary

MAJUMDAR, C H

The health and physical development of students during their university career seem to be anything but satisfactory owing to physical and mental strain. This may, to some extent, be remedied by regular and compulsory physical exercises.

MITRA, The Hon'ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA, Bahadur

Generally, the students are of weak constitution. The study of hygiene should be made compulsory. Every student before admission to any particular course of study should be medically examined. In some cases, the present system imposes undue physical and mental strain. In such cases, students should wait till they are declared medically fit. The members of the governing body of each institution should, in consultation with the teachers, inspectors, and medical officers and the guardians of students, prescribe the course of study (*viz.*, law, medicine, engineering, agriculture, etc.) specially suitable for each student.

MITRA, RAM CHARAN

Students living in private messes or with their parents have generally to attend to other duties according to their circumstances in life. Much of their time is taken up in these duties and, whenever free, they read for their college lectures. Having no appointed time for physical exercise, they generally do not take part in sports or exercise and become physically weak.

MOHAMMAD, Dr WALI

The health and physical development of students leave much to be desired. The absence of healthy home influences, ignorance of the laws of hygiene, the absence of medical inspection and facilities for healthy outdoor exercise, all result in poor constitutions and broken health. An excessive dose of lectures, the half assimilated and half-crammed lessons learnt by burning the midnight oil, the absence of healthy environment, disregard to careful diet and proper nourishment, produce weak sight, consumption and other ailments ending in physical and mental breakdown. A residential university ought to be in a position to look after the health of its students. No recommendation made by the Dacca University Committee appeals to me more than the establishment of a department of physical training. Periodical medical examination coupled with theoretical and practical courses in hygiene and ample space for organised games and sports and a well-equipped gymnasium, ought to improve the physique and the general health of students.

MUKERJEE ADHAR CHANDRA—MUKERJEE BIJOY GOPAL—MUKERJEE RADHAKAMAL—
MUKHOPADHYAYA Dr SYAMADAS—Murarichand College Sylhet—NAG P N

MUKERJEE ADHAR CHANDRA

Very bad.

Yes

Courses should be simplified and the messes should have better surroundings

MUKERJEE BIJOY GOPAL

Speaking generally I may say that during the last few years the health of students in Bengal has much improved but still the number of students whose health breaks down during their university career is not very small. This breakdown however does not seem to be due to any severe physical or mental strain imposed upon them it may rather be attributed in most cases to certain economic causes which it is not directly within the power of the University to remove.

MUKERJEE RADHAKAMAL

I do not think that the courses here are too heavy or that the present system involves an undue physical or mental strain upon students in general. The fault lies not in the system but in the incidents of that system the conditions which are referred to in my answer to question 17

MUKHOPADHYAYA Dr SYAMADAS

My experience of the health and physical development of university students is disappointing. The present lengthy curricula of the University and even of the schools and the multiplicity of difficult examinations of the University are in part responsible. Want of leisure and facilities for physical exercise is the main contributory cause. Ignorance and neglect of hygienic principles tell specially in the malarious climate of Bengal. Want of a nourishing dietary is also responsible.

I should suggest the following as remedies —

- (a) Limiting as far as may be expedient educationally the number of subjects prescribed for a given examination and the number of examinations for which one may qualify in a given period. Much good may be done also by wise guidance on the part of teachers in the matter of examinations.
- (b) Providing facilities for physical exercise.
- (c) Providing healthy habitations and nourishing dietary.
- (d) Judicious observation and advice on the part of guardians or tutors residing with the students.

Murarichand College Sylhet

Health and physical development suffer. The present system imposes undue physical and mental strain. *Physical training should be made compulsory at all stages.* Pass students may be allowed to sit for an examination by compartments. The B A examination might be split up into Parts I and II.

NAG, P N

I am inclined to think considering the number of subjects in which a candidate is required to take his examination that the present system imposes an undue physical

NAG, P N—*contd*—NAIK, K G—NANDI, MATHURA KANTA—NANDY, The Hon'ble Maharajah Sir MANINDRA CHANDRA—North Bengal Zamindars' Association, Rangpur—PAL, The Hon'ble Rai RADHA CHARAN, Bahadur

and mental strain upon students who are not of robust health. This strain, coupled with the malarious influence of the climate of Bengal, affects the health of many. More scope should be afforded and ways devised for the development of the physical and healthy social life of students.

NAIK, K G

If compulsory physical training is provided for there need be no such fear. Even at present there is not much truth in this. I do not believe the present system puts any undue strain on boys.

NANDI, MATHURA KANTA

Up to the matriculation standard I do not think that there is any undue physical or mental strain upon students. I would, however, recommend medical examination of pupils upon admission and at regular intervals for the detection of physical defect, and the application of suitable remedies. The real defect is that mental exertion does not go hand-in-hand with physical exercises. And the real remedy lies in making physical exercises as compulsory as any subject of study.

NANDY, The Hon'ble Maharajah SIR MANINDRA CHANDRA

The principal causes of deterioration of the health of students are the following —

- (a) Want of sufficient nutrition
- (b) Indifferent food-stuffs badly cooked
- (c) Keeping late hours
- (d) Neglect of physical training
- (e) Overcrowding in hostels
- (f) Pure food-stuffs now-a-days are not available. Fish and meat are so dear that students cannot have an adequate quantity of them.
- (g) Defective cooking is inevitable when food for a large number has got to be prepared.
- (h) Generally, students keep late hours for months before the examination time.

For the improvement of the health and physical development of students, I would make the following recommendations —

- (i) The vigour and rigidity of examinations should be reduced.
- (ii) Special attention should be accorded to physical training and athletics.
- (iii) Provision should be made for an improved diet in the self-governing students' hostels and messes.

North Bengal Zamindars' Association, Rangpur

The development of health and physique is surely poor. The principal reason of this is the very unequal proportion of mental of physical exercise. Students are required to study quite a hoide of subjects and too many set texts without deriving any corresponding benefit from them. It is desirable that students should be required to take up not more than one subject, except the compulsory ones. Physical exercises should be made compulsory.

PAL, The Hon'ble Rai RADHA CHARAN, Bahadur

Not at all satisfactory, the present system certainly imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students.

People's Association Khulna—PRATHM The Honble Mr Justice ABDUR—RAY Dr BIDHAN CHANDRA

People's Association Khulna

In our experience the health and physical development of students during their university career in Bengal is lamentable

We are strongly of opinion that the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students. Our reasons will be clear from the following remedies which we suggest —

- (a) More money should be spent on boarding and lodging arrangements
- (b) The pressure entailed by the study of a large number of subjects and by the complexity of subjects especially in the lower classes of high schools can be relieved by limiting the subjects of study to a manageable number
- (c) Well considered schemes of physical culture—suited to the special conditions of the students of the country—should be introduced and made compulsory as far as practicable in schools and colleges
- (d) The encouragement of games and sports by organising competitions and giving prizes is extremely desirable and public funds should be spent on this object more liberally than is the case at present
- (e) If a volunteer corps becomes a feature of the life and work of each college it would go far to promote physical health and culture
- (f) Revival of the traditions of *Brahmacharya*

PRATHM The Honble Mr Justice ABDUR

The present system of university education imposes considerable strain on the student not only in Bengal but all over India. This is partly due to the artificial character of the system its traditions the undue importance which the teachers attach to examinations and consequently the misplaced ingenuity which is often exercised in the framing of questions with the view apparently not so much to test the progress made by the student but to baffle him. I believe that the physique and energy of the educated classes have greatly suffered in consequence. On this ground alone if nothing else it is time that the whole system should be recast and a more rational system given a chance by placing it in the hands of a more carefully selected class of teachers

RAY Dr BIDHAN CHANDRA

The physical development of students during their university career is below par. The reasons are the following —

- (a) The average student resorts to a town from a village and has to live under unaccustomed conditions coupled with bad food and unhealthy surroundings (For remedies see my answer to question 17)
- (b) He joins college at the age of sixteen or seventeen. This age coincides with the transition stage when the boy grows into manhood. The whole constitution is then undergoing rapid changes and developments. He has to begin working in the college for the intermediate examination almost immediately after he has finished his matriculation. Apart from unnatural surroundings the bad food defective hostel sanitation the struggle to get the wherewithal to maintain body and soul together during his stay at college he has further to undergo several tests during the first and second years at the college and then to go through the strain of the intermediate examination. Be it remembered that the several tests at the college during the two years are meant to test the student's fitness for obtaining success at the university intermediate examination. They are not specially intended to find out what progress the student makes in the study of a

RAY, DR BIDHAN CHANDRA—*contd*— RAY, JOGES CHANDRA

particular subject. It would be more suitable to omit the intermediate examination altogether. If a large proportion of matriculates is drafted on at once to professional, technological and commercial courses the rest would very profitably go along to the B.A. degree and appear at the examination at the age of twenty or twenty one when they will have passed the transition stage of life. The intermediate examination breaks up the link between the matriculation and the B.A. examination and gives nothing tangible in return. There is hardly any profession which a student who has passed the I.A. examination can easily enter. He has not even acquired the special distinction of being a graduate of the University. The medical inspector would be able to advise a student who is physically unfit, to take things easy say for a year. This he would gladly do if he knows that the next examination is not due till the end of the fourth year after matriculation. The progress of the student at the college during the four years would be carefully watched by the college authorities.

- (c) The usual method of holding university examinations during the months of March, April and May is harmful. The winter months should be made the examination months. This will enable students to finish the examination before March and resort to their village homes during the spring and recoup their strength.
- (d) As far as possible the examination should be written, oral and practical in all subjects. The written examination alone does not bring the candidate in touch with the examiner and the latter has no means of satisfying himself as to the mental calibre of the student. However carefully a series of questions for a written examination may be set it is impossible to find out exactly what the student does know, although the examiner may find out what the student does not know.

RAY, JOGES CHANDRA

That the health and physique of the university students is worse than that of young men of the same class of society is a recognised fact. The students suffer from weakness of eyesight and digestive capacity. The majority loses the power of physical endurance. The causes of this lamentable state are many, one of which certainly the most important, is the undue mental strain to which they are subject. A curious phenomenon is observed—either there is all work and no play, or all play and no work. The reason for this state appears to be that students are made to lead a very artificial life from their boyhood, having the daily duties scheduled with a view to the mere acquisition of knowledge. They must read for so many hours, usually twelve hours, as soon as they come to the fourth class of their schools. 'Twelve hours' study whether at home or in schools or colleges with insufficient and untimely food cannot be borne by any, but the robust without detriment to health. It is a well-known fact that students improve in health when they go home during vacations. They enjoy rest and eat food well cooked, and at the time they feel hungry. In messes and hostels cooking is not satisfactory. The worst thing is that the students have to bolt the half-cooked food, run to a distant school or college, and immediately be attentive to their lessons. They return utterly exhausted. If they could enjoy a hearty meal and some rest before the school or the college hour there would have been less exhaustion and less strain on the body. Many other matters connected with school and college routine tend to undermine the physique. For instance, boys are made to undergo drill exercises during school hours, frequently just at the time when they feel hungry and fatigued. The remedies are as follows.—

- (a) Less school or college work which should not begin earlier than 11 in the morning and should not be prolonged later than 3 in the evening.
- (b) More attention paid to the lighting and ventilation in school or college rooms.

RAY OGES CHANDRA—*contd*—RAY MANMATHANATH—RAY RAMES CHANDRA

- (c) The taking of physical statistics of the boys and students and thorough examination of the body at least twice in the year by a competent medical man who should be empowered to prescribe suitable remedies for any defect or weakness of the parts of the body and the introduction of the system of keeping registers of physical improvement along with the marks of mental progress
- (d) In the case of students living in recognised messes and attached hostels appointment of such superintendents as can adequately discharge the duties of guardians. The responsibilities of these gentlemen are immense they should be men of high moral principles of religious temperament and of wide sympathies. Considering the amount of work they are expected to do their work as teachers should be lightened. It is they more than the class teachers who can mould the students under their charge on the lines conducive to the general welfare of the future generation

RAY MANMATHANATH

The present system undermines the health and the physical development of students and imposes undue physical or mental strain upon them in many cases. While due regard is paid to the thoroughness of teaching learning and testing the course should be comparatively light one. To cite one instance the present Course I in history should be simplified. If the object of education be the cultivation of intellectual strength moral strength and independent judgment as it obviously is the depth and not the extent would better serve the purpose.

RAY RAMES CHANDRA

The answers submitted refer to the pre university career and not the university career itself. But the scholastic burden a boy for age is lighter in university days compared with that of pre university days.

Educational problems in this country have been discussed by eminent experts from the purely academical point of view time out of number but the aspect of the problem bearing on the health of the scholars has never been scientifically discussed.

Having decided to make a survey of the health of our students we approached the heads of several institutions to grant us permission to undertake the work free of all cost to them. But I regret to say that only three institutions permitted the examination the other four having refused it.

It is not difficult to understand this attitude on the part of school owners. By nature most men are suspicious and most of all the owners of private institutions who scent danger in every breath of wind. We started work at a time (July 1916) when the Bengal Ambulance Corps was in being and when a cowardly assault had been committed on one of the professors in an institution in Calcutta. These were additional factors that easily brought us a denial. The managers and owners of private institutions in Calcutta are as it were always on the defensive—against any irksome impositions and expensive imposts. These are some of the patent reasons why permission was refused. The suspicion was in some quarters raised that we were agents of Government seeking out students eligible for active field service.

Before proceeding to actual facts and figures I owe it to myself to express my sense of deepest gratitude to my friends Dr Raghu Nath Chatterji and Dr Devendra N Ghosh for the very substantial help they ungrudgingly rendered me in the actual examination of the boys at the various institutions.

Historically speaking it was Germany that in 1898 first made the experiment in caring for the health of our boys. Probably it was a part of Germany's forty years preparation for the present titanic conflict. Almost twenty years ago Weisbaden Nuremberg etc

RAY, RAMES CHANDRA *contd*

were chosen for experiment and in that same year (1898) the compulsory care of a school boy's health was introduced throughout the towns in Germany, Switzerland, France, Austria, America (North and South), and Japan all followed the example of Germany in the same year (1898) England did not, apparently, take up this, but when, after the famous Boer war, the Britishers suspected that their manhood had deteriorated physically, they appointed a Royal Commission to find out what was the matter with the nation. The findings of that Commission led to the introduction into England, so late as the year 1907, the means of improving the manhood of the nation. Germany and other continental nations were not content with merely introducing the schemes, they wanted to exchange notes with each other, with a view to securing better progress and this led to the holding of three international congresses on school hygiene in the years 1904, 1907, and 1910. Thus, the Westerners have not only theoretically realised that the boy of to-day will be the prop of the country to-morrow, but they have taken every conceivable step to ensure that the boy of to-day shall grow up into a real man to-morrow.

Amidst this world-movement for the betterment of the future manhood of each nation what has India been doing—India, where every Hindu considers it a social disgrace and a sin to die childless, where the birth of a male child is the occasion for festivities and rejoicings, and where the perpetuation of one's own line is a religious duty. India has stood stolid and silent—most of her educationists and her medical practitioners never knew, and do not even to-day know, of such a world-movement. To Dr Turner, the Executive Health Officer of the Bombay Corporation, belongs the credit of first setting the ball rolling in this country. In the year 1911, for the first time in India, Dr Turner made a sort of private survey of the health of pupils of the lower forms of vernacular schools. In 1915 (October) the Punjab Government appointed six assistant surgeons for the inspection of male pupils of high, Anglo-vernacular, and middle English schools. Judging from the forms and instructions supplied to me I consider that the work must have been thorough. But, unfortunately, the results are not available. In that same year the Bombay Municipality appointed two male, and one female, medical inspectors and to each of these attached a peon and a clerk—all of them being salaried officers. They examined 186 lower forms of vernacular schools and each inspector examined not only the pupils individually, but also examined the premises occupied by the schools. They examined in all 13,907 pupils, one third of whom were girls. The results of these examinations are not available to the public in this case too. In January 1916, at the instance of the Surgeon-General with the Government of Madras, an I M S officer was deputed by that Government to examine the health of twelve elementary schools under the Madras Corporation. He was given an assistant from the Surgeon-General's office to help him in the clerical work. Results here, again, are not published for general information. In Burma, by order of the Sanitary Commissioner, each Government civil surgeon and health officer was *ex officio* made medical inspector of Government schools in his district, such a medical officer was to visit each school at least once a year, in addition to his usual duties. State aided schools were to be visited only if their managers agreed or requested such a visit. The examinations conducted in Burma were directed more to the sanitation of the school buildings than to the personal hygiene of its scholars. It will thus appear that here in India, efforts were not only belated but spasmodic and inco-ordinated—although we have now a minister in charge of the education portfolio and an Education Commissioner and also in spite of our having a Sanitary Commissioner with the Imperial Government. But, of all parts of India, Bengal has the worst record in this respect. Some years ago, a Madrassi private practitioner, interested only in eye sight made a sort of private survey of the eye sight of the students of some of the colleges, his examination led to no public report. In July 1916, Dr C P Segard of the Calcutta Young Men's Christian Association distributed a small printed post card to some Calcutta high schools. It contained a few points of interest, but it appears that the examinations were not conducted and the results, therefore, are not forthcoming. Some three years ago the Government of Bengal called together a conference of some notabilities in Bengal, who deliberated and made certain recommendations, but here again the resolution of the Government of Bengal on the subject is a sealed book to the public.

RAJ RAMES CHANDRA—*cont*

The best therefore that can be said of India is that in spite of its highly centralised organisation only sporadic flash in the pan sort of attempts have hitherto taken place. They savour more or less of a curiosity or a passing whim than of a responsible duty under taken of set purpose. What is more painfully striking however is the stolid indifference coupled with lamentable ignorance in the matter even among those whose duty it is to do better and know better.

With a view to studying the physique of our students on the 29th April 1916 I addressed the Director of Public Instruction in Bengal for permission to examine the health of the students of the two premier schools in Bengal—the Hare and Hindu Schools.

We (Dr P. N. Chatterji, Dr D. Ghosal and myself) commenced work on the 11th July and left off on the 26th September *for want of permission* from other school managers to four of whom we had applied. During this period we examined the following number of students—

☛

Periods	Schools	Number of students
11th July to 6th September	Hindu School	60
11th September to 15th September	Sanskrit College Tol Department	68
16th September to 6th September	St Paul School	133
	TOTAL	261

Our plan of action was to take up schools on the *secular* principle so that we might study in groups certain social, religious and local environmental conditions and their effect on the people of that sect. We selected the Hindu School, the St Paul's School (Christian boys) and the Tol or indigenous department of the Sanskrit College simply because their managers very courteously permitted us to examine their boys.

The subject of health examination of school children evoked an under current of mixed feelings among both the scholars, their guardians and the school teachers. The teachers were silently mutinous, the guardians were full of suspicion and contemptuous sneers in the beginning and the utmost unconcern after the examinations were begun, while the pupils were often full of boyishness. A scion of an ancient house declined to let us have the honour of touching his person although he belonged to a public school. We mention these not in a spirit of complaint but as a warning to future workers.

Before starting work we applied to several authorities to ascertain the measure of their responsibility and to gain such suggestions from them as they could afford.

(a) The Registrar of the Calcutta University was pleased to write thus—

There is no provision in the University Act about it (examination of health of students) and it is not known whether it is contemplated to have such provision * * * * *. The only provision about sanitation in schools that the University indirectly makes is insistence on the sanitary surrounding, ventilation being good, rules against overcrowding and purity of drinking water provided in the schools as well as supervision of tiffin supplied in the schools in some cases (D O No 212 dated the 2nd August 1916). (We do not know how much of this tall talk is applicable or really applied to mofussil schools where the surroundings, the water supply and the food supply are all decidedly bad and therefore deserving of greater care.)

(b) The Director of Public Instruction has intimated that it is no part of his departmental duties to undertake a regular examination of school boys' health and that though certain proposals in connection with the medical examination of school children in certain areas are now under the consideration of Government they do not involve legislation (D O No D-5 dated the 7th August 1917).

RAY, RAMES CHANDRA—*contd*

- (c) The Surgeon-General with the Government of Bengal intimated that his department never officially undertook any work of this sort. Perhaps the management of a few medical men and establishments is all that pertains to his office the health of the province being the care of somebody else.
- (d) The Chairman of the Calcutta Corporation, and the Hon'ble Member in charge of the Education portfolio in Bengal—have not replied to all

It appears, therefore, that in Bengal the health of the school boy, or what is the same thing, the education, physically, of the Bengali nation is nobody's concern—each departmental head looking upon the routine work of his department as though it were all and the end of his tenure of the office. In England, however, matters are quite different and it is refreshing to know what amount of official and private work is daily being done there. In 1907, an Act was passed providing for the medical examination of school children, called the Education (Administrative Provision) Act. The English Board of Education enthusiastically took up the work thus imposed upon it. Medical officers of health of large towns and counties also became medical inspectors of schools. And, further, to help the indigent poor to live more cleanly, in 1897, the Cleansing of Persons Act was passed. Under the provisions of law, scholars are fed by each school authority at public expense if their parents are too poor to afford a good midday meal. The expenses are borne by the county or municipal authorities and are embodied on the county or borough education rate, each parish (county) bearing its own proportionate share. The medical officer (county or borough) is empowered, by statute, to take proceedings against parents who, after warning, still neglect the advice or cautions of the medical officer—the penalties being fine or imprisonment. All students are bound to practise physical exercises in the open, daily, for half an hour before lessons. Organised games are recognised and encouraged as part of the school curriculum. These exercises are compulsory under the code of instructions issued by the Board of Education.

Regarding their residence, students were divided into three classes —
 (i) Those who were permanent residents of Calcutta with parents or guardians.

(ii) Those who resided in 'messes' or 'hostels'.

(iii) Those who, living in the suburbs, attended daily from their suburban homes.

Such of the students as had a mofussil home (and they meant chiefly those patronising "messes") were specifically asked if they regularly spent each of the long vacations in their country homes. The reasons for this enquiry were two in number—to know if those visiting their homes in malaria-stricken areas were liable to relapses—for our experience as practitioners tended that way, and if those visiting non-malarious areas were benefiting by the periodical change. Answers to these queries were conflicting. In three long vacations thus connection, I cannot help pointing out that, of the September–October, in Bengal [*viz*, summer vacation in July, the *pooja* vacation in March and June], and the examination vacation for university candidates between March and June], the *pooja* vacation is the worst for students—for they invariably contract malaria during that period.

A few words about the 'mess' should be added here. Formerly, every student was free to select any house and any company for living. Nowadays, the University insists on university candidates living in licensed messes, but school authorities do not appear to be exacting in this matter. As a result, those who live in messes usually do so with their relations and village folk. They live fairly comfortably there, but have to suffer any amount of inconvenience in the matter of food. Mess life teaches the virtues of self-help and fellow-feeling but is, in other respects, a lifeless, tame affair.

Hygienists are agreed as to the total number of hours of study that students should not exceed at certain ages of their lives. Accurate statistics under this head were compiled and they are tabulated elsewhere. It would not be uninteresting to go into this matter a little in detail. Here, in Bengal, the following educational systems are in vogue —

- (A) *Initiation into the alphabets*—Most of the children are taught the Bengali alphabet, the numbers and the multiplication tables between the ages of five and six.

RAY RAMES CHANDRA—*contd*

Where a mother a leisured father or brother exists the child is carried through his first second and third primers at home till he is well into his sixth year of life At this stage one of three things happens—the child is either admitted into a school or placed under a private tutor or taught at home by the guardian—home teaching being carried on well up to the 12th or seventh or higher class of high English schools

- (B) *Infant school or pathshala*—Most of the villages had and some yet have the indigenous primary school called *pathshala* Here the pupils squat (on small mats which they carry to and from home daily) and in a sing song monotonous tone continually repeat what the teacher or *Gurumohashaya* says Thus they learn by rote either in the open air or in huts the numerals the addition subtraction and multiplication tables and a quantity of mental arithmetic They practise handwriting not on slates but on palm leaves They have a monitor teacher occasionally to help the *Gurumohashaya* This kind of school which sits only morning and evening is fast disappearing
- (C) *Middle schools* are in every respect like high schools only that in them the multiplicity of subjects and the humble condition of the school buildings tend to wear down the young scholars too early Very few people nowadays avail themselves of this intermediate stage
- (D) *High English schools*—The three schools we are dealing with belong to this class Here there are nine classes leading from the rudiments of English to the matriculation stage The periods of teaching are roughly these—10 30 to 11 15 11 15 to 12 0 12 10 to 1 1 30 to 2 15 2 15 to 3 0 3 5 to 3 45 or out of 5½ hours a total interval of 40 minutes is allowed—irrespective of the ages of the pupils We thus get the following statistics worked out—

Physical limit of work per day		WHAT ACTUALLY HAPPENS HERE			
		At school daily		At home daily	
		Hours H M		Morning H M	Night H M
up to 8	1	4	45	1	1
to 10	18	4	4	1	4½
to 13	4	4	4	1	30
to 15	30	4	45	2	0
to 17	36	4	4	2	1
to 19	4	4	45	10	2

We have to remember in addition the following important facts in this connection—

- (1) This country is tropical and adverse to much continued work
- (2) School examinations and home tasks are overfrequent and overstep the capacity of students
- (3) Our children are fed chiefly on a non nitrogenous diet
- (4) Their health is nobody's concern unless they actually fall ill
- (5) No compulsory open air exercise obtains here
- (6) During examination season it is all work and no play
- (7) Malaria and dyspepsia are eternally present in Bengal

Are things practically unknown to our boys at least in the western sense Our boys look down upon games and parents are rare who would encourage their boys to participate in games The result is that every year a games fee is compulsorily realised from each scholar and while the guardians pay this impost and the school authorities collect it neither of them seems alive to each other's duties and responsibilities in this

RAY, RAMIS CHANDRA *contd*

respect. The school very often suffers from want of a good playground, if any exists, the teachers themselves, sedentary and pot bellied individual, are supremely indifferent to its conditions, one gymnastic and dull instructor is often attached to two or three neighbouring schools, the teachers of all of which consider this instructor as outside the pale of their human interest. St. Paul's School is an exception in this respect. The extensive well laid out grounds, the compulsory pre-school hour gymnastics and drill, and the post school hour football, and the practically free compulsory tiffin—apply to all the scholars who, one and all, appeared in better form, smart and agile. We venture to suggest that the authorities of each school should be compelled to have a good playground and a covered area (for use during the rains), and that a minimum physical development, strength, and endurance should be made the test, along with the "test" examination, of eligibility to go up for the matriculation examination. A whole time gymnastics instructor should be attached to each school, the instructor should take his due share in the making up of each pupil, year in year out. Prizes should be awarded and competitions frequently encouraged in games and sports. It would be the surest way to kill a real interest in games and sports if the present staff of school teachers were to be entrusted to see them carried on. Most of them never in their lives saw what the gymnasium was, and the humdrum sedentary life of a school teacher has taken away what of life remained in him. To begin with on Saturdays, the lower classes should be closed and the boys made to go through some games and sports—the class teachers being encouraged to join them. The Corporation should set apart public parks for certain days in the week; and for certain hours daily, exclusively for school boys and the formation of small private clubs and gymnasiums should be encouraged. Once this sportive spirit is ingrained in the young boy he will keep it up instinctively in the upper classes. Guardians should take a personal interest and, if possible, participate in these sports and games, and school masters should not shun these as they do the plague. Unless a boy sees his teacher at school and guardian at home systematically participating in his sports, or taking a lively interest in them, his own enthusiasm will never keep up. Guardians, as a rule, are prone to expect their money's full worth by having all work and no play, but surely a man does not consist of brains only, hence, simultaneous physical development is much needed too. Such as they are, our school boys are 'gentlemen'—sedate, grave, unsporting, hating to turn their hands to anything but the quill. What with malaria and other endemic diseases, with parental neglect and a poor diet rich in adulterations, with continuous ramming in of lessons, home tasks, and exercises, and frequent examinations, with a contemptuous sneer for manual labour and tiring exertion, our boys grow up into weak men—weak in physique, weak in intellectual equipment, and, therefore, necessarily weak in moral strength. The memory of any pious philanthropist who will endow our institutions with good gymnasiums will be cherished with everlasting gratitude, and the example of guardians and teachers vying with each other to improve the physique of the young hopefuls will be not only a model for future generations to copy, but will clear up the atmosphere of the gymnasium, for, as at present, a Bengali boy who regularly frequents the gymnasium is often found in undesirable company, physical culture being yet the pastime of the illiterate!!!

Greater attention to sports and games, as well as regular physical culture, will have the additional advantage of diverting the young man from secret sexual indulgence. My practice among my community, and among students in particular, has given me frequent opportunities to study the student from every point of view, and the increasing neurasthenia among our students and men is, to my mind, the resultant of a combination for which the student is not directly responsible. Born in a tropical climate and among a naturally sensitive people, reared in families where married men are by no means rare, eating stimulating diets (in some cases at least), living in luxurious hostels, fed upon cheap romances, roaming in cities studded with unfortunates, what else can a weakly, brainy young man do? The easiest way to divert him is not by creating libraries or institutes, but by endowing gymnasiums and sports and games clubs all over India.

I had the greatest difficulty in eliciting from each student what his 'amusements' were, in fact, many felt nonplussed when I put to them the question—"What are your amusements? What other exercise than walking do you take?" A study of their

RAJ RAMES CHANDRA—*con d*

answers is edifying. It is tabulated elsewhere. It will open the eyes of many educationists and it ought to open the eyes of those who seek to recruit the army in Bengal. Our indigenous inexpensive plays and games are out of fashion and it is considered beneath the dignity of a pupil to turn to them while every form of manual labour is deemed unseemly. I very much wish that the boy scout movement would be compulsorily introduced into every school. To give an idea of the extent of physical exercise taken by our students I tabulate the results elsewhere.

Coming to the results of our examinations we find that by appearance —

29 students were obese	per cent 41
78 muscular	per cent 11.07
459 lean	per cent 65.2
139 medium	per cent 19.4

Those who had superabundant fat were called obese, those whose pectoral and bicipital muscles stood out and were very light in movements were called muscular, those who were thin and wiry were called lean, and the rest were called medium—neither too flabby nor visibly muscular.

The presence of chain of glands on both sides of the neck, with a sallow countenance, was made the test of scrofulousness and judged by this standard 107 students or 15.2 per cent of the whole were considered scrofulous by us.

Each student was bared down to his waist and socks and shoes were removed. The heights and weights were carefully taken and the results have been tabulated carefully. To enable our readers to compare the results obtained in other countries we have put side by side the English and American measurements and the measures of girls too. We leave each reader to draw his own inferences. In this connection I beg to draw the reader's attention to another table copied from my *Outline of Medical Jurisprudence* giving the weights of Indian viscera side by side with those of European viscera just to give an insight into the relative development and growth of the two peoples. The Indian is in every sense inferior in physique man for man. The other measurements (chest expansion, chest girth, abdominal measurements, cranial measurements) have also been tabulated and they tell their tale.

Out of the total number of pupils examined 967 had enlarged tonsils, of whom 137 had their right tonsil larger and 131 their left. We forgot to make note of mouth breathing in this connection and the 107 scrofulous were included in this class.

Nasal Polypus was found in 219 pupils, 115 having it in their right nostril and 104 in the left. In no case was the polypus so large as to obstruct breathing completely and in most of the cases the pupils were unaware of this defect.

The practice of squatting at home and of using seats unsuited to age at school renders each boy liable to sit crooked. In fact no Bengali student seemed to possess any erector spinal muscle. Judged on the strictest standard every boy had defective posture—to the utter unconcern of both the school authorities and guardians. We have also seen students lying on cots that sagged—everything tending to produce a stooping gait. A manly carriage is a rare sight. To find out therefore how many of such pupils had actual prominence of the dorso-lumbar spines we allowed each to sit as he chose and out of 703 pupils examined in 390 (per cent quite 54.05) the spinal curvature was plainly visible. It is interesting in this connection to recall Sir Havelock Charles' researches into the anatomy of the Asiatic. He found in the Asiatic that the lumbar vertebrae were 8 mm. thicker in their bodies posteriorly due to this accentuated spinal curvature. Although the spine is so much curved although scrofula is present in quite 15.2 per cent of our students and although our students fare is of the poorest and add to these all the fact that in their boyhood many a boy has to regularly take charge of his younger brother or sister regularly carrying the latter in his arms—the wonder is that diseases of the vertebrae are not as frequent as they should have been. I purposely refrain from mentioning how unsuitable the benches are in the schools we have examined. It is time I think that prompt attention was directed to this matter.

RAY, RAMES CHANDRA *contd*

,

We tested eyesight in a very general way and paid no heed to other defects in the eye save the one of sight. But, as practitioners, we have seen trachoma much too frequently. We stood the boy at a distance of 20 feet and asked him to read through the Snellen test types. Those who failed to do so were noted. We did not stop to enquire whether it was myopia or hypermetropia. Judged even by this crude test the number of students who had defective vision was —

Only right eye defective	52 (i e , 7.3 per cent)
, left „ „	60 (i e , 8.5 „)
Both eyes defective	184 (i e , 26.1 „)
Those with normal vision	407 (i e , 57.8 „)

It is interesting to note, in this connection, that out of so many students with defective vision, only 40 students (i e , 5.6 per cent) used spectacles—the glasses of some of whom required change. It is considered queer in this country for boys to wear spectacles, for, the same exposes them to the ridicule of old-fashioned people, that is the reason why so many students with defective vision are without correcting glasses. It is difficult to account for this large number of students with defective vision. It would be a very suggestive study to compare the sight of students of towns with the sight of students in the mofussil. At home, as at school, absolutely no heed is paid to the amount and the direction of light that falls upon the books, the glaze and thinness of the paper, the smallness and clumsiness of the print, the slant of the desks, the posture of the learners—are all matters of absolute unconcern to the guardians and the school authorities. Immediate steps should be taken to prevent this increasing defect of vision.

We have not kept statistics of the dirty condition of the ears—the ears of most students showing a large amount of cerumen. But, happily, defective hearing was very rare. We applied the tuning fork and watch tests and found only 10 students (1.4 per cent) slightly short of hearing. As the teachers were unaware of these defects, and as the students never complained, no front seat was reserved for them. We did not go into the causes of their defective hearing, partly for want of time and partly for want of proper light, for our period of activity coincided with the heavy rainy season and the places assigned to us were not always well lighted.

Oral cleanliness is a thing practically unknown to school boys. Those who chew *pân* (betel) seldom take care to wash their mouth soon after, those who do not chew *pân* do not see the necessity for a periodical mouth-wash. The result was that we found caries in as many as 138 students (19.6 per cent), and this included big boys as well as small boys. Irregular dental arrangement, Hutchinson's teeth (8.4 per cent), and overcrowding of teeth were also noticed.

In the case of every boy we made a note of his cleanliness—as regards his person and dress. The number of students who were immaculately clean could be counted on one's fingers' ends, but, if we take into consideration the number of students who were offensively unclean, we note that 94 students (or 13.3 per cent) were so. The use of *pîn* the daily use of oil to anoint the body, the too free perspiration continually oozing from the body, the absence of underwears and the infrequent change of dress, coupled with the want of a daily bath in some cases, rendered some students offensively unclean. We would not mention the particular institution contributing the largest number to this category.

No one is more alive than myself to the comparatively low statistical value of my figures in consequence of the small number of boys examined, but, for that, I am not to blame. My object in undertaking the enquiry was a personal one—viz, to know the physical condition of our boys. But, having secured some figures, I thought that their publication may have the value of stimulating further work on these lines. The Secretary of the Bengal Social Service League (Mayo Hospital, Strand Road, Calcutta) has given me to understand that he is continuing this work.

I hope before long we shall see Government taking up legislation on school health examination, and the public forming voluntary committees such as 'care committees'.

RAY RAME CHANDRA—*contd.*

to look after the free dieting of the indigent scholar at mid day and after all that pertains to him at home and at school out of school children committees to visit and keep watch upon children whose temporary ailments keep them out of school after care and following up committees to look after school leavers tuberculosis care committees to look after tuberculous children and lecturing committees to organize regular popular lectures on hygiene There should also be free and separate clinics for the examination and treatment of diseases of the ears eyes nose throat skin and teeth there should be open air school and playground classes public swimming baths and gymnasiums specially reserved for children There should be parks set apart for children and provision for free steamer or boat trips or railway excursion into the country there should be remedial exercises under skilled experts And lastly I look forward to the day when every male or female seeking admission into any school will be thoroughly medically examined and the kind and quality of his or her training determined upon the results of such medical examinations

The following recommendations are made —

- (a) To build up the nation's manhood a systematic regular and periodical examination of scholars is a necessity To do so paid whole time qualified medical officers should be attached to a school or a group of neighbouring schools
- (b) Legal powers should be taken to authorise —
 - (i) Such medical examiners to conduct their work under proper authorities to enforce rules of segregation and quarantine to compel guardians either to have the serious defects of their wards treated at home or to place their wards under proper charitable hospital treatment to compel school authorities to take such sanitary or other public health measures as may be deemed necessary
 - (ii) School managers to demand from municipal or other funds such amounts of money as may be necessary to supply free wholesome tiffin to indigent scholars
 - (iii) Municipal and local Governments to establish and maintain exclusively for the benefit of school children special charity hospitals for the treatment of diseases of the ear eye nose and throat
 - (iv) The local Governments to appoint educational boards in every district and in each of the presidency towns Such boards may be composed of representatives of school teachers of municipal or district board authorities of Government executive departments and of local men of high and leading The Director of Public Instruction the Vice Chancellor of the Calcutta University and the Minister in charge of the Bengal Educational portfolio together with three representatives to be elected in rotation from among the several district educational boards—may form the Central Educational Board
 - (v) The formation of volunteer associations such as are indicated on pre page
- (c) Regular syllabus of graduated exercises as such or by means of organised games should be laid down by the University And a minimum physical development as well as the performance of a systematic course of exercises should be insisted upon as conditional to the grant of a diploma or degree The medical officer of each school will have the right to modify this standard in special cases
- (d) From the moment a boy is admitted into a school till the date of his joining an appointment in any establishment or of his entering a profession or trade all the health records regarding the same boy must be entered on one and the same card from year to year

I suggest that a beginning be made at once—at least in some selected areas like Calcutta Dacca Rajshahi etc

I also request that similar steps be taken with reference to school girls—about whom I have not much personal knowledge

RAY, RAMES CHANDRA—*contd*

APPENDICES

School boy's Health Examination Form

Name			Nationality		Class		Section		
Age		yr	mo		Number of brothers		and sisters		
Father's occupation (if deceased or retired, please state exact nature of his past occupation)									
Income monthly, Rs									
Address			Village			District		P O	
Total duration of stay in Calcutta				yr	mo.		Regularly goes to desh ?		
Lives in a " mess " ?				Licensed ?		In family with guardian ?			
Total number of hours of study at home (ordinarily)					By day		By night		
Does he play football ?				Visits gymnasium ?			Uses dumb-bells ?		
Walks how many miles daily ?					What other exercises ?				
What serious ailments since birth ?					At what age ?				
Illness during this year ?				Is he frequently ailing ?			With what ?		
Diet		Does he regularly eat (a) fish ?				(b) Meat ?		How often ?	
(c) Ghee (with rice) ?				(d) Milk ?			(e) Loochis ?		
What does he take for ' tiffin ' ? t school ?									
What food at night ?				What are his amusements ?					
Spectacles first used in what year ?					Renewed when ?				
Does he maintain himself by private tuition ?					Married ?				
Physique			Appearance				Scrofulous ?		
Habits			Peculiarities						
Height		ft	in		Weight		lbs	Measurement round waist	in
Chest girth			in		Chest expansion		in	Formation	
Pupils		Eyegight		R		L		Teeth	
Ear		R		L		Nose		R	L
Throat		Tonsils		R		L		Palpitation ?	
Posture		Standing		Sitting		Cranial circumference			in
Cleanliness of Body			of Dress			of Habits			

Each item should be filled in legibly by parent or guardian (and not by the pupil) in ink, and returned promptly to the head master the next day

To be filled in by medical examiner at school

PAL RAMES CHANDRA—contd

Average height and weight

AGE	MALES						FEMALES			
	ENGLISH		AMERICAN		BENGALI		ENGLISH		AMERICAN	
	Weight	Height	Weight	Height	Weight	Height	Weight	Height	Weight	Height
5	39.0	41.03	49.68	46.73			39.2	40.65	45.31	44.74
6	44.4	44.00	51.75	47.17			41.7	44.88	48.68	46.66
7	40.7	45.97	54.72	48.3	44.4	48.75	47.5	44.45	51.00	47.98
8	54.2	47.05	60.1	49.61	48.1	50.00	51	46.60	57.68	49.67
9	60.4	49.70	64.56	50.8	57	51.13	55.5	48.73	64.38	52.35
10	65	51.84	71.75	54.09	57.9	53.50	60	51.05	70.03	53.96
11	70	53.50	73.30	55.50	60	55.17	68.1	53.10	79.07	55.67
12	76.7	54.99	84.00	56.51	60.8	56.7	76.5	55.66	80.8	58
13	86	56.91	94.8	58.70	80.8	60.0	87.2	57.77	90	60.06
14	90	59.33	107.4	61.40	80.4	65	96.7	59.80	105.90	61.83
15	107	64	117.6	63.93	103.6	63.75	106.3	60.93	105.38	64.63
16	119.0	64.31	121.95	64.5	109.1	65.50	113.1	61.75	113.98	65.01
17			134.05	66.67	114.5	65.60			117.75	65.6
18			140.0	68.96	116.9	65.60			117.73	65.57
19					118.1	65.6				
20					108.0	65.75				
21					108.6	65.33				
22					108.5	66.16				
23					107.5	64.33				
24					114.0	67.6				
25					106.8	64.00				
26					142.0	67.00				
27					163.3	65.58				
28					179.0	66.50				
29					84.0	63.50				
30					170	67.00				

Income statistics

I—General averages—

		Per cent
Income over Rs 1 000	43 guardians or	6.12
between Rs 500 and 1 000	30	4.98
between Rs 100 and 500	165	23.47
below Rs 100	165	23.47
not given	295	41.96
TOTAL	703	100.00

RAY, RAMES CHANDRA *contd**Income statistics contd.**II—Hindu School—*

			Per cent
Total number of pupils examined—502			
Rs 1,000 and over	43 pupils or		8 56
„ 500 to 1,000	32 „ „		6 38
„ 100 to 500	112 „ „		22 30
„ 100 and less	49 „ „		9 76
Income not given	266 „ „		52 99
TOTAL	502 „ „		99 99

III—Sanskrit College—

			Per cent.
Total number of pupils examined—68			
Rs 1,000 and over	0 pupils or		0
„ 500 to 1,000	0 „ „		0
„ 100 to 500	9 „ „		13 24
„ 100 and less	46 „ „		67 64
Income not given	13 „ „		19 12
TOTAL	68 „ „		100 00

IV—C M S St Paul's School—

			Per cent.
Total number of pupils examined—133			
Rs 1,000 and over	0 pupils or		0
„ 500 to 1 000	3 „ „		2 25
„ 100 to 500	44 „ „		33 08
„ 100 and less	70 „ „		52 63
Income not given	16 „ „		12 03
TOTAL	133 „ „		99 99

*Residence Statistics**I—General averages—*

			Per cent.
Total number of students examined—703			
Resident with guardians in Calcutta	568 students or		80 79
„ in mess or hostel	129 „ „		18 36
„ outside of Calcutta	6 „ „		0 85
TOTAL	703 „ „		100 00

II—Hindu School—

			Per cent.
Total number of students examined—502			
Resident with guardians in Calcutta	478 students or		95 22
„ in mess or hostel	19 „ „		3 78
„ outside of Calcutta	5 „ „		0 99
TOTAL	502 „ „		99 99

RAY JAMIS CHANDRA—*contd**Residence Statistics—contd**III—Sanskrit College—*

		Per cent
Total number of students examined—68		
Resident with guardians in Calcutta	39 students or	57.35
in mess or hostel	28	41.17
outside of Calcutta	1	1.48
Total	68	100.00

IV—C M S St Paul's School—

		Per cent
Total number of students examined—133		
Resident with guardians in Calcutta	39 students or	37.60
in mess or hostel	83	62.40
outside of Calcutta	0	0
Total	133	100.00

*Statistics of ailments**General averages—*

		per cent
Typhoid fever	72 or 10.24	
Diphtheria	5	0.71
Malaria	67	9.53
Dysentery	39	5.64
Cholera	15	2.13
Pneumonia	16	2.24
Chicken pox	5	0.71
Small pox	10	1.42
Infantile liver	1	0.14
Asthma	3	0.42
Beri beri	1	0.14
Dropy	2	0.28
Paralysis	2	0.28
Phthisis	5	0.71
Colic pain	3	0.42
Axillary abscess	4	0.57
Ordinary fever	47	6.82
Bronchitis	3	0.42
Appendicitis	2	0.28
Pharyngitis	1	0.14
No history	400	56.89

Diet statistics

	Number of students	Per centage
Strictly vegetarians	68	9.67
Meat and fish eaters	381	54.19
Only fish eaters	635	90.33
Habitual milk users	538	76.53
ladoo users	583	82.93

RAY, RAMPS CHANDRA—*cont'd**Physical disabilities present*

	Number of students	Percentage
Carious teeth	198	28 16
Granular pharynx	120	17 07
Enlarged tonsils, right	147	20 91
„ „ left	144	20 48
Scrofulous	107	15 2
Defective hearing, right	13	1 84
„ „ left	15	2 13
„ sight, right	52	7 39
„ „ left	60	8 53
„ „ both	184	26 17
Students already wearing glasses	40	7 3
Polypus in nose right	115	16 35
„ „ left	105	14 93

Physique statistics

	Hindu School	Sanskrit College	St Paul's School	Averages generally
	Per cent	Per cent	Per cent	Per cent
Obese	28 or 5 57	1 or 1 48	0 or 0	29 or 4 12
Muscular	66 „ 13 14	3 „ 4 40	9 „ 6 77	78 „ 11 09
Lean	298 „ 59 39	47 „ 69 12	114 „ 85 72	459 „ 65 29
Medium	110 „ 21 91	17 „ 25 00	10 „ 7 59	137 „ 19 48

Chest girth

Above 40 in	30 to 40 in	25 to 30 in	20 to 25 in
4 = 56%	231 = 32 8%	317 = 45 09%	151 = 21 4%

Chest expansion

1 to 2 in	2 to 3 in	3 to 4 in	Above 4 in
490 = 69 70%	174 = 24 75%	36 = 5 26%	3 = 44%

Details about spectacles users

Age at time of our examination	How many at that age using glasses	Details of the period for which spectacles are being used
11 years	3	2 for 1 year, 1 for 3 years
12	0	
13 „	1	Using for 4 years
14 „	6	2 using 1 year, 1 for 2 years, 1 for 3 years, 1 for 1 month, 1 for 4 months
15 „	15	5 using 1 year, 2 for 2 years, 2 for 3 years, 1 for 4 years, 3 for 3 months, 1 for 2 months, 1 for 6 months
16 „	8	1 using 1 year, 2 for 2 years, 2 for 3 years, 1 each for 4 and 6 years
17 „	5	1 using 1 year, 2 for 3 years, 1 for 6 years, 1 for 2 months
18 „	1	Using for 2 years,
19 „	1	Using for 1 year

RAY PARI CHANDRA—*contd.*—RAY SARAT CHANDRA—RAY SATIS C ANDRA

Details of defective vision in St. Paul's School and Hindu School —

Class of the school	V =		V =		V =		V =		V =		V =		TOTAL NUMBER OF PUPILS	
	S	H	S	H	S	H	S	H	S	H	S	H	S	H
1st	1	10	1	10	—	8	—	9	3	8	6	0	8	100
2nd	1	10	—	—	—	—	—	5	1	10	1	17	8	96
3rd	1	8	—	4	—	—	1	4	—	3	5	1	19	80
4th	—	—	—	4	—	4	—	1	—	3	—	1	19	95
5th	1	—	—	1	—	1	—	1	11	3	5	—	4	37
6th	—	1	—	1	1	—	—	—	1	1	5	—	1	35
7th	—	—	—	—	—	3	—	3	3	3	6	14	3	61
8th	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	3	—	6	1	0	10

Exercises and Amusements

Football	34.5 or 49.07 per cent
Dumb bell use regularly	142 20.1
Attends gymnasium	146 20.7
Walks daily or exercises	415 59.03
Regular bioscope goes	59 8.3
Other miscellaneous amusements	137 19.4
No definite amusements	50 7.3

(Most of the above notes are from my article on Bengali School boys' Health published in the 1917 November issue of the *Indian Medical Gazette*.)

RAY, SARAT CHANDRA

My experience is that their health is undermined. The causes are —

- Overstrain of both body and mind consequent upon the present method of examination
- Want of physical culture
- Want of proper diet
- Insanitation of the localities in which the students generally live
- Congestion of students in small areas and houses. Yes I have suggested the remedies in the earlier part of this answer as well as in answer to question 9 (rigidity)

RAY SATIS CHANDRA

During the school stage there is much unnecessary duplication of work but apart from this I do not consider that the present system as such imposes an undue physical or mental strain upon students. The strain of the existing course of study falls with disastrous effects upon poor students who suffer from want of sufficient and nourishing food during the best period of their physical development. To this must be added

RAY, SATIS CHANDRA—*contd* —REYAZUDDIN, SYED, QUAZI-- RICHARDSON, THOMAS H —
ROY, HIRA LAL

the scourge of malaria, prevalent in the mofussil, which is also undermining the health of our boys. The strain, if there is any strain at all, is felt because the health of our boys is already undermined by malaria and malnutrition.

REYAZUDDIN, SYED, QUAZI

The existing method is sufficient. The answer to the second part of the question is in the negative.

RICHARDSON, THOMAS II.

The students at the Civil Engineering College undoubtedly improve in health and physical development. Colonel McCay of the Medical College some years ago got some measurements of our students and may be able to give his results.

ROY, HIRA LAL.

My experience is that the average health and physical development of students in Bengal is deplorable. It is not due so much to the syllabus as to the system of examination. The undue strain through which a student has to go for six months or so just before the examination is very injurious to his health. But the main cause is the want of facilities for regular exercise.

In the city of Calcutta, owing to the very large number of students and very few open spaces, it is impossible to provide students with sufficient playgrounds. Moreover, outdoor sports are not in all cases, the best cure for physical weakness. Every student at the beginning of every academic session should undergo a physical examination by the medical adviser of the college, who should point out the particular forms of exercise that every individual student should have, and he will have to act according to these instructions. Many people have a wrong idea that any form of exercise is good enough for everybody. Those who are acquainted with college football teams know how many of the fine 'forward' players become physical wrecks afterwards and fall victims to phthisis, consumption, etc.

To provide every student with facilities for these prescribed forms of exercise every college should have a gymnasium attached to it under a qualified physical director.

Apart from this, to adjust a proper relation between physical fitness and academic attainments, the following rules should be observed by the University —

- (a) Physical exercise should be made compulsory for every student during the first four years of his college career.
- (b) Every student who holds any scholarship must pass the physical examination, otherwise, his scholarship should be forfeited and he should discontinue his studies if the physicians so advise.
- (c) No student who has failed in any college or university examination should be allowed to represent his college or the University in any sports until he passes the next examination. This will drive out the 'professional amateurs' from colleges.

I am myself no believer in compulsion, but the painful circumstances of the country and the early death of many a brilliant student of our University compel me to suggest these steps.

ROY MUNINDRANATH—POY The Hon ble Babu SURENDRA NATH—SAHAY Rai Bahadur
BHAGVATI—SANYAL NISIKANTA—SAIRU The Hon ble Dr TEJ Bahadur

ROY MUNINDRANATH

The physical condition of young men is generally deplorable. Too great a strain is imposed on their health by the system of university examination upon the results of which everything is staked.

An impetus to the pursuit of healthy recreation may be given by the following —

- (a) Excursions made by students in a body under teachers for a few days each session
- (b) Creating a tendency to acquire hardihood by manual labour in the school compound so as to prevent a soft and unduly sensitive nature being fostered in a boy
- (c) The creation of a healthy corporate life both in the school and college where excellence in physical labour and prowess might receive proper encouragement and preference to a mere bookish habit

ROY The Hon ble Babu SURENDRA NATH

Having myself been brought up in the Calcutta University and having sons and relations who have also been brought up there I claim to have some experience as to the health and physical development of students during their university career.

I think the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students who are not exceptionally robust.

Students generally do not get that amount of help from their professors and lecturers which they fairly expect to get from them. This is on account of the large number of students in the colleges. The result is that boys to qualify themselves for examinations take recourse to cramming.

I would therefore suggest that a smaller number of students be admitted to colleges affiliated to the University and that if the private colleges have not sufficient funds to employ a larger number of professors Government ought to come forward to finance them.

SAHAY Rai Bahadur BHAGVATI

On the whole there has been a distinct improvement in the physique and health of the students of Bengal. There are cases of physical and mental breakdown but these are not due to the university system but to some extent to the desire for emulation and excellence and largely to the keen struggle for existence which forces the pace of university education. The only remedy for such cases is to segregate the university system from the system for earning a living.

SANYAL NISIKANTA

The mental strain in the earliest stage is unnecessarily great. In colleges there is too much routine work for students who read for the arts course. The strain would be lessened by the adoption of the vernacular medium and the reduction of the number of subjects to be studied by every student.

SAIRU The Hon ble Dr TEJ BAHADUR

I cannot answer this question with reference to Bengal but I think that the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon the students of

SAPRU, The Honble Di TEJ BAHADUR—*contd*—SARKAR, GOPAL CHANDRA SARKAR, KALIPADA SASTRI, KOKILESWAR, Vidyaratna—SASTRI, Rai RAJENDRA CHANDRA, Bahadur

these provinces who are not exceptionally robust I would suggest the following remedies —

- (a) Fewer examinations
- (b) Better designed courses of study, involving less physical and mental strain
- (c) Insistence upon students taking part in games and general physical exercise
- (d) Periodical medical inspection of students

SARKAR, GOPAL CHANDRA

Generally speaking, the health of students during their university career may be regarded as tolerably good, except in particular localities. But their physical development is not generally quite on a par with their intellectual progress. The present system certainly imposes an undue mental strain upon students, because they are required to learn everything through the medium of a difficult foreign language.

SARKAR, KALIPADA.

During recent years there has been some improvement in the health and physical development of all classes of students. The recent opening of military careers to Bengali youths will have a highly beneficial effect, both direct (witness the University Corps) and indirect, on their health and physique. While this is admitted, the fact is not to be lost sight of that a large number of our students are poor and cannot afford to live in a style suited to their physical and mental requirements. Their dwelling-houses are poor and the food they get is equally so. The consequence is that they cannot fully bear the strain imposed upon them by the University. I do not think that the University is mainly responsible for their breakdown.

The remedy consists in reducing the cost of education and, in a greater degree, in developing the material resources of the country.

SASTRI, KOKILESWAR, Vidyaratna

The physical health and development of the student community in Bengal is steadily deteriorating. The causes are not far to seek. This is due to the following causes —

- (a) Insufficient accommodation, light, ventilation and other sanitary conditions
- (b) Want of sufficiently nourishing food
- (c) Want of proper rest after a full meal. In accordance with the indigenous system of our country, classes should be held in the morning and in the evening, and the whole of the noontime should be set apart for dinner and rest, so that students may not be called upon to do heavy mental work immediately after a full meal as at present.
- (d) Want of open spaces in which they can take their physical exercise

SASTRI, Rai RAJENDRA CHANDRA, Bahadur

My experience has been that the university career in Bengal has a very baneful influence on the health and physical development of students. The present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students who are not exceptionally robust. I would cut down the curriculum for the different examinations and lower the standard of examination for the average student who would be satisfied only with a 'pass'.

SATIAR RADHIKA LAL—SEAL DR BRAJENDRANATH—SEGARD DR C P

SATIAR RADHIKA LAL

The generality of students who live in metropolises of Calcutta are a prey to dyspepsia and defect of eyesight and like diseases disabling them from properly bearing the physical and mental strain imposed upon them by the present system. To improve their morality and health students must lead the life of the *Brahmacarin* of old as far as possible. An attempt towards this direction is being made in the Bolpur institution of Sir Rabindranath Tagore and the *Gurukul* institution near Hardwar. Students should avoid luxury as far as possible but the students set at large amidst the temptations of city life cannot generally resist the natural youthful inclination of indulging in unnecessary expensive ways of living there being no parent or guardian with them to check their improper pursuits.

Poorer boys who cannot afford it often imitate the fashion of rich boys at the cost of tainting themselves of the necessities of life with the result that they suffer in health for want of proper nourishment. This propensity to finery may be effectually checked by introducing some sort of suitable uniform for students while they are in college.

SEAL DR BRAJENDRANATH

My experience as to the health and physical development of Bengali students has not been very encouraging. Malarial fever in one place rheumatism and chronic dyspepsia in another and nervous debility a feeble physique and a dull moroseness everywhere. That is as much as I know of the mofussil but that is not what I know of Calcutta. My answer to question 17 sums up the situation as I understand it.

I will add only one contributory factor to the many I have enumerated in my last answer. The system of an all subjects final examination (without successive or compartmental tests and with the staking of everything on one final throw) unnecessarily aggravates the present strain to a breaking point in many cases. For the rest the whole theory of education (including the theory of examination) has to be recast in the modern world on the basis of our psycho-physical and psycho-physiological studies in vitality and development in relation to adolescence. For example the crowding of school and university examinations on boys (and still more on girls) during the adolescent age and critical period (say from sixteen to eighteen)—marked by a sudden onset of dullness and depression in certain psychological directions in the general interests of ontogenetic development—must be religiously given up and we must go to school to learn the wisdom of the natural races whose instinct is a surer guide in some of the basic (or subterranean) pathways of life being the urge of Life itself.

SEGARD DR C P

My experience as to the health and physical development of students during their university career in Bengal is that little or no attention is given by the student and that the student is undermining his health during college career. Not only is the strain great upon those who are not robust but it is also weakening to those who are of robust physique. This is in part due to the large number of students who are physically incapable of the strain of a college career. Insufficient money and therefore insufficient food plays an important part. Lack of care and attention to the ordinary rules and laws of health is also an important factor. As a remedy I would suggest medical inspection of students with regard to their physical defects and as to whether they are strong enough to continue their work in school or college.

SEN, ATUL CHANDRA—SEN, B M —SEN, Rai BOIKUNT NATH, Bahadur -

SEN, ATUL CHANDRA

The health of students is one of those most important points which have not received such consideration in our University as they deserve. It must be admitted that there has been a great deterioration in the health of the Bengali student in recent times. The reasons are not far to seek. I may mention the following, among others —

- (a) Want of sufficient and nutritious food
- (b) Want of proper physical exercise
- (c) Stress of examinations
- (d) Absence of provision for innocent amusements
- (e) Residence in overcrowded and ill-ventilated dwelling-houses
- (f) Certain social customs over which the University can have no control
- (g) Absence of any knowledge of physiology and hygiene.

For remedying some of these evils I would suggest the removal of colleges from the heart of the town and the introduction of hygiene as a compulsory subject for school examinations. The houses built in the suburbs for the residence of boys need not be stately buildings, but sufficiently spacious and well ventilated. The roofs may even be tiled or thatched, but to every residential house should be attached extensive open fields and gardens.

The question of supplying wholesome and nutritious food is mainly an economical question. If lodging is provided free the money now spent in paying seat rent may be utilised for improving the diet. Moreover, in the suburbs, where there is plenty of land available, small gardens may be attached to each residential house where vegetables may be grown in abundance and dairies may also be set up for supplying milk and milk-products to the boarders at a small cost.

SEN, B M

Many students in Calcutta have to live in congested areas where there are no facilities for games or outdoor exercise. While realising the beneficial effects of residence in a large town in broadening the outlook on life, I submit that the health of the students is seriously affected. I would, therefore, suggest that some steps be taken to discourage the influx of students into Calcutta except for post-graduate studies. This can be done by increasing the number of mofussil colleges in district towns teaching up to the degree standard. This arrangement would also tend to keep down expenses which are rapidly going up. For post-graduate studies, however, Calcutta, with a few selected towns in the mofussil, ought to be the centre.

SEN, Rai BOIKUNT NATH, Bahadur

The health and physical development of students during their university career in Bengal are not satisfactory. I have reasons for thinking that the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students who are not exceptionally robust.

I beg to suggest the following remedies —

- (a) Arrangements for giving nutritious food in sufficient quantity to students living in hostels and attached messes
- (b) Classes ought to be held in the morning, *i.e.*, from 7 A.M. to 12 A.M. in the winter season and from 6 A.M. to 11 A.M. in other seasons
 - (1) At present in order to attend their classes in time the students take hasty meals, sometimes consisting of food not properly cooked, and, without any rest, the majority walk long distances at a rapid

SEN PAI BOHANT NATH Bahadur—*contd*—SEN NIKHILRANJAN—SEN DR S K

pace and thus the digestive functions are prejudicially affected resulting in several cases in acidity of the stomach dyspepsia and heart troubles

- (ii) If the classes be held in the morning the students would be able to take some light food and then take their day meals at regular hours I do not apprehend any inconvenience to the professors or lecturers
- (c) Regular hours of study at night should be prescribed and the superintendent of hostels and messes should insist on strict observance of the rules and regulations
- (d) The courses of study for different university examinations are very lengthy they should be shortened Depth of knowledge should have precedence over volume

SEN NIKHILRANJAN

The most discouraging feature of student life in this University is the total neglect of all physical training. Very few of the students take part in games and only a small number of them takes any sort of exercise. It is no doubt partly due to the absence of encouragement from the colleges and the lack of opportunities for students to be attracted to games and other exercises. The difficulty here in Calcutta is almost un-surmountable but it can be tackled in places outside the city. Here no fields are available within the city to be used as playgrounds and students cannot be expected to gather on the maidan or in other suburban areas every day from distant parts of the city. Consequently physical training and care of health become a matter of option to the students. The problem should be taken up by both the University and the colleges. Mere erection of a gymnasium in every college will not do—in fact a gymnasium exists in most of the colleges. What is wanted is the creation of an interest in games and physical exercises. This may be done by arranging inter collegiate sports (among different groups of colleges) inter class matches (among the same classes of different colleges) which would encourage those who are not first rate players and are necessarily weeded out in all important games by encouraging the inexpensive Indian games which are likely to be popular among the freshmen of the University hailing from the interior and which require much less space than the foreign outdoor games and by arranging regular excursion parties. Every student should be invited to join one or other of a number of clubs in the colleges and some arrangement should also be made for those who prefer indoor exercises. Another scheme may also be offered. For the sake of physical training among student the resources of all the colleges may be organised and placed at the disposal of every student of the University. In this manner different centres may be created within the city and students may choose any one of them according to their convenience.

In the metropolis the problem is much simpler. In fact the students outside Calcutta do care for physical exercise having greater opportunities than their brethren in the metropolis. The question of more systematic and widespread physical training may be left to the college authorities for solution.

Sometimes the health of a student suffers a breakdown in the course of his study at the University. But this is solely due to the lack of physical exercise on the part of students (often with weak constitutions) as stated above and is sometimes favoured by imperfect nourishment. The remedy lies entirely in the improvement of the physique of the student.

SEN DR S K

Their irregular habits are the main troubles. They do not do anything except in the two or three months before their examinations. Every college or school in Bengal ought to have a doctor amongst the teachers.

SEN, Rai SATIS CHANDRA, Bahadur—SEN, SATISH CHANDRA—SEN, SURYA KUMAR—SEN GUPTA, Dr NARAI CHANDRA—SEN GUPTA, SURENDRA MOHAN

SEN, Rai SATIS CHANDRA Bahadur

The health of the student is generally good. Generally speaking, the present system does not impose an undue physical or mental strain upon students. At the same time, arrangements should be made for outdoor and indoor games and students should be compelled regularly to join them.

SEN, SATISH CHANDRA

The health and physical development of students during their university career are not satisfactory. I think the present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain upon students in general. The evils of the present system of examination have already been pointed out and some remedies have been suggested. A vast majority of our students is very poor and cannot afford to live comfortably, but living is growing dearer and dearer every day. Then, they have very little time to rest after breakfast. They gulp their food hastily and immediately run to college or school. In schools of which I have experience the classes are congested in many instances, held in ill-lighted and ill-ventilated rooms, and, even in those rooms which are not so, the air soon becomes vitiated by reason of the congregation. The result is manifest. In fact, our school buildings ought to be thoroughly improved, further, in a country like ours the midday hours are most unsuitable for class work, and a change of the time for holding classes seems desirable. In this connection, I would beg leave to refer to the practice of drilling boys in secondary schools during noon-tide hours. I fully appreciate the value of drill in school discipline, but the manner in which it is taught produces nothing but baneful results.

SEN, SURYA KUMAR.

The health of students is not generally good on account of the undue mental strain. The remedy is either to reduce the number of books prescribed by the University or to reduce the number of subjects for examinations.

SEN GUPTA, Dr NARAI CHANDRA

As a rule, the health of boys and girls is poor, specially in Calcutta. The fault does not lie so much with the exhausting system of education as with other circumstances.

The system of education is to a certain extent, exhausting. The reason is not that they are taught too much, but that the teaching is given under unwholesome conditions and by an exhausting method.

To remedy this, books and memory work should be very largely done away with in the lower classes. The routine should be readjusted so as to secure a reasonable alternation of open-air with class work. The method of education should be reformed so as to make the teaching more conformable to the interest and inclination of boys.

Overstraining for examinations is a potent cause of exhaustion. The importance of the final examination should be reduced and the labour more evenly distributed all through the year, promotions and prizes being awarded on the result of the whole year's work.

SEN GUPTA, SURENDRA MOHAN

The undue strain of the university examination system is telling upon the health and the physical development of students. They are expected to come up to a standard which they cannot always fairly attain. The teaching and study being only for the definite purpose of a pass, students work very little during the first year and a half and very hard

SEN GUPTA SURENDRA MOHAN—*contd*—Serampore College Serampore—SESHADIRI P

during the three or four months preceding the examination : e after the classes are dissolved for the I A B A and M A examinations. If the monthly record of students be kept up and that record is taken into account in allowing a student to pass then the tudy will be spread regularly over two years and it would be easy for the student to attain to the standard expected of him.

The difference between the status of a B A and a plucked B A is so great in securing service and the salary attached to similar appointments held by both is so different that a man will strain every nerve and will easily sacrifice his health to get a degree. An incompetent B A teacher will be given a higher salary than the most competent plucked B A teacher. An artificial value is attached to a degree and not to the attainment. The University itself places too high a value upon degrees and the positions secured in examinations. So promising students strain every nerve in securing high positions in examinations and thus break down in health.

Serampore College Serampore

Our experience does not suggest that the present system notwithstanding all its drawbacks from the standpoint of educational efficiency imposes an undue physical or mental strain upon students who are not exceptionally robust. The few breakdowns in health that we have witnessed have in our judgment been due not to the University system but to quite other causes. In general no doubt Indian students tend to be weak and sickly. This is largely due to the absence of facilities for physical exercise. No doubt the strain at the time of the test and university examinations is fairly intense but the imposing of a certain degree of strain is legitimate in the interests of mental discipline. In this connection a Bengali colleague makes a suggestion. If students are examined by parts as in the present law examinations and in the Allahabad University M A examination this strain would be considerably diminished. The ideal of course is to regard a student's whole record as fixing his final academic standing.

SESHADIRI P

An attempt was made during the academical year 1917-18 to introduce the systematic medical inspection of students—boarders as well as day scholars—at the Central Hindu College Benares. As only one resident physician was available and as much of his time was taken in attending to his routine duties in the boarding houses it was found possible to make only a very modest beginning. It was thought that even a single inspection in the year was worth having at least to familiarise the students with the idea and as a preliminary step to more substantial work in the near future.

There was no positive dislike to the idea of medical inspection on the part of students—there was only a feeling of mild scepticism about its utility and a certain amount of shyness on the part of a few which was however got over soon after the preliminary stages by the appreciation of the defects of eyesight and other ailments drawn attention to by the doctor and the consequent anxiety to rectify matters by a thorough medical examination. I made it also a point to be present for short intervals during the medical inspection to encourage the students to submit themselves to it without any hesitation and cheerfully underwent partial examination myself on various occasions to furnish them with a personal example. The students were also informed in the college that the entries under the head of medical inspection were to be treated as part of the necessary formalities of enrolment in the college and in the University.

The medical inspection was conducted under the following heads —

- (a) Name caste residence and age.
- (b) Weight
- (c) Height
- (d) Chest.

SLSHADIRI, P *contd* —SHARP, The Hon'ble Mr H

- (e) Breathing capacity
- (f) General constitution
- (g) Vaccination
- (h) Condition of eyesight
- (i) Disease, if any
- (j) Recommendations and remarks

It is only necessary to add that the last section dealt with such details as were not included under the other heads

All the boarders in the college—159 in number—and nearly half the number of the day scholars—181—were examined by the doctor. It is probably a striking compliment to the residential system that the boarders should have shown very much better health than the day scholars in every detail. The circumstance may be due not only to the insanitary conditions in which several of the latter live, but also to the want of adequate nutrition on the part of some of the poorer students. Non-vegetarian diet is not allowed in the boarding houses of the college and some students used to a purely vegetarian diet in their homes seem to have found some difficulty in adjusting themselves to the new conditions.

The most practical results attended the inspection of the condition of eyesight. The warning had to be conveyed to a number of students that they should go in for spectacles immediately, and it was probably worth while conducting the examination, at least for this if for nothing else. Valuable suggestions were also made with regard to special diet, exercise, and kindred matters. In some cases showing signs of possible development of serious diseases in the near future, information was sent privately to the guardians concerned. There was a case of suffering from infectious disease, rendering it necessary to consider the isolation of the student.

It is hoped to achieve better results next year by making the inspection more thorough and also more frequent in the year. Even this modest instalment of medical inspection has been enough to convince one of the practicability and great usefulness of the medical inspection of students in an Indian college.

SHARP, The Hon'ble Mr H

My experience leads me to believe that the health and physical development of the Bengali student are good. But my experience has been gathered mainly in mofussil colleges, where good hostels and open-air games are provided. I had particular opportunities of watching the students of the Dacca College, who appeared to me exceptionally healthy and among whom there was very little illness. This impression appears to be borne out by a fact of which I was told the other day found that of the Bengali students who entered the Indian Defence Force 83 per cent were medically fit. Whether the same condition of things prevails among students in Calcutta I cannot say, I have been told by medical and other authorities that the reverse obtains. The lack of opportunities of fresh air and exercise, insanitary surroundings, and the insufficient diet which, I am told, many procure would appear to render this probable.

There is no reason why the present curriculum should put an undue physical or mental strain upon students. In point of fact, it does not, when conditions are reasonably favourable. By 'favourable' I mean not only physically favourable, but also that it is possible, through bad teaching or no teaching at all, for any curriculum and an continued mental exertion to become a serious strain. Boys who come from school prepared and incapable of understanding the lectures, who, moreover, receive no moral help and have no one to whom they can go for assistance and advice about their work and who are perhaps worried with domestic matters and expenses and exposed to insanitary surroundings, naturally become anæmic and prone to disease and breakdown.

I have already made suggestions under the previous question. The first thing is to get the mofussil boys to mofussil colleges, where they will be, if not in their own homes, at least, in a more familiar, surroundings. In Calcutta they are put to expense in lodging, etc., and may find their means insufficient, and

SHARP The Hon ble Mr H—*contd*—SHASTRI PASHUPATINATH—SHASTRI Dr PRABHU DUTT

attempt to economise on a poor diet. In the mofussil ground rent is comparatively low and fresh air and exercise are easily obtained. The second thing is to improve the teaching. There is no need for boys to give up exercise and pore over their books till late at night provided they are reasonably well taught. But the method of teaching at some schools which I have seen in Bengal is calculated to obfuscate rather than to strengthen the intellect. Everything becomes doubly hard to a boy so trained and he comes up to college utterly incapable of wrestling with the course.

I should like to add as a detail some remarks about class arrangements. Boys in school and college class rooms are frequently crowded together so that there is less than ten square feet available per pupil. Now ten square feet may do for a little boy in a primary school but not for a grown boy in a college especially in an airless neighbourhood and in the warm moisture of the Bengal climate. The lighting is often badly arranged from the right hand of the students low and direct. Often I have seen the students placed facing the light. It is difficult to get buildings erected with due regard to their educational use especially in the way of lighting. These defects do not merely injure health and eyesight they detract seriously from the mental condition and power of concentration of the student both at the time and afterwards. Airless surroundings and imperfect supply of light at once affect the nerves with the result that mental effort becomes a double strain and fixed attention almost impossible. The professional examination of every educational building should be insisted upon. There should also be insistence on the use of proper lamps in hostels.

Finally in view of the overcrowded and insanitary conditions of some educational institutions it is necessary that the certificate of a medical officer should be obtained stating among other things the number of boys it can accommodate. If the certificate cannot be obtained or if this number is exceeded the institution should be closed and failure to close it should be a punishable offence. Any such measure would have to be leniently worked in the first instance. But a few examples in glaring cases would have a wholesome effect.

SHASTRI PASHUPATINATH

The health and physical development of students are in a very bad condition. There is not the slightest doubt that under the present system a severe strain is imposed upon students. It is generally believed and that belief is true that a student seldom comes out of the University without sacrificing some organ of his physical system in that temple. The eyesight is generally lost and the digestive organs are impaired. Success in examinations must be achieved and the guardians and friends always goad the poor students in that direction. If he be a good boy in the class his position is still worse because he must keep up his reputation. So the poor student works hard without minding anything else of the world and the result is that his health is ruined. A failure is a dreadful thing. In the news papers we read that plucked students even commit suicide.

The labour of the students may be lessened if they receive proper direction. In the classes they obtain very little help from the professors. The classes are often too big and the lectures are lost upon the students. Then there is nobody to look after them. When the examination draws near students try with might and main either to get by heart the text-books or any notes that may be available. The work is neither intelligent nor methodical. Thus a large portion of the labour is wasted. Students will be much relieved if there be tutors who will show them the proper method of work.

Another good remedy lies in the enforcement of physical exercises.

SHASTRI Dr PRABHU DUTT

The health and physical development of Bengali students during their university career are not satisfactory. While suitable provision is not made for their physical development an unduly severe mental strain is imposed upon them during their student

SHASTRI, Dr PRABHU DUTT—*contd*—SINHA, KUMAR MANINDRA CHANDRA—SINHA, PANCHANAN—SIRCAR, The Hon'ble Sir NILPATAN

career The result is that their physique is deformed, although, in many cases their health appears outwardly satisfactory College work is, under the present conditions, more or less like the routine of a school, inasmuch as students (even of the M A classes of the University) have to attend as many as twenty or twenty-four lectures a week, besides receiving tutorial assistance and taking part in the seminar meetings

The remedies may be stated as follows —

- (a) Too much lecturing should be avoided No under-graduate may be required to attend more than fifteen lectures a week and no M A. student may be required to attend more than eight lectures a week
- (b) Every student should, as a rule, reside in the hostel, except when entirely suitable arrangements can be made by his parents or guardians
- (c) Gymnasias may be erected and students may be required to attend every morning and take exercise under the supervision of gymnastic instructors
- (d) Attendance at athletic sports and games may be made compulsory, and teachers themselves may be required to join in these exercises
- (e) The hostel should contain suitable quarters for a number of teachers as well The resident teachers may dine with the students by turns
- (f) Indian systems of physical exercise which are now quite popular in the Punjab may be introduced into the colleges as well
- (g) Races, tug-of-war competitions, walking excursions, picnic parties, etc., may be arranged frequently
- (h) Monthly or fortnightly musical concerts may be instituted in hostels under proper supervision.

SINHA, KUMAR MANINDRA CHANDRA

The physical development of students is very meagre The studies entailed, and the opportunities offered for 'cramming', help to this end The examination should be so fashioned as to prevent this, physical exercise should be part and parcel of the training a college or institution imparts

SINHA, PANCHANAN

So far as my experience goes the health and physical development of the average students of Bengal are improved during their university career The freedom of college life, physical exercise (for in Bengal only the university men take exercise), and some what better food (for most families stint themselves to properly bring up their young under-graduates) all contribute to this But the present system does impose an undue material strain for a month or two before the final examination, and even the most robust student feels the strain The only remedy I can point out is to do away with the present system of examination in a lump after two years' work, by spreading the burden more evenly over the whole period

SIRCAR, The Hon'ble Sir NILPATAN

The health of the students of our University does not suffer generally on account of pressure of studies When, however, there is difficulty in the way of having good nourishing food, the health of the student does suffer and many of our students cannot afford to have the proper kind of food, nor has the University, up to this time, taken up the task of determining qualitatively and quantitatively the proper diet of our students It is high time that the University should try to settle this point A committee of experts should at once be appointed to advise the University in this matter

SMITH W OWSTON—SUDMERSEN F W—SUHRAWARDY HASSAN—SUHRAWARDY
Z R ZAHID

SMITH W OWSTON

Health is not good I have noticed however that in other provinces Bengalis often take a leading place in athletics They are very quick and active and ready to take up something new

SUDMERSEN, F W

The physical deterioration that students in Calcutta colleges undergo is a matter of common knowledge Such deterioration is far less in evidence in the healthier conditions that prevail in many mofussil colleges But the root of the evil is the unintellectual drudgery which deadens and weakens the mind Healthy intellectual activity would leave a desire and a capacity for physical development

The remedies are—improvements throughout in the methods of teaching and of examination the provision of facilities for recreation and the reduction in the numbers of the students in colleges

SUHRAWARDY HASSAN

Students are generally of poor physique ill fed and ill nourished

Students apart from living in bad surroundings and getting indifferent food undermine their health by putting too much importance on success in an examination which they think to be the only passport to obtaining a means of livelihood They do not do their work uniformly throughout the session are lazy at the beginning and burn the midnight oil and cram hard towards the end

Medical students who have to attend lectures at the college during the day and do clinical work in the hospitals in the morning and also take their turn in doing night duty should have a special hostel adjacent to the college The junior students who do not attend hospital may live in the suburban hostels as suggested in my answer to question 17

The medical curriculum embraces a wide range of subjects and entails association with disease and with a morbid atmosphere therefore it becomes specially strenuous for students in the absence of convenient hostel accommodation

SUHRAWARDY Z R ZAHID

My experience is that the health and physique of university students in Bengal are generally poor The present system imposes an undue physical and mental strain on students who are not given sufficient opportunities and encouragement for physical development The college hours are too many and long leaving little time for physical culture and private study The lecture hours should not be more than three the rest of the day being divided between private study and open air exercise under the guidance of professors The present system of the professor teaching a subject to its minutest detail should be avoided the professors should treat the subject broadly and indicate the line for further detailed work by the student themselves This will shorten the college hour create an impetus for individual work and leave ample time for the course to be finished before the end of the session as is not often done now

VREDENBURG E (in consultation with COTTER, G de P)—WAHEED Shams ul Ulama
ABU NASR—WATHEN G A—WILLIAMS Rev GARFIELD

VREDENBURG E (in consultation with COTTER G de P)

My reply to this question is practically covered by my reply to question 17. I consider that whenever possible the hostels and attached messes should be under the charge and control of organised religious orders.

Perhaps the rules at the hostels might generally be made a little more rigid and some kind of uniform adopted.

WAHEED Shams ul Ulama ABU NASR

The health and physical development of students during their university career are not quite satisfactory. This is not due so much to undue physical and mental strain as to the conditions under which they live and to quite inadequate care and provision for physical culture.

WATHEN G A

Although I have no experience of Bengal I venture to say a word on physical culture. The wastage of health due to mental strain, to infringement of the laws of sanitation and hygiene, lack of exercise and healthy recreation is a tragedy. The remedy lies in hostel life and close contact between the teacher and the taught. But the teacher must be a man of robust vigour with an intense belief in the advantages of physical culture. I claim that in the Khalsa College this problem has been partially solved. The Khalsa College however possesses five hockey fields and ten football grounds in its immediate vicinity. Every resident student is compelled to do twenty minutes hard exercise according to Müller's and other methods daily at dawn.

Tutors go round continually at night seeing that windows are open and that the students are sleeping with their faces uncovered. At present the average student believes in physical culture and recreation so that breakdowns in health owing to the causes that exist among students in cities are hardly known here.

WILLIAMS Rev GARFIELD

Since writing my pamphlet which I have referred to elsewhere and in which I first raised this question I have continued my researches with the result that my previous conclusions have been most unfortunately amply confirmed. If there is any doubt on this question in the minds of the members of the Commission I would ask them to consult doctors who are in charge of asylums in India remembering that a joint family in India will always themselves keep and care for a member of the family who has become insane in preference to sending him to an asylum. Only a very small percentage of those who become insane enters asylums and this is particularly true in regard to the student class.

The enormous increase of consumption and of errors of metabolism in the Indian student class may easily be verified from the medical profession.

The causes may in the main be stated under six heads—

- (a) The pernicious effects of the cramming system
- (b) The nature and method of the eating and the cooking of the food the students habitually eat not only in hostels and messes but even in their own homes
- (c) The absence for most of them of any pursuits calculated to take their minds off their work such as athletics and the many hobbies that students elsewhere in the world have at their disposal

WILLIAMS, Rev GARFIELD—*contd* —WORDSWORTH, The Hon'ble Mr W. C

- (d) Eyestrain This can be verified by making a visit to a students' mess or home at night and noticing the light by which he is reading his notes and favourite 'cram' books, to read which, even in daylight would, in many cases, prove a great strain on the eyes. Medical opinion will also verify the opinion that a relatively enormous number of Indian students is using dangerously imperfect glasses purchased in a bazar, or no glasses at all where the use of them is imperative for health.
- (e) Lack of fresh air and helpful surroundings (and in Calcutta the constant din of the city)
- (f) The enormous prevalence of some form or other of sexual abuse

The remedy for most of these ills lies in the control exercised by a well-run residential university organised in departments, and situated in pleasant and salubrious surroundings

WORDSWORTH, The Hon'ble Mr W. C

The average of health and physique is unsatisfactory. Malaria, inferior diet, long hours within doors, insufficiency of exercise, are chiefly responsible. I am not in a position to say how far social customs may also be causes. The present system does impose excessive mental strain partly because the shadow of examinations darkens the boy's life from early years, partly because bad early teaching makes the student inefficient, so that the results of his labours are not commensurate with the effort. The long college day may be a cause of strain. In Calcutta I believe it is so, for many students have to make long journeys by tram or on foot to their lectures. This makes even a short lecture day fatiguing and short lecture days are the exception in most colleges. I recently visited a mofussil college where all students were given daily two lectures in English and one in each of their other subjects for the Intermediate, i.e., five lectures daily. The eyesight, too, of the student community is below the standard partly because of ill-lighted rooms in schools, partly because few schools trouble to place their pupils advantageously in regard to the light, partly because of years of reading by feeble lamplight. The eyes are usually attended to, other physical defects when pointed out to teachers or parents seldom receive attention.

The remedy lies in wider information, leading to a better appreciation of the value of bodily fitness, and in better school and college organisation. Expert inspection of schools and pupils will, in time, bring about an improvement, but the main responsibility must rest upon parents. A health census of students, published with comments and advice, would arrest attention and, perhaps, be the beginning of improvements.

[I have been into a school class-room so dark, with no pretence at a window, that for some moments I was not aware of the little boys in it. They sat there without teachers, book, or paper, the head master explaining that these were useless in a room where they could not read. To a suggestion that they might do their work in the shade of the trees in the school compound he replied that their parents would be dissatisfied if the boys were not in school. He added that light in schools had only recently begun to be of importance. This is an extreme case, but few teachers are alive to the necessity of good light, ventilation, proper arrangement of desks etc. Hygiene is taught in the middle classes. I have known it taught in rooms intolerably stuffy.]

QUESTION 19

Will you contribute any suggestions arising from your experience regarding the organisation of residential arrangements for students including hostels messes and lodgings?

In regard to hostels and 'attached messes' will you discuss especially—

- (a) the relation of these institutions to the University as well as to the colleges
- (b) the functions and status which you would give to the superintendent
- (c) the methods of management control and inspection
- (d) the proper equipment of a hostel including kitchen and dining room arrangements provision for the treatment of illness library facilities etc
- (e) the best size for hostels and
- (f) the desirability of their providing tutorial assistance?

In dealing with these problems we beg that you will have careful regard to what you deem to be financially practicable

ANSWERS

AHSANULLAH Khan Bahadur Maulvi

Students reside either in homes or in hostels messes or lodgings. A large number reside with unauthorised guardians. Hostels are generally attached to particular institutions. They are mostly under the superintendence of teachers or professors belonging to these institutions. The hostels are used mainly for the purpose of residence. There is lack of corporate life among the inmates. The superintendent, invariably a subordinate teacher, ill fitted to influence the character or habits of the students. He is not altogether a man of personality or special gifts. He collects fees from the students and looks after their diet and only occasionally after their health. He is not the type of man who can arrange interesting occupations for students outside lecture rooms. He has not always the capacity to render any tutorial assistance to them. His relation to the institution is not well defined except that as a teacher he is directly under the orders of the head of the institution to which he is attached.

Lodgings are rented houses which can be freely used by the students for any purpose they choose. The accommodation and sanitary arrangement of messes and lodgings are anything but satisfactory. They are productive of more harm than good being freed from the control of any particular institution. The inmates are drawn from different institutions. Discipline and order are seldom found.

No student should be permitted to join any college who lives in a mess or lodging. To be eligible for admission one must live either in a home or in an attached hostel. No hostel must be recognised which is not placed under the immediate control of the governing body of any institution. The superintendent must always be a senior member of the staff and be a man of character and personality. He should be one who can enforce discipline encourage sporting habit arrange debates and at homes among the student and foster social life among them. There should be another superintendent to assist him in tutorial work.

The inmates should live either in open dormitories or in separate rooms in batches of three or more but never less. Each inmate should be allowed at least 60 square feet of floor space. The door openings should cover at least a fourth of the total area of walls. The floor must always be damp proof and if possible pucca masonry work. The general appearance should be neat and cheerful. There must always be a playground and a library attached to a hostel besides separate cooking and dining arrangements for the inmates of different creeds. Each hostel should be placed under the supervision of a medical officer who should be paid separately by the authorities. Each hostel should have sufficient accommodation for at least one fourth of the total enrolment of the institution to which it is attached. Prayer rooms should be provided along with dining rooms for those who wish them. The buildings should not be extra

ANSANULLAH, Khan Bahadur Maulvi—*contd.*—AIYER, Sir P. S. SIVASWAMY—ALI, The Hon'ble Mr. ALTAH—ALI, SAIYAD MUHSIN—ALLEN, Dr. H. N.

vagantly expensive. In fitting them up the needs of the students who are lodged in them should alone be taken into consideration. Efforts should always be made to present to the inmates the environment in which they are brought up at home compatibly with the preservation of strength of body and the growth of character and social life.

I am opposed to an extension of the existing system of hostels. They do not aid either in stimulating intellectual activity or in developing *esprit de corps*. They should be a part and parcel of the institutions to which they are attached. They should supplement the education that is imparted in the school or college. What is taught in the school or college in theory should be demonstrated in practice when the students come in freer contact with each other outside the lecture room. The training will thus have a theoretical as well as a practical bearing. The hostel should provide opportunities for friendly intercourse and encourage common intellectual pursuits. The inmates should form themselves into social, literary, and athletic associations, which are of primary importance for the growth of corporate life, which develops that instinct for fair play and for loyalty, which is the germ of a wider sense of honour in later life. Cramming for examinations does less for *esprit de corps* than does honest endeavour towards physical, moral, and mental development.

AIYER, Sir P. S. SIVASWAMY

I understand that there is no provision for the treatment of illness in the existing hostels. It ought to be quite easy to arrange for the daily attendance of a medical practitioner at certain hours in the day.

ALI, The Hon'ble Mr. ALTAH.

I think the system prevailing in the M. A. O. College at Aligarh is the best. I cannot suggest a better scheme.

ALI, SAIYAD MUHSIN

- (a) Hostels should be conducted on the lines and under the rules laid down by the University
- (b) The superintendent should work under a hostel committee of which the head master or the principal of the institution to which it is attached should be the secretary
- (c) The school committee should frame rules for the conduct of the hostel and the guidance of the hostel committee. The university rules should be followed, as far as possible, by the school committee in framing the rules for the hostel
- (d) The school committee should provide these, with the help of a Government grant, if necessary
- (f) It is desirable to provide tutorial assistance to small boys

ALLEN, Dr. H. N.

- (a) The inspection committee of the Bombay University inspects the hostels with other college buildings
- (b) A resident professor lives in the compound of the College of Engineering hostel at Poona, who is fully responsible for the management of the hostel. The arrangement works well
- (c) Two resident fellows (students) assist the resident professor in the management of our hostel

ALUM SAHEBZADAH MAHOMED SULTAN—ARCHBOLD W A J

ALUM SAHEBZADAH MAHOMED SULTAN

- (a) The hostels or private lodgings should be under the charge of the superintendent who would be the servant of colleges and the University should inspect them from time to time through its inspector
- (b) See my remarks in answer to question 17
- (d) No doubt there should be kitchen and dining room arrangements a doctor library and segregation room if possible Further general messing should be given to an outside contractor as there may be fear of the superintendent making a profit on the same at the expense of the boys
- (e) According to the requirements of the students
- (f) I think that there should be arrangements for having private tutors to coach the students and they should be paid by separate fees to be realised from the students who desire their services

ARCHBOLD W A J

There ought not to be any attached messes and hence I need not discuss them Students ought to live either in hostels or with their parents or near relatives

- (a) The hostel should be a part of the college and the University as such should have nothing to do with it If it became a scandal the University would deal with it by way of the college The college appoints the superintendent and holds him responsible for the general efficiency of the hostel
- (b) The superintendent of a hostel ought to live there and to have a free house He ought also to have an allowance so as to get a really good man to undertake the work
- (c) Put a good man in as superintendent and let him manage the hostel The principal of the college may pass the rules and confirm the monitors but, as all depends and ought to depend upon the superintendent and the students the whole thing should be as far as possible an independent unit realising and organising its own life
- (d) Much as in the Dacca hostels
- (e) There are three considerations all of which have weight The first is that of expense The second is explained by saying that if you make a hostel small the oversight is better and the life perhaps more intense Again if the hostel is fairly large there is the direct sense of being a member of something important and the clever boys find others of equal or superior capacity—a very important matter If a hostel is reasonably large too it becomes a unit for athletic purposes which is a valuable source of stimulus and educative cohesion
- (f) If there are colleges the tutorial assistance should be given there If only a university and hostels (a bad arrangement in my opinion) the hostel becomes a sort of college and possibly provision for tutorial assistance becomes necessary

We must look on hostels as representing the residential aspect of a student's life His friends are probably there The attrition of one mind on another takes place there It is there that he ought to learn to form and express opinion The superintendent's part therefore is a quiet mostly a silent but extremely important part He ought always to be a member of the teaching staff actual or potential and above all he ought to be one whom the students respect.

AZIZ, MAULVI ABDUL—BANERJEA, J R.

AZIZ, MAULVI ABDUL

It is desirable that residential arrangements be made for students in hostels, not messes and lodgings. Students living under strictly recognised guardians may be allowed to live outside the hostel.

- (a) These institutions will be under the direct control of the principal of the college and under the immediate supervision of the resident superintendent. I am not of opinion that these institutions should be under the control of the University.
- (b) It is essentially necessary that the officers connected with the hostel should be men of character whose company may produce good impressions—religious, social, and moral—upon the students. In appointing superintendents importance should not be attached to the university qualifications only. The duty of the superintendent should be to look after the religious, physical, and moral training of the boarders.
- (c) The hostels will be managed by the superintendents assisted by monitors and inspected by the proctor, who will be a member of the staff. The management of the mess will be left to the boarders, under the general supervision of the superintendents. All the boarders living in a hostel should form a single mess and dine together at the same table.
- (d) A hostel should be well-equipped. It should have a good kitchen and dining-room arrangements and also a sick room. It is necessary that there should be a common room provided with a suitable library and newspapers and magazines. Rooms of the hostel should be two seated. A good medical officer should attend the hostel daily and there should be also a dispensary attached to it. There should be uniform furniture provided to the boarders by the college authorities.
- (f) Tutorial arrangements are needed in the school hostels, and not in the college hostels.

BANERJEA, J R

As regards residential arrangements for students the more that is done for their living in college hostels or messes the better it is for them. But this I say of those who do not live with their parents. The question is about the ways and means. It is not possible to have a very large number of college hostels or messes owing to want of funds. Hence, the best arrangement under the circumstances is for every college to appoint an inspecting officer to visit the residences of students who do not live in college hostels or messes and thus to keep in touch with such students.

- (a) The relation of hostels, collegiate and non-collegiate, to the University ought to be what they are under the present regulations. I would say the same thing so far as their relation to colleges are concerned. As regards 'attached messes' no change in the present relations is necessary so far as they are defined by the regulations. But, in practice, it has been sometimes found that the principal has not full control over such a mess, though according to regulation 19, chapter XXIV, he has full control. Thus for instance, he cannot give a free seat in such a mess to a poor student, he can only recommend his case to the University. He cannot allow the relative of a student to live with him for a few days. He can only allow him to stay if he comes to nurse a sick student and that only for a very short time. No doubt, the University has had reasons for making these rules which are actually followed, but could not principals of colleges be trusted to deal with such cases and do what they thought proper?
- (b) The superintendent ought to be in charge of the mess and all questions of internal management ought to be decided by him. Students, however, ought to be allowed to make representations to the principal when they have any grievance and the superintendent does not remedy it.

BANERJEE J P—*contd*—BANERJEE Dr PRAMATHANATH—BANERJEE Sir GOOROO DASS—BANERJEE JAYGOPAL

- (c) The superintendent should manage with the help of a student's committee so far as questions of messing are concerned. Servants in the mess should be under his control. Every attached mess should be inspected not only by the university inspector of messes but also by members of the staff of the college concerned from time to time.
- (d) There should be bedsteads, tables, chairs and racks in each room. There ought to be a sick room in each hostel. A small library ought to be provided for each hostel.
- (e) Accommodation for sixty students.
- (f) As they get tutorial assistance in colleges, no further tutorial assistance is necessary.

BANERJEE Dr PRAMATHANATH

I am not an admirer of the residential system and the limited experience I possess of the residential arrangements for students does not entitle me to give an authoritative opinion on the different aspects of the question. But without going into detail I may say that a hostel or an attached mess ought not to contain more than 10 or 20 students and that it ought to be under the control of a superintendent who may by his capacity and character be able to win the affection, respect and confidence of the boarders.

BANERJEE Sir GOOROO DASS

My suggestions with regard to hostels and messes are —

- (i) That there should be more messes, the internal management of which should be left to the students under proper supervision, so as to give them training in the management of their own affairs and there should be fewer hostels which only serve to bring up their boarders as hot house plants under a high standard of living and unprepared for the world outside.
- (ii) That the functions of the superintendent who should be a person of high character should be like those of a natural guardian of the boarders.
- (iii) That the management should be left in the hands of the boarders in groups by rotation.
- (iv) That there should be free tutorial assistance rendered by the more advanced boarders to those less advanced.

BANERJEE JAYGOPAL

Speaking from my personal experience of over two decades and having regard to the residential arrangements instituted by the new regulations under the Indian Universities Act 1904, I feel justified in making my observations.

- (a) At present this relation is not of a satisfactory character, the control exercised by the University through its inspector of colleges or hostels and messes being rather shadowy. The present residential arrangements are seldom considered by the boarders as an integral part of the colleges by which they are made and very unwilling outward obedience has to be enforced by the authority of the college or college concerned by means of strict rules. There is so much divergence in the various types of hostels and messes that anything like a uniform standard of life and discipline can hardly be maintained in them. If they are meant to further the ends of a quasi-residential system that object is scarcely attained by the existing messes and lodgings with possibly one or two solitary exceptional instances.

BANIRTI R. JAYGOPAL *contd*

- (b) The superintendent of a college mess should never be a person below the rank of a college lecturer and he should live on the premises. A handsome allowance should be provided so as to attract a professor to take up this responsible duty and he should be endowed with extensive powers under the control of the principal, in matters affecting discipline. The superintendent should be assisted by a committee of management and advice, consisting of two other lecturers or professors, two outside gentlemen in touch with educational matters (preferably guardians of college students) one of whom, where available, should be a medical man, and, at least, one representative of the boarders. Subject to the sanction of the principal, rules for the entire management of the messes ought to be framed in consultation with this advisory committee. This will ensure a healthy co-operation between the college authorities and the educated public who will thus be induced to take a living interest in the realisation of the residential ideal and enable the University to remove sources of friction between the students and the college authorities.

The catering arrangements had better be always left to the boarders themselves, the superintendent having the power to regulate the bill of fare to counteract the tendency to run to excess of economy at the cost of sufficiently nourishing food.

A large measure of freedom should be given to the boarders in the management of their own affairs as a step to the introduction of "self-government" of the type that has so successfully been tried, for instance, at the "Little Commonwealth in Dorset" in England.

- (c) Steps ought to be taken to impress on the boarders the idea that "inspection" and outside "control" are regulated by the principle of helpful guidance and not by that of a detective agency employed for visiting delinquency with punishment. The present deplorable attitude of antagonism defeating the higher objects of college residence will then disappear and a healthy atmosphere will at once be created. Every inspection should be fruitful in helpful suggestions, recorded in the Visitors' Book and disciplinary measures, when absolutely necessary, should be enforced through a college prefect elected from among the students.

A closer association between the boarders and the *entire* body of the college professors concerned is highly desirable. Students should not, as now be left too much to themselves while away from their homes, but should be treated as the natural wards of their college professors whom they may freely and confidently consult on all occasions as their best friends. *In this country* this consummation cannot be brought about merely on the *play ground*. It is not also salutary to transplant without modification western ideas of perfect equality between the teacher and the taught doing violence to the traditional respectfulness of the disciple, as well as to the fatherly affection and love on the part of one in the position of a preceptor.

- (d) The greatest trouble in the mofussil is about proper housing arrangements. Inadequate, and even insanitary, accommodation has sometimes to be tolerated and the kitchen arrangements are oftener than not primitive. It is desirable to have an attending physician attached to at least a group of messes and arrangements for speedy medical aid and supply of medicines, either free of charge or at cost price, ought to be made. For emergency cases some kind of first aid and a small dispensary attached to messes are also necessary. A sick-room and suitable arrangements for segregation of infectious cases must be provided.

Messes should possess a common room furnished with inexpensive books of reference, newspapers, periodicals, and magazines (in English and *vernacular*) under the charge of a professor assisted by a representative boarder. If necessary the boarders may make a contribution towards the maintenance of the common room. Debating societies holding weekly or fortnightly meetings for reading papers and carrying on discussions should be *systematically* organised.

BANERJEE JAYGOPAL—*contd*—BANERJEE RAI KUMUDINI KANTA Bahadur—BANERJEE M N

and their function should be differentiated from that of the more ambitious college unions. Subjects should be so selected as to evoke a spontaneous and enthusiastic interest in the boarders taking part in them and discussions should be less formal in character. Here the vernacular language may be made to play a prominent part.

I can confidently speak from experience and say that considerable improvement in mess life can yet be effected without heavy additional cost merely by means of better organisation and through the help of the college staff.

The inspiring co-operation of the professors helps to foster the growth of *esprit de corps* in an academic atmosphere of which the value cannot be overrated.

(e) 50 members for hostels and 10 to 15 for messes

(f) It is only freshmen who specially require tutorial help in messes. The superintendent or an assistant may take the boarders once a week in batches of 10. Another kind of help which the undergraduates particularly stand in need of is with regard to the selection of books for home reading and of annotated editions of their prescribed text books. These unfortunate young men should be saved by their professors from the *real danger* of falling victims to worthless keys, notes, model questions and answers (their name is legion!) and cheap cribs. This aspect of co-operation should be reduced to a system instead of being left to the good will of individual members of the college staff.

BANERJEE RAI KUMUDINI KANTA Bahadur

Residential arrangements such as hostels and attached messes should form integral parts of a college. They should be under resident superintendents who will look after the students. The superintendent should be a teacher of a college. It is desirable that family quarters should be provided for the superintendents as nearly all the Indian teachers of colleges are married men.

(a) They should be attached to colleges. The University may inspect them.

(b) The superintendent should look after the sanitation and neatness of the hostels and messes and be responsible for good discipline. He should look especially after their physical and moral growth. He should be responsible to the principal for the good management of the hostels or messes.

(c) The messing arrangements should be made by the students under the guidance of the superintendent and assistant superintendent. All internal affairs should be left to the superintendent who will be the final authority for minor breaches of discipline. All admission should be made by the principal if necessary in consultation with the superintendent. There may be a board of visitors. The University inspector should visit these hostels periodically.

(d) Each well conducted hostel should have a proper kitchen and dining room. There should be a segregation hospital for sick students and all large hostels should have libraries, reading rooms and play grounds.

(e) I would prefer large hostels containing 200 or 250 students. They will be conducive to better corporate life. Besides the superintendent there should be an assistant superintendent for each 50 or 60 students.

(f) Tutorial assistance is desirable but not practicable.

BANERJEE M N

I think hostels and messes of big size are difficult to manage. One of about 50 students is easily managed by a superintendent under the direction of the Principal. But the difficulty of housing accommodation which is increasing every day and the multiplicity of superintendentships would involve more expenditure. The library and sick room which should be attached to the messes belonging to each college are also beyond the means of many colleges. The proposed University Infirmary will

BANERJEE, M. N.—*contd.*—BANERJEE, MURALI DHAR—BANERJEE, RAVANESWAR—
BANERJEE, SASI SEKHAR

remove one of the difficulties. Government or the University or the public or all must help to remove the other difficulty.

BANERJEE, MURALI DHAR

For all students who are not able to live with their guardians there should be residential arrangements under the supervision of the university authorities. In regard to hostels —

- (a) In a teaching university the hostels should be under the direct control of the University, in an examining university they should be under the direct control of the colleges and under the supervision of the University.
- (b) The superintendent should be in charge of the moral discipline and health of the students.
- (c) The management should be primarily through the superintendent. It should be divided into departments each of which should be managed by special officers, assistant superintendents, monitors, or mess managers, all of them responsible to the superintendents, but the last of the subordinate officers should be responsible to the students also. In other words, the students should have some control over the mess arrangements.
- (d) A hostel should be equipped with sanitary kitchens, sanitary cooking vessels, sanitary dining-halls, the doors and windows of which should have wire gauze screens to keep off flies, sick-rooms, isolated infectious disease ward, library and reading rooms. The rooms should be single seated, or divided into compartments containing single seats, and on no account should more than one student be allowed to live in the same room or to work at the same table.
- (e) Hostels should consist of long rows of rooms, with verandahs running from east to west to admit of free ventilation from the south, and to avoid the slanting rays of the sun. So, in width each block need not exceed 20 feet, while in length it may vary according to the need and the size of the ground.
- (f) It is desirable by all means to provide tutorial help.

BANERJEE, RAVANESWAR

- (c) In hostels and messes attached to high schools the management should be in the hands of an able and experienced superintendent, who should also be a teacher, preferably a senior one. The head master should supervise his work.
- (d) There should be good bedsteads, preferably iron ones for all the inmates. There should be proper arrangements for regular and prompt removal of all waste products. There should always be a medical attendant and, in the case of big hostels, a small dispensary may be attached thereto. Big hostels may have a common room and good magazines and newspapers may be provided.
- (f) An attempt should be made to provide tutorial assistance to boys living in high school hostels. School teachers, who may be found suitable and willing to render help, may be allowed to live in the hostels free of rent.

BANERJEE, SASI SEKHAR

- (a) The University should have organised control and supervision over college hostels and messes and retain the power of dealing with the broad principle of sanitation and also with the status of superintendents. One of the functions of the University should be to see how far the hostels and messes have contributed to the growth of corporate life.

The carrying out of the details with regard to the organisation as detailed above should be left to the college, which should also have the power of dealing with all questions involving internal management and discipline.

BANERJEE SASTI SEKHAR—*contd* —BANERJI HRIDAYA CHANDRA

- (b) The superintendent should be either a professor of the college or a man of that standing whom the students can respect and in whom they have confidence. In fact he should be a man who can guide the students in their study and recreation and take an active part in the promotion of corporate life. Enforcement of discipline and of good relation between the students should also be a part of his duty.
- (c) A set of rules must be made by the principal for the management of the hostel and mess and the enforcement of them must be left to the superintendent. For messing arrangements and shopping students should mainly be made responsible and for this purpose mess committees should be formed from among the students. For helping the superintendent in the maintenance of discipline prefects or monitors should be appointed from among the senior members of the hostel messes. Questions relating to discipline conduct of individual boarders towards one another or to people outside the hostel and also questions involving financial matters may sometimes arise which the superintendent himself cannot decide. In all such cases the principal should be the final authority.
- In addition to the inspection of hostels and messes by the university committees consisting of members of the teaching staff should exist for visiting hostels and messes periodically. The principal may also visit the hostel at times. Any suggestion made by the visiting committee with regard to any matter connected with the improvement of the hostel or of its discipline may be given effect to as far as practicable.
- (d) As regards the proper equipment of a hostel I beg to suggest the following points —
- (i) Sleeping room—a separate bedstead a small bookshelf a wall rack for clothes a chair for each boarder and a table for every two boarders
 - (ii) Common room—a chair a big table and some benches an almirah containing books and magazines Indian clubs dumb bells etc
 - (iii) Sick room—bedsteads at the rate of five per hundred boarders an almirah containing a clinical thermometer two syringes two feeding cups measure glass s invalid diet such as *sago* etc and some medicine. The sick room should also be provided with a stove one or two urinals and one or two bedpans
 - (iv) Dining room—wooden seats bell metal plates cups glasses and brass *lotas*, cooking utensils and galvanised iron tanks for storing drinking water. For *Muhamm dans* a dinner table benches plates and glasses may be provided
- (e) The proper size of a hostel should be such as to afford accommodation for fifty boarders. The hostel should be divided into two seated compartments. This will be economical and afford every facility for study.
- (f) It is desirable to provide tutorial assistance in hostels. In this respect the superintendent should be assisted by a tutor.

BANERJI HRIDAYA CHANDRA

From my experience of hostel organisation I have come to the conclusion that undue importance is often attached even by high authority to the residential system for our student. I think this system should be resorted to only to supply a necessity especially in large towns to which students come from outside and not to supplant the parental or legal guardianship or the guardianship of near relation or even of persons considered as guardians to whom may be delegated the responsibility for proper control and upbringing of the student. It is always difficult for the superintendent of a hostel particularly if it is a large one to keep an eye on every student under his charge and to watch his activities more or less closely. Very often especially if the supervision is bad a hostel containing a large number of young men becomes the breeding ground for evil ideas or malpractices and the evil started by a few bad persons spreads quickly amongst a large number of the inmates.

BANERJI, HRIDAYA CHANDRA—*contd*

Coming to the specific points raised in the question —

(a) In matters of internal discipline the University should not interfere. Some of the existing rules—for example, section 9, chapter XXIV of the regulations—may be left to be included in the rules made by the principal of the college. The same may be said of the rules about keeping guests in the hostel for a short time.

(b) *Functions and status of the superintendent* —

(1) Exacting from the boarders faithful compliance with the hostel rules. For such compliance the superintendent should possess ample powers so far as internal discipline is concerned—though he may not have occasion to use them often. A superintendent is, as a rule, backed by the principal, but I think a superintendent should be known to possess powers equal to those possessed by a governing body or the principal of a college—so that, in matters of internal discipline, the superintendent's decision should be final and no appeal should lie to the principal or the Governing Body.

(ii) A superintendent must be able to exercise by his personal example and by frequent personal contact with the students under his charge a healthy, moral influence all round. This is the most important part of his functions. He should be approachable by the students for a large portion of the time that he remains in the hostel, and he should *not* be an officer always corresponding with the students in writing, but he should talk to them and thus easily clear up doubts and difficulties and points of disagreement, which cannot be done easily by mere written correspondence. The superintendent must make himself trusted by the students and considered by them as their true guardian and well-wisher. A clear and frank verbal exposition by such a superintendent is always successful in bringing the students to a right view of a thing.

I attach more importance to this second portion of the superintendent's functions than to the first portion. For no amount of mechanical compliance with the rules can prevent an ill disposed student from going wrong himself and spoiling others. But the healthy moral influence exerted by the superintendent is often successful in reforming a student's character.

(c) *The system of management* by which the students pay a *fixed* sum monthly for their board (there being, of course, a fixed rate for rent and establishment and lighting) is a bad system and should be abandoned. Under this system it is impossible for the superintendent to keep the expenses within receipts. The students will always want better food than it is possible to provide within the fixed sum paid by them. Then, there is fluctuation in the prices of articles of food. An increase of rate will be met by an increased demand by students for still better food—so the result will be constant friction between the hostel managing staff and the students. This bad system prevailed in the Eden Hindu Hostel, but, under the new system that I was instrumental in introducing there some time ago, the relations between the hostel staff and the students are quite friendly—so far as messing arrangements are concerned. There can be no complaints in matters of food. The principle of the system is that “boarders pay, month by month, the cost of their actual board.” Accounts are made up monthly, and the total is divided by the number of students in residence (rule 6). The students’ “Mess Committee”, assisted by the official hostel staff, look after the messing arrangements. There is no waste by students, such as prevailed before, and they now learn self-reliance and also business habits.

The superintendent must be the chief controlling authority.

The system of limited control by senior students as prefects is generally successful. They are of assistance to the superintendent in the administration of the hostel. But, I think, especially if the hostel is a large one and divided

BANERJI HPIDAYA CHANDRA—*contd*

into sections or wards there should be for each section of about fifty students an official assistant superintendent having a limited amount of control in addition to the prefects. These assistant superintendents should be elected from the junior college staff. They should be given free quarters and also a certain salary.

Frequent visits by the principal are very useful.

- (d) The number and size of kitchens and dining rooms will depend upon the number of students in residence. But there should be in every hotel a large room to contain the bedding and furniture of students when they leave for their homes during the vacations. The articles cannot be left in their own rooms—for these are generally cleaned and whitewashed during vacations. This point is often missed in the construction of hotel buildings.

There should be a separate building (detached from the main buildings or the students' residential quarters) for students suffering from illness, especially from infectious diseases. There should be a paid duly qualified medical man (a young but fairly experienced man is preferable) who should attend both morning and evening and oftener in cases of serious illness. There should be kept in the hostel a small stock of the more important medicines. Less urgent medicines may be purchased from outside.

There should be in every hostel a large hall where the hostel library may be located. Ample space should be available in the library hall for purposes of a common room or for social functions.

The library is easily started and maintained at the expense of the boarders, a small monthly or yearly subscription being levied on each boarder. The superintendent must be the head of the library committee to see that no undesirable publications are purchased.

- (e) In deciding what should be the best size for a hostel I may state that a large hostel need not be inefficiently managed and supervised by a capable superintendent who throws his whole heart and energy into his work—which should be a labour of love and not in mere exchange for the small pay or honorarium that he receives. But better supervision and better work can be done by a superintendent if the hostel contains a smaller number of boarders.

I should fix upon sixty or at the most seventy-five as the maximum number to be placed under one superintendent. Several such self-contained units may be provided if necessary.

I may here remark that for a superintendent to be able to work satisfactorily he must be provided with family quarters. The point is very often missed. These quarters should be sufficiently removed from the students' quarters. The flat system of quarters is not suitable for an Indian superintendent of either the Hindu or the Islamic faith.

- (f) Tutorial assistance from outside (i.e. by a professor or lecturer of a college) is impracticable. Tutorial assistance is even now given by the senior students to the junior ones in every hostel.

I may here remark that in a hostel containing junior or under-graduate students there should be only a selected but limited number of senior or graduate students. Some of these graduates may act as prefects.

I would like to keep the senior students in a separate hostel under proper supervision or preferably in a mess of their own without any official control. I do not quite see the need for keeping the senior graduate students under the same strict control and supervision that is necessary in the case of the junior under-graduate students.

In attached colleges generally the senior students (who are graduates) reside. The supervision in many of them is so necessarily inefficient that the students are masters of the situation, the superintendent being practically in a subordinate position—for he is not as a rule a college professor or any person commanding respect but is in many

BANERJI, HRIDAYA CHANDRA—*con'd* —BANERJI, The Hon'ble Justice Sir PRAMADA CHARAN—BANERJI, UMACHARAN

cases, a clerk, or a librarian, a drill master, or a teacher in a school. In these messes there is a gate-book—in order to satisfy the university regulations but there is no gateman (and the superintendent is not, and cannot, be the gateman), and, if there is one, he is paid by the students, who are thus his masters and not the superintendent. Such supervision is valueless and had better be done away with.

The observations made above are derived from my experiences as superintendent of the Eden Hindu Hostel and as a visitor of the Hindu messes attached to the Presidency College.

BANERJI, The Hon'ble Justice Sir PRAMADA CHARAN

I would recommend the establishment of hostels similar to those required by the regulations of the Allahabad University and on similar lines. These hostels are working satisfactorily and may be used as model for other hostels.

BANERJI, UMACHARAN

The organisation of residential arrangements for students which have, of late been made, particularly in Calcutta, Dacca and one or two other large centres of education in the mofussil is open to grave objection. It is not at all clear to me why splendid palaces fit for the accommodation of Rajas Maharajahs, and Nawabs should be built for the housing of students who mostly come from the poorer sections of the middle classes, and the income of whose guardians does not generally exceed even Rs 100 per month. Instead of splendid houses smaller houses having thatched bamboo, wooden, or corrugated iron roofing, or humbler one-storied or two-storied brick buildings, ought to be used for the residence of students. Boys who have been accustomed to live in miserable huts since their boyhood are compelled to live in Calcutta in palatial buildings. This arrangement, though psychologically good perhaps in some cases, leads to painful consequences in others. The surroundings of students' quarters should be neat and clean. They should grow up in a calm and quiet atmosphere away from the distractions and excitements of life.

- (a) The hostels and attached messes, as they are called, should be under the control and supervision of the colleges concerned. The University may exercise general supervision over the college hostels and messes, and special supervision over the students of the post-graduate classes which are now a days held almost exclusively by the University itself.
- (b) The position of the superintendent should be improved by giving him better remuneration and by selecting him from among the senior members of the teaching staff.
- (c) The hostels and messes may be managed, controlled, and inspected on the lines at present followed. But the visiting committees should exhibit greater activities in the performance of their duties. The financial control may be vested in the teaching and visiting staffs.
- (d) Every hostel should be properly equipped. The kitchen and dining arrangements should be satisfactory. The food usually supplied to the inmates should be carefully inspected by properly qualified men. Proper arrangements for medical attendance and library facilities should be made. The increased cost should not fall upon the shoulders of the students.
- (e) I am strongly opposed to the erection of very large hostels where hundreds of students may be gathered together. Smaller hostels should be started where 50 to 60 students may at the utmost, be accommodated. Caste restrictions ought to be respected. They cannot be swept away by methods of indiscriminate administration.

BANERJI UMACHARAN—*contd*—BARDALOI N C—BASU NALINIMOHAN—BASU SATYENDRA NATH—Bengal Landholders Association Calcutta

- (f) Tutorial assistance should be given in the college room and not in the hostels and messes. The majority of our students in the mofussil usually live under the care of their parents, uncles or other near relations. No tutorial assistance can be given to such boys at home. But tutorial assistance can be given to the students in some of the Calcutta colleges as most of them reside in the hostels or messes. Special provision should be made however in the college rooms for the tutorial assistance of such students as live under the care of their parents and other relations.

BARDALOI N C

- (a) The University should have nothing to do but colleges should have their own boarding houses.
- (b) The superintendent should not be a tyrant as in some cases he is but he should look after the comforts of the boys and generally act as their guide. He ought not to pass arbitrary orders but he should see that any rules framed by the authorities which the students undertake to obey are observed.
- (c) Control by the respective college authorities and inspection by non official honorary visitors should be introduced.
- (d) Yes all of them are necessary.
- (f) If possible.

BASU NALINIMOHAN

- (a) The site and building of every hostel and attached mess should be approved by a body of inspectors appointed by the University. These inspectors may be selected in each individual case by the Vice Chancellor from the members of the Senate or from the professors of the various colleges in Calcutta and the work done by them must be honorary. The management and control should be left to the college authorities.
- (b) and (c) The superintendent whether resident or non resident should be one of the college staff. Where the superintendent does not reside within the hostel premises there should be an assistant superintendent residing within the hostel premises but the superintendent should visit the hostel at least twice a week. The general rules of discipline should be framed by the college authorities and it will be the duty of the superintendent to see that these rules are enforced. The superintendent should also see to the health and comfort of every member of the hostel and should keep himself always in touch with them in their various activities. The messing and other internal affairs should be managed by a committee formed by the members among themselves with the superintendent as its president.
- (e) No hostel or attached mess should consist of more than 60 members. Where ever possible every member should have a separate room for himself.

BASU SATYENDRA NATH

The organisation of residential arrangements as suggested in the regulations is unexceptionable though there might be room here and there for improvement. Slight alterations or modifications as to details called for by local circumstances might be necessary.

Bengal Landholders Association, Calcutta

Within recent years a great improvement has been undoubtedly effected in the housing condition of Calcutta students; but of course there is room for much further

Bengal Landholders' Association, Calcutta *contd*—Bethune College, Calcutta—BHADURI, JYOTIBHUSHAN, DEY, B. B., and DUTTA, BIDHU BHUSAN—BHANDARKAR, SIR R. G.

improvement in this direction. We, however, are decidedly of opinion that it is mistaken policy to raise huge and costly blocks of buildings in which from 300 to 400 students are crowded together without any possibility of direct personal supervision being exercised over them. The college hostels, as they are now designed and erected, are unsightly, uneconomical, and needlessly expensive in proportion to the house room which they offer. We are further of opinion that this herding together of hundreds of students in the same block of buildings is against the instincts and traditions of the Bengali people and acts injuriously upon the morals and upbringing of our boys. Small houses affording accommodation for not more than 30 or 40 students, and where each student may have a chance of coming in personal contact with the superintendent in residence, would be much nearer our ideal than the barrack-room type of hostel which the University (or Government) now seem to favour.

- (a) We think the colleges, and not the University, should be the controlling authority over hostels and 'attached messes'.
- (b) The superintendent should preferably be a college professor, and he, in conjunction with the principal of the college, should have full authority over the hostel or mess just as the case may be.
- (f) We do not think that there should be any arrangement for giving tutorial assistance in hostels.

Bethune College, Calcutta.

From my personal experience of mess life extending over sixteen years I suggest that in each attached mess there should be a college teacher to take care of 15 to 20 boys. The powers of these superintendents should be considerably increased.

Roy, D. N.

BHADURI, JYOTIBHUSHAN, DEY, B. B., and DUTTA, BIDHU BHUSAN

- (a), (b) and (c) The hostels and messes should be placed as now, under the resident superintendents appointed by the principals of the respective colleges, to whom the superintendents would be directly responsible.

The Students' Residence Committee of the University will be entitled to visit the hostels and report on their condition.

BHANDARKAR, SIR R. G.

- (a) I think hostels and 'attached' messes should be directly connected with the colleges. But these should be inspected by the committees appointed periodically by the University to inspect the affiliated colleges.
- (b) and (c) The superintendent should see that the students are in their places in the hostels by about 8 P.M. He should acquaint himself with where the students go during their leisure hours, and what company they keep, and, if there is anything objectionable in these respects, call their attention to it and prohibit it. He should also have an eye on the conduct of the students while they are in the hostels, should prevent their making rows, quarrelling with each other, and the introduction of an objectionable stranger into their rooms. The status of the superintendent should be that of a professor and he should discuss matters connected with the hostels at a common room meeting of the professors and should be responsible to the common room.
- (d) In the college hostels I have known, there is no common dining-hall. But the students divide themselves into messes of which the secretaryship is taken up in turns by the students. The secretary makes arrangements for the purchase, the

BHANDARIAN Sir R. C.—*contd*—BHATTACHARJEE MOHINI MOHAN

storeroom and the daily consumption of provisions and the employment of a cook or cooks. He keeps accounts and divides the total amount among the members at the end of the term of his appointment. This arrangement is necessary in the present social condition of India in which there are so many castes each having its own method of cooking food and a predilection for certain food stuffs. In the High School for Indian Girls in London there are only two messes—one for Hindus and another for non-Hindus, i.e. Jews and Christians. A time may come when these will have to be divided into smaller messes.

In each of the rooms or dormitories of a hostel one student and certainly not more than two should be accommodated. Each should have a table and a small book case as well as a bedstead.

Each hostel should have an infirmary attached to it for the treatment of illness. There need not be a special library for the hostel. The college library may be made available and where it cannot be special arrangements should be made.

- (c) A hostel or a house should be of a size to accommodate not more than a hundred students.

Tutorial assistance should I think be provided as in the case of certain students and subjects it is almost indispensable.

BHATTACHARJEE MOHINI MOHAN

I was a boarder of the Eden Hindu Hostel for five years and a boarder of the Hardinge Hostel for one year. I have experience of hostels only and my remarks apply to hostel accommodation alone.

- (a) If the hostels are managed and controlled in the way I indicate the University may rest satisfied with inspecting them periodically through its officers or inspectors. But the University may have its own hostels for university students of the post graduate classes and in that case the University will have to arrange for their administration and control as well.

- (b) The superintendent must necessarily be the head of the hostel administration as I have already stated. He will be the final authority as regards control and discipline. No appeal should be from him to the principal for otherwise students would not attach much value to his orders.

But the superintendent should also be a man to whom students may look up for inspiration and guidance. He should not only have his official authority to support his influence on students but also character, learning and sympathy. He should not only be feared but loved and respected. He should preside over social functions and meetings of the debating club and be the leading figure in the hostel life. For this reason it is desirable that a senior member of the college staff should be appointed superintendent of a hostel.

- (c) If the hostel is attached to the college the principal of the college would naturally be the final authority in all matters relating to the hostel. But ordinarily the resident superintendent would be in sole charge of the hostel and the principal would not interfere in its internal management. The prefects would be senior students nominated by the superintendent or where expedient elected by the boarders of the different wards. There must be an assistant superintendent or a clerk to look after the meals, control the cooks, servants, sweepers etc. and he must go to the market personally to purchase articles of food. Students should pay fixed monthly dues to the hostel office and the assistant superintendent should keep an account showing the receipts and the expenditure. In the Hindu Hostel only two meals are supplied and there is no arrangement for breakfast or lunch. In the Oxford Mission Hostel and in most of the hostels attached to the Scottish Churches College there is provision for lunch though not for breakfast. I think there ought to be provision in each hostel for the

BHATTACHARJEE, MOHINI MOHAN *contd* —BHATTACHARYA, NIBARANCHANDRA

supply of breakfast and lunch Two full meals and two light repasts are certainly needed by young men, and what Bengali students suffer from is not overfeeding, but underfeeding

The superintendent would exercise control over the students through the prefects, who should report to him cases of misbehaviour and breach of discipline The assistant superintendent would have nothing to do with the discipline of the hostel A gate-book ought to be kept in which every student who stays out after 9 or 10 in the evening will have to sign his name, and the offender who cannot give any reasonable explanation of his default would be liable to punishment

The present system of inspection by the university inspector of colleges, and by the officer specially appointed for the purpose under the new regulations, may continue.

(e) Hostels should be of convenient size They may be divided into wards If there are separate buildings each story of each building may be made into a ward In the Eden Hindu Hostel a ward consists of more than 50 members But, considering the fact that each ward is under a prefect, the number 50 seems too large Prefects call the rolls and are entrusted with the duty of enforcing the orders of the superintendent They are also responsible for the discipline and orderly conduct of the students But it is not possible to come into daily contact with 50 students so as to influence their conduct and behaviour Twenty or twenty-five would be a more manageable number If there are three buildings, with two wards in each, we have about 125 students in all A superintendent who is entrusted with the control and guidance of 125 students has indeed pretty hard work to do But if he is ably assisted by the prefects of the wards I think he will manage it quite well Of course, the lesser the number of students the better will the supervision of the superintendent be The number of boarders can be lowered only by increasing the number of hostels, which means increased expenditure There are hostels attached to the Scottish Churches College where each student is provided with a room These rooms are, however, very small and, probably, their size interferes with free ventilation Rooms ought to be spacious and, even if they are provided with two beds, they would be more convenient than small single seated rooms But there ought not to be more than two beds in a room, as there are in the Hindu Hostel

(f) Tutorial assistance to students is given ordinarily in the colleges where students meet the teachers in batches But, if it is proposed to be given in hostels, provision must be made for the residence of the teachers in the hostels All teachers of all the different subjects—or at least one teacher of each particular subject—would have to be accommodated To erect buildings for this purpose would not perhaps, be financially possible Then, again, it would also be necessary to have a fairly big library in the hostel with at least the standard works on a variety of subjects This, too, would not, I am afraid, be financially possible, especially as we see that there are many colleges without suitable libraries

BHATTACHARYA NIBARANCHANDRA

Verandahs of hostel buildings should be made on the north or on the west side, and not on the south or the east side as are frequently done In the summer we want the southern wind and in the winter we want to shut out the northern wind This means that the southern or eastern door should remain open throughout the year But with a verandah on the south or east the rooms cannot be occasionally completely separated from the outside world Therefore studies suffer

For under-graduate students I prefer three or four seated rooms They are bound to be better lighted and ventilated, and therefore healthier than single seated rooms Insinuation about sexual vices occur more frequently in single seated rooms than in three or

BHATTACHARYA NIRANJANDRA—*contd*—BHATTACHARYA HARIDAS

four seated rooms Two seated rooms or rooms with wooden partition should not be kept

I am in favour of big sized hostels accommodating 200 or more boarders My reasons in support of this view are —

- (i) The Bengalis are deficient in power of organisation In a big hostel the staff and boarders will have good opportunities for studying the ways of a tolerably big organisation Men trained in this way will be better fitted to act as organisers in various activities of citizen life
- (ii) Big hostels are bound to be more economic
- (iii) I consider that supervision can be better done by five superintendents supervising 200 boarders resident in one building than the same number of superintendents supervising the same number of students resident in five completely separate buildings Symptoms which will be overlooked by some may be properly interpreted by others and grave crises avoided that way

There should be one superintendent for every 50 students The hostel must be controlled by one authority I am strongly opposed to the dual control of the hostel by the University and college The principal of the college will be the supreme head of the hostel The resident superintendent should be carefully selected but must be given autocratic power in the matter of discipline and his decisions should not be reversed unless in case of imperative necessity Messing arrangements should be entirely made by the students the superintendent ought not to have any concern with this The superintendent must be provided with family quarters in or near the hostel otherwise it will be difficult to get good superintendents

Hostels should not be situated in the middle of a populous city Residential colleges should always be built outside a town But when colleges can be maintained inside the town by filling it entirely with students resident with their guardians no opposition should be made against the existence of such colleges Further expansion of the hostel system should be cautiously made The new expansion of this system has been pretty rapid and its results should be watched before further extension of the system be made

The most obvious effect of hostel life is that it has helped to create discontent by raising many boys far above their social and economic position They live in better buildings than they were accustomed to and they spend a good deal of money on clothes etc They are afraid to do any manual work lest their richer friends should slight them This increase of discontent has its good and bad sides It has given Bengal its revolutionaries but it has at the same time given those brave Bengali detectives who are not afraid to sacrifice their lives for their Government and the Bengali soldiers who have gone to fight for their king

The second effect of hostel life has been to sap the foundation of traditional morality The good point of this is that social reform has got an impetus from the hostel system caste prejudices are dying out very fast But the bad effect is that old beliefs can be uprooted easily but new ones cannot be transplanted so easily in their place Thus boys are afraid to pray in a hostel for fear of being scoffed at by their fellows A student's life in the hostel is practically a life without any reference to God at all

In the Government Eden Hindu Hostel there is accommodation for 260 boarders The space allotted for various purposes is as follows —

- (A) The average floor space given to each boarder — 9½ 2 square feet
- (B) The total area for dining halls $250\frac{1}{2} \times 123\frac{1}{2}$ —5610½ square feet
- (C) The total area for sick room—960 square feet
- (D) Number of privies—27

I consider the above accommodation adequate for 260 boarders

BHATTACHARYA HARIDAS

I generally approve of the present system of hostels and messes, but I should like to draw the attention of the Commission to the fact that a system of compulsory residence

BHATTACHARYA, HARIDAS—*contd* —BHATTACHARYA, Mahamahopadhyaya KALI-
PRASANNA—BISWAS, SARATLAT.

in a hostel, or with a proper guardian is likely to press very hard in individual cases. There is a large body of students struggling through the university examinations and dependent solely upon their own exertions for the maintenance of themselves and their families. If a decentralisation of college education takes place these students ought to be allowed to proceed to Calcutta as Calcutta can alone supply them with fields of learning. To accommodate these the University ought to found a poor students' hostel where seats would be free or they should be allowed to make their own boarding and lodging arrangements, subject to the condition that their residence should be notified and visited at frequent intervals. Post graduate students ought to have more freedom.

- (d) Each hostel should have a fully-equipped library of books likely to be used by the students. The present system of indiscriminate boarding ought to be discouraged and, as far as practicable, students taking up identical or cognate subjects should be put in the same hostel and, if possible, in the same room or in adjoining rooms.

Each hostel ought to be fitted up with a gymnasium and attendance at this ought to be compulsory.

- Each hostel ought to provide at least three meals every day.

There should be a segregation ward in each college for contagious diseases and, if possible, each hostel should have a segregation room in addition to a sick-room.

- (e) No hostel ought to contain more than 50 or 60 boarders and each room ought to be single seated for B A, B Sc. M A, and M Sc students. For intermediate and B L students each room may be double seated.

There should be a good-sized common room in each hostel, and periodicals and journals ought to be subscribed for by the students themselves.

- (f) One or two freshmen ought to be assigned to every senior student, who would help the former in study and with advice. Students should be so assigned that occasional help may be available from the senior students of the same hostel.

There ought to be separate hostels for Muhammadan students, well-to-do classes, and ladies. In the first, religious instruction ought to be allowed on orthodox lines. In the second, the charge ought to be higher, but students ought to be given instruction in riding, law, surveying, and zamindari management.

In the last, domestic economy, personal hygiene, singing, music, etc., should be taught. The establishment of a ladies' hostel has become urgently necessary as the Bethune College is unable to cope with the large number of applications every year.

BHATTACHARYA, Mahamahopadhyaya KALIPRASANNA

- (a) The hostels and attached messes should be of the same category, and they should be under the direct control and supervision of the college or the University as the case may be.
- (b) Superintendents of hostels should be given more power than they possess at present for maintaining effective discipline in the hostels.
- (f) There ought to be tutorial assistance for the boarders in the hostels.

BISWAS, SARATLAT.

Students who have passed any degree examination of the University should not be allowed to live in hostels or "attached messes". It is expected that their university training has been sufficient to make them responsible and self-reliant young men. They must make their own residential arrangements which might afterwards be recognised by the University.

BOROOAH JYANADABHIRAM

BOROOAH JYANADABHIRAM

I beg to refer you to my previous answers—particularly to question 17

Hostels and attached messes should be directly under the college and the college of course is under the University. The superintendent of the hostel will be answerable to the University for any omission or commission. If it is a Government college he will thus have two masters to serve but that will not operate inharmoniously.

Ordinarily the principal of the college should be the superintendent with an extra allowance for this work. He should reside in the hostel compound within view of the hostel. In a big college the superintendent will of course have assistants as he himself will not be in a position to supervise the whole of it personally. The assistants may be selected from among the professors of the college and they should receive an adequate remuneration. All professors however may not be suited for the superintendent's duties as I have indicated a superintendent should identify completely with the students under his care. The principal therefore will have to use extreme caution in selecting his assistant superintendents. All professors may not have the necessary tact to cope with this work. What discipline may be good for school boys may not be good for college students. The latter should be allowed certain privileges in accordance with their age and status. At the same time these privileges should not be abused—that they are not so abused must be one of the main duties the principal should attend to.

Sometimes retired officers of note may be chosen for this post. It is well known that some dewans of private estates and zamindars are retired officers of mature experience—these officers make good dewans or managers so there is no reason to think why some of them should not make good superintendents of hostels.

All hostels should have non official visitors—men of note who are specially interested in matters educational. They should not only inspect the hostel every month but should invite the students to their homes or meet them in the hostel socially. These meetings will help the students to fill in their leisure—but they must not be stiff and formal. The students must be made to talk, the visitors on these occasions should treat them as friends. Not only the visitors but the principal and the other professors also should take the best chairs in the room—they must forget for the time being that they are principals, professors or visitors appointed by Government or the University.

The University inspectors should make periodical inspections.

The superintendent should see that the students take *good whole some* food—cheapness should not be the first consideration. The students are young—their appetites are good and they must get food of an easily digestible kind. A rupee or two even three or four rupees extra a month will not be grudged by the parents or guardians if they know that their children or wards are being well fed.

The servants of the hostels should be paid for by Government or the college authorities and not by the students themselves.

Two meals a day is the usual rule in this country but ninety nine per cent of the student community like something in the morning and in the afternoon after their day's work and before their evening exercises. This something takes the form of tea almost invariably which is supplemented by bread and butter *chapati loochi, poore, mohani hog* etc. The authorities should supply these necessities also.

There should be morning and evening roll calls in every hostel—after the morning roll call the students should (unless medically prevented) do dumb bell or Indian club exercise for this purpose the superintendent or one of his assistants (or according to the size of the hostel more than one assistant) should be present at the time to see that this is done. This would make the students vigorous and ready for their day's work. The monitors of each ward may also supervise this exercise—whoever supervises it it should be gone through religiously every day.

Seat rent should be very moderate. The extra money which may be paid for seat rent may be utilised for food.

Swimming is another healthy exercise which is neglected. Every hostel should have a swimming bath attached to it. Any money spent on this will be most wisely spent.

BOROAH JNANADABHIRAM—*contd*—BOSE B C—BOSE Rai CHUNILAL Bahadur

I do not think that the hostel reading room should contain text books. There should be suitable arrangements for games (indoor) in the hostel. Outdoor games of course there must be. A student is supposed to buy his own text books—if he is not able to do so he may borrow them from the library attached to the college.

There should be definite hours for study.

There should be no tutorial assistance in the hostel. It is not necessary—if a student so desires he may easily walk over to one of the several assistant superintendents who I am sure would help him over his difficulty.

The hostel or hostels attached to a college should have the capacity to board and lodge almost as many students as the college has seating arrangements for. That is if there are 200 students in a college the hostel should be also able to accommodate 200 students. It may be that the majority of students or all the students have no other place to live in the college town. No student should be refused admission to a hostel simply because there is no room in the hostel. There should be no maximum in this matter.

Stringent university rules with regard to admissions to schools have told very heavily on many a student. A student is driven from pillar to post—both in schools and colleges—when he seeks admission. Education should not be denied—the portals of the temple of Education should be open to all. A few people in Assam have started schools (private) but they are like little drops. We could do with more schools. India is a large country, there should be plenty of accommodation for us all.

To ensure proper management a college having more than 200 students should have additional hostels which will exist entirely independently of each other but will be under the principal. Two hundred students to each hostel—more than 200 additional hostels under the college—this should be the rule. The principal will be the head of all the hostels and he will be assisted by his staff and non official visitors—if there are no non official visitors forthcoming official visitors will most gladly help. I am sure. Above all let the students feel that though they are in a hostel they are not away from a home. Let them have all the home comfort, and those who have no home comforts at home let them feel what home comforts are like. The superintendent by identifying himself with his wards should help them to feel that they are at home. Sympathy should be the underlining element in the superintendent's actions.

In the hospital or sick wards first class sanitary arrangements must prevail.

BOSE B C

I wish to make only the following suggestions—

- (a) The hostels and attached messes should be directly controlled by the colleges and through them by the University.
- (b) The superintendent should be given an important and dignified status enabling him to command respect and exert a healthy influence as his function will be to control the students and regulate their mode of life. It would be desirable to induce a senior professor possessing a warm heart and noble character to work also as the superintendent. The moral effect would be invaluable. But he should have good assistants to look to matters of detail concerning dinners, obedience to rules, etc.
- (c) The management should be greatly left to the boards but under the effective guidance and control of the superintendent.

BOSE Rai CHUNILAL Bahadur

Please see my answer to question 5.

- (d) Each student should be supplied with the necessary furniture only which should include a bedstead, a table, a chair, a book shelf and a wall peg supplied by the hostel authorities on a small monthly charge from the student. He should

BOSE, Rai CHUNILAL, Bahadur *contd* —BOSE, G C —BOSE, Miss MRINALINI

furnish himself with a trunk to keep his clothes and money, and bedding, consisting of a mattress, a pillow, four pillow-cases, four bed sheets, a mosquito curtain, and a sufficient number of dhotis, shirts, coats, and socks to enable him to put on clean clothes at all times. The rooms should be furnished with electric installation for lights only, but I would not recommend fans. The arrangement of lights should be such as not to injure the eyesight. The dining-rooms should be large, well lighted and well ventilated, their windows should be protected with fine gauze wire or *chucks* to prevent the access of flies. Whenever possible, all the boarders in a hostel should be made to take their breakfast and dinner together at a fixed hour, and the practice of taking food in the bed-rooms or in the kitchens or at different times should be discountenanced on grounds of cleanliness, convenience, discipline, and also to prevent deterioration of food by keeping

The kitchen should also be fairly large, well lighted and well-ventilated and proper arrangements should be made for the escape of smoke. This is one great defect noticed in most messes in Calcutta. For about an hour in the morning, and also in the evening, the boarders suffer acutely from the diffusion of smoke throughout the house on account of the defective cook-room arrangements. Wherever possible, the cook-room should be on the topmost story of the house and at a respectable distance from latrines and urinals. The windows should be guarded by wire netting or *chucks*, and no refuse matter should be allowed to collect in the room even for a short time. It would be convenient if the dining-room were situated close to the cook-room.

A good room, with sufficient accommodation for two sick boarders and two attendants, at one side of the house should be kept apart as a hospital room for the treatment of sick boarders. It should have a separate convenient privy arrangement, and should be furnished with plain and simple furniture for the convenience of the patient and the attendant. This room should never be used by healthy boarders. All infectious cases should be removed to hospital, under medical advice, as early as possible. Each collegiate hostel should have a medical attendant who should visit it at least once daily. It should be open to the boarders to be treated by the medical men of their own choice, provided they are called in consultation with the regular medical attendant.

Each hostel may have its own small library of useful and entertaining books and journals, both English and vernacular. Wherever possible, arrangements may be made for a common room for meetings of debating clubs, lectures, and social gatherings in each hostel.

- (e) It would depend upon the number of boarders. The superficial area for each boarder in the bed-room should not be less than 100 square feet, and there should be some open space on all sides of the house.
- (f) It is very desirable that, wherever possible, the students should be provided with tutorial assistance, the cost of such instruction to be met by the students themselves.

BOSE, G C.

My views with regard to the organisation of residential arrangements for students will be found summarised in a paragraph of the annual report on the Daulatpur College which I was deputed to inspect in 1916.

BOSE, Miss MRINALINI

See my answer to question 17

- (a) These institutions should be under the control of the University and should be inspected from time to time by the controlling agency.

BOTTOMLEY J M—CHAKRAVARTI BRAJALAL—CHAKRAVARTI CHINTAHARAN

BOTTOMLEY J M

Messes and lodgings should be abolished. The maintenance of proper control over them by the college is almost impossible while they are too small communities for the civic virtues to thrive in them. For the same reason I advocate large hostels. To maintain control of a hostel containing say 200 students there should be at least three resident members of the college staff.

CHAKRAVARTI BRAJALAL

The essence of the residential system is that the students should live under the eyes of and in close touch with the teachers forming as it were members of the same household. This is possible only in denominational institutions. The arrangements for the residence and messing of the students should be such as they have in their homes and should not be in a more costly or fashionable style. Subject to the supervision of the teacher the work of management should be left to the students as much as possible. The complete success of the residential system would require some sort of healthy and productive manual work such as gardening or agriculture.

- (a) Absolute control of these institutions should be left to the colleges concerned.
- (b) The supervision must be done by the principal himself with the assistance of the members of the teaching staff for purposes of close supervision the hostel may be divided into blocks each being under the charge of some member of the staff. It is the moral influence of the teacher which alone can maintain proper discipline among the students and superintendence by one who is not a teacher is positively harmful.
- (c) Control and supervision will be exercised by the teacher and the work of management is to be done by the students themselves.
- (d) Provision for treatment of illness is to be made by the college library facilities etc. may be had from the college itself. The equipment should be as plain as possible and in no case in a style higher than what the student has at home.
- (e) A block under the charge of a single teacher should not contain more than fifty inmates.
- (f) Tutorial assistance may be given by the resident teachers.

CHAKRAVARTI CHINTAHARAN

The hostels and attached messes should be under the direct control of the institution concerned. The students of different institutions should not be allowed to put up in the same hostel or mess. The hostels and messes should be open to inspection like the educational institutions to which they belong. The superintendent should be wholly responsible for the internal management of the hostel or mess in accordance with the rules framed by the head of the institution and try to observe as far as practicable the manners and customs of the community to which the boarders belong.

The dining room should be separate from the kitchen and two or three small kitchens and dining rooms are preferable to one big kitchen and a large dining hall.

Every hostel or mess should have a medical attendant and if possible a small stock of medicines that are often required. A room may be set apart for the sick for whom the superintendent should make special arrangements about diet and nursing. A small library should be provided suitable books being selected by the superintendent. He should with the help of one or two monitors arrange for the issue and return of books.

Instead of one large hostel there should be two or more small hostels. There is no harm if these hostels were established near one another in the same compound but each hostel must have separate kitchen and dining room arrangements under the management of a separate resident superintendent. Such arrangements would ensure better

CHAKRAVARTI, CHINTAHARAN—*contd* —CHATTERJEE, The Hon'ble Mr A C —CHATTERJEE, Rai LALITMOHAN, Bahadur

discipline, and greater cleanliness in the preparation and supply of food. The maximum number of boarders in a hostel should be 25

- (a) Hostels and attached messes are an integral part of the colleges and as such, they should be directly under the control of the principal. Nothing should impair his authority over the management and administration of the hostel or hostels attached to his college. The University should only prescribe certain general rules and interfere as little as possible with the principal's arrangements.
- (b) Subject to the principal's approval, the superintendent, who stands in the place of the guardian of the boarders, should have full power and opportunity to supervise, guide, and control them. He should be an aged, experienced, and well paid member of the college staff. The influence of his character and personality should be considered at the time of his appointment. No boarder should be sent up for any examination unless the principal is satisfied from the superintendent's report as to the boarder's good conduct during his stay in the hostel or mess attached to the college.
- (c) The internal management should be in the hands of the superintendent and his assistants. He should have absolute control over the menial staff. The latter should be paid by the college, and not by the boarders. The principal and his staff should visit the hostel or mess every week as a part of their regular duties. Their visits should not be merely formal and should give the boarders an opportunity to come into closer contact with them. The inspector of messes should pay frequent visits and send a copy of his inspection report to the principal for his information.
- (d) (i) Iron bedsteads should be used, instead of wooden ones, in the hostels and messes.
 (ii) Rooms should not be more than two-seated as a rule.
 (iii) An isolated room should be specially reserved for the treatment of illness. During the prevalence of an epidemic, e.g., smallpox, the University should provide for the treatment of its students in a central nursing home.
 (iv) A small library and a prayer room should be provided in each hostel. It is desirable that the boarders should have weekly meetings for discussing social and literary topics, under the supervision of the superintendent.
- (e) The number of boarders in the hostel should ordinarily be 40 and 30 for the college and school, respectively.
- (f) The provision of tutorial assistance is desirable, if it is possible. It should not be made a part of the superintendent's regular work in the hostel.

CHATTERJEE, The Hon'ble Mr A. C

I have already said that I would compel all students, unless they live with parents or very near relations within a reasonable distance of the college or university 'department', to reside in a college or department hostel. I would have no 'attached messes' nor hostels open to students of different colleges. I would have some of the teachers of the college living in the hostel and sharing its common life. I do not believe in superintendents unconnected with college work of some sort. At the head of the college teachers living in the hostel there should be a dean, who will have disciplinary powers similar to those of the dean of a Cambridge college. The dean will be subordinate to the principal or master of the college. The business aspect of the hostel will be managed by a member of the college staff, who may be called bursar, and who will have stewards under him.

CHATTERJEE, Rai LALITMOHAN, Bahadur

Students not living with their parents or *bonâ fide* guardians should live in college hostels. No other kind of residence should be allowed.

- (a) The University should leave the hostels to be organised and managed by the colleges, which should be given a free hand.

CHATTERJEE RAJ LALITMOHAN Bahadur—*contd*—CHATTERJEE P K—CHATTERJEE SANTOSH KUMAR

- (b) It is best not to define rigidly the functions or status of the resident superintendent. He should be under the principal and accountable to him for the good behaviour of the boarders. His duty will be chiefly to watch over the students in his charge and help them in all difficulties.
- (c) The management of the hostel should be in the hands of the boarders who should appoint their own committees. The superintendent should advise and help. The control of the University over the hostel should be exercised through the principal only. Hostels should be always open to inspection but regular periodical inspections are apt to defeat their purpose.
- (d) The hostel should be as little like a barrack and as much like an Indian home as possible.
- (e) The best size for hostels is accommodation for 40 students in a separate house under a teacher (who should be provided with married quarters). Comfort not luxury should be the ideal.
- (f) I think tutorial assistance should be given entirely in hostels outside the fixed hours of college work.

CHATTERJEE P K

- (a) The present system seems to be satisfactory. Each college should manage its own hostels through its superintendents and the Students Residence Committee of the Senate should exercise general supervision from time to time.
- (b) and (c) The superintendent should preferably be a member of the teaching staff. He should be responsible for the good management of the hostel or hostels under him and he should be given considerable freedom in its management subject to the general supervision of a committee consisting of members of the teaching staff or of the principal. He should have some remuneration for this work. The principal, the members of the teaching staff and those of the Governing Body of the college should from time to time inspect these hostels and report to the committee or to the principal.
- (d) and (e) The best size for a hostel would be one accommodating either 50 or 100 students. Each hostel should have one or two kitchens according to its size and one spacious dining room. One or two rooms should be set apart for inmates who might be ill. Proper medical attendance should be provided for. In the mofussil and in towns where available there should be recreation grounds attached to hostels.
- Special library facilities for hostel students are desirable but are likely to entail great financial strain on the colleges concerned.
- (f) Tutorial assistance is desirable but may not be practicable under the present financial condition of most colleges.

CHATTERJEE SANTOSH KUMAR

Students who cannot afford to live with parents or guardians should generally reside in hostels or attached messes of their respective colleges. Advanced students however [i.e. those who belong to colleges of group (B)] may be permitted to live in lodgings approved by their own colleges. Each college will have its own hostels and attached messes over which it will exercise strict supervision and control.

- (a) The University should lay down certain rules with a view to securing good sanitary condition in the hostels and attached messes and their proper supervision by the college authorities. It should also require the college authorities to furnish annual reports regarding the conduct of these hostels and messes but it need not directly interfere with their internal management.

CHATTERJI, SANTOSH KUMAR—*contd.*

- (b) The superintendent should be a member of the teaching staff of the college. He should be selected for his special power of commanding the respect and confidence of the students. He will be responsible for the supervision of health and morals, and also for maintenance of discipline among the students placed under his care. His influence, therefore, should be moral rather than coercive. He should aim at the maintenance of discipline by a firm, but conciliatory demeanour, rather than by threat of punishment. It must never be forgotten by him and the college authorities that one main object of collegiate education is to develop among young men an ardent love of civic virtues so as to fit them to be free citizens of a free commonwealth.
- (c) The hostels will accommodate a much larger number of students than the 'attached' messes. They will, therefore, have to be placed under the control of a resident superintendent. But members of the teaching staff will not usually like to live with the students in the same building unless their privacy is assured by the provision of suitable family quarters. Every superintendent will have to be assisted by a permanent assistant superintendent, who need not be a member of the teaching staff of the college. He should be a man of culture and good breeding so that he may be at no disadvantage in his dealings with the members of the hostel. It will be his business to help the superintendent in every way in the performance of his duties, especially in connection with routine work.

Senior students in hostels may, with profit, be appointed monitors to help the superintendent in the disciplinary portion of his work. Their services should be purely honorary; as, otherwise, they will cease to command the confidence of their fellow-boarders and will be objects of distrust and suspicion.

The messing in the hostels should be left entirely to the boarders themselves. But it will be the duty of the superintendent, as well as of the assistant superintendent, to help them with their advice and guidance in these respects. Boarders should be encouraged to take their turn in the management of the hostel business. A true corporate spirit will thus be developed among the students residing in the hostels.

- (d) Each hostel will have its own kitchen and dining-room, sufficient to accommodate the entire body of its members at one time, so that on occasion, all of them may take their meals together. Each hostel also should have special provision for the removal of any of its members to a room specially reserved for the purpose in case of contagious disease. It should also have its own library and a common room, where there would be newspapers and magazines of all sorts. Wherever possible, each hostel should have a playground of its own. It must also be equipped with a gymnasium. The boarders should be encouraged to take an active part in all outdoor sports and games and other kinds of physical exercise.
- (e) Hostels, as outlined above, may easily provide accommodation for about a hundred and fifty boarders. The superintendent will then be able to become personally acquainted with all the students placed under his charge. A smaller number will not help in the growth of that corporate spirit which is one of the objects of collegiate life to foster among the students, a larger number will make the hostels too unwieldy.

The 'attached' messes should be conducted on the same lines as the hostels. But, as they will generally contain a smaller number of students, two or three of them may be placed under the charge of one superintendent. He should, however, be within easy reach of all the messes and in frequent and intimate touch with the members thereof. In no case should more than a hundred and fifty students be placed under the care of one superintendent.

Special hostels and messes should be established for the students of the backward classes in Hindu society. It is probable that except in Calcutta and perhaps also at Dacca, there will not be a sufficient number of students of members of such classes in any one college to warrant the formation of separate messes for them in each college. In

CHATTERJEE SANTOSH KUMAR—*contd*—CHATTERJEE Rai Bahadur SARAT CHANDRA—
CHATTERJEE SATIS CHANDRA

that case several colleges may start common messes for any one of these classes. In many centres of learning outside Calcutta there is but one college. In these cases separate blocks in the college hostels may be reserved for the use of such classes of students where they would be able to make special arrangements for themselves as regards messing but otherwise they would be under the direct supervision and control of the superintendent of the main hostel.

All the large colleges contain a number of Muhammadan students for whom therefore separate hostels should be established providing good accommodation for all of them. They should be managed exactly on the same system as in the case of the other college hostels.

CHATTERJEE Rai Bahadur SARAT CHANDRA

There should be separate hostels for each college. The hostels should each have a superintendent residing and messing with the inmates. The superintendent should be either a teacher in the case of schools and a professor in the case of colleges. His function would be generally to control and supervise the management of hostels and to look after the hygiene, the moral and physical training of the inmate and to foster and encourage fellow feeling and a spirit of comradeship amongst them.

The hostels should be accommodated in separate buildings to contain not more than 100 students each. The inmates should be divided into two groups of not more than 50 each under a superintendent. Each group should be further subdivided into two or more groups with a servant and cook and sufficient separate accommodation for kitchen, dining room, etc. for each such group. The management should be left to the students themselves, one of whom will by turn manage the arrangement for about a week. This in itself will have an educative value.

The hostels should be located as near to the colleges as possible and the college libraries and laboratories should be made accessible to the students both during the college hours and in the mornings and evenings.

There should be separate arrangements in each college hostel for the treatment of illness and in residential colleges there ought to be a dispensary attached to the college, the medicines being supplied to the students at cost price.

CHATTERJEE SATIS CHANDRA

The present residential arrangements for students do not seem to me to be perfectly satisfactory. Students from different districts of Bengal are now made to live in some big hostels and to partake of the same food. But this is prejudicial to the health of many students as there is a conflict of taste among students of different districts. I know the instance of a student from the Howrah district who suffered greatly from dyspepsia from the excessive use of pepper corn on the part of his mess mates from Eastern Bengal. Again a superintendent who has a large number of students under him cannot pay particular individual attention to all the students.

In view of the facts it is desirable to have small attached messes each consisting of twenty students at most who are residents of the same district and who should be placed under the personal care of a teacher as their superintendent. The superintendent must be an able and upright teacher who can give valuable help to the students in the training of the body and the mind. The management of the mess should be left to the students themselves so far as its expenses and the selection of food stuffs for its inmates are concerned. As regards the treatment of illness which is but occasional it is more desirable to leave the matter to the personal account of the student in question than to make the poor students maintain a physician all the year round. As for library facilities it may suffice to permit the students to make the fullest possible use of the college library instead of having separate libraries for so many messes. Tutorial assistance if neces-

CHATTERJEE, SATIS CHANDRA—*contd*—CHATTI RILE, SUNITI KUMAR—CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Justice SH ASUTOSH—CHAUDHURI, BHUBAN MOHAN

sary, may be given by teachers who act as superintendents of the messes. Every mess should afford to the students good opportunities for physical exercise, and should be equipped accordingly. The University should make sure, by means of inspection, that messes are so situated and managed as to ensure the moral character and physical health of the students.

CHATTERJEE, SUNITI KUMAR

Every college should have attached to itself a few big hostels, as near to each other as possible, so that the hostels and the college might form a group. The hostels should be big enough to accommodate among themselves all the students of the college. Each hostel should have a big quadrangle to serve as a playground, and each hostel should have its own medical arrangements. There should be one mess in each hostel managed entirely by students, under the supervision of a resident professor, but the hostel might be divided into sections and, for purposes of discipline, the best senior students in each section may be placed in charge. The college should try to foster a sense of *esprit de corps*, as well as of corporate life, among the boarders of a hostel and among the hostels themselves. Students should be encouraged to form libraries, clubs for debates, etc., and to organise social functions. By all these a sense of self-help and organised action might be engendered. It is essential that there should be no separate hostel arrangements for students of the well-to-do classes.

- (a) These should be controlled by the University, through the principal, who will place some professor in charge.
- (b) The students will manage the hostel or mess by themselves entirely. There will be a resident professor, who will maintain discipline and exercise general supervision.
- (c) Control and inspection should be left to a committee composed of the members of the college staff, who will act in accordance with the regulations of the University.
- (d) Barring the provision for treatment of illness, every arrangement (library, mess, etc.) should be left to the students themselves.
- (e) Hostels of the size of the Eden Hindu Hostel should be the rule.
- (f) If the obligatory percentage of attendance at lectures, which is now very high (75 per cent), be reduced, as it should be, tutorial assistance in the hostel will be imperatively necessary. But, under the existing system, tutorial assistance should be provided if a student desires it, or if the professor finds that he requires it.

CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Justice SH ASUTOSH

Messes and lodgings ought to be under better control and inspectors ought to be appointed by the University for that purpose. I am in favour of a residential university, but I fear that the system which has been so long in force cannot now be modified, except by the introduction of hostels and seminaries. Residential colleges in the district towns are more practicable than in Calcutta.

CHAUDHURI, BHUBAN MOHAN

The hostels and attached messes in the university town should be under the direct control of the University and those in the mofussil under the college authorities. The superintendent must be a person who, by his character and education, can command respect from the boys under his charge and he should look after the health of the students and their moral and intellectual progress. The hostel should be situated in an open space having sufficient space for a playground and a gymnasium,

CHAUDHURI BHUBAN MOHAN—*contd*—CHAUDHURI HEM CHANDRA RAY—CHAUDHURI
The Hon'ble Babu KISHORI MOHAN

The kitchen and the dining room must be sufficiently spacious. A doctor should be specially engaged for the treatment of illness in the hostel and for giving advice about sanitary arrangements. There must be a common room in each hostel where the students should meet every day at a particular hour to read newspapers and periodicals and for free interchange of thought. Tutorial assistance in a hostel may be possible if there are two resident superintendents—one to supervise the hostel and the other to give some tutorial assistance to the boys. The head of the institution at least should live in the compound or very close to it.

CHAUDHURI HEM CHANDRA RAY

- (a) Hostels and messes should be under the direct control of the president or the principal of the institution to which they are attached. This control should be exercised through superintendents chosen by the boarders from among their professors and prefects elected by the boarders from among themselves. The University should have powers of inspection.
- (b) and (c) The superintendent should distribute seats, maintain discipline and call the rolls. He should not interfere with kitchen and dining room arrangements. Inspectors should be, as a rule, senators, principals or professors.
- (d) Messing arrangements should be entirely in the hands of the students. There should be in every hostel or mess one resident medical officer for the treatment of illness.

Every hostel or mess should be provided with a common room and a library.

- (e) A hostel should not consist of more than 50 boarders.
- (f) No, unless the students desire it.

CHAUDHURI The Hon'ble Babu KISHORI MOHAN

- (a) The hostels and attached messes should be under the control and supervision of the colleges. The University should have no particular concern with them beyond the general power of supervision and control which it should continue to exercise over the colleges.
- (b) The superintendent should preferably be a tutor or junior professor and should be resident in the hostel or mess. He should fill the position of guardian of the boarders. He should watch the moral, intellectual and physical development of the boarders and teach them to be regular and simple in their habits.
- (c) The premises and sites for the hostels and messes should be selected by the college authority. The arrangement for food and establishment should be delegated to a committee of the boarders who should make proper arrangements under the guidance of the superintendent.

The superintendent should have full control over the students committed to his care. The committee of students with the superintendent at its head will make the internal arrangements subject to the control of the college authority.

The governing body of the college should appoint a committee for the supervision of the hostels and messes. One or more of the committee should inspect the hostels and messes as often as possible and give suggestions to the superintendents about the improvement of the institutions and submit periodical reports to the governing body. The work of inspection should not be undertaken by the University, but the university inspectors should consider the arrangements made for the residence of students generally at the time of their inspection.

- (d) The superintendent should consider the kitchen and dining arrangements. Necessary arrangements for physical exercise within the premises is indispensably necessary. A qualified medical man should be appointed who will daily visit the hostels. A separate room should be set apart for patients. Each college

CHAUDHURY, The Hon'ble Babu KISHORE MOHAN—*contd*—CHAUDHURY, The Hon'ble Babu BROJLADRA KISHORE ROY—CHOUDHURY, Rai YATINDRA NATH

should keep a dispensary which should supply medicine to its students at a common rate. Boarders should have free access to the college library and reading rooms. There should be arrangements for religious instruction as far as practicable.

(c) The best size for a hostel is one which can accommodate sixty boarders.

(f) It is desirable, but it is not financially practicable, for the college. The superintendent should watch the progress of the boarders and if, in individual cases, he thinks tutorial assistance necessary he should advise the guardians accordingly.

CHAUDHURY, The Hon'ble Babu BROJLADRA KISHORE ROY.

Students should, as far as possible, be allowed to live in their homes under natural guardians, but where they have to live in boarding-houses or hostels they should always live under a residential superintendent, who should be very carefully selected, should, preferably, be a teacher of the institution, and must be a man full of sympathy and patience, with no heterodox leanings. The position of the superintendent should, as stated before, be, as far as possible, that of a natural guardian, with almost the same rights and responsibilities. The boarding-house and superintendent should also be under the general control of the University, or boards of professors, or boards of well-selected prominent individuals, who should be invited and requested to undertake such duties.

Whether in big hostels or boarding-houses, there should be separate cooking arrangements for a limited number of boys, not more than 20 or 25 being put together. The management should rest with the students themselves, under the general supervision of the superintendent. The equipment should be simple and inexpensive.

As far as possible, boys of different castes should be placed in different messes, with separate cooking arrangements. At least, there must be separate dining-rooms for different castes.

Students nearly related to one another should be provided with accommodation in the same lodging, and, as far as possible, in the same room, although they may belong to different institutions or although one may be a student of a secondary school.

Library facilities may be provided in big hostels but, in doing so, we must not make living in boarding-houses expensive, for libraries, after all, very often prove ornamental things even in our colleges and schools and are at times a source of destruction.

As to tutorial arrangements in boarding-houses this is very necessary, but it is equally necessary to make them inexpensive, in most cases, in a poor country like ours. The senior students in messes and boarding-houses should, under proper safeguards, be made to spend, say, an hour's time daily in helping a junior student or some juniors in his, or their, studies. This will tend to generate in seniors affection and sympathy for their juniors and a sense of respect in juniors towards their seniors—so essential for the natural growth of ideas of discipline and comradeship in corporate life.

CHOUDHURY, Rai YATINDRA NATH.

My suggestions regarding the organisation of residential arrangements for students are already given. Those living with their parents and natural guardians should not be disturbed, but those who live in licensed hostels should be under the special care of superintendents appointed by the authorities of the respective colleges. The University should appoint a visitors' board, consisting of the fellows, with a suitable percentage of outsiders, who are men of influence and education, to inspect these college hostels.

Regarding residential colleges, the University should appoint a visitors' board from amongst their members, with power to associate with them men of local influence and education, to inspect frequently those colleges and to see that proper discipline is observed. These colleges being their own, in a special sense, the University would be ultimately responsible for the good conduct of those students who are taught in the university colleges.

CHOU DURY Rai YATINDRA NATH—*contd*—CROHAN Rev Father F—CUNNINGHAM
The Hon'ble Mr J R—DAS BHUSAN CHANDRA and RAY BAIKUNTHA CHANDRA

The financial aspect of the question under discussion need not trouble us because students will pay for their mess and board and further because Government the University and the college authorities will have to contribute to the funds of the o Hostels By suitable economic management and by dispensing with unnecessary luxuries I think this system would not be impracticable even from a financial point of view

CROHAN Rev Father F

The existing university regulations in regard to hostels etc are if kept to very satisfactory

- (b) I would suggest that the resident superintendent should be a professor or demonstrator or tutor of the college who has already gained the good will of the students
- (c) In this connection I would ask leave to quote here a paragraph from my annual report of 1917 —

The hostel for our Indian students at 219 11 Lower Circular Road was formally opened this year and from the very outset every seat was filled The accommodation provided is for 60 students only and we much regret that the University did not see its way to accord us a more substantial share in the grant allotted for hostels so as to allow of a larger building The demand in our case far exceeds the supply St Xavier's does not enjoy the advantage possessed by the other colleges more centrally placed in the north of Calcutta of having a number of licensed messes in close proximity and as the proportion of students coming to us from distant localities annually increases it seems reasonable to expect that the one hostel attached to the college should be such as to offer accommodation to a fairly large percentage

This applies to all similar cases

- (f) As tutorial assistance is already given in the college to all the students the hostel residents could form literary scientific and dramatic clubs under the guidance of the college professors They should also be obliged to speak English

CUNNINGHAM The Hon'ble Mr J R

Not more than 40 students should be under the care of a single superintendent the superintendent being provided with family quarters in covered connection with the hostel and a study in the hostel building

DAS BHUSAN CHANDRA, and RAY BAIKUNTHA CHANDRA

- (a) The University will lay down general principles and colleges will make rules according to special conditions
- (b) A special service may be created by the University for the supervision of the work of hostels and the superintendents of hostels will belong to this service There should be a graded scale of pay and a provision for pension Each superintendent should be provided with family quarters in the hostel in his charge The superintendent must be a man of excellent character having genuine faith in the religion he professes conversant with religious books and sympathetic in his behaviour His rank will be that of a member of the teaching staff He from time to time will have talks with students on religious topics and the students of each class may have one period set apart on the time table for a short discourse on any approved religious book

DAS, BHUSAN CHANDRA and RAY, RADHISTHA NATH :—Dr. GUPTA, KALINA KANTA :—Dr. HAR MOHUN :—Dr. SATISCHANDRA :—Dr. PARSODA PROSAUD

- (c) A superintendent will have in his charge not more than 50 boarders. The mess and arrangement in a hotel will be managed by student. Twenty-five students will form a mess association.
- (d), (e) and (f) Fifty student hostellers in one hotel. A hotel should have sanitary quarters for one superintendent, one tutor, one clerk, thirteen four-bedded rooms (for 50 student), two kitchen, two dining rooms, two store rooms, one library, one sick room, and one common room.
- There should be one attending physician for four such hotels.

DAS GUPTA, KALINA KANTA.

I have no definite knowledge of the modern hotel system in Calcutta for college boys. It is certainly desirable for no school attached to a hotel to have separate kitchen and hostel arrangements for different castes, classified as touchables and non touchables, provision for treatment of illness should be made by reserving a room or two, with a certain number of beds for segregation of contagious cases. It is also necessary to keep a sufficient stock of medicine in the hostel compound or nearby in charge of a competent medical authority who should ordinarily be an assistant surgeon. This arrangement has worked well in Gauhati, especially as medical aid is given here free of cost.

Accommodation should be so far limited that a boarder may get at least 600 cubic feet of air space.

In a school hostel boys in the lower classes do sometimes get a sort of help from boys in the higher classes, but it is not enough. Tutorial assistance is certainly needful towards the use of a decent library which should be added to each hostel.

Dr. HAR MOHUN

- (b) The superintendent should be chosen by vote from among the candidates of the staff. When the proper man is got, he should be allowed the maximum of freedom with regard to the management and control of the hostel under him. His remuneration ought to be handsome so as to attract a qualified man.

Dr. SATISCHANDRA.

- (a) The existing relations are good.
- (b) The superintendent should be a professor or lecturer.
- (c) The existing arrangements are good.
- (d) and (e) Hostels similar to those in the compound of the Dacca College should be constructed. I am for small hostels, each accommodating 25 boarders and one superintendent, because only in such small hostels can individual attention be paid to boarders.
- (f) This is desirable, but seems to be financially impracticable.

Dr. BARODA PROSAUD

In regard to hostels and "attached messes"—

- (a) They should be under the direct control of the University, and the college authorities should co-operate and have immediate charge.
- (b) The superintendent should generally be an elderly professor of the college, and his status and functions should be like those of a natural guardian.
- (c) There should be a set of rules regarding the management, control, and inspection of hostels. These are matters of detail.

DEY BARODA PROSAUD—*contd*—DEY N N—DHAR SASINDRA CHANDRA

- (d) Hostels should be properly equipped and should have all facilities according as funds are available
- (e) A hostel should be a well ventilated commodious building
- (f) It would certainly add to the usefulness of a hostel if tutorial assistance is provided but it means money

DEY, N N

This question has been partly answered in my answer to question 17

Students of different colleges should be allowed to club together to live in a mess under the control of the principal of one of the colleges a professor or a tutor of such a college being the superintendent. One advantage of this method is that village groups may be formed and another is that brothers or cousins reading in different colleges may live under one roof forming family groups as it were

Big hostels are not at all convenient both for the students and the superintendent and my idea is that sixty ought to be the limit for one building under one superintendent

The hostels messes and attached messes should be under the full control of the colleges

The superintendent should be a man of the status of a professor of the college and he must have enthusiasm for the work and must be as much a sympathiser and well wisher of the students under his charge as their parents or guardians. He will have absolute control over the boys in matters of discipline and would look after the moral physical and intellectual welfare of the boys placed under his charge

The superintendent ought to be relieved of the duties of detailed management which duties will be placed in charge of the assistant superintendent

All other arrangements for the hostel—equipment kitchen dining room and treatment of illness—should be amply provided

Library facilities and provision for tutorial assistance are the two items which cannot be taken in hand at present for financial considerations

DHAR SASINDRA CHANDRA

- (a) The University should have nothing to do with the internal management of a hostel or an attached mess which shall be under the exclusive control of the principal of the college
- (b) The superintendent should have powers akin to those of the principal in matters of discipline and his authority should be final. Class promotion or the sending up of a candidate for university examination ought to depend on a good report from the superintendent. The superintendent should be a member of the teaching staff of the college. He should not be a young man and should be well paid. Family quarters should also be provided. All the menials should be under his exclusive control. The superintendent should preferably be an Indian
- (c) Professors of the college should often visit the hostel which should be regarded as an integral part of the college. The principal should visit his hostel at least once a week. It is desirable that professors of the college should also take an active part with the students in games and other thing
- (d) Every hostel should have dining and kitchen rooms separated from the main building. Ample provision should also be made for games and outdoor exercises. There ought to be the nucleus of a small library in every hostel and there should be a segregation room for the sick
- (e) Not more than 50 and not less than 30 otherwise the superintendent cannot come into personal touch with every individual student

DHAR, SASINDRA CHANDRA—*contd*—D'SOUSA, P. G.—DUKE, W. V.—DUTT, REBATI RAMAN—DUTTA, PROMODI CHANDRA—FAWCUS, G. E.

- (f) Any tutorial assistance should be a labour of love on the part of the superintendent and need not be made a condition of his appointment.

Considering the financial stringency now, and for some time to come, it would be advisable to utilise any grant from the public funds towards subvention to attached messes. This would be economical. A larger number of students can be housed in this manner. The attached messes should, thus, really be hostels, with buildings hired for a long term. Unattached messes are an unmitigated nuisance and they should be abolished forthwith.

D'SOUSA, P. G.

The warden of the students should be an Indian professor who can enter into the life of the students. It is always best to give as much self-government as possible to students. Each hostel should be provided with a hall to serve as a library or a general meeting-place, a special block for students that are ill, kitchens for different communities, etc.

DUKE, W. V.

Messes are distinctly dangerous and injurious to the students in respect of study, discipline, morals, etc.

- (c) The three student room is not satisfactory. Four students would appear to be the minimum number of students who should reside in one room.

DUTT, REBATI RAMAN

I have already said much about my idea of hostels in answer to other questions. Of course there must always exist a number of hostels and attached messes for a great number of our boys who cannot live with their parents or other suitable guardians, but the hostel should never be made to displace the temple of the family. The hostel should be a tutorial hall attached to the college, under the control of a man or men who can, and do, act as tutors, and the management should be left to the boys themselves. The size should never be too big and about 50 should be the maximum number of students in any hostel. Each student will contribute a rupee for tuition, and the existing college tutors will be asked to be the hostel superintendents, 30 to 50 students should be under the control of one tutor in one hostel.

DUTTA, PROMODI CHANDRA

The superintendents of the hostels should be good professors, preferably senior in age; so the salary must be made attractive.

- (c) Each hostel should not contain more than three messes, with 20 students in each mess.
- (d) Each mess of 20 students should get a kitchen, etc. There should be a reference library in the hostel (60 students). Senior students might coach junior students *gratis* or for a small remuneration.

FAWCUS, G. E.

I have already stated that I think that hostels should be designed for not more than 50 boarders. The type-plan for a hostel for 50 boarders in this province provides

FANCUS G E—*contl*—GANGULI SURENDRA MOHAN—GEDDES PATRICK—GHOSA PRATAPCANDRA—GHOSE SIR RASH BEHARY

for a main building which forms three sides of a quadrangle the front being enclosed by a railing. The students sleep and do their work in large dormitories and they have also a common room. Behind the main quadrangle are two smaller ones one of which contains the kitchens store rooms and a night latrine while the other contains the superintendents *zanana* quarters. Bihar students seem to prefer to eat their food in the rooms in which it is cooked so separate dining rooms are not provided. Each hostel has a segregation ward at some distance from it. The superintendent is responsible for seeing that the boarders observe the prescribed routine and do not leave the hostel at night. He supervises the arrangements for their food and helps them in their work. If he is not the head master the latter exercises a general supervision over his work. This type of hostel appears to be satisfactory. The hostel being designed so that it can be locked up at night cases of breaking bounds are rare while the provision of *zanana* quarters for the superintendent in connection with the hostel not only tends to make the supervision closer but is popular with the superintendents and thus renders it possible to obtain good men for the work. These hostels for 50 students with superintendent's quarters cost about Rs 50 000.

GANGULI SURENDRA MOHAN

I do not wish to enter into the details of a scheme but it may be said that in any kind of residential arrangement strict discipline of a mechanical type without the loving guidance as that of a parent or a brother will produce very little good.

GEDDES PATRICK

As a hostel builder I cannot but feel disappointment on the whole with what I have seen of hostels in various Indian university cities. The present industrial and bureaucratic forms of society appear to me far too often to infect them with elements recalling the defects of the factory the barrack and even the prison and with too little of the respective merits of these production discipline and health. I believe since I have so long experimentally found that it is through the freedom the self government yet the self discipline of the students that satisfactory results can alone be obtained and I look at those who would establish hostels as a means of control and as a measure against unrest and who thus cannot but over regulate with more than mere distrust.

- (a) (b) (c) (d) (e) and (f) Time does not permit my entering into these many points but if opportunity arise I shall be happy to state my experience and conclusions (from my home experiences especially) in conversation or under examination if desired.

GHOSA PRATAPCANDRA

- (a) As regards hostels etc they should be subordinate to the University

GHOSE SIR RASH BEHARY

Law hostels should be abolished. The maximum number of boarders in a hostel should be between 30 and 40.

A university service of superintendents of hostels should be instituted recruitment to the service being made chiefly on the basis of personal character. Men of a missionary type self sacrificing and thoroughly acquainted with the sacred scriptures of the country should be given preference. European missionaries may also be taken if they are thoroughly familiar with the vernaculars. The superintendents will have family

GHOSE, SIR RASH BEHARY—*contd* —GHOSH, BIMAL CHANDRA—GHOSH, DEVAPRASAD
GHOSH, Rai HARI NATH, Bahadur

quarters provided for them in the hostels, and they will supplement the secular teaching given in the college by moral and religious instruction. They may also provide tutorial assistance to the students outside college hours. Government will be expected to liberally provide funds to make the scheme a success.

The hostels will be attached to the colleges under the supervision of the University.

GHOSH, BIMAL CHANDRA

The question of residence is best met by increasing the number of colleges in the mofussil and expanding the colleges already there. This will remove the congestion in Calcutta colleges and, at the same time, improve the condition of rural areas by arresting emigration therefrom. Opening new colleges in Cossipore, Howrah, and Entally, with hostels and messes, will also remove the congestion.

- (a) Hostels, messes, and lodgings should be managed by the colleges, but inspected by the University.
- (b) The superintendent should be a member of the college staff, assisted by a clerk or senior student for every fifty boarders. In a mess or lodgings, however, any respectable person—such as a laboratory assistant or a clerk in the college office—might do the duties of superintendent.
- (c) The best size for hostels would be 100—50 for the intermediate and 50 for the B A students—but a maximum of 200 may be allowed.
- (d) The kitchen and dining-room arrangements should be looked after by a lady. There should be a reading-room and a small library, and two sick-rooms, with the usual fittings, for two patients in each. Every hostel for 100 students should have a medical attendant attending daily.

GHOSH, DEVAPRASAD

The principle of having attached messes and hostels and licensed messes is quite a good principle. Some sort of supervision is exercised over the students, and their health and comfort are, presumably, better looked after. But the arrangement ought to be on a much more extensive scale than at present—in fact, it ought to be such that all the students of each college can be accommodated. And, until either the University or the colleges are able to provide this, students ought to be allowed to start messes on their own account and permitted to reside in them.

The main thing that ought to be borne in mind when attached hostels and messes are started should be this, that the expenses that the boarders there have to bear are not prohibitive. I know from personal experience that seat-rents in messes started by students themselves are sometimes as low as Rs 3-8, Rs 3, and even Rs 2-8 per month, while seats of the same type on the ground floor in college attached messes and hostels are all Rs 5 per month and on top floors not less than Rs 6. The unmistakable tendency now-a-days has been the gradual raising of rent charges in college hostels. In view of the widespread poverty of our people this thing is distinctly reprehensible.

No sort of restrictions ought to be imposed upon graduates, all such restrictions as to residence should be confined to under-graduates, for the graduates are sufficiently well-advanced in intellect and have developed sufficient sense of responsibility to be trusted to look after themselves.

GHOSH, Rai HARI NATH, Bahadur

- (a) They are to be, as far as possible, individual academic messes, the overflow being accommodated in cosmopolitan messes, and they are to be all under the University.

GHOSH Rai HARI NATH Bahadur—*contd*—GHOSH JNANCHANDRA—GILCHRIST R N—
GOSWAMI Rai Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN

inspectors of boarding houses. The college authorities should select their own superintendents who are to be appointed by the University and superintendents are to have qualifications in practical sanitation and drill

- (b) The superintendents are to have a graded service three special remunerations to be founded for good management and sanitation
- (c) Local control by a resident superintendent and monitors selected from among the student to help the superintendent superintendents to instil ideas of discipline there are to be Saturday afternoon drills by the superintendent. Five inspections a year distributed over the working months at intervals of about two months besides special surprise visits by the inspectors
- (d) One table of a half secretariat pattern a chair a table and a lamp with a topshade to cut off the rays hitting the eyes directly. Kitchen and dining room arrangements are to be always on the top floor. The cooks and servants who are to be appointed must be passed by the doctor as to their health and they are to be well paid. They are to be trained by the superintendents in observing cleanliness and sanitation. A room to be set apart for the treatment of the sick. Doctors appointed for hostels
- (e) Accommodation for 50 in one administrative block with one common room. There may be several such blocks in one large building
- (f) Arrangements for regular tutorial assistance impossible for college going folk. But approved tutors may be allowed to such students as specially need them on their own account

GHOSH JNANCHANDRA

I have the following suggestions to make regarding the residential arrangements for students —

- (i) Hostels should be made small in size each accommodating about 30 students.
- (ii) For the proper supervision of hostels a special university service of superintendents should be created. The service should include men of some academical distinction and of high character who are prepared to devote their lives to the welfare of the students. If they are Europeans they should be missionaries and should possess a competent knowledge of the vernaculars so as to be able to converse freely with the students in their mother tongue. If they are Indians they should have sufficient knowledge of either the Hindu or the Muslim sacred writings so as to be able to converse freely with the students about the moral and religious ideals of their race. I do not think there will be any difficulty in creating a service composed mainly of Indians—Hindus as well as Muslims—inspired by high moral and religious idea.

—

GILCHRIST R N

I think that a scheme should be evolved placing all residential arrangements in charge of colleges with a central committee in the University

- (e) I think 40 a reasonable number for each hostel
- (f) Tutorial assistance should be left entirely to the colleges,

GOSWAMI Rai Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN

- (a) Students not living with their parents or approved guardians should be made to live in hostels or attached messes. Each college must have its own hostel or

GOSWAMI, Rai Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN—*contd* —GOSWAMY, HARIDAS

attached messes, and these hostels or messes should be directly under the control of their own colleges and indirectly under the control of the University

- (b) And the hostels or attached messes must be placed under superintendents who should belong to the staff of the respective colleges, should be experienced, able and responsible officers who, by their scholarship and force of character, can command the respect of the students placed under their care. The duty of these superintendents will be to look after the moral and physical well-being of the students, to enforce discipline, and to create a well-regulated habit of study among the students, and to see that a sober, simple, and honest mode of living prevails among the boarders

In order that they may be able to enforce discipline they should be empowered to impose fines upon, to rusticate, or to expel refractory students according to the nature of their offence.

- (c) In order that the superintendents of hostels may effectively supervise, control, and manage the hostels in their charge they should be assisted in their work by a graduate of some years' standing in each hostel
- (d) In a hostel there should be arrangements for providing each boarder with a bed, a small table or desk, a chair or sitting stool, a book-shelf, and a rack for clothes. There should be arrangements for light also. A kitchen, with a dining-room outside the hostel buildings, must be provided for each hostel, with quarters for the servants. Social rules and customs must be observed in messing. The management of dining arrangements will be looked after by the boarders themselves, who will have to submit monthly accounts to the superintendents. Medical help should be given gratis. There should be a sick-room and a segregation ward for infectious or contagious diseases in each hostel. The boarders will have a common room equipped with a small, but useful, library
- (e) A hostel should not be very large. It should be commodious enough to accommodate 40 or 50 students. To put together a large number of students in a hostel interferes with effective supervision and control. It is not possible for a superintendent, be his abilities ever so great, to know fully the doings, and watch the movements, of a very large number of youths placed under his care
- (f) It is, no doubt, desirable that tutorial assistance is provided for the boarders of a hostel, but there are difficulties in the way, for it is not possible for the superintendent of a hostel to render tutorial assistance to each and every boarder of the hostel in every subject of his study. To do this the services of many competent persons will be required, which means considerable expense

GOSWAMY, HARIDAS

- (a) Hostels should be so organised as to become integral parts of the college, not detached institutions between which and the college there is no connection, save and except that the lodgers all, or mostly belong to the same college and that, in most cases, an assistant of the college, not a professor, lives a life of isolation in the same premises. The hostel and the college *together* should be the college, a common life throbbing under them
- (b) The superintendent should invariably be a highly respected professor who can enter into the life of the students, share their joys and sorrows, and, preferably, their sports, help them in their studies, and imbue them with his own spirit, thus insensibly moulding their character and shaping their lives.

He should be the head of this *family*, directing the activities of the different members in their important concerns, yet leaving them a large measure of freedom, and leading them to promote the individual and social good. It is preferable that as many professors as possible should live with them

GOSWAMY HARIDAS—*contd*—GRAY Dr J HENRY—GUHA JATINDRA CHANDRA

- (c) The management should be in the hands of a students committee or a committee of elected prefects with the superintendent as their president having the supreme right of interfering to avert a serious wrong
- (d) There should be frequent visits by other professors and the principal in the course of which they should lay aside the reserve and aloofness to some extent inseparable from lecture rooms and should enter into the interests and activities of the students
- (e) There should be a common dining room a common room with a small library of well chosen books and a sick-room under the supervision of a qualified whole time or part-time medical officer
- (f) Fifty is the best size for a hostel
- (g) Tutorial assistance should be provided

GRAY Dr J HENRY

- (a) The superintendent must be a man of sufficient power and standing in the community to command respect and not be someone placed in the position to enable him to gain additional remuneration
- (b) Present arrangements are adequate if carried out
- (c) There should be some proper accommodation for sick students either in the hostel or perhaps in a special hospital built for this purpose or perhaps by the reservation of a ward in the Medical College Hospital for students only Proper medical supervision must of course be provided for
- (d) A small unit of say 40 so that adequate supervision may be possible but this ideal is practically impossible in Calcutta because of the cost of construction and land. Supervision might however be worked out on the small group plan
- (e) This should be worked out

GUHA JATINDRA CHANDRA

The present constitution and management of the hostels and the attached messes are not quite satisfactory. The messes are not generally placed under such superintendents as can exercise any real control over the boarders and are not always located in healthy quarters and surroundings. The hostels are generally too big and their unwieldy size is hardly conducive to the growth of corporate life in them which is claimed to be one of the chief advantages of hostel life for students. The number of boarders is so large that they do not get sufficient opportunities of becoming intimately known to one another and these heterogeneous units instead of being knit together into a homogeneous whole form small coteries through natural affinities which are constantly at feud with one another. The superintendent also cannot come into personal touch with all of them and as a result of this the boarders are very much left to themselves and free to drift into evil courses. The hostels therefore should be small enough to be manageable and should not contain more than 30 or 40 members each at the most. Each hostel should have the superintendent's quarters attached to it and all the hostels belonging to a college should be located in the same place and stand round a quadrangle which should contain a common hall and a library for the use of them all. To provide tutorial assistance to the boarders a body of tutors may be appointed from the college staff who should be remunerated mainly by the boarders themselves. There should be separate hostel accommodation for the depressed classes where the number of boarders belonging to these is likely to be large. For the treatment of illness there should be a common hospital for all the hostels. Where it is not possible to provide hostel accommodation sufficient to meet the needs of a college messes may be formed in suitable quarters and placed under the general supervision of a college proctor who should go round and frequently visit them.

GUHA, RAJANIKANTA

GUHA, RAJANIKANTA.

I would offer some general remarks on hostels. We are now building big hostels for our colleges. They have advantages, as well as disadvantages. I shall point out some of the latter —

- (i) Big college hostels are much more costly than messes, and most of our students are very poor.
- (ii) It is extremely difficult to secure the satisfactory management of a big hostel, especially in the matter of food, the cooking in it is seldom well done.
- (iii) When epidemic diseases break out in a big hostel the panic and the dislocation of academic work caused thereby are far greater than in small hostels or messes.
- (iv) Lastly, the moral danger also should not be overlooked. When three or four hundred young men are brought together it is not unlikely that one or two black sheep will lurk among them, and these may be powerful enough to vitiate the whole atmosphere. The evil effects in that case will be simply incalculable. There is such a thing as the influence of numbers, and it may not be always wholesome.

I would, therefore, recommend that hostels should not be, as a rule, larger than what is necessary for the accommodation of fifty students, and that this is the maximum number that should lodge and board together. From my experience of messes in Calcutta in my college days I would rather cut down the number to thirty. It would have been better if, with a view to this, our college hostels had been built in blocks, but, even now, the messing may be split up into several sections.

Students should be allowed, as hitherto, to live in messes and lodgings under proper supervision, and trained to manage their own affairs.

Too much emphasis should not be laid on the residential system. The German universities are not residential, and yet they have become potent factors in the national uplift, and one of them, the University of Berlin, stands to day at the top of the universities of the world. The idea of converting our colleges entirely into residential institutions should be discouraged, for what is indigenous at Oxford or Cambridge is an exotic in Bengal. Here, it is bound to labour under various disadvantages which will interfere with its life and vigour. My views on this topic were set forth in an article named *Residential Colleges in India* which I contributed to the *Modern Review* for March, 1907.

The following paragraphs are extracted from it —

- * * * * * * *
- “ Evidently, the idea seems to be gaining ground in certain quarters that because residential colleges play a most important part in the education of the youth of England in the great centres of light and culture like Oxford and Cambridge, therefore, they must be equally successful in India. Residential colleges have, undoubtedly, their usefulness everywhere and, unless scandalously ill-managed, they cannot be dead failures in any part of India. But it is well to note their limitations under the peculiar and exceptional circumstances of this country, for, do what we may, limitations of a serious nature and drawbacks not altogether to be disregarded, they must have, for the very plain reason that the conditions that crown with success the career of a residential college at Oxford or Cambridge are different in many vital respects from those that obtain in this country.
- “ The four principal elements that go to build up the corporate life of an under-graduate in one of the great seats of learning in England are the playground, the dining hall, the chapel, and the club. Of these four, the first alone can be utilised in full in the formation of the character of an under-graduate in an Indian college. Its value in the education of a young man, the citizen of the future, cannot be overrated. It is hardly necessary to refer to the celebrated saying of the Duke of Wellington to the effect that half the battles of England

GUHA RAJANIKANTA—contd

were won on the playgrounds of public schools. Till recently Indian youths especially the talented section of them did not take kindly to outdoor sports and games but a change is now clearly discernible everywhere and some few colleges have made it compulsory for their pupils to pay greater and closer attention to the training of the body than they had hitherto done. The time may or may not have come when a systematic course of physical culture should be made compulsory for every aspirant to the hall mark of the University but one fact is undisputed it is that the playground is a most powerful factor in moulding the character of a student and that for this latter purpose a residential college may take advantage of it to a far larger extent than a college that is not residential.

But a residential college in India unless it be strictly denominational cannot have a common dining hall for all its pupils—and the dining hall is not a negligible factor in university education in England. The under graduates says the late lamented Dr Sathianadhan in his *Four Years in an English University* dine together in the college hall. It is indeed an interesting sight which these college halls present—crowded with young under graduates all in their black gowns the whole place filled with bustle talking and laughter. Many a joke goes round the table and many a discussion on politics and other topics of general interest is held. Unfortunately in India in more than half a century English education has touched only the outer fringe of society and the result is that the caste rules are to all purposes as rigid to day as they were in the days of the famous controversy between the Orientalists and the Anglicists. In the hostels attached to our colleges these rules have been relaxed only so far that young men belonging to the three higher castes—and what we say is limited to Bengal—do not object to dine in the same room but the time seems to be yet far off when in a mixed college of Hindu and Muhammadan youths it will be possible to have one common dining hall.

The most noticeable feature of a residential college in Oxford and Cambridge is the chapel. To quote again the word of Dr Sathianadhan — We must look upon the universities of Oxford and Cambridge as having a spiritual power in the kingdom in order to realise the subtle influences at work insensibly moulding the young men who in their afterlives play the most important part in every sphere of English activity. Regular religious services form a necessary part of the corporate life of all existing colleges. Of late we are hearing much about the utter absence of any religious training in Indian schools and colleges but we do not know that anybody has suggested how it is possible to impart religious instruction in a non denominational institution much less how its pupils professing as they do different faiths and holding a variety of creeds and dogmas within the same faith can have a common spiritual exercise. We have seen in the Central Hindu College at Benares provision made for the purpose of enabling its pupils to perform their *pujahs* but it is as its very name indicates a denominational college and even here the programme of spiritual culture that has been adopted cannot exert the same influence on the lives of its *alumni* as a chapel does in a residential college at Cambridge. For we should always remember that while Christian worship is congregational and has therefore in all ages deeply influenced the corporate life of the worshippers Hindu worship is essentially individualistic.

Every English college has a club attached to it as most Indian colleges have though these latter do not often display a superabundance of life and vigour in fact in comparison with their European prototypes they may be regarded as being constantly in a moribund condition. Be that as it may there can be no two opinions on the valuable work that is done by the college and university clubs in fashioning the life and destiny of an English under graduate. Who has not heard of the Oxford Union and the Cambridge Union and of the intellectual feats achieved in them by rising young men like Macaulay and Gladstone and a host of others too numerous to be named? That the club can play an equally important part in this country is admitted on all hands. But does the club in a college especially in a Government college in India mean the same thing as the club in an English college? Then in Oxford and Cambridge young Englishmen discuss with unrestricted freedom and boldness all manner of topics social political and literary and

GUHA, RAJANIKANTA—*contd* —GURDON, The Hon'ble Lt Col. P R T.

debates on political subjects, according to the testimony of those who have participated in them, are usually the most interesting Will the Government of India, or for the matter of that the Government of Western and Eastern Bengal, permit the free discussion of political topics in the colleges under their immediate control? We do not mean to contend that a young inexperienced under-graduate should be forthwith turned into a full-fledged politician But what we do maintain is that the interdiction of any branch of inquiry in the education of a young man cannot but stunt and dwarf his whole mind There can be no partition of the soul with impunity Bar the avenue of knowledge in one direction, and it will exercise a depressing and paralyzing influence on the mind, even in those directions which were left open As in the domain of politics, so in the domain of knowledge the intellectual slave is not less incapable of solid original work than the political slave of achieving all-round national greatness

GURDON, The Hon'ble Lt-Col P R. T.

Extract from letter No 520 G dated Gauhati the 14th September 1916, to the Second Secretary to the Hon'ble the Chief Commissioner of Assam

Will you please refer to an article which appeared in the *Assam Bhasini* in its issue of the 22nd of June, 1916, on the subject of hostels for Assamese students in Calcutta? Recently, whilst staying in Calcutta, I made some personal enquiries, visiting the Hardinge hostel, the mess for Assamese students in Amherst Street and the M L Jubilee hostel for Muhammadans this hostel, I think is in Mizapore Street The accommodation in the Hardinge hostel is, no doubt, good, but that in the Amherst Street hostel and the M L Jubilee hostel for Muhammadans I think rather inferior, especially in the latter One point which struck me was that in both the Amherst Street and the M L Jubilee hostels there did not seem to be any really responsible superintendent in charge I had no time to visit other hostels, but I gather from a list of hostels which was supplied to me by Srijut Nabin Chandra Bardaloi that there are quite a number situated in different parts of Calcutta, some of which are under no proper form of supervision I do not refer, of course, to the hostel of the Oxford Mission nor to that of the C M S Mission, nor to that of the Scottish Churches Nor is it clear that an inspector from the University exercises supervision The matter of supervision seems to be an important one, also the question of adequate accommodation There are now, according to the list, 73 Assamese students studying for different examinations in Calcutta, and it would seem to be, therefore a matter for consideration whether the students could not be accommodated in one or more houses, the houses to be provided by Government Should there be no Government buildings available which could be used as hostels might I suggest the advisability of Government hiring houses for the purpose? A superintendent or superintendents (if it is decided to have a separate hostel for Muhammadans) will be necessary, and the pay of the superintendents will have to be met by Government It will be part of the arrangement that the students should pay seat-rent or fees in order that a portion, at least, of the expenses incurred by Government might be recouped

Some Assamese gentlemen whom I have consulted recently, *e.g.*, the Hon'ble Mr. T R Phukan, the Hon'ble Rai Ghansyam Barua Bahadur, the Hon'ble Rai Sahib Phandhar Chaliha, and Srijut Nabin Chandra Bardaloi, are of opinion that it is desirable that something should be done to safeguard the Assamese students who are in Calcutta It may, of course, be argued that, if the Cotton College and the Murarichand College are affiliated with the Calcutta University in all the required subjects, it will not be necessary for students of this province to resort to Calcutta at all for purposes of study, but the Cotton College has not been affiliated in all the subjects, nor has the Murarichand College, and, until such affiliation takes place, students from Assam presumably, will continue to resort to Calcutta Again, even when the desired consummation has taken place, *i.e.*, affiliation in all required subjects, it is possible that some Assamese students may prefer to study in Calcutta I think myself that it is - - - to meet the demand for hostel accommodation in Calcutta,

HALDAR UMES CHANDRA—HAQ Khan Sahib Maulvi KAZI ZAHIRAT—HARLEY
A H

HALDAR UMES CHANDRA

The so called attached and licensed messes should be abolished

- (a) The hostels should be subject to periodical inspection by university inspectors of hostels who should be medical experts
The college authorities should be primarily responsible for the good management of the hostels
- (b) The superintendent who should be a member of the instructive staff must look after the physical intellectual and moral welfare of the boarders and should also see that proper dietary arrangements are made
- (c) The boarders should be allowed a certain amount of freedom consistent with discipline As the superintendent is solely responsible for the proper management of the hostel he should be empowered to appoint monitors from amongst its inmates
- (d) There should be a store room a kitchen a dining room servants quarters a common room a library and a dispensary in charge of a duly qualified medical officer and also a segregation room for infectious cases
- (e) Small hostels accommodating 30 boarders at most allowing 60 square feet of space for each are preferable
- (f) This is highly desirable

HAQ Khan Sahib Maulvi KAZI ZAHIRAT

The residential arrangement for students at present existing is only nominal it is an arrangement for the housing of students only There is no corporate life no tutorial assistance either in hostels or messes The posts of superintendents are almost a sinecure They have hardly any other duty than calling the rolls and remaining in their quarters after a certain hour of the night

HARLEY A H

- (a) The hostel should be directly under the supervision of the principal of the college and the superintendents should be appointed on his nomination by the governing body of a private college or by the director in a Government college The University's interest in the hostel would be represented by the University inspector of hostels and messes and possibly by a member appointed by the University to the Visiting Committee of the hostel
- (b) (i) The superintendent would be responsible under the general supervision of the principal for the administration of the hostel He would make the admissions impose punishments grant leave from the hostel at his own discretion and make special supervision of the kitchen and out houses and sanitary arrangements He would bring any grave case to the notice of the principal in whose hands would be the power of expulsion for serious misdemeanour
- (ii) As regards messes it is desirable that however small they should not be placed under the control of a senior member of the mess but that they should be in charge of a member of the teaching staff of the institution to which the mess is attached or of another academical institution and he should reside on the premises
- (iii) For the supervision of messes there should be a mess committee appointed by the University to inspect them in conjunction with the University inspector of messes and hostels
- (c) The superintendents should be resident in the hostel and should be accessible to the boarders at all reasonable hour They should make frequent inspections

HARLEY, A. H.—*contd.*

of the living rooms and make the close personal acquaintance of every boarder. The superintendent should be a member of the Visiting Committee, which should comprise about six of the prominent members of the community, whose duties should be of an advisory nature in the administration of the hotel.

In both Madrassah hostels the boarders cater for themselves and in view of the consensus of opinion on their part being favourable to the existing arrangement, it was decided not to interfere with it. The alternatives are the messing arrangements to be in the hands of the authorities and a fixed rate charged from all, and the messing to be placed in the hands of an outside contractor, an arrangement which the Muhammadan student of the Canning College, Lucknow, have adopted.

In our hostels however, the boarders mainly object that they can secure cheaper messing arrangements than the authorities of the hotels. Provided the superintendent is satisfied with the condition in which they eat and that the quality of food is wholesome, I do not consider that the present arrangement need be changed.

(d) (i) In a Muhammadan hostel it is necessary that a prayer-room should be provided. Inasmuch as there is no provision for religious instruction in schools and college there is a strong body of opinion in favour of insisting that all Muhammadan students in residence should observe together one of the five prayer times obligatory on Muslims. It is not essential that an elaborate prayer room should be constructed, but an extensive covered place should be reserved for the purpose.

(ii) So long as the messing arrangements are left to the boarders themselves it is sufficient to provide in the kitchen two fireplaces for each mess of twenty to thirty boarders and stores accommodation. Dining common, and living rooms require only the provision of the bare necessities. As the boarders make their own messing arrangements it is advisable they should have the management of the arrangements in the dining-room and kitchen, under of course the supervision of the superintendent.

As it is usually difficult to obtain admission for boarders in to the hospital and as cases have occasionally to be kept under observation, it is necessary to have separate accommodation for sick cases. Usually the friends of the sick boarder are anxious to attend and help, but it is essential that a hostel servant should be in attendance.

The servants provided by the authorities in hostels for all purposes, except those connected with cooking and messing should be —per fifty students, three and a half farrashes, one-half sick-room attendant, and two sweepers, and, for fifty to two hundred students one chaprasi.

The boarders should provide at their own expense for the common room, daily papers and journals approved by the authorities. For this purpose a charge of one rupee per annum might be made. Books could be supplied from the college library.

(e) The recommendation of the recent Presidency College Committee appointed by Government commends itself as the most satisfactory, *viz.*, that not exceeding fifty boarders should be assigned to one superintendent. It seems desirable that the boarders should be accommodated in blocks, fifty to a block, and, as far as possible, of the same college year.

For schools the dormitory and study-room system is better than a system of four-seated rooms which serve as living and study-rooms.

(f) It is desirable that the superintendents should prove as helpful as possible to the boarders in their charge and that they should encourage visits of members of the teaching staff, but tutorial assistance in hostel or in mess should not be insisted upon. The student has enough tutorial aid by day and requires time for preparation and quiet reading.

HAZRA JOGENDRA NATH—HOLLAND Rev W E S

HAZRA JOGENDRA NATH

Students who do not live with their natural guardians or who do not depend upon charity or private tuition should be induced to join a hostel

Students sometimes find it less expensive to board with an unrelated guardian or in a private mess. But this should not be allowed except under very special circumstances. To induce a large number of students to join a hostel no rent should be charged. If this be not feasible the seat rent should be as light as possible. Where a hostel or hostels cannot accommodate all the students who come to join attached messes it could be allowed

- (a) Collegiate hostels and attached messes should be licensed by the University and inspected annually by the inspector of colleges the principal of a college should have complete control over its management

Each college should make rules for its own residential arrangements and for the enforcement of hostel discipline subject to the general rules made by the University

- (b) The superintendent of a hostel should be a member of the staff and must reside in the hostel. To secure a better class of superintendents they must have family quarters in the hostel compound. It is better to select one who has got light work in the college. The superintendent should be given an allowance in consideration of the number of boarders and his salary in the college. If he is allowed family quarters that fact should be taken into account in fixing the allowance. If the number of boarders be large there should be an assistant superintendent or there should be prefects to watch over a number of boarders

- (c) Students should manage their own messing. For this there should be a mess committee appointed by the boarders and two of its members appointed every month to supervise the purchase cooking and serving of food. In this they may be if found necessary helped by a messing clerk who should keep accounts. The superintendents should supervise students health study and the kitchen arrangements and should be held responsible for the discipline of the hostel. The hostel should be inspected regularly by the principal and other visitors appointed for the purpose

- (d) Furniture such as bedsteads tables stools and chairs should be provided for students. The dining hall and the kitchen should be sufficiently large for all the boarders and the space round them should be scrupulously clean

There should be an infirmary for sick boarders at a sufficient distance from the main building of the hostel. A boarder when ill may be taken to it

There should also be provision for adequate medical attendance

There should be a common room attached to each hostel with a modest collection of books. Boarders should be encouraged to meet together at intervals in the common room and hold discussions on current topics

- (e) A hostel should not be unduly large. One hostel for 50 boarders is the best arrangement. But where this is not feasible a hostel should be divided into wards with separate kitchens and separate sanitary conveniences

- (f) It is desirable to provide suitable tutorial assistance. This will no doubt make hostel life more attractive

Hostels should be so regulated that boarders may derive most of the advantages of reading in a residential college

HOLLAND Rev W E S

- (a) The careful inspection of hostels should be part of the duty of university inspectors when visiting colleges. All hostels should be under the direct supervision of member of the college staff

HOLLAND, Rev. W. F. S. -- *contd.* HOLMES, Rev. W. H. G.

- (b) The warden should reside in the hostel or in an attached house. He should visit the students in their rooms in the evening. He should visit and see to the proper care of all work. He should deal with all applications for leave, other than absence for the whole night. He should be in charge of the discipline concerned with roll calls and the rest. He should be the friend and guide of all his students.
- (c) Prefects responsible to the warden should be used as widely as possible in the management and responsibility of hostel discipline. Prefects will have much more real and effective authority if they have been elected by the student themselves. Only election will lead to discipline unless the greatest punishment to bring home to the student the seriousness of the responsibility with which they are being entrusted.
- (d) Our experience in Calcutta has shown that Hindus of all castes can dine in a common hall. Another dining hall will be enough for Christian, Muhammadan, Buddhist, Brahmin, and strict Hindus. Each of the two halls must have its own kitchen. The students are left to manage their own messes. A sick-room with lavatory attached is needed in each hostel. Also a comfortable common room, well supplied with magazine and games. College libraries should be accessible.
- (e) See my answer to question 18.
- (f) The tutorial system, though feasible in a non-residential college, is, obviously, yet more easy in a residential college.
- Apart from return for outlay on buildings and supervision, a Rs. 3 fee will cover all expenses in the way of servant, repairs, light, and water.

HOLMES, Rev. W. H. G.

Messes and lodgings should be abolished. I am using the word 'mess' as signifying a body of students who jointly rent a house, or part of a house on their own responsibility and make arrangements themselves for food and service. The time and anxiety occupied in the management of servants and food adds to the already more than sufficient burden of the students. The nomination of a senior student, or a graduate, as "superintendent" of the mess in no way lessens the objection to the mess system for he has neither the time, nor the authority, really to 'superintend'.

- (a) There ought to be no distinction between a 'hostel' and an 'attached mess' in other words, 'attached messes' ought to be organised, managed, and supervised in the same way as hostels.

Hostels should be college hostels normally, and should be entirely under the control and management of the college authorities. Under the circumstances, however, of the University of Calcutta, in which the hostel system was begun by private, non-collegiate, and non-university effort, non-collegiate hostels should be permitted, if approved and licensed by the University.

- (b) He must be a person of real standing and must have full charge of the discipline of the hostel. The only appeal from his authority should be in really grave matters, such as the case of expulsion from the hostel, when the appeal should be to the principal of the college.
- (c) Once have really efficient superintendents of standing and authority and questions of methods of management and control answer themselves. As regards inspection, in the case of college hostels, the principal of the college ought to be trusted to see that his hostels are being properly managed, and no university inspection should be necessary. In the case of hostels provided by private and non-collegiate enterprise, such as those of the Oxford University Mission or Young Men's Christian Association, the University might be responsible for whatever inspection is deemed advisable.

HOLMES Rev W H G—*contd*—HUNTER M

- (d) One kitchen two dining rooms a room isolated and suitable for sick cases and a small library (the main library should be in the college) The students normally should live in small rooms each adapted for one occupant only

In this hostel one dining room suffices and the superintendent and students (Hindu and Christian) all dine together in Indian style

- (e) Hostels should not have more than 40 students

- (f) It is most desirable that the superintendent of the hostel and his assistant (if he have one) should be on the staff of the college and should assist tutorially the students of the hostel

NOTE—During the last few years Government has given large financial aid to the building of hostels and supply of suitable houses in Calcutta. The principal object, however, is efficient provision to the main groups and more pressing need namely the provision of efficient provision of adequate standing to supervise the hostels, etc. Merely to erect a building and put it in it is comparatively useless. It is essential that the control of management should be of much higher kind than that which is obtained in many of the hostels provided. It is necessary to be carefully selected by persons who are so much so that the hostel is not only a real personality with its own life but also be in a position to be able to do it off in the best way possible. This consideration of the essential need of heads of hostels of standing enough to command reverence and obedience has been largely lost sight of. A well constructed hostel may be dangerous morally and politically.

HUNTER M

Hostels should be arranged in separate buildings or houses each containing not more than 60 students probably 50 would be an ideal number for a hostel but the question of cost then becomes very serious and in many cases prohibitive. Each hostel should be provided either with single rooms not less than 12 feet by 10 feet the longer side opening on to a verandah or to the outer air so as to secure good ventilation or there should be rooms at least 24 feet by 20 feet to accommodate four students. Single rooms are in many respects the best as they secure quiet and privacy but it is not always easy to obtain suitable ventilation for them while in large rooms the question of ventilation is simple. Further the habits of the students have to be considered for example I find that many Burman students prefer to be three or four in a large room rather than to be alone in a small one as it approximates more to their home conditions.

I am strongly in favour of having a professor of some standing in charge of each hostel and in colleges with a number of European professors some should be given charge of hostels. Such superintendents should be provided with comfortable and roomy quarters not overlooked by the students and with separate entrance and staircases. There should also be an assistant superintendent to look after the details of messing etc where as in Burma the messing is provided out of the hostel funds and all the students live as regards messing in European fashion using tables knives forks etc.

The superintendent should have control of the general discipline of the hostel and should not have to refer to the principal except in extreme cases. Each hostel should be inspected from time to time by the principal (I find in my own hostels that visits during the working hours after dinner are much appreciated by the student who will ask questions and talk more freely than under other conditions) and the accounts should be checked monthly by the principal or the bursar if such an officer is entertained.

The most important feature in a hostel will always be its sanitary arrangements—a feature to which in the past very little attention has been paid. The custom of having the main latrines and bathing sheds in a building outside the hostel so that they cannot be used at night and placing so called night latrines inside the hostel in any corner convenient or otherwise is most unsanitary and much to be deprecated. On each floor of each block of a hostel there should be complete sanitary arrangements the best method is to have at the back of each block a gallery or colonnade on each floor leading to the bathrooms and latrines which should be 30 feet or more from the main building. The sanitary fittings should be of the most modern type and wherever possible there should be the water system of removal. The bathing shed should be divided into compartments

HUNTER, M *contd*—HUNTER, MARK—HUQUE, M AZIZUL—HUQUE, KAZI IMDADUL.

or cubicles, each with a tap and shower bath, there should be no long water-troughs as is now the custom in most hostels, but each student should be able to bathe in privacy and so clean himself properly.

As regards hospital accommodation there should be a separate hospital in institutions where there are more than two hundred students, in other cases, one room with the necessary sanitary fittings in close connection, should be set aside as a sick room for use when required. My own experience at Rangoon is that there are very few sick students; out of an average of 180 boarders it is very rare to find as many as three really ill at one and the same time, and the sick room (there is no hospital) is often empty for weeks on end.

I have had no experience of messes, as there is nothing of the kind in Rangoon.

The University might have power through its inspectors to see that hostels are properly equipped, but the main control must always lie with the principal of the college to which the hostel is attached, and he alone should decide whether a student should remain in a hostel, for instance, the present rule of the Calcutta University (paragraph 11 of chapter XXIV) that a student may not be removed from a hostel without being removed also from the college is quite uncalled for, as a student may have manners and habits which unsuit him for living in a hostel while in no sense disqualifying him from attending a college as a day student.

HUNTER, MARK.

No doubt, the Commission, if it visits Madras, will inquire into the working of the hostel system in this University. It is, on the whole, I think, satisfactory and promising. The majority of affiliated colleges have hostels attached to them. Some of these hostels may be considered distinctly good, all are useful. College hostels, as constituent parts of the colleges to which they belong, are under university control. They are required to submit annual returns, and are carefully inspected when the colleges are inspected. They are generally under the supervision of a warden, who is a member of the college staff, and resides in or near the hostel. Many of them have some sort of reading-room and library, as also provision for games, but, as most hostels are close to the college buildings, often in the college grounds, such provision is merely supplementary to the facilities in these matters provided by the college itself.

HUQUE, M AZIZUL

Though the University now obliges the colleges to provide residential accommodation, it is practically a nullity in so far as it does not effectively make any such provision. The messing system is a huge failure and produces effects almost opposite to what the intentions of the framers of the regulations were. When it is remembered that these messes were, or are, mostly started by the students themselves—who perhaps after vain search find out some marginal house—a course which is almost always condoned by the college authorities—and these messes then go out with their sanction and their name, I venture to submit that, considering the number of students living in the messes, some radical reforms are urgently needed.

HUQUE, KAZI IMDADUL

(a) Hostels and 'attached messes' should be directly under the respective colleges, and supervised and subsidised (where necessary) by the University.

(b) The superintendent will be responsible for the general conduct of the students in daily life. He will be a guardian to them, seeing to the regularity of their habits, supervising their food, games, and studies. None but a senior teacher should be the superintendent. He will have family quarters in the hostel compound.

HUQUE KAZI IMDADUL—*contd*—IRFAN MAULVI MOHAMMAD—JALIL ABDUL

(c) The management will be in the hands of a committee of students elected from time to time under the control of the superintendent and under the inspection of both the college and university authorities

(d) Each student should be provided with a bedstead a table a chair a book shelf a small cupboard a clothes horse and a light (to be shared by several)

Kitchen—There should be all the necessary utensils plates cups etc

Dining room—Tables and benches should be provided

Treatment of illness—There should be a separate room or building to be used as a sick room with the necessary furniture There should be a separate room for attendants Students will nurse the patients themselves forming batches for the purpose There should be provision for daily medical attendance Medicine ought to be purchased at cost price by the students from a dispensary attached to the college or school

Library—Each hostel ought to be supplied with a set of books from the college library for a certain length of time which is to be replaced by another set after the expiry of that time The library will be in charge of a committee of students to be elected by them from time to time There ought also to be a common room where selected periodicals and newspapers will be kept A register will be kept showing the extent to which books are taken out and read The superintendent will often examine the register and supervise the study of the students

(e) A hostel ought not to be for more than 50 boys under one superintendent A space of not less than 100 square feet should be allowed to each student The building need not be of a costly type Corrugated iron roofing should be avoided Tile or thatch will be better Even mat walls should not be objected to The plinth ought always to be *pucca*

(f) Tutorial assistance does not seem to be necessary in college hostels Small tutorial classes ought however to be provided for in colleges where students may get individual assistance In hostels independent work ought to be encouraged

IRFAN, MAULVI MOHAMMAD

It is very useful for students that residential arrangements should be made for them in hostels not messes and lodgings Students living under strictly recognised guardians may be allowed to live outside the hostel —

(i) These institutions should be placed under the control of the principals of the colleges and under the immediate supervision of the resident superintendents who will be professors of the colleges These institutions should not be under the control of the University

(ii) The officers connected with the hostels should be men of character whose association may have a good effect upon the boarders—religious social and moral In appointing superintendents the question of the races should be taken into consideration by the authorities The duty of the superintendents should be to look after the physical religious and moral training of the boarders

JALIL, ABDUL

In spite of the fact that life in a hostel is comparatively more expensive—and the question of expense is a serious one to Indian parents and sometimes to their detaining their sons and relatives reluctantly at home—in spite of this the hostels are more in demand at present In every scheme of organisation of residential arrangements therefore particular attention should be given to make such arrangements as cheap as possible and provision made for a maximum of contact outside the class room between the students and their professors

JALIL, ABDUL—*contd*

The residential arrangements may be divided into two heads, *viz* :—

- (i) The hostels maintained by the colleges, and managed by them
- (ii) Private lodgings, maintained by private individuals.

I would first deal with (ii)

Such lodgings should be required :—

- (A) To be as near the college or the University as possible.
- (B) To be situated in healthy quarters and have good sanitary arrangements
- (C) They should be inspected by a college or university authority, appointed in this behalf, and should be disaffiliated in case of unsatisfactory arrangements, always provided that the person or persons in charge have persisted in refusing to remove any drawbacks clearly pointed out to them.
- (D) If necessary, they should be required to allow a college professor to reside there under conditions determined by the college or university authority

In the case of (i) I would propose the following suggestions —

- (1) As far as possible, all the hostels should be situated close to the college and close to each other
- (2) In case of institutions wholly or mainly residential, each of the separate parts of a hostel should have its assistant tutor or superintendent and a tutor and provision made for their residence close to the hostel
- (3) The tutors and assistant tutors or the superintendent should have nothing to do with the messing arrangements of the students—all the messes being under a separate whole-time officer
- (4) In case of colleges partly residential, the separate hostels should have one superintendent each, who will maintain discipline and supervise arrangements for messing
- (5) The hostels built out of the funds contributed by Government, communal bodies, or private individuals should be directly under the principal of the college to which they are attached. The University should have the same control over, and relations with, it as with the college to which they are attached
- (6) The superintendent should be a member of the college staff. He should be responsible to the principal for the general behaviour and welfare of the students and the discipline in the hostel. He must be *ex officio* president of societies or clubs in the hostels, and should supervise the performance of religious duties, studies, and physical exercises

As a remuneration for hostel work he should be allowed Rs 100—200 per mensem, and the status of a professor.

- (7) The superintendent, in consultation with, and under the advice of, the principal, will make the necessary rules and see to their observance in the hostel. The hostels should be inspected at least six times during a session by the principal or another officer appointed by him. The superintendent should select monitors, from the senior students, to help him in the control of the hostel and the management of the kitchens and dining hall.

- (8) A self-contained hostel should contain :—

- (i) Kitchen (in the case of Muslim or such students as can avail themselves of a common dining-hall) or kitchens (in the case of students observing the caste system).
- (ii) Dining-hall, only where the residents have no caste hindrances
- (iii) Common rooms, for newspapers, indoor games, and debating club.
- (iv) Prayer room
- (v) A set of rooms for the sick, apart from the hostel
- (vi) A small library, attached to the debating club.

(When two or more hostels are situated near together they may share some of the requirements noted above)

- (vii) Bath-room, latrines, and quarters for bearers and kitchen servants.

JALIL ABDUL—*contd*—JONES T CUTHBERTSON

- (9) A hostel should have seats for about 70 students
- (10) The tutorial assistance is very desirable but the system of training and examinations requires to be greatly modified before that assistance can be of much use to the students

JONES T CUTHBERTSON

- (a) Hostels and attached messes should be under the direct control of colleges subject to the University regulations in this behalf
- (b) I have found it the best plan to appoint a senior European professor as warden of the hostels with a residence situated close at hand and to make him subject to the principal responsible for the maintenance of order and discipline as well as for the comfort and well being of the boarders. If possible this post should be given to a whole time European officer or if this is not possible to a senior European professor because an European officer is less likely to come under caste or sectarian influence and is more able to hold the balance evenly between conflicting parties. His status in the college should be at least as high as that of any other professor
- (c) Subject to the principal the management and control of the hostels should be under the warden. But where the college is a residential one as in Agra or Aligarh and where the majority of the students resides in hostels quarters should also be assigned to European or Indian professors in the larger hostels for the control of which under the general supervision of the warden they should be responsible. In addition to free quarters such professors who would have to be unmarried should receive special allowances in addition to the pay of their substantive posts. In each house monitors should be appointed to call the roll at night and be responsible under the resident professor for discipline and control. Monitors should be made to understand the serious and responsible nature of their duties and those of them giving evidence of tact discretion and zeal should be suitably rewarded. I have also found it desirable that the hostels should be thoroughly inspected once a week by the principal or in his absence by one of the senior professors on which occasion all the boarders are lined up for inspection in their college head dress outside their houses proceeding afterwards to their rooms which are all visited by the inspecting officer when any complaint or irregularities are noted and entered in the Inspection Book. In order not to stifle originality and to make life as happy and comfortable as possible for each individual student consistently with discipline and good order I permit each boarder to make out his own time table which after approval and countersignature by the warden he is required to place in a conspicuous position in his room and to observe. Discipline I find is best enforced by the infliction of fines by the warden and sub wardens serious offences being punishable by rustication expulsion or dismissal from the hostel at the discretion of the principal. I allow boarders and messes to provide their own servants reserving the right to expel any unsatisfactory servant from the hostels
- (d) Students should have separate rooms at least 10 feet by 10 feet provided with a bed a table a chair hooks on the walls for clothes and recesses for book shelves. If the verandah is wide so much the better as this will serve the purpose of a sitting room. There should be a through draught between door and windows and plenty of light and ventilation. Kitchens and latrines should be situated outside and to the rear of the hostel. Kitchens need not be elaborate or expensive but should have good tiled roofs. Latrines of the Crawly pattern made at Cawnpore are cheap and satisfactory. They need a brick or concrete platform. Bath rooms should be situated in the hostel as it is too cold to bathe outside in winter in many parts of India. Water should be laid on to the bath rooms and in dry climates like Agra or Delhi the water used in bath rooms

JONLS, T. CUTHBERTSON *contd.*—KADIR, A F M ABDUL

can be employed with advantage to irrigate tennis courts, gardens, etc., near the hostels

If electric light is not available in the hostels great care must be taken to ensure the provision of good lamps, as students are apt to injure their eyesight by using bad lamps, or even *charags* to read by. Hindus will generally eat their food in their kitchens, and dining-rooms for them are seldom necessary.

Muhammadans might dine in the hall, as at Aligarh, in the presence of the European staff. I see no particular advantage in this unless they are taught table manners and how to eat with knives and forks instead of with their fingers. It should also be remembered that Indian educational work is very tiring and exacting and, personally, I think a professor in this country must be allowed to eat his meals in peace and quietness if he is to retain his efficiency. At the Agra College, where the students are mostly Hindus, I find that much the best arrangement is to permit the students to form their own messes and provide their own cooks and food, giving them only kitchens and cooking utensils. In my own hostels the students have a co-operative society for the purchase of food and are enabled thereby to buy good food at less than the ordinary market rate. Every college should have a resident assistant surgeon, a dispensary, and a small hospital for serious, but non-infectious, cases. A competent assistant surgeon can be engaged in the mofussil for free quarters and about Rs 40 to 50 per mensem. He should attend to ordinary cases and dispense simple medicines. The Civil Surgeon should be retained for serious cases and his advice should be taken regarding the purchase of a stock of necessary medicines, which may cost about Rs. 1,000 or Rs 1,500 per annum.

Every hostel should have a reading or common room, provided with chairs and tables and supplied with suitable newspapers and magazines. A separate hostel library is not necessary when the college buildings are close at hand and students are permitted to take out books from the college library. When funds are limited, and the number in the hostel or hostels is large, it will be necessary to charge small monthly fees of from 4 annas to 8 annas for water, medical attendance, lighting, and reading-room, in addition to the regular monthly fee for lodging.

- (e) A hostel should not contain more than 60 rooms with accommodation for 60 students, a common room, superintendent's quarters and bath-rooms inside the building. In the mofussil a hostel of this description, built of brick, would cost from Rs 65,000 to Rs 70,000 before the war. Few colleges can afford resident superintendents for smaller hostels than this, and larger ones tend to become unmanageable.
- (f) In my own college every student is assigned to a tutor, through whom alone applications are forwarded to the principal. These tutors, who are always members of the teaching staff, are expected to take a special interest in their wards, and to supervise their work generally. Every tutor forms cricket, hockey, and football elevens and tennis pairs from among the students committed to his care, and these play matches with the teams of other tutors on the "American tournament system", the winning side receiving medals. I find this works better than the 'house match system' when, as at Agra, hostels are of very different sizes, some large and others quite small. I do not consider separate tutorial assistance necessary in the hostels. It is apt to weary the professor and bore the student, and is very likely to be 'scamped'.

KADIR, A. F. M. ABDUL.

I have lived at Calcutta, and at Lahore, as a boarder in Government hostels, I was also a student at the M. A. O. College, Aligarh, for seven years, during which time I worked for two years as an assistant tutor at a boarding-house. I am thus

KABIR A. F. M. ABDUL—*contd.*—KUNDU PURNACHANDRA—JAHIRI GOPAL CHANDRA

led to think from my own experience that the conditions that obtain at Aligarh are healthier and more instructive than elsewhere. The boarding house tutor at Aligarh is not merely a game superintendent nor a mere kitchen supervisor. Rather he lives and moves with the students and has his being with them. I should have dealt with this point more elaborately but as one of the Commissioners is Dr. Ziauddin Ahmed, the senior tutor of the M. A. O. College Aligarh, I think it is unnecessary. But at the same time I may be allowed to suggest that a visit to the Aligarh College by some members of the Commission and study of the situation at first hand may be productive of good results. As a general hint on this point I may say that the appointment of tutors and assistant tutors who may be able to live with the students will be a sufficient advance in this line.

KUNDU PURNACHANDRA

Regarding residential arrangements for students it is desirable that most if not all of them should live in hostels attached to the college. The situation of these hostels must be very near the college itself. Hostel life should be made as attractive as possible so that all who can afford may in their own interests live there. The boarders will have the following advantages—

- (i) The college library should remain open in the morning and in the evening and the boarders on account of living near the college will have better facilities for using the library.
- (ii) They will have free medical advice.
- (iii) They will have single seated or at most double seated rooms which should be better for their health than if they lived in their homes.
- (iv) They will have greater facilities for participating in games and other amusements such as picnics, river trips, etc. and for attending occasional lectures by teachers on interesting subjects.

The number of hostels under each college should be increased gradually so that it may be adequate to the demand. I do not wish that there should be any difference between a hostel and an attached mess, both should be located near the college, have the same facilities and be under the supervision of a teacher who should have family quarters within the premises. Each hostel should contain not more than 50 students under one superintendent. Regarding the management, control and equipment of hostels, the rules that have been laid down in the regulations (Chapter XXIV) are quite sufficient. Although tutorial assistance is desirable it is not financially practicable.

LALJI, GOPAL CHANDRA

The colleges and attachments of city life and localities should be removed from the tumult and temptations of city life and localities. The professors should also be provided with quarters near them. It should be however in easy communication with the city so that professors and students may avail themselves of the educational resources of the city and students living with their parents in the city may easily attend their colleges and take part in games. There should be no messes independent of the control of professors or teachers. The condition that students should live only in attached hostels may prove hard in the case of many students who are now maintained by private charity or by their relatives. To mitigate this hardship Government should bear in the case of Government and aided institutions and private proprietors in the case of private institutions the cost of maintaining the hostel establishments.

The University need not have any direct control over the hostels. The university professors spoken of above who should be university inspectors also should inspect the hostels and submit reports to the University which should oblige the college authorities to mend the defects pointed out in the reports.

The superintendent of a hostel should be a person of such character and qualification as can command respect from the students. He should look to their general comfort, health, meals, and school diet. He should also look to the neatness, cleanliness, and hygienic arrangement of the hostel. It should also be his duty to collect the hostel charges and keep account. He should be in charge of the hostel stores, and appoint students to do the necessary work in rotation.

For every hostel, if the college library be not within easy reach of the students, there should be a library of reference books and books of information and innocent leisure time studies. Every hostel should have its own athletic club in addition to the college gymnasium.

The kitchen should be supervised by the superintendent, and the articles of food examined by a resident doctor. Caste prejudice should be maintained in the dining-room arrangements. Sometimes students disregard their duty out of a false spirit of liberalism or moral timidity. But, as they cannot show the same spirit when they return to their families and societies, it is nothing short of hypocrisy, which is subversive of moral principles.

In each hostel there should be segregation rooms, where sick members should be removed for treatment and nursed by their fellows.

There should be a medical store, under a resident physician, helped by a competent compounder, for all the hostels of the congregated colleges, each of which should bear its own share of cost necessary for the maintenance of the establishment, the students paying for the medicines they consume.

There should not be more than a hundred members under the same superintendent.

LAHIRY, RANJOIT CHANDRA

The best residential arrangement would be to keep students in the family of their teachers as was done in ancient *Brahmacharya Asram*. In the present state of Indian society this arrangement seems almost impracticable. But still an attempt should be made to keep the teachers with their family in touch with the students.

Hostels and attached messes should be under the direct control of their respective colleges. The number of boarders should be such as can be easily looked after by a professor, and 50 may be the maximum. The University will only see that the general rules are followed, and the University should be the final authority in disciplinary measures.

The main function of the superintendent should be to act as a medium between the guardians and parents, and the college and University authorities on the one hand, and the students on the other. Any misconduct or impropriety on the part of the students should be reported by the superintendent to the college and university authorities, as well as to the guardians and parents.

Messing should be left to the boarders who would, in turn, arrange for their meals, including tiffin. The sweets sold by vendors in Calcutta are injurious to the health of the boarders. Facilities should be given to the boarders to arrange for their tiffin in the hostel or mess.

Tutorial assistance should be provided, and there should be provision for the treatment of illness, and library facilities should be given.

Kitchen and dining-room arrangements should be left to the boarders. No boarder should be allowed to ignore caste restrictions without the permission of his guardian.

There should be an independent body of visitors for inspection.

LANGLEY, G. H

- (a) Where the University consists of a group of colleges, hostels should be under the control of the college authorities and where the University is without colleges they should be controlled by the University.
- (e) About one hundred students.

LANGLEY G H—*contd*—MAHALANOBIS PRASANTA CHANDRA—MAHTAB The Hon ble Sir BIJAY CHAND

- (f) Tutorial assistance should be provided by the college or by the University but not through the hostels. In the case of honours students it is desirable to unite those studying in different departments in one hostel. A group of students of this kind would necessarily be assigned to a great many tutors who could not be attached to a single hostel.

MAHALANOBIS, PRASANTA CHANDRA

The hostels should preferably be split up into small sections otherwise hostel life is too apt to degenerate into a monotonous barrack-room like existence. Where a large building is in existence arrangements should be made for breaking it up into smaller social units.

- (a) Hostels and messes etc. should be under the general control of the University but it is not desirable that very strict rules should be enforced. Such strict rules are difficult to administer and lead to general friction all round. The socio-political unrest is more aggravated than otherwise by irksome regulations. In fact it is futile to hope to fight effectively the unrest among the students by the strict administration of external regulations.

The hostels should not as a rule be restricted to students from a single college.

- (b) It is necessary to ensure that the superintendent be not looked upon as an official solely for the performance of police duty. Unfortunately a general feeling of this kind is undoubtedly prevalent among the different student communities of Calcutta.

- (c) The management in the case of small units should be in the hands of an elected committee of the boarders themselves. The superintendent may be the *ex officio* head of this committee but every attempt should be made to develop the spirit of co-operation and a sense of responsibility for the whole house in the minds of the students themselves.

In the case of large hostels a separate administrative staff will be necessary.

- (d) In every house attempts should be made to provide a certain amount of social life and a common room with a small library seem essential elements. The boarders should be allowed a good deal of discrimination in the matter of equipment. There is a tendency at present to indirectly encourage the hostel students to live above their means by laying undue emphasis on the external fittings etc.

- (e) The smaller houses would probably be best suited to our requirements. But the provision of large hostels is also necessary.

In a small house the average numbers should be something between 20 and 30. Growth of social life would be hampered if the numbers are much larger than this.

The great need at the present time seems to be adequate housing provision. The desirable policy to adopt would seem to be the erection of a large number of small houses which would be permanently available for occupation by the students. In fact this would amount to providing suitable permanent houses for the formation of the mess units. Probably in most cases such messes would be quite stable in character and the mess committee would also be fairly permanent.

- (f) For tutorial assistance there does not seem to be any urgent demand at present.

MAHTAB The Hon ble Sir BIJAY CHAND

vide my answer to question 17

- (a) The hostels and messes should be a part of the colleges and the colleges in their turn an integral part of the University.
- (b) The superintendent should always be chosen from among the teachers of the college. One or more may be appointed according as it may be necessary for the efficient management and control of the messes—regard being had to the number of its

MAHTAB, The Hon ble Sir BIJAY CHAND contd —MAITRA, GOPAL CHANDRA

boarders He shall look to the discipline and comforts of the boarders and shall act under the guidance of the principal

- (c) Each mess should be divided into a convenient number of wards, and in each ward there should be a monitor chosen from among the senior boarders The duties of a monitor should be to keep an attendance register and to report every case of misconduct or breach of discipline to the superintendent The superintendent should make an enquiry into the report of the monitors and should submit a note to the principal for final decision All questions regarding the mess and its management and discipline should be settled by a council of teachers, consisting of five teachers, of whom the superintendent shall be one, and the principal shall be the president It shall be the duty of the members of this council to inspect the messes from time to time Any complaint by a boarder regarding food and sanitation of the mess should be made through the monitor of his ward either to the superintendent or principal and the principal, in consultation with his council, may vest such powers in the superintendent as may be considered necessary to maintain his dignity and for facility of management
- (d) I have already made some suggestions on this point in my answer to question 17 There should be one kitchen spacious enough to give facilities of separate cooking for strict vegetarians and the dining rooms should be so arranged as to regard, as much as possible the restrictions of each particular caste There should also be a hospital segregated as far as possible from the residential quarters and kitchen, where any boarder suffering from any contagious disease or chronic complaints must be removed The patients should bear the cost of medicines supplied to them, but the diet should be given from the mess A qualified medical practitioner should be appointed on a fixed salary who must come to the mess at least twice a day to attend to cases of illness He should also see that the mess is kept in a perfectly sanitary order and should report to the principal all conditions which may appear to him detrimental to the health of the inmates If several colleges are grouped together in the same locality it would be better to have one common hospital for all these at a safe distance and the mess attached to each college may be asked to contribute proportionately for its maintenance and upkeep Messes attached to the colleges need not have a separate library arrangement, but the college libraries should be accessible to the boarders at certain hours There should be a covered bath, a common latrine, and urinal for each mess The two latter should be built apart and must be constantly flushed and regularly disinfected whenever possible All structures should be built according to the latest sanitary principles and care should be taken to keep them scrupulously clean.
- (e) I think no hard and fast rule can be laid down in this respect The size must depend upon the number of boarders in each case
- (f) It is not necessary to make any special provision for this, except as suggested in my answer to question 17

MAITRA, GOPAL CHANDRA

- (a) The University should lay down, as now, the general rules about discipline, adequate supervision, medical inspection, and attendance, but questions of internal management, including the admission of students and the appointment of the superintendent, should be left to the authorities of the college to which the hostels are attached
- (b) The status of the superintendent should be equal to that of a member of the teaching staff of the college He should, if possible, be a whole-time officer He should not only be able to command the respect of the boarders by his intellectual attainments but must also be a man of excellent character, who takes a real interest in the well-being of the students under his charge He may be assisted by a subordinate in keeping the accounts, or doing other routine work that he may think necessary to delegate, but the whole concern should be

MAITRA GOPAL CHANDRA—*contd* —MAITRA HERAMBACHANDRA—MAJUMDAR BIRAJ MOHAN

under his immediate management. His duty should consist not merely in maintaining discipline among the students but in looking after everything that contributes to their welfare. In the case of first year class students if not of all students of the intermediate stage the monthly allowances remitted by the boys' parents and guardians should be left in his charge. The superintendent should live among the students and share their meals.

- (c) The college council will settle the question of fees and indicate the general lines on which the hostel should be managed. Supplementary rules to suit the needs and circumstances of each should be made by the superintendent thereof, subject to the approval of the college council or the principal. The sole control should be vested in the superintendent and the principal will interfere with his decisions only in exceptional cases.

The messing arrangements should be settled in consultation with the students' representatives.

The hostel should be periodically inspected by the principal and a responsible officer of the University to see if the students are comfortable and if they live under proper discipline.

It should be visited by the medical attendant at least once every day.

- (d) *Proper equipment of a hostel* —

- (i) Well ventilated rooms of suitable size to serve as studies and sleeping rooms.
- (ii) A common room where the students may assemble during their leisure hours.
- (iii) Suitable sanitary arrangements.
- (iv) A kitchen and a dining room of sufficiently large size.
- (v) An infirmary for the treatment of sick boarders. There should be a separate infirmary (common to all the hostels of a college) for the treatment of students suffering from infectious or contagious diseases.
- (vi) Apparatus for physical exercise.

- (e) As it is of the utmost importance that there should be close personal relation between the superintendent and the boarders, no hostel should accommodate more than fifty students.

- (f) It is certainly desirable to provide tutorial assistance if funds permit.

MAITRA, HERAMBACHANDRA

- (a) The system of making students live together in large numbers in hostels is not an ideal one. An attempt should be made to establish or encourage the establishment of boarding houses for batches of not more than fifty under competent superintendents.

The University should not interfere in the internal administration of boarding houses, though it may lay down a few rules that colleges may be asked to enforce.

MAJUMDAR BIRAJ MOHAN

With regard to the present regulations relating to the residence of students it is desirable that they should be relaxed in the case of post graduate students preparing for the M. A. or the law examinations. Every one of them attains the age of twenty at least when he passes the B. A. examination. Consequently, there cannot be any legal guardian of such a person who has attained majority. Moreover, most of them are married and are heads of their own families. To enforce the regulations in such cases often leads to absurdities.

MAJUMDAR, PANCHANAN—MAJUMDER, NARENDRAKUMAR

MAJUMDAR PANCHANAN

Such organisation is not unsatisfactory. So far as the building goes it is often superior to many a student's home. I am inclined to think that too much stress is often laid on these matters and the type of building which is gradually being introduced is rather unsuitable to the requirements of the country and beyond its financial capacity. The style of living has a tendency to become luxurious and opposed to plain living and high thinking. I have heard of students on whom the style of living in Calcutta has produced injurious effects and who often do not reconcile themselves to the humble style of their home lives. What is wanted is not luxury, but plain living, in the midst of healthy surroundings, and the building need not be palatial but it should be considered quite suitable if it has sufficient accommodation and has provision for sufficient light and air.

- (a) The hostels and attached messes should be under the direct management of the college authorities, and they should conform to the regulations of the University, which should have the power of supervision over them and of controlling their arrangements.
- (b) and (c) The superintendent should be some professor of the college to which the hostel or mess is attached and he should be a gentleman of broad culture and sterling uprightness of character with a genuine love for the students. The superintendent must live among the boarders and should be the head of the boarding institution. He must have a large degree of freedom in the management of the institution subject to the control of the principal of the college. There should be a board of visitors consisting of some professors of the college and guardians of the students, who should visit the hostels and messes as often as possible, and their inspection notes shall be duly considered by the superintendent and the principal of the college and shall be given effect to whenever practicable.
- (d) Every hostel should have as many dining-rooms as the caste prejudices of the boarders may require, but the cooking may be done in one place. The kitchen and the dining-rooms must be neat and clean.

The condition of the kitchen in many a mess in Calcutta, is anything but desirable and stands in sad need of improvement.

There should be provision for a sick-room and treatment of illness and attendance upon the sick. The students themselves may be left to make their own arrangements about this. The hostel should have an appointed doctor to treat its boarders.

Library facilities may also be provided on a moderate scale and the boarders should have free access to the college libraries.

- (e) One hostel should not ordinarily contain more than 100 students or boarders and each room should not ordinarily contain more than two boarders.
- (f) Tutorial assistance may also be provided in the hostels if the charge does not thereby become prohibitive.

MAJUMDER, NARENDRAKUMAR

In hostels careful attention should be paid to a proper grouping of students. Students taking up the same, or similar, subjects should live in adjoining rooms.

The authorities ought to remember also that growing poverty stands in the way of expensive style in boarding arrangements.

MALLIK Dr D N—MITRA The Hon ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA Bahadur

MALLIK Dr D N

On the whole there should be much greater intercourse between professors and students living away from their parents than is now the case

- (a) There should be attached to the colleges the University having only the right of inspection
- (b) The superintendent should be *in loco parentis* to the students under his charge. The students should manage the hostel under his direction and should be encouraged to come to him in all their difficulties.
- (c) The superintendents should be in all cases professors of some standing
- (c) The hostel should be under the management of a committee of students under the supervision of the superintendent the principal of the college to which the hostel belongs having general control. It should be inspected by senior professors and the principal as well as by the members of the Residence Committee periodically
- (d) A large hostel is preferable to a small one provided it is arranged that no superintendent should have more than say 50 students under his direct supervision. In the case of larger numbers the superintendent must be assisted by wardens (as in the Hindu hostel where however wardens are senior professors not in residence) who may be junior professors in residence. The committee of management will then consist of students representatives the wardens and the superintendent. It will of course be under the general control of the principal
- (e) This is unnecessary but would be an improvement. If suitable wardens and superintendents are available the necessary internal assistance can be arranged for

MITRA, The Hon ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA Bahadur

I should suggest that teachers must be compelled to live in hostels along with students. Every school or college shall have a hostel attached to it and students who do not live under the direct control of and in the same house with their guardian should not be allowed to live in unrecognised messes or lodgings.

As for the students living in hostels the teachers should be their guardians in all matters. Each teacher must be given a definite number of students in his charge. There should be uniformity in the mode of living amongst the students. Natural guardians (parents etc.) should not send money to the students direct but to the teachers who should take all responsibilities. No luxurious living should be allowed in hostels. The superintendent should be the chief authority in hostels. If possible the head of the school or college should be the superintendent. He should be a resident in the hostel. He should be assisted by the other teachers and professors. Some teachers if not all must be residents of the hostel. The hostel should be as near as possible to the school or college so that separate arrangement for library etc. might be avoided.

There should be separate rooms for study. The kitchen and the dining rooms must be in a separate building within the compound. The dining rooms should be spacious. The resident teachers in the hostel should dine along with the students at the same time. A particular time should be fixed for each meal. Regularity should be observed in each case.

The playing grounds should be near to the hostels. Tutorial assistance should be given to students by the resident teachers. Club rooms should be set apart in each hostel for discussions. The resident teachers must attend those club rooms. Students should receive lessons on morality from the teachers. They should always be in touch with the teachers. They should not leave the hostels without the permission of the teachers. Qualified doctors must daily attend the hostels. Food supplied in the hostel should be examined by the doctors.

MOHANNAD Dr WALI—*contd*—MUKERJEE ADHAR CHANDRA—MUKERJEE Dr ADITYA NATH—MUKERJEE BIJOY GOPAL

We have once or twice tried the experiment of having attached messes but we found the experiment ended in complete failure. The growth of corporate university life is not possible without the creation of a university quarter where students live side by side with the teachers and lecture rooms overlook playing fields.

MUKERJEE, ADHAR CHANDRA

Hostels and messes should be placed under superintendents who should be men of high character able to influence the lives of the students by precept and example. Moral and religious teaching (not sectarian) should also be given to the students living in hostels and messes.

- (a) They should be under the supervision of the college and the University
 - (e) Hostels must be very small in size and must not on any account contain more than 30 or 40 students
 - (f) Tutorial assistance should be provided
- Money should be contributed by the State to a large extent

MUKERJEE Dr ADITYANATH

Hostels of the type which have been recently built for our students have many excellent features e.g. library facilities facilities for debate recreation and the growth of a healthy corporate life provision for the treatment of illness etc. But at the same time this mode of residence has certain drawbacks.

The cost of living presses very hard upon our poor students—and the majority of our students are poor—by introducing them to a standard of comfort which they neither desire nor are accustomed to and which many of them will not be able to keep up after they leave the University. The ancient traditions of India have always associated plain living with high thinking. Attempts to plant foreign institutions of the type of an Oxford or a Cambridge University do not sufficiently take into account the suitability of the soil on which they are sought to be transplanted. Hence I would leave students entirely free if they prefer it to make their own mess arrangements and to manage them as economically as they can. If this be allowed students of similar means would form themselves into small groups or units for the purpose.

Again in many of the hostels and messes the control exercised by the superintendent is very inadequate either because he is a subordinate officer of the college and as such cannot command sufficient respect and obedience from students committed to his charge or because the institution is too large to be controlled by a single officer.

Hence for purposes of better control and to create a living personal relation between the teachers and the pupils I would break up one big charge into smaller and manageable ones each under the control of a professor of the college. If the superintendent be an officer of the rank of a professor who meets his wards daily in the lecture rooms—and this is the case with a few hostels now—we need not be very particular as to how we define the functions and status of the superintendent for in such a case the superintendent will be treated with the utmost respect and even reverence and the relations between him and his wards will be paternal on the one side and filial on the other. Such a system would be in keeping with Indian traditions.

MUKERJEE BIJOY GOPAL

- (a) As the hostel of a college forms an integral part of it the University should exercise the same sort of control over it as it does over the other departments of the college.

MUKHERJEE, BHOJA GOPAL *contd* MUKHOPADHYAYA, Dr. SYAMADAS

- (b) The status of the superintendent of a hostel should in no way be inferior to that of a college professor. He should be able, both by his character and attainments, to command the respect of the young men whose well being is committed to his care. He should, as far as possible, share the actual life of the boarders, and try to mould their character not so much by precept, as by personal example. He should be able to maintain discipline in the hostel, and foster a spirit of reverence for law and order. In training young men one has to bear in mind that if undue leniency is harmful, undue severity is no less so, and the superintendent has to avoid both these extremes. The ideal hostel is one in which the boarders constitute a happy family under the care of the superintendent whom they may always look up to for advice and guidance in all matters relating to their moral and intellectual advancement. In order that the superintendent may properly exercise such wholesome control over the boarders it is essentially necessary that he should have free private quarters within the hostel compound, it is also desirable that his remuneration should be commensurate with the responsibility of the position he holds.
- (c) The hostel should be under the direct management of the superintendent, who should have an assistant to take charge of all routine work of minor importance. The superintendent should be responsible to the college governing body, the ultimate controlling authority being the University. The governing body should appoint a board of visitors, on which the guardians of the boys should be represented. Any suggestions made by the visitors for the improvement of the hostel should be duly considered by the governing body. Prefects should be appointed from among the senior students residing in the hostel, each prefect being put in charge of a ward. There should be a "mess committee" consisting of a certain number of boarders, with the superintendent as its president, and the medical officer in charge of the hostel as its vice-president. The principal and the other members of the Governing Body should regularly inspect the hostel, and there should be periodical inspections by the university inspector and the members of the Students' Residence Committee.
- (d) There may be one kitchen, but there should be separate dining-rooms for boarders of different castes whom social convention would not allow to dine together. There should be a competent medical officer to look after the health of the boarders. In cases of illness it should be optional with the patients to be treated by this medical officer, or by any licensed practitioner from outside. A room should be set apart for the sick, to which their relatives should have free access. There should be a "common room", as well as a visitors' room, attached to the hostel. Suitable arrangements should be made for physical exercise, and there should be a play-ground within the hostel compound or close to it. There may be a small library, if funds permit.
- (e) Each hostel should not accommodate more than sixty boarders. The rooms may be partitioned off, and one cubicle may be allotted to each boarder. Some economy may be effected if there be a number of hostels within the same compound for, in that case, there may be one common hospital, one common library, one 'common room,' and one medical officer for all of them.
- (f) As there are arrangements for tutorial assistance in the colleges themselves any further assistance of this kind does not seem to be necessary.

MUKHOPADHYAYA, Dr. SYAMADAS.

My experience of residential arrangements for students in Calcutta leads me to offer the following observations on their defects —

- (i) Too many students are often crowded into the same room.
- (ii) The superintendent is generally a man who has other full-time duties and has not the time, even if he has the capacity, to attend properly, to his very responsible

MUKHOPADHYAYA Dr SIAM DAS—*contd*—Murarichand College Sylhet—
NAIK K. G

duties as a superintendent. His remuneration is generally nominal and his position too subordinate. He fails generally to command the respect of the boarders.

- (iii) Young boys left practically without any guardians deeply interested in their welfare often become slack in their studies and sometimes take to evil companionship.
- (iv) The dietary is in general not sufficiently nourishing. All these defects can be remedied by a proper hostel organisation with resident tutors. But such an organisation is likely to be too expensive for Indian students and special aid from the University or other sources would be necessary for its maintenance.

Murarichand College Sylhet

- (a) Directly under the college authorities but subject to inspection by the University.
- (b) The superintendent should look after discipline, study, health, cleanliness, physical training and sports of the students (*in loco parentis*). The messing arrangements should be under the control of the students, each mess consisting of about twenty students. The superintendent should see that undue expenditure is not incurred and that the quality and quantity of the food be good and sufficient.
- (d) There ought to be one sick room and one segregation room for contagious and infectious diseases. There should be a small reference library. Senior students might be provided with single seated rooms.
- (e) Twenty boarders in each mess and two or three sub messes at most under each superintendent. Each superintendent with twenty students is the ideal (in such cases only free quarters and no monetary remuneration need be given to the superintendent who should be a member of the teaching staff of the college).

NAIK K. G

There should be as many hostels attached to a college as possible and the boys should be compelled to stay in them. The influence of a resident superintendent (professor) goes a great way in strengthening the character of a student. I lay particular stress on this matter from my experience as a hostel superintendent in Bombay (Wilson College) for three years and my intimate relation with the Science Hostel of the Krishnath College, Berhampur. The superintendent should have free quarters (family) and he should be paid for the tutorial work which he should be compelled to do. He should guide the students in the methods of studying the various subjects and direct them to the usefulness of their study so that much energy which is spent now a days may not go to waste. The boys when they come to college should be particularly guided in their course of study so that they may not have to repent in after life for the subjects selected by them. Besides this it should be one of the duties of the superintendent to create active college life in the hostels for really they are places where men are made. All this I am stating from my experience at Berhampur where the system has a larger number of evils than anywhere I know of. Superintendents should be men who take a lifelong interest in students, men who know self sacrifice and who prefer to remain students all their life. We do not want men who scarcely form an integral part of the corporate life of students. Such superintendents exist in some of the Government and private colleges. They are quite unfit for their profession for Bengal boys are more easily manageable by persuasion than by force.

- (a) University control should be more stringent especially in the execution of the existing rules which might be supplemented by others providing against the scandal due to underfeeding of boys in hostels as at Berhampur.
- (b) The superintendents should be more free than at some places (say Berhampur) in the internal management of their hostels. They should be guides of students in study and choice of discussions.

NATK, K. G. *contd* —NANDY, The Hon'ble Maharajah Sir MANINDRA CHANDRA—
NANJUNDAYYA, H. V.

- (d) Dispensaries should be attached to hostels. This is most necessary. But for our good laboratory assistant many accidents would have been fatal for want of prompt attendance and treatment. Some hostels, as at Berhampur, are quite lacking in library facilities. There should be a separate reading-room for the students and the superintendents should not monopolise the newspapers, for which the boys alone contribute money.
- (e) Hostels should be built in blocks, each accommodating 50 students, with one resident superintendent over them. The superintendent should have free family quarters. Each room should contain two students. They should be provided with tables, chairs, bedsteads, and, if possible, with light.
- (f) Certainly.

The finances should be arranged by Government grants from Imperial revenues. If each college can pay 50 per cent of the cost of a block Government should, without hesitation, grant the other 50 per cent. In any case, whatever the expenses may be, if we want the formation of a healthy nation who will stick loyally to the old mother England, Government should spend more money here than elsewhere, for hostels can give us centres of regulating the discussions of our young men and leading their energies in the right direction.

NANDY, The Hon'ble Maharajah Sir MANINDRA CHANDRA.

The hostels and messes should be organised so as to contribute to the growth of corporate life. The superintendent, who should be either a professor of the college or a man of his position, should be assisted in his management by a board of students elected by rotation for a month. Virtually, the superintendent should guide the students in their study and recreations. In addition to the college authorities respectable gentlemen of the locality should be approached to act as visitors who will see that the rules made for the management of the hostels and messes are duly observed and supervise the diet served. A hostel physician should visit the messes or hostels every day. The hostels and messes should be made self-governing as far as practicable. For this purpose, a plot of land for kitchen gardening will be profitable while, at the same time, it will provide for healthy recreation. For the maintenance of discipline prefects or monitors should be appointed from among the senior members of the hostel or mess. Matters in connection with the students which cannot be decided by the superintendent should be referred to the principal.

The following should be the equipment of hostels or messes —

- (i) Sleeping-room, with furniture for each boarder.
- (ii) Common-room, with furniture
- (iii) Sick-room, with necessary furniture and medicine
- (iv) Dining-room, with wooden seats and utensils
- (v) Hostels should be big enough to accommodate 50 boarders
- (vi) Provision for tutorial assistance in hostels is desirable.

NANJUNDAYYA, H. V.

In the Mysore University we have hostels attached to each of the main colleges. They accommodate about 100 students each, but will shortly have room for about 150 or 200. Our object is to make them suffice for about half the number of students in each place, which is about the proportion of resident students we expect to have. The colleges being part of the University these institutions are virtually component parts of both the University and the colleges. They are under the direct management of committees appointed by the University Council, the principal being the head of each committee. It is essential that there should be some means of allowing the poorest students to live more economically if they wish. Perhaps two classes of messing-house may be established.

NANJUNDAYIA H V—*contd*—NEUT Rev Father A—PARANJPE The Hon ble Mr R P

About 100 would be a good number but we apprehend no difficulty in maintaining our hostels in a proper state with twice the number

- (f) Tutorial assistance is desirable and should be provided by resident tutors who should be selected from among the younger graduates of merit who aspire to train themselves for professorial or research work—A stipend of Rs 70 to Rs 100 may be given to them for three years

NEUT Rev Father A

Hostel it seems to me cannot produce all the expected effect unless they be limited to small groups of students—say some sixty—so as to make it possible to be influenced individually by the superintendent the latter being I take it a specially selected member of the college staff I know this would mean enormous expenditure at least as long as students flock in such unwieldy crowds into the University courses

Besides the multiplication of hostels much more should be done to create an *esprit de corps* which I take to be an indispensable requisite in the formation of the character Thus e.g. debating or literary societies besides football cricket and hockey club should exist in each hostel And in these should be exercised as much as possible the influence of the professors.

The ideal would be to have the hostels on the same premises as the dwellings or quarters of the principal and staff of the college—taking it for granted that the latter are sufficiently devoted to live among their students and to mix freely with them

PARANJPE The Hon ble Mr R P

The system of messes obtaining in colleges in the Bombay Presidency in the hostels attached to the various colleges is found to be very suitable The hostels should be attached to colleges where they exist In the case of post graduate students where the university provides the teaching they should be attached to the University On this side about 25 students are found to be a suitable number for one mess These engage their own cook and servant elect every fortnight a secretary who buys provisions and looks to the expenses and have a general secretary in addition who holds office for the whole year The general supervision is in the hands of the superintendent who looks to the whole hostel though about 100 is the highest number that can be placed in charge of one such superintendent He only keeps a general eye over the mess expenses etc The superintendent will allot the rooms to the students see that the students behave properly have the roll called at stated times and generally see that the students do work in the hostel and not simply waste their time The superintendent should be a member of the college staff and should have regular teaching work assigned to him in the college Otherwise he will not be able to exercise the proper influence over them

In each mess a kitchen a dining room and a store room are provided in this college together with two small verandahs These are enough for the mess But in connection with the whole hostel it would be convenient to have a big dining hall—though this would be very expensive and some permanent arrangement for putting up a temporary covering for a pandal would be enough—a resident medical attendant and a small hospital to contain a dispensary and beds to accommodate three per cent of the students a reading room—which may be dispensed with if the hostel and the college are in the same compound—and proper facilities for outdoor games like cricket tennis football and hockey and a gymnasium for indoor exercise

In a college hostel tutorial assistance is not required and can hardly be given What assistance is needed should be common to all students resident and non resident The superintendent should see that the students do their college work regularly by making enquiries of the college tutors and by means of college examinations results etc

In this part of the country we find that to make reasonable accommodation for one hostel student a sum of about Rs 1 000 is required for the building etc on an average The conditions may be slightly different in other parts of the country

People's Association, Dacca—RAHIM, The Hon'ble Mr Justice ABDUR—RAY, Dr.
BIDHAN CHANDRA

People's Association, Dacca

The present mode of living in hostels—the buildings and other arrangements for the comfort of the boarders—is apt to create habits in them such as do not generally meet with encouragement afterwards under the present conditions of service and professions. The upshot is depression and discontent, inevitable upon such inequalities of living. With a strict eye upon morals and the preservation of health, students should be made accustomed to a mode of economic living such as they can in after-life expect to enjoy under all circumstances. Superintendents of hostels and messes should be persons who, in education, official position, character, and principles are the best ideals before the students.

RAHIM, The Hon'ble Mr Justice ABDUR

(f) There should be no question that tutorial assistance must be provided as far as possible,

RAY, Dr. BIDHAN CHANDRA

- (a) The duty and responsibility of looking after the messes and hostels should devolve on the colleges. At present, most of the big colleges in Calcutta have obtained grants-in-aid to construct hostels attached to the colleges. Those students who cannot be accommodated in such hostels should also be under the direct charge of the colleges. The University may, if necessary, settle any differences that may occasionally arise between the students and the college.
- (b) The superintendent should be a member of the college staff, not a clerk. He should keep in touch with the guardians of the students on the one hand, and with the college, on the other. He should guide, not control, the students. He should maintain discipline and preserve the balance of interests. Naturally, he should be possessed of a large amount of sympathy and tact, so that the students can look up to him as their guide and friend. He should be given an allowance by the college for his labour.
- (c) The mess management should be in the hands of a committee of students, of which the superintendent should be the president. This committee should be elected monthly. One of the members will be the manager for the month. He should look after the monthly and daily purchases of food, attend to the difficulties and inconveniences of the boarders, keep an account for the month, control and manage the servants, and, in return for such services, he should get free board and lodging for the month. The university medical inspector should help and guide the superintendent and the committee as far as possible.
- (d) Every hostel or mess should have a separate kitchen and dining-room. It is evident that the distinction of class or creed or caste amongst students is happily disappearing and, therefore, it is to be hoped that it will not be found necessary in the near future to provide separate kitchens or dining-rooms for different sets of students. Every mess should have at least one detached room set apart for illness. If the case so demands, the patient should be transferred to a central hospital or institution to be maintained by the University.
- (e) The best size for a hostel is to provide for not more than seventy-five to a hundred students.
- (f) If it is possible to induce other members of the staff of a college, besides the superintendent, to reside in the messes, the personal example and guidance and tutorial assistance should prove of immense value to the students.

RAY MANMATHANATH—ROY The Hon'ble Rai SRI NATH Bahadur—ROY The Hon'ble Babu SURENDRA NATH

RAY MANMATHANATH

The hostels now lack supervision each hostel should be placed in charge of a man with academic qualifications and of high character the teachers in the colleges are fully occupied so that there should be a separate service of superintendents composed of men with academic qualifications but recruited mainly from the point of view of high character who will have to devote their whole time to the work of the hostels. They will be men of the missionary type self-sacrificing and thoroughly acquainted with the Hindu or Muslim scripture who will have family quarters attached to the hostel. Such a system would exercise a profound influence on student life and will supplement the secular teaching given in the college. These superintendents and their service should be under the control of the University as Government service may not inspire confidence and may be looked upon with suspicion. Government will have to provide funds for the purpose. Such a service of superintendents would conduce to greater good than any elaborate police organisation or espionage to enforce discipline among students and would also help in providing tutorial assistance.

The hostels should be attached to college and under the supervision of the University. The maximum number of students in each hostel should be 50.

ROY The Hon'ble Rai SRI NATH, Bahadur

Hostel life should not be too costly or luxurious. In most cases the boys are allowed more comfort and luxury in hostels than they are accustomed to at home. And in consequence they suffer much in after life as they have to adopt a costlier style of living.

The hostel buildings should be well ventilated, healthy and dry, but the buildings and the equipment should not entail more cost than is necessary.

ROY The Hon'ble Babu SURENDRA NATH

- (a) There ought to be hostels or attached messes attached to colleges especially for students who come from the interior of the district. I do not think that the University should have the power to recommend to Government to financially help hostels and attached messes which are in need of help.
- (b) I would suggest that the superintendent in charge of a hostel should be a medical officer who should look after the health and comfort and freedom of the boys placed under his charge. He would remain there as the guardian of the boys and would bring to the notice of the school authorities or the guardians of the boys any delinquencies on their part.
- (c) The hostels should be managed like any ordinary household and the superintendent should remain in charge of it. His work however should be subject to the supervision of the college council and inspection by them as well as by the university authorities. The university authorities should not however come to inspect the institution in a carping and fault-finding spirit.
- (d) Every student of a hostel should be supplied with a bedstead, a small table and two chairs. Or if the student so desires, he can be supplied instead with a carpet and a bed sheet.

There should be proper sanitary arrangements in the dining room and it ought to be neat and clean. Special inspection of the kitchen should be made by the superintendent every day as well as by the principal along with the senior boarders every fortnight or whenever there is a complaint.

There ought to be library facilities in the hostel buildings or if the hostel be in the same or in the adjoining building to that of the college arrangements should be made for the free access of boys to the library both in the morning and in the evening.

Roy, The Hon'ble Babu SURENDRA NATH *contd.*—RUDRA, S. K.—SAPRU, The Hon'ble Dr. Tej Bahadur—SARKAR, KALIPADA

I think it is desirable to have a small dispensary, or rather collection of medicines which are of daily use, in the hostel building, so that the superintendent, who ought to be a medical officer, may treat the boarders whenever necessary

- (c) The size of the hostel should be such as to accommodate the number of boarders fairly. The boys should not be huddled up together and, if practicable, not more than two students should be allowed to remain in one room
- (f) It is greatly desirable that the boarders in the hostels should be provided with proper tutorial assistance. For this reason, some professors of the colleges might be induced to remain with the boys and take up the work.

RUDRA, S. K.

The University should control the hostels through the colleges. The colleges should be compelled to own responsibility for the hygienic and moral conditions of the residential quarters of their students. The University should inspect the hostels, and take such action with regard to affiliation, etc., as it thinks fit.

The best size seems to be 40 to 50 pupils under one superintendent, who should, if possible, be a man of academic distinction, and may give some tutorial assistance.

SAPRU, The Hon'ble Dr. TEJ BAHADUR.

I am connected with the Macdonnell Hindu Boarding-House at Allahabad. About 200 students reside in that hostel. We receive some financial aid from Government. There is a superintendent in charge of it. Recently, we have had to reorganise the whole hostel. Under the present system, so far as the internal management and control of the kitchens and dining-rooms are concerned, it has been handed over to the students at their request. They have also got a co-operative society which they are working. The superintendent only exercises supervisory powers. A separate room has been kept apart for the sick and we have got a competent medical officer, who is in charge of the hospital section of the hostel. There is a library, though it requires to be considerably improved. But for financial difficulties, we should like to have an assistant superintendent. From the experience that I have gained I think that, in a hostel like this, there is need for a superintendent and an assistant superintendent. I would not have more than 200 students in a single hostel as the difficulties of management are very great. I would give the superintendent general powers of supervision, but, at the same time, I would give the students great liberty in managing their internal affairs and organising their games. We are paying the superintendent Rs. 200 a month. I think this is a fairly good salary for the nature of the work. We have got no arrangements for tutorial assistance. I recognise the need of it, but our resources do not permit us to provide that. The hostel is affiliated to the University, which has got disciplinary powers. It is not attached to any particular college, though most of the students residing in the hostel are reading in the Muir Central College.

SARKAR, KALIPADA.

In view of the caution given at the end of the questions in this section, *viz*, financial practicability, I am inclined to think that the present system is, on the whole, suited to our requirements. The only thing to do is to arrange for more frequent, and better, supervision and provide tutorial assistance to students, as far as practicable.

The 'block system' may be introduced everywhere for the supervision of all students not living in regular hostels controlled by formally appointed superintendents. Under this system, the area occupied by the students is divided into a number of convenient blocks, each being put under a responsible teacher, carefully selected. He visits the domiciles of the students, whether living with parents or guardians or in

SARKAR KALIPADA—*contd*—SAYIED ABDULLAH ABU

messes not as a detective but as a friend and guide mixes with the parents and guardians makes enquiries about the conduct and progress of the boys and gives information and advice

- (a) The present rules will do
- (b) The superintendent will look after the management of the hostel and the conduct and progress of the inmates. He will also give the students as much tutorial assistance as he can. He will work under the orders of the school or the college committee and be helped in his duties by carefully selected students
- (c) The present rule will do
- (d) Ditto
- (e) Experience shows that a single superintendent cannot efficiently control more than a dozen students if he is to be a real friend philosopher and guide to them. A large number of boys in schools and particularly of youths in colleges placed under a single superintendent of ordinary calibre is often a source of great mischief. If the size be reduced it would also solve the question of tutorial assistance to a great extent
- (f) Rendering tutorial assistance should be a condition attached to the post of a superintendent.

SAYIED ABDULLAH ABU

The question of finance naturally makes one reticent to suggest measures for handling the problem of students residence. In a place like Calcutta it seems to me particularly difficult to solve this problem without a considerable expenditure of money and the conservatism of those who persist in demanding proper accommodation for students in the town rather than that they should go somewhere outside to some easily accessible site in the suburb adds to the complexity of the problem. Within the town of Calcutta I would suggest restricting the number of new admissions to colleges to the extent of accommodation available for the year in different hostels. A careful estimate should be annually prepared during the long vacation and mofussil candidates should be informed in time if they can be accommodated. The makeshift arrangement known at present as attached messes should be abolished and the policy of distributing the rush to Calcutta between different mofussil centres should be adopted.

This difficulty however has not to be faced in mofussil centres where land is available comparatively cheaply and it is possible to accommodate students more comfortably and in good surroundings. A corresponding policy of expanding hostel accommodation in well chosen mofussil centres *pari passu* with the rise in the number of students should be adopted. Whatever force there be in the argument for keeping the hostels of Calcutta in the town which undoubtedly offers many advantages to students no such reasons exist in the smaller towns of the province and colleges that are in making at different mofussil centres would do well to remove to places where they can expand without much hindrance before it becomes too late on financial grounds.

- (a) Hostels of colleges should form integral parts of these institutions situated in close proximity to it. Being part of the college it should bear the same relation to the University in matters of general control as the college itself and the inmates of the college should be compelled to reside in its hostel excepting those who are living with *bona fide* guardians. No college should be permitted to admit more than it could accommodate properly both in classes and in hostels and the University should fix the number of admissions to colleges on this basis and any increase over it should only be permitted when a satisfactory arrangement for meeting this increase has been made.
- (b) Members of the college staff only should be eligible for superintendentships of college hostels and they should be allowed to have a free hand in maintaining discipline and management under the control of the principal. Frequent interference with their authority and encouraging so called grievances are subversive of discipline.

SAYIN, ABDULLAH ABU--*contd*—Scottish Churches College Senatus, Calcutta

At the present time, the popularity of hostels is in proportion to the laxity of control which they exercise, and there is an unwholesome tendency to deery those where attempts are made for better control and discipline. I do not maintain that our youths should be housed under miniature jail conditions, but an almost inexpressible ideal of bringing them up as self-respecting, and well-behaved, gentlemen should be aimed at.

- (d) and (i) Hostels of colleges should be on block arrangements, providing accommodation for not more than 50 boarders in each block, under a separate superintendent, with family quarters for him attached. Each block should have a separate kitchen, dining-hall, and mess arrangements, managed by the boarders, under the general control of the superintendent. The rooms in each block should be partly single-seated and partly three-seated—the former for more advanced students and the latter for junior under-graduates. Plain, but decent, furniture should be provided by the college authorities, consisting of a table, a chair, a bedstead, and a small wall almirah. Cution-money should be taken at the time of entrance to a hostel to be returned, after deductions for any damage, when the boarder leaves. Medical and sanitary arrangements should be common to the whole hostel system and a union hall with a reading-room, provided in some central place of the hostel area. All the different blocks should be in one compound and, on an average, each block should have for its compound four acres of land which can be easily insisted upon in mofussil centres.
- (f) If by tutorial assistance is meant a general guidance of hostel residents by the superintendent, in advising them regarding their studies, it is highly desirable. Moreover, he should meet boarders in batches from time to time at his own place and entertain them socially on a modest scale which will not only cultivate a better mutual understanding, but give a general polish to them in social manners. I must add that it would be too much to expect a superintendent to do all these in return for the pittance that is now given to him in the form of an allowance, but my strong conviction is that something is needed on the lines suggested above. Where there are European members on the staff they should be preferred, and an allowance given to some of them for occasionally meeting students in batches. This arrangement may, possibly, produce an everlasting beneficial effect on our youths.

Scottish Churches College Senatus, Calcutta.

For the normal college at the present time hostels and attached messes form the chief residential arrangements made for students who do not have homes in Calcutta or stay with guardians recognised by college and university. But, where advance is to be made, it should be in the further elimination of such messes, for the advantages of a mess, at its best, under the present system, can only approximate to those of a hostel.

- (i) The definition in the university regulations that a mess is a temporary boarding-house formed by a combination of students who desire to share expenses, though slightly modified where college authorities have control, indicates one disadvantage. The temporary nature predicted for the mess prevents the growth in it of a real *esprit de corps* and of such a tradition as in many a hostel is a most valuable possession.
- (ii) In so far as messes are dwelling-houses rented by the University for the period of the academical year seldom are the buildings adapted suitably, and never specially for student residence. Although the houses may be chosen with regard to the suitability of the neighbourhood nothing can ever be expected of a mess in Calcutta in the way of provision of facilities for recreation of any kind.
- (iii) The prevailing method of control partly through the University and partly through the college, leads to difficulties. The building is rented by the University. The amount of outlay in this direction is recovered by the lodging fees paid by the

Scottish Churches College Senatus Calcutta—*contd*

students in residence. If sufficient is not realised in this way to cover the rent the University has to meet the deficit. In order that this deficit may be as small as possible difficulties are put in the way of a student who wishes to leave a mess during the session. A room in a collegiate hostel may fall vacant but no mess boarder can apply for it—though it offers him a healthier and happier mode of life—unless he can either find a substitute for his place in the mess or pay up his seat rent to the end of the session. Such a condition has often prevented a transference which should be facilitated rather than made more difficult.

- (iv) Still another point may be noticed in which the mess lags behind the hostel and this has special reference to the system of management in the hostels of the Scottish Churches College. In these hostels the management is responsible for the provision of the furniture of all living rooms and common rooms for cooking utensils and all dishes required for serving the food as also for the control of servants and all feeding arrangements. In the mess the student must provide such furniture as he wishes and the general establishment is jointly provided for each year with the result that in the interests of economy it is kept at a minimum. The feeding arrangements in a mess are in the hands of the students themselves and while often such arrangements are satisfactory they often also lead to difficulties seldom experienced in a hostel and they almost always lead to greater expense. This general question of management will be further discussed under (c) below.

The conclusion seems to be that if rented houses are necessary for the accommodation of students until a college can provide specially built and specially adapted residences they should be more completely under the control of the college which should be responsible for the renting of the building for such adaptation of it as may be possible and for the general establishment in it. Having in view then the elimination of the attached mess as at present understood we refer in the replies which follow to the different sections of the question to collegiate hostels alone—whether rented houses specially adapted or buildings specifically built as hostels.

- (a) In so far as it seems fundamentally important that the residence of students should be collegiate the University should have the minimum power of control over the hostels attached to a college. The borders of a hostel are all of one college and their life naturally centres in the college in which they study. The college should thus be responsible for the provision for the superintendence of the hostel for the framing of its general rules and for the control of its finance. A sufficient relation between the hostel and the University will be maintained by an annual visit paid by some university inspector in company with the principal of the college.
- (b) The superintendent of a collegiate hostel should be a man of high academic standing and preferably a member of the college staff. Where certain members of the staff are Europeans it is valuable if they can be associated with the supervision of the hostels and most valuable if they can actually stay in them. While the college through its governing body maintains the control suggested above the superintendent should have full power to deal with the internal affairs of the hostel in the admission of boarders in management and in discipline.
- (c) The question of the methods of management control and inspection are to a large extent related to the answer to the following section (e) but assuming that the size of a hostel should not exceed what is sufficient for the accommodation of a maximum of 60 boarders the internal management may well be concentrated in the hands of the superintendent associated with whom may be an assistant superintendent or monitor who may be a senior student receiving in return for his services only free board and lodging. After experience of various forms of management with regard to the board of students in hostels we consider that the most satisfactory results obtain from a system in which the superintendent makes all arrangements for food and has sole control of all hostel servants. With a mess

Scottish Churches College Senatus, Calcutta—*contd*

committee in a hostel continual difficulties arise which increase, rather than facilitate, the work of a superintendent, and from the experience gained in our hostels we should say that students infinitely prefer the present system. It makes easier the prevailing practice in our Hindu hostels of recognising no caste distinctions. Three Brahmin cooks prepare and serve the food, but the boarders in two batches (in a hostel of sixty or thirty each) sit down together. Within the experience of the past five years no difficulty has been met with on this score though men from all castes, high and low, have resided in the hostel. With regard to control our rules lay it down that the hostel gates be closed at 9 P.M. and opened at 5.30 A.M. A roll is marked twice a day in the morning and at 9.30 at night. The assistant superintendent at the same time satisfies himself that the boarders marked present are in the hostel. Leave from the hostel is only to be granted on personal and written application to the superintendent, and two gate books are kept in one of which is recorded leave granted for less than 24 hours, and in the other leave granted for more than 24 hours. In addition the control of the superintendent extends over the general conduct of the boarders in the hostel and discipline is exercised not only for disorderly behaviour, but for want of cleanliness, for continued neglect of study, and in cases where a student remains in the hostel during lecture hours without good and sufficient cause.

When the superintendent is of such standing as to be a member of the governing body of the college and so can report important matters relating to the hostel to that body there seems little need for the establishment and powers of inspection on the part of the college other than such as the principal would normally exercise. Reference has been made above in (a) to university inspection.

(d) The answer to this question is likewise based on the assumption that the accommodation of the hostel is for a maximum of 60 boarders.

(i) *The buildings*—We have found that the most satisfactory form of hostel building in Calcutta is one built on three sides of a rectangle with a verandah running round each door on the inside and with only a single width of room. Where the site is about one bigha (1/4 of an acre) a small and private compound round which the hostel is built is thus afforded. Each student should have one living room of his own, the measurements of which should be about 12' by 8' by 12'. Two to four, but not more, double rooms might be provided for the benefit of brothers who might wish to stay together. A sick room should be included, as also a dining room, common room, kitchen, and store-room. Bath-room and latrine accommodation should be on the ground level but, if the building is built in stories, one bath-room for night use should be available on each floor. The superintendent's quarters should be part of the hostel building.

(ii) *The furniture* of the students' living room need not be elaborate, i.e., one table (with drawers), one chair, one iron bedstead, one book rack, and one clothes rack. The hostel should be provided, where possible, with an electric light installation, a monthly charge of, say, Re 1-4 per head being made to cover consumption and upkeep expenses. The equipment of a dining-room in a Hindu hostel is of the simplest, consisting of the requisite number of low seats or *pisis*. The common room should afford facilities for indoor games and should be provided with table and benches in order that it may serve as the meeting room of the hostel. In it also the hostel library may be housed. The library in each of our hostels is managed by one of the boarders and is maintained and extended, by a small monthly subscription from each boarder. The sick-room should be provided with two bedsteads, tables, chairs, a small almirah and perhaps an electric fan and should be in immediate proximity to a bath-room. In the kitchen, for a hostel of the size we suggest, it will be necessary to have four fireplaces or *chulas*. In addition to all the necessary cooking utensils the hostel will have to provide a sufficient number of brass dishes for the serving of food.

Scottish Churches College Senatus Calcutta—*contd*—SEAL DR BRAJENDRANATH

- (iii) *Servants*—The servants necessary for such a hostel and suggested rates of monthly pay are as follows—
 Durwan (Rs 10) first cook (Rs 12) second cook (Rs 10) third cook (Rs 8)
 1 kitchen servant (Rs 5) 3 bearers (Rs 5 each) sweeper (Rs 11) Each servant will be provided with his food from the hostel There will be a barber in addition provided with food from the hostel but receiving remuneration from the boarders he serves
- (iv) *Provision for the treatment of illness*—A doctor should be engaged to visit the hostel each morning the amount of his fee being recovered by a monthly charge on the boarders In our hostels each student contributes annas 8 per month towards the hostel doctor's fee
- (v) *Provision of facilities for recreation*—In Calcutta it is impossible for such a hostel as that to which we refer to make any adequate provision for outdoor recreation for its boarders In the compound of the hostel however something can certainly be done and if the college possesses a playing field sufficient opportunities will be available
- (e) We have already indicated that the hostel should not exceed in size what is sufficient for the accommodation of a maximum of sixty boarders If it goes beyond this limit superintendence is more difficult and the development of the *esprit de corps* which means so much in the life of a hostel is endangered by the formation amongst the students of cliques and sets We have suggested a maximum of 60 rather than a lower figure in view of economy of building and management But the advantages of economy would not carry us beyond this limit because of these other serious disadvantages to which we have referred
- (f) We do not feel that the hostel can or should be made responsible for the regular provision of tutorial assistance to the students in residence in it

SEAL DR BRAJENDRANATH

The hostels and messes should continue to be licensed by the University and be subject to periodic inspection by the University But the actual administration of the college hostels as well as of the messes attached or unattached so far as they are properly amenable to control should be with the colleges When students of two or more colleges live in the same mess inter-collegiate arrangements if desired may be made without much difficulty In the case of college hostels and attached messes it is always desirable to have a professor as resident superintendent whose honorarium will be paid from the general college funds and not specifically from the boarders' fees The superintendent should possess disciplinary powers which he will exercise in graver cases in consultation with the principal But the professor superintendent while maintaining authority should subordinate merely penal considerations remembering that he represents not merely the legitimate college policing but also the wise benignity of an Alma Mater and he is there to secure the intimate touch of the college its culture its ideals and its tradition with the students' daily life and morals and to annul the unredeemed vulgarities of a mess life with the sweetness and light which culture within the college walls ought to foster Thus will the students' residences in the town be converted into a greater college round the college Every college hostel should have a small library and a Sunday Club which will occasionally arrange for inter-hostel conferences

Besides one or two professors detailed for each mess local gentlemen interested in students' welfare including a medical man and an active member of the Municipal Board should in every case be appointed visitors to every hostel and every mess

The catering arrangements so far as the marketing and the menu or bill of fare are concerned should be left to the management of the inmates who will arrange for rotation of work representatives etc as may be necessary this will keep down the cost—and keep the (normal) discontent within due limits But the superintendent and the visitors will satisfy themselves that the food and other necessities are not cut down below the level of efficiency The menials on the establishment of a college hostel must be under the control of the superintendent who will regularise their duties Habits of hard work

SFAL, Dr. BRAJINDRANATH—*contd*—SEGARD, Dr. C. P.

(including co operative manual work for the institution)—of going without menial help whenever practicable and of an intelligent thrift and sometimes a more intelligent expenditure, must be encouraged among the students, and as far as possible, regularised. A students' dispensary on a small scale should be attached to a number of messes for supplying medicine at cost price to the student boarders.

The arrangements for the kitchen, for the sick-room, and for the latrines (and conservancy) should be specially inspected by the visitors, and in the matter of drainage and conservancy (specially the clearing of the cisterns where the cisterns are in use, the removal of offal and garbage specially from the kitchen room and its environs, and the opening of gutted drains) the Municipal Commissioner on the Visitors' Board should be able to render material service (shall I call it Knight's or Moller's service ?) by securing prompt and vigilant municipal attention and interest. The arrangements for drinking water, and the water-supply generally, in towns without water works, are a perennial source of difficulty. The artesian well wherever the soil (or sub soil) favours it, should be a great convenience, for ordinary household uses. The drinking water ought to be boiled (not warmed), even if the water bearer be placed on his oath to fetch water from the municipal (reserved) tank (if any)—the water bearer's back is a broken reed to lean upon—he will fill his *kalsi* or *moshak* from any horse pond on the way. The Indian servant, it must be remembered, is splendid in personal service, faithfulness, and loyalty, but he has four articles in his creed—

- (i) He believes in *one anna* in the rupee—in some confessions it reads *two*—on bazar expenses.
- (ii) He believes in his "*dasturi*."
- (iii) He does not believe in pure water (though his habits are aquatic, bathing and drinking).
- (iv) Above all he does not believe in the *Bacillus*, the modern man's Devil, the enemy invisible!

Then there is the cook—lord of the kitchen and master of the mess (and its gregarious stomach), master, whoever may be its superintendent, he belongs to a trade union and loves to go on strike. Anyone who can solve the cooking problem in Bengali messes will be a greater benefactor of our students than all your building-reformers and text-book reformers put together. Over grown hostels are hot beds of faction, the mutual recriminations of the boarders, cooks, menials, and petty functionaries are vulgarising to a degree. A maximum of sixty boarders would be a good arrangement for the average hostel. The reduction of cost by timely purchases, storing, boarders' own marketing and catering arrangements, and co operative manual work in certain directions, will make such small-sized hostels financially practicable, especially if we do not make things too expensive by architecture and furnishing on an imposing pattern, such as is entirely unsuited to the needs or the resources of a tropical, and typically agricultural, people accustomed to live the simple life in the open country, if not in the open.

"Coaching" and "tuition" in hostels, apart from the general tutorial arrangements in college or school, may suit school boys, but should not be encouraged, in any scheme of collegiate instruction.

SEGARD, Dr. C. P.

My only experience with regard to the organisation of residential arrangements for students is that hostels in general in high schools are poorly managed and generally dirty. They are dirty not only so far as filth is concerned, but also with regard to parasites.

- (c) I believe that the management should be in the hands of a capable superintendent.
- (d) More care is necessary with regard to beds being of iron, instead of wood, and that kitchen and dining-room arrangements should be such that all waste is carried away or disposed of, and that where large hostels are located there be a small dispensary with an isolated room and that attention should be given to latrines for both day and night-time,

SEN RAJ BOIKUNT NATH Bahadur—SEN Dr S K—SEN SATISH CHANDRA

SEN RAJ BOIKUNT NATH Bahadur

- (a) Regarding hostels and attached messes general principles may be formulated by the University but the internal management should rest with the authorities. The University should have the privilege and power of interference at its option according to contingencies and necessities.
- (b) There ought to be a separate service for superintendents of hostels and messes. They should be recruited from retired professors or elderly graduates serving in the Education Department. The service ought to be a graded one. The status of the superintendent would be that of the chief controlling authority of the institution. His functions would consist of general supervision of food, the health character and conduct of the students, observance of strict discipline, regulation of hours of study, moral training, supervision of tutorial work, selection of associates, proper physical exercise and cleanliness.
- (c) Rules and regulations should be prescribed by the University for the methods of management, control and inspection.
- (d) The details must be arranged in accordance with university regulations with such modifications as may be necessary for adaptation to circumstances but not inconsistent with or in violation of university regulations.
- (e) Accommodation for (50) fifty students.
- (f) I have already referred to tutorial assistance in answer to a previous question.

SEN Dr S K

- (a) Absolutely subordinate to the University through their college authorities.
- (b) Like other professors in charge of a certain department.
- (c) The management should be entrusted to a board elected every month from amongst the students presided over by the superintendent. The control should be in the hands of the superintendent and a committee of the professors. So far as inspection is concerned an inspecting board consisting of a doctor and professor and a Government officer should visit them as often as possible.
- (d) The kitchen and dining room arrangement should be kept in Indian style at present as the European style is always abused by poorer people.
- (e) One hostel for one college.
- (f) Tutorial classes should be introduced.

SEN SATISH CHANDRA

- (a) Hostels and attached messes may be under the inspection of the University. The colleges to which they are attached may have some control over their disciplinary arrangement.
- (b) The superintendent should be a member of the college staff who by his attainments, character, social standing and sympathy may have a commanding influence over the inmates. His functions should be general supervision in all matters, maintenance of discipline and looking after the moral, intellectual and physical interests of the boarders. He should be under the control of the principal and the governing body of the college.
- (c) The hostel should be divided into blocks of 20 or 25 with a monitor selected from among the senior students at the head of the management. He may be assisted by a committee of 2 to be chosen by the superintendent every month. The monitor and the committee will make arrangements for diet etc. subject to the control of the superintendent. The hostel should be frequently inspected by the college and university authorities but the studies of the boarders should not be disturbed. Each block should have separate canteen arrangements. Thus

SEN, SATIS CHANDRA *contd* SEN GUPTA, Dr NARES CHANDRA—SEN GUPTA, SURENDRA MOHAN.

will lead to a healthy rivalry among the blocks regarding the quality of food, economy, etc. Occasionally all the blocks may dine together. The superintendent should take his meals in the several blocks alternately. The dietary arrangements in most hostels are not satisfactory. The quality of the food supplied should be improved. It does not matter whether there are a certain number of dishes or not.

- (d) Kitchen utensils, dining plates, tumblers, etc., should be provided, but a small fee may be levied on the boarders for their use. Medical attendance should be regular and free, and a stock of medicines for common diseases should be kept in the hostel. There should be a common room. Furniture should be provided free.
- (e) The best size for a hostel is one for about 100 boarders.
- (f) Tutorial assistance is desirable, and may be provided if practicable.

SEN GUPTA, Dr. NARES CHANDRA.

All students' residences should be inspected by the University from time to time, but the direct control ought to vest in the colleges.

I am in favour of small boarding-houses and messes with not more than fifty inmates. I should prefer twenty for each boarding house. There is a great deal more of sociality in a small mess than in a big one. Besides, the food is generally much better looked after and better cooked in small messes.

On the other hand, I quite realise the good points in big hostels. They furnish opportunities for an ampler social life and greater facilities for the development of an adequate corporate existence than small boarding-houses. I should therefore suggest the grouping together of a number of small boarding-houses in a single area so as to combine the advantages of both small and big hostels. It will also make it possible to place over them a well-paid superintendent who will be able to command the respect of the students.

The superintendent ought to be a whole-time officer of the same class as a professor, and be assisted by a house tutor for each house, on the one hand, and a business manager on the other. His duties should include maintenance of discipline, control of the studies, and the supervision of the life of the students, as well as the business management of the hostel.

The messing arrangements should be separate in each house. Students should be associated in the management and may be allowed to control their messing arrangements, but the bill of fare must be approved by a dietetic expert.

The hostels should be healthy, but the living should be as inexpensive as possible. The furniture should be supplied by the college. It should be cheap but decent. Cleanliness must be insisted upon and the health of each boy periodically examined by a medical officer.

SEN GUPTA, SURENDRA MOHAN.

There should be inter-collegiate (where students of different colleges may live) hostels so that in residences in the preliminary university stage the students may form village or family groups. These institutions should be under the control of one or other of the colleges whose students reside in it. The superintendent will have absolute control over the student in guiding him. The superintendent will not be saddled with the duties of management unduly. He shall have the position of the guardian of the students. He shall look after the mental, moral, and physical welfare of the boys placed in his charge. It is further necessary that the superintendent should also be as sympathetic towards the boys as their parents or guardians and should himself be an enthusiast in that work. I do not think that a hostel should consist of more than sixty boys generally. The superintendent will have the status of a professor of the college of which it forms a part.

SEN GUPTA SURENDRA MOHAN—*contd*—Serampore College Serampore

Messes should be allowed to grow up. A number of boys will form themselves into a mess. But the rules and regulations will be similar to those of hostels. Students must find out some gentleman of position willing to live among them and to take charge of them at the same time fully trusted by the college authorities.

The control and discipline of the superintendent should not be formal but real. He should help the boys in their study as well.

Serampore College, Serampore

We have in connection with the college three hostels—the main hostel a quadrangular building in the college compound one side of which is the principal's house and on another side quarters for members of the Indian staff. A few yards away is the college house with quarters for other European members of the staff including the hostel superintendent. This hostel contains accommodation for some seventy students almost all being in single rooms 10×8 . The assistant superintendent—an Indian graduate—has his quarters in the compound a few yards away from the hostel building. The general dining hall is for Christians or any others—Hindus or Muhammadans—who care to join. The caste Hindus have a special dining room of their own. The messing arrangements are made by the students themselves through food committees and food managers acting under the general supervision of the superintendent. We append for the information of the Commission and as a reply to some of the items of this question our hostel rule and regulations. There is regular medical supervision and adequate provision is made in the hostel itself for all ordinary cases of sickness. Our hostel arrangements have in the main proved an unqualified success and we regard our hostel life as a highly important feature of our collegiate discipline and training. The other two hostels situated on the river side about half a mile distant from the college are serving an useful temporary purpose but from the nature of things they lack some of the characteristic features of the main hostel. In reply to the more detailed parts of this question we desire to remark—

- (a) It is within the right and duty of the University to insist on certain fundamental requirements while allowing the colleges a good deal of liberty to develop features in accordance with their own special ideal.
- (b) We consider the superintendent should be a member of the professorial staff and should be given adequate disciplinary powers to be exercised in special cases in consultation with the principal and the regular college authorities.
- (c) and (d) Answered largely in our rules and regulations and in the introductory material given above. The college library close by is available. A special hostel library is being gradually formed. In the hostel common rooms there is a liberal supply of books and magazines. There is in addition the college common room and the debating and other facilities of the Union Society, the rules of which we append. There are varied facilities for sports in the college grounds. The college has also its own magazine *The Students Chronicle* which circulates all over India.
- (e) We would put the limit at 100.
- (f) The superintendent should be sufficiently free to give a couple of hours daily to general tutorial assistance.

HOSTEL RULES AND REGULATIONS

Hostel hours —

- (a) *Gate hours*—The gates are closed at 9 P.M. and opened at 6 A.M. Between these hours no student must be absent from the hostel except by the special permission of the superintendent.
- (b) *Roll call*—The roll for arts students is called every morning at 7 and every evening at 9. Each student is expected to be present unless he has received special leave of absence.

Scrampore College, Scrampore—*contd.*

(c) *Prayers*—Immediately after roll call prayers are held morning and evening. All arts' students resident in the hostel are expected to attend, unless they have conscientious objections.

(d) *Meals*—The hours for meals are —

Breakfast	9.30 A.M.
Tiffin	1.50 P.M.
Dinner	7.0 „

Students are expected to sit down to their meals at the proper time. If they are absent from any meal, or find it necessary to have a meal at a slightly different hour, they must give adequate notice to the manager. All students obtaining leave of absence should also intimate to the manager the period during which they will be away.

2 *Payment of fees*—Both the establishment fee and the food charges are payable on the first day of the month. If not paid by the third of the month a fine of one anna will be levied for each day's delay.

3 *Remission of food charges*—Students leaving the hostel in term-time during the course of any month are required to pay the full food charges if they have been in residence for a period of three weeks or over. If they leave after any shorter period of residence they shall be allowed a reduction of 50 per cent. on the charges due for that portion of the month during which they are absent. For portions of a month at the beginning or end of the term the food charge will be 5 annas per diem.

4 *Leave of absence* —

A *Theological students*—Theological students desiring leave of absence should inform the superintendent of their department.

B. *Arts' students*.—

(a) Written application must be made to the superintendent not later than the morning of the day of departure.

(b) The application must state the period for which leave is required, and also, in the case of students not going to their homes, the name and address of the relative whom they desire to visit.

(c) The written permission of a parent or guardian must first be obtained before a student can be allowed to visit a friend's or a relative's house.

(d) In the case of students desiring leave for a period of less than 24 hours the application must state the time of departure and return and also the purpose for which leave is required.

(e) Students who do not return to the hostel at the proper time render themselves liable to dismissal.

5 *Use of rooms and furniture* —

(a) Each student is provided with a bed, table, chair, book-case, lamp, and clothes pegs. Students are expected to keep their rooms and furniture clean and are responsible for any damage which is done to them. Students are also responsible for the replacing of any lamp chimneys which they may break.

(b) Students must not hammer nails into, or otherwise deface, the walls of their rooms. The superintendent will, on application, supply a carpenter for any necessary work.

(c) The superintendent may prohibit the putting up of any picture in a student's room which he regards as unsuitable.

(d) Students must not introduce other furniture than that supplied by the college into their rooms without special permission. They must also limit the number of their boxes to those absolutely necessary.

(e) Each student is provided with a lock and key for his room, and a key for the drawer of his table. If these are not returned intact at the time of his departure from the hostel, he will be required to pay the amount of their cost.

Serampore College Serampore—*contd*

6 *Lights out*—Students must not keep their lamps burning after 11 P M without special permission

7 *Miscellaneous* —

- (a) Students are expected to be in their own rooms between 7 40 and 9 A M and after 9 30 P M also as far as possible between 7 and 9 P M
- (b) Students are expected to endeavour at all times to avoid disturbing the other inmates of the hostel quadrangle by loud reading singing or shouting
- (c) Students must not walk along the east and west parts of the quadrangle except when visiting one of the professors
- (d) Students must not walk or sit on the hostel roof except between the hours of 5 and 6 30 P M and must not go beyond the bounds marked by black lines
- (e) Students appointed to perform any special duty in connection with the management of the affairs of the hotel and undertaking responsibility for the same are expected to discharge their functions with due regularity and thoroughness
- (f) Students are expected to act as gentlemen towards the servants The *kitchen servants* are specially under the direction of the food committees acting through their respective food managers for the time being and the *general hostel servants* are under the authority of the assistant superintendent
- (g) All orders to the *hostel servants* should be made through the assistant superintendent or in his absence through the hostel superintendent
- (h) No student is entitled to use the servants for any private business nor to dispatch them anywhere outside the hostel without special permission

(N.B.—Theological students may have if necessary the services of their own special bearer when he is not required for general hostel work)

- (i) All complaints regarding kitchen or hostel servants must be promptly made in writing to the hostel superintendent
- (j) Students are forbidden to use the night lavatory during the time when the hostel gates are open except with special permission
- (k) Students must refrain from spitting in any part of the hostel buildings
- (l) Students are liable to discipline for any misconduct not specifically provided for in these rules
- (m) Arts students are liable to have their names placed in the conduct registers (which is inspected by university officials) for the following misdemeanours —
 - (i) Disobedience of orders or infringement of any rules made for the well being of the hostel
 - (ii) Absence without sufficient cause
 - (iii) Continued neglect of study
 - (iv) Insubordination or disrespect to the authorities
 - (v) Assaulting or abusing a servant
 - (vi) Want of cleanliness and tidiness in their rooms or on the premises

SERAMPORE COLLEGE UNION SOCIETY RULES

1 The name of the society shall be the Serampore College Union Society

2 The objects of the society shall be—

- (a) To provide opportunities for the discussion of all matters affecting the welfare of the students of the Serampore College
- (b) To arrange debates discussions and lectures upon topics of general interest
- (c) To take any steps that may appear to the members advisable from time to time with a view to promoting a corporate feeling among the students of the college

3 All students of the Serampore College and all professors lecturers and officials of the college shall be regarded as members of the society

Serampore College, Serampore—*contd.*

4 The executive management of the affairs of the Union Society shall be vested in a committee consisting of the officers of the society, *viz*, a president, four vice-presidents, a secretary, and a treasurer, together with the secretaries of affiliated societies or clubs, *ex officio*, and one representative of each of the following —

- (a) The Higher Theological Department
- (b) The Fourth Year Class (Arts)
- (c) The Third Year Class (Arts)
- (d) The Second Year Class (Arts)
- (e) The First Year Class (Arts)
- (f) The Vernacular Theological Department.

5. The officers of the Union Society shall be appointed as follows —

- (a) The principal of the college shall be president, *ex officio*
- (b) The two senior members of the staff shall be vice-presidents, *ex officio*.
- (c) The remaining two vice-presidents shall be elected by ballot
- (d) The secretary shall be elected by ballot
- (e) The bursar of the college shall be treasurer, *ex officio*.

One of the vice-presidents shall always be a Bengali member of the staff. No name of a candidate shall be placed on the voting paper for election by ballot unless the candidate has been nominated by two members of the society. Elections of office bearers, *viz*, president, vice-presidents, and secretary shall take place annually at the end of the session, and those of the representatives, at the opening of the college session. Vacancies may be filled at any ordinary meeting of the society, provided that three full days' notice be given by an announcement published on the college notice board.

6 The representatives of the Higher Theological Department, fourth year (arts), third year (arts), second year (arts), first year (arts), and Vernacular Theological Department shall be elected by ballot by the students whom they severally represent at sectional meetings called for the purpose in connection with an ordinary meeting of the society, unless special sectional meetings be otherwise arranged for the purpose under sanction of the committee.

7 The ordinary meetings of the society shall be held on Tuesday afternoons during the term and shall begin at 3 P.M.

8 A special meeting of the society shall be called by the president at any time upon receiving a requisition signed by one officer and four ordinary members of the society. Special meetings may also be called by the president, as requested by the committee of the society.

9. Any club or societies connected with the college may apply for affiliation to the Union Society. All such applications shall be considered and voted on in an ordinary meeting of the society.

10 No society or club shall be affiliated unless it includes all the students of the college within its membership.

11 The committee shall provide facilities in the meetings of the Union Society for the transaction of the business of all affiliated clubs and societies.

12 The president shall take the chair at the meetings of the society, in his absence the chair shall be taken by one of the vice-presidents. In the absence of all the above-named officers a chairman shall be elected by the committee of the society. The president shall, however, always be at liberty, even though he himself be present, to request one of the vice-presidents to take the chair.

13 During each meeting of the society the ruling of the chairman shall be final on all points concerning the order and courtesy of debate. No question shall be raised afterwards as to the conduct of any debate or the ruling of the chairman except at a special meeting of the society convened for the purpose. The president shall call such a meeting if requested in writing to do so by at least ten members, within one week of the debate referred to, but no motion shall be declared carried at such a meeting unless approved by two-thirds of the members present.

Serampore College Serampore—*contd*—SHARP The Hon'ble Mr H—SHASTRI Dr PRABHU DUTT

14 At each meeting of the society after the reading of the minutes of the previous meeting time not exceeding ten minutes shall be allowed for questions to be asked of the officers of the society or of any affiliated society or club

15 The agenda of each meeting of the society shall be prepared by the secretary and submitted to the committee No variation from the agenda shall be allowed except with the consent of the majority of the members present at any meeting of the society Any member however may give notice at any meeting of the society of his intention to bring forward any resolution at the first convenient opportunity and on such notice having been given it shall be the duty of the committee to arrange such an opportunity as early as possible with due regard to the claims of other business

16 No alteration shall be made in the rules of the society except with the consent of at least two thirds of the members present at an ordinary meeting of the society written notice of the proposed change having been handed to the chairman and announced by him to the members present at an ordinary meeting of the society at least 14 days previous to the meeting in which the proposed change is voted upon

SHARP, The Hon'ble Mr H

As regards hostels (and incidentally messes and lodgings if such are retained) I should say that —

- (a) They should be college institutions under the principal Exceptions may be made in the case of special communities e.g. Musalmans Buddhists etc Such hostels may be under the University or a joint committee of the colleges concerned
- (b) The superintendent should be a professor and should have extensive powers under the general control of the principal
- (c) As much of the control and management as is possible should be delegated to monitors and the messing arrangements to a committee of students Medical officers should inspect hostels which should be under the same obligation as schools and colleges in regard to overcrowding insanitary conditions etc
- (d) I have nothing particular to say under this head save that it is sometimes complained that hostels are luxurious and tend to make the humbler class of boys discontented with their homes I am doubtful if there is much foundation for this complaint I would not for example object to electric light in hostels It saves eyesight and teaches the advantage of reading by a good light
- (e) A hostel or a block of hostel should be of the size manageable by a superintendent : e.g. it should hold about 50 boarders
- (f) The superintendent should give tutorial assistance He cannot do this in all subjects but he should do what he can

It is difficult to have regard to financial possibilities because if local universities are started and if Calcutta colleges confine their admissions to *bond fide* Calcutta students there will be some rearrangement and it cannot be foreseen how many students will require hostel accommodation The cost of hostel accommodation in the mofussil is considerably less than in Calcutta Superintendents should receive allowances

SHASTRI, Dr PRABHU DUTT

- (a) Hostels and messes should be under the direct control of colleges but should be open to inspection by the University as well ~
- (b) The superintendent should be one of the senior professors of the college and should be directly responsible for the discipline of the resident students He should be assisted by a number of assistant superintendents (the number to depend on the size of the hostel) and by a steward

SHASTRI Dr PRABHU DUTT—*contd*—SHRI. REV T E T SINHA, KUMAR MANINDRA CHANDRA

- (c) All matters of routine should be in the hands of the steward, who should also be in charge of the dining hall. Each ward should be controlled by an 'assistant superintendent', the hostel as a whole being under the charge of the superintendent. The superintendent and his assistant should also be able to offer some tutorial assistance to students to conduct their debating clubs and to organise excursions.
- (d) There should be one or more common rooms for students in every hostel.

SHRI. REV T E T

- (a) Hostels and "attached houses" should be controlled directly by the colleges to which they are attached and the University should exercise its control through the colleges and the residential arrangements of each college should be included in the periodical inspection by university officers.
- (b) The superintendent must be given a status which will give him complete authority over the students outside of the college class rooms. I would again look to the house master of an English public school as offering the best example, within my own experience, of the kind of relationship which should exist between the superintendent and his students.
- (c) I should bring the students themselves into the management, as far as possible letting each of them undertake in rotation responsible duties connected with the messing arrangements, library games, etc. The principal of the college should be personally responsible for inspection, but might delegate the actual duty to a senior member of his staff. Speaking generally, I should be in favour of securing the most competent men possible as superintendents and then reducing inspection to a minimum.
- (d) A hostel should, if possible, consist entirely of single rooms, however small in size, simply furnished on a uniform scale, each student being responsible for the care of furniture and the cleanliness and good order of his room.
- The kitchen, with dining-room adjoining, should be detached from the main building and connected by a covered verandah—the bathing place should be contiguous. The arrangements, furniture and equipment would vary to some extent according as the students were Hindus, Muhammadans, Christians, or Brahmos.
- A sick-room should be provided with conveniences for isolating infectious cases and latrine accommodation, and there should be common rooms for the students, including a small library containing books of general interest and selected fiction lying outside the course of the college studies.
- (e) The best size for hostels is one affording accommodation for about 40 students.
- (f) If, as I advocate, the hostel superintendent is a member of the college staff, he and his assistant would naturally assist the boarders in their studies and it is desirable that they should do so.

SINHA, KUMAR MANINDRA CHANDRA.

- (a), (b), (c), (d), (e) and (f) The University should have direct control over hostels by the appointment of committees to carry out these functions. The superintendent should be under the orders of this committee, the committee should look into the proper equipment and arrangements of hostels, should judge the size of hostels, and should insist upon the introduction of a tutorial system. It is on the proper management of such hostels that the future success of students will depend.

SINHA PANCHANAN—SINHA UPENDRA NARAYAN—SIRCAR, The Hon ble Sir NILRATAN
—SMITH W OWSTON

SINHA, PANCHANAN

Residence outside the family is a necessary evil. Hostels etc. should therefore be organised as much as possible on the lines of the family organisation. The superintendent should have family quarters attached to the hostel in order that the evil effects of hostel life may be minimised as much as possible.

- (a) Hostels and attached messes should be placed under the care of the colleges. The University may lay down certain general principles of management and ascertain by periodical inspection whether its directions are followed or not.
- (b) The superintendent should guide and control the students placed under his care and he must be given sufficient authority to have his commands obeyed and respected. The appointment and dismissal of cooks and servants and the proper upkeep of the sanitary arrangements of the hostel should be under his charge.
- (c) The management of messing and marketing and keeping of proper accounts should be entrusted to the students themselves. The ultimate control should be vested in the principal and the college authorities who will arrange for inspection of hostels and attached messes under them.
- (d) The rooms should in general accommodate three students each. Each student should have a bedstead, one table, one stool, one shelf and one rack for clothes provided by the college. Students should provide their bedding, dishes and other furniture. Each hostel should have at least two dining rooms, one kitchen, one store room, one room for the sick and a small library. *The accommodation should be provided by the State free of rent.*
- (e) I consider a hostel accommodating 20 to 25 students to be of the best size.
- (f) It is desirable to provide tutorial assistance in hostels. The work may be entrusted to superintendents and a special fee may be levied for the purpose.

SINHA UPENDRA NARAYAN

- (a) As it exists at present.
- (b) The same as under regulations now in force.
- (c) As at present.
- (d) There should be a separate room in each hostel or in each unattached mess for the treatment of illness. There should also be a library in each hostel.

SIRCAR, The Hon ble Sir NILRATAN

The size of hostels should not be large. The best size would be such as would accommodate 30 students.

The food supplied to the students at present is quite unfit for student life. Hospital and jail dietary has been settled long ago after careful enquiry made by committees but this important matter which affects the health of thousands of our young men has received no attention up to this time.

SMITH, W OWSTON

I feel so strongly that everything depends upon the kind of men put in charge of hostels that until that point is settled it seems useless to answer in the void. I have had a long and intimate experience of hostels and have often drawn plans and organised methods of management designed to secure the co-operation of the student to encourage *esprit de corps* to prevent vice and sedition. But in wrong hands the powers given might be used to promote the very things which I wish to prevent.

SMITH, W. OWSTON—*contd.*—SUMMERSEN, F. W. SUHRAWARDY, HASSAN.

I regret that pressure of work in connection with the new University of Patna, and the attempt both to complete my old work at Bankipur and to prepare for my new duties at Indore, make it impossible for me to go into these questions more fully. But if I wrote a volume it would only amount to this: Make great efforts to get good men with high ideals, ability, scholarship, and sense, and when you have got them let them work freely. (If it be considered proper to mention names I would say such men as Charles Russell, H. R. James, John Mitchell, and Rev. William Machin of Lucknow.)

SUMMERSEN, F. W.

It is difficult to make suggestions regarding residential arrangements for students that are financially practicable. Any attempt to grapple with the problem in Calcutta with the present congested colleges involves expenditure out of all possible consideration. But I should urge that the jail or workhouse type of buildings that seems to be specially in favour just now in Calcutta for the new hostels that are being erected out of Government grants have not much of an academic appearance about them and are not very favourable to the development of corporate life.

The best hotels are single-range ones containing about 50 boarders, with a resident professor provided with family quarters in the immediate proximity. A cook-shed and subsidiary arrangements should be provided for this as a unit. A hostel system may have any number of such units, the only essentials being that sufficient space be left intervening and that sanitary arrangements be centralised. All this is of course impossible in Calcutta, but in the mofussil it should be comparatively inexpensive.

Unattached messes and lodgings should be abolished when hostels are sufficient for needs.

In regard to hostels and attached messes —

- (a) These institutions should be under the immediate control of the college concerned, the University exercising general supervision.
- (b) Hostel superintendents should be professors or lecturers of the college and should actually live in the hostel or in adjoining quarters with their families. This is the nearest approach possible in India to the "house system" of English public schools.
- (c) The management of the hostel in respect of its food supply should be largely in the hands of the students, who should appoint a mess committee and make a rota of students for purchases in the bazar. The servants should, however, be appointed and dismissed by the superintendents, who should also see that the hostel is run economically and satisfactorily and that the account books are kept in a business-like way. All matters of discipline must be in the hands of the superintendent, whose control must be absolute.
- (d) It is not possible to enter into details as to the proper equipment of a hostel without differentiating between Calcutta and mofussil hostels. In the hostels recommended above the dining-halls and kitchens are separate buildings, the furniture is of the simplest—a *charpoy*, a table, a stool, a shelf, and a row of pegs.
- (e) Hostels should not be for a larger number than 50 to reduce expenditure; many blocks may be provided on adjoining sites. The rooms should be generally three-seated and give 70 square feet for each student.
- (f) With a number of hostel blocks located in a given area, each under the supervision of a resident superintendent, a certain amount of tutorial assistance is possible.

SUHRAWARDY, HASSAN

- (b) The functions and status of a superintendent of a mess or hostel should be like that of a proctor in a British university town.

He should also be a man capable of creating confidence by social intercourse with the students and instilling comradeship of corporate university life.

SUHRAWARDY HASSAN—*contd*—SUHRAWARDY Z R ZAHID—TOWLE J H

- (c) The superintendent should have a managing committee consisting of elected students who should control all internal affairs
- (d) Kitchen and dining room should be inspected daily by the superintendent who should also partake of at least one meal a day with the pupils in the dining room. Proper arrangements should be made for the treatment of the sick in every hostel
- (e) Instead of having a very big hostel capable of giving accommodation to a large number of students it is better to have a group of similar institutions where supervision management and control can be easily exercised overcrowding prevented and personal touch with the superintendent ensured. Accommodation for about 50 pupils seems to be the outside limit.
- (f) Is very desirable
If for financial reasons groups of small self contained hostels cannot be built it is very desirable to have a number of assistant superintendents whose personal contact with the boys will be useful.
They may also hold tutorial classes and act as resident tutors

SUHRAWARDY Z R ZAHID

As I have already said I am not in favour of messes and lodgings as distinct from hostels

- (a) Colleges should provide their own hostels under their immediate control under the supervision of the University
- (b) The superintendent should be one of the teaching staff of the college with a free hand in the management of the institution in his charge
- (c) There should be periodical inspection by the members of the committee of management of the hostel or by visitors appointed for the purpose or by the university inspecting staff. The control of the hostel should primarily rest in the superintendent who will be under the guidance of the principal
- (d) A hostel should be equipped with bare necessities and not more than two students should be put in a room. Efforts should be made to accommodate such students in one place as may mess together thus simplifying kitchen and dining room arrangements. Where necessary separate kitchen and dining room arrangements should be provided in view of different castes and different modes of life but students should not be allowed to make their own mess arrangements
- (e) Ordinarily a hostel should not accommodate more than 50 students
- (f) Tutorial classes should be held in the evening in the presence and under the direction of a professor

TOWLE J H

I will take lodgings and messes first

I do not think that students should be allowed to live in messes and lodgings without any form of supervision or discipline. Such private enterprises as messes and lodgings ought at any rate to be subject to a system of licences under the control of the college or University to ensure that the accommodation is reasonably healthy and clean and the surroundings do not demoralise the student.

As to hostels the question requires fuller consideration. Given reasonable financial provision I think that the following arrangements would be both possible and highly desirable—

The hostel building should be constructed preferably to allow one student per room. It will be impossible the room should contain three students. Each hostel should have accommodation for not more than 75 students—personally I think 50 is the more manageable number. Besides students rooms there should be quarters for the assistant tutor or superintendent as the case may be. There

TOWLE, J. H. *contd.*

should also be one reading or recreation room, and unless hostels are to be grouped into larger units, there should be a dining-hall if caste observances admit. Similarly, there should be either a room or small building for religious observances.

The sanitary arrangements for such a hostel will be easy to make in places where there is a good water-supply and a drainage system, but in all cases great attention should be paid to the free access of air and sunlight to the latrines and bathrooms. I mention this point as it is so frequently overlooked in designing students' quarters. In each hostel there should be a sick-room for the reception of emergent cases of illness or accident. The hostel should in all cases be capable of complete closing at night.

If there be a larger unit than that of a hostel for collegiate or university purposes then I would suggest that such unit be composed of not more than four hostels, that is to say, it would provide for the residence of a maximum of 300 students. In this case, it would be possible to have a common dining-hall for all students of the unit, also a library and common playing-fields. Medical treatment would be more efficiently provided in such a unit, *e.g.*, there should be a dispensary in charge of a qualified man.

As regards the management and control of hostels, together with their relationship to a college or university, I beg to offer the following suggestions —

Each hostel should have its own menial staff working directly under the assistant tutor or the superintendent. The superintendent, as mentioned above, should be a resident officer. The machinery of hostel life should be controlled by him. He should also have disciplinary power in case of minor offences. I consider that the best type of assistant tutor would be found in the junior ranks of a collegiate teaching staff. In any case, the superintendent must be a man of education if he is to deal satisfactorily with his students. Above this superintendent, it is not easy to say whether there should be only the principal of the college, or a member of the teaching staff entrusted with tutorial duties (using "tutorial" in the Cambridge sense of the word). If the college is large I think the tutor becomes a necessity. He should be adequately remunerated for this extra work and his teaching work should be lightened. He should be required to live within reasonable distance of his hostel. His powers should be considerable and should include all minor matters of discipline, together with the right to recommend expulsion or rustication. The tutor will command more influence if he be also a professor of the college. Ability to play and organise games is highly desirable.

If hostels be organised in the larger unit, as mentioned above, it may be possible to do away with the tutor altogether and to make the assistant tutor or the superintendent responsible directly to the man in charge of the larger unit, who may be called "Warden". It is clear that the warden is in an entirely different position from that of a tutor. He should be a man of very high standing in the college or University and, preferably, a man who does some of the higher teaching, because his influence will be greater on that account; but he will be able to do very little teaching. His duty will be to manage this larger unit. He will exercise the right of punishment in all cases not delegated to the assistant tutor, and there should be no appeal against his decision even in case of expulsion or rustication. The warden will require at any rate one assistant who can relieve him of some of the hostel work, *e.g.*, organisation of games and societies. The warden should try to know as many of his men as possible. The certificate of the warden as to his attainments and character should be held as a most important credential for a university student. The warden should have considerable independence if he is to make his unit a success and to encourage *esprit de corps*.

These large units can be organised for games purposes, firstly, by hostels for competition among themselves, and, secondly, as a single body for competition with external teams or clubs.

TOWLE J H—*contd*—TURNER F C—VACHASPATI SITI KANTHA.

The principal of the college or the vice chancellor of the University as the case may be should have advisory and supervisory powers over wardens but in no case should he have the right to interfere with the internal discipline of the warden's unit.

This brings us to the connection between the hostels and the college or University. Personally I think hostels should form an integral part of the colleges and the college should be the teaching unit attended by the students residing in the different groups of hostels. It is possible however that a university may rise in which there are no colleges all teaching being provided by the University. In this case the wardens would report direct to the Senate of the University. While the Senate through the vice chancellor should exercise advisory and supervisory powers excluding matters of internal discipline in which the warden's authority should be supreme.

(f) Finally this subsection raises the question of tuition in hostels. I think this idea has many points to recommend it. So far as it is possible the assistant tutor or the tutor preferably the latter should give tutorial work in his own subject among the men of his own hostel. If there is no tutor for each hostel then some arrangement would have to be made for lecturers or professors outside the hostel staff to give tuition.

It would be perfectly impossible to expect a warden to give much of this tuition. On the whole such tuition in my opinion should be given through the hostel organisation. To bring an external authority into the hostel in this country is likely to lead to trouble. If therefore it be impossible to arrange for this tuition through the hostel staff I am inclined to think that it would be better not to consider it as a part of the hostel arrangements but as a part of the college teaching.

It will be noted that an effective tutorial system will require quite a large staff in fact a considerably greater staff than is possessed by most Indian colleges at present.

The above note has not discussed details as the time at my disposal was sufficient only to lay down general lines.

TURNER F C

(a) I consider that the University should not be called upon to assist colleges in residential arrangements for their students except by providing building or maintenance grants where these are possible. The university inspectors of colleges should however inspect residential arrangements and in cases in which these are inadequate the college should be compelled to reduce its numbers. A possible method of compulsion would be to cause the college to forfeit to the University the whole or part of the fees of students for whom residential accommodation has not been provided.

(e) The best size for hostels is determined by the number of students with whom the superintendent can form and maintain human relations. This number depends on the personality of the superintendent but 50 may be taken as a maximum. In hostels of under 25 boarders a corporate spirit can with difficulty be maintained.

VACHASPATI SITI KANTHA

Students should live wherever possible with their parents and guardians and in the midst of family influences. In other cases students must live in hostels and attached messes under proper supervision.

(a) and (c) Hostels and attached messes should be under the management and control of the college authorities who should be responsible for proper management to the University. Occasional inspection of these institutions by university inspectors is desirable.

VACHASPATI, SITI KANTHA *contd* — VIDYABHUSAN, RAJENDRANATH and VIDYABHUSANA, Mahamahopadhyaya Dr SATIS CHANDRA—WAHEED, Shams-ul-Ulama ABU NASR—WATHEN, G A — WILLIAMS, Rev. GARFIELD

- (b) and (f) A professor of the college or any other educationist of high merit should be the superintendent. He will frame rules and exercise authority over the students in respect of management and control of the institution, and should give tutorial assistance to the students.
- (d) Hostels should possess a decent library, a common room, and a debating club. The kitchen and dining-room should be at some distance from the residential part. A medical practitioner should be engaged for hostels. He, however, need not occupy the hostel premises.
- (e) A hostel should accommodate fifty students, and not more.

VIDYABHUSAN, RAJENDRANATH, and
VIDYABHUSANA, Mahamahopadhyaya Dr. SATIS CHANDRA.

The general answer to these queries is—Students should live, wherever possible, with their parents and guardians and in the midst of family influences. In other cases, students must reside in hostels or attached messes under proper supervision. Hostels for college students should be under the control of the college authorities, who will be responsible for proper management and supervision to the University. The superintendent should be an educational officer of high merit. It is desirable to provide for tutorial assistance, boarders should be given every facility to manage their own affairs under the guidance of the Superintendent.

WAHEED, Shams-ul-Ulama ABU NASR

My suggestions regarding hostels and messes are the following —

- (i) The tutorial system should be introduced in hostels.
- (ii) Hostels and messes should be under the personal supervision of teachers of exemplary character of the same religious denomination.
- (iii) Provision for separate reading-rooms and dormitories.
- (iv) Religious observances should be strictly enforced, especially in case of Muhammadans.
- (v) A prayer-room for Muhammadans should be set apart.
- (vi) Weekly lectures on moral and religious subjects.
- (vii) The superintendents should be men of exemplary character and piety who can conduct prayers and deliver suitable lectures on religious subjects.

WATHEN, G A

I have had much experience in regard to residential arrangements for students. These should, I think, be controlled always by the college authorities. In charge of each should be a warden who should be a professor or a lecturer, under him a superintendent whose duties would be largely those of a housekeeper or matron in the boarding-house of a public school. The warden would be responsible for the discipline, the superintendent for kitchen arrangements. Each hostel should have about 50 students, under a warden. Each college should have a sanatorium, a doctor, a large common room, and a library for its resident students. I think the ideal is a college of 500, with 10 hostels, 10 wardens, 5 superintendents, and 10 messes.

WILLIAMS, Rev GARFIELD

- (a) Hostels should be entirely under the control of college authorities. But in the terms of affiliation the University should lay down its minimum requirements in respect of residential quarters, and no college should be affiliated which is not prepared to comply with these minimum requirements. Probably

WILLIAMS REV CARIFLD—*contd*—WILLOUGHBY R W D

there should be a special sub committee of the board of control whose duty it would be to see that these requirements in respect of students residences were complied with and to deal with all questions which might arise in respect of the college's agreement with the University made at the time of affiliation. Apart from this the University *qua* University should have no control whatever over the hostel. But it must be clearly understood that this contemplates the elimination of all hostels not under the direct and absolute control of some college affiliated to the University.

I have no hesitation in discarding the attached mess as an institution utterly unworthy of a university.

- (b) Under the scheme outlined above the principal of a college would be the ultimate authority in all residential quarters attached to the college and under him would be a number of tutors and some of the University professorial staff. Some of these would act as wardens and superintendents of the various residences. Such wardens would be in respect of all actual hostel administration the final authority under the principal and great latitude should be allowed to colleges in their methods of conducting and controlling hostels. The University should not interfere with anything provided the moral physical and intellectual well being of the students is properly guaranteed by arrangements approved by them in their original agreement. In almost all cases the superintendent will be a recognised University professor or tutor and one of the rules that the University will lay down as an *essential* to affiliation will be that proper accommodation and arrangements for *resident* tutors (whether superintendents or not) exist in all hostels.
- (c) Apart from the inspection indicated above the management control and inspection should be in the hands of the college authorities and great latitude should be allowed in respect of them.
- (d) Single rooms adequate lighting and ventilation and protection from sun and rain. Kitchens and dining room arrangements should be in a separate block joined to the quarters by a covered way. And they should be so constructed that they can be transformed at will into separate messes or a common mess.

The college library would always be at the disposal of the hostel students but a reading room and one or two common rooms should be provided.

If possible a small wing with two rooms should be set aside for illness.

(e) Not less than 30 and not more than 50 in each block.

(f) Something more than a desideratum in my view an essential.

There is absolutely no reason why these hostels should be expensive buildings. They must however have attached to them accommodation for both married and single professors and open spaces for athletics and if possible gardens. Such a hostel is impossible if the University remains where it is.

WILLOUGHBY R W D

Co operation is an alarming word but it really means something almost ludicrously simple. The whole progress of humanity is a history of how men learnt *work together* and all that co operation means is working together. It follows from this that in so far as we are civilised and removed from the primitive individualistic savage we are already to a high degree co operative. The whole organisation of our lives so far as it is organised is already co operative—even in the most remote and primitive Indian village. Our administration our commerce industries our domestic life the whole fabric of our culture is only possible because we are people who work together with a more or less clear conception of our own job—what particular function in the great organism is ours. We can find a very striking illustration of this in the great war in which we are now engulfed. The difference between this war and past wars for instance the great world wars of the

WILLOUGHBY, R. W. D.—*contd*

last century, is chiefly this—that those were wars of armies and navies and this is a war of the nation, organised and co-operating from the general in the field and the admiral on the seas down to the women who are making our shell, cutting our harvest, driving our motor cars and to the small boys who are guarding our coasts and performing the hundred useful functions of the boy scout. Our factories, our farms and our clerks are nearly as important as our armies and navies and are part of the same organisation. The co-operative national structure is one of the great lessons which Germany is forcing on the world and our success depends on our learning the lesson and directing its result to finer ends. If then civilisation is already co-operative the natural question arises as to what is the point of the co-operative movement if it represents only a sort of pious exhortation to go on doing what we are doing.

What justification have I got to come here and talk to you about things which you all know as well as I do and many of you probably much better?

The answer is I think this—that huge classes of humanity, not only in India and often the most important classes from an economic point of view are *not* working together as they might and without help and instruction show no signs of beginning to do so. Now the most obvious and largest of these classes (especially in India) is the cultivating peasant, and hence the fact that in India the co-operative movement finds its primary and most important field among the agricultural population, but it is important that co-operation itself should not be identified with one of its developments, and that you should not think of it as meaning village banks or college stores. Co-operation is an attitude towards life.

Now there are certain elements of the economic body which have under the pressure of advancing civilisation been organised or organised themselves to work together more or less effectively, but there are others which are hardly organised at all. The administrative sections of most nations, the industrial and the military sections, have learnt to play into each other's hands, to work together because they are subject and have for some time been subject to fierce international competition. But there are, even in a highly developed nation such as England, two elements of the community where such mutual adjustment is rudimentary—the agricultural producer and the consumer of agricultural products. It will be observed that the last section comprises every person in the nation, since every one eats and every one clothes himself and all food and clothes come from the land, but we are regarding each such person in his aspect as a consumer. If he is himself also an agricultural producer he can generally feed himself. Now such dislocation and failure of adjustment means a gap. That gap has to be filled somehow and a class of man always springs up to fill it. He is very often quite well organised for his own ends and so long as the gap exists he is necessary and performs a useful function. This kind of man in the case of the two classes we have in view is roughly the middleman and moneylender. To leave these vague generalities and come to the concrete conditions with which we are mainly concerned I propose to consider the two classes indicated as they exist in India. We have then on the one hand, the cultivator and, on the other hand, the class which does not live on the land, but has to buy at shops all it eats and all the clothes it puts on—a class to which you and I belong. In India the cultivator is a very big and very important man indeed. Economically he is a giant who dwarfs the rest of us to pigmydom. Our industries are comparatively insignificant, or, to put it in another way, agriculture is our main industry—overwhelmingly so. We are all sitting on the shoulders of the cultivator and if we can add 5 or 10 per cent to his powers of production it means a growth of crores in the wealth of India and a corresponding increase in the standards and possibilities of the whole of Indian life. Now the cultivator needs a lot of things, but he needs perhaps most of all water, seed and money and the greatest of these needs is money. Water is supplied by the heavens if they are kindly—though water is not always sufficient or available where it is most wanted. Seed he can manage for himself if he has a crop—though not always good seed. Money he *must* get from some outside source and he has usually to borrow at something over 25 per cent, sometimes very much higher. Now the cultivator is generally an honest man and a hard-working man, he is attached to his fields and he usually discharges his debts. Does it not then strike you as curious that he should have to pay 25–33 per cent for the money without which he cannot raise his crop, while there are crores

WILLOUGHBY P W D—contd

of rupees all over India seeking investment at much lower rates of interest? The wild joint stock concerns which failed in the recent banking crises found thousands of confiding persons to lend them large sums at 5 or 6 per cent. There is obviously something very wrong here—there is one of these bad gaps we are talking about. Why do not the great bankers and all the persons who have more money than they can use themselves lend money to the cultivator—if he is an honest man and can afford to pay a very good return on the money? Because he has no security and no prudent man will lend money to a man he knows nothing about personally unless good security is offered. The individual cultivator has normally nothing he can offer in the shape of security—he has no transferable rights in his tenancy, he has no solid property of the type of buildings etc. He has only his labour and his honesty. But how is the distant bank or capitalist to know that this particular man is honest and laborious? He can't know this and therefore won't lend. So a class of men springs up to bridge the gap. He gets to know the individual cultivator more or less and he lends him money at high interest—taking his risk. The village moneylender charges this high interest not because he is a rapacious blood sucker or a grinder of the face of the poor or any other of the unkind things that are said about him (the village *bania* is often quite a decent individual and he performs an indispensable function) but because he is taking big risks—he has no security. So the problem is how to find a security which the cultivator can offer. This security can be found—like most things—through organisation and combination. If in a small village the more substantial and honest cultivators band themselves together to be jointly and unlimitedly responsible for each other's debts to assess each other's real credit and to watch jealously that the money which they have jointly borrowed is so spent by each of the members that it will produce more money—you have got security and quite good security—and where you have got security you have got credit. A man lending to such an association is in a very different position to the ordinary moneylender. If one of the cultivators forming the association turns dishonest or lazy, he has the others to fall back on—to their *la tanna*—and moreover he knows that a member of the society is not likely to turn dishonest or lazy because all the others will watch him for their own sakes and will see that he does not borrow too much and that he applies what he does borrow to productive expenditure (selection and supervision) explain. This rather crudely put is the principle of agricultural credit co-operation. It is not mysterious and it is not magical—it is simply an example of the obvious fact that a lot of people working together can do things better than the same people trying to do the same things each by himself. But co-operation does not stop at creating security or credit—the two things are identical—it goes on to create capital. It would be little use calling societies into existence which were to go on till Doomsday borrowing money at 12 per cent. The co-operative society's function is not only to enable its member to borrow from new sources and at rate at which he could not borrow before but also to enable him to do the opposite to save and amass capital—which he equally could not do before except in a wholly uneconomical way. Supposing the *kashikar* has had a couple of good years and has made more money than he can conveniently put into his cultivation—he has now nothing to do with it except to hide it or to convert it into ornaments. In both cases it may be stolen and in neither case is it of any use to himself or the community. It is earning him nothing and it is earning nobody else anything. He is too small a man to start moneylending on his own account. You can't set up as a local Shylock on five or ten rupees. Therefore he as often as not spends it on something quite useless or foolish and when the procession of lean years is upon him he has to stand up and face it with empty hands. Now the small Raiffeisen societies or poor cultivators in Europe seem to have had a stronger instinct than the Indian peasant towards thrift—for even in the most poverty stricken and usury ridden tracts they began from the outset to put their few annas of savings into their societies and it was not long before these societies became independent of outside borrowing. But in India it has proved very difficult to inculcate thrift in the village. There are many reasons for this which I have not time to enter into here beyond saying that it is not reasonable to expect the peasant to deposit money in his society till he has paid off all his old mahajan debts and so long as he can put the money into his land with greater advantage. So we induce him to save money despite himself by the share system and from his society margin of interest. By the second I mean that while the primary society borrows from its financing

WILLOUGHBY, R W D.—*contd.*

agency at say 12 per cent. it levies interest from its members at 15 per cent and the margin of profit goes to the societies' own capital. By the share system I mean this—each member has to take according to his status one, two, three or more shares. The share is of say Rs 20 and is fully paid up in 10 years. Each man accordingly pays one rupee a *fasl* for each share. The sum thus accumulating also goes to swell the working capital of the society as a whole. These two factors result in the case of a normally healthy society in its owning within five years or so more than half the capital which its members are employing and when the shares are fully paid up the society should own at least its whole original working capital. When the ten years are up, the members will begin to divide the profits according to their shareholding and could of course, if they like, reduce the rate of interest their society charges to its members. One of the main functions of a central co-operative bank is thus the paradoxical one of teaching its societies, how to stop borrowing from it. A really co-operative society should, when it has reached this stage, be its own banker, possess substantial capital and greatly improve its production and the standard of living among its members. This process has of course a moral side on which there is no time to enlarge—but it is obvious that the continuous responsibility, mutual dependance and mutual vigilance must induce a corporate sense strongly discouraging to quarrelling, drunkenness, gambling and other antisocial practices—as has been found in actual fact. This sketch of the ordinary primary agricultural credit society is necessarily compressed and bald, but will perhaps give an idea of the bulk of our work. It is by no means the only way in which co operation can raise the cultivator in the scale of life though it is the first and indispensable way in which he can be helped to help himself—for until he has been shown how to emerge from the quagmire of sempiternal debt, how to acquire credit and to possess capital he cannot begin to work out his own salvation. Once he has emerged, having learnt the lesson of organisation, it requires small stretch of imagination to perceive that co operation will bring within his reach the improved seed that will both increase and improve his out-turn, the tube wells and other wells that will cause his dry lands to grow green and the spectre of famine to fade into the distance, the manure that will enrich his harvests and the improved implements and power plant that will help him to face the rising cost of bullock power and manual labour. In many of these directions co-operation has made good its footing—notably in the matter of seeds, wells and implements. We have made a beginning with cattle insurance—a matter of vital importance to a man whose chief agricultural capital may be swept away in a few days by epidemic disease and there are still further developments looming on the horizon. I have spoken of the gap, the failure of adjustment between the producing and consuming classes and the growth of a necessary, but parasitic body of men to bridge the gap. The cultivator has brought his crop to harvest, he has been relieved of something of the crushing burden of interest on the money he has borrowed to raise it, he has even organised his supply of seed, of water, of manure, of implements, of cattle. He still does not reap the full value of his produce. He must sell to a small dealer, who sells to a larger dealer, who may sell to a big wholesaler, who in turn sells to a retailer, who sells to you and me. Each of these worthy persons levies his toll and performs no indispensable economic function. So long as the gap exists it must be bridged, but if the cultivator and the consumer could join hands to bridge it themselves, the cultivator and you and I could put those tolls in our pocket—and there would be quite a pretty penny to divide. Now recently a number of societies in two or three districts have combined together to put on the rail a considerable quantity of the new Pusa 12 wheat grown from seed obtained through co operative agency which was consigned by the help of the Agricultural Department direct to the English market. One need not be a visionary to foresee a time when federations of co-operative societies will be loading their own trucks with agricultural produce and even opening their co operative sale depôts in Lucknow, Agra and other large cities. Such an association could afford to sell us, consumers, agricultural produce at cheaper rates while the cultivator was getting bigger prices for it.

This brings me to the other side of co operation to which I alluded at the beginning of these remarks. The consumer is in some ways as ill organised as the cultivator. I suggested that the fact that the honest and laborious cultivator can't get a loan at 15 per cent. when the dishonest company promoter could get any amount of money at 5 or 6

WILLOUGHBY R W D—*contd*

per cent showed clearly that there was something wrong. Does it not also strike you as somewhat surprising that while in villages not ten miles away pure milk does not fetch more than a rupee for 10 or 11 seers you have to pay a rupee for not more than 8 seers of milk of very doubtful purity?—that it is very hard to get ghee which is not adulterated and that even then you pay 50 per cent or so more than is received by the person who makes it? It is clear that there is something wrong here too. This is the other face of co operation—the organisation of the consumer. Development on this side is in India rudimentary so far but in England for instance it is far the most important aspect of co operation. The North of England in particular is covered with co operative stores and the great co operative who esales have huge turnovers which run into crores of rupees. In these provinces distributive co operation as it is called (apart from the distributive work in agricultural credit societies) is represented by the few co operative stores some of them at colleges and boarding houses—there is one quite successful one in Mirzapur city—and by enterprises like the yarn store by which the Sandila weaver has combined to cut himself loose from the middleman by getting reliable yarn at wholesale prices. The store is of particular interest to us here because it is a co operative enterprise which has been more successful in colleges boarding houses and hostels than elsewhere and because experiments have already been made with a co operative store in the Meerton hostel at Badshahbagh. It has even greater importance in my eyes because of its effect in bringing the educated youth of this country into practical contact with co operative ideas and business practice—a process which I conceive to be of vital importance not only to co operation but to you. I will revert to this point. Meanwhile it is of interest in connection with the mal adjustment—the gap—which I instanced in the matter of ghee and milk that a co operative society in a boarding house at Allahabad has tackled the problem with considerable success by getting into touch with a co operative ghee society and taking up most of their outturn and by arranging for a supply of milk from cows of their own.

I have said that the development of co operation on the distributive side—which for us means practically speaking co operative stores—has been rudimentary in this country as compared with Europe and also as compared to the progress made in credit co operation. The chief reasons for this difference are to be found in the contrast which obtains between the conditions here obtaining and those which prevail in western countries. The cardinal difference which governs the whole problem in India lies in the smallness of the margin between wholesale and retail prices. I mean by this that the shopkeeper in the Indian bazar has very much smaller expenses than his equivalent in say an English town. Rent and taxes are very low nothing is spent on plate glass or showy window dressing and the cost of establishment is very often practically negligible. In the bulk of cases the small shopkeeper has no assistance other than that of his own family—and their wages have not to be reckoned in when he is fixing the prices of his commodities. Moreover most trades in this country are hereditary and shops descend from father to son for generations so that the shopkeeper acquires a sort of ancestral *clientèle* of customers whose tastes and requirements he can gauge with extreme accuracy. These family connections engender mutual confidence and he is not only enabled to lay in a stock which will meet without exceeding his customers requirements but he can reduce to a minimum the risks of the credit sale system which is the almost invariable custom in the towns of North India. Now a co operative store has to compete with this retail system it has to keep up a paid establishment which eats into the profits and which is almost necessarily less efficient in buying and selling than the hereditary shopkeeper. Moreover a co operative store is often not in a good position to estimate the requirements of its members and is apt to be landed with surplus stock of unsaleable goods. It also loses interest on the large amount of capital locked up in credit sales and it sometimes suffers severely from bad debts. There is another factor which operates against the co operative store in India. In Europe shopping is done among the great mass of the population by the purchaser himself or herself. In India the upper classes and—wherever *parda* prevails—the middle classes also send servants to do their shopping. Servants do not get any *dashtori* from the co operative store and consequently do their best to deter their employers from resorting to them. In England most co operative stores give tokens or

WILLOUGHBY, R. W. D.—*contd*

counters to each person purchasing and at the end of the year a cash bonus proportionate to the profit made by the store to the person who produces the tokens. Now in the bulk of cases the women do the shopping for the family and appropriate this bonus as pocket money at the end of the year. Consequently the actual purchaser has there a strong motive to remain loyal to his store, whereas in India there is an equally strong and similar motive to make the actual purchaser abstain from dealing with the co-operative store.

Our experience, however, shows that success can reasonably be anticipated if certain definite conditions be given. The members of a store society must be recruited from a homogeneous community—they must be people all more or less of one sort—so that their requirements will be uniform and can be gauged with accuracy. A large Indian town ordinarily comprises a considerable variety of creeds, communities and castes whose habits of life differ very widely. Some are meat eaters, others vegetarians, some wear one type of clothing, others affect perfectly different styles and even materials. But unless the co-operative store can standardise its demand it is likely to be landed with a lot of stale and unsaleable stock. Secondly, the members must have acquired sufficient economic or co-operative training to appreciate the manifest advantages, both to themselves and to their society, of the cash system of business. Thirdly, the store must be able to command the honorary services of capable and disinterested persons with some business training or aptitude. This is essential in order to keep down the cost of establishment and to guard against the possibilities of embezzlement, dishonesty, or mere negligence on the part of the paid staff.

The conclusion which our experience has drawn from these considerations is that there are only two types of co-operative stores which can at present be recommended with any confidence. The first of these types is adapted to the requirements of the middle class residents of a small town or the inhabitants of a *mohalla* of a larger town most of whom belong to the same community or *stratum* of life. If the majority of members of such a society consist of, say, clerks, officials, and salary-earners whose income ranges from 30 to 100 rupees per mensem then requirements in the way of food and clothes are likely to be fairly uniform and if standard qualities are stocked and a little experience has been acquired there is not likely to be any large surplus of unsaleable stock at the end of the year. It is also likely that among such a community it may be found possible to secure men of business experience who are ready to devote to the store especially in its earlier stages—a certain amount of unpaid time and trouble. The members are all monthly wage-earners and it should not prove difficult to induce them to deposit at the beginning of each month a fixed amount in advance against purchases to be made during the month. From such a type of store moral as well as economic results may be anticipated. The members will gain familiarity with the advantages of thrift—it is an infectious and insidious virtue—thrift—and will probably begin to practise it in other directions. They may be led on to take a general interest in the co-operative movement, to found separate thrift and credit societies and even to associate themselves with the administration of the district bank—if one should exist in their district.

The second type of store which can now be recommended with considerable confidence—is that of which some of you have already some acquaintance—a store society for the members of a hostel or a large boarding house attached to a college. The requirements of students living in such a hostel are usually fairly uniform and are limited to standard articles of consumption. They have also the very great advantage of an *esprit de corps*—a communal sense and communal pride—which provides honorary management of a keen and capable type. Even where no store has been brought into existence it is, I understand, a common practice for students to pay for purchases in advance, and this essential feature will not therefore be felt as revolutionary or burdensome. Moreover the members have the great advantage of help and guidance from the superintending staff and the college can often help to save its running expenses by placing at its disposal a godown or store room. Apart from the saving to your pockets and the assurance of decent quality in what you buy, such an institution has, I think we can justly claim, considerable educational value. It is an object lesson in the elements of economics and contact with realities always stimulates interest. It will, I hope, attract the minds of many young students to

WILLOUGHBY R W D—*contd*

the economic and industrial problem which will loom so large before the India of to-morrow and whose solution is so vitally important for the future of our country. It will I hope impress on many minds—still plastic enough to retain the impression—the dignity and the romance of business and of labour. There has been as you probably know of late years a considerable movement in the direction of enlisting the support of the under-graduate in our older English universities to the co-operative organisation by the creation of such stores which are on a large scale and managed by the under-graduates themselves.

I would again emphasise the importance of eschewing credit. The system of advance deposits is, as experience shows, very easy to enforce in the case of a college store. It is often the case that the members of a hotel belong to so many messes. Each mess will then under this system deposit an advance with the store society and each individual will do the same for his separate requirements. The accounts are adjusted at the end of the month and the system will be found to weigh heavily on no one. The managing committee should themselves decide after full discussion what classes of commodity should be stocked and should as far as they can contrive it make the necessary purchases. It is also their duty to fix the prices current and when they can find the time to supervise the actual sales—particularly at unusually busy times. As little as possible of the higher management should be left to the paid staff. I and my department will be glad to help to settle the forms of books and accounts. One other point: every effort should be made to manage the business with capital raised within the society—and no money should ever be borrowed from outside without consulting a general meeting or the department as to the extent and terms of such borrowing. It is an excellent plan to keep us under stand to be the case: a store going for some little time before seeking registration. This is quite easy so long as you do not borrow money from outside. I would also impress on you that the audit of a store society, comprising as it does a complete stock-taking and valuation is a formidable business and should be done in sections and it is desirable that some of the members should volunteer to assist the auditor.

There is so much to do and so few of us to do it that I have not been able to find time to give more than a rambling and incomplete sketch of the meaning and scope of co-operation. I am profoundly impressed with the importance of the co-operative movement and my own job. I consider it about the most valuable work to which a man who has the interests of his country at heart can lay his hand. The economic problem of India is to my mind prior to the problems of education and politics. Till the body of the community has attained a certain level of organisation and standard of independent life neither politics nor education can have very much meaning or effect. Economic organisation means eventually both education and politics—lots of them—but it must precede them if they are to be in any sense national. Politics are at present meaningless to that gigantic but pathetic figure who represents the vast majority of our fellow citizens and a little ill-digested learning would lie precious sour on his empty stomach. In his case at least life must be made more worth living before education can touch him or politics interest him. The field that lies before us stretches over the horizon and a little understaffed Government department can only turn a few lonely furrows in the great expanse. The success that has been achieved is due in large measure to the unpaid labour and devotion of the gentlemen who direct the administration of our district and central banks and to the district officers' sympathy and guidance. But all these gentlemen have their own avocations and can only give us their spare time. They cannot do the spade work of preaching, organising, educating, supervising in the village and in the city. The labourers in this vineyard are lamentably few. For this our most essential work we need men and need them bitterly—men of the right type—and I look to the colleges and seminaries of the province to produce them. Unless the movement can attract them and compel their enthusiasm the economic regeneration of this province will be a halting, hard-fought and spasmodic struggle.

We need men to take up organisation and propaganda as a labour of unpaid patriotism and we need men to enter the service of our district and central banks. I can offer such men no bed of roses—the work is hard outdoor work and it needs long patience and great industry. It does not mean sitting in a bank office and telling other people to do things. It means going into the village and town and talking to the peasant and the

WILLOUGHBY, R. W. D.—*contd*

artisan about their own little affairs, explaining things over and over again which are as often forgotten, wrestling with apathy, with dishonesty, with stupidity. Nor can I offer such men high pay at the outset—though as the movement grows the banks are beginning to be able to offer their servants a not unattractive wage. But the work is interesting, healthy and inspiring and is perhaps (apart from the field of battle) the clearest opportunity of serving our country, which now presents itself—and India has never been lacking in men who have put the service of an ideal before the service of their personal ends.

BYE-LAWS OF THE HOSTEL CO-OPERATIVE SOCIETY LIMITED, ALLAHABAD

I Preliminary

1 In the construction of these bye-laws unless the contrary appears from the context, the words or expressions are used in the following sense —

- "The Hostel" for the Oxford and Cambridge Hostel, Allahabad
- "The Society" for the Hostel Co-operative Society, Limited
- "The President" for the president of the society for the time being.
- "The Secretary" for the general secretary of the society for the time being.
- "Member" for the member of the society
- "Month" for the calendar month
- "Year" for the academical year (July to June)

Words signifying the singular shall include the plural and *vice versa*

II Name and Objects

2. The society shall be called the "Hostel Co-operative Society, Limited, Allahabad;" and its registered office shall be in the Oxford and Cambridge Hostel, Allahabad

3 The objects of the society are —

- (a) To assist its members in obtaining the necessaries of life and such other things that are generally required by students, at reasonable rates
- (b) To receive deposits from members and thereby promote thrift
- (c) To do any other co-operative business approved of by the general meeting of the society and sanctioned by the Registrar of the Co-operative Societies
- (d) To promote and assist the development of co-operative ideas and enterprise and to encourage thrift, mutual help and spirit of fellow-feeling generally

III Capital

4 The capital shall consist of —

- (a) An undetermined number of shares of the nominal value of Rs 10 each
- (b) Deposits from shareholders
- (c) Advance money from purchasers
- (d) Loans.

5 Each share shall be payable as follows —

With application Re 1 on allotment Rs 4. The liability of a member for the debts owned by the society shall be limited to the nominal value of a share or shares held by him

6 The following shall be eligible for membership —

- (a) Present and past hostellers
- (b) Present and past members of the staff of the hostel

7 The intending members shall sign a prescribed application form and when admitted to membership on payment of the allotment money (Rs 4) shall receive a certificate of membership signed by the President and the Secretary

WILLOUGHBY R W D—*contd*

8 The approved applicant shall pay Rs 4 on each allotted share within two weeks from the date of intimation given to him failing which the application money (*i.e.* Re 1) will be forfeited and the reserved share shall be withheld

9 Each member must hold at least one share in the society

10 No member shall at any time hold more than ten shares

11 Membership shall cease on —

(a) Withdrawal —

(b) Expulsion

(c) Death

12 A member wishing to withdraw shall make an application to the Secretary who will lay it before the Board of Directors for necessary consideration

13 A member may be expelled or removed by the Board subject to the sanction of a general meeting—

(a) For failure to make payments due from him

(b) For dishonest dealings with and attempts to injure the society

14 A member who in connection with the society has ceased under bye laws 11 (a) and (b) or his heir under 11(c) shall be entitled to the repayment of the money to his credit subject to the deductions under bye law 15 provided that if he is expelled the whole or part of the balance due to him may be withheld by the Board together with the value of the shares held by him

15 Any member who ceases to be such shall remain liable for any money he owes to the society

16 The liability of a past member for the debt of the society as they existed at the time when he ceased to be a member shall continue for a period of two years from the date of his ceasing to be a member

17 A member ceasing to be such (under 11(a)) or his heir in case of his death (*vide* 11(c)) shall apply to the Board who will make arrangements for the transfer of his shares

18 All applications for transfer shall be disposed of before any new shares are issued and proceeds thereof remitted to the former owners

19 All applications for transfer must be made to the Secretary between 20th March and 25th July or when leaving the Hostel

20 Share money and other sums due under bye law 14 which remain unclaimed for three years shall be forfeited to the society

21 (a) If any member fails to pay any instalment on or before the day appointed for the payment thereof a penalty of an anna per day shall accrue from the said day provided that the maximum penalty shall not exceed Re 1 in the case of any one such default

(b) If the instalments be not paid within a month from such default the Board may serve a notice on such member requiring him to pay on a fixed date such dues and fines on pain of the share in respect of which such due is payable being forfeited without any further reference to the member concerned

22 The Board may re allot or otherwise dispose of any forfeited share as they think fit Fines shall be credited to the current accounts of the society

II General Meeting

23 The supreme authority shall be vested in the General Meeting of the shareholders

24 A general meeting will be held—

(a) In August (called the Annual General Meeting)

(b) Whenever summoned by the Board or the President (called an extraordinary general meeting)

25 In a general meeting every shareholder shall have one vote which shall be given personally

26 One fifth of the members residing in the hostel shall form a quorum In case of a meeting adjourned for want of quorum and held again no quorum shall be required

27 At least two days notice specifying the date hour and place of the meeting and the business to be laid before it shall be given to the members

WITTOUGHBY, R. W. D. *contd.*

28 (A) The Annual General meeting shall —

- (a) Elect a president and the directors for the year from among the members of the society, residing in the Hostel
- (b) Remove them according to these bye-laws
- (c) Determine the disposal of the reserve fund and of the profits (subject to these bye-laws)
- (d) Consider and pass the annual balance sheet and also consider and pass orders on proposals of the Board
- (e) Limit the maximum liability to be incurred by the Board on behalf of the society
- (f) Transact any other business brought before it by the Board

28 (B) Any proposal signed by twenty members must be put before a general meeting, other proposals shall be dealt with under bye law 41(K)

29 All matters shall be decided by a majority of votes, the President of the meeting having a casting vote, in addition to his vote as a member

The votes shall ordinarily be taken by the raising of hands, but ballot if so desired

30 No member shall vote on any matter in which he has a direct personal interest

V Board of Directors

31 The affairs of the society shall be controlled by a board of directors of seven members including the President, elected by the general meeting (28(a)) for one year or until the new directorate has been elected. It shall have power when necessary to co-opt not more than three other directors from among the members of the society

32 All the directors shall retire from office on the day fixed for the election of the new directorate, but they shall be eligible for re-election

33 A director shall vacate office —

- (a) If he ceases to be a member of the society
- (b) If he absents himself from three consecutive meetings of the Board without sufficient reasons

34 The following office bearers shall be elected by the Board from among themselves —

- (a) A general Secretary
- (b) One or more assistant secretaries
- (c) A treasurer
- (d) Auditors

35. A casual vacancy occurring on the Board shall be filled up by co-option by the remaining directors, and a director so co-opted shall hold office for the remainder of the retiring director's term of office

36 Three directors shall form a quorum for a meeting of the Board

37 The Board shall, subject to the approval of the General Meeting and in accordance with these bye laws, make such rules as they deem advisable for the working of the society

38 Meetings of the Board shall be called whenever necessary (but at least once a month) by the Secretary and at any time at the requisition in writing of at least three directors. In the absence of the President and Vice-President any other Director may be elected as chairman of the meeting

39 All matters shall be decided as under bye-laws 29 and 30

40 The Board may recommend to the general meeting the removal of any director before expiration of his term of office

41 The Board shall have the following powers —

- (a) To purchase food grain and other commodities in which the society is doing business on conditions conducive to the interest of the members generally
- (b) To fix rates for the goods so purchased with powers to revise such rates at any time
- (c) To cause a notice board to be fixed up in a prominent position in the shop for notifying particulars of rates current for the commodities

WILLOUGHBY R W D—*contd*

- (d) To fix rates for the payments of the instalments of shares and for the recovery of loans
- (e) To see that no member takes undue advantage of his rights to purchase goods from the society
- (f) To borrow money on behalf of the society (subject to bye laws 28(e))
- (g) To receive and disburse money and other property on behalf of the society and to arrange for the safeguarding of its funds and documents
- (h) To appoint suspend and dismiss salaried or non salaried officers and other employes and to require security from any of them if necessary
- (i) To admit new members and to secure transfer of the shares of the existing members
- (j) To expel members subject to the sanction of the general meeting
- (l) To receive and decide complaints and proposals made by any member
- (l) To examine and publish accounts and to publish the annual balance sheet of the society
- (m) To consider the inspection notes of the Registrar and his assistants and to make proposals to the general meeting with regard to them
- (n) To make proposals to the general meeting whether as regards dividends profits and reserve fund or any other of the society's affairs
- (o) To supervise the business of the society in accordance with these bye laws
- (p) To sanction contingent expenses as recommended by the Secretary
- (q) To regulate the routine of the office
- (r) To delegate by a special resolution any of their powers to the Secretary
- (s) To maintain for the society such registers and books as may be required by the Registrar
- (t) To arrange for the safe custody of the funds of the society
- (u) To call a general meeting

40 The Board may appoint to perform special duties committees consisting of such members of their body or any other member of the society (subject to his consent) as they think fit. Such committees shall conform to any regulations that may be imposed upon them by the Board.

43 The Board may with the approval of the general meeting require the services of any or all of the members for any work undertaken by the society in such capacity as may be prescribed by the general meeting.

VI President

44 The President shall —

- (a) Nominate one vice president from among the Directors
- (b) Convene an extraordinary general meeting
- (c) Call a meeting of the Board if necessary
- (d) Act as a responsible head of the Board and of the whole society

45 The Vice President shall have the powers of the President in the latter's absence.

VII Patron

46 The Warden of the Hostel shall be the patron of the society.

47 He shall be an *ex officio* Director but bye law 33(b) shall not apply to him. He shall have the power to ask the Board to reconsider any action of the society.

48 He shall be eligible for election as the President of the society under bye law 28(a).

49 He shall have the power to nominate a member of the staff as pro patron and delegate to him any of the powers vested in him under these bye laws.

VIII Secretary

50 The duties of the Secretary shall be —

- (1) To attend the meetings of the Board and general meetings
- (2) To record the minutes of such meetings and to present them for confirmation at the next meeting

WILLOUGHBY, R. W. D—*contd.*

- (3) To sign on behalf of the society all papers except receipts and cheques issued by the Treasurer, the share certificates, deeds and other similar documents shall also bear the signature of the President
- (4) To conduct the correspondence of the society and supply information to the members
- (5) To keep all the important papers of the society other than those kept by the Treasurer
- (6) To prepare the annual report
- (7) To superintend the work of the office
- (8) To arrange for and procure the stock-in-trade of the society and to issue the same
- (9) To incur the expenditure on contingencies within the limits fixed.
- (10) To delegate any of his powers to the assistant secretaries
- (11) Generally to carry on the business of the society and to exercise his discretion in cases of emergency and to perform any duties which may be specially entrusted to him by the Board
- (12) To call general meetings and meetings of the Board under these bye laws or under the instructions of the President of the Board

IX Treasurer

51 The treasurer shall —

- (a) Receive all monies on behalf of the society and issue receipts for the same.
- (b) Pay bills bearing the signature of the secretary and preserve vouchers for the same
- (c) Keep all the accounts of the society
- (d) Prepare and sign cheques which shall also bear the signature of the President
- (e) Prepare the annual balance sheet and submit the same to the Secretary

X Payments and sales.

52 All transactions by way of purchase and sale shall be concluded for cash or against advance deposits

53 The stores kept by the society shall be retailed ordinarily to those members only who reside in the hostel including their guests and servants and to non-members in case of surplus and damaged goods

54 The prices shall be fixed and altered by the secretary under the general directions of the Board in conformity with the market rates as far as possible

XI Auditors.

55 One or more auditors shall be appointed by the Board from amongst the Directors to audit the accounts of the society, monthly and to report on them and to audit the annual balance sheet

56 The accounts shall be subject to current check by the auditors

57 The following registers will be kept —

- 1 A register of members
- 2 A register of shares
- 3 A minute book of all the meetings of the society and of the Board.
- 4 A stock book of stores.
- 5 A cash book
- 6 A purchase book
- 7 A sales book
- 8 A day ledger
- 9 Any other book or register prescribed by the Board or the Registrar.

WILLOUGHBY R W D—concl'd

XII Profits

58 Profits shall be disposed of as follows —

(a) Of the annual profits 25 per cent shall be placed to the reserve fund

(b) The remainder (75 per cent) shall be applied —

(1) To the payments of bonus not exceeding 4 per cent on the annual amount of purchases on the advance deposits system

(2) To the payment of bonus not exceeding 2 per cent on the annual amount of purchases on the cash system

(3) To the payment of dividend on share capital not exceeding 6½ per cent

(4) To any local charitable object in an amount not exceeding 4 per cent of the profits

(5) The remaining to the increasing of the reserve fund

XIII Reserve Fund

59 The reserve fund may be invested as decided by the directors and approved of by the general meeting (subject to clauses (a) (b) (c) and (d) of section 32 (1) of Act II of 1912) It can be drawn upon to meet losses as decided by the Board approved by the general meeting and sanctioned by the Registrar

60 (1) On the dissolution of the society the reserve fund shall be applied first to the discharging of the liabilities of the society secondly to the repayment of the shares paid up and lastly to the payment of any unpaid dividend on share capital for the previous twelve months

(2) Such portion of the reserve fund as shall remain after the payments mentioned in clause (1) shall be applied to such local object of public utility as may be selected by the directors and approved of by the Registrar If within three months of the dissolution of the society the directors fail to make any selection that is approved of by the Registrar the latter shall either apply it to any local object of public utility that he considers suitable or place the amount in deposit in some co operative or other bank until a new co operative society with a similar area of operations is registered in which event it shall be credited to the reserve fund of such society

61 The funds of the society may be deposited in the Post Office Savings Bank or the Allahabad Bank or the Bank of Bengal

XIV General

62 The society shall be dissolved by the Registrar or by a two thirds majority of the shareholders assembled at a general meeting specially called for to consider this question and with the sanction of the Registrar who may appoint a liquidator

63 Disputes between the society and its members concerning the business or the working of the society shall be decided by the Board subject to an appeal to the general meeting whose decision shall be final

64 These bye laws shall be binding on all members directors and office bearers whom they concern and shall only be modified by a two thirds majority of the shareholders at a general meeting specially called for this purpose and with the sanction of the Registrar

S C SATYAWADI BA

President

H D BANERJEE

Secretary

The bye laws of the Hostel Co operative Society Limited, Allahabad No 112 of Allahabad district were duly registered on 11th December 1916

R W D WILLOUGHBY

WORDSWORTH, The Hon'ble Mr W C —YUSUF, Khan Sahib Maulvi MOHAMMAD

WORDSWORTH, The Hon'ble Mr W C

I believe primarily in the 'day' system, pupils and students living at home, and attending local schools or colleges. Next in hostels, either small, say 50-60 students, or if larger, internally divided into units of this size—all hostels or smaller units to be under adequate supervision. Adequate supervision means supervision by a man whose character and position evoke respect and confidence—of a school hostel, by a master, of a college hostel, by a professor. Supervision, *e.g.*, by subordinate clerks, has little value, they have no control and can set no standard of conduct. The superintendent of a college hostel should be a tutor in the sense of general adviser and friend—not in the sense of a coach, provision for this should not be made in the hostel. College hostels should be under the control of colleges, not of the University; a college should be entirely responsible for its hostels, though the rules for their management and the arrangements for supervision should be reported to the University for approval. Messing should be arranged by committees of the boarders. The superintendents should invariably be members of the teaching staff of the institutions concerned, and should have family quarters on the premises. This is essential: the Indian teacher does not normally regard this kind of work as a duty that may be properly expected of him, and is not likely to undertake it unless the conveniences are considerable. Every hostel should contain rooms (single by preference) for boarders, adequate kitchens and dining rooms for different castes, a common room sufficiently large for general meetings, a library with facilities for consulting books on the spot, a sick-room remote from the main building, and space for indoor and outdoor recreation. The daily routine should be definite and strictly enforced, since college students in Bengal have to learn habits of regularity and punctuality which they should have learned at school. In particular definite study hours should be insisted upon, and quietness be compulsory during them. First year students might with advantage spend these hours in the common room, under the charge of a senior student.

I do not approve of messes, for reasons previously given. I also consider school hostels an undesirable development, to be countenanced only where the need is patent: no attempt should be made to attract young boys away from their home locality and their proper guardians. In school hostels boys are seldom under adequate supervision: schools seldom realise the moral responsibility they incur by aspiring to satisfy more than purely local needs. I would gladly see none but day schools for Indian boys.

Such papers as I have seen relating to recent troubles suggest the conclusion that most of the students who have come under political notice have been tampered with in hostels.

I do not consider that any satisfactory hostel scheme is possible in Calcutta: difficulties of expense and of site will always stand in the way. Numerous *mufassal* colleges, with attached hostels, will be the most economical and efficient solution, and local contributions to this end would probably be forthcoming.

YUSUF, Khan Sahib Maulvi MOHAMMAD

- to audit balance.
- 1 The hostel should be directly under the supervision of the principal of the college
 - 2 and the superintendents should be appointed on his nomination by the governing body of a private college or by the director in a Government college. The
 - 3 University interest in the hostel would be represented by the university inspector
 - 4 A hostels and messes and possibly, by a member appointed by the University
 - 5 A revisiting committee of the hostel
 - 6 A minute superintendent would be responsible, under the general supervision of the
 - 7 A stock book for the administration of the hostel. He would make admissions,
 - 8 A cash book for the administration of the hostel. He would make admissions,
 - 9 A purchase book for the administration of the hostel. He would make admissions,
 - 10 A sales book for the administration of the hostel. He would make admissions,
 - 11 A day ledger for any grave case to the notice of the principal, in whose hands
 - 12 Any other book or power of expulsion for serious misdemeanour.

YUSUF, Khan Sahib Maulvi MUHAMMAD—*contd*

- (ii) As regards messes it is desirable that however small they should not be placed under the control of the senior member of the mess but that they should be in charge of a member of the teaching staff of the institution to which the mess is attached or another academical institution and he should reside in the premises.
- (iii) For the control of messes there should be a mess committee appointed by the University to inspect them in conjunction with the inspector of messes and hostel.
- (c) The superintendents should be resident in the hostel and should be accessible to the boarders at all reasonable hours. They should make frequent inspection of the living rooms and make the close personal acquaintance of every boarder. The superintendent should be a member of the visiting committee which should comprise about six of the prominent members of the community whose duties should be of an advisory nature in the administration of the hostel.
- In both Madras and Calcutta the boarders enter for themselves and in view of the consensus of opinion on their part being favourable to the existing arrangement it was decided not to interfere with it. The alternatives are (i) messing arrangements to be in the hands of the authorities and a fixed rate charged from all the messing to be placed in the hands of an outside contractor, an arrangement which the Muhammadan students of the Canning College Lucknow have adopted.
- In our hostel however the boarders mainly object that they can secure cheaper messing arrangements than the authorities of the hostels provide. Provided the superintendent is satisfied with the condition in which they eat and that the quality of food is wholesome I do not consider that the present arrangement need be changed.
- (d) (i) In a Muhammadan hostel it is necessary that a prayer room should be provided. Inasmuch as there is no provision for religious instruction in schools and colleges there is a strong body of opinion in favour of insisting that all Muhammadan students in residence should observe together one of the five prayer times obligatory on Muslims. It is not essential that an elaborate prayer room should be constructed but an extensive covered place should be reserved for the purpose.
- (ii) So long as the messing arrangements are left to the boarders themselves it is sufficient to provide in the kitchen two fire places for each mess of twenty to thirty boarders and stores accommodation. Dining common and living rooms require only the provision of the bare necessities. As the boarders make their own arrangements it is advisable they should have the management of the arrangements in the dining room and kitchen under of course the supervision of the superintendent.
- As it is usually difficult to obtain admission for boarders to the wards of hospital and also cases have occasionally to be kept under observation it is necessary to have separate accommodation for the sick cases. Usually the friends of the sick boarder are anxious to attend and help but it is essential that a hostel servant should be in attendance.
- The servants provided by the authorities in hostels for all purposes except those connected with cooking and messing should be per fifty students three and a half farashes one half sick room attendant and two sweepers and for fifty to two hundred students one chaprasi besides one or two durwans a daftry a bhusti and a mali to look after the grounds etc. The boarders should provide at their own expense for the common room daily papers and journals approved by the authorities. For this purpose a charge of one rupee per annum might be made. Books could be supplied from the college library.
- (e) The recommendation of the recent Presidency College committee appointed by Government commends itself as the most satisfactory viz that not exceeding fifty boarders should be assigned to one superintendent. It seems desirable that

YUSUF, Khan Sahib Moulvi MOHAMMAD *contd* —ZACHARIAH, K

boarders should be accommodated in blocks, fifty in each and, as far as possible of the same college

For schools the dormitory and study-room system is better than a system of four-seated rooms which serve as living and study rooms

- (/) It is desirable that the superintendents should prove as helpful as possible to the boarders in their charge and that they should encourage visits of members of the teaching staff, but tutorial assistance in hostel or in mess should not be insisted upon. The student has enough tutorial aid by day and requires time for preparation and quiet reading

QUESTION 20

Do you consider that the financial resources already available for higher education in Bengal are employed in the most economical way? If not with a view to the strengthening and expansion of higher education can you suggest some form of university organisation which while securing economical administration would make a more powerful appeal for support from private liberality as well as from public sources?

ANSWERS

ALI, The Hon ble Mr ALTAF

I do not think there is any other way than raising the fees but I am not sure if this will be popular

BANERJEE J R

I believe they are employed in the most economical way

BANERJEE Dr PRAMATHANATH

I think the financial resources available for higher education in Bengal are on the whole employed in an economical way

BANERJEE, JAYGOPAL

I am afraid not. The salary scale now adopted for different classes of service in the department is rather a ticklish question. There is undoubtedly a strong feeling in the country that a readjustment of this matter consistently with departmental efficiency which nobody will sacrifice is not simply a crying need but the easiest way of liberating a part of the already available public source which may be more fruitfully applied to the expansion of education. Private liberality will tend to flow with a quicker pace and in a larger volume as soon as the conviction is successfully removed from the public mind that the Education Department is sometimes run with a view to secure special advantages to what is considered a favoured class of men. It is also a fatal error in a country like this to suppose that a high standard of education must necessarily mean a highly costly system. Indian traditions and conditions give the lie to such an alien idea. Another check upon public liberality proceeds from a lurking distrust in many a mind that —

- (a) A purely literary or scientific but theoretical training is *not at present* the greatest need of the country on which rich people are disposed to spend large sums
- (b) Funds made over to the University are not utilised economically when use is made of them for creating chairs with liberal salaries attached to them to be filled by men however eminent and distinguished as scholars without any permanent interest in the land or in the future advancement and welfare of its people and wanting both in accurate appreciation of the special needs and conditions of the people as well as in warm sympathy with their growing aspirations

Unless our brilliant University men are actually trained in habits of higher research by those filling the chairs created by the munificence of rich donors this reluctance on the part of the latter to provide endowments will not speedily or successfully be overcome. This is a move in the right direction which ought to be made immediately.

BANERJEE, Rai KUMUDINI KANTA, Bahadur—BANERJEE, MURALI DHAR—BANERJEE, SASI SEKHAR

BANERJEE, Rai KUMUDINI KANTA, Bahadur

I think the financial resources already available for higher education in Bengal are employed economically. I am afraid the resources available are not quite sufficient.

The governing body of Government colleges should have more power, and representatives of the people should also be appointed members of the governing body. They are now merely advisory bodies. The college should be managed by the governing body, subject to the control of the Director of Public Instruction. Government should make an annual grant to each college. The governing body should frame the budget and spend their income, subject to the control of the Director of Public Instruction. If the people want development and are prepared to pay for it, Government should aid them financially, if possible, and encourage private liberality for the improvement of higher education. If the people have a voice, through their representatives, in the development of their colleges I am sure they will support liberally any scheme they may formulate.

BANERJEE, MURALI DHAR

I do not think that the financial resources available in Bengal are employed in the most economical way. It is so because under the present arrangement —

- (a) The quality of education is sacrificed to quantity, there is expansion without strengthening, too many subjects are taught superficially, none thoroughly, and, as a result, there are too many graduates, but none fit for any useful work. This sort of education is a waste of public money.
- (b) The higher education is now mainly literary, very little has been done by the University for scientific or technical education which are more urgently required for improving the economical condition of the country. The organisation of scientific and technical education would appeal more powerfully for support from private liberality and, being productive, would be economical.

BANERJEE, SASI SEKHAR

My experience, so far as this question goes, is very limited. I may however, be permitted to make one or two statements. As regards the first part of the question my belief is that economy can be effected in a certain direction. Arrangements exist in the medical and engineering colleges for the study of certain science subjects which might have been gone through in the intermediate, or the degree, stage. The duplication of such studies may, I think, be avoided by some reorganisation of the existing system. Students who have not read a particular branch of science at the intermediate stage, or have not offered it at the matriculation examination, may be made to obtain their training, both theoretical and practical, at some Calcutta college, such as the Science Association, and then allowed to appear at the preliminary scientific M.B. examination. The Civil Engineering College, by reason of its distance from Calcutta, may not offer such facilities to its students as the Medical College can, but, by the introduction of an altered programme of study, I think it may be practicable to effect some economy even there.

I venture also to say that the agricultural colleges at Sabour and Pusa are not run upon an economical basis. The students coming out of those colleges do not go back to the soil, nor take to farming as a profession, but seek Government or other employment.

With regard to the second part of the question, my reply will not again be exhaustive. My idea with respect to the agricultural college is that it should turn out experts who would take to agriculture or farming as a profession and show by the adoption of improved methods that that profession is an economically advantageous one. Such institutions

BANERJEE SASI SEKHAR—*contd*—BANERJEE SUDHANSUKUMAR—BANERJEE UPENDRA NATH—BARDALOI N C—BASU SATYENDRA NATH—Bengal Landholders Association Calcutta

should have a direct touch with the people. Any problem referred to them concerning the nature of the soil, the nature of the manure, the nature of remedies for particular pests, information as to the locality where certain things can be had etc. should receive proper attention and satisfactory replies should be promptly given to the queries made. The real importance and utility of the department will thus be appreciated and public and private liberality may then be stimulated. The interest of the people will be aroused when it becomes known that the department is doing real work.

BANERJEE SUDHANSUKUMAR

The financial resources available for higher education in the hands of the University are being most economically employed for its post graduate teaching which is some how making both ends meet and is struggling under great financial difficulties especially in its science establishment. It is unfortunate that the same cannot be said with regard to the Government grant to the colleges maintained by Government where a very large portion of the grant is being spent in paying big salaries to the third class men recruited from some second grade universities of the United Kingdom.

BANERJEE, UPENDRA NATH

Full freedom should be conceded to institutions as regards their method of teaching and the heads of the tutorial staff should exercise their discretion only in special cases requiring particular direction, advice, or guidance as may often be necessary with those who have recently joined the teaching staff.

BARDALOI, N C

I do not advocate any expenditure on a lavish scale as the sum may be more profitably employed in giving technical training to our young men.

BASU SATYENDRA NATH

Decent buildings may be a necessity—but sometimes too much is made of them. The general impression seems to be that more is spent on inspection than on instruction.

Bengal Landholders Association Calcutta

At present university education in Bengal is chiefly financed by the fees realised from students—supplemented to a small extent by grants made by Government.

In the early days of the spread of English education private liberality helped largely in fostering the growth of higher education in this province and institutions like the Rajshahi College, the Krishnagar College and the old Hindu College benefited largely from the generosity of munificent patrons. But this source of support has now practically dried up altogether. No doubt within recent years the Calcutta University has been the fortunate recipient of large private benefactions, but this was due to the influence and exertion of one individual and not to the appeal which the University makes to the people at large.

The cause of this difference in the attitude of the people will have to be looked for in the way in which the affairs of the University are administered. As things stand at present, the University is little more than a Government department and as our people

Bengal Landholders' Association, Calcutta—*contd*—Bengal National Chamber of Commerce, Calcutta—BHADURI, JYOTIBHUSHAN—DEY, B. B. and DUTTA, BIDHU BHUSAN—BHANDARKAR, SHI R G

have no share in the power, responsibility, and work of Government, their attitude towards the University (as towards other departments of Government) is that of interested onlookers, rather than of active participants. Naturally, they cannot finance an institution which they do not control, and, equally naturally, they look to Government for the entire support and financing of the University. To remedy this state of things the University must be made an independent and self contained unit—the control of which must rest with an independent body recruited wholly from the colleges and other institutions which will constitute the University.

Bengal National Chamber of Commerce, Calcutta

There are people of means in whom special interest may be created in favour of different branches of study on the "modern side"—agriculture, commerce, industrial technology, and also in the various Indian systems of *Darsana*, logic, theology, and sociology. If they be properly approached by Government we think substantial help will be forthcoming in aid of training in those branches. The financial success which the Hindu University in Benares has attained supports our view.

BHADURI, JYOTIBHUSHAN, DEY, B. B., and DUTTA, BIDHU BHUSAN.

The expenditure of money on higher education is controlled partly by the Director of Public Instruction and partly by the university authorities.

Government could effect considerable economy without any sacrifice of efficiency by a larger use of indigenous agency for teaching work. European professors would, naturally, require some consideration for residence in a country whose climate does not suit them and in environment to which they are not accustomed. The country also loses altogether the valuable experience they have gained when they retire from the public service and settle not in India, but outside.

The University has within the last decade provided for post-graduate instruction in law, arts, and science and thus incurred considerable expenditure which would be more than justified if an ideal teaching university could be created round this nucleus. If this object could not be realised in the near future it would mean the waste of a large amount of money and a good deal of strenuous effort.

There is no likelihood of raising large subscriptions for the general purposes of the University.

Considerable endowments may, however, be secured for specific purposes—technology and industrial training, study of Sanskrit and the classics, etc.—if the University takes under its auspices special institutions for cultivating these branches of learning and gives to the donors a voice in the management of the institutions founded by them.

BHANDARKAR, SHI R G

I do not know anything about Bengal as regards the matter touched on in the first part of the question. As to the second, I do not quite understand its scope. But, so far as I can form any conception of it, I am not able to suggest a new form of university organisation which, while securing economical administration, would make a more powerful appeal for support from private liberality. Even the present form has widely appealed to private liberality both in Calcutta and in Bombay. We, in Bombay, owe two excellent buildings to private liberality and a great many scholarships, prizes, and medals. If a proper appeal were made by the Chancellor or the Vice-Chancellor for the endowing of a new college I do not think that the appeal would long remain unresponded to. We owe some valuable endowments to a public-spirited merchant in Ahmedabad. If the point aimed at in this question is whether there

BHANDARKAR Sir R G—*contd*—BHATTACHARYA NIBARANCHANDRA—BHATTACHARYA Mahamahopadhyaya KALIPRASANNA—BHOWAL GOVINDA CHANDRA—BOROOAH JNANADABHIRAM—BOSE G C

should be any sectional universities such as the Hindu and Muhammadan universities my view of the matter is that in their actual working many points must arise calculated to render the education imparted in these institutions narrow and illiberal I am therefore opposed to the creation of such universities

BHATTACHARYA, NIBARANCHANDRA

Besides Government aid public donations fees obtained from students and royalty obtained from the university publications I think that considerable financial help may be obtained by instituting university loans similar to municipal loans All the hostels might be built with the money received from the loans and the rent obtained from the students might go to pay up the interest

That the above proposal is not impracticable will be proved from the fact that many private colleges not only maintain themselves on the fees of students but some have even succeeded in accumulating funds

I am indebted to Babu Brijlal Chakravarty founder of the Daulatpur Hindu Academy for this suggestion He told me that by instituting a similar system in the Daulatpur College he solved a good many financial problem

BHATTACHARYA Mahamahopadhyaya KALIPRASANNA

The public is of opinion that the University is not economical in its expenditure

The public as well as the University are grateful to the Honble Justice Sir Asutosh Mukherjee for securing large endowments for the Calcutta University from two distinguished persons of Calcutta viz the late Sir Taraknath Palit and Sir Rashbehary Ghosh The University ought to appeal to the public for such private liberality from time to time.

BHOWAL GOVINDA CHANDRA

Yes inspectorships should be abolished The erection of palatial buildings for schools and colleges should be discouraged Healthy and convenient buildings will do

The University should have inspectors of its own and they will do for the secondary schools affiliated to it The post of the Director of Public Instruction should be abolished Primary schools may be placed under the management of district and municipal boards Dual authority over schools is most undesirable

BOROOAH JNANADABHIRAM

It would be admirable if the college could be removed but it would cause a great deal of hardship to students and their guardians—to those students particularly who would live with their parents or elders

BOSE, G C

The financial resources already available for higher education are not being employed in the most economical way The practical monopoly by the University of higher studies in arts science and law especially in Calcutta is financially expensive and educationally unsound as colleges are likely to do this work more economically and on more sound lines under proper safeguards and with suitable encouragement This monopoly is looked upon with disfavour by the people in general and the educated public in particular Moreover the quality of its outturn is bound to deteriorate in the absence of the stimulus of healthy emulation and inspiring competition

BOSE, KHUDI RAM—BROWN, Rev A E.—CHAKRAVARTI, BRAJALAL—CHAKRAVARTI, Rai
MON MOHAN, Bahadur

BOSE, KHUDI RAM

Post graduate studies in arts and science at the University may, perhaps, be more economically managed, and on the principle—the greater includes the smaller—the financial and educational aspects of the University arts and science colleges may be considerably improved by admitting to their rooms *optionally* college students of lower forms intent upon extending further their knowledge of special sciences and arts. The Indian Association for the Cultivation of Science may be cited as a notable object lesson in this connection.

BROWN, Rev. A. E.

We consider that it would be an advantage in many ways if Government grants to colleges were made not as lump grants, but as endowments of chairs and lectureships. This would enable Government to encourage the study of less popular subjects and thus prevent the scope of education, especially in the smaller colleges, from being narrowed down to just the few subjects which 'pay' because most popular.

This might also serve as an example to individuals or public bodies to endow similar chairs, etc.

We hold that money which is now being spent in erecting large hostels in Calcutta might be used more profitably in the way suggested above. Experience has shown that the erection of hostels does not necessarily solve the educational problem of Calcutta. If by establishing valuable chairs, first class professors were attracted to the mofussil students would be less tempted to rush to Calcutta and, at the same time, one of the chief difficulties in the way of establishing new universities would be removed.

CHAKRAVARTI, BRAJALAL.

I am inclined to think that the present method of work has not been economical. The prevailing idea as to the adequacy of equipment has been somewhat extravagant and money is being spent lavishly on buildings. The amounts that are spent in cities might produce better results if utilised in rural places.

The cost of education will be much reduced if educational institutions be located in the mofussil where land is cheap and living also is cheap. The establishment of denominational schools and colleges will appeal strongly to private liberality, and management by such bodies will necessarily be very economical.

The financial question may be attacked more effectively from another side. Encouragement should be given to the idea of asceticism in the teacher and the student and that will result in a reduction of expenditure. At the same time, an attempt should be made to utilise the labour of students by giving them scope for manual work. This can be done in rural colleges by providing land for gardening and agriculture and in the cities by providing facilities for industrial work. Subject to the above arrangements, for the purpose of securing economy, all work of education must ultimately have to depend upon the financial support of Government.

CHAKRAVARTI, Rai MON MOHAN, Bahadur

This question can be answered only by a small audit committee. To judge from the calendars, minutes, etc., received by me as a registered graduate I think their size and cost may be reduced as follows —

- (i) By avoiding repetitions
- (ii) By using abbreviation and compression
- (iii) By excluding some unimportant matters

CHATTERJEE Rai Bahadur SARAT CHANDRA—CHAUDHURI The Hon'ble Justice SIR ASUTOSH—CHAUDHURI BHUBAN MOHAN—CHAUDHURY The Hon'ble Babu BROJENDRA KISHORE ROY—CHAUDHURI The Hon'ble Nawab SYED NAWABALY Khan Bahadur

CHATTERJEE, Rai Bahadur SARAT CHANDRA

No they are riddled away in the holding of examinations in the different centres The University budget should be framed with greater care than it is now

CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Justice SIR ASUTOSH

Private liberality depends upon the usefulness of the institution In the higher branches of scientific studies experts engaged in research work may be encouraged to start lecture rooms of their own Such lectures will secure the attendance of students interested in the subject Fees from them ought, in time to prove adequate for the lectures and the University will be relieved from maintaining them Doctorate degrees may be granted on the certificate of such lecturers In technological subjects this scheme has, perhaps a larger field

CHAUDHURI, BHUBAN MOHAN

The financial resources already available for higher education are not employed in the most economical way the major portion being spent for purposes other than those calculated to serve the purpose of education best e.g. in multiplying inspecting agencies The plague spot in the educational system of Bengal is the poor pay of teachers in secondary schools So long as the teachers are ill paid and therefore cannot reasonably be expected to devote the whole of their energy to their work no amount of university regulations however wisely they may be conceived will be able to effect any substantial improvement of education The teachers should be well paid so that the best products of the University may be attracted to where they are most wanted The financial resources available for education may be made over to the University and the University may create a board to employ them economically and to appeal to the public for donations

CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Babu BROJENDRA KISHORE ROY

No the available financial resources are not always employed in Bengal in the most economic way and too much is spent upon lands buildings and at times upon fittings also If second grade colleges are established in the mofussil in larger numbers and if control of education is gradually transferred to the people both economical administration and powerful appeal for support from private liberality will most certainly be far better secured

CHAUDHURY, The Hon'ble Nawab SYED NAWABALY Khan Bahadur

The financial resources available for higher education in Bengal are not employed in the most economical way In a system where the teaching is not carried on by the University but by the different colleges affiliated to it for examination purposes the colleges have to provide their own libraries and laboratories and have to appoint their own professors and lecturers for the different courses of study also prescribed by the University The result is that ill equipped laboratories and libraries and ill paid and third rate professors and lecturers are multiplied with the necessary evil effect on higher education The University as has been explained in my answer to question 16 has failed to co ordinate its post and under graduate work I think that this wastage of energy and resources would be saved under a teaching university more especially one of a uni college type in Calcutta or near about with its centralised libraries and laboratories and first rate though limited number of professors devoted to particular subjects I would also add to this the suggestion I have made in answer to question 5 as regards the bringing together of colleges outside Calcutta under a university system of the kind referred to therein

CHOUDHURY, Rai YATINDRA NATH—CHOWDHURI, DHIRENDRANATH—DATTA, BIBHUTIBHUSON

CHOUDHURY, Rai YATINDRA NATH.

The financial resources now available for higher education are not employed in the most economical way. There is much waste of money in paying the staff which is employed to inspect schools and colleges. Expenditure under this head can be easily cut down and much of the present expenditure under this head can be better utilised in founding suitable institutions for higher training and adequate student-ships for research. Government contribution should also be increased for improving higher training in the country. Furthermore, by taking up purely Indian subjects, and those ones which are necessary for the amelioration of the moral and material condition of our countrymen, I think the imagination of our countrymen may be touched and, thereby, a more suitable situation in the country may be created which would make a more powerful appeal for support from private liberality.

CHOWDHURI, DHIRENDRANATH

The available financial resources for higher education in Bengal are not at all economically employed. More money is spent on buildings, furniture, and inspection than on the real needs of education. In a country where once the banian tree comfortably accommodated the aspirants after knowledge the building ideal of the University seems to be too much for the patience of the people. I do not want the University to return to the old way, which is impossible, but there must be a limit. In many cases the available funds are used up in procuring the paraphernalia of education, whereas education itself is starved. In order to see that a well-fed education is supplied, and not a starved one, an elaborate system of inspection has been instituted. That means further expenditure on externals, so further starvation of education itself.

DATTA, BIBHUTIBHUSON

The financial resources already available for higher education in Bengal are not employed in the most economical way.

As shown in my answer to question 2 only ordinary English graduates are recruited for the Indian educational service, what high teaching quality can then be expected from them? Still, thrice as much is spent to secure an English teacher as would be required to get an Indian teacher of equal ability.

We Indians live in thatched houses, why do you prescribe expensive *pucca* buildings for our schools? an open-air system will be more beneficial to our health. The amount saved in that way can be better used in securing teachers of higher ability and in the better equipment of libraries, etc. While considering the economic expenditure of the financial resources *already* available I should say that the resources *actually* available for education in India are very meagre. The Indian Government annually spends at present a little more than threepence halfpenny per head of population, while in England the public expenditure on education per head of population is exactly as much every week as the Indian Government spends in the course of a year. This economic education policy of Government is mainly responsible for the enormously high percentage of illiteracy among the Indian people and for the intellectual backwardness of the average English educated Indian. In a review of the progress of education in India the worthy president of the Commission, Dr Michael E Sadler, once remarked—

“The highest art in the educational policy of a nation is to anticipate needs, to be beforehand with them, to guide nascent aspirations by favouring provision of well-planned intellectual discipline and opportunity. Our English educational history is full of missed opportunities, of failures on the part of the State to look ahead and provide in time the kind of educational organisation which the nation was about to need. The same is true of India. There, as here, the Treasury has failed to do

DATTA BIBHUTIBHUSON—*contd*—DATTA BIRENDRA KUMAR—DEY BARODA PROSAUD—
DEY N N

soon enough what the growing and changing needs of the people required. Educational policy has been stingily thwarted by a too narrow view of finance. Education from the treasury point of view has been traditionally regarded as unproductive expenditure. The old trinity of a too commercial and of a too individualistic political economy has clung to its educational theory. The presuppositions of it have been fallacious. The Treasury mind has never here or in India fully realised that a wise and generous educational policy must look ahead, must be venturesome, must stake much on the future and it is in essence capital outlay upon a scheme of development. What Bacon said about the planting of colonies is true of the planning of education — It is like the planting of woods. You must make your account to lose almost twenty years' profit and expect your recompense in the end. Indian education has never had enough money spent upon it. It is anemic for want of proper subsidy. It is in great measure mechanical and sterile because it has been virtually starved.

I appeal to the president that when he is at the helm he will set the university steering in the right direction so that it may reach the ideal which he himself has held out.

DATTA, BIRENDRA KUMAR

Too much money is being spent on the erection of buildings for boarding houses and hostels while sufficient attention is not being paid to increasing the pay and prospects of teachers and professors. As regards the pay of the teachers there should be an increase from the lowest to the highest grades.

Education should be made cheaper. It is too costly at present.

DEY BARODA PROSAUD

Financial resources already available for higher education in Bengal are employed in the most economical way.

DEY N N

Some suggestions for more economical employment of the financial resources of the University are noted below —

- (a) Real co-operation between the colleges and the University secured by adequate representation of the professors and teachers on the Senate. Already mentioned in question 5.
- (b) The formation of the academic councils will much lighten the work of the Senate (*vide* question 8). The academic councils by their constitution would most successfully approach the rich people of the locality and induce them to endow colleges and schools.
- (c) Post graduate classes in some subjects may be opened in colleges in Calcutta or the mofussil where competent professors in those subjects may be willing to take up the work. Post graduate students of the Calcutta colleges ought to be given facilities to use the University laboratories and libraries.
- (d) The study of law may easily be made over to the constituent colleges whenever provision can be made for their teaching. The academic councils can arrange for the opening of law classes in institutions under them. The faculty of law would recognise such efforts.
- (e) The private colleges with their defects—however numerous they may be—have done much towards the spread of collegiate education in a most economical way. Institutions of a similar nature may be allowed to be established in different centres.

DEY, N N—*contd*—DHAR, Rai Sahib BIHARI LAL D'SOUZA, P G—DUTT, REBATI RAMAN—DUTTA, PROMODE CHANDRA

- (f) The University ought to recognise private liberality towards the establishment and equipment of colleges by appointing these big donors honorary fellows, as such recognition may act as a stimulus to further endowments. It is a pity that the University has hitherto but scantily recognised such private liberality. It ought not to make a distinction between a direct endowment to the University and an endowment to a college.

DHAR Rai Sahib BIHARI LAL.

No, too much money is being spent for building purposes.

D'SOUZA, P G

The tutorial system is not quite suited to Indian students, who should be drawn away from the habits of cramming.

DUTT, REBATI RAMAN

I have already said that I expect the University to assume the fullest responsibility for the cause of high education as the University really should by the original intentions of its foundation. The University will work through its college education board and the District Education Council and the system will greatly economise our expenses on inspection and building equipment. Such a system of organisation will keep the University greatly in touch with the country and the University's cause will arouse the greatest enthusiasm and its appeal will meet with the readiest response. Let it not be said that the people wanted a Swarnamayee College, but the University did not. Let the people's cause be the university's care and the university's cause the people's own, there will be no want of money in a land that could found a university four thousand years ago.

The university senate should be thoroughly representative—75 per cent of its members being elected by several constituencies, graduates of districts, professors of colleges, head masters of schools, boards of Sanskrit education, of Muhammadan education, vernacular education, women's education, agriculture, commerce, industries, medicine, engineering, arts, science, law, music, and theology. No district that has got less than 100 graduates will have a right of representation on the council.

DUTTA, PROMODE CHANDRA.

The available financial resources are not spent most economically. If divisional inspectors are taken from the Provincial educational service the work will be carried on more economically and efficiently. It seems a huge joke to appoint as inspectors of schools men who are not thoroughly acquainted with the language, customs, and manners of the people. At present, the inspectors do no useful work which could not be done as efficiently by a clerk on Rs 200 to Rs 300 per month.

There should be no Indian educational service professors for ordinary college work. The experience of the last thirty years has demonstrated that the average Provincial educational service man does better than the average Indian educational service man.

The Indian Government seems to recognise this fact when it says that, in future, teachers of colleges should exclusively be Indians.

There are many vacancies in the Indian educational service. The best thing would be to transfer these posts to the Provincial educational service and to allot the money thus set free to improve the status of the members of the subordinate educational service who teach college classes.

GANGULI SURENDRA MOHAN—GEDDES IATRICK—GHOSH BIMAL CHANDRA—GHOSH
JNANCHANDRA—GILCHRIST R N

GANGULI SURENDRA MOHAN

The following general outline may be suggested —

- (a) The matriculation or the school final course should be of a higher standard
- (b) Colleges should be established for teaching science and technology
- (c) Literary education should be arranged for those who intend to elevate their lives by higher culture and who take up teaching as their profession
- (d) There should be established separate teaching institutions for other professions
- (e) Special arrangements should be made for the teaching of law and if possible this important subject should be entrusted to a separate corporate body
- (f) Special coaching arrangements should be made for higher posts under Government

GEDDES PATRICK

Here I need only recall the briefly stated general views of university organisation and of changes I believe are approaching. Given beginnings of a post-germanic university there is no fear of its support.

Here I may again refer to my Report on Indore to the Indore Darbar now in press (March 1918) in which the suggested University of Central India at Indore is reported on at some length with designs for various of its needed institutes and elements and suggestions towards its beginnings.

GHOSH BIMAL CHANDRA

If our object be the strengthening and expansion of higher education the University should be unofficialised—at least much less officialised—and the needs and interests of particular communities considered as far as possible. It is only by these two means that we can hope to enlist sympathy and support from private liberality and public organisations.

GHOSH JNANCHANDRA

The colleges should exist solely for the benefit of students and institutions whether proprietary in name or in essence should not be allowed to continue as such. The finances of each institution should be scrutinised every year by a standing committee of the Senate with the assistance of a trained accountant. The recommendation of such a committee that a college is conducted on sound educational lines and deserves financial help is likely to carry great weight with wealthy people interested in the promotion of education.

GILCHRIST R N

I have already answered the first part of this question in the *Calcutta Review* articles. I consider that the present system is honeycombed with economic waste, waste of money and personality. The system seems to me to secure the worst results from both finances and human labour. The various branches of university work which I have already criticised for example the post graduate classes show that money is actually being spent in supporting schemes or organisations which far from being of productive value deteriorate both teachers and students. The continuous dragging down process that dragging down to the level of the weakest institutions is again a virulent economic cancer in the present body academic. The wastage of

GILCHRIST, R N—*contd*

power in teachers arising from the system is uneconomic, the bad education of the students is uneconomic. The hugeness of the organisation is uneconomic, for the hugeness leads to breakdowns, as in the recent matriculation examination, and to enormous loss of time and power through travelling. Greater than the actual loss of time and power through travelling, is the enforced absence of man-power, arising from the inability of the University to collect its resources. Many resources exist, but they cannot be tapped. These remarks apply to the University. When, however, as the question asks, we consider the whole area of Bengal education, my condemnation of the system is almost limitless. In Bengal (as pointed out in the *Calcutta Review*) we are spending on colleges as much as on primary education. Yet, in our colleges, almost cent per cent of our students are not of university standard. Our secondary schools are most inefficient, yet we create university professorships on large salaries, for no students. We delight in speaking of our future imports of "men with European reputations" when, as yet, we have bare walls as their audience! We educate M A's by the hundreds by an expensive university organisation, when the first conditions of M A work are lamentably wanting. We all agree that our schools are bad, but, if it is a choice between an ornamental professorship and a grant to a divisional inspector of schools of fifteen thousand rupees, most of our university senators prefer the professorship.

Which education, from the economic point of view, would, in the present condition of Bengal, be the more salutary, ten professorships on Rs 1,500 each or almost two lakhs for divisional inspectors of schools? There is no need to labour the answer.

Here, let me protest against a pernicious interpretation placed on the true statement that in education true reform must come from above. Reform must *not* come from above, but from within. The imposition of high ideals both in morals and education by the most highly educated men is of no avail unless these ideals take effect. Only by a gradual change in the *morale* of a people is true reform possible, and the notion that that can be forced from above is, to my mind, erroneous. It certainly is erroneous as applied by some local theorists, who hold that only with a perfect university can primary and secondary education improve. A perfect university must, on the same grounds, receive its perfection from above likewise. What we want in Bengal is not a perfect university, but a university which will give us good results for the people, a university which will produce men to set high theoretical and actual examples of the good life before pupils, a university which, above all, will produce workers in the best cause for Bengal. For that, a series of training colleges for teachers would be infinitely more useful than the present system with its peculiar way of "reforming from above." The highest stage of our University, the mastership stage, provides only the worst possible workers in schools. It provides the unsuccessful from the law profession and the disappointed applicants from Government service. Corruption, as well as reform, comes from above.

The second part of this question asks whether "with a view to the strengthening and expansion of higher education" it is possible to suggest any particular form of university organisation which will appeal to private resources for support. I do not believe in any immediate expansion of university education. I consider that restriction and reformation is necessary, so that more resources may be given to more urgent needs. Expansion on the present basis would simply mean expansion of the evils and I definitely consider that, till the foundation for university education is properly laid, no expansion should be considered. At the same time, it is necessary to extend resources on remodelling the present University to make room for the expansion which will be the inevitable, and welcome, result of the new basis. A non-rigid, elastic framework should be given a framework capable of expansion as the growing needs of the times may demand, but a framework *only* I consider as necessary, not a completely filled in scheme.

I consider that the scheme I suggest supplies a framework of this kind, whereby the institutions in Calcutta should develop as they have been doing, but under strict limitations, and expansion take place in selected mofussil centres. These selected mofussil centres seem to me to be the only way of attracting local effort or private liberality, and this alone should be a strong argument for them.

A glance at the university calendar will show that the mofussil colleges owe much to private effort. The extent of the private effort has been determined largely

GILCHRIST R N—*contd*—GOSWAMI BHAGABAT KUMAR Sastri—GUPTA AMRITA LAL

by the necessary standards of the Calcutta University. I consider that once certain colleges are developed on the assumption that they are to become independent universities, local effort will respond far more freely than it has done in the past. Somehow or other the present University of Calcutta has worked under a cloud of suspicion, not unnaturally so, for a zamindar of Rajshahi might far less be expected to endow the Calcutta University than a Leeds ironmaster the University of London. To expect endowments for the Calcutta University as distinct from its colleges is to demand too much from local patriotism. Local patriotism, however, may confidently be expected to respond to local development. Even a small college like Krishnagar has received much from local contributions; its actual endowment, not to mention prizes and scholarships, is rapidly approaching a lakh of rupees. The Rajshahi College, too, to mention only one other example, has been well served as Bengal colleges go by private effort. The origin of most local colleges has been by private effort and the private effort is the more laudable as it does not as a rule result in added income to the founder. Though many of these colleges are ill equipped and inefficient generally, the fault is more due to the changing and unsatisfactory standards of Calcutta than to the local people.

For proper endowment too efficient management is necessary, management which will secure the funds of the institution being used to the best purpose. Rightly or wrongly the impression has prevailed in many quarters that the present university has not deserved encouragement. Suspicions perhaps accumulate in direct ratio to one's distance from Calcutta, but it is perfectly natural that local contributions should not be given to Calcutta when local influence in the university is so slight. Local patriotism in Bengal is strong and as yet it has not been tested for university work, a distinct from collegiate work.

I consider that in this respect as in others the scheme I advocate is more feasible. The State University will be able to accumulate endowments as well as the proposed Calcutta University and the concentration in mofussil colleges will give full opportunity for local effort, both private and municipal.

GOSWAMI BHAGABAT KUMAR Sastri

All interests should be adequately represented in the University administration which is now practically run by masterful lawyers. The University, when it ceases to be the lawyers' concern, may perhaps be run on practical lines in every sphere.

GUPTA AMRITA LAL

The available financial resources of Bengal are neither used in the most economical way nor to secure efficiency in the best possible way.

The dual control of the University and the directorate and the responsibility divided between them appear to be prejudicial to the best interests of Government schools and colleges in the province. The duplication of the ministerial staff and of the extremely costly supervision, control and direction should be done away with.

Secondary schools form the heart of the educational system of this as well as other countries. They are also the feeders of the University. If the quality of the teachers in the schools is improved the need for a costly inspection and supervision will diminish greatly. To improve the character of secondary schools the pay and prospects of teachers, a very important factor determining their efficiency, should be improved at once. It is idle to expect noble example, manly inspiration and high ideals from a man half starved himself and burdened with a half starved family in addition perpetually troubled with anxiety for the daily bread and with the little life left in him shrunk into epigastrium. It is bad economy and utter neglect of efficiency to deny even a cottage allowance to those who strive to work nobly on a miserable pittance scarcely sufficient to keep body and soul together. The worst is to grant house or local allowances to those who with their princely salaries can afford to live in palaces in the face of the afore said

GUPTA, AMRITA DAT *contd*—HUQ, The Hon'ble Maulvi A K FUZZUL—IYER, The Hon'ble Mr Justice T V. SESHAGIRI—JONES, T CUTHBERTSON

circumstances crying for immediate attention To ensure a steady progress of the car of education the horses drawing it should be properly cared for The educational salvation of the country lies in sincerely trying to secure the excellence of the indigenous products

Despite the praiseworthy motive, the training colleges of the province are but costly nothings on account of a deplorable lack of appreciation, encouragement, and opening for the trained and successful teachers and facility for the conscientious discharge of duties

The University ought to be the one authority—supreme and final—in educational matters in the present circumstances and it should be at once a federal and teaching organisation for economy and efficiency The private colleges affiliated to the University should be treated as federal units, managing their own internal affairs independently, but to check the deplorable growth of commercial spirit in some of the private colleges University auditors should be appointed with a view to see that profits are not enjoyed by the proprietors alone at the cost of efficiency, but are shared by the teaching staff for a heartier co-operation and a portion is set aside as a reserve fund for the benefit of the institution Government colleges should all be under the direct management of the University and a university service should be organised Divisional educational services and divisional boards of education, responsible for the primary and secondary education of the division concerned to the University, but having freedom to provide for, and direct the teaching of, some craft or industry of local importance determined after a thorough and scientific investigation of natural resources and facilities, should be organised The education of the whole province, or of any consolidated area, should be a continuous process and, in the whole system, the University should be the head, and the local and federal units, *e.g.*, the University colleges, the private colleges, the divisional boards, etc., should be the members

HUQ, The Hon'ble Maulvi A K. FUZZUL.

My answer to the first question is emphatically in the negative

IYER, The Hon'ble Mr Justice T V. SESHAGIRI.

This has been answered to a certain extent by my previous observations I do not think that such money as is necessary is being spent upon higher education Whatever may be the present-day necessity for a more economical administration of public funds there should be no attempt to starve higher education The extent of the financial help which can be got from the people in Madras is not encouraging The zamindars of the place, who alone are competent to endow colleges or chaus, have not got the same interest in education as is expected of them If they are more enlightened probably they may feel inclined to encourage education among the people

JONES, T CUTHBERTSON

Assuming that the financial resources suitable for higher education in Bengal are employed pretty much on the same system, or lack of system, as in the United Provinces, I am of opinion that they are not employed in the most economical way. In the United Provinces money is lavished upon new laboratories and hostels in one or two Government institutions, while aided institutions, which form the vast majority of the colleges affiliated to the University, are sometimes insufficiently endowed, or not endowed at all, and make both ends meet chiefly by the income derived from fees, and from what they can get from Government in the shape of annual and special grants

I think a better system would be for the University to be self-contained and, subject to the ultimate authority of the local Government, self controlled, severed from all connection with the Department of Education and free to use its own financial resources for the up-keep of the University and the maintenance of the university staff, as well

JONES T CUTHBERTSON—*contd*—KAR SITES CHANDRA—KARVE D K

as in assisting affiliated colleges when necessary abolishing the present distinction between Government and aided colleges. If the University were as I have suggested in my answer to question 7 intimately connected with the general industrial and commercial development of the country it might with a better conscience than at present appeal for popular support and larger Government grants might be confidently expected. Further the throwing open to Indians of more posts in the highly paid Imperial services would provide a good reason for a much higher rate of fees. A student or should be willing to pay more a month for the chance of getting a post worth from Rs 500 to Rs 2 000 per month than he would for one worth Rs 70 to Rs 300. In addition to the amount sanctioned each year by the Government of India for the purpose of university education to the different provinces the local Government should be empowered to levy taxes for the purpose of higher education. Private benevolence will only flow in the direction of colleges and universities if Government make it clear that special recognition will be accorded in the shape of titles and rewards to those who endow higher education. Grants should be made to colleges by the University according to their needs and requirement.

It seems important that colleges outside the university town should be maintained at a high level of efficiency if the rush to the centre is to be avoided. In the United Provinces it is only in so far as aided colleges like those at Lucknow, Agra and Aligarh have been able to maintain themselves against the attraction of the University centre in Allahabad that the tragic fate of the Calcutta University has been avoided. Personally I prefer a university organisation under which members of the university staff are recruited by public advertisement throughout the Empire and are all placed upon the same footing as university servants to the present system with one model Government college and a number of inadequately equipped insufficiently staffed aided colleges.

KAR SITES CHANDRA

Yes I do not think further economy can be effected without detriment.

KARVE, D K

With regard to the first part of the question I have no knowledge so as to enable me to give a reply. To the second part of the question as also with regard to the control of the universities my reply is as follows—

The present organisation of the University has almost made the University a department of Government hence people and especially educated people do not take sufficient interest in it. In order to make universities popular and in order that they may appeal to the imagination of the people the organisation of the University must be made more popular. At present nearly 80 per cent of the fellows are nominated by Government. The graduates of the University have practically no voice in the management. The rules for the registration of graduates are prohibitive and almost insulting. These rules must be modified. Registration of graduates ought to be an automatic matter on payment of a small fee for life. Then these registered graduates should be allowed to elect a large number of fellows of the University. Again patrons who pay large amounts to the University as donations should be given the right of electing a certain number of fellows. This will be an inducement to the rich to help the University financially. By these reforms the universities should be made largely popular bodies and then and then only will the universities appeal to the people. In this respect I might mention the experience of the Indian Women's University with headquarters at Poona. On account of the popular constitution of the University it has been able to secure the sympathy of a large body of educated Indians. The graduate voters of this two year old University are nearly a thousand in number. The members take a keen interest in the management and progress of the University.

LAHIRI, BRCHARAM—LAHIRY, RANOJIT CHANDRA—MAHALANOBIS, PRASANTA CHANDRA

LAHIRI, BRCHARAM

No, unnecessarily costly professors are brought from England. Useless, at the same time prohibitive, costs of inspecting agencies. The following list would show that the financial resources were not at all economically employed. If capable Indians be appointed much extravagant expense may be saved.

Officers recruited for the Indian educational service since its reorganisation on the 23rd July, 1896

Years	No of appointments	Indians
1896-1900	29	<i>Nil</i>
1901-05	52	<i>Nil</i>
1906-10	92	<i>Nil</i>
1911-16	115	7

The figures speak for themselves. No comment is necessary.

In order to strengthen and expand higher education Government ought to allow a larger amount. This may be done—

- (a) By reduction of police expenditure
- (b) By imposing tax on the lines of the Calcutta Improvement Trust—terminal tax of one pice on all intending passengers
- (c) By the establishment of a special trust fund committee of the University which will be pleased to accept small donations, honours, and titles, and special distinctions may be conferred on those who may be pleased to contribute handsomely to this Trust Fund.

There is vast scope for private liberality if a well-organised Government department be opened solely for that purpose.

LAHIRY, RANOJIT CHANDRA

The financial resources are not employed in the most economical way. In second-grade colleges professors have scarcely sufficient employment. These colleges should be allowed to be connected with high English schools. Arrangements for special tutorial assistance, on payment of a special fee, by professors who have not sufficient employment, to students who may want it, is likely to appeal for support from private liberality.

The cost of buildings is proportionately high. More attention should be given to secure competent professors.

MAHALANOBIS, PRASANTA CHANDRA

A certain number of central advisory committees should be formed to advise individual colleges in matters of buildings, equipment, etc.

A good deal of economy might be attained, for example, if a central apparatus committee is formed which will keep a general inventory of all expensive instruments, etc., and would be thus in a position to advise about particular requirements.

A central commission for giving advice on general educational matters should prove highly useful. This commission should be purely advisory in character, but should form a constituent part of the University. The value of educational surveys has been well demonstrated by the Carnegie Foundation and a permanent commission for the performance of work of a similar nature is necessary. The subject of "examination," for example, has received very little of the attention it deserves. A special committee for investigating the inherent advantages and disadvantages of examination tests is urgently necessary for the general educational progress of the whole world.

MAJUMDAR RAMESH CHANDRA—MALLIK Dr D N

MAJUMDAR RAMESH CHANDRA

No I do not find any rhyme or reason for appointing European professors on a high scale of salary and at a higher grade of service. This pernicious system is at the root of many evils in the existing educational system. Indian professors deprived of their legitimate aspirations and made subordinate to persons decidedly inferior to them in mental capacity lose all heart in the work and high education in the country consequently suffers a great deal. A distinct organisation under the University should be entrusted with the management of the sum of money earmarked for education. It should have a free hand in appointing professors awarding grants to private colleges, establishing colleges where it likes and abolishing existing Government colleges if it thinks that the charges for maintaining them are too heavy.

MALLIK Dr D N

Yes on the whole so far as I know though not exactly in all cases.

The main source of the University is the income from fees. The first charge on this should be remuneration to examiners. This is not at present adequate.

In this connection it should be borne in mind that when the teaching university is separated from the examining body (of the federal type I hope) the income from fees (any part of it) will not be available for financing post graduate work. Till therefore private liberality and public resources are available in sufficient amount to replace this the separation of the teaching and federal bodies cannot be contemplated.

When the separation is effected on a sound financial basis the large income from fees now derived may well be utilised in improving the constituent colleges of the federal university.

I should like also in this connection to refer to the financial basis of the present post-graduate scheme. A considerable number of lecturers receive Rs 200 per mensem in the minimum pay of the Provincial educational service the prospects of which are inferior to those of most other Government departments. The salary is really of the value of a research fellowship. Unless therefore provision is made for giving suitable prospects to these men there will be discontent and consequent inefficiency.

There is also another aspect allied to the financial from which the post graduate scheme has to be regarded. The present practice of using the Darbhanga buildings for University offices and meetings for law classes as well as for post graduate classes cannot be viewed in any other light than as a temporary arrangement. Fortunately the fish market is available and it seems to me to be almost essential that immediate steps should be taken to house the post-graduate classes suitably.

The University (being arranged on a federal basis) should have greater control over the finances of the constituent private colleges.

At the first blush it may appear to be reasonable that Government expenditure on higher education would be best incurred by a grant to the University. This is not however desirable. Up to the graduate stage Government colleges should be *model* for private colleges to imitate. For post-graduate work also Government colleges should not lose their individuality. The professors doing post graduate work in the colleges ought to do some amount of undergraduate work. This is desirable in every way. The organisation I should favour would be to constitute a university post graduate college of arts and university college of science as distinct colleges (with their governing bodies etc) duly affiliated to the University. These together with the post-graduate department of the Presidency and other colleges should constitute the post-graduate body to be governed by the post graduate council of which the members should be the teachers in these institutions or their representatives. The representatives of the council of post-graduate studies and of a similar council of the undergraduate studies together with a few outsiders nominated by Government and a few elected by graduates other than teachers should form the senate.

MAZUMDAR, The Hon'ble Babu AMVIKA CHARAN—MITRA, The Hon'ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA, Bahadur—MUKERJEE, ADHAR CHANDRA—MUKERJEE, SATISH CHANDRA

MAZUMDAR, The Hon'ble Babu AMVIKA CHARAN.

I cannot speak with confidence about the financial resources of the University. But I can say with some degree of knowledge that a large percentage of Government allotments for education is frittered away in superfluous and excessive inspection. The high schools even belonging to Government are starved, ill staffed, and insufficiently provided with class accommodation, there is quite an army of inspectors of all ranks who seldom look to actual education, but are constantly on the move to enforce building regulations and do the work of sanitary inspectors. If this army were reduced to a reasonable limit a large portion of Government grants would be released either for the development of higher education or for the improvement of primary education. A top heavy construction is always unsafe whether in architecture or in education.

MITRA, The Hon'ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA, Bahadur.

A large portion of educational grants is spent on appointing too many inspectors. The posts of some of the inspectors may be abolished and the savings therefrom may be utilised for actual teaching purposes. A redistribution of the pay of the higher grade officers is necessary. Some officers are liberally paid while others are ill-paid. There should be no distinction between the Provincial and the Indian educational services. If possible, the system of granting pensions to retiring officers in the Education Department should be revised. Provident funds, such as are prevalent in the Railway Department, should be started, and, instead of granting pensions, a lump sum accumulated in the provident fund may be given to the retiring officer. But this system should not be introduced unless it is found that the retiring officer gets a decent sum of money at the time of his retirement. The working of the University may be satisfactorily conducted in the following way—Each school or college must have a governing body. The members of the governing body must be elected by the guardians of students residing in those schools and colleges and the members of the district boards and municipalities. Other educationists of the locality should also have the power to vote for membership of the governing body. The governing body should be given some liberty in framing the budget of the particular school and in appointing or dismissing teachers and professors. The governing body should frame rules according to the peculiar needs of each place. The working of the governing body of each institution may be supervised by the members of the Syndicate, who should be elected by the members of the governing body of all colleges and schools. There should be a fixed number of representatives from each district. The Vice-Chancellor of the University should be elected by the senate.

MUKERJEE, ADHAR CHANDRA

Proprietary colleges should not be countenanced, for in such colleges all the income is not spent for the benefit of the college and its students.

MUKERJEE, SATISH CHANDRA.

In order to establish colleges of agriculture, technology, and commerce the University, with the sanction of Government, can make use of the resources that are already present, *e.g.*, Pusa Research Institute, Sabour Agricultural College, Serampore Weaving School, Government Commercial School, etc., and even private institutions like the Indian Association for the Cultivation of Science and Bengal Technical Institute can be persuaded to join the University. Law and journalism can be taught in one and the same college, and the Sanskrit and Madrasa Colleges can be converted into theological

FFJI SATI H CHANDRA—*contd*—NAIK, K. C.—North Bengal Zamindars Association
Rangpur—LAL The Honble Lal RADHA CHARAN Bahadur

leges. Private munificence is also sure to flow into the University if it is made apparent that henceforth such training is being given to some students as will enable them to enter new careers.

If an ideal university college be established it is sure to appeal to the imagination of any rich Hindu who may be expected to endow it. A similar college for Mussalmans will draw pecuniary help from the Mussalman community.

The public will help the University if they are directly benefited by it in their turn. In a large number of university extensions lectures are delivered in Bengal in different parts of the country and if there is a Welfare Work Department attached to the University (as in American universities) and if the research work carried on in the university throws light on important problems of the country the University will become very popular and attract private munificence. It is further desirable that the school and college buildings should be utilized for holding evening classes and vacation classes (during vacations) for the education of the masses where teachers and students will work as honorary teachers.

NAIK, K. C.

Government colleges which are represented as model institutions could be administered by the University. Government transferring all the staff buildings and materials to the control of the University. Then we shall be in a position to derive the largest benefit from public funds spent rather lavishly to maintain these institutions. The profuse spending of public money has made it very difficult for private colleges to exist. In fact the latter work against powerful odds. Moreover the staff of these Government run colleges is under no control of the University and hence they give the least work in cohesion and in collaboration with the University. They can stand out as distinct units if they cannot monopolize the University and the various boards under it. I should propose even to recruit Indian educational service men on the distinct understanding that they have to be under the control of the University for what good can those professors do who would not like to be controlled by the University which should mainly be composed of themselves? If this is done and if Government interference in the University is reduced to a minimum I am sure private donations to the extent of millions would come forth once the people are satisfied that they will be managed by men who are allowed to use their democratic power and discretion.

North Bengal Zamindars Association, Rangpur

No. a very great part of the available resources is spent on the construction of substantial buildings and residential quarters without leaving a sufficient margin for the working of the institutions and their recurring expenditure. In a poor country like India particular emphasis should be laid on economy. A great majority of the students develop a very false notion of their pecuniary position by living in great mansions in student life and eventually find their paternal cottages uncomfortable. The practice of *Brahmacharyya* should be insisted upon. In order to draw support from private liberality second grade colleges should be widely distributed in rural areas. The motto education with minimum cost should be adhered to.

PAL The Honble Rai RADHA CHARAN, Bahadur

I think not very great waste is involved in having to provide institutions for those who do not come to the University for the sake of higher education but for entry into services and professions and no improvement is possible so long as huge numbers continue to be examined from one centre. The first step to be taken is to reduce

PAL, The Hon'ble Sri RADHA CHAKRA Bahadur - *contd.* — RAHM, The Hon'ble M Justice ABDUR — RAY, MANMATHANATH

the numbers coming to the University by the institution of a suitable school final examination for those who require only a working knowledge of the English language and other subjects suitable for entry into service and professions. After the numbers are reduced in this way residential college should be provided for those who go in for a training in science or technology, or for literary education in the case of those who intend to take to a life of study and culture. There should be separate institutions for study for the professions. In these institutions general courses of higher culture suited to the particular profession should be introduced. As regards residential arrangements, and for the equipment of institutions in general, it should be borne in mind that neither the minds nor the habits of Indians require anything elaborate or expensive, and every effort should be made to keep expenditure under this head within strict limit. Nothing should be done which would encourage in student extravagant or uneconomical habits. The tendency during recent years has been in the direction of making university education more and more expensive so that at the present time, university education is already becoming almost prohibitive as regards most parents in Bengal. Efforts should, therefore be directed towards cheapening higher education. In the most ideal, at all events, where land is cheap and the standard of living not so high as it is in Calcutta, the object might, perhaps, be attained by attaching to each institution large areas of land and utilising the produce. It would not only be an attempt to promote the health of students, but might also be made the means of giving them a grounding in practical agriculture and, if sufficient funds were forthcoming, to set up workshops and other appliances for also giving them a training in some common art or handicraft. In this way, not only might students be given a training in some useful and remunerative industry side by side with high mental training, but also the sale of the produce both of the land and the workshops would probably be found to go some way toward cheapening the cost of education to the benefit of the parents and of the country.

RAHM, The Hon'ble Mr Justice ABDUR

I cannot say whether the financial resources available for higher education in Bengal are, or are not utilised in the most economical way. The best way of making a more powerful appeal for support from private liberality would be, first of all, to establish a university centre where rich parents can see at a glance the advantages of a well-endowed, well organised and up-to-date university. I should also have some of them on the governing body and confer honorary academic degrees on the more munificent benefactors. If the main idea is carried out there should be no difficulty in obtaining far more generous support from public sources.

RAY, MANMATHANATH.

There are no materials before the public by which the public may be satisfied that the financial resources of the colleges are employed in the most economical way.

The proper application of funds should be examined by a standing committee of the Senate on the footing that each college is held in trust for the public. The existence of such a committee will be a powerful appeal for support from private liberality, as well as from public sources.

There is a statutory obligation in English universities for the preparation and publication of college accounts.

The standing committee of the Senate may also consider other matters, e.g., the question of affiliation in additional subjects, which would involve additional expenditure. The committee may have to consider whether there should be affiliation in the additional subject, or whether the students should attend the lectures on that subject in another college which would effect economy, and would also prevent competition and underselling.

141 SARAT CHANDRA—ROY The Hon ble Rai SRI NATH Bahadur—ROY The Hon ble Babu SURENDRA NATH—SARKAR KALIPADA—SASTRI Rai RAJENDRA CHANDRA Bahadur—Scottish Churches College Senatus Calcutta

RAY, SARAT CHANDRA

I think the financial resources are employed economically but the resources should be increased

ROY, The Hon ble Rai SRI NATH, Bahadur

Yes

ROY, The Hon'ble Babu SURENDRA NATH

I think the financial resources already available for higher education in Bengal are employed in the most economical way

SARKAR, KALIPADA

I would spend less on buildings in many cases. I am also of opinion that furniture especially in schools is a costly item. Not the least harm would be done if we had fewer benches and stools for the youngsters especially in the lower forms. Squatting on the floor overspread with mats in the orthodox oriental fashion will do equally well. Spend as much as you can on teachers and teaching appliances and as little as practicable on other items. The idiosyncrasies of individual officers should be kept under proper check as they alienate popular sympathy. Let the University lay down after careful consideration the minimum requirements and let there be no bar to the recognition of schools and colleges on account of individual likes and dislikes provided the prescribed minimum is attained. Undue restrictions should not be placed on the spread of education. What the country wants at present is more education sound but not costly.

SASTRI Rai RAJENDRA CHANDRA Bahadur

It is very difficult to answer the first part of the question. But this much is certain that the newly created post graduate system makes the nearest approach to the organisation contemplated under this head.

Scottish Churches College Senatus, Calcutta

We consider that the financial resources already available are *not* at present utilised in the most economical way. We consider that a far greater proportion of public money and of money available from private liberality should be devoted to the strengthening of high schools and colleges. The money which has been spent in the institution of highly specialised professorships might be considered to be better purpose and the policy is an illustration of the mistake of building an elaborate superstructure before the foundations have been properly laid. It is not yet ready to support a large number of highly qualified specialists. Only a few men of very outstanding ability have been appointed but they have frequently devoted themselves to narrow specialisation and have exercised little influence on education as a whole. They are in any case too few in number to undertake any great share in the education of the more advanced students and the larger part of the teaching in the post graduate classes has had to be left to junior less experienced men who have been appointed in unnecessarily large numbers who have to teach under adverse conditions heterogeneous masses of students who would be far better employed if they were left in close connection with the

Scottish Churches College Senatus, Calcutta—*contd* —SEAL, Dr. BRAJENDRANATH

colleges to which they originally belonged, these colleges being enabled, through public or private benefactions, to employ a more adequate staff than at present. We consider that the ideal is that the colleges should be so strengthened that they may be able to carry on to post-graduate work a few of their own students—and a few only—whose abilities have been gauged and whose studies may, therefore, be more profitably directed. We consider that only students who have taken up honours in a subject in the B A course should be permitted to go on to post-graduate work in that subject and that, for the majority of students, the B A, and not the M A, should be regarded as the natural conclusion of their academic career. We consider that overlapping could easily be prevented by mutual arrangement between colleges, and that the considerations we have urged under our answer to question 5 should secure that the teaching in each college would have a certain definite character which would, naturally, suggest the lines on which it would specialise in post-graduate work.

If, further, greater importance were assigned to the colleges they would more readily call forth liberality from the members of the communities with which they are more specially connected.

SEAL, Dr. BRAJENDRANATH

We spend too much on building, and too little on men. And the amount of money we spend on the superior grades of the teaching profession (or service) is entirely out of proportion to the amount of work they do. Excluding the medical, engineering, and training colleges, we have, or had shortly, on the effective teaching staff of our Government colleges in Bengal, about 16 per cent. Indian educational service, 61 per cent. Provincial educational service, and 23 per cent. Subordinate educational service men. And there is not any considerable distinction in kind, or quantity (or for that matter in quality), of work as between the I E S and the P E S men (taken as a whole). In fact, the first-grade Government colleges other than the Presidency, Dacca, and Rajshahi, are manned by P E S men, headed by an I E S principal in each case, and, of the three exceptions, the big college at Rajshahi is administered by a principal in the P E S. The time for appointing men from abroad for *general* educational or administrative work (as distinct from *special* charges) is drawing to a close. No doubt, subjects like English constitutional history, Greek and Roman history, and some of the recent developments of the mathematical, physical, biological, and sociological sciences—I mean those that are yet in a nascent experimental stage, and especially those that are yet heterodox in the ranks of science—should be taught by specialists who have been trained in European universities in the particular work or department concerned, and we must continue to appoint such men, and be prepared to pay the price. The European must be compensated for his loss of domicile, and the salary must be commensurate with his style of living; this is only just and fair. But, this makes it all the more necessary that we should not employ the costly agency except where the interests of *educational* efficiency would otherwise suffer. And these specialists' appointments should, ordinarily, be on special terms for a fixed tenure and outside the cadre of the service. If once the educational services (with these exceptional appointments outside the cadre) were organised on an Indian basis it would not be necessary to pay the Indian staff on the same scale as the European though, under existing conditions, this is a regrettable necessity of any reorganisation of the educational services.

I may be permitted to touch on a matter going beyond the scope of the question, but hardly irrelevant in this connection, I mean the expenditure on the superior inspecting service, whether Indian or otherwise. It would be more economical to employ Indian inspectors of schools after giving them a special training in the theory and practice of teaching (with educational psychology and history), the methods of school management and school inspection, and the experimental study of school children. The staff of the teachers' training colleges should contain some Indians trained in Europe or America, and these last, in collaboration with the experimental psychology department, should be able to carry on experiments in child study and school teaching, and to devise

SRI Dr BRAJENDRANATH—*contd*

an educational methodology more adapted to the Bengali tradition the Bengali psychology and the Bengali physical environment than the loosely fitting (and hitting at random) formula derived from a cultural tradition and temper widely different from the Indian. Hitherto our school inspectors Indian or foreign with the honourable exceptions as ever have had no training in child study or experimental child psychology and in the case of many members of the superior staff are ignorant of the ways or even the language of Indian children (except a mere smattering sufficient to make the darkness visible). I do not think that too much is spent on inspection the pity is that the money is thrown away on a thing so effete as judged by modern methods of school management.

As regards State grants to the universities I do not think that the money is ill spent on hostels or laboratories or on the University post graduate staff. A great experiment was made in inviting eminent men of science or letters to the University in connection with its chairs and readerships. The experiment was abundantly worth making it has established the position that expansion from within with the natural co-ordination of teacher and pupil and of regional needs and interests is the broad path marked out for this University though loans and still more exchanges of professors will always serve as sign posts on the way. Again the endowment of research as such in the University for permanent ends has prior claims on Indian philanthropists and even the Indian public funds so far as it is research by Indians (in the most comprehensive sense of the term). A colony of foreign men of science or letters for example carrying on pure humanistic or naturalistic research in an orientalist or research institute and exploiting the intellectual resources of the Indian cultural zone may be a good thing for the world at large and for India but this is not an object on which the University funds (or the exiguous public funds) can legitimately be spent. Again in the university organisation foreigners may and should be employed in the first instance to train Indians for research in certain technical departments but this is clearly only a provisional and preliminary step of which the success is to be measured by its speedy abandonment. Finally the development by the State of the country's resources material as well as moral by means of research may offer a more legitimate field for foreign experts and their assistance but the best resource of a country is of course the capacity of its people and the best of capacities is the capacity for self development with free utilisation of material from abroad. This therefore should be the one objective of all cultural development.

Confining myself to Bengal and the neighbouring provinces the promoters of the Hindu University and of the proposed National College for Muhammadans in Calcutta seem to have solved the problem in one way. The Science College Foundation is a solution along a different line. These are organisations either in broad denominational interest or for the cultivation of research by Indian men of science which has a fascination for every educated Bengali of our day. Local and regional need cultural or industrial so far as they are genuine and not forced *ab extra* will always command financial support. Witness the many college foundations springing up in the districts of Bengal. In one case the money was forthcoming but the scheme was ill conceived and came to naught. Just now a technological and agricultural department opened under the auspices of the University is likely to capture the public imagination (and public purse though more shyly after recent experience) provided it is worked exactly on the lines of the Science College Foundation. If these conditions should be wanting the scheme will have to be run by the University on what funds it can spare from its own resources or can procure from Government. It must be clear from the very beginning that the scheme aims at turning out Indian industrials of all sorts and grades overseers and foremen as well as Indian captains of industry and *entrepreneur* who will no doubt begin on the lowest rungs of the ladder but need not necessarily stop there and who will be given the theoretical as well as the practical training which will qualify them in time when they come to the top for the highest enterprise and research. What is essential to the success of this new technological organisation of the University is the co-ordination and co-operation of the landholding interests the banking concerns and the hereditary skilled labour with the landless moneyless intellectuals who will supply the brains in this partnership. In other words we must begin at both ends or rather at all the four ends if this new organisation of the University is not to court failure. The times are ripe overripe for

SEAL, DI BRAJENDRANATH—*contd.*—SEN, ATUL CHANDRA—SEN, RAJ BOIKUNT NATH, Bahadur

such a form of university organisation. For the same reason, an engineering college at Dacca, and weaving and textile schools in centres of jute, etc., are also likely to meet with financial support.

In these questions, we have kept in view the economical use of the financial resources already available for higher education in this province, and also incentives to private liberality in this direction. Other financial questions do not come within the scope of the Commission. But, all said and done, the prime necessity is to devise ways and means, to devise the expansion of public funds for the expansion and reconstruction of a national system of education, in all its grades, primary, secondary, as well as higher. "The public revenues," says Burke, "are the sinews of the State, or, if you please, the sinews, nervous arms of public beneficence relieving public necessities, through the central agency of the State." The problem of educational expansion, therefore, like every other problem of State, is fundamentally also a problem of financial expansion. The questions, therefore, of an education cess (or cesses) and of the allotment of an increased percentage of the public revenues to education are questions that must be raised and answered if university education in Bengal is to be cast (or recast) on sound and progressive lines.

SEN, ATUL CHANDRA.

At present, the money available for higher education is spent in maintaining several Government colleges and an inspecting staff and awarding scholarships. A diversion may be made which would confer greater benefits on the people than the present system of expenditure. I would suggest the closing of a number of Government colleges, such as the Hughli and the Krishnagar colleges. Only one college may be maintained by Government at each university centre. The money thus saved should be handed over to the universities, for distribution among their constituent colleges according to their respective needs, either as capital or recurring grants.

Private colleges must cease to have even a semblance of the proprietary character. If they are placed in this respect on the same footing with other public institutions there is no reason why they should be debarred from getting any financial help either from public funds or private charity.

The money spent by Government on higher education is not adequate to the needs of the country. Moreover, a considerable portion of that money is spent in maintaining a costly inspecting staff, whose usefulness is not commensurate with the cost incurred. Government might well transfer a part of the work now done by the Education Department to the different councils of education and provide them with ample funds for carrying on their work.

SEN, RAJ BOIKUNT NATH, Bahadur.

To the first portion of the question my answer is in the negative. Popular views should be accurately and definitely ascertained. The views expressed by Government officials in the matter of expansion of higher education are often not in harmony with popular ideas, and private liberality for the economical administration of educational institutions and development of higher education, becomes discouraged and loses its enthusiasm. Some of the expensive, nice, commodious college buildings in Calcutta demonstrate the private liberality of individuals when they appreciate and realise the nature and magnitude of good work.

Outside Calcutta, private charity is most prominent in many districts, notably in the district of Murshidabad, where the private charity of the Hon'ble Maharajah Sir Manindra Chandra Nandi, in furtherance of higher education, must have been noticed by the Commission, which, I feel sure, has become convinced that the capable portion of the community with adequate resources ungrudgingly comes forward for the advancement of knowledge. The districts of Rajshahi, Nadia, Jessore, Rangpur, Birbhum, Khulna, Howrah, Hooghly, and Midnapur also afford instances of spontaneous private charity connected with matters educational.

SEN Rai BOKUNT NATH Bahadur—*contd*—SEN GUPTA SURENDRA MOHAN

The Pusa and Sabour Agricultural Government colleges furnish examples of disregard for economy against almost universal public opinion. The absolute failure of the Sabour College is not a matter of controversy. The Pusa College has done much important valuable research work but the question is whether the expansion and diffusion of knowledge can be considered to be proportionate to the heavy expenditure initially incurred and the recurring expenses on its maintenance. It is not merely scepticism on the part of the educated community but it is their conviction and firm belief that the expenditure incurred on the establishment and maintenance of the Pusa College could have been better utilised for the more urgent needs of Bengal and that the Agricultural Department requires a thorough overhauling and a radical change.

SEN GUPTA SURENDRA MOHAN

The financial resources are not spent in the most economical way. There should be more co-operation between the colleges and the University. The University should be federal in reality, not in name alone. Teachers should have a more effective voice on the Senate. Academic councils should be set up in each divisional head quarters for the present of not more than fifty and not less than thirty members. Two fifths will be elected by the teachers of the colleges, one fifth by the teachers of the schools, one fifth by the educated public and one fifth nominated by the Government of the province. These academic councils will together form the Senate including some other members whom the Senate will elect. The Senate will be the supreme controlling body where the budget of the University will be passed. It will have the right to elect the chief executive (Vice Chancellor) of the University. The Chancellor shall have the right of veto. The University should be relieved from the fetters of unalterable regulations. The Senate will determine its regulations and will be free to discuss and settle all matters on their merits alone. In colleges in Calcutta or the mofussil there are some teachers who are competent to teach the post graduate courses. Those colleges will be granted affiliation in those subjects for the post graduate studies. In the case of Calcutta colleges students taking up science subjects will work in their college laboratory if that be considered sufficient for the purpose by the University or in the University science laboratory. The University only maintaining some laboratory directors who would look after the practical work of the students. In the case of students taking up art subjects similar provision would be made by the University library if necessary under the librarians of the University. In the mofussil the academic councils will approach rich people of the locality for libraries or laboratories and organise post graduate studies in the centres. More and more centres of culture should be opened up and greater facilities for study should be offered to students. The University will directly make provision for teaching those subjects which cannot be arranged for by the academic councils and the other constituent colleges. The study of law should not be restricted but may be easily made over to the constituent colleges wherever provision can be made.

Schools and colleges can easily be made self supporting if some of the professors are entitled to lecture to post graduate students the University may easily diminish its costly establishment to a very great extent.

And money that is spent by the Government of the province on collegiate education may be more profitably utilised. Instead of maintaining all Government colleges some of them like the Berhampur College may be handed over to public bodies and the money to the academic councils. Government may retain two of them as model colleges.

Another feature of the University is the number of private colleges. Whatever may be their defects—they are perhaps too numerous—they have been responsible for the spread of education in a far greater degree than Government college. Even the Presidency and Rajshahi colleges owe their inception to private endowments. So it cannot be said that the rich and intelligent men were at any time backward in supporting education. But the scant recognition of their worth by the University is a disgrace to that body. Even colleges which are backed by the richer people and organisations (like Burdwan, Berhampur, Hetampur, Scottish Churches and Cooch

Behar colleges) do not fare much better In making an endowment for a college as distinguished from an endowment to the University people may be deterred by the thought that they may not have any position in the Senate of the University The Maharajah of Kasimbazar was appointed an honorary fellow as soon as he endowed the University No notice was taken of his benefaction to the Behampur College though the amount spent by him on that college seems to be much greater than his university endowment Evening and night colleges and schools for working men should be encouraged

Serampore College, Serampore.

There is ample scope for seeking to employ in a more economical way the financial resources already available for higher education in Bengal So far as Calcutta itself is concerned we have already expressed the opinion that greater efficiency would be secured if the regular teaching were concentrated in a thoroughly equipped and commodious central institution, and the colleges became halls of residence, exercising tutorial supervision Colleges and schools in mofussil areas like the Hughli district could be reduced in number to the advantage of all concerned Here, we have three colleges and a large number of high schools, all more or less imperfectly manned and equipped Such a state of things would never be tolerated in a similar area in Great Britain There, the need for concentration in high schools and colleges is regarded as an essential feature of university administration and reform The Hughli district could do very well with three high schools and one college Combination of forces would be more feasible if the number of classes in high schools were reduced to five or six, apart from the proposed post matriculation class Boys would thus remain in their own village vernacular schools until the age of ten or eleven, and then proceed to the local high school and begin the study of English under competent guidance As the most impressionable and formative years of a boy's life are passed in secondary schools we consider the improvement of these schools to be even more important than that of the higher stages of the university course The superstructure cannot be firm and well-placed unless the foundations are quite strong But the number of secondary schools is so large that one is overawed at the prospect of having to reform every one of them For one thing, the problem of money to finance them properly would appear to be almost insoluble in the present condition of our country We would, therefore, suggest that a few really first rate residential schools should be founded in different parts of the country and, if possible, let the students read there up to the intermediate standard We are of opinion that such schools should be run, as far as possible, on the lines of English public schools with modifications due to our peculiar conditions For their success it follows, therefore, that they should be managed by first-class head masters, preferably English, who should be helped by the best trained teachers in the country Provision should be made in these schools for manual training and for the practical teaching of elementary science, in addition to the existing matriculation course Physical exercise should be made compulsory for every student

As this type of schools would be very costly we would suggest that higher fees be charged from the students We believe that there is a class of people in our country who could afford to pay more for a higher type of education for their boys The effect of these schools on other secondary schools would be very great as the latter would try more and more to approach the standard of the former

SHARP, The Hon'ble Mr H

The question is difficult to answer because the money available is insufficient to deal adequately with the demand In two ways I would comment on the present objects of expenditure

- (a) There is a tendency to establish all sorts of courses in small colleges, whereas these would be better advised to confine themselves to comparatively few

SHARP The Hon ble Mr H—*contd*—SINGH PRAKAS CHANDRA—SINHA ANANDAKRISHNA

- subjects students who want other subject going to larger centres. Wherever possible inter collegiate lectures and tutorial work should be started.
- (b) Considerable amounts are paid for the higher forms of university study with out consolidation of the preliminary stages.

The formation of local universities will make possible a concentration of teaching in the higher grades. I do not mean that post graduate teaching should be forbidden in colleges that remain under the affiliating university. But such colleges would have to provide adequate facilities. Nor do I contemplate the transfer as a regular matter of students from smaller colleges under the affiliating university to a local university where they could complete their higher studies. To do so would constitute a breach of one of the main principles inculcated in the report of the Royal Commission on University Education in London. But that such transfer will take place is inevitable and is a fact which must be faced as one of the imperfections inherent in present conditions and in a transition period. It will be mitigated by the growth of local universities and the ability of a college to maintain post graduate classes will constitute a sign that it has arrived at the stage where it can be raised to the status of a local university.

I am not without hope that the establishment of local universities will stimulate private liberality within the locality to institute chairs. Where colleges remain under the affiliating university and are unable to provide for the higher standards private liberality might usefully take the form of sending a few deserving students to local universities for the whole of the college course.

SINGH PRAKAS CHANDRA

I have thought over this question long and discussed it with all my friends who take an interest in the matter.

The financial resources available are not employed in the most economical way.

The three most essential things for good education in a college are —

- (a) A good staff of professors and teachers
- (b) A good and healthy locality for the college and its hostels
- (c) Decent and commodious buildings for them

As regards (a) the State expenditure on this may be much reduced if the distinction between the Indian and Provincial service be done away with and the race question be altogether kept out of consideration in selecting candidates for appointments and in determining the scale of pay. I do not think the pay of the Indian professors—I mean of those in the Provincial service—is low but it is the difference between their pay and that of their European colleagues—though they may not be educationally or even as teachers better qualified than they—that is galling and a source of discontent. If only specially qualified men on higher personal pay are brought from outside the country—especially to teach scientific and mathematical subjects—a great deal of saving under this head may I think be made.

Some saving may be made also by not building such costly and palatial buildings for hostels etc. It is possible that both healthy and good but less showy hostel and college buildings may be constructed in healthy localities with less cost.

The Indian ideal is to make education not costly but cheap. In ancient India the professors fed the students and found accommodation for them in their own houses and the State supported the professors. The students had only to learn and pay nothing. Even if that ideal cannot possibly be followed under modern circumstances I think the chief aim of the University should be not to make education costly but as cheap as possible. The quality may be improved but not at the sacrifice of quantity.

SINHA ANANDAKRISHNA

The financial resources already available for higher education in Bengal are not employed in the most economical way. Government has got some colleges on which it spends lavishly but which are not worth it. The Krishnagar College and

SINHA, ANANDAKRISHNA—*contd* SINHA, KUMAR MANINDRA CHANDRA SINHA,
PANCHANAN—SUDMERSEN, F W

Hughli College, for example, teach only a limited number of students, but the drain on public finances is enormous in proportion to the benefits conferred by them. If the sums thus spent on these colleges are withheld, and the amount handed over to the University to be distributed as grants to private colleges, the position of these private colleges would be strengthened and they would be able to confer more benefits than the colleges at Hughli and Krishnagar are doing. I do not say that these colleges should be abolished, but my contention is that they should remain as semi-Government institutions. Let them be self-sufficient, as far as possible, and let the deficit only be given as grants by Government.

Then, again, though the proprietary system of colleges has long gone out of existence in name, it has not done so in reality. Each college (private) has got a pseudo-proprietor who is all in all. For example, the Ripon College is associated with the name of the Hon'ble Babu Surendranath Banerjee and Bangabasi College with that of Mr G C Bose. So long as this thing lasts, so long the institution does not really exist for itself, and no amount of appeal will draw public attention and charity. Why should the public subscribe to a college when it knows that such and such colleges are the properties of such and such men? If public help is to come forth this must be put an end to.

SINHA, KUMAR MANINDRA CHANDRA.

I do not consider that the financial resources are being used in an economical way. People of substance always avoid giving help because the present University does not claim their confidence. If things mend there will be growing opportunities for such an outside interest.

SINHA, PANCHANAN.

The answer is in the affirmative, except that sometimes third-rate men are brought from England at a cost considerably higher than that of first rate men of this country. I do not object to really first class Englishmen, but colour should not be a passport to the higher grades of the educational service.

Organisation of sectarian universities on purely indigenous lines may secure the objects aimed at.

SUDMERSEN, F. W.

Financial resources available for higher education in Bengal are largely expended in an unprofitable attempt to provide colleges in every limited area that produces a sufficient number of matriculates. Concentration of higher teaching in a few good colleges, with a carefully selected enrolment, would have produced a much better total effect upon education. Most of the colleges are really far below the level of an ordinary county council secondary school both in respect of the staff employed, the mental equipment of the pupils, the facilities for study, and of the outturn.

The unprofitable nature of the struggle to provide a college course for all who demand it has resulted in colleges being generally held in low repute by thoughtful men.

It is doubtful, however, whether much response will result from moneyed men even after a radical alteration of the whole university system. The large endowments recently secured in Calcutta have been mainly due to the weight and influence of the leading man of the Calcutta University, who has dreamt a dream and has succeeded in inspiring in a few others a hope of its realisation. Princely endowments in the European or American sense of that term are not likely in Bengal. It is all the more urgent that a concentration of effort be made.

WILLIAMS, Rev. GARFIELD—WORDSWORTH, The Hon.ble Mr. W. C.

WILLIAMS, Rev. GARFIELD

The best arrangement I can think of is that suggested in the educational report submitted as a general memorandum.

WORDSWORTH, The Hon.ble Mr. W. C.

Interpreting economical as efficient I do not. The organisation for higher teaching ascribes too large a share of the finances and certain more elementary needs are not met. The University spends no money in maintaining schools or colleges. This is left to the Department of Education. Certain capital grants are given annually to assist private colleges though financial stringency has interfered with this since the war began the grants are distributed by the University but the money is granted by Government. It is a matter of opinion whether the money spent on maintaining certain of the university chairs is well spent the value of these chairs is not patent to all. It is also a matter of opinion whether generous expenditure on such a subject as experimental psychology is justified—and generally whether the superstructure of higher studies is not too heavy and whether greater profit might not result from lightening the superstructure and strengthening the lower parts. Expert opinion might be consulted on the value of the research work now being done by universities and I am hand Royal hand scholars and on the equipment that these scholars possess for research. The work of two Government research scholars pursuing investigations in chemistry in the Presidency College was recently submitted to external valuation the work of one was approved of the other unhesitatingly condemned. The French and Russian scholars have not of recent years contributed much to the advancement of knowledge so far as I have been able to discover. Generally I consider that we should first of all aim at making satisfactory our teaching and our equipment for teaching the desire and capacity for research will then arise in due course. Hitherto I fear it has been artificially stimulated.

My answer to the second part of the question will be found in a separate memorandum.

QUESTION 21

Have you any suggestions or criticisms to offer with regard to the proposal that the University (and such of its constituent colleges as may desire) should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs with a view to facilitating—

- (a) an expansion of the activities of the University
- (b) the erection of suitable buildings for colleges and residences for teachers and students and, generally
- (c) the growth of corporate university life

ANSWERS

ABDURRAHMAN Dr

The Oxford and Cambridge idea of keeping the university segregated and away from the general life is not regarded with favour by the modern educationists. The educational cenobitism of the two famous English universities is a legacy to us from the monks of the Middle Ages. The idea of monastic education was to produce a particular type of human being by adopting what may be called the method of inhibition. The student was to be brought up in an artificial society. But the tide of life has caught even Oxford and Cambridge in its rush and if the universities have not gone to life, life has come to them. Oxford and Cambridge are now for all practical purposes like any other town.

Except for Cambridge and Oxford, Englishmen themselves have returned to the normal type of large town universities. All the latter universities of the British Isles such as London, Birmingham, Manchester, Edinburgh and Dublin have been established in the great centres of trade and commerce.

If the first purpose of a university is the discovery and publication of truth and the library, laboratory and the observation of life are its proper tools, it cannot be permitted to withdraw from the world. The universities of Paris, Berlin, Vienna, Petrograd and Rome could have never attained to their present position if they had followed the *Gurukul* ways of Oxford or Cambridge. Metropolitanism is the life force of the modern universities of Europe and America.

AIYER SIR P S SIVASWAMY

Unless there is a prospect of unlimited funds forthcoming for the removal of the University to a suburban site, it is not worth while discussing this question. If special facilities for research work are intended to be provided and laboratories to be attached to the University, it may be worth while to construct such laboratories in a place like Guindy with residential quarters for the university professor and the students.

ALUM SAHEBZADAH MAHOMED SULTAN

- (a) (b) and (c) I think that the University and such of its constituent colleges as may desire should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs for the purposes mentioned. For university life it is essential that the students should have different sorts of play grounds mix with their tutors etc. and therefore it is absolutely necessary to have a very big ground for the college for the residence of the teachers, hostels etc. and that cannot be obtained in a crowded city unless heavily paid for.

AZIZ, MAULVI ABDUL—BANERJEE, J. R.—BANERJEE, GAURANGANATH—BANERJEE, SRI GOOROO DASS

AZIZ, MAULVI ABDUL.

It will be a great gain in every way if the University together with its attached residential college and other hostels and colleges be removed to the suburban site, free from a noxious and vicious atmosphere.

BANERJEE, J. R.

My criticism is that much money has been spent in erecting university buildings. The fish market was acquired some time ago for the construction of a university building for post graduate teaching. Why should not the existing buildings and the building to be erected be thought sufficient? Again, college professors and principals deliver lectures in colleges and in the University. If the University is removed to the suburbs, they cannot quickly move from their colleges to the University (in the course of the day) and back again when necessary, and thus they will be put to great trouble.

BANERJEE, GAURANGANATH.

I would gladly support the scheme of removing the University (and such of its constituent colleges as may desire) from the highly congested quarters in which it is at present situated to an easily accessible site in the suburbs, e.g., Ballugunge, with a view to facilitating,

- (a) an expansion of the activities of the University,
- (b) the erection of suitable buildings for colleges and residences for teachers and students, and generally
- (c) the growth of corporate university-life

The present environments of the Calcutta University do not help to create an atmosphere of pure study, and therefore, as soon as sufficient funds are forthcoming, the University should remove to an easily accessible site in the suburbs, without delay.

BANERJEE, SRI GOOROO DASS.

With all respect for the influential opinion in its favour, I feel bound to say that I am decidedly opposed to the proposal that the University (and such of its constituent colleges as may desire) should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs for the purposes mentioned in the question. And the reasons for my opposition are shortly these —

- (i) An accessible and healthy site of sufficient extent in the suburbs will be difficult and expensive to obtain.
- (ii) The proposed change will, I fear, be viewed by the Indian public as being more for gratifying a desire for luxury than for supplying an actual want, and anything which savours of, or may be mistaken for, luxury, will ill accord with the poverty of the country and with its austere and ascetic, but beneficent and lofty traditions, especially in the field of education.
- (iii) The proposed change will involve lavish waste of money in the abandonment of existing sites with all their costly superstructures.
- (iv) The proposed change will add a little to the comfort and convenience of mofussil students, but it will add much to the discomfort and inconvenience of Calcutta students, who now attend college from their own homes, but who will after the change have to live the life of boarders in hostels, which, under the best arrangement even, will be but a poor substitute, both as regards comfort and discipline, for life at home under the care of parents and other near relations.

BANERJEE SIR GOOROO DASS—*could*—BANERJEE JAYGOPAL

- (v) The proposed change will in no case effect a complete or even a sufficient centralisation of educational institutions as neither the Calcutta Medical College with its extensive hospitals, nor the University Law College with its staff drawn mainly from the High Court Bar nor the Sir Tarak Nath Palit Science College with its palatial buildings nor colleges like the Vidyasagar the City and the Ripon with their costly buildings will be able to follow the change
- (vi) The purposes for which the change of site is proposed may be served though in a modest measure without any such wasteful change. And if the growth of corporate university life of the entire body of students by their complete separation from home and the rest of the world and their seclusion in the quiet of a university retreat is not secured we need not regret the result very much because happy as quiet university hostel life may be it is insufficient training for the world outside the college walls with its troubles and turmoils which have in the end to be faced and because the mingling of hostel boarders with even a handful of homeliving students who serve as a salutary leaven is consulted to make the student community better fitted to be citizens of the world than they would be if brought up in the utter seclusion of university life

BANERJEE JAYGOPAL

Considering the financial difficulties that loom so large before our eyes this idea with all its fascination seems to be too good for practical policy. What is more important Calcutta on the whole is far and away more healthy all the year round than any other place on the Lower Bengal plains and residence in the town is all things considered cheaper besides being calculated to lend the needful stimulus to the growing intellect of young men. Unless the University with its colleges can be removed to a healthier locality (which perhaps will imply a hill station) and almost unlimited funds are made available for creating a really residential university town of the modern type furnished with all the requirements of such a university prudence would suggest that the present situation and site of the existing University should be improved by further acquisition of contiguous lands.

Practically by an imperceptible but progressive *natural* growth the locality luckily named as *College Square* has been developing into an academic area including the Senate House the Durbhanga Building the Government schools and colleges the University Institute the old City College Building and the Medical College with its numerous *annexes* which should not be too hastily interfered with. Steps may be taken towards further extension of area and improvements.

This is not all. Academic seclusion is not an unmixed good—is not without its special danger on social perceptions and interests which are claiming greater and greater attention from qualified educationists of to-day. The Calcutta University should profit by these latest ideas and steer clear of the evil effects of the proverbial *separation of town and gown*.

Education in modern times cannot completely fulfil its functions and yield the richest harvest except when carried on in a social environment in close touch with the many-sided activities of the highly complex life around the scholar in his own day and country. Let us not so late in the day swear by the mediæval ideal of cloistered scholars living an insulated barren life devoted to scholastic intellectual gymnastics. Both for the sake of full and harmonious development as well as in the interests of the highest social and civic efficiency adult scholars (as opposed to school children) must have the advantage of growing in the midst of that very life and amidst the very surroundings for which their education after all is a preparation so that their college life may not be unnaturally dissociated from the larger life outside which is destined very soon to form the *proper sphere* of their activity after they have come out of the University. After all the apprehensions from the so called dangers and temptations of a town life about which we unreasonably hear so much are more imaginary than real born of an unjustified distrust in the moral strength of our young men who have a right to resent it and at any

BANERJEE, JAYGOPAL *contd*—BANERJEE, RAI KUMUDINI KANTA, Bahadur—BANERJEE, M N—BANERJEE, MURALY DHAR—BANERJEE, SASI SEKHAR

rate, are *more than counterbalanced* by the prospect of incalculable intellectual and social advantages. Most of the latter-day universities of England have been reared 'mid city-noise' where the thrill of life is intense and amidst surroundings different from those of 'the sweet City with her dreaming spires'.

BANERJEE, RAI KUMUDINI KANTA, Bahadur.

It is desirable that the University with a few colleges be removed to the suburbs. Some colleges should remain in different parts of the town. The mofussil students would generally join colleges in the suburbs, and the town students, colleges near their homes.

(a), (b) and (c) Will be facilitated by these

BANERJEE, M. N.

I do not think that the University could be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs. But a residential college there might be attempted.

The advantages of a residential college are to a certain extent neutralised in this country by the caste system and the habits of life. The students cannot have a common dining table, but must dine in several groups, according to their castes, in the same establishment and in a manner not very conducive to social intercourse or comradeship, the groups accentuating the differences among themselves. I am glad to say that so far as my college messes are concerned, the students all dine together.

BANERJEE, MURALY DHAR

(a), (b) and (c) For facilitating these objects the university and its constituent colleges may conveniently be removed to the southern suburbs of Calcutta where sufficient lands within the Municipal area of Calcutta can be acquired at a moderate cost and where the University already possesses considerable lands, the gift of Sir Tarak Nath Palit, Ballygunge, may be especially recommended for the site of a residential teaching university for the following reasons —

- (i) It is easily accessible from the city both by train and tram.
- (ii) It is free from the smoke and dust of the city.
- (iii) It is free from epidemics and the temptation of city life.
- (iv) It has the advantage of being within the boundary of the Calcutta Municipality.
- (v) Though it has already a large maidan the Calcutta Improvement Trust will still more improve this area and construct an extensive park (two miles long) to its south, which may supply ample recreation grounds to the students.

BANERJEE, SASI SEKHAR

Under the existing condition of things, I feel extremely diffident to deal with this question properly. For many things can be said in favour of or against the proposal of removing the Calcutta University to an easily accessible site in the suburbs. But to me it appears that the balance of opinion will be on the side of the policy of non-interference. The different colleges that have grown round the University with all their costly equipment in libraries, laboratories and residential quarters, the different institutions that have sprung up for the advancement of learning, the facilities that Calcutta affords to the students of botany, mineralogy, geology, zoology and medicine, the University Library and the buildings with its colleges, and above all the fond associations which

BANERJEE SASI SIKHAR—*contd*—BANERJEE SUDHANSUKUMAR—BANERJI The Hon ble Justice PRAMADA CHARAN—BANERJI UMACHARAN

Calcutta as a great centre of learning calls forth in the minds of generations of students will undoubtedly stand in the way of such a proposal

- (a) (b) and (c) Nor do I think that the removal of the University will help in the realisation of the objects aimed at inasmuch as it is doubtful whether other colleges which are under private management will be in a position to bear the heavy cost of removing to a new site whether sufficient funds will be available for the buildings contemplated in (b) and whether in the absence of the colleges referred to here the growth of University life as contemplated in (c) can be fostered

BANERJEE SUDHANSUKUMAR

The University should not be removed under any circumstances to a site in the suburbs. The cost of removing the University and its constituent colleges would be simply tremendous which may be better utilised in many other ways for the improvement of the present condition of the University. The removal of the University to an easily accessible site in the suburbs is objectionable from various points of view. The students who are at present putting up with their guardians would be unnecessarily taken away from the care of their tender and loving parents and the beneficial family influence. Many poor students who are somehow managing to put up in Calcutta would find it a very costly affair to go to the suburbs and meet the costly expenses of university life. If the University be removed to a suburb the students will be completely segregated from the influence of society and the various activities of town life and will turn out on finishing their university career a batch of theoretical people entirely inexperienced in the mode of life. Even if the post graduate department of the University only be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburb the post graduate students will be completely separated from the under graduate students to the great disadvantage to the latter a condition of affairs which has been strongly opposed by the London University Commission

BANERJI The Hon ble Justice Sir PRAMADA CHARAN

I think it would be an advantage to remove the Calcutta University and its colleges from the congested parts of the city to its suburbs with a view to facilitating the matters mentioned in the question

BANERJI UMACHARAN

- (a) (b) and (c) In my judgment the University and its constituent colleges should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs with a view to facilitating the objects stated
- (i) In the very busy parts of the city where the University and some of its constituent colleges are situated at present there are serious defects. The distractions and excitements are overwhelmingly great whereby the students are prevented from concentrating their minds vigorously on the pursuit of their studies
- (ii) The evils and temptations of social and political life are so numerous that many a student is hopelessly spoiled thereby. The students should be brought up in a calm and quiet atmosphere amidst healthy surroundings free from all evil influences and distractions. These points are rigidly insisted on in the famous law books of ancient India and they were strongly enforced in the Universities at Taxila, Nalanda and Vikramshila

BASU, NALINIMOHAN—BASU, Rai P K., Bahadur—BASU, SATYENDRA NATH—Bengal Landholders' Association, Calcutta—Bengal National Chamber of Commerce, Calcutta.

BASU, NALINIMOHAN.

I strongly support the proposal referred to in this question. I believe that if the proposal be carried out, it will create a very healthy atmosphere among the students as well as among the teachers.

BASU, Rai P. K., Bahadur.

It would be extremely desirable to have the University located in the suburbs, if the surrounding country be so well drained as to render an outbreak of malaria impossible. The first requisite for the success of such a scheme of a suburban university would be that the executive of the University should have the right to order the withdrawal of any objectionable person or the closure of any shop or house, the continuation of which in the neighbourhood is considered objectionable within a mile of the University premises.

BASU, SATYENDRA NATH.

(a), (b) and (c) The removal of the University to an easily accessible site in the suburbs with their quiet atmosphere may facilitate these points, but the expenses involved in the scheme and the inconveniences unavoidable to non-residential students would be too great to carry it out successfully.

Bengal Landholders' Association, Calcutta.

Please see our answer to question 3. In view of the educational advantages possessed by Calcutta and in view of the heavy initial cost which will be involved in the work of removing the University and its constituent colleges to the suburbs, we are decidedly against any proposal for such removal. No doubt the growth of corporate university life is an end worth attaining, but in all proposals for reforming the Calcutta University, we must take into account the material resources actually possessed by us and how they can be utilised most efficiently and economically. Considering the urgent and clamant needs of the University in other directions as regards better staffing, better libraries, better laboratories and better equipment generally—we are decidedly of opinion that it will be sheer wastefulness on our part, if we fritter away our scanty resources in securing the growth of a corporate university life. Besides, it is easily possible to lay excessive emphasis upon this corporate university life. University life in each country and community will grow up according to the inherited culture, tradition and social practices of such countries and communities, and it is an idle and unprofitable ambition to think of producing replicas of Oxford and Cambridge in every country of the world.

Bengal National Chamber of Commerce, Calcutta.

We do not think, when all the circumstances are taken into consideration that it is either necessary or desirable to remove the University to the suburbs even if it were practicable. On the contrary, we think the student should feel the pulse of modern life and for that it is necessary that the University should remain where it is in Calcutta.

Bethune College Calcutta—BHADURI JYOTIBHUSHAN DEY B B and DUTTA BIDHU
BHUSAN—BHANDARKAR D R—BHANDARKAR SIR R G

Bethune College Calcutta

I am for immediately establishing a teaching and residential university in a healthy locality in the suburbs of Calcutta Calcutta should continue to be the seat of a federal university

I hold that some scheme of removing the University is necessary in the best interests of the University itself and of the students

The teaching university suggested in this report should be residential and in a healthy suburb of Calcutta It should be kept comparatively small by the provision of other universities for the mofussal towns (including the University of Bengal as suggested above)

The Calcutta women's colleges might easily be grouped near and form part of this residential suburban university

BHADURI JYOTIBHUSHAN DEY, B B, and DUTTA, BIDHU BHUSAN

The resources of Calcutta as a centre of learning have been discussed under question 3 All these advantages are lost if the University is removed from Calcutta The medical engineering and law departments could not possibly be removed from their present positions and the transfer of the science department would involve huge expenditure

In spite of all these drawbacks some advantages could no doubt be secured if the University could be removed to a suitable site with all its affiliated arts colleges now situated in Calcutta But if only some of the constituent arts colleges are transferred there will be an undesirable separation of under graduate teaching from post graduate instruction in arts and science which is now conducted exclusively by the University Both teachers and students will suffer by the loss of contact between the two departments—post graduate and under graduate—between which no sharp line should be drawn.

BHANDARKAR, D R

I do not think that the growth of corporate university life will necessarily be better served by removing the University and some constituent colleges to a suburb

(a) and (b) The objects specified especially in the latter will no doubt be better realised if this step is taken but it is I think well nigh impossible financially

BHANDARKAR SIR R G

I have long been making suggestions for the removal of the Elphinstone College from its present noisy surroundings to some quiet locality in the suburbs which may be easily accessible by the Bombay Baroda and Central India or the Great Indian Peninsula Railway A small committee was appointed to consider such suggestions and it came to the conclusion of retaining the college in the present locality for the convenience of students and families that reside in the vicinity But I still think that this decision is wrong and that it is necessary that a spacious quiet locality in the suburbs should be chosen for the erection of suitable buildings for our colleges and residences for teachers and students and generally for the growth of a corporate life All the affiliated colleges should be located here and also the University buildings But it is a matter of heavy expense We have got two fine buildings for the use of the University of Bombay and two for two of the affiliated colleges

BHANDARKAR, SIR R. G.—*contd*—BHATTACHARJEE, MOHINI MOHAN

What to do with these and how to attain funds for the new buildings will be a difficult question. The Elphinstone College has no building constructed specially for it. It had one at Byculla, but it was made over to a technical institute, and the present building, originally intended for a Government press, was assigned to it. But whatever the difficulties, I am strongly of the opinion that the colleges and the University itself should be removed to a quiet locality.

BHATTACHARJEE, MOHINI MOHAN.

I do not know what the term 'University' means in this question. At present the University of Calcutta has undertaken post-graduate teaching and classes held for this purpose are called university classes. If the term 'University' means these classes, the University Law College, the Senate and its offices, the removal of the University to the suburbs is at least practicable though even then there would arise serious inconveniences. For instance, the professors of the different colleges now lecturing at the University would find it very difficult to attend both their own colleges and the suburban University. It is however possible to have whole-time lecturers for the University. But it is admitted that post-graduate work should not be entirely cut off from under-graduate teaching and done by an altogether different class of lecturers. This system would put under-graduate students to great loss—they would lose not only the society and the example of post-graduate students, but also the influence and the inspiration which is invariably produced by distinguished professors.

The University may be taken to include the colleges which now impart instruction to under-graduates, and such of the colleges as may desire have been proposed to be removed along with the University proper. Left to itself, I do not think any college will express any desire for removal. No private college has sufficient funds, and no one of them could build suitable hostels without help from Government. So the question is one of financial assistance from the Government. I shall take up this question later on. But if some of the colleges are removed along with the University, the other colleges will suffer in the way I have already described—they will lose the company of advanced students and the influence of the university lecturers. Let us suppose that all the colleges are removed either with the Government's help or otherwise. There are many students who are residents of Calcutta, and so long as Calcutta retains its present position, the number of such students will never decline. For them it would be a great hardship to go to the suburbs for education of which residents of many smaller towns in Bengal can easily avail themselves.

It is undoubted that the removal of the University to the suburbs will facilitate all the three objects mentioned in the question, *viz.*, the expansion of the activities of the University, creation of suitable buildings for colleges, and hostels, and the growth of corporate university life. The University has of late arranged for public lectures and University extension lectures by distinguished professors and educationists. I am afraid this new activity of the University will suffer by the removal.

Coming to the question of expenditure necessary for the removal of the University, everybody will doubt whether in the present state of the country it is expedient to incur such expenditure. Whether the University alone is removed or whether some or all of the colleges are removed along with it, the expenditure must be huge. Higher education or research alone is not entitled to state-aid, primary education also demands patronage. Certainly we have not an excess of high education, but the ignorance of the masses is deplorable. A Bill has recently been introduced in the Bengal Legislative Council for making primary education compulsory within the municipalities and village unions. It has been received by a member of the Government without any objection. If the Bill is passed into law, Government would have to spend a good deal for primary education, and I doubt if its funds would then permit any huge expenditure on building up a new residential university.

Calcutta has a thousand-and-one evils and temptations, and students of the suburban university would be at a safe distance from them. This is desirable to a certain extent. But monkish seclusion does not build up character, though it may be a protection against

BHATTACHARJEE, MOHINI MOHAN—*contd*—BHATTACHARYYA HARIDAS—BHATTACHARYYA Mahamahopadhyaya KALIPRASANNA—BHOWAL GOVINDA CHANDRA

vice Character is built up by struggles against temptations and evils and by the experience of the world as it is around us. Then again the proposed university will be situated in a lonely locality far away from the current of the national life of the province and its literary and various other activities. This certainly cannot be said of Oxford and Cambridge which have been the centres of many movements and are still the battle ground of political parties. Universities are not meant for the production of scholars only but also for the preparation of men who will be leaders of public opinion.

BHATTACHARYYA, HARIDAS

I am opposed to the removal of the University to the suburbs on the following grounds —

- (i) A total dissociation from civic life is not desirable
- (ii) The new site would be far away from the homes of many day scholars. I am not in favour of compulsory residence within the university compound of all students
- (iii) Struggling students would have to put up near the University and thus be deprived of their means of livelihood
- (iv) Many professors and lecturers have homes of their own at Calcutta and would not like to live within the University
- (v) The University will not be able to provide buildings for all the members of a professor's family. This will mean the breaking up of many joint families which is likely to be resented
- (vi) This will mean the abandonment of present university and college buildings and the incurring of heavy expenditure. There are more pressing matters on which expenditure ought to be made first. Decentralisation of college education ought to be undertaken first and selected schools ought to be helped financially to raise their status and become second grade colleges. Libraries and laboratories ought to be established on a lavish scale before the University is removed.

Corporate life will grow if the suggestions mentioned under question 17 be accepted. The activities of the University will expand even in its present locality —

- (A) If the Presidency College be absorbed as also the David Hare Training College
- (B) If the Eden Hindu Hostel be taken over
- (C) If the Baker Laboratory be absorbed
- (D) When the first market site will be built over
- (E) When the University College of Science will be expanded in its present compound.

BHATTACHARYYA Mahamahopadhyaya KALIPRASANNA

My answer to this question is in the negative. This question was once discussed before and the Calcutta public and several distinguished people connected with the University gave their opinion in the negative saying that the removal of the University and the colleges to the suburbs would stand in the way of college education of a large percentage of students for whom it would be impossible to meet their college and boarding expenses if they were to leave the houses of their guardians in Calcutta.

BHOWAL, GOVINDA CHANDRA

- (a) This is objectionable. For certain classes of colleges removal to an easily accessible site in the suburbs may be desirable.

BHOWAL, GOVINDA CHANDRA *contd*—BISS, E E.—BISWAS, SARATLAL—BOMPAS, The Hon'ble Mr C. H.—BOSE, B C

- (b) The erection of suitable buildings will be a costly affair. This will make education expensive and it will be beyond the means and reach of many of the poor students of the country most of whom are maintained at private houses by the charity of generous friends and relatives and under the *Jagir* system among the Musalmans. The effect will be the diminution of the area of high and university education.
- (c) The growth of a real corporate university life in India is not possible. Diversity of castes and creeds is a great obstacle in the way. The growth of a corporate university life with teachers of foreign nationality is, generally speaking, a mere dream.

BISS, E E

I do not think that professional studies such as law, medicine, etc., can profitably be removed from Calcutta just now. I also doubt the advisability of removing the post-graduate work in arts and science from the city. I do think, on the other hand, that all work up to the B A and B Sc should be removed from the city except that provision should be made for the students whose homes are actually in the city. All mofussil students should be housed in suitable quarters outside.

BISWAS, SARATLAL

The proposal is good provided, however, that the students are not isolated from the town to such an extent as to grow up ignorant of the ways of the world.

BOMPAS, The Hon'ble Mr. C H

If the University continues to grow at its present rate, there will presumably be no question of spending money on removing the present colleges to the suburbs. All available funds will be required for building new colleges, these should certainly be built in the suburbs and not in the centre of Calcutta. I do not consider that there is reason to remove the University from the centre of Calcutta to the suburbs. If the influence of Calcutta on the University is evil, that influence would continue to work. If the University is to be removed, it should be removed to a new university town, to be created on a suitable site at least 100 miles from Calcutta. I should, however, prefer to reduce the size of the present University by founding sister universities in other parts of the province. Calcutta itself will always remain the seat of a university.

BOSE, B C

The proposal has charms enough. But there are *several difficulties* which cannot be lightly treated.

In the first place, the removal seems financially impracticable.

Secondly, it might be hard to find any 'easily accessible' locality that would be unexceptionable from a sanitary point of view.

Thirdly, all the colleges cannot be removed, and so it would, at best, be a halting measure, affecting only a part of the student community.

Fourthly, absence of adequate social forces might make these students backward or lifeless in some respects.

Fifthly, libraries and other facilities would not *all* be within such easy reach, as at present.

Sixthly, it would take away from wholesome family influences even those who are now benefited by them.

BOSE B C—*contd*—BOSE RAI CHUNILAL Bahadur—BOSE G C—BOSE HARAKANTA—
BOSE J M

Seventhly if the place selected be too near the town the apprehended evil influences on the students (*vide* my answer to question 17) will not be effectively avoided while if too far away the fellows and others may not be able to attend and guide the deliberations of the Senate etc

- (a) (b) and (c) The aims proposed in the question are all very good in themselves; but in view of the attendant disadvantages it seems that the proposal had better be dropped at least for the present. And if it is to be at all carried out care should be taken to *provide beforehand* suitable accommodation and comforts (at rates quite within the means of the poor middle classes of the province) for all those who may have to go to the new place for carrying on their studies

BOSE, RAI CHUNILAL Bahadur

It is no doubt an ideal arrangement but in the present conditions of the country education would be made too costly and its expansion would be retarded. I cannot therefore recommend it

BOSE, G C

The proposal that the University should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs opens up a large question on which I hesitate to hazard any opinion as it seems to me to be beyond the range of practical politics at least for sometime to come

BOSE HARAKANTA

The removal of the University and some of its constituent colleges from the town to the suburbs is not desirable in the interest of the student. In the suburbs they would it is true have purer air to breathe and more open space for play ground but their segregation from the general social life would tend to make them too good for the world. Society is our best training ground even its trials and temptations have their uses. Nearly all the great men of the past were brought up in big towns and most of the universities of the world are situated in the midst of crowded surroundings. If the political and social conditions of these places have not stood in the way of the development of manhood it is not clear why they would do so in India. The days of monastic seclusion for youths are past and its revival would not be beneficial to the country. Most of the objects for which the proposal has been made by the University might be attained without disturbing the present arrangements if enough money were available for providing suitable play grounds residences etc for the teachers and students. Then again it would not be desirable to spend such an enormous sum of money on the attainment of an ideal scheme when so many urgent educational reforms affecting the general body of students have not yet been carried out. There is another reason against the proposal—the separation of advanced students from their juniors would deprive the latter of the good influence of the former

BOSE J M

Many incidents have happened which has often forced the Government and the university authorities to consider seriously the question of the removal of some of the colleges to a healthier site. If I remember correctly sometime ago the Government proposed to remove the Presidency College to Ranchi but the proposal was shelved. Owing to occasional outbreaks of serious epidemics the public and the press have often deleted the question as to whether Presidency College ought not to be removed from

BOSE, J. M.—*contd.*—BOSE, KHUDI RAM—BROWN, ARTHUR

its present site. Recently a committee appointed to enquire into the discipline of the Presidency College also suggested its removal to a healthier site.

During their visits to different colleges, the members of the University Commission have no doubt noticed how widely scattered these colleges are, and the unhealthy surroundings in which teachers and students live. As a matter of fact teachers of different colleges do not even know each other and co-operation between different colleges has never been thought of. It is obvious therefore that no attempt can be made to develop a corporate university life so long as this state of things is permitted to continue and the proposal to remove the colleges to a better ventilated quarters to be strongly supported, although there are many difficulties to be overcome.

- (i) The colleges must be built in a quarter which must be suitable for the residence of the Bengali students. This was one of the main objections to the removal of Presidency College.
- (ii) The most formidable difficulty will be the enormous expenditure involved for the numerous buildings that will be required.
- (iii) Most of the 'private' colleges will also require financial assistance in order to move to the new site.

Owing to the financial stringency caused by the war, it will be almost impossible for the Government to meet these heavy expenses at the present time.

BOSE, KHUDI RAM

The proposed provision of a separate site for the University and some of its affiliated colleges somewhere in the suburbs of Calcutta, does not appeal to me as quite a progressive move, as much on financial as on educational grounds. It would obviously be quite an onerous burden on the public revenue that has so far failed to make any provision for free compulsory primary education, which has been an essential feature of educational policy in most of the civilised and enlightened countries. There may result from so large a scheme certain educational advantages accruing to a section of the community, but its moral advantages appear to be a little too dubious. Most of our young men in Calcutta are used to reside with their parents and guardians in their respective homes, amidst the most endearing associations of domestic life in which filial love and brotherly affection play a prominent part. To sever these sacred bonds and mar such chastening influences of home-life in any way, cannot be taken to make for the perpetuation and elevation of the traditional moral ideal of the country. During the last sixty years of the existence of the University here, the process of anglicisation and perhaps of denationalisation, of young Bengal, has made rapid strides, and if anything were wanting to consummate these not very welcome processes, it would perhaps be supplied by this extravagant scheme of educational reform.

BROWN, ARTHUR.

I am strongly opposed. I recognise the difficulties of the present situation, and if it were possible for every efficient educational institution of Calcutta to be removed I should be in sympathy. But the cost is prohibitive, and in addition the presence of the High Court at Calcutta necessitates the presence of the Law College. A merely partial removal would destroy the chance of Calcutta developing along academic lines. The faculties must be in touch with each other and the libraries and other facilities must certainly not be less than at present. Among the library facilities I give the Law

CHAKRAVARTI BRAJALAL—CHAKRAVARTI Rai MON MOHAN Bahadur—CHATTERJEE,
The Hon ble Mr A C—CHATTERJEE RAMANANDA

CHAKRAVARTI, BRAJALAL

The removal of the University to an easily accessible site in the suburbs of Calcutta will unquestionably be an improvement

CHAKRAVARTI Rai MON MOHAN Bahadur

The question of the removal of the University and its college to some other site is mainly dependent upon cost. The building and other expenses will be extremely heavy and as a large number of students now attend from their homes the erection of extra mass houses will cost a great deal more. Consequently in the present state of finance the cost becomes prohibitive and the money to be spent on removal can be more usefully utilised in strengthening the funds of the University and its affiliated colleges.

CHATTERJEE The Hon ble Mr A C

If funds were unlimited I would agree to the removal of the University with all its constituent colleges to an easily accessible site in the suburbs. But with present means of locomotion in and near Calcutta I would not agree to the University being located at any place more than six miles* from say College Street and land in such accessible localities is even now exceedingly dear. I would leave the nucleus of the University where it is now all round College Square and gradually attempt to take in all the land between Upper Circular Road, Bowbazar Street, Halliday Street and Mechua Bazar Road and convert it into the university quarter. For play fields I would acquire cheaper land to the east of Circular Road and provide an electric train service.

CHATTERJEE, RAMANANDA

I am against the proposal of removing the University and the existing Calcutta colleges to a suburban area but I am not against the establishment of a new residential teaching institution in the suburbs or elsewhere teaching up to the highest standards for those who can afford to pay all its expenses.

I consider the proposed removal impracticable on various grounds.

The growth of corporate university life implies that students of all faculties are to be in the university area for otherwise the corporate life would not comprehend the activity of all classes of students. But the Medical College with its hospitals and the Engineering College cannot obviously be removed to that area. Hence even if all the other colleges were removed the corporate life would not be a complete corporate life.

By removing the Law College its students can be made to reside in the University area but not the professors who are practising lawyers for that would be inconvenient for their clients. Moreover many poor law students maintain themselves by private tuition and other jobs in the city. They would be deprived of this means of support and would have to give up their studies.

If only the post graduate classes of the arts and science faculties were removed the arrangement would be open to grave objections of an educational character of which the nature will be understood from the following extracts from the Final Report of the London University Commission.

We read in paragraph 68 of that report

We agree with the view expressed in the Report of the Professorial Board of

CHATTERJEE, RAMANANDA—*contd*

post-graduate work must be artificial, must be to the disadvantage of the under-graduate, and must tend to diminish the supply of students who undertake post-graduate and research work "

Paragraph 69 observes —

" it is in the best interests of the university that the most distinguished of its professors should take part in the teaching of the under-graduates from the beginning of their university career."

Paragraph 70 adds —

" If it is thus to be desired that the highest university teachers should take their part in under-graduate work, and that their spirit should dominate it all, it follows for the same reasons that they should not be deprived of the best of their students when they reach the stage of post-graduate work. This work should not be separated from the rest of the work of the University and conducted by different teachers in separate institutions "

Writing on the 'advantages' of associating junior with advanced students,' the members of the London Commission observe in paragraph 71 of their final report —

" It is also a great disadvantage to the under-graduate students of the University that post-graduate students should be removed to separate institutions. They ought to be in constant contact with those who are doing more advanced work than themselves and who are not too far beyond them, but stimulate and encourage them by the familiar presence of an attainable ideal "

The present arrangements for post-graduate studies in our University do result in this disadvantage to large numbers of under-graduates. The proposed removal to a suburban area would increase the disadvantage.

Moreover, as many teachers of the post-graduate classes are connected with the colleges in the city, it would be inconvenient and impracticable for them to live and teach both in the city and in the suburbs. If they did not live in the suburban university area, they would not be able to contribute to the growth of corporate university life and take part in it. Even if all post-graduate teachers were whole-time men, the objections to be inferred from the extracts from the London University Commission's Report would hold good.

These objections can be obviated by removing all Calcutta colleges to the suburban university area. But the cost would be enormous. After the war financial stringency will continue for years and may increase. The University itself is not in a position to bear the cost of even its own removal. Government cannot easily meet it. Particularly as, if Government agrees to the removal, it ought for consistency's sake remove also the Presidency College, Sanskrit College and Bethune College. But the cost would be prohibitive. The missionary colleges and unaided colleges are not in a position to bear their own cost of removal. Government must bear it. But Government cannot, and would not, be justified in bearing it. So far as education is concerned, the first claim on the Government purse is that of elementary education. The main difficulty always pleaded to be in the way of universal and free elementary education has been financial, and hence in Bengal 923 per mille of the population are illiterate. Sir S. P. Sinha, the Government Member in charge of the education portfolio, in speaking in support of Mr. S. N. Roy's Primary Education Bill, felt constrained to observe

" The necessity of universal primary education was admitted on all hands. The question was only to find the ways and means, and the Honourable Member deserved special consideration for solving this question of ways and means. The Honourable Member had provided that the municipalities should raise funds. It was true that the contributions in other provinces for the purpose were larger than in Bengal, but he reminded the Council that the contribution made by Bengal in secondary and higher education was larger than in other provinces and *perhaps in doing so they had neglected the poorer classes* "

CHATTERJEE RAMANANDA—*contd*

I do not urge that Government should not any longer spend any money on higher education. My contention is that it ought not to spend money on any project which has not been demonstrated beyond doubt to be indispensably necessary for the further spread and improvement of higher education. I think all the objects referred to in question 21 can be attained within the city itself at less cost than the proposed removal would involve.

Supposing the proposed removal were carried out even if purchasers could be found for all the existing university and college buildings in the city which is doubtful they would have to be sold very cheap. Would this waste of money be justifiable?

What would be the cost of removing all the colleges for as we have shown nothing less would suffice for attaining the object in view? It would be very much more than that of the establishment of some of the new British universities for these are meant for a much smaller number of students than the proposed Calcutta suburban university would have to provide for. But even the British universities referred to cost enormous amounts as the following extract from the journalist and author Sir Edward T Cook's writings indicate—

Large subscriptions have been forthcoming for the general purposes of the new universities. Some idea of the scale of local benefactions may be gathered from the fact that the value of site building and endowments at the time when they severally applied for university charters was—Liverpool £673 000 (Rs 100 90 000) Manchester £587 000 (Rs 83 00 000) and Birmingham £639 000 (Rs 90 80 000) Birmingham finding its endowments insufficient for its now more spacious schemes secured from the City Council only the other day an annual grant of £15 000 (Rs. 2 20 000).

If Government pays for the removal of the non Government colleges it would be at the price of the latter's liberty. For in such cases Government never pays without exacting a price. The professors of these colleges will not like the loss of freedom. They would lose freedom of self expression and action in civic political and semi political matters like Government servants. That would be a loss to themselves and to the country and leading compulsorily incomplete lives they would not be able to influence their students even to the small extent that they are able now.

Residential institutions are too costly for poor Indians and most of our students are poor. Many of them depend for their meals on charitable persons or institutions. Others support themselves by private tuition and other jobs. They should not be deprived of the means of education. The Dacca scheme recognises this fact in the case of poor Muslim students at least. We read in the Report of the Dacca University Committee

Poor madrasah students are not infrequently housed and supported by charitable persons under the jagir system and consequently many will not be able to live in college. It will be the duty of the authorities of the Muhammadan College to see that those who live in *jagirs* or otherwise outside the college are properly looked after by responsible persons.

Though the Dacca scheme did not make a similar exception in favour of poor Hindu students which it ought to have done its recognition of the claims of poverty in the case of even one sect shows that we must not forget the poor in our ambitious projects for the well to do. It is not known whether it would be possible for the suburban university to make such exceptions in the case of poor students residing in Calcutta nor whether its distance from the city would enable them to attend classes by doing the distance on foot. They would either be excluded altogether from the advantages of higher education in the residential university or would not be able to contribute to the growth of corporate life and share in its benefits.

I could give numerous quotations to show that it is now recognised that the sons of the poorest should have opportunities for the highest education. The sons of Scottish ploughmen and peasants can and do go in for university education. That is why the Scots are such a successful nation. In the course of the address which Lord Haldane delivered on the occasion of opening the new buildings of the Hartley University

CHATTERJEE, RAMANANDA *contd*

College at Highfield, he said that "he had sat in the University of Edinburgh side by side with the sons of ploughmen and the sons of men who earned a weekly wage"

That all men are entitled to have opportunities for educating themselves to as high a level as they are intellectually capable of, is a truth which the war has made more widely recognised than before. The inaugural address of the last session of the Edinburgh Philosophical Institution was delivered on November 1 last by Dr Walter Page, the United States Ambassador. He spoke on 'The American Educational Ideal'

He expressed the indebtedness of the United States to Scotland for its strong educational impulse. The old Scottish idea that every man was entitled to have his intellectual life quickened, and that other old Scottish idea that any true education was a process of building character as well as of imparting information—those eternal and fundamental truths, which underlay the educational structure alike of Scotland and of the United States, made the countries akin quite as much as the Scottish blood that flowed in so large a part of the best population of the Republic. The University carried its activities to every part of the commonwealth, so that the people had come to believe that the University was not merely a place where a limited number of pupils might go to receive the benefit of higher learning but that it was the organising centre for the intellectual, industrial, and commercial activities of the whole State. It belonged to everybody.

"That system was a new thing in the world in that it aimed to reach every dweller in the commonwealth. Where would they find other communities in which every human creature regarded the schools as things for his or her own use, not for the use of the rich only, or the fortunate, or the brilliant, or the privileged, but for the use of all persons outside the gaols and mad-houses, and precisely on the same conditions? Education had ceased to be regarded as a privilege or as a charity—it was a right. This system that he had ventured to call American, in the fulness of its development, did build the three pillars of a free State—general intelligence, civic judgment, and a generally diffused prosperity. A democracy was at best a clumsy instrument of government. The most that could be said for it was that it was less clumsy than any other. It became exact and trustworthy in proportion to the sincerity and excellence with which such a plan as this was carried out. Therefore it was that while the colossal American demonstration of democracy had somewhere, at some time, committed all the absurd mistakes in the fool's calendar, it had not committed any capital mistake. The secret of this important historical fact rested, he thought, on this scheme of free education for all the people alike."

The Allies have repeatedly declared that they are fighting for the establishment of democracy throughout the world. Dr Page's address shows what sort of preparation is needed for a democracy to be a successful experiment. Viscount Haldane's recent address at Chelmsford on 'Education and Democracy' also shows what is required. It shows, too, that for the development of industries also, for which many people appeal to care more than for a liberal education, the highest education, in the widest commonalty spread, is needed. Let us quote Viscount Haldane—

"The other announcement filled him with gladness. It was the determination of the Labour Party in their reconstructed programme to couple brain with hand. There was a close connection between the schools and democracy. There were members of the Labour Party who did not want this education until we had a social revolution, because (they said) any new system of education would only be exploited by the capitalists. Those were belated views. Industry depended largely on knowledge. The worker had to be a thinker. It would not do for him merely to shovel on coals, but to know why he was doing it. He must think just as the professional man thought, that would give him an interest in his work and tend to break down the barriers separating the 'educated' from the 'uneducated' classes.

We did not know what we had done by starving our democracy in education. There was a vast reservoir of talent amongst boys and girls which might contain the Watts, the Kelvins, the Faradays, the great discoverers some of whom had risen

CHATTERJEE I AMANDA—*contd*

from humble origin. The only means of selecting exceptional talent where it existed was to give genius its chance. There might be genius in the brain of the child of the labourer as in the brain of the child of a lord and if that talent never matured it was a great loss to the State.

It was a delusion to suppose all people were equal. Therefore there must be competition and natural selection but to-day selection was according to class. Opportunities were withheld. The ideal of our new system should be equality of educational opportunity giving every child a chance of rising whatever its circumstance to the highest. And here came in democracy. We should have an aristocracy but it would be an aristocracy of talent the elite of democracy which would kill the other aristocracy.

The world was awaking to the importance of education. A friend told him that if Germany had gone on for ten years from the date the war broke out, leading in her peaceful educational method she would have been hard to overtake. We as a nation had been awakened from our slumber—let us see our lamps were trimmed and ready.

We ought not to go in for any externals of education which would prevent poor and middle class students from being highly educated.

I am not ignorant of the advantages claimed for residential universities. What I say is that those who want the advantages should bear the whole cost themselves. The general tax payer should not be called upon to pay for them. Oxford and Cambridge are not maintained nor were they established by Government.

It should also be borne in mind that the Scotch universities and the new British universities are not like Oxford and Cambridge nor are Berlin and Paris and the many famous American universities like Oxford and Cambridge. The late idea is not for universities to shun crowded cities. Many new ones are in the midst of busy cities. Sir Edward T. Cook tells us why the well-to-do people of England made such munificent donations to the new British universities. He writes:

What is the conviction of which such large provision of money is the expression?

The activities of a university have as Professor Raleigh says 'come to be recognized as essential to a full grown municipal civilization and from each place in turn the cry has gone up for a university for the city of the city in the city.'

Why is our Calcutta University not to be for the city of the city in the city? Why are the numerous sons of the poor not to have the highest university education dwelling in the houses of their parents in the city?

If the wealthy enlightened English people have thought universities in the city good enough for them why should it be bad for us to have our university in the city?

In America the facilities for higher education are ample. There are free State universities. Yet I find that there is an active and successful movement for the establishment of universities in each municipality even in small ones.

We read in the Report of the Commissioner of Education U.S.A. for the year ended June 30 1915 Vol I page 40:

The development of State universities has been recognized as a fine forward sweep of democratic education but the municipal university is now making a strong appeal for support on the ground that it is still more democratic. It offers higher education to the youth of the city who can live at home more economically than away.

The organization of the Association of Urban Universities at Washington last winter emphasizes the growing importance of this problem. State legislation has been analysed so that any city can easily find what statutory changes need to be made in order to permit taxation for a municipal university. Ohio still leads in numbers universities at Toledo and Akron having been opened in addition to that at Cincinnati the pioneer of a real municipal university. The way is being paved for such a university in Detroit a city eminently fitted to support such an institution.

show —

"The entire 'public school,' or barrack system, the college or convent system, as practised in England, with all their unnatural consequences and essentially material spirit, may be, as things are, necessary evils, they are thoroughly abnormal and vicious in principle. The normal and noble education can only be given in *families*, and not in barracks or convents. The moral, religious and social stimulus of education ought to rise mainly there, and its ground work should come from the parent."

However, as things stand at present, large numbers of students must live away from their towns or villages, in hostels and licensed lodgings in towns. And accommodation is available in the city of Calcutta for more students than there can be in the proposed suburban university area. There the number of students would be limited by two causes. Hostel accommodation cannot be unlimited, and the official tendency to restrict the benefits of high education within narrow limits would stand in the way of the provision of ample hotel accommodation. The second limiting cause would be the comparatively expensive character of residential institutions.

Taking it for granted that residential universities like Oxford and Cambridge have done unmixed good to English youth, which I do not admit and which has been denied by many competent Englishmen themselves, it cannot be taken for granted that such universities must do good to Indian youth also, for the circumstances of the two countries are very different. Prof. John Perry's Presidential Address to the Educational section of the British Association, 1904, contains the following passage:

"Every clever man who has gone to a public school and to Oxford or Cambridge — worships the system which has taken from him his spiritual birthright, his individuality, his initiative, his originality, his common sense, his power to think for himself — Yes, I may say his belief in himself. He has become too much like a sheep, ready to follow the bell wether, he is a man who has greatly lost his soul."

A separate university area, buildings, teachers and students living together near one another,—these constitute the mere skeleton of a university. The real thing is the life, the spirit, animating this body. Mere corporate existence is not in itself valuable. Prisoners in jail, indentured coolies in coolie lines, soldiers in barracks, have corporate existence, but the corporate life which one desires for a university is not like these. Life in a free western university is good because students can there grow up to their full intellectual, moral, spiritual, civic and political stature. There is no *political* watch over students in Oxford and Cambridge. They do not live under the shadow of suspicion. The restrictions imposed on them are meant only for their moral and intellectual advantage, not because it is thought that they are possible political agents, or because it is desired to make them entirely non political beings. Conditions are different.

CHATTERJEE RAMANANDA—*contd*

The life of no one in or outside a university is perfect in any country. What is wanted is that there should be a desire for perfection and a movement towards it and this desire and movement should not only not be hindered in any direction but on the contrary should be encouraged, stimulated, strengthened and guided in all possible directions. This is the case in the free western universities. It is not and cannot at present be the case in our official University. In the first place the general population is not a free population. In the second place professors in non Government colleges enjoy less freedom of action and self expression than the general population as regards political, semi political, socio-political and economic political matters. In the third place professors in Government colleges have no freedom at all in these matters and lastly the University has no independence and no freedom of teaching.

In free western universities the professors are in all legitimate directions free to do to be and to teach what they think best. And they can, therefore exert great beneficial influence on their students. The student also can supplement this influence by contact with the great personalities outside the universities in intellectual, social, moral, religious, civic and political field. In India in Bengal as I have said before our professors are not free in all legitimate directions to do to be and to teach what they think best. Therefore they cannot directly and indirectly give our students the best that they are capable of. Their enforced and artificially one-sided and lame lives even stand in the way of their winning the whole-hearted respect of their students in some cases. What the students are thus deprived of having from their professors they can make up for in the city only to a small extent by contact with the personalities, ideas and activities of social, religious and civic leaders unconnected with the University—I say to a small extent because we are not a free people. But even in the city students cannot always hear *under university auspices* what they may hear not only without harm but with positive advantage. An example occurs to me now. A Bengali author, or high character, the lady superintendent of a girls' high school recognised by the University was prevented from reading a paper on the Message of Rabindranath Tagore in the Calcutta University Institute. This fact will be found recorded or ought to be found recorded in the minutes of the Committee of the Calcutta University Institute. But in this institute a few men some times lecture who are men of unclear lives and are notorious libellers of gentlemen and ladies.

If the University and colleges be removed outside the city students will have even less contact with the life and thought of the city and of the country generally. This will be bad for them and for the future of the country as they are to be its future citizens, social servants and workers in all fields.

I do not believe in the prevalent official opinion that students should have nothing to do with non official politics. Man—modern civilised man in any case—is a political animal. And if we want our young men to be modern and civilised they must be political. Men do not on coming of age all at once become what they wish to be. There is preparation needed. Politics is a serious thing. Unless a student takes interest in politics in his youth he cannot become a politician or even a good citizen in his maturer years. Nobody has yet contended that the study of history is bad for students. Politics is only contemporary history. If the study of past history be good and necessary is the study of contemporary history of how history is made necessarily bad and needless? Government no doubt wishes to control and mould the lives of our students in order that they may not make mischief and get into trouble but it should be remembered that men who are or have been made perfectly harmless actually or potentially men who have been made incapable of mischief are also likely to be powerless for good. Control should be such as to leave the development of many-sided capacity, initiative, resourcefulness and strength of character entirely unaffected. The glory of man's nature lies in this that his conduct may be self-determined. Even innocence like that of some of the lower animals is not noble if it be not self-determined. Therefore the more a man is deprived of the opportunity and power of self-determined activity the more difficult is it made for him to rise to the full height of his being.

Europe has many achievements to her credit. One is that she has been particularly successful in discovering Nature's laws and thereby harnessing the forces

CHATTERJI, RAMANANDA—*contd*

man's benefit. Another is the realisation of citizenship and the consequent insistence on the rights of man as man. Without any desire to be unjust to exceptions among them, I must say that our European professors have not taught and encouraged our students to become citizens, to value their manhood and to insist on their rights as men. The professors have been more concerned with exacting salaries and obedience and with having their racial superiority recognised by the students in an abject manner. For this reason corporate life with European professors cannot bear good fruit.

In India the social life of Europeans is distinct from the social life of Indians. For this reason, the social life of European professors and their interests and joys and sorrows, are different and distinct from those of Indian professors and students. The European professors' attitude is one of aloofness, if not sometimes of arrogant contempt. Under the circumstances, there cannot be any corporate life instinct with sympathy and cordiality. Neither Indian professors nor Indian students can lead unconstrained natural lives in the presence or neighbourhood of European professors. The latter, too, must feel the presence of Indians in their midst a source of inconvenience. All these facts are greatly to be deplored. But so long as the political status of Indians is inferior to that of Europeans, and so long as the assumed racial superiority of the latter stares Indian professors and students in the face in the constitution of the Imperial and Provincial educational services, to talk of the growth of a corporate university life is more a mockery than anything else.

In England, professors and students can and do mix on terms of perfect social equality. They belong to the same community, race and society. In India, European professors and some Indian professors, too, cannot and do not mix on terms of social equality with their students. They belong to different communities, races and societies. However affable the English professors here in India may be, the gulf between them and their students, generally speaking, is impassable, so long at any rate as India continues to be treated as the Cinderella of the British Empire. This may be a harsh truth, but it is a fact which it is perfectly useless to conceal.

In England the intellectual and cultural aims and goals of professors and students are the same, and are not in any way antagonistic. An English professor naturally desires and intends that his English students should in time equal him in culture and intellectual equipment and strength, nay, he must often be delighted with the prospect of his students leaving him behind in the race, and outshining him in original work and name and fame. What a great stimulus all this must be to the work of both teachers and students! In India do the European professors welcome the prospect of their Indian students becoming their equals, not to speak of their being their superiors, in culture, in intellectual equipment and strength and in original work? Or do they work with such a prospect in view, to bring about its realisation? I have never heard that as a class they do so, or that a majority of them or even an appreciable minority of them do so. Do they as a class help and encourage their students to rise to the top? I shall be glad to know that they do or will do at the end of the next quarter of a century.

The Provincial educational and other services may have been constituted with the best of intentions, *which I do not believe*, but they have served as a great damper on our educational enthusiasm, and they are calculated to dwarf our intellect and capacity and destroy our self-confidence and self-respect. So long as they are not put an end to, teaching and residential universities under the racial suzerainty of European professors can do our students little good.

In England the political status, aims and goals of both professors and students are the same. The student is, or may be, when he comes of age, as much a citizen as his professor. There is no desire, inducement or thought in the professor's mind to keep his students in political tutelage or subordination. The students take part in politics and political debates and in political elections. Politics is not taboo to them. There is no political surveillance or watching over them. There is no desire or effort to make them entirely non-political creatures, beings without national consciousness in a political sense.

CHATTERJEE RAMANANDA—*contd*—CHATTERJEE Rai Bahadur SARAT CHANDRA—
CHATTERJEE SATIS CHANDRA—CHATTERJEE SUNITI KUMAR

All the circumstances detailed in the previous paragraph make the relations between students and professors in British universities cordial and sympathetic and fruitful of good results.

Among Indian students themselves there cannot be under official auspices the same kind of social life as there is among English university students. Credal and caste distinctions for which nobody can blame Government stand in the way. As Government is pledged not to interfere with the religious and social notions of the people any residential system under official auspices and control cannot but enforce credal and caste distinctions in a more rigid form than is observable in their present relaxed condition in Indian society.

In residential and other universities much depends on the persons who exert influence upon the students and the character of that influence. The Calcutta University as at present constituted does not represent all the best literary, artistic and scientific fruits of the Bengali renaissance. Who are then the dominating figures in our university? And by what methods do they maintain their ascendancy? Has anybody received great thought, new fruitful ideas, moral impetus, pregnant suggestions or epoch-making inspirations from them? Do they represent any side or aspect of the Indian renaissance? Is it not by astuteness and exercise of patronage, by appealing to men's love of money and position and similar low motives that ascendancy is maintained in the Calcutta University? What is the moral influence of all this on students? What is the resulting effect in their minds of success in life? Is the University in the suburbs going to be under this sort of elevating influence in its corporate existence?

Should a residential teaching university be founded I would suggest that its students should be given opportunities of social service either in connexion with the Bengal Social Service League or in a separate university organisation so that they may be in touch with their fellow men in a way best calculated to develop their character.

In the present non-residential university too social service should be as in Harvard University one of the principal recognised student activities.

I would also urge the establishment of an appointments board as in the Dacca University scheme and the institution and recognition of a students' employment bureau in order to help poor students to become self-supporting as in America.

CHATTERJEE Rai Bahadur SARAT CHANDRA

(a) No

(b) Suitable buildings should be erected for colleges, hostels and residences of teachers and staffs and institutes should be established to which a student should be compelled to join in creating a corporate life.

CHATTERJEE SATIS CHANDRA

I have no sympathy for the proposal that the University should be removed from the heart of the town to a site in the suburbs. It may suffice to extend the present university buildings by further acquisition of land in the vicinity and thereby expand the activities of the University itself. As for other colleges and residences for teachers and students it is financially advantageous to make certain improvements in the existing system as suggested above instead of effecting a complete change in it.

CHATTERJEE, SUNITI KUMAR

The present situation where the University of Calcutta has grown up is as good as any. Questions of financial practicability should for the present put a stop to any proposal to remove the University with its colleges and hostels to some easily accessible site in the suburbs. Besides I do not think it will be desirable to remove young men

CHATTERJEE, SUNITI KUMAR—*contd* --CHATTERJI, MOHINI MOHAN—CHAUDHURI, BHUBAN MOHAN—CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Babu KISHORI MOHAN—CHAUDHURY, The Hon'ble Babu BROJENDRA KISHORE ROY

from such a great centre of life as Calcutta. Most of the modern universities of England have been established in big industrial and commercial centres. I do not understand why we should revert to the mediæval type of university in this matter in the case of Calcutta. But with a view to the organisation of our resources in the best way possible, we can without great difficulty have a University enclave in Calcutta itself, with the Senate House as its centre. We have a great centre of college life round about College Square. The Calcutta Improvement Trust is now operating in Halliday Street, and we could with Government support easily have a university block (like the Medical College block), bounded by Colootolah Street in the south, Halliday Street in the west, Harrison Road in the north and College Street in the east. Land may be acquired for the University or for its colleges and hostels round College Square. Thus without necessitating the removal of the University, a great university area can grow up, with the various colleges, hostels, laboratories, etc., close to or within easy distance of one another. Within the proposed university enclave, suitable residences for professors, if desired may be built, and also hostels, and everything will conduce to facilitate the expansion of the activities of the University and the growth of corporate university life.

CHATTERJI, MOHINI MOHAN

I would suggest in the interests of the health and morals of students that colleges be removed from the heart of the town to the suburbs and there located within convenient distances of one another and within a defined area. The university authorities should be vested with magisterial and police powers within such area.

CHAUDHURI, BHUBAN MOHAN

There are arguments for and against the location of the University in the suburbs. Some are of opinion that the University should be situated in the centre of civic life and others are for removing it from the bustle and tumult of the city. The majority are perhaps in favour of the latter proposal.

CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Babu KISHORI MOHAN

It is desirable no doubt, for the growth of corporate university life. The educational institutions for higher education as far as practicable in Calcutta may be located in suburbs amidst their own surroundings and a self contained university, mainly on the residential system, with its colleges, residences, both for professors and students, and other requisites for a healthy, intellectual and moral life, may be established. For those students that may reside with their parents and other guardians inside Calcutta easy communication may be arranged.

CHAUDHURY, The Hon'ble Babu BROJENDRA KISHORE ROY

Some advantages might be derived from the removal of the University college to an easily accessible site in the suburbs, but as the Government and the University have already spent enormous amounts in raising buildings and purchasing lands in Calcutta, it is doubtful whether the benefits to be derived from such removal will be anything like a sufficient compensation for the losses and the other various disadvantages to be occasioned by such removal of the college away from society and of a large number of students from their families and the care of natural guardians no less by the removal of the college from such a great centre of learning and intellectual activities as Calcutta. The advantages expected by removal may, with certain alterations, etc., improvements in the arrangements of hostels and quarters of professors be secured at perhaps lesser expenses in the town of Calcutta also.

CHAUDHURY The Hon ble NAWAB SYED NAWABALI Khan Bahadur—CHAUDHURY
Rai YATINDRA NATH

CHAUDHURY, The Hon ble NAWAB SYED NAWABALI, Khan Bahadur

It would be highly desirable that the University should be removed outside the city. The unhealthy conditions under which students in Calcutta live have been referred to in answer to question 18. Neither the hostels nor the attached or recognised messes could satisfactorily cope with the increasing number of students who resort to the metropolis for university education there being at present about 15,000, a small proportion of whom live with parents or approved guardians. A large number of students numbering 4,000 and over are uncontrolled and left to make their own arrangements as best they can. Even if the University could undertake the responsibility of providing suitable accommodation for all the insanitary conditions prevailing in the city and the want of sufficient places to erect hostels would render such responsibility a heavy burden on the time and resources of the University. This apart there is hardly room for the University to expand if suitable teaching arrangements are to be made. The difficulties that have been felt as regards the expansion of the Presidency College ought to afford a warning in this respect.

The University should at all costs be removed outside the city preferably towards the Barrackpore side. I anticipate there will be some opposition on the part of private institutions which are attended by about 8,000 students and also by other vested interests. It is also true that the buildings at present occupied by the University and other colleges may not fetch anything like their proper value when put on sale. I realise these and other difficulties as well as living in the way of removing the University to a suburb. But the attempt is worth the undertaking and deserves all help from the Government and every heroic effort from the University itself. The cause of education in Calcutta has considerably suffered under the present unwholesome conditions and it would be far wiser to spend a large amount on this undertaking at once rather than continue to waste from year to year a no less amount to perpetuate the existing evils. As a matter of fact I do not believe that either the University or the colleges who may come out with it, will have to undergo any serious financial loss by so doing. Their properties in the city may not when sold bring their proper value. But it must be borne in mind that the price of land outside the city necessary for locating the colleges and the University buildings and the cost of erecting them will not be as high as in the city and it is quite possible that looked at from this view point the University and the colleges may not have much to lose financially by the change. I would therefore strongly urge that the University should be removed outside the city as soon as circumstances permit along with the present Government colleges. A few private colleges are sure to follow the University to the new place. The other colleges which may continue to oppose the scheme must be told plainly by the Government that if they do not wish to come under the Calcutta University teaching and residential as it would then be they would have to form part of any new controlling agency that may be formed to bring together the outside colleges in Western Bengal. I dare say the opposition will die down and a large number of colleges may eventually desire to share the benefits and responsibilities of the new system.

In this connection I would like to suggest that every high school in Calcutta should be asked to teach up to the Intermediate standard on lines suggested by the Calcutta University as reorganised. This may entail a burden on these schools and so I would further suggest that the lower forms should be taken away to form separate middle schools. The result of this arrangement would be that below the University stage there would be a well defined body of institutions looking after the preparatory work of the University and for their courses of studies and examination controlled by it. They will form feeders to it. The arrangement will also lessen the pressure on the University itself since it will then have to deal with a far less number of students than at present.

CHAUDHURY, Rai YATINDRA NATH

So far as the residential colleges of the Calcutta University are concerned I think that colleges for teaching engineering and technological subjects should be removed from the City of Calcutta and other colleges should remain where they now are.

CHOUDHURY, RAI YATINDRA NATH *contd* —CULLIS, Dr C E —DAS, Dr KEDARNATH
DAS GUPTA, HEM CHANDRA—DAS GUPTA, KARUNA KANTA—DAS GUPTA, SURENDRANATH

For the expansion of its activities separate universities, say, for teaching Indian history and antiquity in all their branches and for giving higher training in commerce and trade should be instituted outside the limits of the town of Calcutta. But till full-fledged universities are established for the teaching of these special subjects colleges for teaching them should be established in Calcutta. These special colleges should be controlled by our University through different faculties specially created for the purpose, consisting of expert men only

The growth of corporate university life would be amply provided by the hostel system and other suitable organisations in the line of the Calcutta University Institute and the like.

CULLIS, Dr C E

The removal of the University and colleges to an open site outside the town would be of the utmost advantage in nearly all respects. The site should be a very large one to remove all fear of future overcrowding, and great attention would have to be paid to drainage and sanitation

DAS, Dr KEDARNATH

If the University takes upon itself the task of teaching, then it would be desirable to remove it with its constituent colleges to an easily accessible site in the suburbs

DAS GUPTA, HEM CHANDRA

I fully approve of the scheme, and I would like to offer the following suggestions regarding (a) and (c) —

- (a) Different colleges should be made to grow and develop along special lines while the pure scientific training required for technical branches will be imparted in the colleges affiliated in pure science
- (c) There must be good arrangements for sports and for literary recreation. The teachers should mix with the students freely. There must be a regulated style of living. India is a poor country, and if at their tender age our young men are in touch with a very luxurious way of living the moral effect produced will be disastrous to the whole country

DAS GUPTA, KARUNA KANTA

Students should be kept as far as possible away from the distraction of town life

DAS GUPTA, SURENDRANATH

I am not in favour of the removal of the present site of the Calcutta University for reasons which I have already elaborated in Question 3

In addition to those elaborated there, I may further note that the health of Calcutta is generally much better than any of its suburbs which are generally malarious. The advantage of getting the best medical aid which we have in Calcutta should also be a matter of consideration in a centre of student population

The expenses which will be necessary for such a removal will be enormous and with that amount of expenditure the present university needs could be developed to a

DAS GUPTA SURENDRANATH—*contd* —DE SUSHIL KUMAR—DEY BARODA PROSAUD—
DEY N N

much further extent than could be expected by such a scheme of transfer. I think that if funds are available and the whole plot of land with the Calcutta University as the centre and the Metropolitan Institution as the radius could be acquired and the bazar removed to other parts of the town that would be a better scheme. Most of the colleges in Calcutta now are contiguous to one another and if the land is acquired to the extent I propose there will be ample field for any contemplated expansion of the University for any time to come.

Even if the land is not acquired it may not be so difficult for instituting facilities for a corporate life as the colleges generally are close to one another. Houses for hostels and other purposes may be acquired even now without removing the centre.

Calcutta has generated a peculiar literary atmosphere and it is desirable that the advantages of such an atmosphere should be availed to the fullest extent for it is best always to remember that a literary atmosphere often is much more useful than any amount of teaching. In this particular point the development of men seems to have much similarity with the development of trees.

DE SUSHIL KUMAR

It is not practicable to introduce a residential system in our university. The economic condition of the middle class from which by far the largest number of students are recruited as well as the peculiar domestic arrangements and social restraints would stand seriously in the way of such a scheme. Moreover it would be difficult to get good superintendents or persuade teachers to live with their families and freely mix with the students. The conditions of the socially free life of western countries do not obtain here. Besides Cambridge and Oxford universities which are frequently held up as the best examples of the residential system are often criticised as mediæval types—types of universities cut off from city life and out of touch with a cosmopolitan or civic atmosphere.

DEY BARODA PROSAUD

It would be a grand thing if a sort of up to date residential university could be started in some healthy suburb of Calcutta on the river side. But many vested interests stand in the way.

DEY N N

For financial as well as practical considerations I do not agree to the proposal that the University (with some of its constituent colleges) should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs.

The main bulk of the Calcutta colleges are within a very short distance from each other and from the Senate House and the University Science College so that it is not very difficult for them to be in constant touch with each other and with the University.

The want of play grounds is a very serious matter. But this may be solved by opening up a maidan on the north east part of the town where the Improvement Trust operations are going in and such a maidan could admirably help the growth of corporate life.

The University Institute can be well organised so as to be more useful to the students of these colleges.

Of course colleges may be established in the suburbs like the South Suburban College and the University may readily affiliate these.

A sufficient number of rented houses are always available in the college locality which could be taken up as residences for teachers and attached messes for students.

D'SOUZA, P G —DUNNICLIFF, HORACE B —DUTT, BAMAPADA—DUTT, REBATI RAMAN.

D'SOUZA, P. G.

The University should be in active touch with life as it is. Our present object is not to produce scholarly recluses, but men of action. It would, therefore, be a mistake to transfer the University to a suburb and accentuate the evils of artificial isolation.

DUNNICLIFF, HORACE B

If the University is to provide inter-collegiate lectures its buildings and laboratories and other buildings should be accessible to all those who participate in the inter-collegiate system.

If a college is situated in a large town one is confronted with difficulties, such as the shortage of land for games. Moreover, living in a town brings the student near the temptations of town life.

I would not advocate the removal of the colleges to the suburbs, but see no reason why, in the interests of health, the boarding-houses or hostels should not be moved to outside of the city.

An Indian superintendent should be appointed, who should be provided with free quarters in the hostel. The superintendent marks attendance, reports any irregularity or sickness, and generally supervises the cleanliness of the rooms. I do not consider it the function of a superintendent to see that the boarders work, but rather to see that idle students do not prevent diligent students from working. The arrangement by which one or two resident assistant superintendents are appointed from the M A classes has been tried and found satisfactory. I am not of the opinion that the superintendent should be of the assistant professor grade. Each hostel should be under the personal supervision of a member of the college staff.

DUTT, BAMAPADA

I consider the proposal of the removal of the University to an easily accessible site in the suburbs with a view to facilitate the expansion of the activities of the University to be sound and desirable. This will remove the students from the din and noise, distraction and temptation, of a great crowded city and will conduce to more undisturbed studies in a more pleasant and quiet atmosphere and, at the same time, it will have the advantage of existing educational resources of Calcutta.

DUTTA PROMODF CHANDRA—GANGULI SURENDRA MOHAN—GANGULI SYAMACHARAN—
 GEDDES PATRICK—GHOSA PRATAPCANDRA—GHOSE The Hon ble Rai DEBENDER
 CHUNDER Bahadur

DUTTA PROMODE CHANDRA

The University should remain as it is. The lower classes of the Presidency College (first second third and fourth years) might with advantage be removed to the suburbs and the building given to the University for post graduate work.

If any college will remove itself to the suburbs with the Presidency College so much the better.

GANGULI SURENDRA MOHAN

The scheme is very desirable but too costly and it is doubtful whether in a poor country like ours it will be very successful. In any scheme of university organisation the cost of higher studies for students should not be made prohibitive.

GANGULI SYAMACHARAN

The removal proposal appears to me to be a very unwise one. Economy it obviously disregards it stands up for what is after all not a necessity and apparently it has no definite view as to how the existing costly buildings in the city are to be disposed of. It is not half a century yet since the laying down of the foundation of the Presidency College buildings by Sir George Campbell then Lieutenant Governor of Bengal. He was Lieutenant Governor from 1871 to 1874. A street in Paris bears the name of *Rue de l'Université* and from this an obvious inference is that the University of Paris is in the heart of the city. If Paris can have her university within her limits why cannot Calcutta do the same? The proposers of removal appear to be obsessed by the English modes of Oxford and Cambridge.

If necessity arises in future for the expansion of the University of Calcutta by the addition of new colleges residential quarters and recreation grounds it will in every way be desirable to have them in the suburbs. Such a course would be evolutionary removal would be revolutionary.

GEDDES, PATRICK

The proposal that the University be removed to the suburbs appears to me absurd and not even frankly so but only explicable as a timid and futile proposal against unrest—for which university reorganisation and not this scheme of exile (whole sale because of individual cases) must be left to deal with and I do not say merely to allay but to transform into useful energies.

Were the University transported to-morrow a new university would necessarily arise as is natural to every great city.

GHOSA PRATAPCANDRA

It would be surely advantageous to all concerned if better and more commodious sites were secured on the banks of the Hugli north and south of Calcutta easily accessible by trams etc.

GHOSH The Hon ble Rai DEBENDER CHUNDER Bahadur

The idea of removing the University and its affiliated colleges from the crowded part of Calcutta to some such suburban part as Ballygunge would have been an admirable one if it had been started sixty years ago. For financial and economic reasons it is now impracticable and we must put up with existing conditions.

GHOSE, SIR RASH BEHARY—GHOSH, BIMAL CHANDRA—GHOSH, DEVAPRASAD

GHOSE, SIR RASH BEHARY.

I am in sympathy with the proposal for the removal of the University to a suitable site in the suburbs as tending to secure the objects stated, and, the proposal should be carried out at once, if funds permit. Government will be expected to provide for it liberally. It is necessary that the site selected should be easily accessible, and it should be optional with the existing colleges to remove to the site.

GHOSH, BIMAL CHANDRA.

Only the *post graduate department*, with library and research laboratories, should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs, and centralised there.

- (i) After a four or five years' stay in the city post-graduate students require a change to healthier surroundings.
- (ii) They are then in greater need of retired work and segregation from unhealthy influences.
- (iii) They are in greater need of a closer association with teachers and their work.

For this advanced work the University should be transferred to the suburbs, but to an easily accessible site, for many students would still have to be in touch with centres of population, *e.g.*, clinical work at the hospitals, teaching work at the schools, attendance at solicitors' offices, and studies of civic problems.

Colleges for under graduate studies should not be removed from where they are, on the contrary, more colleges should be opened in areas of the city—fast growing in importance *e.g.*, Howrah, Cossipore, and Entally.

Such colleges should be kept up and increased in district towns as youths between sixteen and twenty should remain with their parents as much as possible and should be of as little expense to their guardians as possible. Also they should be encouraged to go through some manual training in the workshops of the town. Further, the population of towns should not lose touch with secondary education.

GHOSH, DEVAPRASAD

The residential type of university away from the haunts of men, as seems to be contemplated in this question, is a distinctly mediæval concept. Students—immersed in an atmosphere of pure study, far from the madding crowds' ignoble strife, untouched and unmoved by any of the multitudinous currents of modern life—are extremely unlikely to develop into active, useful, and intelligent citizens who are to shape the future destiny of the country. To start residential universities of this cloistered type is a most retrograde step.

Secondly, to create such a university *ab initio* would be immensely expensive, the money required for which might be much more profitably spent in improving the University as it stands, and it is consequently very likely to render education much more expensive to the students themselves.

I am not in favour of still more increasing the congestion in Calcutta, but the remedy lies not in instituting a still more congested university in Calcutta suburb, but in building (and in encouraging the creation of) colleges and still more colleges in the mofussil, the Calcutta University still remaining of the federal type.

Even in England the residential type has become something of an anachronism; and most of the modern universities that have been started are not modelled after Oxford or Cambridge.

GHOSH JĀNCHĀNDRA—GHOSH JĀNĀENDRA CHĀNDRA—GHOSH Rai Bahadur
NISI KANTA

GHOSH, JĀNCHĀNDRA

(a) (b) and (c) I fully approve of the proposal that the University (and such of its constituent colleges as may desire) should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs

This should be done wholly or partially if funds allow

GHOSH, JĀNĀENDRA CHĀNDRA

The University should not be removed to the suburbs. It must always be the University of the busy, as distinguished from the University of the wealthy. The poor students in Edinburgh, Glasgow and Aberdeen work in a garret and live on oatmeal porridge during the winter months attending the university classes to go back again to the plough or to the counter in the summer to enable them to attend the next winter session. Does anyone doubt the blessings which the Scottish universities have for many generations conferred on the middle and poor classes of their country? [*Life and Experiences of Sir H. E. Roscoe page 177*]

A residential university is merely a catchword. Even in wealthy England the modern universities of Manchester, Leeds, Liverpool, Sheffield and Birmingham have successfully fought for the dethronement of this mischievous idol. The money that is necessary for this purpose could be far better spent in establishing more arts colleges and in opening well-equipped technological and agricultural departments of the University. The University of Calcutta should be modelled on the lines of the modern universities of England, of whose achievement Sir Edward Thorpe speaks in such eloquent terms —

From the circumstance that they are all situated in large towns and in the midst of industrial communities the study of science as a rule is a prominent feature in their scheme of instruction and accordingly their science faculties are usually strongly developed. A spirit of emulation makes them all active centres of research especially in physical science and in its technical applications and their aggregate output of scientific enquiry is now very considerable and in extent and quality compares most favourably with that of continental nations. Their influence upon the conduct of those industries which ultimately depend upon science is already very marked and as the number of scientifically trained men becomes larger as the result of their instruction their influence is bound to become still greater. With the diffusion of a knowledge of scientific principles new applications of science to practice will follow and these in their turn will react upon the instruction in the schools of science. The ultimate effect of all this will be a still clearer recognition by the community that the permanence and eventual success of our manufacturing industries depends upon the intelligent applications of science. [*Life of Sir H. E. Roscoe page 95*]

GHOSH Rai Bahadur NISI KANTA

If financial consideration would not be a bar I think it is a fair proposal that the University with all its constituent colleges and (*not as many of them as may desire*) should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburb for its expansion for erection of buildings for residence of students and teachers and for colleges and generally for the growth of corporate university life. But would it be practicable for such an old standing University like that of Calcutta to shift with all its constituent colleges? And would not the cost be prohibitive?

Besides is there any likelihood that the numerous colleges in Calcutta will be willing to shift themselves along with the University in the suburbs incurring such heavy expenditure unless compelled? Even if some of the colleges do agree others will remain

GHOSH, Rai Bahadur NISI KANTA—*contd* —GILCHRIST, R N —GOSWAMI, BHAGABAT KUMAR SASTRI

in their present localities, and would these circumstances help the growth of a corporate University life as contemplated ?

This may be very feasible and practicable in the case of a university going to be newly founded but may, for financial reasons, be not practicable at all in case of an old-standing university like that of Calcutta

The removal of the seat of the present University, with the colleges incorporated to it and a few other colleges like the Presidency College, in the suburbs, leaving other large colleges in the centre of the town, would not, help the development of the corporate university life. An attempt in that direction if apparently successful, may, for various reasons, turn out to be an artificial one rather than helpful to the spontaneous growth of such a corporate life

GILCHRIST, R N

I oppose further concentration of university institutions in Calcutta for reasons academical, moral, and physical. At the same time, I advocate making full use of what material exists at present for the future universities. The removal of the University from Calcutta to an easily accessible site in the suburbs, such as Alipore and Belgachia, is very desirable, but I do not see how it can be financed. In the scheme I put forward I should like to see the present university buildings given over to the State University, and the new Calcutta University should be a university on the new London model. The removal of the new University College to the suburbs would be very desirable, but the removal of the constituent colleges would be possible only if the buildings of these colleges could be sold. Considerations other than financial would, however, prevent the removal of missionary colleges, and their loss would be a deadly one for the University. Any new colleges that might be incorporated in the University should be built in a less expensive area than Calcutta.

The Presidency College, again, might be made the University college, and the unitary arts colleges of the State University built in an accessible site. Reasons sentimental, as well as financial, would stand in the way of such a plan.

The impossibility of financing any considerable movement such as is suggested in the question strengthens the case for the concentration in mofussil centres where university facilities already exist. Once this is accepted I see little reason for spending huge sums for removing colleges from Calcutta when a result similar to that given in the answer, *viz* —

- (i) Expanding the activities of the University
- (ii) The erection of suitable buildings for colleges, residences for staff, and students' hostels
- (iii) The growth of corporate life may be achieved by the far less expensive scheme I advocate. It seems to me a ridiculous waste of both money and resources to pay a lakh of rupees for a bigha of land when it can be had at a tenth of the price in good, healthy, mofussil centres where buildings already exist. Other reasons, physical, moral, and academical, added, the argument for expansion of selected mofussil centres seems to me overwhelming. Rome was not built in a day, nor will these universities be built in a day, but we can at least lay down the framework of a policy which will allow for their growth in the future.

GOSWAMI, BHAGABAT KUMAR SASTRI

The ideal is certainly good, and it is not at all impracticable. The cost will largely be covered by the sale of existing buildings. The advantages are immense and will be in all directions. The whole concern, however, must be run on strictly business lines to make high education as little costly as possible, in order not to jeopardise its widest diffusion among the people.

GOSWAMI KUNAR BHAGANATH SASTRI—*contd*—GOSWAMI Rai Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN—
GUHA JITES CHANDRA—GUHA RAJANIKANTA

If necessary the local Government should be empowered to levy a special education cess to meet partially the initial expenditure for such a scheme and for its successful operation in future. Ways may be found to tap the lawyers bankers and zamindars in possession of the accumulated wealth of the country for this really useful purpose.

GOSWAMI Rai Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN

I fully approve the proposal that the University and its constituent colleges should be removed from the bustle and tumult of a big city to its noiseless and sequestered suburbs.

GUHA, JITES CHANDRA

I cannot approve of the suggestion of the removal of the University to the suburbs as that would cause immense hardship to poor students whose number is legion.

GUHA, RAJANIKANTA

I am opposed to the proposal that the University and such of its constituent colleges as may desire should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs and for the following reasons—

- (i) The cost would be enormous and prohibitive while the gain would not answer to it. All the colleges in Calcutta with the exception of one or two have buildings of their own. If they are forced to abandon them and to remove to the suburbs the sale proceeds of these will fall far short of the vast amount of money that will be necessary for their location in the new site. The deficit must be made good by the Government. With a fraction of the money that would be required for this purpose elementary education might be made free, secondary education widely diffused and highly improved and the University itself immensely strengthened. If however those of the colleges that do not choose to go are left undisturbed—the thought of removing the Medical College with the hospitals attached to it can never be entertained—the scheme will be defeated of one of its purposes, i.e. that of fostering the growth of corporate university life.
- (ii) The Haldane Commission of 1910 fully considered the advantages of centralisation in the case of the University of London and recommended the creation of a university quarter in that city. But the considerations that apply to London do not apply to Calcutta. The wealth of the one bears no proportion to the wealth of the other and the traditions and social organisation of the two are quite different. And even in London the Commissioners admit complete centralisation will not be possible.
- (iii) It should further be noted that the Haldane Commission did not recommend the removal of the University to the suburbs of the city. Their words are—We think the aim should be to bring the constituent colleges and the university departments in one part of London and group them round the central buildings of the University when they are not actually within its walls. If it be thought desirable for the Calcutta University to follow this advice it can do so far more easily at its present site than by adopting the scheme under discussion. There is already something like a university quarter in Calcutta. The Senate House, the Darbhanga Building, the Presidency College, the Sanskrit College, the David Hare Training College, the Medical College with its hostels and hospitals, the Hindu and Hare schools, the Hardinge Hostel, the Eden Hindu Hostel and the University Institute are contiguous to one

GUHA, RAJANIKANTA—*contd* —GUPTA, UMES CHANDRA—HALDAR, UMES CHANDRA—
HARLEY, A H—HOLLAND, Revd W E S

another The City School is two minutes' walk from the University ; the City, Ripon, Bangabasi, St Paul's, Vidyasagar, Bethune, Scottish Churches, and the University Science colleges are within easy distances from it. There remain three other colleges—St Xavier's, Central and South Suburban—the first two are easily accessible from it by tram, so that there is only one college which is at a considerable distance from the stream of academic life in Calcutta. If it be held indispensable to the well being of the University to bring all the constituent colleges together, and group them round the Senate House, the most feasible plan would be to acquire sites for them in the area bounded on the north by the Machhabazar Street, on the east by the Circular Road, and on the south by the Bowbazar Street. The price of land is much higher in the city than in the suburbs, but we shall have to build far fewer buildings, and as all the colleges will be located in the heart of Calcutta neither the students nor their guardians will have any objections to the proposed centralisation.

GUPTA, UMES CHANDRA

No such removal is necessary and it would exclude many students from university education.

Such removal will practically make the colleges residential.

HALDAR, UMES CHANDRA.

I am against the removal of the University to a site in the suburbs on the following grounds —

- (i) The removal will deprive the students of the special opportunities offered for civic education by the exigencies of town life
- (ii) The removal will be detrimental to the formation and growth of national character, the foundations of which are laid in town life
- (iii) The removal will involve unnecessary hardship and expense on the part of poor students and those living with their parents or guardians, who will be compelled to live in the hostel
- (iv) The ends mentioned in (a), (b), (c) may be achieved by acquiring land round the present site of the University and erecting suitable buildings there
- (v) Modern universities have been established and are flourishing in large towns in America, Europe, Japan, and China

HARLEY, A H

I am not of opinion that the University should be removed to a site in the suburbs because Calcutta offers such facilities as have been advantageous to students in Western cities and have tended to the prosperity and progress of those universities. But it is desirable that a college which cannot provide its students with facilities for recreation, etc., should be encouraged financially, if necessary, to remove to an easily accessible suburb.

HOLLAND, Revd W E S

An altogether admirable proposal. I have treated of it under question 5

HREQ The Hon ble Maulvi A K FUZLUL—HYDARI M A N—IMAM The Hon ble Justice Sir ALI—Indian Association Calcutta—IYER The Hon ble Mr Justice T V SESHAGIRI—JENNINGS The Hon ble Mr J G

HREQ, The Hon ble Maulvi A K FUZLUL

- (a) (b) and (c) I am in favour of a removal of the University to an easily accessible site in the suburbs with a view to facilitate the objects set forth

HYDARI M A N

The only suggestion that I have to offer is that from a financial point of view such a removal would be really an economy for the sites where the existing colleges happen to be located must be very valuable and can be sold without any loss

IMAM The Hon ble Justice Sir ALI

The growth of corporate university life is not practicable in the Indian universities where the bulk of the colleges are external and situated at great distances from each other. But as I have indicated in my previous answers universities should maintain at least one university college where the best possible system of education should be endeavoured to be obtained by attracting the best teachers. I have also indicated how professors should be encouraged to go round to the external colleges and deliver lectures each in his special subject so as to raise the standard of lectures everywhere.

Indian Association Calcutta

The idea is good but the outlay would be enormous and perhaps prohibitive. Further it would be difficult to remove existing colleges which are already located in Calcutta.

IYER, The Hon ble Mr Justice T V SESHAGIRI

I do not think it desirable to remove a university from the centre of population to a secluded area.

JENNINGS The Hon ble Mr J G

Without venturing to speak of Calcutta with the conditions of which I am not particularly familiar I may say that an essential feature of the Patna University scheme is the establishment of a unitary residential and teaching centre in Patna. Government have acquired an area of approximately one square mile for the University and plans for the buildings to be erected thereon are under discussion although during the war there is little likelihood of their materialising. Without such a university centre to set the example there would be little likelihood of the divisional centres developing into unitary universities in the course of time. Perhaps it may similarly be said of Calcutta that so long as there is no example of a unitary residential university in the metropolis the ideal is scarcely likely to flourish in the rest of the province. On the other hand all the many colleges in Calcutta are not likely to be uprooted and something can doubtless be done and so far as post graduate studies are concerned is being done to group them into one or more aggregates of mutually helpful and complementary institutions whether related to a unitary centre as in the Patna University scheme or not.

KADIR, A F M ABDUL—KAR, SITES CHANDRA—KO, TAW SEIN—KUNDU, Rai BEJOY NARAYAN, Bahadur—LATIF, Syed ABDUL, Khan Bahadur

KADIR, A F M ABDUL

The removal of the University to any good site in the suburbs will be a material help towards creating a literary and scholarly atmosphere which, even up till now, the University has failed to create owing to its situation in a busy quarter of a big town where one cannot live and work with that singleness of purpose which should characterise the university professors and alumni

KAR, SITES CHANDRA

I think the proposal that the University and its constituent colleges should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs is worth serious consideration. The idea of a university town with colleges and residences for teachers and students grouped together is open to the single objection that the financial difficulties may be serious, in spite of the fact that land is very much cheaper in the suburbs than in Calcutta. No great weight attaches to the objection sometimes raised that our day scholars living with guardians in Calcutta would be put to serious difficulties in attending lectures at a great distance. This is easily overcome by the provision of cheap tram-car communication. I do not go in for an out-and-out residential university. The peculiar conditions of our social life and the general poverty of a large class of our students would impose tremendous hardship on them if residence is insisted on in every case.

KO, TAW SEIN

The University should be removed to the suburbs. Town life is inimical to university life in all its forms. Learning can never grow amidst the distractions and pleasures of a large town.

KUNDU, Rai BEJOY NARAYAN, Bahadur

It is desirable that the University should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs and residential schools and colleges should be established there. The attached hostels should be divided into blocks, and each block should not accommodate more than forty boys, who will be under one paid superintendent. There should be a library and laboratory and an attached hospital and prayer-houses for students of different religions, quarters for teachers should also be erected near the hostels. I know of guardians who keenly feel the necessity of a residential college of the kind for want of which they are obliged against their will to send their boys to unprotected boarding-houses. As regards the pecuniary question, in a big institution of this kind, which should be provided with its own tanks, gardens, etc., the expenses which the students will have to bear will not be more than at present. I personally know of some asylums existing on the Malabar coast where 300 to 700 persons live, which are so economically managed that the cost per head, including medical expenses, does not exceed Rs 7. In starting an institution like this a large sum will, of course, be required in the beginning, which I think Government and the rich people will ungrudgingly subscribe, as they will be amply compensated hereafter.

LATIF, Syed ABDUL, Khan Bahadur.

The removal of the University and its constituent colleges to an easily accessible site in the suburbs is very necessary. This will not only create an atmosphere of academic calm, but will also help the growth of corporate university life.

MAHALANOBIS PRASANTA CHANDRA—MAHASAI KUMAR KSHITINDRADEB Rai—MAHTAB
The Hon ble Sir BIJAY CHAND—MAITRA GOPAL CHANDRA—MAITRA HERAMBACHANDRA

MAHALANOBIS PRASANTA CHANDRA

It is thoroughly undesirable to remove the central university quarters from its present site. I do not believe a greater mistake than this can ever be committed. It would have a highly injurious effect on—

(a) the activities of the University and

(b) to some extent it would be easier to provide suitable buildings if the site is removed to a suburb but I do not believe that the problem of finding sufficient available grounds near the central university quarters is after all one of insurmountable difficulty

(c) the growth of corporate life

In the twentieth century there is not a single instance of any important university being founded on a site other than in important centres of population. In Bengal it would be a great mistake to isolate the University from the intellectual centre of the province. It must be definitely recognised that an educational institution in the modern world best serves its universal ends by being thoroughly and efficiently local in its foundations.

MAHASAI, KUMAR KSHITINDRADEB Rai

It would not be expedient to remove the University to the suburbs. It will entail heavy expenditure without any proportionate gain in efficiency.

If the Calcutta University is turned into a teaching university with the Calcutta colleges as the units with an extra jurisdiction for conferring degrees on mofussil colleges in Western Bengal only as proposed in answer to question 4 the question of the removal of the University will not then arise.

MAHTAB The Hon ble Sir BIJAY CHAND

The cost may be prohibitive but it would undoubtedly be a move in the right direction to remove the University to an easily accessible site in the suburbs such as Alipore Ballygunge or Cossipore.

MAITRA GOPAL CHANDRA

If the existing nature of the Calcutta University is maintained and colleges situated in the distant mofussil continue to remain affiliated it is difficult to perceive how the removal of a college or two from their present sites will lead to the expansion of the University activities and help the growth of corporate university life. The question of cost furnishes a strong ground against such removal.

MAITRA HERAMBACHANDRA

Colleges may be established in the suburbs. Quite apart from the objects mentioned in the question the establishment of new colleges is needed to meet the growing demand for university education. But the University should not be removed outside the city. It is the ornament and glory in an intellectual sense of a city like Calcutta. Steps should be taken towards the conversion of the city into a university town.

MAJUMDAR, BIRAJ MOHAN—MAJUMDAR, PANCHANAN—MAJUMDAR, RAMESH CHANDRA—
MAJUMDER, NARENDRAKUMAR—MAZUMDAR, The Hon'ble Babu AMVIKA CHARAN

MAJUMDAR, BIRAJ MOHAN

It is very desirable that the University and all the Calcutta colleges should be removed from the crowded quarters to the suburbs where land even now may be secured at a cheap rate and in large quantities. There is no doubt that if suitable buildings for the different colleges, with residential quarters for the professors and hostels for students, be erected, with extensive playgrounds around them the health and morale of the students would be improved and it may lead to the growth of corporate university life amongst the student community. But when we think of the financial resources to carry on such a scheme—it is reduced to nothing but a dream.

MAJUMDAR, PANCHANAN

I am not in favour of the proposal for the following reasons :—

- (i) The cost of education will become very much greater
- (ii) A suitable site is not available, or at least the proposed site does not possess the advantages of Calcutta]
- (iii) The estrangement from home, and the absence of home influences, will have a bad effect upon the character of the students
- (iv) Caste prejudices will hamper the growth of corporate university life.

MAJUMDAR, RAMESH CHANDRA

The proposal will entail the expenditure of a vast sum of money which may be more profitably employed in establishing more colleges. It is a notorious fact that every year a large number of students cannot secure admission into colleges for want of accommodation. This constitutes a grave situation and requires instant remedy.

Besides the removal of the University to a lonely suburb, far from the healthy current of life, seems to me a doubtful blessing.

MAJUMDER, NARENDRAKUMAR.

A suburban university will not be able to utilise the rich resources of Calcutta referred to in my answer to question 3.

The scheme is impracticable not merely because of the waste of the existing educational plant that it will imply, but also for the expensiveness of the residential arrangements which will be prohibitive to the average Bengali student.

MAZUMDAR, The Hon'ble Babu AMVIKA CHARAN

It would no doubt be a great step taken towards the advancement of higher education if the seat of the Calcutta University could be removed to a well-chosen suburb of the town where it might grow and expand in a serene atmosphere of education and away from the bustle and confusion, as well as the many temptations of a vast business city like Calcutta. But I am afraid the cost of such an experiment would be very heavy, if not prohibitive.

MITRA The Hon ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA Bahadur—MITTER Dr DWARKANATH—
MITTER The Hon ble Mr PROVASH CHUNDER—MUKERJEE ADHAR CHANDRA—
MUKERJEE Dr ADITYANATH—MUKERJEE BIJOY GOPAL

MITRA, The Hon ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA Bahadur

Calcutta is not a suitable place for facilitating the expansion of the University

It and its constituent colleges can be conveniently removed to some easily accessible place within fifty miles or even some smaller distance from Calcutta where large tracts of land can be purchased at a cheap price and ideal buildings may be constructed thereon. Enquiry may be set on foot as to the place particularly suitable for the University. Such a place should be near to a railway station and also near the river side. Buildings for the residence of students as well as teachers should be constructed.

MITTER Dr DWARKANATH

I do not approve of the proposed removal of the University and its colleges from their present site to the suburbs of Calcutta but would suggest that near the present site of the University more land may be acquired with a view to an expansion of the activities of the University. I would suggest that if feasible all colleges in Calcutta should be located in a central position near the site of the University.

MITTER, The Hon ble Mr PROVASH CHUNDER

The enormous sums that will be necessary to give effect to these suggestions will benefit the cause of education far more if they are spent for the benefit of the existing institutions and other necessary institutions both general and vocational. In the next place I do not think it will be possible either for the Government the University or the people to find anything approaching the requisite sums of money. Lastly it will mean such a reckless waste of large sums already sunk and such a dislocation of existing conditions that the results will be almost disastrous.

MUKERJEE ADHAR CHANDRA

The scheme is desirable if funds permit

MUKERJEE Dr ADITYANATH

- (a) (b) and (c) This is mainly a financial question and if there be no financial difficulty the ideals enumerated in the question are excellent and I would heartily support the scheme provided that the residential system contemplated does not prove too costly for our students.

MUKERJEE BIJOY GOPAL

It would be a distinct gain if the University and some of its constituent colleges be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs. One material advantage of such an arrangement would be the removal of the students from the unwholesome influences of a crowded metropolis. They would be free from the various distractions incidental to town life and such isolation would be quite in consonance with the educational methods of ancient India. But there is one serious obstacle to the realisation of this high ideal. During the last few years large sums of money have been spent on buildings designed exclusively to meet the requirements of certain educational institutions and it is extremely doubtful whether they would now fetch their price in the market if sought to be disposed of by sale. The main question thus reduces itself to one of finance and it is for the authorities of these institutions to consider whether this financial problem can be adequately solved.

MUKERJEE, RADHAKAMAL.

MUKERJEE, RADHAKAMAL.

As the means of communication exist at present, a site, however convenient it may otherwise be, will be more or less inaccessible. The present University has created around it a zone of college-going population. The distance of the college site from the centres of civic and social life is not a thing to be desired under present conditions when we have already had too much of separation of intellectual interests from the human and civic issues of life, created and emphasised by the existing education. It is the college which represents the high water-mark of communal interest in forming a better average type of manhood, and it is the college that is, or ought to be, most concerned of all public institutions to open the gates of culture to all people, rich or poor, high or low. In India higher education had always been recognised as enlarging man's sphere of social service and the ideal always was to extend and diffuse culture amongst all. The application of aggressive good-will to the human issues of education led Indian teachers to act not merely as educational advisers and advocates, but as friends, philosophers, and ministers to the locality. In western learning in India a mechanical division of labour and a consequent isolation of the human and social sciences have resulted in futile specialisms. In western education this abstraction of specialised aspects has been strengthened by the general dissociation of thought from action and from life. This is perhaps the strongest argument against the removal of the centralised teaching university from Calcutta to the suburbs which will further emphasise the intellectual isolation and detachment with which western education has been associated in our country. If the college is to develop as a true social and civic centre, feeding, and being fed, by the deep issues of life of the metropolitan city and designing and inspiring social action and policy, its existence and development in the heart of the population are advantages, while a forced removal would, in an atmosphere of academic aloofness, seclusion and stagnation postpone the date when the University would be constant in its watchfulness towards a fuller civic and social application of every sort of specialised capacity and training. The professor no longer confined to his library or the laboratory, the professor abroad in homes and slums, workshops, and clubs, one who teaches as he learns, and learns as he teaches, and whose learning and teaching are all for social and civic education and betterment—that is a type, too rare as yet, and that a teaching university, far away from the life of the people, with its joys and sorrows, hopes and aspirations, and from the opportunities of social work and service can seldom develop in our country. Apart from these, the expense and the waste will be immense, and this for only 77 per cent of the population in a country where primary and secondary education are not being proportionately encouraged.

The teaching university in the suburbs, again, implies the residential system which will be too costly for the average Bengali student, expensive not merely for the boarding and tuition fees, but also for the time and energy spent in an education that after all trains them so little for living life easily, joyously, nobly.

Moreover, as long as in the government of the University, and its residential and other arrangements, the intellectual and natural leaders of the country do not occupy the position and status which they rightly hold in the universities of the West, the residential university in the suburbs will not be calculated to develop a healthy corporate life among students and teachers, and the country will also lose in the freedom and initiative the teachers are now enjoying outside the range of any rigid residential organisation. There cannot be a 'healthy' corporate life in the University which cuts itself aloof in a fancied imitation of the conservative traditions of Oxford and Cambridge from the main currents of the country's intellectual and social life. In England the universities of the new type chartered within the last few years are all municipal. They are Birmingham, Bristol, Leeds, Liverpool, London (reorganised), Manchester, and Sheffield. These civic institutions had their origin in an endeavour 'to raise the intellectual level of the towns' in which they were placed. But situated as they are in the centre of England's commercial and industrial life, and confronted by an intense desire of the students and the people for greater efficiency in these activities, they immediately widened their scope of work and became strongly technological. England is looking not to Oxford and Cambridge

MUKERJEE RADHAKAMAL—*contd*—MUKHERJEE B—MUKHOPADHYAYA Dr SIAMADAS

but to these new town universities as agents in promoting her economic and military efficiency during the course of the war. In the United States of America every Western State has its university which is not only in its purpose service but also in its support public. Beyond this cities have made provision of a like character. The University of Chicago for instance occupies an unique position with reference to higher education in the Middle West. Upon it largely rests the responsibility of maintaining and extending graduate work of the highest type and the ultimate establishment of professional schools upon a graduate basis. On the other hand the location in a great city throws upon the University the obligation to provide for under graduate teaching. It is the aim of the University to fulfil both these functions with fidelity to the best standards and without sacrificing either task to the other. The University extension and social settlement work are among the other distinctive features of this University originating in the special needs opportunities and responsibilities of the University in the midst of a great agglomeration of the population.

In Calcutta the large and wealthy population conditions that the University ought to continue to render under graduate teaching work as well as to provide for the highest teaching in the professions commercial science and technology to satisfy the insistent demands of the urban population for efficiency in these departments. The largest and wealthiest centre of population in India cannot remain unprovided with facilities for higher education and even if the present colleges and the centralised university are removed to the suburbs there will be an inevitable tendency for new colleges to be established which will be bound to flourish at the expense of the university in the suburbs that will stagnate in the shade of intellectual and civic isolation. In the struggle for survival among universities the civic university in the heart of the city developing a civic personality will prosper more than a hermit university which lives in the suburbs to protect its classical culture from the throbbing life of the multitude.

MUKHERJEE B

There is much to be said both for and against the removal of the University to the suburbs. The question was exhaustively discussed and considered a few years ago. The question is largely one of finance. I need not deal with the arguments that were put forward some years ago on both sides of the question. On the whole it will be an immense advantage to the cause of education if the University can be removed from its present site to the suburbs. It will add greatly to the strength and efficiency of the University. Most of the pressing difficulties of the University will be easily and quickly removed by such a removal. The expansion of the University and its colleges the difficulty of finding adequate residential quarters for teachers the improvement in the residential condition of the student provision of open spaces for physical recreation the need of a corporate and social life in the University and a host of other difficulties which at present seem almost insuperable can be easily solved by such a transfer of site. But the question is largely one of finance.

MUKHOPADHYAYA Dr SIAMADAS

Such a scheme if it could be adequately carried out would be an inestimable boon to Bengal. It would obviate the overcrowding in the Calcutta colleges by drawing away the mass of students to a large extent. It would be of far greater advantage to the residents of Calcutta if there could be established half a dozen good Government schools in Calcutta instead of half a dozen colleges mainly filled by mofussil students. If facilities were offered to bona fide Calcutta students who preferred to live under the protection of their guardians to attend the proposed colleges as day scholars the overcrowding in the Calcutta colleges would be further reduced. If the B.Sc. qualification were made compulsory for entrance into the medical college then the colleges which might remain in Calcutta for the benefit of students from all parts of Bengal would be mainly of the post graduate type.

NAG, P N—NANDY, The Hon'ble Maharajah Sir MANINDRA CHANDRA—PAL, The Hon'ble Rai RADHA CHARAN, Bahadur—PEAKE, C W

NAG, P N

- (a), (b), (c) It is very desirable from moral, physical, and intellectual points of view that the University and its constituent colleges should be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs for the growth of corporate university life. But I am afraid that the conditions favourable to the attainment of this end may not be obtainable in Bengal.

NANDY, The Hon'ble Maharajah Sir MANINDRA CHANDRA.

I consider that the removal of the University to the suburbs would involve an expenditure disproportionate to the advantages anticipated. The University will not gain, but lose, from its isolation from the currents of social and civic life that its removal to the suburbs will imply. The residential arrangement, again, is too costly for an average student, and its advantages with regard to the proportion of corporate life among students and teachers do not appear to be great.

PAL, The Hon'ble Rai RADHA CHARAN, Bahadur.

The scheme is a very desirable one, but there is reason to fear that it may turn out to be too costly and is objectionable only on that ground. It is very unfortunate that the proposal made some years ago to transfer the Presidency College to a suitable site outside the city found but scant support. Had the project been carried out then the expenditure would have been much less than it is likely to be at the present time, and this institution might have been turned into the nucleus for such a reorganised university as is contemplated in these questions.

PEAKE, C W.

One fundamental point which will doubtless receive the anxious consideration of the Commission is the determination of the site of the University centre. I believe that they will find it neither desirable nor possible to remove the centre to the mofussil, but it has been suggested that a site should be found within a region covered by the Calcutta tramway system, where land is reasonably cheap, to which the University may be transferred.

The considerations governing the situation appear to be as follows.—

- (i) The fundamental necessity of providing healthy residential accommodation for the students and playing-fields for their physical recreation.
- (ii) The necessity of making arrangements for professors, European and Indian, to live in close contact with the students.
- (iii) The fact that large sums of money have been sunk in buildings in North Calcutta for the university colleges.

It appears to me best to adopt a compromise. Let the university buildings—Senate House, University Library, University College, the Presidency College, and one or two colleges with considerable funds sunk in buildings remain where they are for the present, but take up land outside Calcutta within easy reach of the Shambazar tram lines for hostels, residences of professors, colleges, playing-fields, etc., and, in fact, for a university settlement. To this site one or two of the colleges whose buildings are of no great intrinsic value might possibly be removed, the cost of the new buildings being defrayed partly by the sale of the valuable land upon which they are situated. Hostels, such as the Eden Hostel, might remain for the present, but the Eden Hostel building should be modified and the number of boarders reduced so as to allow for the residence of Indian professors under suitable conditions in association with the students.

PEAKE C W—contd—RAY, MANMATHANATH—RAY Sir P C

The new hostel in contemplation for the Presidency College should be erected on the new site and not on the land already acquired for it which might be converted into a playing field. Generally speaking the most economical policy would be to reserve for the present the hostels already in existence for post graduate students and to transfer to hostels on the new site as many students as possible below the graduate stage whose parents do not reside in Calcutta. The transfer could take place gradually an essential part of the process being the provision of residences for professors *pari passu* with the transfer of the students. It is quite possible that in the distant future the majority of the colleges and hostels might be transferred to the new site but the rate at which the change could be effected would depend on the finances available and the extent to which college buildings hostels etc already constructed in Calcutta could be utilised for other educational purposes. It would be within the range of possibility to obtain funds to the amount of a few lakhs or so yearly from the Government of India the Provincial Government and private sources which could be utilised as they became available. A gradual change of this kind would in no way throw the organisation of the University into confusion while the scheme would be highly beneficial even if carried out on the smallest scale as it will enable the University to close gradually the Calcutta messes which constitute the weakest part of its administration. Further such a scheme would render it unnecessary to scrap the magnificent laboratories of the Presidency College University buildings and University College of Science etc. The essential condition of course for the possibility of a change such as I have suggested is the availability of a site sufficiently near to render it possible for students to come to Calcutta daily by tram and attend the lectures and laboratories of the University and of colleges which have not been transferred to the new site. I understand however from the report of a previous committee that land of the kind required is available.

RAY, MANMATHANATH

The removal is desirable not only because that will have the effect of making the colleges and their surroundings more dignified and more attractive than they are now but also because the residential system brings into play that sense of corporate life and of common interests on which the value of the college as an institution chiefly depends. The professor's duties do not end at the door of the lecture room or even at the gates of the college but the professor should assume responsibility for all his pupils well being physical and moral as well as intellectual and it is only when students and teachers live at a college and meet each other readily that collegiate life attains its completeness.

The removal should be effected at once if funds permit. Of course Government will be expected to provide liberally for the purpose.

The site should be easily accessible. A fairly large area may be acquired in the suburbs of Calcutta and the scheme may be completed and the buildings and residences erected in a number of years say five years during which period Government will have to make a recurring grant every year.

It should be optional with the existing colleges to remove to the site.

This scheme would not increase the cost of education if Government finds money for the buildings and the residences for students. On the other hand the cost of lodging will be reduced and each boarder will have to pay a set rent of Re 1 only per month to cover the cost of repairs.

RAY, Sir P C

I am strongly against the proposal. Hostels are very expensive. I learn that each of the hostels recently built by the University from Government grants at a cost of three lakhs of rupees each can accommodate only from 150 to 200 students. On the other hand each college contains on an average about 1500 students of whom more than 1000 come from the mufussil. Thus it is financially impossible to house all of them in hostels specially built for them.

RAY, SH. P. C.—*contd.*—RAY, Raja PRAMADA NATH

Moreover, the students whose families live in Calcutta should not be isolated from their home environments. The greatest drawback of the residential system is that the students are kept under artificial conditions, away from the every day world, and thus cannot acquire the worldly experience which now stand them in good stead when they enter some profession.

A large proportion of students are extremely poor. They depend upon private tuition, moreover, there are in Calcutta several endowments and charities which provide free board for college students, e.g., those founded by the late Raja Digambar Mitter, by the late Babu Subal Chunder Chunder, Raja Rajendra Lal Mallick, etc. Calcutta with its suburbs has a population exceeding a million. Hundreds of students are housed and fed by the householders. If the University were to be removed to a distant place all these students will be deprived of the benefits of university education.

It is forgotten that the average income of an Indian is £1-10s while that of an Englishman is £12 per annum. Students brought up in the artificial and luxurious style of the hostels cannot adapt themselves to their home life in the villages. Under the residential system the cost per student, including college fees, is not less than Rs. 35 per month, which very few guardians can afford to spare. I have been lately reading Sir Henry Roscoe's 'Memoirs,' as also his 'Life,' by Sir Edward Thorpe. It is well known that Roscoe played a leading part in founding the universities of Manchester and Leeds, and the universities of Birmingham, Sheffield, and Liverpool have been modelled upon these. Roscoe is full of sneers and biting sarcasm against the artificial and highly expensive life as represented in Oxford and Cambridge. The following two extracts from Thorpe's 'Life of Roscoe' will make the points clear—

It was, he said, to be 'The University of the Busy' as distinguished from the old Universities of Oxford and Cambridge—'The Universities of the Wealthy'. He pointed to the existence of the Scottish universities, and explained what their influence had been for generations back on the middle and poorer classes of their country. Was not Lancashire, with its many populous manufacturing towns, as fully entitled to the advantages of a university as the cities over the border? The time had passed for imagining that Oxford and Cambridge, rich and powerful though they were, could do all that England legitimately required in the way of the highest academic culture."

"Moreover, it must be admitted, there is a great deal in the *genius loci*. That spirit had succeeded in developing John Owens' foundation into a splendid institution suited to the local life and requirements. They in Manchester knew what the busy North wanted, but they were not quite so sure that the Dons of Oxford and Cambridge knew it as well as they themselves did. They asked to be allowed to work out their own salvation in their own way."

I have altogether lived seven years in England and Scotland, and lately as a delegate of the University of Calcutta in the Conferences of the Universities of the Empire I had an opportunity of visiting many British universities. The residential system has not been popular anywhere. What has been given up as impracticable in rich England, should not be hoisted upon poor India. Sir Edward Thorpe, speaking on Roscoe's efforts in localising the Owens College in the heart of Manchester says,—It was not used for it to set itself athwart the economical condition of the community.

RAY, Raja PRAMADA NATH.

The University and the principal colleges in Calcutta should be removed to healthy and well-drained suburbs to create an educational atmosphere there, and all these colleges should be made residential so that the students may be kept out of all temptations and evil influences.

RAY SARAT CHANDRA—RAY SATIS CHANDRA—RFAZUDDIN SYED QUAZI—ROY The Hon'ble Rai SRI NATH Bahadur—ROY The Hon'ble Babu SURENDRA NATH—SAHA MEGHNAD

RAY, SARAT CHANDRA

The proposal of removing the University and the colleges to the suburbs is a very good one if funds permit. But no extra fees should be levied upon the student community for the same. The students should as far as practicable be kept also from the attractions, inducements and evil influences of town life.

RAY, SATIS CHANDRA

I entirely fall in with the idea of removing the University to an expansive site in the suburbs preferably on the river side where the students besides having opportunities of swimming and rowing will learn to appreciate the beauty of nature. I consider this removal necessary not only on grounds of facilities but on the ground that young men should during their period of arduous work requiring attention and reflection be as far removed from the amusements, temptations and distractions of city life as possible. The thinking powers are developed better and concentration of attention more easily cultivated amid quiet surroundings. I have been assured that there will be no difficulty in disposing of the existing buildings (with land) at an advantage and if this can be effected the questions of funds is easily solved. The different branches of study should be represented by separate buildings or groups of buildings (not more than two storeys high) providing ample accommodation for all the requirements of university life and for future expansion. The site should be big enough to provide for an agricultural experimental farm and a botanical herbserium.

RFAZUDDIN SYED QUAZI

The University should be removed from the congested portion of the town to save the students from bad society.

ROY The Hon'ble Rai SRI NATH Bahadur

The University should not be removed to a suburb of the city.

ROY The Hon'ble Babu SURENDRA NATH

The University and such of its constituent colleges as may be desired should not be removed to an easily accessible site in the suburbs for any reason whatever.

SAHA MEGHNAD

Instead of removing the whole University from its present site it will be better to acquire land round the present University area. At present there are two distinct university areas—the first includes the Darbhanga building, the Senate House, the Presidency College and the Eden Hindu Hostel. This area can be enlarged by acquiring all the remaining land comprised within the boundary of College Street, Halliday Street, Colutola Street and Harrison Road. This will constitute an excellent University Arts area.

Similarly, all the land included between Upper Circular Road, Amherst Street, Mechhuabazar Road and Parsabagan Street may be acquired for a University Science and Technology area. At present the University College of Science stands at the north east corner of this area. In future the laboratories for physics, biology and botany, the buildings of the technical high school and the agricultural college can all be erected within this area.

SAHAY, Rai Bahadur BHAGVATI-SAPRU, The Hon'ble Dr TRI BHADUR—SAPRU,
KALIPADA—SASTRI, KOKILESWAR, Vidyaratna—Scottish Churches College Senatus,
Calcutta—SEAL, Dr BRAJENDRANATH

SAHAY, Rai Bahadur BHAGVATI

I do think it necessary that the University should be located in a retired and quiet place, free from the din of town and temptations of life. I would not, however, recommend such a course for the three objects specified in the question, which may as well be, and have as a fact been, secured in the present university centre.

SAPRU, The Hon'ble Dr TRI BHADUR

I am generally in favour of universities being established in suburbs of a town. This idea has been accepted by the new Benares Hindu University.

SARKAR, KALIPADA

The proposal is sound. The real difficulty is want of funds.

SASTRI, KOKILESWAR, Vidyaratna

In view of what I have suggested in reply to questions 2 and 18, I am strongly, in favour of removing the University (and such of its constituent colleges as may desire) to an *easily accessible* site in the suburbs.

Scottish Churches College Senatus, Calcutta

While the removal of the University to a site outside the bounds of Calcutta would probably be valuable as making possible the provision of more adequate facilities for the full growth of corporate university life, experience of the present system leads us to consider that no corporate university life is possible unless the University is a much smaller unit, and that no attempt should be made to foster a university community at the expense of the important existing community of life in many of the colleges unless the reduction of the size of the larger unit is possible. If the removal of the University to a site outside the city were to leave certain of the colleges affiliated to it within the city little gain would result. This is especially so as Calcutta is regarded by the student as the healthiest centre in Bengal, a belief justified, we believe, by the relative standard of health in the Calcutta and the mofussil colleges. One looks for relief from the present congestion in other directions as well, but something could certainly be done if a sufficiently strong university centre could be created in some suitable centre outside Calcutta, the colleges remaining in Calcutta being incorporated in the Calcutta University.

SEAL, Dr BRAJENDRANATH

In the remarks that follow I proceed on two assumptions, which, to my mind, are not mere guesses, but very strong probabilities, amounting to moral certainties, from the nature of the case. In the first place, the development of cheap (and rapid) traction, whether by electricity or otherwise, to and from the suburbs (including even places like Narikeldanga and Ballygunge), and on the extensive scale, which alone can serve the needs of our university population and our citizens in the matter of free and constant inter-communication, is a tangled question of municipal politics and foreign company managements and policies, to the uncertainties of which we cannot afford to commit the future.

SEAL Dr BRAJENDRANATH—*contd*

of university education of the Bengali people. In the second place in spite of every conceivable facility the toll of time and money and of business dislocation payable in the daily transits would represent an unutilisable wastage which would necessarily reduce the volume and increase the cost of the educational commodity.

On this basis I proceed to discuss the question of the removal of the University from the city.

India has enough of isolation and of the village life enough of the virtues of peace and meditation in her grain. Let the Bengali boy and girl grow up at home under the refreshing greenness of her waving corn fields and crowned palm groves but after the village *pathsala* and village school let the growing youth stand facing the crowded vistas of civic life in the heart of humanity. Not in cloistral segregation but in coming out of the mediæval cloister lies India's salvation whatever may be the saving power of ruralisation to-day in the West. Not expansion but contraction of the University and its life and span will be the immediate result of this removal to the suburbs. Farewell all hope of expanding the University extension movement which is destined to gather under its wings the army of the great failed and the greater fallen on the way flanked by evening classes on the right and a continuation system on the left. Farewell the new Legend of Good Women the vision in the city of a woman's university in the vernacular. And how shall we get the active co-operation of business men on our faculties of commerce and technology in such a scheme of segregation? or the intimate contact with corresponding firms, banks and factories? or in those filled up swamps or riverside flats that odour of jute or hides of all ah and fat which is the very breath in the countenance of industry and commerce?

And this is not all. The metropolis of the Middle East will continue to grow her own intellectual centres in the heart of her business and her population—her Sahitya Parishad and her Sahitya Sabha her Pam Mohan Library and her Chaitanya Library her Bose Research Institute and her Science Association her Victoria Memorial her various clubs and societies literary mathematical philosophical not to mention the halls of her three Brahmo Samajes her Theosophical Society her Ramkrishna Mission and her Devalaya. A greater college round the colleges the institutions in their ensemble create a social atmosphere of Western Eastern culture a milieu which socialists that culture a living image without which the world of the school or college teaching would remain to the Indian student a distant and airy abstraction. And even if we create a suburban University to-day it will be but a twentieth century Fatehpur Sikri an Akbar's dream in (cheap) marble now alas! a mausoleum (or cenotaph) of that weary Titan or a Hadrian's Palace the vastest and the blankest of ruins! The same metropolitan and cosmopolitan forces which have set up the London University in the centre of civic life and business will operate in this Eastern metropolis and the coming city extension the progress of Calcutta will sweep past and round this suburban corner reabsorbing this suburban learning in the urban humanities!

And this again is not all. A university town capable of accommodating from fifteen to twenty thousand students cannot be built up in a day with the resources at our disposal. The inevitable result will be loss of facilities and opportunities of education to hundreds if not thousands of students hailing from all parts of Bengal—for general as well as vocational education—with a consequent unrest and unsettlement which will be bound to strike deep roots into the social structure unless the face of the country can be covered with a network of institutions of the collegiate and university grade—liberal as well as vocational and technical—of which magic transformation in the near future there is not the least hope having regard to the resources of an agricultural population like Bengal.

On the other hand College Square with the reclamation of land for college and hostel sites on the same plan as that of the City Extension and Improvement Trust may be converted into an academic quarter in the heart of the city which will provide full scope for corporate university life as well as space for new colleges and residences for students and teachers alike. The sub-centres in Cornwallis Square Amherst Street and Lower Circular Road have already an academic air which may be preserved from intrusion.

SEN BENOY KUMAR—*contd*—SEN PAI BOH UNT NATH Bahadur—SEN DR S K—SEN SUPYA KUMAR—SEN GUPTA DR NARENDRA NATH—SEN GUPTA DR NARES CHANDRA

may be renamed the University of Bengal) continues to perform its proper functions and is not adversely affected in its financial position by the creation of the new teaching University of Calcutta in the suburbs. That a university be at the same time both a teaching and an examining body seems to me to be anomalous. Such an unnatural combination is bound to lead to the creation of illogical differences in the relations of the University to colleges in the town and to colleges in the mofussil.

SEN, RAJ BOIKUNY NATH, Bahadur

- (a) (b) and (c) The removal of the University to an easily accessible site in the suburbs for facilitating the objects mentioned does not commend itself to me. It is undesirable the task would be a Herculean one and the result would be disastrous. Its practicability from a financial aspect of the case is next to impossible. If given effect to the advantages can never be commensurate with the sacrifices.

SEN, DR S K

The idea is splendid and nothing could give better facilities to the students than that.

SEN SUPYA KUMAR

The removal of the University to a site in the suburbs of Calcutta will cause much inconvenience to the public and increase the cost of education in a poor country like India where the expenses of education have already enormously increased.

SEN GUPTA DR NARENDRA NATH

I am opposed to the proposal of transplanting the University on the following grounds—

- (i) It will be uneconomical to abandon buildings and land and to rebuild anywhere else.
- (ii) It will mean the creation of a whole city including residential houses for teachers. It means an expenditure of several crores. That amount might with much greater profit be spent on supplementing the present resources.
- (iii) Many poor students who work their way through the college would be deprived of the opportunity of higher education.
- (iv) I am not sure that a secluded university is the best type of university. It is better for students to live and study in the natural environment than to enjoy artificial peace. We do not want a hermit university revelling in the peace of seclusion but a civic university which is likely to develop civic consciousness and personality.

SEN GUPTA DR NARES CHANDRA

The suggestion is a counsel of perfection. It would be admirable if we had a *tabula rasa*. But I do not think it would be worth while now to incur the expense of such removal. The money could be more profitably spent in endowing teaching faculties and providing residences for students.

There ought to be a fixed plan however to group educational institutions round College Square so that they may be near one another and have the benefit of co-operation.

SIN GUPTA, DE NALLUR CHANDRA - *contd.* SIN GUPTA, SUPRENDRA MOHAN. Serampore College, Serampore- SHARF, The Hon'ble Mr. H. SHASTRI, PASHUPATINATH

It is impossible to remove any but arts and science colleges out of their present localities. The removal of the Medical College, with its hospital, for instance, out of the question, without a most serious detriment to the public and also a corresponding reduction of opportunities of instruction from the hospital which is well supplied with patients by reason of its central position. The Belur College too, would not be removed.

SIN GUPTA, SUPRENDRA MOHAN.

I am not in favour of the removal of the colleges to the suburbs. Colleges may spring up in the suburbs.

I think at the present moment all the colleges of Calcutta except one are within the radius of a mile from the Senate House. This order of things should not be disturbed. If a central locality near to the Senate House, like the Marcus Square, be monopolised for the University students to play and meet, then the corporate life will be facilitated. The present Marcus Square can be much enlarged by the Calcutta Improvement Trust acquiring all the adjoining *bustles*. I do not consider that the money available should be spent in building residences for teachers when the whole country is crying loudly for more and more education. The money may be better utilised in helping the foundation of new libraries and laboratories.

Serampore College, Serampore.

As we have already indicated, we are in hearty sympathy with this proposal, and we regard it as an indispensable preliminary to the satisfactory solution of the grave and complex problem of university education in Calcutta. An indefinite continuance of the present system spells disaster.

SHARF, The Hon'ble Mr. H.

(a), (b) and (c) Such a proposal would have an excellent effect under these heads and would enable technological and agricultural institutions to become an integral part of the University, provided this is deemed desirable. The expense, however, would be very great, and I am doubtful whether it could be adequately met by the sale of sites and buildings in Calcutta. The idea is well worth consideration. But, if it were found feasible, its completion would take a long time, and it should, therefore, not be allowed to delay any general reorganisation. I am assuming that such a scheme would be for a local university of Calcutta and would not touch the affiliating organisation and the colleges left in Calcutta. A beginning could be made with a local university in the present accommodation, embracing those colleges which are situated immediately round the Senate House and the Presidency College. Meanwhile, the possibilities of a transfer outside Calcutta could be examined. A danger to be avoided is that of making such a university on too large a scale as regards numbers. To do so would wreck some of the main objects of institutions of this kind and would tend to dwarf other local universities, the development of which, for local reasons, is important.

SHASTRI, PASHUPATINATH

If the University be removed to the suburbs many advantages will be gained. But all the students must not be compelled to reside there, for that would tell heavily upon the purses of poor guardians. Besides, it is better that the students remain in touch with their homes, for, otherwise, they are likely to become mere theorists and learn outlandish habits and manners which will render them unfit for our poor society.

SHASTRI Dr PRABHU DUTTA—SINHA KUMAR MANINDRA CHANDRA—SINHA
PANCHANAN—SIRCAR The Hon'ble Sir NILPATAN—SUDMERSEN F W

SHASTRI, Dr PRABHU DUTT

It seems to me very desirable that a kind of educational colony should spring up in an easily accessible site in the suburbs of Calcutta and the University, as well as all its constituent colleges in Calcutta should be removed to that site. It will then be possible to create a real university atmosphere and to bring about a better organization of higher studies. The growth of a real corporate life among students of the University is impossible in a town like Calcutta under the present conditions.

SINHA, KUMAR MANINDRA CHANDRA

I advocate the location of the University in the southern suburbs of Calcutta, this allows for all sorts of expansion for buildings for teachers and students residence, and for the engendering of a corporate university life.

SINHA PANCHANAN

The proposal is a very good one and is worth a serious attempt. The financial difficulties also are not so insuperable as may be imagined at first sight. If Government comes forward with a large grant of land in a suitable place and advances the initial cost of the buildings etc. the transfer may prove highly beneficial to the college even from the financial point of view.

SIRCAR The Hon'ble Sir NILPATAN

I see no reason for removing the University bodily to a suburban site. I do not believe that the activities of the University will be expanded by this step alone. On the other hand a very large sum of money will have to be spent in buildings and equipment.

As regards the growth of corporate university life I do not see why it should not grow under the existing system. Simply confining all the students in a hostel should not lead to the creation of much solidarity of interest or of feeling.

Further such a step will deprive a very large number of our students of the opportunity of residing with their parents. We all know how very benign this parental influence is. I would however welcome the establishment of a large residential college in the suburbs.

SUDMERSEN, F W

The very cogent arguments by which the London University Commission supported the general retention of the London University in London as opposed to its more distant suburbs cannot be applied to Calcutta. It is true that there is a more or less clearly defined collegiate quarter but the conditions are such as are generally unfit for healthy living. The result is that as soon as financial circumstances permit all members of the teaching staff make their homes in the more healthy and distant parts of Calcutta. Collegiate life is impossible under these circumstances. The objections raised that proximity to the High Court to educational institutions to libraries to workshops is an essential will not hold if the site chosen is one that offers cheap and rapid communication. But few of the colleges will be ready to share in the migration. They may however form the second Calcutta University suggested above and minister more especially to the needs of the poorer or less enterprising and ambitious sections of the community. The Presidency College and the Scottish Churches College together with the recently established College of Science and the University post graduate classes would form a healthy nucleus for the migrated University. The Law College which seems to be run more on professional than on academic lines might perhaps remain in its present location.

SUHRAWARDY, Z. R. ZAHID—TURNER, F. C.—VACHASPATI, SITI KANTHA—VREDENBURG, E. (in consultation with COTTER, G. DEP.)

SUHRAWARDY, Z. R. ZAHID.

I am strongly of opinion that a university town should be established in the suburbs of Calcutta, and no college situate outside its area should be affiliated to the University.

TURNER, F. C.

This is an exceedingly difficult question to answer because, as far as I know, no endeavour has been made to estimate, even approximately, the cost of establishing and maintaining such a university. There is, however, no doubt in my mind that in a university town in the suburbs of Calcutta, with colleges built close to one another and surrounded by playing-fields and parks, it would be easy to develop a far higher standard of university life than is possible under present conditions. It would be possible to develop such a university town, college by college, if Government were to take up a considerable area of land between the Barrackpore Road and the Eastern Bengal Railway and make over sites (on terms to be determined) to individual colleges, and would permit an extension of the tramway system along the Barrackpore Road. This area would be easily accessible either by train or tram from the Senate House and the parts of the city in which the majority of students live.

VACHASPATI, SITI KANTHA

I have the following objections to the proposal —

- (i) Want of sufficient funds
- (ii) The result will not be worth the trouble and the gain will not be at all satisfactory when the enormous cost is taken into consideration
- (iii) The under-graduate students of the University will be deprived of the benefit of association with the advanced post-graduate students in case the constituent colleges exercise the option of remaining in the town
- (iv) The residential system will be too costly for our students, who are usually poor
- (v) Many students live by private tuition in Calcutta. What will befall them?
- (vi) Many distinguished educationists have their residential home situate in Calcutta and it will be impracticable for them to undertake the journey to the suburban university

VREDENBURG, E. (in consultation with COTTER, G. DEP.)

In view of what I have said under questions 17 and 19 I do not consider it advisable for India, however suitable it might be in some other countries. For numerous students who live with their parents it would deprive them of the priceless blessings—family life. For the others, unless the University were to provide in its curriculum for religious instruction it is to be feared that the student in pursuing their studies from a worldly point of view, would lose the grasp of religious faith. It may seem strange that I should so much insist on the religious aspect of all these questions, but it must be kept in mind that I am speaking from the point of view of India, and that the Indians have preserved their spirituality more than any other peoples, and that we must, at all costs, save them from drifting into the agnosticism and atheism that have devastated the West.

WAHEED Shams ul Ulama ABU NASR—WALKER Dr GILBERT T—WEBB The Hon ble Mr C M—WILLIAMS Rev GARFIELD—WORDSWORTH The Hon ble Mr W C—ZACHARIAH K

WAHEED, Shams ul Ulama ABU NASR

I strongly support the proposal and my suggestions are embodied in my reply to question 8. It is essential that all the constituent colleges should be in the same place to derive the full benefit of corporate university life and enjoy the same academic atmosphere. They should also be assimilated to form a university of the mono-college type.

WALKER, Dr GILBERT T

I am not familiar with the constitution of the Calcutta University and I do not know how far it resembles that of our oldest English universities or the London University. But it would seem extremely difficult for Government to order private colleges away to the suburbs and perhaps the University might remain in Calcutta as far as its examining is concerned. But I consider it vital that the Presidency College should go outside Calcutta and would greatly prefer that the University should also go as far as professors' lectures and laboratories are concerned.

WEBB The Hon ble Mr C M

In Rangoon after a long discussion with reference to the site of the proposed University a suburban site of over 400 acres about four miles from the centre of the town has been selected. Otherwise a site sufficient to permit of adequate expansion could not have been secured. With the improvement of communications it is expected that the University when established will be able to keep in touch with the urban institutions (hospitals, museums, libraries, law courts, etc.) necessary to complete its sphere of activity.

WILLIAMS Rev GARFIELD

I have not altered the opinion which I stated nine years ago in my pamphlet 'The Indian student and the present discontent' that the only solution of the problems of the Calcutta University lies in the removal of the arts and science sections of the University from its present site.

WORDSWORTH, The Hon ble Mr W C

Every attempt should be made to diminish the pressure on Calcutta and those colleges that remain in Calcutta should be as far as possible removed from noisy cramped sites. I do not favour the proposal to transplant the whole University with its colleges to an outside site; the result would be the detachment of higher education from the general life of the province, an arrangement that would make strongly for artificiality. I prefer to contemplate colleges in numerous localities, feeling themselves in touch with local needs and aspirations. Having regard to the importance of domestic relations in the social organisation I do not think the development of a corporate university life entirely apart from these either possible or desirable. I do think that teachers should generally live near their colleges and still more important near their college hostels.

ZACHARIAH, K

I should thoroughly approve of migration to the suburbs (See my answers to questions 1 and 5)

QUESTION 22

To what extent do you consider that the needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered —

- (a) in the government of the University
- (b) in its courses of study and
- (c) in its residential and other arrangements ?

ANSWERS

ABDURRAHMAN Dr

- (a) The interests of the Musalmans and other minorities should be duly protected in the government of the University. They should be adequately represented on the Senate and the Syndicate. If a motion is opposed by two thirds of the members of the Muslim or any other community on religious grounds it should not be allowed to be passed.
- (b) The study of the Urdu, Persian and Arabic languages and literatures should be encouraged.

Islamic history should be included among the subjects of the curricula of the University.

- (c) Seats should be reserved in adequate number in all Government colleges for Musalman students and account should be taken of the fact that Hindu students can get a lion's share into a number of Hindu colleges where it is difficult for Musalmans to be admitted.

The distinction made between the first divisioners and the second divisioners for preference in admission should as a special favour not apply in the case of Muhammadans. Muhammadans are sadly backward in education and need such preferential treatment.

An adequate number of seats should be reserved for Muhammadans in all boarding houses and special boarding houses should be erected for them, having regard to their special needs and convenience.

AHMAD SAYID ASHRAFUDDIN, NAWABZADA, Khan Bahadur

- (a) It cannot be denied that Muhammadans in India form a very living important and very far from negligible factor. It is hardly necessary to quote chapter and verse in support of this fact as it has always been acknowledged as a sort of self-evident truth not only by consecutive Viceroys but also by the lowest man who thinks about it. This being an accomplished fact I would urge their needs and requirements more because of their past history and political considerations in the country than for their numerical strength. It may look paradoxical for Muhammadans to claim special treatment as regards education but it is no use gaining that everything being considered they do need it and deserve it though at present they do not get even what goes to their sister community Hindu—in the ordinary course of events.

With this purpose in view I would suggest that in the Calcutta University —

- (i) There should be Hindu and Muhammadan fellows in equal proportion. Muhammadans being elected by a wide electorate of their own and then supplemented by nomination by Government.

AHMAD, SAYID ASHRAHUDDIN, NAWABZADA, Khan Bahadur—*contd.*—AHMAD, KHABIR-
 UDDIN—AHMED, TASLIMUDDIN, Khan Bahadur.

- (ii) There should be a similar consideration in the Syndicate, half the seats being reserved for Muhammadans.
- (iii) Muhammadans should be given equal facilities in the university offices and to every kind of appointment in the University
- (iv) Qualified Muhammadans should be ungrudgingly given examinerships in the University
- (b) The courses of study should be altered so as to equip students better for the world In this connection a representation of qualified Muhammadans on the Senate and boards of studies who are responsible for the courses prescribed is all important Objectionable passages that are often found in some of the prescribed books should be taken as a disqualification of the book concerned Elphinstone's *History of India* is a case in point (*vide* the chapter on Islam and Mahomed) I would also recommend that only roll numbers, and not names, should be mentioned on the answer books, and that undue preference should never be given to the works and compilations of people who are on the Senate or Syndicate for the sole reason that they occupy high places
- (c) In boarding houses for Muhammadans proper arrangements should be made and facilities given for prayers and special rooms should be set apart for this purpose If possible, short lectures on theology should be arranged in hostels on the lines of the M. A. O. College at Aligarh

AHMAD, KHABIRUDDIN

- (a) There should be adequate representation of Muhammadans, who form 52·7 per cent. of the total population in Bengal, in the Senate, Syndicate, faculties, and boards of studies
- (b) The future of Oriental students who pass the final examination from senior madiassahs deserves special consideration.

AHMED, TASLIMUDDIN, Khan Bahadur

School and college education is making steady progress amongst Muhammadans. The number of students in schools and colleges is daily increasing The number of passed students is not inconsiderable Though many of them are pressed by want they patiently continue their studies There are many schools in Eastern Bengal in which the number of Muhammadan students preponderates, so Muhammadan interests are as great as Hindu interests The Muhammadan grievance is, as is loudly and justly ventilated by the press, that the Musalman community is almost unrepresented on the governing body of the Calcutta University Charges of partiality and injustice have been brought against the Senate and Syndicate To instance it I attach herewith a few cuttings from the "Musalman" and earnestly invite the best attention of the Commissioners to them I make the following suggestions which, under the above circumstances, cannot be considered unreasonable or charged with partiality —

- (a) (i) Half the number of the Senate should be elected and the other half nominated by Government
- (ii) Of the elected members half should be Muhammadans The minimum number of Muhammadan members, whether half or one-third, should be fixed. These members are to be elected by the University electorates, by Hindus and Muhammadans alike
- (iii) The electorate should consist of persons who have obtained the B.A., or similar degree, and who are of ten years' standing and who have registered their names on payment of a reasonable fee. A qualified person may be permitted to enrol himself as an elector on payment of the necessary fees from the date of registering his name.

ATTACHED TASTIMUDDIN Khan Bahadur—*contd*

- (iv) The minimum number of Muhammadan members in the Syndicate should be fixed and they should be elected by the Senate. It should not be less than one third of the total number of members.
 - (v) On the other bodies at least one third should be Muhammadans.
 - (vi) The Assistant Director of Public Instruction for Muhammadan Education should be an *ex officio* member of the Senate, the Syndicate and also of the board of accounts.
 - (vii) On the governing body of the affiliated colleges and schools the minimum number of Muhammadans should be one third.
 - (viii) Either the Vice Chancellor or the Comptroller or the University inspector should be a Muhammadan.
 - (ix) A sufficient number of Muhammadans should be paper setters and paper examiners.
 - (x) Roll numbers and not the name of the examinees should be written on the paper.
 - (b) (i) All the affiliated colleges and schools should make arrangements for teaching Arabic, Persian and Urdu.
 - (ii) Like Bengali, Urdu should be recognised as part of the university curriculum making it optional with Bengali.
 - (iii) Like Arabic, Persian and Sanskrit, Urdu and Bengali should be recognised as second languages.
 - (iv) Books objectionable to Muhammadans should not be used as text books.
 - (v) In the text-book committees of colleges and schools there should be a sufficient number of Muhammadans.
 - (c) All the affiliated colleges and schools should maintain hostels for Muhammadan students.
- The superintendent should be a Muhammadan from the teaching staff.
Facilities should be given for the observance of prayers and fasts.

APPENDIX I

The Calcutta University

Now that the Commission appointed by Government to enquire into the affairs of the Calcutta University has been sitting and so far as we understand inviting public opinion on various questions affecting higher education in the area within the jurisdiction of the University it is necessary that the Musalmans of Bengal who form 52 per cent of the total population in the presidency should come forward and point out to the Commissioners not only their special needs and requirements in regard to higher education but also their grievances against the University. What is responsible for the absolutely inadequate recognition of Muslim claims and Muslim interests on the part of the Calcutta University is the fact that the Musalman community is almost unrepresented on that body. Only 20 per cent of the members of the Senate are elected and 80 per cent. are appointed by Government. Both the electors and Government have so far failed to do justice to the Muslim community. The ostensible object of Government retaining the nomination system if it is not to keep the University under the complete control of Government is proper distribution of seats among all classes interested in or concerned with university education but it is a matter for regret that the interests of so important a community as that of Musalmans have so far met with scanty recognition at the hands of Government in the matter of their representation on the Calcutta University. We are deliberately of opinion that the nomination system should be done away with and the Senate should be entirely elective only a small number of seats may be reserved for certain educational officers who would be *ex officio* members. There must be due provision for the adequate and effective representation of the Muslim community both on the Senate and on the Syndicate. We shall now try to show why separate representation of Musalmans is necessary in an educational body like the University.

AHMED, TASTIMUDDIN, Khan Bahadur—*contd*

Those who know anything about the conduct and management of the Calcutta University will, we hope, be constrained to admit, unless they are interested in not admitting it, that the University has almost totally failed to minister to the needs and requirements and remove the grievances of the Muslim community. What is most regrettable is that this temple of learning has even occasionally failed to be equally impartial or to mete out equal treatment to Hindu and Muslim candidates appearing at the various examinations. We propose to enumerate here some of the difficulties which Musalman students and the Muslim community have now and then to labour under.

The bulk of Musalman students take up Persian or Arabic as their second language. These text-books are compiled and published by the University. Unfortunately, the publication of these text-books is almost always late, and sometimes it so happens that I A or B A students have to wait for months together, even for a year, before their course is published. The students concerned cry hoarse over the matter, but all petitions and prayers are unavailing. The text-book which the University prescribes for two years is thus to be read by them within a year or so. The hardship can be easily imagined.

It is a well-known fact that a number of schools and colleges affiliated to the University have no provision for the teaching of Persian or Arabic as a second language. The Musalman community often urged upon the University the desirability of inducing all such institutions to make provision for the teaching of those languages. The Bengal Provincial Muhammadan Educational Conference suggested that provision for the teaching of Arabic and Persian should be a condition precedent to the affiliation of all new institutions and, as regards the existing ones already affiliated to the University, they should be asked to make such provision, on pain of withdrawal of affiliation in case of failure. Unfortunately, this suggestion, though repeatedly made, has been paid no heed to and the result is that at many places Musalman students have reluctantly to take up Sanskrit in place of Arabic or Persian. Paucity of Musalman students can be no excuse now-a-days as in Eastern Bengal more than half the boys are Musalmans in all high schools and in Western Bengal, too, their number is not generally less than one-third in those schools. As regards colleges their number is everywhere sufficient and nowhere insignificant. So provision for the teaching of Arabic and Persian ought to be made everywhere. But the University cares very little for it. Moreover, even in institutions where there is provision it is so inadequate and the quality of education imparted is generally so bad that it often happens that Muhammadan students get plucked in a second language though they may have passed in all other subjects. No efforts are made by the University to induce the managers of those institutions to improve the quality of the education or make adequate provision for the same.

The vernacular of Musalmans of Bengal is Bengali. The exception is insignificant. Under the rules of the University the students have to answer a vernacular paper in all examinations up to the B A. Musalman students, whatever their second language may be—Arabic or Persian or any other thing—take Bengali as their vernacular and of course, they do so quite naturally. But, unfortunately, the text-books selected for the examinations are generally so Sanskritised that they are difficult for Muslim students and comparatively easy for Hindu students who take up Sanskrit as their second language. There are many Bengali books of the required standards—books from the pen of distinguished writers—which can be easily understood without knowing even a bit of Sanskrit and, if these be selected, there can be no complaint from any quarter. But, unfortunately, the University cannot be made to understand the difficulties of Muslim students.

Government grants are the main source of the income of the University and the 52 per cent. of the population of Bengal has, therefore, we hope, some claim on the funds of that body. While the University has built a palatial building for the accommodation of Hindu law students there is only an apology for a hostel for Muslim law students at a rented house in Mirzapur Street. True it is that the University collected funds from private individuals also for the law college hostel for Hindu students and the contributors were all Hindus, but what we regret to say is that the University did neither try to collect funds for a Muhammadan hostel, nor did it grant a substantial sum out of its own funds, as share of the Muslim community, for the building of a suitable hostel for Muslim law students. We are, however, glad that recently the University has opened a hostel

AHMED TASLIMUDDIN Khan Bahadur—*contd*

for Muslim college students not of course law students and we are thankful to it for this much even. It must however be mentioned in this connection that the construction of this hostel is more or less due to certain pressure which Government brought to bear upon the University.

Last year we pointed out several cases in which Musalman candidates failing to secure the minimum marks in certain papers for the B.A. examination were not of course declared successful while Hindu students getting less marks were declared to have passed the examination. We do not of course say that any candidate failing to secure the requisite number of marks should come out as successful but when Hindu candidates miserably failing are declared to have passed why should Muhammadan candidates securing better marks and deserving favourable consideration be shabbily treated? The attention of the University was drawn to specific acts of partiality last year the Muslim candidates in question moved heaven and earth to get their grievances redressed even the then Director of Public Instruction Bengal intervened in the case of a certain student but the Syndicate was inexorable. What was disclosed was a serious reflection on the very character of the University but even after the disclosures the University did not move an inch from the position it so wrongly took. In our next issue we shall quote some specific instances of partiality and reproduce some of the comments we made thereon last year and Dr Sadler the president of the Commission and his colleagues will then see what the University as at present constituted is capable of. The grievances of Musalmans will never be removed until and unless there be provision for adequate and effective representation of their community on the Senate and the Syndicate of the University.

APPENDIX II

Partiality in examinations

(a) The following is reproduced from the issue of the *Musalman* dated the 9th February 1917 —

What does it mean?

Culture and learning always commands respect and one naturally expects better justice fairness and impartiality from learned bodies like a university than from any other bodies or departments where passions and prejudices generally play a conspicuous part. A society of learned men is awe inspiring and is generally looked upon with reverence. Injustice or partiality is never expected to soil its holy precincts. A recent action of the Syndicate of the Calcutta University to which we all look up for the moral improvement of our people has startled us. Here are the mark sheets of two candidates one a Musalman and the other a Hindu who appeared at the B.A. examination in 1916 —

CALCUTTA UNIVERSITY

B.A. EXAMINATION—1916

Roll Cal No 59 Azharuddin Ahm d St Paul's College 7716

English		Vernacular Bengali		Philosophy		Economics		TOTAL	
Full marks	300	Full marks	100	Full marks	300	Full marks	300	Full marks	1000
Pass	100	Pass	33	Pass	100	Pass	100	Pass	330
	106		36		109		108		3

AHMED, TASLIMUDDIN, Khan Bahadur *contd.*

Roll, Cal No 1477, Nagendra Nath Roy, II, Ripon College, 2-12-16

English		Vernacular, Bengali		Philosophy		History		TOTAL	
Full marks	300	Full marks	100	Full marks	300	Full marks	300	Full marks	1,000
Pass	100	Pass	33	Pass	100	Pass	100	Pass	360
91+6+3R		33		100		126		359	

P. BRÜHL,
Registrar.

It will be seen that the Hindu candidate at first got 91 marks only in English, then 6 grace marks were given to him and, when that too could not secure him the bare pass marks, he was given 3 more marks on his paper being re-examined. The Musalman candidate got pass marks in all the subjects without being favoured with any grace marks. In English he got 6 marks over and above the requisite pass marks. In the aggregate the marks of both the candidates were, however, short by 1 and so both failed in the examination. But in the latter part of November last, that is, some six months after the results of the B A examination had been out, the Hindu candidate was gazetted to have passed the examination. Somehow or other the Muslim candidate came to know that the claim of the Hindu candidate was in no way superior to that of his and, accordingly, he moved the Syndicate to consider his case, when one who had failed so miserably in English was declared to have passed, but, unfortunately, to no effect. We for ourselves have not been able to understand the logic of the Syndicate if it is not undue favouritism to a candidate who may have been connected with some influential person. May we ask the Hon'ble Dr. Deva Prasad Sarbadhikary, the Hon'ble Justice Sir Asutosh Mookerjee, and Sir Gooroo Dass Bannerjee, who are at the helm of the affairs of the University, what all this means?

(b) The following is quoted from the issue of the *Musalman*, dated the 2nd March 1917 —

Calcutta University — B A examination scandal.

Our readers are aware of the scandalous conduct of the Calcutta University in overlooking the claim of a Muslim candidate at the last B A examination who secured pass marks—more than the pass marks—in all the subjects, and in favouring a Hindu candidate who lamentably failed in English. It will be remembered that the Hindu candidate was given 9 grace marks in English in two instalments and his total marks came up to 359. The Musalman candidate failed in no subject and no grace marks were given him and the total received by him too were 359. Thus, in the aggregate, the marks of both the candidates fell short by 1, the total minimum required being 360, and so both failed. As we have already stated in our issue of the 9th ultimo, six months after the results of the B A examination had been published, the Hindu candidate was gazetted to have passed the examination. The Muslim candidate then moved heaven and earth for the consideration of his claim, but to no effect. We are thankful to the *Englishman*, the *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, and the *Hatabadi* for condemning this conduct of the Calcutta University. Our contemporary the *Patrika*, however, takes exception to the case being treated as a Hindu-Muslim one. In the opinion of our contemporary the University is incapable of any racial bias, though our contemporary admits that the case under notice calls for a sifting enquiry. We reproduced the articles of the *Englishman* and the *Patrika* in our last issue and our readers must have read them. Nobody would have been more glad than ourselves if the *Patrika's* contention that the case is not a Hindu-Muslim one were correct. Here is another case. A Muslim candidate named Aftabuddin, Roll, Dac, No 257, got 92+6R=98 marks in English, 44 in Bengali, 112 in history, and 106 in economics. It is to be borne in mind that the pass

AHMED TASLIMUDDIN Khan Bahadur—contd

marks in these subjects are respectively 100 33 100 and 100. In the aggregate the candidate thus got 360 marks the minimum required. As in English his marks were short by 2 he was not successful in the examination. The Hindu candidate who at first got 91 marks in English and who failed in the aggregate even after being favoured with 9 grace marks could be declared successful in the examination but the Musalman candidate who at first got 92 marks in English and got 6 marks more on his paper being re-examined and who secured the requisite aggregate could not be successful. We would not call this a Hindu Muslim question as in that case our contemporary the *Amrita Bazar Patrika* would take exception to it but what we deplore is that in meting out even handed justice to all our University overlooks the claims of those who happen to be Musalmans and pays particular attention let us hope quite unwittingly to the claims of those who happen to be Hindus and unconsciously does even undue favour to them. His Excellency the Viceroy is the Chancellor of the Calcutta University. May we hope that His Excellency would be graciously pleased to put an end to the pranks of this University.

(c) The following is reproduced from the issue of the *Musalman* dated the 16th March 1917 —

Calcutta University scandal

In our previous issues we have shown how the Calcutta University showed undue favour to a Hindu candidate and did injustice to two Musalman candidates who sat for the B A examination in 1916. Here is a third case of gross injustice to a Muslim candidate. One Shaikh Azizur Rahaman Roll Cau No 31 of Gauhati Cotton College got 109 marks in English 40 in Bengali 111 in history and 99 in economic and thus 359 in the aggregate. It is to be remembered that the Hindu candidate to whom undue favour was shown at first got 91 marks only in English. He was given 9 grace marks and still his aggregate fell short by 1. In spite of that he was declared to have passed the examination six months after the results had been out. But this Muslim candidate got in economics only 1 mark less than the pass marks. If he was given 1 mark only in economics his aggregate too would not have fallen short by 1. But this 1 mark was denied to him. We do not say that this Muslim candidate as well as the two others whose cases we noticed before had any right to get grace marks and to have come out successful in the examination but what we say is that when the Hindu candidate in question who lamentably failed in English could be declared to have passed the examination why the Musalman candidates whose cases were immensely better and who had much superior claims were so shabbily treated. Some of our Hindu contemporaries would object to these cases being called Hindu Muslim ones and so we refrain from so doing. But is it not deplorable that the claims of candidates who happen to be Muslims should be so deliberately overlooked? Is there anybody who can call the University to account and put an end to such scandals?

APPENDIX III

*Grievances of Muhammadan students**To the Editor of the Musalman*

Sir—I have pointed out before that the Arabic and Persian teaching staff in colleges is not competent. However something is better than nothing. For there are colleges in which there is no provision for the teaching of Arabic and Persian. The Berhampur College is famous for its good teaching staff. But alas! Muhammadan students suffering is the same here as elsewhere. Perhaps the college authority will try to hush these sorry facts by saying. Where are students for whom to make provision? I must say there are hundreds of students who are compelled to take up other subjects as a second language owing to the various obstacles in the way of taking Arabic or Persian.

AHMED, TASLIMUDDIN, Khan Bahadur, *contd* — AHMED, Maulvi TASSADDUQ.

Under the existing systems considerable number of marks is allotted to translating into English of unseen Arabic and Persian passages. As for example, 50 marks are allotted in the B A examination. But how can the boys be expected to do this unless they read some books besides text-books? And students are ever ready to read such books. But who will supply them with those desired books? The University?—Never, for to hope so is to hope against hope. Year after year it is notified in the University Calendar that an Arabic grammar would be published by the University shortly. We do not know why the University was kind enough to notify this for years have passed and yet the invisible grammar has not been visible! However, let us think that perhaps the war is its cause and thus console ourselves. Outsiders may say that plenty of Arabic and Persian books may be had at cheap prices. Yes, they may be had, but considering the pressure of study in college life no student can afford to spend his valuable time in reading his clumsily printed books in confusing types. Confusing I say because these have confused our 'Tolba' class for many years. Now let some competent men of our community edit these books which will bring money and which will do a great service to the student community.

Now one vital question relating to the present academical year. All know that Arabic has been omitted from the matriculation text-books, i.e., up to the matriculation examination boys taking up Persian are no longer required to read Arabic along with it. But, as soon as they pass the matriculation examination and enter college, they have to jump like monkeys and reach the top of the tree of 'Arabic Knowledge' for they have to begin at once the celebrated Eastern romance, namely, *Arabian Nights*, and that in Arabic type without having vowel points (*Zer Zabar*). We do not know how these boys can be turned into monkeys. Let the University authorities answer the question.

Lastly, owing to the late beginning of the I A session this year, the University has kindly omitted some text-books. The other day we have seen a notice of the University which declares some portion of the Sanskrit text-book omitted. But as yet no notice is issued omitting any portion of Persian or Arabic text-books. Perhaps there was no Muhammadan member in the meeting of the Senate to raise any such question. Be as it may, but our concern is to know whether the University is going to do anything to this effect.

AHMED, Maulvi TASSADDUQ.

- (a) In the government of the University the Muhammadans have very little voice. Whether it be in the Senate, Syndicate, the different faculties or boards of studies, Muhammadans are not represented commensurate with their importance as a community. Even in the appointment of examiners and paper-setters Muhammadans have never got their due share. It is the fond hope of every educated Muhammadan that, now that the Commission is enquiring into all that pertains to the University, this sad neglect about Muhammadan interests in the government of the University will be remedied ere long.
- (b) With regard to the courses of study I have already suggested the inclusion of a study of the history and civilisation of Islam.
- (c) Under residential arrangements I would suggest that all colleges, Government, aided or unaided, should have adequate hostel accommodation for Muhammadan boys. For post-graduate students the University should build a hostel like the Hardinge Hostel.

It is the duty of the University to see that in all colleges where there are Muhammadan students sufficient provision is made for the teaching of Arabic, Persian, and Urdu.

Lastly, I would like to refer to the difficulties which Muhammadan boys encounter in the matter of admission to colleges. The growing demand of the community in this matter has not been fully met by the colleges of Bengal, and especially those in Calcutta. The necessity for a Muhammadan college in Calcutta has now been fully demonstrated.

ANSANUILLAH Khan Bahadur Maulvi

ANSANUILLAH, Khan Bahadur Maulvi

- (a) The administration of the Calcutta University is entrusted to the Senate a legislative assembly of a fairly large size and the Syndicate a smaller executive body. Besides these two bodies in which the government of the University is mainly vested there are faculties and boards of studies and accounts subordinate to them.

The following is a comparative statement of the members of different creeds composing the Senate the Syndicate and the subordinate boards —

Constitution of the Senate

Members	Europeans	Hindus	Muslims	Others	TOTAL
(1) Honorary fellows	-	1	2	3	33
(2) Honorary fellows nominated by the Vice-Chancellor	-	3	-	-	3
(3) <i>Ex-officio</i> fellows	8	1	1	-	10
(4) Nominated fellow	40	-	7	10	79
(5) Elected fellows	3	14	-	3	0
TOTAL	53	61	1	16	14

Muslims 10 per cent.

Constitution of the Syndicate.

	Europeans	Hindus	Muslims	Others	TOTAL
(1) <i>Ex-officio</i> members	1	1	-	-	2
(2) Elected members	4	6	-	5	15
TOTAL	6	7	-	5	17

Muslims 0 per cent.

Constitution of different faculties

Faculties	Europeans	Hindus	Muslims	Others	TOTAL
(1) Arts	30	3	6	3	63
(2) Science	7	14	-	4	25
(3) Law	4	1	4	3	12
(4) Medicine	8	6	-	2	16
(5) Law/Incrim	7	1	-	-	8
TOTAL	56	25	10	18	140

Muslims 7 per cent.

Constitution of boards of studies

Boards	Europeans	Hindus	Muslims	Others	TOTAL
(1) English	7	2	-	3	12
(2) Sanskrit	-	9	1	-	10
(3) Arabic and Persian	-	1	6	-	7
(4) History	4	6	1	1	12
(5) Philosophy	4	4	-	2	10
(6) Mathematics	1	7	-	1	9
(7) Geography	2	6	-	2	10
(8) Teaching	3	4	-	3	10
(9) Law	1	10	1	-	12
(10) Medicine	5	6	-	-	11
TOTAL	7	63	9	16	105

Muslims 8 per cent.

ANHSANULLAH, Khan Bahadur Maulvi—*contd*

A glance at the figures will show how poorly the Muslims are represented on the governing bodies of the Calcutta University. Muhammadan elements should be sufficiently increased in order that questions of principle may be decided in due regard to the needs and sentiments of the Muslim community. The Government of India have commented on the small part that has been assigned to Muslims and have indicated a desire that Muslims should have a much larger voice in the administration of a university. Unless special arrangements are made for greater representation of Muslims it is idle to expect any appreciable improvement in their educational prospects. The balance between Hindus and Muhammadans cannot be adjusted by nomination inasmuch as such nomination cannot, in justice, be demanded purely on a sectarian basis. In the governing bodies of the University provision should be made for special representation of Muslims in the proportion in which they are represented on the Provincial Legislative councils by a separate Muhammadan electorate formed on a broad franchise. Such an electorate may be composed of.—

- (i) The Muhammadan graduates of the Indian and European universities
- (ii) The Muhammadan members of the Provincial and Imperial Services (Educational, Executive, Judicial, Medical, &c)
- (iii) Muhammadan barristers
- (iv) Muhammadan sub-registrars
- (v) Muhammadan professors and lecturers
- (vi) Muhammadan head masters of high schools
- (vii) Muhammadan deputy inspectors of schools
- (viii) Muhammadan scholars of high oriental distinction

The creation of such an electorate will be fully in accordance with the principles regulating the constitution of other self-governing institutions. Considering the importance of the Muslim community I would suggest that at least a third of the members should be Muhammadans. Such a constitution will give the Muslims, who form 52 per cent. of the total population of Bengal, a reasonable share in the government of the Calcutta University.

If the educational advancement of the Muhammadan community is to be assured they should be duly represented on the various governing bodies of the University. To keep out one important section from participation in higher education will be a suicidal policy. It is a paramount duty of Government to range the various divisions of the vast population in one advancing line of even progress.

- (b) The interests of the Muhammadan community can but receive scanty consideration under the existing arrangement. Among the faculties science, medicine, and engineering go altogether unrepresented. Similar is the case with the boards of studies that represent English, Sanskrit, philosophy, mathematics, geography, teaching, and medicine.

Bengali, which is treated as a compulsory subject, has no board of its own. All questions connected with Bengali are decided by the Sanskrit board, which is represented by 11 Hindus and only 1 Muslim. This poverty of representation accounts for the numerous complaints to which reference has been made from time to time at the annual sessions of the Muhammadan Educational Conference. Books that are prescribed for the university examinations are found to contain stories and passages hurtful and repugnant to Muhammadan sentiments. There have been occasions when the educational authorities had to intervene and suggested the exclusion of certain texts from the prescribed courses. If the University has to educate all the sections of the community it ought to take into consideration the interests of at least such of them who play not altogether an insignificant part in the growth of scholastic life. It is high time that each of the faculties and boards should be reconstituted with due regard to the needs of the various communities from which students are drawn.

To aid in the promotion of oriental culture among the Muslims the creation of a separate Board of Islamic Studies appears to be indispensable. There is a strong feeling among the Muslims to modernise the madrasah courses and to combine with instruction in

ABSANULLAH Khan Bahadur Maulvi—*contd*—AIYER SIR P S SIVASWAMY—ALI The Hon ble Mr ALTAF

Islamic studies a thorough grounding in the English language. Such a course will more fully equip the Muslim for the battle of life and will go a long way to popularise higher education among the bigoted section who look askance at anything and everything which is unconnected with the tenets of Islam. This board will arrange for the conduct of the senior and junior madrasah examinations, prescribe courses of study for all classes of madrasahs and take up in addition the work that is now entrusted to the Arabic and Persian Boards of Studies. This board will also arrange for religious instruction and observances in connection with such institutions as can provide for them without offending the religious sentiments of the people of other creeds.

Books which contain words conveying ideas and sentiments peculiar to Muslims or such words as have not an exact equivalent in current Bengali will greatly appeal to Muhammadan students. Bengali literature is at present permeated mainly by Hindu ideas and does not interest Muhammadan boys. The Board of Islamic Studies will recommend books of a Muhammadan character as an alternative to other Bengali books more suited to Hindu tastes. Bengali is the vernacular of the bulk of Muhammadan students and it is only meet and proper that in prescribing text books the needs on such students should be more fully consulted.

- (c) It is admitted on all hands that students not living with parents or near relations should be called upon to reside in the school or college. Messes and unattached hostels are often hotbeds of evil. They are ill controlled and ill managed. Any laxity in the matter of residence defeats the very object of the University as it is mainly in residential schools and colleges that the full benefits of the scholastic life can be derived. The duties of teachers and students should extend to all aspects of the life of the student. At present there is lack of all that makes for a corporate life. The teachers should be required to come in more intimate relationship with the students. Hindu and Muhammadan boarders should as far as possible be accommodated in the same place, separate arrangements being made for cooking and other purposes. Combined hostels will be welcomed both from the scholastic and the economic point of view. They will greatly facilitate the growth of an intimate brotherhood among the students of different creeds and will permit of organised tutorial system. At present there is a large number of institutions which are without any Muhammadan hostels attached to them.

The governing bodies of schools and colleges in which the management of the hostel is vested should be reconstituted in due regard to the interests of the different communities. Few hostels have managing committees and fewer still have governing bodies of a representative character.

AIYER SIR P S SIVASWAMY

- (a) and (b) No such arrangements are necessary either in regard to the government of the University and the course of study or residential arrangements.
- (c) All that is necessary is that in making residential arrangements caste scruples must be respected in the matter of messing.

ALI The Hon'ble Mr ALTAF

- (a) (b) and (c) None. The University should make no distinction for any particular community, especially in view of the fact that the Dacca University scheme gives considerable advantages to the Muhammadan community.

ALI, SAIYAD MUHSIN—ALI, NAWAB NASIRUL MAMALEK, MIRZA SHUJAAT, Khan Bahadur
—ALLEN, Dr. H. N.—ALUM, Sahebzadah MAHOMED SULTAN.

ALI, SAIYAD MUHSIN.

- (a) Adequate representation of each community on the governing bodies of the University
- (b) Introduction of subjects interesting to each community
- (c) Providing of facilities for the observance of religious rites and for elementary religious education.

ALI, NAWAB NASIRUL MAMALEK, MIRZA SHUJAAT, Khan Bahadur.

- (a) and (b) There should be adequate and proportionate representation in the governing bodies of the University of the important communities in Bengal, as well as on the bodies which settle courses of studies and look after the needs of the student community. Muhammadans should be represented on these bodies according to their numerical strength in the population.

ALLEN, Dr. H. N.

- (a) As far as Bombay is concerned the University is, and should be, perfectly non-sectarian
- (b) In the hostels separate dining-rooms have to be provided for different castes.

ALUM, Sahebzadah MAHOMED SULTAN.

- (a) It is a well-known fact that the Musalmans are very much neglected, and especially is this the case in Bengal. By far the majority on the Senate is Hindus. The Hindus are also examiners, with very few exceptions, so, naturally, the interests of Musalmans suffer. I would submit to the members of the University Commission and to Government that something now ought to be done for Musalmans who are numerically more than Hindus. Now, as they have awakened, the path of their progress ought to be made smooth so that they may not be obstructed on account of the want of authorities or persons to remove any obstacles that may be in their path of progress. I would suggest, therefore, that one-third of the total number on the Senates should be Musalmans, one-third Hindus, and one-third Europeans. Out of a total number of 100 on the Senates fifteen members are to be elected by the graduates, of which I would suggest that five should be elected from Musalmans, five from Hindus, and five in the manner which the Commission thinks advisable. Amongst the *ex-officio* members I would suggest only the Chancellor, the Vice-Chancellor, the directors of public instruction, and the education member. No other officer or person should be *ex-officio* members.
- (b) In European schools scripture and catechism are taught so that students may know their God and what is good and bad or moral and immoral. They learn this from their infancy and their minds imbibe such ideas when their hearts are tender and impressionable. Unfortunately, however, nothing is being done in schools where Indian boys are taught. I will take the case of Musalmans. It is very essential that their minds, as well as the minds of Hindus, too, should be impressed with such education and, therefore, religious textbooks should be introduced in schools and colleges. Besides, in the history of the Muhammadans the history of their great men should be introduced.

ALUM Sahebzadaḥ MAHOMED SULTAN—*contd*—ARCHBOLD W A J—AZIZ Maulvi
ABDUL—BAKSH Khan Sahib Maulvi KADIR

A great many things and even Grecian and Roman history which are full of Hindu mythology are taught in Bengal and are of no interest to the Musalmans

If there be a sufficient number of Muhammadans on the Senate and Syndicate they will naturally see what is necessary for Muhammadan students. At present the members are so selected that they form too small a minority and their voices are not heard. To say nothing about election Musalmans are never elected and no notice is taken of them. The election of the Syndicate should be so arranged that Musalmans will be selected by Musalman Senators. Hindus by Hindus and so on. There ought to be a sufficient number of Musalman representatives on the boards of studies and other governing and advisory bodies of the University.

- (c) Wherever there are colleges, hostels and private lodgings should be erected for the separate residence of Muhammadan students and when the number is small a sufficient portion of the hostel or private lodgings should be set apart for Musalmans. At present many Musalman students are refused admission to colleges as well as to hostels for want of accommodation and therefore sufficient seats for Musalmans should be set apart in colleges as well as in hostels.

ARCHBOLD, W A J

There is great danger of weakening communities by giving them privileges altogether apart from questions of the justice or otherwise of such a course of action. But we must not let doctrinaire politics take us outside the limits of common sense. I do not believe in sectarian universities myself, but I see no objection to Hindu or Muhammadan colleges, though I do not advocate them, and I see the absolute necessity of arranging hostel life in India on a sectarian basis.

A717 Maulvi ABDUL

This is a crying need

- (a) The number of the members should be at least in proportion to the population of the different races and communities in the land both on the Syndicate and the Senate.
- (b) For Musalmans Arabic Persian Urdu history and those books which deal with faith, manners and customs. Books on Muhammadan philosophy, philology, history and science should be included in the course of studies.
- (c) These arrangements should be left to Musalmans, Hindus and Christians for their own pupils. The arrangements should be made by a committee of students under the guidance of their professors and teachers.

BAKSH Khan Sahib Maulvi KADIR

In Bengal the needs and interests of the Muhammadan community which constitutes the major portion of the population of the province but is yet backward in point of education should be specially considered as follows—

- (a) In the government of the University regarding the Senate, the Syndicate, the text book committee and other executive committees at least $\frac{1}{3}$ rd of the members should be Muhammadans.
- (b) In its courses of study to such an extent as would make subjects of Muhammadan interest play an adequate part in them.
- (c) In its residential and other arrangements to the extent of the growing needs and requirements of the Muhammadan community from time to time.

BANERJEA, J. R.—BANERJEA, Dr. PRAMATHANATH—BANERJEE, GAURANGANATH—
BANERJEE, Sir GOOROO DASS—BANERJEE, JAYGOPAL

BANERJEA, J. R.

- (a) As far as possible, in the government of the University, the needs and interests of particular communities should be considered. This would require the reconstitution of the Syndicate. Provision ought to be made for sufficient representation of teachers (European and Indian), and the representation of the Hindu, the Muhammadan, the Brahmo, and the Indian Christian communities. The Director of Public Instruction, Bengal, should always be on the Syndicate as representing Government and as being conversant with the needs and interests of the different communities.
- (b) In its courses of study the needs of different communities have been already considered. Thus, Hebrew has been recognised as a language which a student may take up. This is in the interest of the Jews.
- (c) There ought to be separate hostels for Hindus and Muhammadans and for other communities if it is found that their members cannot live with Hindus or Muhammadans. As regards other arrangements to promote *esprit de corps* no separate provision should be made.

BANERJEA, Dr. PRAMATHANATH.

- (a) I am opposed to the principle of separate representation in the government of the University.
- (b) While the courses of study should, in the main, be the same for all, they may, in respect of some subjects, be adjusted to the needs of particular communities.
- (c) Separate residential arrangements may be made for different communities, if and when necessary.

BANERJEE, GAURANGANATH.

- (a) In the government of the University the needs and interests of particular communities should not be specially considered, otherwise, disastrous results would speedily ensue.
- (b) In the particular courses of study, however, the interests of the particular communities may be adequately considered and safeguarded.
- (c) I strongly advise, for the sake of harmonious relations, that there ought to be separate residential and messing arrangements for different communities.

BANERJEE, Sir GOOROO DASS.

Excepting matters relating to denominational religious instruction and residential arrangements no other matters occur to me in which the needs and interests of particular communities require to be specially considered. Within the sacred precincts of the temple of learning all votaries should receive equal treatment and none should claim any special favour.

B
BANERJEE, JAYGOPAL

- (a) Muhammadans, Indian Christians, Parsees, and Marwaris, representing minorities, should be given a voice in the government of the University by means of adequate representation.

- (b) It is not desirable to allow the courses of study to be differentiated except in regard to theology which should include all schools of thought but never be *sectarianised* and culture history and the history of the civilisation of different races and communities
- (c) Residential arrangements cannot be allowed to be divided into water tight compartments tending towards disruption of a common corporate university life. On the contrary the students as such should be encouraged to *feel intensely and realise deeply* that they have a common ideal and must live a communal life as the future citizens of one and the same Empire and useful members of one nation all minor differences notwithstanding. Sectarian prejudices are daily dying out under the liberalising influence of a catholic western culture and the University should be the last body to lend however indirectly its helping hand towards the perpetuation of what is so prejudicial to a fuller life

BANERJEE RAI KUMUDINI KANTA, Bahadur

- (a) and (b) Nothing special need be done regarding the government of the University and courses of study
- (c) Residential arrangements for Muhammadan and backward Hindu classes should be provided

BANERJEE M N

The less we hear of communal interests in the University the better. The University is the only place where all races, creeds, and nationalities meet on common ground. I do not think separate universities for Hindus and Muhammadans are movements in the right direction. Separate chairs for Arabic and Sanskrit and for Hindu and Muhammadan philosophy or religion would have met the requirements. The needs and interests of particular communities should only be specially considered in the residential arrangements.

BANERJEE MURALY DHAR

The needs and interests of the Hindu and Muhammadan communities should be specially considered —

- (a) By having representatives of each community on the Senate
- (b) By the creation of degrees in Brahmanic and Islamic studies
- (c) By providing separate hostels for Hindu and Muhammadan students and also separate religious instruction if desired by the guardians

BANERJEE SASI SEKHAR

- (a) The University being the centre of learning should be free from party considerations. There should not be any party government or communal representation in the University but on its government only the best and capable men should be enlisted without any reference to his nationality so long as they will be able to serve the best interests of Government of colleges and of learning
- (b) The claims of the different classical and vernacular languages have been recognised by the Calcutta University and so far as the former is concerned provision for the highest training also exists. A university which does not represent a particular class should not aim at more than what the Calcutta University has done in this

BANERJEE, SASI SEKHAR—*contd*—BANERJEE, UPENDRA NATH—BANERJI The Hon'ble Justice Sir PRAMADA CHARAN—BARDALOI N. C.—BASU, P

respect To me it appears that in prescribing courses of study a non communal university should follow the line of the Calcutta University

- (c) In the residential and other arrangements the needs and interests of particular communities should be considered. Encouragement may be given to the backward classes by making special grants for scholarships and special arrangements for hostels and messes

BANERJEE, UPENDRA NATH.

Especial attention to be paid to the study of subjects connected with England, India, Japan, Australia, the United States, and similar other advanced and important countries of the world and the examiners should do their best to select questions from subjects having especial relation to these countries

BANERJI, The Hon'ble Justice Sir PRAMADA CHARAN.

I would not make any communal difference in university matters except as to residence in separate hostels for each community

BARDALOI, N. C

- (a) The needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered regarding the control and management of the University There should be enough non official members representing different communities and people For example, there should have been now enough non official representatives from Assam to safeguard her interests on the Senate as well as on the Syndicate The Muhammadan community is also very poorly represented there This state of things should never occur in the University It brings on a distrust in the minds of the people so neglected, which is really prejudicial to the best interests of the country
- (b) No
- (c) Yes

BASU, P

As a general principle I consider special representation of any community as highly mischievous In university matters this is more so But as the needs of different communities differ much with regard to certain aspects of university life to that extent specially competent persons for that purpose should be asked to give advice

- (a) In the government of the University there can scarcely arise any question which requires special knowledge of any community or which affects the needs and interests of any one more than those of any other The University deals with matters which are common to all young men who are students thereof Their capacity, efficiency, and method of work are tested and supervised by the University In purely administrative matters also efficiency, justice, etc, guide the university authorities And this should be so rather than the sectional interest of any community in the pursuit of imaginary needs peculiar to itself in matters pertaining to the government of the University
- (b) Similarly, courses of study should always be determined by the needs of the students of a particular age who have attained a particular training by passing some examination or other test of the University The University does not attempt, nor

BASU P—*contd*—BASU SATYENDRA NATH—Bengal Landholders Association Calcutta
—Bethune College Calcutta—BHADURI JYOTIBHUSHAN DEY B B and DUTTA
BIDHU BHUSAN

has ever been alleged to attempt to put in religious instruction or anything else which may prejudicially affect any community more than the general body of students. In such cases to bring in special consideration of the peculiar needs and interests of any community would mean either an attempt to lower the standard of the course of study for students belonging to that community or a deliberate fostering of struggles between communities by creating special facilities for putting forth objections where none are put forth under the existing system. The absurdity of the system may be realised by imagining such considerations in favour of the low class labour population of London in that university where perhaps they will attempt to bring in cockney English as part of the syllabus instead of the chaste literature that forms a part now.

- (c) In residential and other arrangements affecting the social or domestic matters of the student it can be allowed with far greater reason on its behalf that such considerations should be brought in. In such matters it seems that special bodies consisting of members of each community should be formed each in charge of students belonging to the same community. They will organise and do the supervision work whereas co-ordination of rules etc. may be entrusted to a body superior to them all in which each will be represented along with other representatives of the University. If this system be introduced the students would experience little change from the homes from where they come to centres of education where they are now compelled more or less to shift for themselves in an alien surrounding.

BASU SATYENDRA NATH

- (a) The government of the University should not be placed on a sectarian basis.
(b) For the interests of particular communities special subjects of study may however be prescribed.
(c) Special residential arrangements may be allowed.

Bengal Landholders Association, Calcutta

- (b) and (c) The association is decidedly against the introduction of the communal question in matters of university government and university education. No doubt in primary and partly even in secondary education the needs and requirements of classes and communities may have to be taken into special consideration but the University must be a broad and open republic where students will meet on one common ground of equality as inquirers after truth and where government will have to be directed not with reference to this community or that but only with one object in view—viz the promotion of the best interests of learning.

Bethune College Calcutta

Roy D N

- (a) There should be no representation of different communities.
(b) and (c) The needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered.

BHADURI JYOTIBHUSHAN, DEY B B and DUTTA, BIDHU BHUSAN

- (a) The aim of the University is Advancement of Learning. All sectarian differences should be merged as far as possible in the common object of fostering

BRADURI, JYOTIRMUSHAN, DIX, B. B., and DUTTA, BIDHU BHUSAN—*contd.*—BHANDARKAR, D. R.—BHANDARKAR, SIR R. G.—BHATTACHARYYA, HARIDAS—BHATTACHARYYA, Mahamahopadhyaya KALIPRASANNA

the growth of "a corporate university life". The lesson of English education is fusing the diverse Indian races into a homogeneous whole. In order to attain this ideal in the near future our petty differences should not be accentuated.

- (b) For students following different religions and speaking different languages the University allows option as regards translation and the second language. This safeguard is quite sufficient.
- (c) Religious neutrality is the accepted policy of Government. Hence, students, if they so desire, may have separate boarding arrangements. But teachers being men of culture may, and should, rise superior to prejudice and, hence, ought to live near each other, if the ideal of a residential university is attainable.

BHANDARKAR, D. R.

- (a) and (b) The needs and interests of particular communities should not be allowed to weigh with us.
- (c) Separate messing arrangements should be made only where they are required.

BHANDARKAR, SIR R. G.

- (a) and (b) I do not think that the centrifugal forces, which are so powerful in Hindu society, notwithstanding our contact with western civilisation for nearly two hundred years, should be further strengthened by the University and, therefore, the needs and interests of particular communities should not be taken into consideration in the government of the University and its courses of study. These should be arranged to meet the needs and interests of Indians, and Indians only.
- (c) I have already stated in my answer to question 19 that the members of different communities should be allowed to have their own independent messes. If any community insists on having separate blocks of dormitories for its students it should get these constructed at its own expense.

BHATTACHARYYA, HARIDAS.

- (a) The following communities ought to be represented by a system of election—
 - (i) The mercantile community—European and Indian
 - (ii) The landowning community
 - (iii) The mill-owners
 - (iv) The Muhammadans
 - (v) The teachers

The system of election may be the same as that adopted by the Provincial Legislative Council. The post-graduate councils in arts and science ought to have two representatives each. The Calcutta Corporation should also be represented.

- (b) The courses of study should be uniform for all, except for women. There should be no system of communal education.
- (c) But separate residential arrangements may be made for Muhammadans, well-to-do classes, and women, and tutorial assistance of the nature indicated in reply to question 19 may be given.

BHATTACHARYYA, Mahamahopadhyaya KALIPRASANNA

- No special consideration should be made for the interests of a particular community.
- (c) Of course, separate hostels should be established for Muhammadans.

BHOWAL GOVINDA CHANDRA—BISWAS SARATLAL—BOROOAH JNANADABHIRAM—BOSE
Rai CHUNILAL Bahadur—BOSE G C—BOSE Miss MRINALINI

BHOWAL GOVINDA CHANDRA

- (a) Needs and interests of particular communities should not be considered
- (b) They should not be considered
- (c) They may be considered

BISWAS SARATLAL

- (a) The government of the University as well as its teaching departments should be composed as far as possible of Indians and preference should always be given to the people of Bengal.
- (b) No special consideration should be paid to any particular community but the courses of study should not contain anything objectionable to any sect
- (c) As regards arrangements for the boarding and lodging of students such interests (e.g. customs) should be observed as far as practicable

BOROOAH JNANADABHIRAM

- (a) There should be an adequate number of each community proportionate to its *educated members*
- (b) In the courses of study religion should not be a bar to one's taking up any subject he likes. For instance a Muhammadan ought to be able to aspire to getting a title of Pandit on Hindu Theology and a Hindu may be given a title if he is competent enough in accordance with Muhammadan usages. Non Muhammadans have written books on Muhammadan law
- (c) In residential arrangements caste and religion and interests of communities will have to be considered. In a hostel for instance there should be arrangements for Christians Muhammadans Hindus the hill tribes etc. in the same way to live according to their own views of life. This is necessary in India—but a member of the hill tribes for instance should not be refused admission simply because there is no accommodation according to his ways and modes of life. Accommodation should be ready in each case

BOSE, Rai CHUNILAL, Bahadur

In view of the fact that the Indian student community is of great diversity in respect of creeds and castes it is necessary to a certain extent that the needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered particularly in regard to their residential arrangements

BOSE G C

The needs and interests of particular communities are being taken into special consideration.

BOSE Miss MRINALINI

All communities should be treated alike.

CHAKI, Rai Sahib NRITYA GOPAL—CHAKRAVARTI, BRATAJAL—CHATTERJEE, The Hon'ble Mr A C—CHATTERJEE, Rai Bahadur SARAT CHANDRA—CHATTERJEE, SATIS CHANDRA—CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Justice Sir ASUTOSH

CHAKI, Rai Sahib NRITYA GOPAL.

- (a) There should be separate electorates for Muhammadans and for Pandits from recognised *toles* to elect members of the Senate
- (b) For Muhammadans Urdu or Persian should be one of the compulsory subjects in secondary schools
Special facilities should be given to students who prosecute their studies only in oriental languages There should be regular examination in those subjects. University degrees should be conferred on them.
- (c) For depressed classes, or for those belonging to the lower classes in Hindu society, separate arrangements ought to be made for their residence

CHAKRAVARTI, BRATAJAL

- (a) The University ought to take up general questions only, and ought not to enter into any particular matter of any community
- (b) and (c) Special courses of study and residential arrangements should be left to be provided by the denominational colleges without any interference on the part of the University

CHATTERJEE, The Hon'ble Mr A C

- (a) None
- (b) None
- (c) Yes, so far as absolutely necessary

CHATTERJEE, Rai Bahadur SARAT CHANDRA.

- (a) None
- (b) None
- (c) Yes, special arrangements according to local conditions may be made

CHATTERJEE, SATIS CHANDRA

The needs and interests of particular communities should be considered not so much in the courses of study, as in the government of the University and in its residential arrangements Representatives from all the great communities of the province should act as constituent members of the Senate, and there should be different residential arrangements for the members of such communities as differ widely from one another in respect of the mode of their practical life

CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Justice Sir ASUTOSH

There is a strong body of opinion against sectional educational institutions, but I favour the idea There is no harm in founding institutions to meet the special requirements of particular classes, with separate residential or hostel arrangements, but I think separate colleges should meet such wants I am not in favour of calling such colleges universities They should be included in the republic of learning I have mentioned

CHAUDHURI BHUBAN MOHAN—CHAUDHURI The Hon ble Babu KISHORI MOHAN—
CHAUDHURY The Hon ble Babu BROJENDRA KISHORE ROY—CHAUDHURY The
Hon ble Nawab SYED NAWABALY Khan Bahadur

CHAUDHURI BHUBAN MOHAN

- (a) All communities should be associated with the government of the University
- (b) The courses of study should be suited to all communities
- (c) The cases of all communities should be taken into consideration in residential and other arrangements

CHAUDHURI The Hon ble Babu KISHORI MOHAN

- (b) As regards courses of study there appears to be no necessity for any differential treatment except in the study of religion. Separate chairs may be created for this purpose to such an extent as may be found necessary.
- (c) The interests of particular communities should be looked after by the University in its residential arrangements by the provision of separate residences.

CHAUDHURY The Hon ble Babu BROJENDRA KISHORE ROY

- (a) With the transfer of the government of the University and of the boarding houses and hostels practically to the people the University ought to be in a position to encourage the denominational religious education for the students of the Hindu Muhammadan and other communities in separate classes and to encourage if not to enforce in their boarding houses and homes religious practices and observance of the traditional scruples of the communities in respect of food and clothing and social manners and modes of living etc.
- (b) Systematic study of the Hindu scriptures—except the Vedas Hindu mythology—the Puranas and Itihasas and of Hindu philosophy and Dharmasastras by Hindu students ought to be encouraged in the higher studies and the same advantages ought to be given to Muhammadan students also.
The study of the Vedas ought to be entirely excluded for various reasons from the course of study in our colleges except where possible in case of Brahmin boys in separate classes and under conditions favourable for the study thereof according to orthodox methods.
- (c) Hindu and Muhammadan students ought to be placed in separate hostels built in entirely separate compounds with entirely separate arrangements regarding religious education.

CHAUDHURY, The Hon'ble Nawab SYED NAWABALY Khan Bahadur

In answer to this question I would specially draw attention to the needs and interests of the Muslim community which for reasons into which I need not go is relegated to the background in the Calcutta University. I would merely offer a few suggestions with a view to securing for them their proper share in the organisation of the University.

- (a) *Senate*—Either through election or through election and nomination two fifths of the Senate should be composed of Europeans most of which should be from amongst those engaged in the teaching profession the remaining number of seats to be divided equally between Hindus and Muhammadans the principle underlying the arrangement being that the European element would keep the balance between the respective interests of the two communities due regard being paid to the academic character of the University. I make the suggestion especially in view of the continued hardship to which the community has been subjected by those who have been guiding the destiny of the Calcutta University.

CHAUDHURY, The Hon'ble Nawab SYD NAWABALI, Khan Bahadur—*contd*

Syndicate—The seats on the Syndicate should be divided in the same proportion between the three communities, as in the Senate, the three sections being partly nominated and partly elected by the members of the respective communities in the Senate, the same proportion to be maintained in regard to the board of accounts, library, general committee, transfer committee, and the students' residence committee. I may here add that, as circumstances stand, I am not in favour of an entirely elective principle to be applied to the formation of the Senate and Syndicate, for, as it sometimes happens, men experienced in the art of canvassing are returned in preference to men of real worth, though I cannot pass without also observing that the privilege of nomination, too, has not always been exercised in the proper way

The office of the Vice-Chancellor should be filled by Europeans, Hindus, and Muhammadans, in rotation, likewise the office of the Comptroller

One-half of the ministerial and higher appointments should be reserved for Muhammadans

(b) *Bengali*—The suggestions which I have made in answer to question 12 in regard to this subject should be followed. Also the following which I transcribe from my note submitted to the Commission on the 13th November, 1917.—

- (i) There should be a separate board for Bengali literature, composed of an equal number of Hindus and Muhammadans, for selecting suitable Bengali text-books for all the University examinations
- (ii) Books in Bengali, suited to Muslim tastes, should be prescribed as alternative text-books
- (iii) When a question bearing on mythology is set in an examination paper there should be an alternative question of a general character

The standard of difficulty for the Arabic and Persian courses should be the same as that for Sanskrit. To show how the Arabic and Persian courses compare at present adversely with the Sanskrit course I shall, *exempli gratia*, take the texts prescribed for the Matriculation of 1917-18

The Arabic course includes selections from the *Koran*, the *Arabian Nights*, and the *History of Tiber*, and the Persian from the works of Sadi, Nasir Khosrao, Foruiddin Attar, Shaik Ali Hazin, and Amir Khosrao, whereas the course in Sanskrit includes selections from *Panchatantram*, *Hitopadesa*, *Punacuthanam*, and *Dhritarashtra Bilapa*. Those versed in these languages hold that, from the view of points of diction, style, and subject matter, the Arabic and Persian selections are decidedly of a more advanced type than are those in Sanskrit, and require in the students a developed critical faculty to be understood and fully appreciated by them. You have, in addition to this difference in quality, to take into consideration the difference in the quantity of matter the students have to study. There are in round numbers about 13,000 words in the Arabic course, 22,000 in the Persian and 10,000 in the Sanskrit course. This apart, it is to be borne in mind that Arabic and Persian are foreign languages to the Muhammadan student in Bengal. His mother-tongue is Bengali and, since in this language you have a large number of words derived from Sanskrit, the study of Sanskrit becomes much easier for him than that of Arabic or Persian. But the Muhammadan student prefers, on religious and other grounds, to take Arabic or Persian in the Matriculation and is, consequently, placed at a great disadvantage as compared with a Hindu student who invariably takes Sanskrit for his second language. He has to spend greater time and energy in understanding his subject than a Hindu student and, as a consequence, is obliged to pay a less amount of attention to his other subjects.

This is one of the chief causes why Muhammadans have fared so badly in secondary and higher education. I would, therefore, strongly urge that the existing defect should, without further delay, be removed and the Muhammadans placed on an equal footing with students of other denominations.

The course in Persian should not comprise texts in Arabic for the I A and B A. It may be observed here that in other universities the two subjects are treated

CHAUDHURY The Hon ble Nawab SAID NAWABALY Khan Bahadur—*contd*

as separate Till very recently the Persian course in the Matriculation also was defective in this respect but after repeated requests by the Muhammadan Educational Conference this defect was removed without a simultaneous removal of it from the higher courses with the unfortunate result that the students in the I A and B A who have not had to deal with Arabic in the Matriculation have to learn it afresh in the college stage This unnatural amalgamation of the two subjects weighs heavily on Muhammadan students and ought to be given up at once I may here add that the Syndicate referred this matter some time back to the board of Arabic and Persian which was then presided over by an experienced orientalist Major Peart who after due consideration of all sides of the question submitted a very strong note to the Syndicate along with the unanimous recommendations of the board but the Syndicate did not think it worth while to take action in the matter

Urdu should be recognised as a second language in all stages It should be taught also in the middle forms preparatory to the study of Persian and Arabic in the higher forms of high schools

Texts in Indian history which are hurtful to the sentiments of the community should be excluded from text-books

Provision should be made for religious and moral instruction to students under the University

Provision should also be made for the teaching of Islamic history both in colleges as well as in the school department

(c) Every Government institution affiliated to the University should be required to have a Muhammadan hostel attached to it with separate accommodation to enable the Muhammadan students to offer their prayers Every other college where there is a hostel should be asked to set apart a wing of it at least for the use of Muhammadan students with a separate dining hall and a prayer room Every Muhammadan hostel should be placed under a committee composed of Muhammadans The superintendent should be a Muslim member of the staff of the institution to which the hostel is attached

Among other matters which may be discussed under this heading I may suggest that in all Government colleges 30 per cent of the total number of seats should be reserved for Muslim students seeking admission provided however that when these seats are not filled before a particular date every year they may be opened to students of other communities The University should insist on a similar provision being made in other colleges affiliated to the University Lastly I may add that there should be a separate section in the annual report of the University dealing with the progress of Muhammadan education in the different departments of the University

I may here observe that the recommendations which I have made in answer to this question are some of those which were adopted after an exhaustive consideration of the problem of Muslim education in Bengal by the committee which was appointed by the Government of Bengal under instructions from the Government of India in their letter No 585—595 dated Simla the 3rd April 1913 and I may add that so far as Government are concerned most of the recommendations contained therein have been almost given effect to in the Educational Department But the University to whom the report of the committee was also submitted has not thought fit to give effect to any of the suggestions and recommendations made therein I strongly commend the report of the committee to the earnest and sympathetic consideration of the Commission

The above suggestions are made with reference to the existing conditions but the principles underlying them should be borne in mind when the University is to be remodelled on different lines

CHOUDHURY, RAI YATINDRA NATH—CROHAN, Rev Father F.—CULLIS, Dr. C. E—
CUNNINGHAM, The Hon'ble Mr J. R—DE, HAR MOHUN.

CHOUDHURY, RAI YATINDRA NATH

I would oppose any communal representation in the governing body of the University and, for the matter of that, in all local bodies. What is wanted is good men, and not men selected in a haphazard way from any community because they belong to it. However, it is desirable that in the oriental side of our University, and in the side which would control Indian history and antiquity, we should have a certain percentage of men from the different communities to enable adequate consideration being given to their respective needs and interests.

CROHAN, Rev Father F

The needs of the Anglo Indian community should be studied, and their higher education more powerfully encouraged. As it is, the university courses do not fit in with their secondary education. The I A and I Sc courses overlap with those of the Senior Cambridge, and the new course of study proposed by Cambridge for the last school class will even overlap the syllabus of the B A or the B Sc. This is a cause of much disappointment to many.

CULLIS, Dr C E

I consider that these questions would be best dealt with by the University itself, so long as provision is made in it for the due representation of all communities.

CUNNINGHAM, The Hon'ble Mr J R

(a) For the purposes of this question I incline to consider the whole community as divided into three main classes —

- (i) The Hindu *bhadralog* and the clean Sudra castes
- (ii) The Muhammadans
- (iii) Others

Classes (ii) and (iii) should, I think, be adequately represented on the government of the University

(b) I do not advocate the institution of special courses of study for special communities further than this is done at present, the aim being rather the reconciliation, than the emphasis, of differences

(c) In the matter of residential arrangements it is still desirable to provide separate hostels for Muhammadans. So far as the backward Hindu castes are concerned, however, all that is necessary is to allow for separate messing arrangements—kitchens, dining-rooms, etc. Many of the backward castes, however, are shy of intruding in the general Hindu hostels. As a temporary measure reservations may be made for them in large systems. This may be followed by allowing groups to occupy rooms for three or four students in the general system until diffidence and prejudice pass away and students from the other border of the Hindu system can be placed without disadvantage in a hostel wherever room can be found for them. The question is less important in Calcutta than in the mofussil.

DE, HAR MOHUN

- (a) and (b) In the University there ought to be no special consideration for any particular community
- (c) Must be modified

DE SATISCHANDRA—DEY BARODA PROSAUD—DEY N N —D SOUZA P G —
DUNN S G

DE SATISCHANDRA

The needs and interests of the depressed or backward classes and poor middle classes should be considered always when there is any proposal for raising fees (tuition and examination) and boarding charges and for concentrating high education only in Calcutta where living is dear

DEY BARODA PROSAUD

Particular communities coming to the front should have —

- (a) Proper representation in the government of the University
- (b) *Their vernaculars and special laws finding places in the courses of study*
- (c) Separate residential and other necessary arrangements

DEY N N

- (a) In the Senate the needs of the particular communities may be safeguarded by Government nominating some of them Further the particular communities are bound to come from the different electorates mentioned in answer to question 5
- (b) The languages of these communities ought to find a place in the courses of study
- (c) Separate residential arrangements have been found to be necessary for particular communities

D SOUZA P G

- (a) Communal considerations seem out of place in the government of a university and in the courses of study
- (c) For a long time to come separate kitchens will have to be provided for the different caste

DUNN S G

The needs of particular communities should be met by the establishment of special universities such as the Hindu University at Benares or the proposed University of Islam at Aligarh these universities should be financed and in every way controlled by the communities which demand their establishment public funds should not be used for them at all

- (a) Apart from these communal or sectarian universities the needs and interests of particular communities should not be specially considered in the government or academic organisation of the universities a university in which such needs and interests are considered is a contradiction in terms
- (b) The courses should be framed solely with a view to securing the best possible education
- (c) But in the residential arrangements there is ample opportunity for the communal spirit special communities may and should erect their own hostels and residential colleges provide their own tutors and wardens to look after the intellectual social and religious interests of their members and offer scholarship bursaries etc for their poorer classes

All lecturing teaching and examining apart from special tutorial work done in colleges and hostels will be directly organised by the university staff and from this all communal or sectarian spirit should be strictly excluded sound learning and efficient teaching should be the sole considerations in the appointment to university posts any other aim is entirely outside the range of a university policy

DUNNICLIFF, HORACE B.—DUTT, REBATI RAMAN—DUTTA, PROMODE CHANDRA

DUNNICLIFF, HORACE B.

I consider that science teaching should be entirely non-sectarian. The best men in a given subject should be appointed or elected to control the affairs of that subject. Appointment to University committees should not be made because the candidate's father rendered good service to Government or because he is of a particular religious persuasion, but because he himself is the best man to express helpful opinions on the matters considered by those committees.

I have had experience in two of the most prominent sectarian institutions in the East (the M. A. O. College, Aligarh—5½ years and the Khalsa College, Amritsar—3½ years) and I cannot call to mind a Hindu-Muhammadan or Hindu-Muhammadan-Sikh question arising. In fact, I have been struck on many occasions by the extraordinary harmony which prevails when the students work, play or have feasts together. They seem instinctively to avoid offending each other's religious points of view. Other things being equal, I should advocate a Muhammadan staff for Aligarh and a Sikh staff for the Khalsa College but, if a suitable man were not available I should recommend the appointment of a suitable man of any creed to fill the post. I have seen Hindu professors at Aligarh and non-Sikh professors at Amritsar and am not aware of any prejudice or bias existing on the staff against the appointment of these men whose efficiency was recognised by their colleagues.

DUTT, REBATI RAMAN.

- (a) In the general management of the University there is no need for sectarian representation. True education needs no colour, a Hindu or a Muhammadan will do as well, Father Lafont, or a Shams-ul-ulama Mahmud, or a Mahamahopadhyaya Rama Chandra, would do as well. He will prescribe the same course of studies for all, and pass all the students at the same standard. Only on special boards, *e.g.*, theology, Sanskrit education, Muhammadan education, let the particular denominations predominate. On the other boards under the University let the best men of the particular branch be brought in, and few of the best men of a particular community may be encouraged to join, with some slight considerations in their favour. But the Senate of the University should always consist of the best brains of the country, the best men of the individual boards.
- (c) Let all the students of any community join the school or college as they like, and it is prejudicial to the healthy development of a boy's mental attitude, fraternity, and imperial citizenship to keep reserved compartments for a particular community to the exclusion of another or to keep reserved schools or colleges for any special community. But, certainly, special hostel arrangements have to be made.

DUTTA, PROMODE CHANDRA.

- (a) and (b) None
- (c) Arrangements should be made in every college for the messing of such students as are not allowed by the custom to dine in a general hall. There might be general messes and hostels in every college in which there should be no restriction of caste or religion and where Hindus, Muslims, Jains, Sikhs, Brahmans, and Namasudras might live together. Such hostels should be created only if there be definite demand for them, and not otherwise.

GEDDES PATRICK—GHOSH Dr B N—GHOSH BIMAL CHANDRA—GHOSH DEVAPRASAD
—GHOSH Rai HARI NATH Bahadur

GEDDES, PATRICK

Here I need not say that as a university senator I should wish to deal with distinctive communities as I do in practice as a town planner viz enquire into their requirements, their ideas their ideals and endeavour to adjust these with those which to my more modern outlook may seem indispensable But not with the conviction that mine are to predominate with impartial indifference to theirs as sometimes seems to be the attitude of western and western educated minds and this within the present generation especially with its too frequent loss of the cultural sympathies and appreciations so frequent in the past generation and lack of the anthropological understanding and sociological interpretations of the opening one

GHOSH Dr B N

- (a) Certainly every community should be properly represented in the control of the University
- (b) The course ought to be of the same standard in every case
- (c) There ought to be separate residential arrangements for all communities but in all cases they ought to get the same advantage

GHOSH BIMAL CHANDRA

Now that the principle of communal electorates has been accepted in the country it would be wise to consider the needs and interests of even small communities in the province as far as practicable On this principle also the question of more universities acquires a greater importance A beginning should be made in the way of recognition of interests and needs by the institution of scholarships and residential arrangements for students from particular communities and admitting their representation in the Senate as far as practicable When the vernacular of the community is other than Bengali such vernacular should be recognised (I believe this is already done by the University) And graduates from such communities should be urged and encouraged to carry on independent investigations in matters and subjects of interest to such communities

GHOSH DEVAPRASAD

- (a) There should be no communal representation on the administrative body of the University
- (b) But in view of the fact that there are different communities representing different traditions and cultures at present in Bengal in framing the courses of study their special requirements ought to be taken into account
- (c) The same thing is also applicable to residential arrangements i.e. different messes and hostels should be arranged for the different leading communities

GHOSH Rai HARI NATH Bahadur

- (c) In matters of residential arrangement separate provision has to be made for Hindus and Muhammadans for the present

GHOSH, JNANCHANDRA—GILCHRIST, R. N.—GOSWAMI, BHAGABAT KUMAR, Sastri—
GOSWAMI, Rai Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN—HALDAR, Dr HIRALAL

GHOSH, JNANCHANDRA.

I don't think communal distinction is desirable —

- (a) in the government of the university, or
- (b) in its courses of study
- (c) Residential and other arrangements should be made according to the needs and interests of particular communities

GILCHRIST, R. N.

I have very little to say on this question, but I wish to point out that the desires of communities would be best met by a decentralisation such as I suggest, viz, the concentration on one divisional college. It is impossible to secure the fair representation of sectarian interests in a centralised University like Calcutta. On general principles I object to the representation of interests of this kind, as such, in a university. The present Government policy regarding Muslims is an example in point. In the Education Department the favouring of sections means the acceptance of lower qualifications than competition in the open market would give. Political reasons, however, may demand such a procedure, and they will demand separate representation. A glance at the many memorials on university representation from Muhammadans in Bengal will show how far the demands made are incapable of fulfilment simply because of a lack of qualified men.

By local universities, however, fair representation of sectional interests is far more possible. The Dacca University will provide for the Eastern Bengal Muhammadans, for example, and Chittagong for Buddhists. The development of these universities, too, will show how real the demands for representation are, i.e., the special studies, or courses for separate sections of the community, may, very reasonably, it may be expected, be endowed by those communities themselves.

I have already said (answer to question 14) that Government control is necessary to secure fairness to minorities of this type.

GOSWAMI, BHAGABAT KUMAR, Sastri.

- (a) and (b) As the education is secular the question of communal interests hardly arises
- (c) Such interests, however, must be considered in connection with residential and mess arrangements

GOSWAMI, Rai Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN.

- (a) In a university intellectual aristocracy should prevail. It should be governed by intelligent and learned men of high abilities to whatsoever community they may belong. There should be no consideration for caste and creed, no special consideration or concession for particular communities.
- (c) But special consideration is necessary for residential and dining arrangements for particular communities, and care should also be taken to prescribe such courses of study as may not be obnoxious to the religious or moral persuasion of any particular community.

HALDAR, Dr HIRALAL.

In the government of the university and in its courses of study it would be ridiculous to consider the needs and interests of particular communities, though in its residential and other arrangements this must necessarily be done. Educational standards should be fixed on academical grounds alone.

HALDAR UMES CHANDRA—HAQ Khan Sahib Maulvi Kazi ZAHIRAL—HARLEY A H—
HAZRA JOGENDRA NATH

HAJIDAR UMES CHANDRA

The needs and interests of the depressed or backward classes and for poor middle classes should be considered especially when there is any proposal for raising fees

- (a) There should be some members on the governing body of the University specially nominated from the backward classes if they be sufficiently qualified
- (c) Having regard to caste prejudices students of the depressed or backward communities should be allowed to live in the hostels but separate servants and dining rooms should be provided for them

HAQ Khan Sahib Maulvi Kazi ZAHIRAL

- (a) (b) and (c) In all these three points the interests of Hindus and Musalmans should receive equal consideration

HARLEY A H

- a) It is desirable in view of the number of Muhammadans in this province and the increasing proportion of graduates among them that at least one third of the total number of the members of the Senate should be from this section of the community. Of the total number of one hundred senators fifteen should be elected by the registered graduates and of these fifteen five should be Muhammadans. For the remaining members of Senate the principle of nominating one third from the Muhammadan one third from the Hindu and one third from the European community should be recognised. There should be no *ex officio* fellows except the Rector Chancellor Vice Chancellor Member for Education and directors of public instruction. Professors should be among the nominated members
- (b) It is a universal complaint among Muhammadans that religious instruction has not been a recognised part of the curriculum and many orientalists have been of opinion that educational systems in this land should have been based on the religious courses in the existing institutions. The University cannot give satisfaction to the Muhammadan public until it makes sufficient provision in its courses of moral and religious text books which will in some measure compensate for the lack of Scripture lesson and Catechism in the school course. I consider that this need cannot be met until there is a strong representation of Muhammadans on the Senate the text book committee and the boards of study because the mere acceptance of the principle is not enough it is necessary to have a group of men with definite views empowered as also required by the University to introduce books
- (c) As far as possible separate hostels for Musalmans and Hindus should be constructed and where this is not feasible owing to the small number of members of either community they should have separate accommodation in the same house with independent messing arrangements. Seats should be reserved for Muhammadan students in colleges and hostels according to the population of the division. Hostel accommodation should be provided for Muhammadan M A and law students

HAZRA JOGENDRA NATH

The particular communities whose interests and needs are to be considered are —

- (i) The Muhammadans.
- (ii) The aborigines
- (iii) The depressed classes.

HAZRA, JOGENDRA NATH—*contd* —HOLLAND, Rev W E S —HOSSAIN, WAHED

The Muhammadans and the depressed classes should have their representatives in sufficient numbers on the governing bodies of the University to look after their interests. There are up to now no aborigines sufficiently qualified for this purpose.

Students from these communities should be encouraged by special scholarships to prosecute their studies in the University, and special arrangements should be made for their residence even if these be expensive.

HOLLAND, Rev W E S

Students of all castes and religions can reside together in adjacent rooms. All that is needed is separate arrangements for food to the extent indicated in my reply to question 19. There is a grievous loss to the liberal influences of university education if the different Indian communities are segregated. Few things make more for an intelligent understanding, healthy, and united Indian life than the living together of India's castes and creeds in the same hostel.

HOSSAIN, WAHED.

There are one hundred fellows out of whom twenty are elected and eighty nominated by Government. But it is not clear on what principle the fellows are selected and nominated. Academic attainments do not seem to be the guiding principle, probably on the ground that ability to manage university affairs does not depend upon academic distinction. But this principle is hardly adhered to in nominating fellows from the Muslim community. However, in more cases than one, fellowship has been bestowed by way of compliment. Exercise of influence through some unknown channel seems to be another determining factor. In some cases, fellowship has been bestowed upon persons who are hardly interested in educational matters, or who seldom care for university affairs, but come only once a year to grace the university hall on the occasion of the convocation. Thus, the absence of a fixed principle has led to indiscrimination. If Government desire to bestow a favour upon an aspirant to distinction they may confer a title upon him, but the bestowal of a complimentary fellowship upon a person not possessing the requisite qualifications for a fellow, or the ability to conduct the affairs of a university, is a sacrifice of principle and abuse of powers vested in Government.

As to the election of fellows the method adopted is not free from objection. Apart from canvassing and wire-pulling, inducement and promises are held out to young and inexperienced graduates for obtaining their votes. Instances are not wanting to show that even a threat was held out to serve one's purpose. Superior influence and expectations raised in the mind of young men fresh from colleges sway the election. Some of our best men—more conscientious and having a sense of self-respect—have refrained from standing for election. A glance at the list of elected fellows and syndics will show how election has revolved in a groove. It will also disclose that none but men belonging to a particular community can hope for success under the present system of election.

The Indian universities are intended for all races and communities inhabiting India, and they preside over the higher education of the children of all classes and denominations. Among the Indian races the Hindu and the Muslim form an important section of the educated class as a whole. Naturally, the educated men who form these two communities are taking a keen interest in, and desire to associate themselves with, the affairs of the universities. But, as a matter of fact, the Muslim element has hardly been represented in the several bodies which preside over the destiny of the Indian universities. They are almost entirely in the hands of one community only. It appears that the Muhammadans have been excluded for the following reasons—

- (1) Constant whispering and misrepresentation by the vested interests regarding the paucity of competent Muslims have so much prejudiced the mind of the officials that they have turned a deaf ear to the repeated representations and complaints of the Muhammadan. In fact, a sort of belief has been created in their mind to the effect that Muhammadans, whatever qualifications they may

HOSSAIN WAHED—*contd*

positions and whatever position they may occupy are not fit to manage the affairs of the University. The effect of this belief is clearly discernible in the exercise of the large powers of nomination in the hands of Government. It can hardly be contended that Muslims are not fit to manage the affairs of the University although they are competent enough to be judges of the high court officiating chief justices, members of the executive councils—supreme and provincial—and occupy other high positions under Government.

- (ii) It is alleged that academic distinctions and high attainments should be the test for fellowship and not natural ability and competency. This test has hardly been applied to the election and nomination of non-Muslim fellows of the University. A look at the list of fellows will dispel the illusion. Moreover it is not at all correct to say that educated men with the requisite qualifications are not to be found among Muslims. We have among us graduates with diplomas from English and Indian universities and yet they have been put aside in preference to others. The principle of nomination seems to have been applied differently to the selection of fellows from different communities.

It is significant that ever since the creation of the University not a single Muslim has been successful in being elected a fellow of the University though some of the candidates were graduates of proved merit and ability. Though the number of Muslim graduates is not so small, the number of the registered graduates who alone can exercise the right of voting is very limited as Muslim graduates are generally poor and can seldom be persuaded to spend the amount necessary to have their names registered. The right of voting is thus practically confined to non-Muslim graduates who seldom consent to record a vote in favour of a Muslim. The result has been that in the matter of admission to the University through the medium of election the doors of the University are wholly shut against the Muslim community.

The constitution of the University has been based on legislative enactment amended and modified by the Government of India which have reserved the statutory power of nominating a large number of fellows in order to preserve the necessary equilibrium between the interests of different communities. In spite of this large power of nomination and in spite of the almost total absence of Muhammadans from the governing bodies of the University very little has hitherto been done to secure an effective representation of Muhammadans in the Senate, the Syndicate and the different boards of studies.

Be that as it may, the higher education among the Muslims of India has come to a stage when a large number of Muslim graduates—some with very high academic attainments—pass out of the University annually. With the remarkable advance made by Muhammadans in all phases of life and activities a desire to be associated with the administration of affairs in their own *Alma Mater* is one of the natural aspirations of these educated men. It will be greatly lowering their level of thought and activities if their natural aspirations in this matter are not satisfied.

In these circumstances it is submitted—

- (i) That the statutory power of nomination should be exercised on a fixed principle and that if the existing rules and regulations do not allow such a course they should be so amended as to secure an adequate and effective representation by the Muhammadans on the Senate, the Syndicate and the different boards of studies to the extent of one third of the total number of the nominated fellows.
- (ii) That the election of the Muslim fellows in the above proportion should be through the medium of a special electorate composed of Muslim graduates—registered and unregistered—members of the councils, barristers, Arabics and Persian professors and principals and professors of Madrasahs. The number of these educated men will be sufficiently large to form an electorate.

If the idea of separate election or special electorate be considered unpleasant then the number of Muslim representatives in the several bodies of the University should be fixed in the above proportion and they should be allowed to enter through the general election.

Hossain, Wahid—*contd*—HUNTER, MARK HUQ The Hon ble Maulvi A K FUZLUL—
HUQUE, M AZIZUL.

At any rate, the University should have a real representative character, and the educational interests of a community should be allowed to be safe guarded by the representatives of that community.

HUNTER, MARK

- (a) This I take it, is practically a question of nomination or election to the Senate. It is certainly desirable that the special interests and needs of particular communities should not be lost sight of—and the Government of Madras cannot well be accused of overlooking the claims of any community or educational agency. On the other hand, it is not to the interests of the University as a whole that persons academically considered of little or no significance should be given place and influence in the University, simply as representing this or that community, to the exclusion of men of high academic qualification who are likely to be of real service in university work.
- (b) No, unless such consideration can be given without detriment to university studies generally. Doubtless, courses in Persian and Arabic should be provided for Muhammadans, and a course in Hebrew for Jews, but this is an obvious obligation.
- (c) It should certainly be the aim to make provision for all castes and communities in college hostels, and in Madras this may be said to be regularly done.

HUQ, The Hon ble Maulvi A K FUZLUL

- (a), (b) and (c) I am strongly of opinion that the needs and necessities of particular communities, especially the Muhammadan community, should be specially considered and provided for. The reasons are too well known to need a detailed discussion.

HUQUE, M AZIZUL

In answering this question I would only confine my attention to the Muhammadan community.

- (a) I am very strongly of opinion that the needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered in the government of the University, and always so especially when that particular community is a very important section of the people. A scheme of reform which does not take note of the actual and practical effect and its consequence on two important communities, *viz*, Hindus and Musalmans, is radically imperfect. To ignore it in a presidency where the Muslims form the majority of the population is almost suicidal. You cannot create a system where the backward would become still more backward only to allow speed to the forward section. This has just been the case with the Calcutta University which has created palatial residential quarters for Hindus on the subtle plea that the demand is greater among them, while the Musalmans have been left to shift for themselves. The presence of a strong Musalman element in the government of the University would greatly mitigate the difficulties of the situation. The needs and interests of particular communities should, therefore, be fully considered in the government of the University.

The present absence of Muhammadans in the government of the University is a factor which should not easily be brushed aside. Muhammadans have a catalogue of grievances against the management of the Calcutta University. I would take leave to enumerate some of them here—

- (1) There has not been a single Muhammadan on the Syndicate to specially look after the needs of the Muslim community ever since the new reformed regulations have come into force.

HUQUE M AZIZUL—*contd*

- (ii) Subjects of lectures and researches selected by the University hardly touch matters of Islamic studies and interest though they often go to Hindu history culture and civilisation
- (iii) The list of examiners contains only a very few Muslim names
- (iv) Patronage in office and establishment—tutorial and ministerial—very rarely goes in favour of Muhammadans
- (v) Nobody seems to care for Islamic languages Persian and Arabic questions are mostly stiff University courses are hardly published and never in time The B A third year students did not know of the course even in September 1916 The B A Arabic honours course was not published for nine years before 1916
- (vi) While the University appointed lecturers and professors in every possible subject even when several colleges were affiliated in some of those subjects it did not think of Arabic—though the Presidency College was the only college affiliated in Arabic—while students willing to appear in Arabic privately not being able to read in any college owing to want of affiliation were refused permission Students passing the final and title Madrassah examinations which represent the highest oriental scholarship in Arabic were also refused permission
- (vii) The University has hitherto failed to meet the problem of inadequacy of Persian and Arabic staffs in the colleges
- (viii) A huge amount of money was spent on the organisation of Calcutta messes but very little was spent on Muslim boys
- (ix) The University provided a palatial building for the accommodation of Hindu law students but nothing was done for Muslim students though there were over 100 Muslim students at the time in the University Law College A number of seats remained vacant in the first year in the said hostel but the Muslim students had no room there
- (x) The new regulations are very hard on the Muslim community the cost of higher education has been almost prohibitive
- (xi) Books by Muhammadan authors are never selected as text books
- (xii) Sometimes students of other communities were allowed to appear in some subjects privately owing to want of affiliation but even the final Madrassah passed students were refused this concession
- (xiii) Examination dates are sometimes fixed on Muslim festive days
- (xiv) Books are selected which insult and wound the religious feelings of the Muslims.
- (xv) Favouritism is shown to Hindu students
- (xvi) A Muhammadan student was refused permission to read in the M A Sanskrit classes of a university lecturer
- (xvii) The University has not the ordinary courtesy of even replying to the representations and resolutions of the Muslim associations
- (xviii) Muhammadan interests are not adequately looked after
- (xix) Three cases of gross favouritism were accidentally brought to light very recently How many cases there have been none can say

	Pass marks 100	Bengal	Pass marks 100	Pass marks 100	TOTAL
English (Grace)			Philosophy	History	
Hindu student	91—6—3 R	33	100	1—6	359 Pass
Muhammadan student	96	66	100	108	359 Plucked
	9—8 R	44	Economics		
	109	40	106	112	360
			99	111	359

HUQUE, M AZIZUL—*contd*

It is impossible to narrate all the other difficulties and disadvantages in a nutshell. Recently it is understood that, though a number of books of a certain Muhammadan author was sent to the University, the board of studies could not get any copy from the library when it wanted to consider the selection of text-books. I would suggest that —

- (A) At least one-third of the total number of fellows must be Muhammadans, half of whom should be elected by an electorate of Muhammadan graduates on the lines of the Dacca University scheme. The electorate may consist of all Muhammadan—
 - (1) Graduates
 - (2) Professors, lecturers, head masters, and other educational officers not below the rank of district deputy inspector of schools or drawing pay of Rs. 1,200 or over.
 - (3) Barristers
 - (4) Members of the Provincial Service executive, judicial, or educational
 - (5) Oriental scholars of known repute and ability—a list to be framed by the assistant director of public instruction for Muhammadans.
 - (6) All high educational officers belonging to any nationality holding charge of Muhammadan educational institutions
- (B) That all Muhammadans qualified to vote should be eligible for fellowship
- (C) That the post of vice-chancellor and the comptroller of examinations should be alternatively held by Muhammadans
- (D) That the ministerial appointments to the extent of one-half should be open to Muhammadans
- (E) That a proportion of one-third of the total number of higher university appointments and examiners should be thrown open to Muhammadans
- (F) That the Muhammadan fellows should return three members to the Syndicate. Every Muhammadan fellow should be eligible for membership of the Syndicate
- (G) That Muhammadans should be duly represented in the governing bodies of colleges and high schools and this should be a condition precedent to affiliation
- (b) The needs and interests of particular communities should be primarily considered in the courses of study and I make the following suggestions under this head —
 - (i) That there should be a faculty of Islamic studies and it should be composed of Muhammadan fellows and oriental scholars in Islamic studies belonging to other communities
 - (ii) That in the faculty of Islamic studies and the subjects of Islamic theology, traditions, history, literature and antiquities, etc., should be incorporated.
 - (iii) That there should be a faculty for Bengali as separate from the faculty of the Sanskrit and Sanskrit languages and should consist of Hindus and Muhammadans in the proportion of half and half
 - (iv) That Bengali books suited to Muhammadan requirements should be prescribed as an alternative course in all university examinations for Muhammadan students
 - (v) That Urdu should be included in the list of second languages for Muhammadans whose vernacular is not Urdu.
 - (vi) That final Madrasah-passed candidates appearing in any university examinations should be exempted from appearing in the classics or in the vernaculars up to the intermediate standard and also may be exempted from attending lectures in those subjects
 - (vii) That Muhammadan students should be permitted to attend university classes without restriction and, should any lecturer, professor, or reader refuse to permit a Muhammadan student to attend his lectures, his services should be forthwith dispensed with
 - (viii) Post-graduate classes ought to incorporate a chair in Islamic studies.
- (c) In any proposal for residential and other arrangements Muhammadans and Hindus should have half and half so long as enough Muhammadan students are

HUQUE M AZIZUL—*contd*—HUQUE KAZI IMDADUL

available to take advantage of these privileges. If there are 10 000 Hindu students and 1 000 Muslim students and if residential accommodation is provided for 1 500 students in all 750 must be for Muhammadans

I also suggest that —

- (A) Admission in one college should not be a bar to admission in another college within a month of the beginning of a session and that without the student being required to take any tran fer. But students shall be required to send a notice to the college of first admission. The absence of this rule creates great hardship on Muhammadan students
- (B) The system of writing down names in answer papers should be abolished
- (C) In schools colleges and hostels local Anjumans or associations may arrange for Persian Arabic or Urdu teaching or religious training by keeping stipendiary or honorary maulvis mullas etc
- (D) School and college students may be permitted to live together in places where a sufficient number of Muhammadan students is not available and in backward areas
- (E) Muhammadan matriculates I A S B A s etc of other universities may be permitted to attend lectures and to sit for examinations of the University an appreciable number of Muhammadan students goes up to Aligarh and other places
- (F) The results of the university examinations must be published two months before the beginning of the session
- (G) Residential regulations should not be enforced unless actual provision is made by the college or the university authorities without any unnecessary burden to students

In any scheme of reform one should not forget that the University exists for the people—people as a whole and not a section only. If the major section through circumstances or otherwise has not hitherto been able to take any advantage of the university system three courses are open either—

- (1) the two communities should be separated and two separate universities should be started—one for the forward and another for the backward
- or
- (2) the regulations should be so framed that they may not stand in the way of the backward section
- or
- (3) there should be two separate sets of regulations for the two separate communities in the same university

unless of course we took the fourth inevitable alternative of not giving the backward sections any advantages of university life and education at all. Remembering the steps that were taken to popularise the spread of education among the people in the fifties and sixties of the last century we should frame the regulations to suit the circumstances under which Muhammadans find themselves to-day and which are almost the same as those in which the more forward sections were in the sixties. We ought not to leave the backward to become still more backward. You cannot hope to create an Oxford or a Cambridge or a Harvard amidst the desert tribes of the Sahara.

HUQUE KAZI IMDADUL

- (a) Half the Indian members in the Syndicate should be Muhammadans and ^{there} must be a few Muhammadans on each board of study
- (b) Muhammadan subjects ought to be adequately represented in the courses of ^{eg} Islamic history biography philosophy and theology ought to be. Further every college should make provision for the teaching of ^{Arabic} Persian

HUQUE, Kazi IMDADUL contd —HUSAIN, The Hon'ble MIAN MUHAMMAD Fazli, Khan Bahadur—HYDARI, M A N —IBRAHIM, Khan Bahadur MUHAMMAD

- (c) All Government and aided colleges should have Muhammadan hostels exactly on the lines of other hostels attached to them. Further, the University should build a hostel for post graduate Muhammadan students on the lines of the Hardinge Hostel

All Government and aided colleges should have a few Muhammadan members on its staff—not merely teachers of Arabic and Persian but professors and tutors in other subjects as well. Their presence is absolutely necessary for the all-round training of Muhammadan students

HUSAIN, The Hon'ble MIAN MUHAMMAD Fazli, Khan Bahadur

In the interest of the Muslim community to which I belong—

- (a) a percentage of fellows should be fixed and provision made so that they may get a chance of working on the boards of studies and the Syndicate

This suggestion is like that for protecting new industries, and is due to the fact that Musalmans have taken to western education only lately and their comparative poverty renders it difficult for them to make good the time lost already

- (b) Only partially, e.g., it should be possible for them to specialise in Islamic history.
(c) Entirely—because, ordinarily Hindus refuse to eat, drink or bathe with them

HYDARI, M A N

- (a), (b) and (c) I am strongly of opinion that in the highest interests of university life, even from its purely academical side, it is necessary that the needs and interests of particular communities like the Muhammadan community should be specially considered in the government of the University, its courses of study, and its residential and other arrangements. There should be an adequate proportion of the members of the community on the Senate and Syndicate and other governing and advisory bodies of the University, and in the arrangements for housing the students. I have already, in reply to question 11, shown how, for instance, the special needs of Muhammadans should be considered with regard to the medium of instruction. Similarly, such subjects as Islamic history and such languages as Persian, Arabic, and Urdu should have a due place in the framing of the university courses of study and every effort made to equalise the standard required in these with that in other optional subjects and languages

IBRAHIM, Khan Bahadur MUHAMMAD

- (a) In the government of the University there should be adequate representation of the different communities of Bengal on the Senate and the Syndicate, not according to the number of educated men among them, but according to the percentage of their population. In the Calcutta University, half, or if this be found impracticable at least 33 per cent, of the members of the Senate and the Syndicate should be Muhammadans. To gain the object members should be taken in not by election, but by nomination of Government, with due regard to the interests of the different communities. From the personnel of the Calcutta University it will not be too much to see that it is a Hindu university. The Muhammadan community may appeal to Government alone to safeguard their interests in the University by altering its constitution
- (b) Considering the miserable condition of the 20,000 Muhammadan students now studying in the madrassahs of Bengal it may be pertinently suggested that the

IBRAHIM Khan Bahadur MUHAMMAD—*contd*—IMAM The Hon ble Justice Sir ALI—
Indian Association Calcutta—IRFAN Maulvi MOHAMMAD—ISMAIL Khan
Bahadur MOHAMMAD

University should take their cases into consideration and endeavour to do some thing for them With this end in view the desirability of the introduction of English as an additional language into the prescribed course of the Madrassah may be considered in connection with the question of its pupils as university students They should be on an equal status with candidates for different university examinations and be allowed to sit for examinations under the University as in the Punjab University The University should have a special board of studies appointed for the conduct of the examination of madrassah students It must be stated here that the syllabus of studies prescribed for the madrassah covers a wide range of secular and religious subjects such as Arabic and Persian literature Muhammadan law jurisprudence theology logic philosophy elementary natural science and mathematics The concession prayed for therefore may not be considered unreasonable

IMAM The Hon ble Justice Sir ALI

Except in residential arrangements and in matters of food and religious discipline no special arrangement is needed for any particular community The highest branches of education should be open to all communities alike and the endeavour of the University should be to discourage sectarianism and not to emphasise them In matters of study the needs of all communities are very much alike and the universities cannot regulate them with a view to the encouragement of the education of any particular community

Indian Association Calcutta

In the government of the University or its courses of studies or needs interests of particular communities should not be considered There should be a uniformity

In its residential and other arrangements where the habits of life of particular communities have to be taken into consideration attention may be paid to communal needs, if the communities so desired

IRFAN Maulvi MOHAMMAD

- (a) This is a crying need The number of members should be in proportion to the population of the different races and communities in the land both in the Syndicate and the Senate

ISMAIL Khan Bahadur MOHAMMAD

- (a) The needs and interests of the Muslim community should be safeguarded by adequate representation in the Senate as well as in the Syndicate In the Senate the number of seats available for European members of the teaching profession have been provided and should be equally divided between the Hindus and Muhammadans The same proportion should be observed in the Syndicate also The office of the vice chancellor should be filled by a Hindu European and Muhammadan in rotation
- (b) Arabic and Persian should be taught exactly up to the same standard as Sanskrit The course in Persian should not comprise Arabic for I A. and B A—Persian and Arabic should be treated as two separate subjects Urdu should find a place as a second language Geography should be a compulsory subject for the Matriculation Provision for the study of Islamic history should be made in schools and colleges
- (c) There should be hostel arrangements for Muhammadan boys in every college and school

ILAL, The Hon'ble Mr. Justice T. V. SESHAGIRI—JALIL, ABDUL.

AYER, The Hon'ble Mr. Justice T. V. SESHAGIRI.

Universities which are intended to give equal facilities for talent wherever it may be found should not be hampered by restrictions as regards classes and creeds. They should throw open their portals to all alike, irrespective of creed or caste. I am, however, for offering special scholarships to deserving students belonging to backward communities. I do not think any hot-house experiment by which particular communities are given special representation in the University will have the effect of stimulating education among such communities.

JALIL, ABDUL.

- (a) There is at present no provision for adequate representation of the interests of particular communities on the governing bodies of the universities which, naturally, leads to the sacrifice of the needs of those communities. The principle of communal representation in the universities should be recognised, the same proportion being maintained in them as in the Provincial Legislative councils. Taking particularly the case of the Muhammadans of India I think they had better try hard for their adequate representation in the University rather than in the Legislative councils.

The most deplorable state of Muslim education in India generally, and in Bengal particularly, demands that steps should be taken to safeguard its interest. It is the duty of Government, no less than that of the communities themselves, that the different communities in India should come up to the same level of culture and education. The sister communities should be more sympathetic towards any effort of Government, or of the Muslim community, designed to further the education of the latter, and bring them to their level, as the advancement of India is bound to be incomplete if any of its communities is not raised to an equal standard of education.

Being thirty years behind them in taking to western learning, the Muslim community require extra help at the hands of Government, and sympathy from and the good wishes of the sister communities to make up the deficiency and keep pace in the future advancement of education.

- (b) On the board of studies and the text-book committees particular communities should have adequate representation on the same principle noted above.
- (c) Attached to every college maintained by Government or district boards there must be separate hostels for Muslim students, and Government, by contributions, should encourage the building of such hostels for students in other colleges maintained by particular communities. It would certainly be to the advantage of students and to a certain extent to that of India as a whole, if all Indian students were living together, but on account of their different modes of living, of culture, and of religion and, in view of the fact that the Muslim students, as generally all other students, take more eagerly to the special hostels for them, it is in the interests and to the advancement of their education that they should be provided with separate boarding and lodging facilities.

A certain number of University and technical scholarships should be exclusively given to Muslim students and the same provision made for students of other backward communities and the so called depressed classes. The backwardness of Muhammadans in education, especially higher education, and the special circumstances of their middle classes, demand adequate and special provision for them.

In case of colleges established by particular communities, the University before granting affiliation should be satisfied as to the representation, to some extent at least, on the managing body of the college, of communities other than the one establishing it. The same principle should be adopted in the case of communal universities.

KADIR A F M ABDUL—KARIM MAULVI ABDUL

KADIR A F M ABDUL

Muhammadans should be represented on the Syndicate of the Calcutta University according to the strength of their population in the province. At present as far as I know they are not given any place amongst the syndics. Apart from social or political considerations the arrangement is detrimental to the best interests of education and advancement of learning which the University has in view. Not long ago a Muhammadan student who had taken his B A degree with Sanskrit as a compulsory subject wanted to proceed for his M A in Sanskrit. But he was denied a place in the lecture room of the university prof. or of Vedas. The only thing which as far as I know stood in his way was his creed. There is every likelihood of a recurrence of such events and a proper safeguard can be made only by giving the Muhammadan a proper and legitimate share in the government of the University.

KARIM MAULVI ABDUL

- (a) In the government of the University the needs and interests of the Muhammadan community should be specially considered. Numerically the Musalmans preponderate in the presidency of Bengal. As such they should have preponderated in the governing bodies of the University that is intended for the education of all classes of people in Bengal. But far from this being the case since the establishment of the University the community has never had either by nomination or by election even one sixteenth of the seats in these bodies. Notwithstanding the comparative backwardness of the Musalmans in western education they might reasonably claim a much larger share of representation in the administration of the University than they have hitherto had. Under the new University Act the total number of fellows has been fixed at 100 of whom 80 are nominated and 20 elected. The reservation by the Chancellor of the power of nominating so many as four fifths of the fellows perhaps with a view to preserve the necessary equilibrium between the different communities interested in the University should have secured the representation of the different communities on the different bodies of the University in proportion to their numerical strength and communal importance. Even if allowance were made for the difference in educational advancement their representation should on no account have been so absurdly disproportionate as it is at present. That an overwhelming majority of even nominated fellows should have come from one particular community is regarded as a grievance that calls for immediate redress. There is no fixed principle according to which selection is made by Government. It does not seem to have been always based on academic attainments. As for election since the introduction of the elective system not even a single Muhammadan has ever been returned although competent men were in the field. Under such circumstances it is no wonder that the interests of the community have not only been systematically neglected but have sometimes been unjustly sacrificed. This deplorable state of things has prevailed too long to be permitted to continue any longer. I hope and trust the Commission will see its way to make such recommendations as will remove the long standing grievances of the community by securing for its members adequate and effective representation in the administration of the University. Unless this is done the Muhammadan fellows would be as at present in a hopeless minority and their voice would be too weak to protect the interests of their co-religionists. The statutory power of nomination reserved for the chancellor should be exercised on some principle and a sufficient number of Musalmans should be selected by him to be fellows of the Calcutta University. After having given the matter much thought and taken into consideration the different points of view I have come to the conclusion that unless at least one third of the fellows be Musalmans

KARIM, Maulvi ABDUL *contd*

the interests of the community would not, under the existing circumstances be sufficiently safeguarded. I have no doubt that the required number of qualified Musalmans would be easily available. If anyone thinks that such a number of competent Musalmans in Bengal and Assam would not be forthcoming he is not, I am afraid, fully aware of the progress the community has lately made in education.

The number of Muhammadan fellows to be nominated and to be elected should be fixed. As for the latter, they may be elected either by the general electorate or by a special electorate consisting of Muhammadan graduates, educational officers of some standing, and reputed oriental scholars. If the election of the required number of Muhammadan fellows be secured it matters little whether they are elected by the general electorate or by a special electorate. The selected and elected Muhammadan fellows should form a separate court, which should elect its own representatives on the Syndicate, the boards of studies and other governing and advisory bodies of the University and also have the privilege of electing some Muhammadan co-opted members. In this connection I would beg to suggest that the elective system, which has an educative value of its own and which creates in the *alumni* of the University, as well as in others concerned in its affairs a particular interest, be extended to an appreciable extent. It is desirable that at least half the number of fellows be returned by election.

A fair proportion of the higher appointments and of the ministerial posts under the Calcutta University should be given to qualified Musalmans. In appointing examiners also their claims should be taken into due consideration.

I am strongly of opinion that the special needs and requirements of Musalmans be taken into consideration in connection with the reorganisation of the Calcutta University, and these should not be left to the proposed Dacca University scheme for I have much misgiving as to how far the community will be really benefitted by the Dacca University. Poor as the Musalmans are, I am afraid the cost of education in a residential university will prove too high to many of them to avail themselves of its benefits, and the special attraction held out to them in the shape of a faculty of Islamic studies and a Muhammadan college cannot induce them to overlook their pecuniary difficulty. Besides, the scope of a residential university being limited, a sufficiently large number of boys cannot be educated there. Moreover, there is no knowing when the Dacca University will come into existence. A federal university like that of Calcutta is best suited for the diffusion of knowledge over a wide area with a large population. Such a process of extensive education is likely to go a great way in uplifting the poor Musalmans of Bengal. It is essentially necessary, therefore, that their special interests should be properly safeguarded in the Calcutta University.

- (b) The needs and interests of particular communities with reference to the courses of study also require careful consideration. The English literature taught in Indian schools and colleges deals with English life and customs, English heroes and heroines, and English scenes and scenery, and, as such, it cannot prove as interesting and useful to Indian boys as it should be. Besides, it is difficult for them to thoroughly grasp things with which they are altogether unacquainted. Without a fair knowledge of English history and the physical features of England and other continental countries boys can hardly form even a hazy idea of the subjects treated in English books. Practical exclusion of these subjects from the course of studies for the matriculation examination has added much to the difficulties of the boys. It is most desirable that an English literature dealing with Indian life and history and depicting Indian scenes and scenery should be created for Indian boys, particularly for those preparing for the matriculation examination. If the English language is to have a permanent place in the course of studies for Indian boys the creation of a literature of the kind suggested above is essential. The present denationalising and disturbing tendencies, I am afraid, cannot be counteracted unless such a literature is taught.

KARIM MAULVI ABDUL—*contd*

Historical text books should be very judiciously selected. Books containing misrepresentation of facts and unjust criticisms of historical personages should not be included in the list of text books. The object of teaching history being not so much to acquaint the reader with dry facts and figures as to inspire him with patriotic feelings and noble impulses such books as give without sacrificing truth interest and ennobling accounts of the great deeds of their great men of the past should be prescribed as text books in history. A history of Islam should be included in the curricula of studies for the university examinations.

Some of the Bengali text books prescribed for the university examinations are not suitable for Muhammadan boys. These books deal with subjects which though interesting to Hindu boys do not appeal to Muhammadan students being full of Hindu ideas and sentiments illustrations from Hindu history and mythology and quotations from the Hindu Scriptures and classics. They prove most uninteresting and even distasteful to Musalmans. Instead of being inspired by Islamic ideas and ideals Muhammadan boys imbibe non Muslim thoughts and consequently show non Muslim tendencies in their manners and behaviour. Such books as draw largely upon the history traditions and scriptures of Islam and deal with subjects interesting and inspiring to Muhammadan youth should be included in the list of text books prescribed for the university examination. There are some books of this kind in existence and experience has shown that an inclination on the part of the authorities to encourage such publications brings in to the market a sufficient number of them. For the uplifting of the Musalmans of this presidency Bengali literature specially suited to their tastes and requirements is essentially necessary. Measures that are calculated to contribute to the improvement of such a literature should be adopted. The formation of a board of studies for the Bengali language as separate from the existing board of studies for Sanskrit and Sanskrit languages with a sufficient number of Muhammadan members and the appointment of a reader for this purpose would be steps in this direction.

Books dealing with subjects that are offensive to Musalmans or to any other community should not find a place in the list of text books. Passages calculated to wound the feelings of any community should be carefully expunged from books that are not otherwise objectionable.

- (c) The needs and interests of the Muhammadan community should be taken into due consideration in connection with the arrangements for the residence of students. For want of suitable lodgings at educational centres Muhammadan students find great difficulty in the prosecution of their studies. When Persian was the Court language many of the officers and members of the different professions were Musalmans and a large number of Muhammadan students used to board and lodge with them to feed and otherwise help a student being considered by the Musalmans as a sacred duty and a social obligation. When the number of such philanthropic people considerably declined on account of the abolition of Persian as the Court language the students supported by them had to shift for themselves. This is one of the chief causes that had deterred the Musalmans from availing themselves to any appreciable extent of the advantages of the education imparted in English schools and colleges. Even parents who can afford to pay the high cost of English education hesitate to send their children far from home for want of proper guardians. In these days when there is great risk of young students catching contagion from their surroundings and of being led astray by mischievous people it is very unsafe to keep them at stations where there is none to look after them. In these circumstances it is urgently necessary that adequate hostel accommodation should be provided for Muhammadan students. At least half of the money available for the provision of residential accommodation should be utilised for their benefit.

As on account of their poverty Musalmans are unable to pay the high seat rent charged in expensively constructed hostels cheaply built houses should be provided for them. I am not in favour of costly edifices for the residence of students of

KARIM, Maulvi ABDUL—*contd* —KHAN, MOHOMED HABIBUR RAHMAN—LANGLEY, G. H.
—LATIF, Syed ABDUL, Khan Bahadur

any community If boys accustomed to reside in scantily furnished humble houses are accommodated in well-built and well furnished structures they are discontented when they go back to their old dwelling It is most undesirable that, with a view to secure their unnecessary comfort, and to raise their standard of living, the taste of the boys should be changed and a desire for such residential houses created in them as they did not have before coming to the educational institutions and will not have after leaving them As a rule such houses should be provided as are generally the dwellings of the majority of those who come to reside in them Besides other advantages this will reduce the cost of education

The chief advantage of the residential system lies in the opportunity it affords for the formation of character through the close association of pupils and preceptors This is the chief reason why the residential system prevailed in olden times in most of the educational institutions in this country It would be superfluous to say that Musalmans attach much importance (perhaps much more than the members of other communities do) not only to religion, but also to morals and manners, and they view with much disfavour any deviation from the established social etiquette Unless the residence of Muhammadan students is placed in charge of good Musalmans, and the atmosphere in which they live and move is Islamic, such deviation cannot be altogether avoided For example, a Christian professor may not see anything objectionable in not only tolerating, but even in enforcing a football or hockey match at a time when Muhammadan boys should be engaged in their Maghrib (evening) prayers, and he may not have hesitation in calling for a peg when he finds himself run down in the field Such occurrences, if they chance to happen, cannot but be viewed with alarm by the Musalmans, and cannot but detract from the popularity of the institutions concerned Such being the case, I would strongly urge the desirability of invariably putting Muhammadan students under the charge of Muhammadan professors, who can command the esteem and confidence of their co-religionists That the success of hostels to a great extent depends upon the judicious selection of their superintendents should never be lost sight of

KHAN, MOHOMED HABIBUR RAHMAN.

e various communities should be adequately represented on the various executive academic committees of the University
e proportion of the representatives of the Muslim community, considering its number existing educational condition, should be 40 per cent

LANGLEY, G. H

- (a) Each community should be fairly represented because each subscribes to the funds whereby the University is supported By fair representation also the interests of the various communities will be maintained
- (b) Courses of studies should be designed to meet the needs of the various communities, but narrow sectarianism in the selection of subjects should be discouraged.
- (c) If any workable scheme can be devised it is advisable that students from different communities reading for higher examinations should reside together (answer to questions 4 and 7)

LATIF, Syed ABDUL, Khan Bahadur.

There is a serious complaint against the Calcutta University that the needs and interests of particular communities are not considered at all. This is due to the

LATIF Syed ABDUL Khar Bahadur—*contd*—MAHALANOBIS PRASANTA CHANDRA—
MAHTAB The Hon ble Sir BIJAY CHAND—MAITRA GOPAL CHANDRA—MAJUMDAR
PANCHANAN

fact that representatives of these communities are not on the boards of the University Hindus and Muhammadans are mainly the students of schools and colleges under the Calcutta University but while Hindus are fully represented Muhammadans are almost entirely ignored. The result has given rise to the complaint that it is a Hindu university. The *Mussalman* which is recognised to be an impartial organ of Muhammadans with no quarrel with the Hindus has from time to time pointed out instances of injustice to Muslim students. In its issue of December 14th 1917 it has ably pointed out some of the grievances of Muhammadans which can hardly be expected to be removed as long as the existing constitution of the Calcutta University continues. There is no doubt that the representatives of one community cannot appreciate or realise the difficulties of students belonging to another and it is only by the association of the members of different communities on the Senate and Syndicate that their angle of vision may be changed and the defects of exclusiveness from which the Calcutta University now suffers may be removed.

MAHALANOBIS PRASANTA CHANDRA

It is necessary under existing social conditions to make some provision for communal needs. But the general ideal should be a fundamental unity in academic needs rather than diversity of purpose for different sections of the people.

The University though making adequate provision should never encourage the general tendency of our social life to differentiate itself into an ever increasing number of water tight and to a great extent mutually exclusive compartments. A proper and fundamentally unified differentiation is a different matter altogether but it must be admitted that the present artificial process of innumerable cleavages in our society is not a thing to be encouraged.

MAHTAB The Hon ble Sir BIJAY CHAND

I do not think any such special consideration is necessary in the government of the University but such consideration is necessary in fixing the vernacular courses of study each community being given the opportunity to study its own vernacular literature and there should be separate messes for Hindus Muhammadans and Christians according as the number of students belonging to any of these communities may require in any college. Besides this there should be no other distinction. The general principle of education and discipline should be the same in every case.

MAITRA GOPAL CHANDRA

- (a) The government of the University should be in the hands of the most competent persons irrespective of the communities to which they may belong.
- (b) As to courses of study communal interests need be considered only in recognising the different scriptural languages as equally important subjects of study.
- (c) There should under existing circumstances be separate residential arrangements but not separate colleges for different communities.

MAJUMDAR PANCHANAN

- (b) Books on Hindu and Muhammadan religion or divinity may be introduced into the courses.
- (c) Provision should be made for the residence of the depressed classes of the Hindu community.

MASOOD, Syed Ross—McDOUGALL, Miss ELEANOR—MITRA, The Hon'ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA, Bahadur—MITRA, RAM CHARAN—MOHAMMAD, Dr WALI

MASOOD, Syed Ross.

The various communities should be adequately represented on the various executive and academic committees of the University

McDOUGALL, Miss ELEANOR

- (c) I think that the needs and interests of special communities should be considered with regard only to this

MITRA, The Hon'ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA, Bahadur

- (a) A proportionate number of representatives from all communities must form the governing body of the University. This proportion should be according to the number of students in each particular community that receive education.
 (b) There should not be different courses of study for different communities except in the vernaculars.
 (c) Separate residence for separate communities should be provided for

MITRA, RAM CHARAN

I think that only in residential arrangements should there be some distinction between Hindu and Muhammadan students, but even this may be done away with with the unanimous consent of the boarders

MOHAMMAD, Dr WALI.

It is perhaps very unfortunate that the needs and interests of the various communities in India are not always identical. This is due to differences in religion, ideals, traditions, manners, the language of its classical and sacred literature. Muhammadans, for instance, form an important minority and their just claims cannot be ignored. In Bengal, though over half the population is Muhammadan, yet their education, both elementary and advanced, has been seriously neglected. Government is alive to this state of affairs and has taken special measures to remove the disparity. The granting of special concessions in the form of exemption from fees, together with special scholarships, provision of hostels, the appointment of special Muhammadan inspectors, and the improvement of Maktabas and Madrassahs have all helped elementary education. In higher education Muslims are still backward. Taking the figures for 1915-16 we find that, out of a total of 55,489 students receiving university education in British India, only 5,992 were Muhammadans. This gives a percentage of only 10.8 while Muhammadans form nearly 23 per cent of the total population of India—these figures become still more startling when we bear in mind that in Bengal more than half the population is Muhammadan. The Calcutta University Calendar shows that in the various governing bodies of the University (like the Senate and the Syndicate) Muhammadans are conspicuous by their absence. What is more deplorable is the non-existence of Muslim professors on the staffs of Government or private colleges. Even the few assistant professorships of Persian and Arabic are scarce. When it is borne in mind that the public administration demands a fair representation of all the important communities of the presidency, and that public servants cannot be trained except at the universities, the problem becomes of the utmost importance.

- (a) It is evidently necessary that on the various controlling bodies of the universities Muhammadan interests should be adequately represented and properly

MOHAMMAD DR WALI—*contd*—MUKERJEE ADHAR CHANDRA—MUHAMMEDI PANCHANANDAS

safeguarded. It may be urged that owing to the scarcity of Muhammadans on the professoriates of the colleges suitable representatives are not forthcoming. Until suitable Muslim professors from Bengal are available it may be necessary to import professors from other provinces of India. The M. A. O. College Aligarh, the Islamia College Peshawar and the Islamia College Lahore could perhaps spare a few capable men for either temporary or permanent service in Bengal. Specially trained men can be secured by offering special scholarships for advanced study in India and abroad. I attach great importance to the adequate representation of Muhammadans in the government of the University and consider it a question of vital importance deserving the careful attention of Government and the public.

- (b) The Dacca University scheme contemplates the creation of a department of Islamic studies. This is a much needed improvement and will be welcomed by Muhammadans. A department of Islamic studies on the same lines should be created in Calcutta and perhaps at other important places. It is essential for the success of this experiment that the existing *madrasahs* which are to serve as feeders should be reformed and improved without unnecessary delay.

There is a general complaint among Muhammadan students of Bengal that no arrangements for teaching Arabic and Persian exist in many of the important colleges. This can be easily remedied by the appointment of Arabic and Persian professors. Urdu should be recognised as a vernacular for such Muhammadan students as do not want to take up Bengali. Special scholarships, medals and prizes should be given to Muhammadan students seeking higher education. It is not difficult to devise means to encourage Muhammadans if a genuine effort were made and co-operation secured.

- (c) Muhammadans take to the residential system much more easily than Hindu students. This is owing to the absence of any rigid caste system or any hard social restrictions. If special hostels for Muhammadan students are established and facilities for religious instruction are provided, Muhammadan students would flock to them. Such hostels should not be isolated from others but should form a part of the general residential system. In the Punjab, in hostels attached to Government and mission colleges, Muslim and Hindu students live not only in adjoining rooms but often in the same dormitory. Their dining halls and kitchens however are separate. In Allahabad they have got separate hostels situated near each other but having their own management, kitchen and dining hall. I am strongly opposed to segregation on the basis of religion or caste or creed but would under existing social conditions have different wings of the same hostel reserved for different communities.

MUKERJEE ADHAR CHANDRA

Communal representation is not desirable in the University

MUHAMMEDI PANCHANANDAS

I strongly think that the needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered in the residential and other arrangements of the University and its constituent colleges. But I do not think that it is desirable or necessary—except perhaps in the case of Muhammadans—that there should be any special representation of particular communities in the government of the University. As regards courses of study the needs and interests of particular communities should be consulted with reference to the study of the second languages and the vernaculars.

Murarichand College, Sylhet—NAG, P N—NAIK, K G—NANDY, The Hon'ble Maharajah Sir MANINDRA CHANDRA—NANJUNDAYYA, H V—NEOGI, Dr P

Murarichand College, Sylhet.

(a) and (b) None

(c) Residential and messing arrangements for separate religious denominations and such sub castes as by custom are not allowed in the general hostel and the mess. There may be one general hostel with a single messing arrangement for those students who have no religious prejudices (view of some of us).

NAG, P N

(a) and (b) The needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered, according to their educational and numerical strength, in the government of the University and in its courses of study. Men of talent and ability, when available, should represent the interests of particular communities

NAIK, K. G.

(a) and (b) At the portals of the University all communal differences should vanish.
(c) Residential facilities should be provided for all communities, if possible

NANDY, The Hon'ble Maharajah Sir MANINDRA CHANDRA.

(a) and (b) Communal needs and interests should have no consideration either in the government of the University or in its courses of study.
(c) In residential and kitchen arrangements, however, the special habits and traditions of the particular communities should be respected. Encouragement may be given to the backward classes by making special grants for their education as well as residence.

NANJUNDAYYA, H V.

(a) In the government of the University it goes without saying that persons versed in all the branches of learning pursued should have a share. In the lay element (which should also be selected with an eye to securing the services of men interested and capable of taking an intelligent share in the advancement of learning) all important sections of the people for whose benefit the University exists should be duly represented. In an Indian university the Indian element should be predominant—I mean among the lay portion of it. The Musalmans have a somewhat different ideal of education as regards languages and so they should find a place.
(b) Those who wish to study branches of Sanskrit learning and the vernacular languages and of Musalman culture (where there is a demand for it) should have their needs supplied as far as possible.
(c) In residential and messing arrangements the broad distinctions of caste and race, to the extent they are respected in the province of the University generally, should be respected.

NEOGI, Dr P.

(a) and (b) In this connection I would strongly urge for special educational facilities for what are called the *depressed classes of the Hindu community* such as

NFOGI Dr P—contd—North Bengal Zamindars Association Rangpur—PARANJPYE
The Hon ble Mr R. P

the Namasudras the Shahas the Dhobis Bagdis etc I don't know their exact numerical strength but I think they form a very large percentage of the Hindu population of Bengal Their degraded social position poverty and misery can only be removed through education in which they are exceptionally backward Special facilities have justly been given to Muhammadans for their education in schools as well as in colleges For example every Government school is bound to accept a certain percentage of Muhammadan students as free students Then there are special scholarships for Muhammadan students awarded on the results of the matriculation and intermediate examinations and special hostels for Muhammadan students have been built everywhere I would strongly plead for the same if not more liberal treatment for the depressed classes who are infinitely more backward in education than Muhammadans My specific recommendations on the subject are the following —

- (i) A schedule of the communities forming the depressed classes should be prepared and Government should instruct the schools maintained or aided by them to admit poor students belonging to these classes as free students up to 5 per cent of the total number of students in the schools
- (ii) Twenty special scholarships of the value of Rs 10 each and ten of the value of Rs 15 each should be given by Government to students belonging to these classes on the results of the matriculation and the intermediate examinations respectively
- (iii) A special central hostel for students belonging to these classes should be built at Calcutta and in other centres suitable arrangements for their residence should be made I often find that a student belonging to this class is unable to find a seat in ordinary hostels or messes At the same time a separate mess in a separate hired building for three or four students of this type costs a good deal We in Rajshahi have solved the difficulty by starting what is called a Liberal Mess in which besides students belonging to the depressed classes students of other higher castes who have no objection to live with them are put In this way Brahmans Kayasthas and students of other castes live with the sons of the depressed classes and the mess expenses are shared by them all I do not know if the same system prevails at other places If it does not I would strongly recommend that a Liberal Mess on the system followed at Rajshahi be established in connection with every secondary school and college not only in Bengal but throughout India
- (iv) At least two graduates belonging to the depressed classes should be nominated fellows of the University so that they may bring their special grievances to the notice of the University

North Bengal Zamindars Association Rangpur

- (a) No other test than that of education is deemed necessary
- (b) No course of study calculated to wound the religious feelings of any community should be prescribed
- (c) Residential arrangements should be made with due regard to the religious susceptibilities of the students

PARANJPYE The Hon ble Mr R. P

I am strongly of opinion that no communal considerations should be introduced in the government of the University The Senate and the Syndicate should consist of the best men. As regards courses of study it is natural that some subjects may specially appeal to some special community e.g Persian and Arabic to Muhammadans Sanskrit to Hindus Avesta and Pahlavi to Parsis Pali to Buddhists etc The Senate or at least

PARANJPYE, The Hon'ble Mr R. P.—*contd*—RAHIM, The Hon'ble Mr. Justice ABDUR—
RAY, DR. BIDHAN CHANDRA.

the boards of study, should contain representatives of all the subjects which the university offers to teach and the University should aim at teaching all subjects for which there is a demand. It should so arrange its courses that they are not too narrowly sectarian. Thus, I would deprecate a course of Sanskrit for Jains in which no books, but those by Jain authors, are prescribed. Every student of Sanskrit should have some knowledge of the literature contained in Sanskrit as a whole before specialising in one particular branch.

In the matter of separate institutions for different communities I deprecate the foundation of communal universities or even colleges. I am willing to allow only separate hostels at the most, but I would prefer a hostel for all classes, the messes only being distinct for different classes. In this way all classes of young men will have ample opportunities of coming together and will begin to feel unconsciously that they are Indians first and foremost, and not members of their separate little communities only. This is the impression that I want them to take from their education, and not merely the prescribed amount of book-learning in various subjects.

RAHIM, The Hon'ble Mr Justice ABDUR

- (a) Speaking for the Muhammadans it is extremely important that they should be adequately represented in the government of the University, including the Senate, the Syndicate, the board of studies, and the examining board, and also on the governing bodies of hostels, messes, and lodgings. I may here mention that the practice in the Calcutta University of insisting upon the names of the candidates to be written on the answer papers has long been a matter of complaint in the Muhammadan community and, I think, in fairness to the examiners themselves, the system should be changed. In Madras the names of the examinees are not divulged, but I have not heard that any inconvenience is caused thereby. As for the courses of study I would recommend that Islamic history be recognised at least as an optional subject.
- (b) In any system of higher education of women, the cultivation of the fine arts, especially music and painting, should have a special place. In schools for women the care and management of children, the domestic arts, and the art of house-keeping should be an indispensable part of the curriculum.
- (c) Speaking for the Muhammadan community the great difficulty in the way of higher education among the women is the custom of *purdah*. It is, no doubt, showing some signs of weakening, and many families are now prepared to send their girls to ordinary girls' schools up to twelve or thirteen years of age. At present, therefore, higher education among Musalman women would only be possible if a college were to be founded at each university centre for Muhammadan *purdahnashin* girls, wholly staffed by women teachers, and all necessary arrangements be made for the observance of *purdah*. Among them such early marriages as prevail among the Hindus are not largely in vogue. On the average they are married between the ages of sixteen and twenty-two. Wherever it be not feasible to establish a college such as is suggested the only other course is to organise home classes and provide women teachers to go round and take those classes.

RAY, DR. BIDHAN CHANDRA

- (a) The government of the University should be vested (as I have explained in answer to question 14) in the Senate, which should consist of members elected from different constituencies. Such constituencies should be chosen with an eye to their usefulness from an educational standpoint. No representative of

RAY DR. BIDHAN CHANDRA—*contd*—RAY MANMATHANATH—RAY SARAT CHANDRA

any particular class or sect as such should have any place there. The chief communities that should be represented besides those directly connected with educational institutions are —

- (i) Commercial and business men
 - (ii) Engineers
 - (iii) Medical men
 - (iv) Literary scholars of eminence
 - (v) Men connected with the spread of education among the masses and the backward classes.
 - (vi) Women's education should be directly represented by women
- (b) In choosing courses of study great efforts have been made in the past to avoid such studies as might offend particular communities. For example the study of the growth and practice of different religious faiths may have been omitted because it was felt that the university teaching should preserve a spirit of neutrality in such matters. But if these are taught from a purely educational standpoint they could hurt the religious susceptibilities of only a few.
- (c) Happily the broad dividing line between youths of different castes and religions is fast disappearing. No scheme of reform should be adopted which may operate directly or indirectly to widen it. It is painful to a sensitive mind to see that students among whom a spirit of *bonhomie* should be paramount have to live apart eat separately and feel differently because of the rules which have been instituted in a hotel in conformity to the wishes of a few. I have opportunities of knowing that such feeling of aloofness and mutual separation are fast vanishing. Classes and sections there must be but why establish them among students during college life? Differential treatment is still evident in institutions where youths of different nationalities reside. True there are differences in the mode of life customs etc. and they will be there but they are necessary, evil and separate arrangements should not prevail in one part of the institution which are not found in another.

RAY MANMATHANATH

- (a) The needs and the interests of particular communities need not be specially considered in the government of the University except that in the Senate of the University there ought to be men competent to deal with the particular courses of study which may have to be framed to suit the needs of particular communities. The only question then is —Who are most competent to advance the interests of learning—the different *interests* should be represented but not the different *communities*.
- (b) The needs of particular communities may be considered to some extent in respect of the courses of study e.g. Arabic Persian and agriculture.
- (c) In the hostel arrangements the special needs and interests of particular communities may have to be considered but there need be no special arrangement with regard to the facilities of admission to educational institutions.

RAY, SARAT CHANDRA

As regards education no consideration should be made for any particular community. Only as regards residential arrangements necessary consideration may be made to suit the convenience of the particular community.

RAY, SATIS CHANDRA—REYAZUDDIN, SYED, QUAZI—ROY, The Hon'ble RAI SRI NATH, Bahadur—ROY, The Hon'ble Babu SURENDRA NATH

RAY, SATIS CHANDRA.

I agree that the needs and interests of particular communities should be differentiated in the courses of study, in the residential arrangements, and in the government of the University. But I would guard against the danger of subordinating general interests or national culture to communal interests or culture.

I would not reduce the standard of examination because a particular community requires special encouragement, or that special examinations should be instituted for testing the fitness of its members for special callings and professions, because it is backward in education. This course is bound to excite needless jealousy in the community receiving least favoured treatment and will tend to degrade the callings and professions by the introduction of men with a lower standard of university education.

REYAZUDDIN, SYED, QUAZI.

- (a) The needs and interests of particular communities should be specially considered according to their population. My special interest concerns the Muhammadan community. Now, 52 per cent of the population of Bengal belong to this community. And they ought to be represented by 52 per cent on the Senate and the Syndicate of the University to look after the interests of the students of the community. The education of the community should not depend on the discretion of the other community, which is its rival, in every affair. Some scandals have already been brought to notice as to the results of the examination, which are conducted by, with a few exceptions of Europeans, Hindus. In the government of the University unless there are Muhammadan members in proportion to their population the difficulties and disadvantages of the Muhammadan community would not disappear. There should be a proportionate number of inspecting and teaching staff, also examiners.
- (b) In the course of study also books written in the vernaculars and in English by Muhammadan authors should be introduced into the curricula.
A similar number of members should represent the text book committee.
- (c) Of the money spent on education if 52 per cent be allotted for the education of Muhammadan students, and Muhammadan students are helped in the shape of stipends (as the Muhammadan community is too poor to bear all the expenses) a residential arrangement is possible.

I believe Muhammadans have a right to claim these privileges as of right.

Before these changes are effected the names of all the examinees should not be written on the answer books as has been adopted in the Allahabad University.

ROY, The Hon'ble RAI SRI NATH, Bahadur

- (a) and (b) The communal interest should not be allowed to interfere with the government of the University or the course of study.
- (c) Separate hostels should be provided for the different communities.

ROY, The Hon'ble Babu SURENDRA NATH

- (a) The Muhammadan community considers that it is very poorly represented in the Senate of the University. I think a few more Muhammadan members may be added to the Senate.
- (b) and (c) I do not think that particular communities have any real grievance either in the course of study or in its residential and other arrangements.

SAHA MEGHNAD—SAHAY Rai Bahadur BHAGVATI—SANYAL NISIKANTA—
SAPRU The Hon'ble Dr TEJ BAHADUR

SAHA MEGHNAD

(c) If the residential system be adopted I think that proper care should be taken for the accommodation of students of democratic classes (I use this term to denote those classes which are usually but sometimes very unjustly styled depressed classes). It is a standing complaint that at the present time the hostels attached to colleges are practically the monopoly of a few aristocratic classes—viz. of the Brahmans, the Kayas, the Vaidyas and the Nababaks. Members of democratic classes are either not admitted or if at all admitted they are allowed to live not as a matter of right but as a matter of grace. If any student of the orthodox type demurs to living with them in the same room and taking meals in the same dining hall the unfortunate student is asked to remove to some other place and take his meals in his own room. The writer knows of several instances where this state of things has actually existed.

Now members of democratic classes feel that in at least those hostels which have been constructed at public expense they have the same right as members of other classes. They expect that they should be admitted freely and allowed to live in a manner consistent with their ideas of self respect and dignity. It will not do if separate hostels are opened for them for in that case at least twenty five separate communal hostels should be opened for each college one for the use of each particular community.

That being clearly impossible the only feasible solution is that the hostels should be declared freely open to all classes of students. The Government as a matter of principle does not make any distinction of caste or creed in points of law or employment. The same principle should be adopted in this case. Those students or communal leaders, who find it irreligious to dine with their fellow brethren of other castes should be asked to shift for themselves, or construct hostels at their own expense. They should not be allowed or encouraged to introduce a feeling of discord in the pure academic atmosphere.

SAHAY, Rai Bahadur BHAGVATI

I would recommend separate universities for special needs and interests of particular communities. To provide for their special needs and interests in a university that is to cater for the general population will be ineffective and a source of trouble.

SANYAL, NISIKANTA

There need be no cut and dry rule. The University should have freedom to adopt what appears to it to be the best policy. But no principle should be acceptable which stands in the way of academic efficiency.

Neither the Hindus nor the Muhammadans have accepted for women of their communities higher education as imparted in the present institutions. There should be no undue expansion of such education at their expense until it can be made acceptable to them.

SAPRU, The Hon'ble Dr TEJ BAHADUR

(a) and (b) I am not in favour of any communal representation in the government of the University nor do I think that it is possible to design courses of study with reference to the needs and interests of a particular community.

(c) As residential arrangements, I should prefer Hindu and Muhammadan students living in the same hostels though necessarily separate arrangements will have to be made for their board.

SARKAR, GOPAL CHANDRA—SARKAR, KALIPADA—SASTRI, Rai RAJENDRA CHANDRA, Bahadur—SAYIED, ABDULLAH ABU

SARKAR, GOPAL CHANDRA.

Except in respect of residential arrangements, and in prescribing courses of study, I do not think that special considerations are necessary in the government of the University in the interests of any particular community.

SARKAR, KALIPADA.

I am not for making distinctions of the sort contemplated so far as education, pure and simple, is concerned. There must be one standard and one rule for all. It is preposterous to think, for example, of a Muhammadan student being allowed to graduate with a simpler course of study than his Hindu and college mate.

But, in certain pecuniary matters, as, for example, college and examination fees, prizes, medals, and the like, some consideration may be shown to backward areas or communities. These areas or communities should be represented in the government of the University.

SASTRI, Rai RAJENDRA CHANDRA, Bahadur

When Hindus and Muhammadans and, possibly, other sections of the people are going to have universities of their own, no special consideration need be shown to them either in the management of the University or in regulating its courses of study. It is only residential and other arrangements that call for consideration in the case of important sections of the people.

SAYIED, ABDULLAH ABU.

Rightly or wrongly there is a strong feeling amongst Muhammadans that though they are numerically superior to other communities in Bengal, and are making every effort to advance in education, very little regard is paid to their requirements in the University. Cases like that of a Muhammadan Sanskrit student being removed from the University class on the ground of his *faith* naturally cause strong resentment and Muhammadans reasonably feel that had they been given a proper share in the government of the University such sectarian prejudices could have been effectively checked. The community has repeatedly urged upon the University the desirability of doing away with the practice of the examinees' names being written on answer papers, but hitherto to no purpose. To get an insight of what the community feels regarding the constitution of the University, I would invite a reference to the issues of December 14th and 21st of the "*Mussalman*" of Calcutta. Although Persian and Arabic are taught in many of the colleges affiliated to the University, in the cultivation of which Muhammadans are deeply interested, it is to be regretted that there has not been for several years past, and even at present, a single member on the Syndicate of the University who is interested in their studies. University publications on these subjects seldom come out punctually, and some have never seen the light, though their publication has been promised since the inception of the new regulations. Besides, the few members of the community that are on the Senate are mainly taken from those not connected with collegiate education which they are supposed to control. Provision for at least two Muhammadan members on the Syndicate and 20 on the Senate should be made.

Since Muhammadans are more cosmopolitan than any other community in India it is necessary to offer for the proper education of the youths of that community a course on Islamic history and civilisation, *alternating* with some other subject throughout their university career. At present, such a provision exists only in the post-graduate course of history, but this should begin earlier from the I A stage rising up to the M A. In no case can the argument of teaching people their own glorious past be applied with greater force than in that of the Muhammadans.

Scottish Churches College Senatus Calcutta—SEAL DR BRAJENDRANATH—SEN BIPIN BEHARI

Scottish Churches College Senatus, Calcutta

- (a) We consider that any very marked adaptation of the University to the needs and interests of particular communities is alien to the very idea of a university. Normally if discussion is kept on purely academic lines no question should arise in the University as to the particular community to which a student belongs. We do not therefore think that any formal provision should be made for the representation of particular communities in the government of the University. We consider that this should be left to the practical common sense and public spirit of the electorates or nominating authorities. At the same time the University should regard it as one of its functions to see that the needs of a particular community are not overlooked and that every encouragement is given to backward communities.
- (b) As to courses of study we are of opinion that a sufficient number of options would meet all the requirements here.
- (c) The provision for the various communities in regard to residential arrangements should be left to the different colleges acting either separately or through voluntary co-operation.

SEAL DR BRAJENDRANATH

My scheme of a provincial educational council with the control of general policy and financial management would provide for the representation on an elective basis of the principal interests and communities but the Senatus Academicus in charge of educational administration (including courses of study and examinations) will be composed of representatives of the teachers in all the faculties general as well as technological with co-opted experts and specialists and business and professional men chosen in the interests of educational efficiency without reference to the claims of communities. So far as residential and other arrangements are concerned the educationally backward communities or those below the water line (like the Muhammadans on the one hand and the *Sahas Suvarna Vaniks Yugis Baruis* and *Namasudras* on the other) have separate claims on the public funds and should be represented on the students residence committees in the University but every college hostel should provide an additional heterodox department which should be opened to members of all communities without distinction of caste or creed. The humiliating position assigned to students of the so called lower castes in some hostels (not all private institutions) is a running sore which should be stopped at once.

SEN BIPINBEHARI

The University has been founded on a secular basis and on the principle of equality. In the republic of learning no sectarian considerations should be allowed to interfere with higher training. The walls of separation between classes and creeds should go down under the influence of liberal culture and the University should promote social intercourse among all classes of students with due respect for their religious principles. A common intellectual kinship and rivalry should take the place of petty strifes separating one community from another. Freedom of thought and spirit of intellectual inquiry will remove all sectional prejudices. The object of the University is to place all classes on a common intellectual platform. If the Senate or the governing body of the University is composed of men of liberal culture there does not appear to be any necessity for safeguarding the interests of particular communities by a system of communal representation which if introduced will give rise to a number of factions and petty strifes prejudicial to the best interests of the University as a corporate body.

SEN, BIPINBHARI—*contd*—SEN, Rai BOIKUNT NATH, Bahadur—SEN, Dr S K—
SEN, Rai SATIS CHANDRA, Bahadur—SEN, SATISH CHANDRA

The Calcutta University has not been indifferent to the special needs of particular communities. It has prescribed courses of studies suited to their requirements, and has always acted in harmony with their religious and moral scruples.

But the boards of studies should be better organised by the admission to them of scholars and professors, other than fellows of the University, who have long specialised in the subjects for which the boards are constituted. It not infrequently happens that gentlemen who are fellows of the University, but who neither teach a subject nor have made a special study of it, are appointed to be members of the board in that subject. I beg to suggest that members of the post graduate boards of studies should be members of the under-graduate boards of studies.

There should, however, be separate hostel arrangements for students belonging to different communities.

SEN, Rai BOIKUNT NATH, Bahadur.

- (a) and (b) In the government of the University and in its courses of study no special consideration is required for the needs and interests of particular communities.
- (c) Residential and other arrangements may be made for the Muhammadan community, Christian converts, and the domiciled community.

SEN Dr S. K.

- (a) The main points are the religious and social requirements of the Europeans, Eurasians, Native Christians, Hindus (Liberal) and (Orthodox), Brahmos, and other castes and sects. If the ideals of the British universities and standards, with British elements dominating at present, are maintained, special consideration in the government of the University is not required.
- (b) As regards courses of study the interests of European men and women, Eurasians, and others with the same ideas should be considered in framing mechanics, music, drawing, and similar courses.
- (c) It is difficult to observe the difference in habits and sentiments of Indians of different religions in England. That idea should be encouraged by having general hostels. Particular small accommodation for more orthodox types ought to be made in the beginning.

SEN, Rai SATIS CHANDRA, Bahadur.

- (a) In the government of the University the needs and interests of particular communities should be considered.
- (b) Yes, but on no account should there be any lowering of the standard in the courses of study.
- (c) Yes.

SEN, SATISH CHANDRA

- (a) The constitution of the University should be catholic and eclectic. I do not consider that there is need for special communal representation. I, however, think secondary schools, as forming the groundwork of the University, should be adequately represented on the University.
- (b) It suffices if courses of study are various, as at present, to meet the choice of students of different sects.
- (c) Residential arrangements should be made according to the requirements of the particular community to which the boarders belong. I would strongly advocate a religious training of the inmates within the hostel.

SEN SURYA KUMAR—SEN GUPTA Dr NARENDRANATH—SEN GUPTA Dr NARES CHANDRA

SEN SURYA KUMAR

- (a) Particular communities should have a share in the government of the University in proportion to the number of boys studying in colleges from their respective communities
- (b) No special consideration in the course of study should be made in favour of any particular community
- (c) Residential arrangements may be made for different communities at different places Any other arrangement in favour of a particular community should not be made inasmuch as it is likely to result in discontent and bitterness of feeling

SEN GUPTA, Dr NARENDRANATH

I am not in favour of representation of the particular religious or social units in the government of the University But arrangements should be made for the residence of different sects and religious groups

It is desirable however that the different professions such as law teaching and medicine as well as the mercantile community should be represented on the Senate.

I have no sympathy with the Dacca University plan of introducing special degrees and special courses of study for the Muslim community

SEN GUPTA Dr NARES CHANDRA

There ought to be considerable provision for free tuition and boarding as well as partial remission of fees for poor students of all communities—especially of backward communities.

The interests of Muhammadans should be considered in the designing of the courses by giving to Arabic and Persian the same place as Sanskrit If they so desire Muhammadans may endow special chairs for Islamic studies but I do not think the University is called upon to provide in a special manner for such studies in the present circumstances

I do not think that there are any special interests which ought to be secured in the government of the University The only possible interests are those of Muhammadans and Anglo Indians But I think it would be against principle to give to Muhammadans and Anglo Indians as such a right to have representatives in the Senate High academic qualifications and interest in education are essential in every member of the governing body of the University Where a Muhammadan or Anglo Indian has such qualifications he should be appointed by all means but no one should be appointed merely because he is a member of a particular community

I am of opinion that the number of elected fellows ought to be largely increased If that is done there is a sufficiently large number of Muhammadan graduates who may if they are so inclined return quite a decent number of Muhammadan fellows by getting themselves registered and voting in a block

To look upon education from the point of view of sectional interests is a pernicious habit and should not be encouraged On this matter it should be remembered that questions on which the interests of Muhammadans go against those of others arise in the Senate once in fifty years or more For the sake of these rare occasions it would be absurd to permanently weaken the Senate by bringing in members who are there not by virtue of their academic qualifications but because they are supposed to look after the interests of a community

SEN GUPTA, SURENDRA MOHAN—Serampore College, Serampore SHARP, The Hon'ble Mr H SHETH, Pandit HARGOVIND DAS T, NYAYATIRTHA, VYAKARANATIRTHA.

SEN GUPTA, SURENDRA MOHAN.

- (a) I do not think that particular communities can be specially represented on the Senate or the Syndicate. They should be represented by general electorates of schools and colleges, as well as by members of educated communities, and by benefactors and if they cannot come in by any of these channels I am afraid they must be satisfied with their representation by Government nominees only.
- (c) In residential arrangements attention should be paid to making separate arrangements for special communities.

Serampore College, Serampore

We consider the University should be broad enough in its aim and outlook as to be able to deal fairly and impartially with the particular communities and minorities in its area. No community ought to be made to feel that it cannot rely on liberal treatment and fair play on the part of the university authorities. Even prejudices should within reason be respected, provided that thereby the rights and liberties of others are not interfered with. This principle we would carry into all three departments mentioned in the question. A university that exercises its powers and privileges in a tyrannical way, and drives minorities to form separatist independent organisations, is unworthy of the name.

SHARP, The Hon'ble Mr. H

The consideration of the needs and interests of particular classes is of great importance. Among such communities in Bengal would be reckoned the Musalmans (who though numerically just over half the population, form a minority among those who seek higher education), the Buddhists, and the depressed classes.

- (a) The Musalmans require larger representation on the governing bodies. This can best be arranged by the establishment of local universities at centres of Muhammadan population like Dacca and Chittagong and by the devolution of examinations.
- (b) One of the chief complaints of the Musalmans has been the alleged difficulty of the Persian course owing to insistence upon a certain knowledge of Arabic. This has been partially remedied. Another is the unacceptability to them of some of the books recommended for the study of the vernacular in the matter of language, subject, and sentiment. I have not heard of any complaints from Buddhists regarding the Pali course. The suggestions made in my general note would probably remove any alleged hardships.
- (c) Complaints are sometimes made that Musalmans have difficulty in gaining admission to colleges and to hostels. I am unable to say how far these complaints are justified. It is important that Musalmans should have their own hostels (to a considerable extent they now possess them) supervised by Muhammadan professors, and with arrangements for religious observance, which is much prized by this community.

SHETH, Pandit HARGOVIND DAS T, NYAYATIRTHA, VYAKARANATIRTHA

The needs and interests of all important communities, irrespective of their number should be considered if they contribute towards the literature of the country, helping modern research in sciences, philosophy, language, etc. The members of such communities should be given the opportunity of placing their views as regards the governing body of the University, their literature should form a part of the courses of study and their views should be respected in residential and other arrangements.

SINHA KUMAR MANINDRA CHANDRA—SINHA PANCHANAN—SIRCAR The Hon'ble Sir
NILRATAN—SUDMENSEN I W—SUHRAWARDY HASSAN—SUHRAWARDY Z R
ZAHID

SINHA KUMAR MANINDRA CHANDRA

- (a) (b) (c) Every effort should be given to secure adequate representation for the interests of particular communities such as the Muhammadan and the domiciled Anglo Indian and every attempt should be made to include representatives of such communities in the deliberations of the University. This will help a cosmopolitan view being taken of problems affecting the University.

SINHA, PANCHANAN

The Calcutta University had always been undenominational and in the best interests of education should remain undenominational. The needs and interests of particular communities need not be specially considered either in its government or in its courses of study. But there should be separate residential arrangements for Hindu, Muhammadans and Christians.

SIRCAR, The Hon'ble Sir NILRATAN

The interests of particular communities may be recognised in the residential arrangements but they should be altogether ignored in the government of the University as well as in the courses of its study.

SUDMENSEN, I W

I do not think that the present University can be fairly charged with any deliberate neglect of any particular community. Muhammadans however are of opinion that they do not get a fair representation upon the Senate and the Syndicate and that the Muhammadans on the Senate are usually unconnected with collegiate education.

SUHRAWARDY, HASSAN

- (a) Proper representation of members of all communities is necessary to safeguard particular interests and answer peculiar requirements e.g. there is not a single Muhammadan on the faculty of medicine.
(b) Only in general education.
(c) It is very necessary that easy and free social intercourse should be encouraged to fight down caste and racial prejudice so that in the end an advanced student and Varsity man will break through the shell of bigotry and denominational bias in a way worthy of one having a liberal education and not simply get through certain stiff tests of an academical nature.

SUHRAWARDY, Z R ZAHID

- (a) The Muhammadan community backward as it is in education should receive special consideration and for this purpose the representatives in the Senate should be increased so as to secure at least one third of the number of senators from the members of that community. On the Syndicate there should be the same proportion. Besides every institution should have a few Muhammadan

SUHRAWARDY, Z R ZAHID—*contd*—WAHEED, Shams-ul-Ulama ABU NASR—WEBB,
The Hon'ble Mr C M—WILLIAMS, Revd GARFIELD.

professors in the general line, and not for Arabic and Persian only, as at present I understand there is not a single Muhammadan on the staff of any college except for Arabic and Persian

- (b) In the case of Bengali speaking Muhammadans Urdu should be considered as a second language, along with Persian, Arabic, etc
- (c) With regard to hostel accommodation and other facilities for Muhammadans I adopt the recommendations of the Committee appointed by the Bengal Government to consider questions connected with Muhammadan Education in 1914

WAHEED, Shams-ul-Ulama ABU NASR

- (a) The Musalmans must have an effective hand in the government of the University in order to promote Muslim education and safeguard the peculiar interests of Muslim students "The ratio of the number of Muslim senators to the total number of Indian senators should be equal to the ratio of the Musalman population of Bengal to the total population" The Muslim fellows of the University should be allowed to nominate an adequate number of representatives on the Syndicate from among themselves There should be, at least, one Muslim member on every board of studies If the study of Bengali be made compulsory on all students there should be adequate Muslim representation on the board of studies for the Sanskritic languages (as this board also selects text-books in Bengali) in order to see that text-books containing expressions offensive to Muslim taste and feeling should not be selected In order to increase the number of Muslims qualified to sit on the Senate qualified Muslims should be appointed to the staff of the University There should be Muslim representation on the governing bodies of colleges
- (b) An Islamic course of studies, under a faculty of Islamic studies, combined with English, leading to the university degrees, should be provided Every college should make provision for the teaching of Arabic, Persian, and Urdu The University should make provision for the study of the history of Islamic civilisation beginning from the intermediate stage

Though the value of hostel accommodation has been definitely recognised the actual accommodation provided for Muslim students is quite out of proportion to their needs The University should make adequate provision for hostel accommodation for Muslims Muslim students should be under the superintendence of Muslim teachers Provision should be made for religious observances

In order to ensure that Musalman students will be able to secure admission into colleges an adequate percentage of seats should be reserved for them.

WEBB, The Hon'ble Mr. C M.

In Burma the community whose needs and interests require to be specially considered is the Burmese community I should deprecate any special consideration being given to any other community The University of Burma should be a purely national university guiding and co-ordinating the intellectual activities of the Burmese and of the indigenous races of the province

WILLIAMS, Revd GARFIELD

- (a) Not at all in the government of the University Very largely in the government of the colleges.

WILLIAMS Reid GARFIELD—*contd*—WORDSWORTH The Hon ble Mr W C—YUSUF
Khan Sahib Maulvi MOHAMMAD

- (b) Not at all in the university courses Colleges should be at liberty to give what compulsory or optional teaching they like on any subject they like in any residence or group of residences under their control
- (c) The University should have nothing to do with this This is a matter for the college authorities who should be given power to do what they think best in respect of this matter

WORDSWORTH, The Hon ble Mr W C

I consider that the following should have their needs and interests specially considered in the government of the University in its courses of study and in its residential and other arrangements —

- (i) The Muhammadan community
- (ii) Those engaged in European education
- (iii) Those engaged or interested in women's education

It is advisable that efforts should be made to interest the non official and non educational community both Indian and European in the affairs of the University Of recent years the university's interpretation of the needs of the public it serves has been mainly inspired by one dominant personality with much resultant unrest A more catholic government would give wider satisfaction and disarm much hostility A more catholic constitution of the Senate might be accompanied by the reservation to Government of the right of nominating two members of the Syndicate this could be used to nominate e.g. a Muhammadan when as is usual neither the faculties nor the Senate elect one

YUSUF Khan Sahib Maulvi MOHAMMAD

- (a) It is desirable in view of the number of Muhammadans in this province and the increasing proportion of graduates among them that at least one third of the total number of members of the Senate should be from this section of the community Of the total number of a hundred senators fifteen should be elected by the registered graduates and of these fifteen seven should be Muhammadans For the remaining members of the Senate the principle of nominating one third from the Muhammadan one third from the Hindu and one third from the European community should be recognised There should be no *ex-officio* fellows except the Rector Chancellor Vice Chancellor Member of Education and the Director of Public Instruction Professors should be among the nominated members
- (b) It is a universal complaint among Muhammadans that religious instruction has not been recognised as part of the curriculum and many orientalists have been of opinion that educational systems in this land should have been based on the religious courses in the existing institutions The University cannot give satisfaction to the Muhammadan public until it makes sufficient provision in its courses of moral and religious text books which will in some measure compensate for the lack of scripture lessons and catechism in the school course I consider that this need cannot be met until there is a strong representation of Muhammadans on the senate text book committee and the boards of study and faculties because the mere acceptance of the principle is not enough it is necessary to have a group of men with definite views empowered as also required by the University to introduce books
- (c) As far as possible separate hostels for Musalmans and Hindus should be constructed and where this is not feasible owing to the small number of members of either community they should have separate accommodation in the same house with independent messing arrangement Seats should be reserved for Muhammadan students in colleges and hostels according to the population of the division Hostel accommodation should be provided for Muhammadan M.A. and law students

ZACHARIAH, K.

ZACHARIAH, K

My general answer would be—"As little as possible" As a free trader I do not believe in the protection of infant communities—and this for two broad reasons, besides special ones

- (i) Communal representation and division are inimical to the development of a corporate spirit. On the other hand, they tend to create factions and cause questions to be decided not on their intrinsic merit, but on party grounds.
- (ii) They tend, further, to keep the communities specially represented in a continued state of tutelage

There is nothing so invigorating and healthy as having to stand up and fight without special favour. To these general reasons may be added special ones applying particularly to a university. The component units of a university—which, like the State, is a *communitas communitatum*—are not racial or religious communities, but colleges. The test of a university is indeed whether it can melt diverse elements into a common culture—it must fuse, and not simply envelope. In this matter, we may take warning from the evil results of the division into "Nations" in mediæval universities. Everyone knows of the secession of the Germans from Prague in 1409. Here is an example from Oxford: "A more serious fray than usual between northern and southern students in the University in 1334 led to the retreat of the former who withdrew to set up a rival university at Stamford. The King was forced to recall the Northerners."

Nevertheless, certain exceptions are necessary

- (b) In the courses of study communal differences have, to a certain extent, to be considered, e.g., in allowing different vernaculars
- (c) In hostels different kitchens and dining-halls may be needed. (But see my answer to question 19)

QUESTION 23

- (i) Are there any points in which your answers to the foregoing questions would be different in respect of the needs of men and of women?
- (ii) To what extent and in what fields are additional and special facilities for higher education required for women?
- (iii) What are the peculiar difficulties and needs which affect the higher education of women in India?

ANSWERS

AIYER SIR P S SIVASWAMY

Additional and special facilities for higher education are required for women to enable them to take their proper place in the professions of teaching and medicine.

The system of early marriage interferes with the progress of higher education among Indian women but I am inclined to think that with the extension of the system of high schools and colleges staffed entirely by women there will be less and less objection to the sending of girls to high schools and colleges for the purpose of education. Medical colleges run by female doctors and taking in only female pupils will soon become a necessity. In fact it has been engaging the attention of certain medical missionaries and I believe also of Government.

ALI Nawab NASIRUL MAMALEK MIRZA SHUJAAT Khan Bahadur

- (i) So far as the Muslim females are concerned their guidance should be entrusted to Muslim gentlemen until the women are fit to give advice themselves.
- (ii) and (iii) To the proper education of Muslim females *purdah* and early marriage are the greatest obstacles. The prejudice of the past years against any and every kind of female education has considerably diminished but as this cannot be got rid of in a short time rearrangement should be made by appointing visiting female teachers who might go inside the *sanana* and teach Muslim *purdah* girls. Government should select important centres of Muslim population and there encourage the establishment of girls' schools and liberally help the existing ones with the ultimate view of making them training schools for teachers. Special care should be given to those places where old and aristocratic Muslim families live to enliven their sympathies and draw the students from that class which will carry influence with the general public and popularise female education. The greatest difficulty at present is to find trained female Muslim teachers even for the lowest forms and so far there seems to be no Government provision to remove this urgent want.

Association of University Women in India

- (i) It is not desirable that a lower standard should be required of women than of men in any department of study. In regard to professions equally open to men and women it is suggested that the standard of work and the curriculum should be the same.
- (ii) The special needs of India make necessary a training in mothercraft and child culture and in domestic science and domestic sanitation. It is suggested that special diploma courses in these subjects and in art, applied arts, home art, should be provided at a central teaching institute.

ASSOCIATION OF UNIVERSITY WOMEN IN INDIA *contd.*—BANERJEA, J. R.—BANERJEA, Dr. PRAMATHANATH—BANERJEE, GAURANGANATH.

- (iii) The peculiar difficulties which affect the education of women in India are:—
- (a) The *purdah* system
 - (b) The practice of early marriage.
 - (c) A widespread prejudice against education, even in its primary stages, based on mere conservatism
 - (d) A wider spread fear of higher education as likely to unsettle women and unfit them for home life.

The chief needs are:—

- (A) Training colleges
- (B) Women qualified and willing to undertake educational work both in schools and colleges It is thought that the improvement of school education would help the situation in regard to the higher education of women
- (C) Definite propaganda, stirring up the women who have received the advantages of higher education to a sense of service

It is thought that there should be some definite separate organisation to represent women in matters relating to the University, and that women should, in addition, be represented on the Senate

We would recommend that such separate body should include —

- (1) Two representatives of each affiliated college, one being the principal
- (2) Principals of affiliated schools
- (3) One representative of European secondary schools
- (4) Two representatives of the Association of University Women in India
- (5) One representative of the interests of medical students
- (6) Any other representative whom it may be necessary to co opt from time to time

That the Council should be a regularly constituted body meeting at stated intervals and forwarding its recommendations to the Syndicate

That this Council should be recognised by the Senate and should be supplied with all the literature, etc., that is supplied to the members of the Senate.

BANERJEA, J R

- (1) No
- (ii) For training of teachers and for medical education Women cannot go in for law as they are not allowed to practise in courts The career of a teacher, doctor, or inspectress is open to them Hence additional and special facilities for training of teachers and for medical education are required
- (iii) Girls in orthodox Hindu families are married early and hence the higher education of women is seriously affected.

BANERJEA, Dr. PRAMATHANATH.

The educational needs of women are not absolutely identical with those of men, but a course of general instruction is as necessary for the former as for the latter The question of special facilities for women should be carefully investigated with the help of persons who are intimately acquainted with the conditions of women's education in this country

BANERJEE, GAURANGANATH.

“With scrappy teaching, with no preparation for her subsequent calling as wife and mother, without any comprehension of the position of a man as a citizen, she becomes the life-companion of the latter But the family is still the mainstay of the nation and will remain so as long as the life of the State is healthy. The whole civic

education of the boy will give us much less anxiety if all girls are trained for their duties as wives *κατ' εξοχήν* —Dr Georg Kirschensteiner in *Education for Citizenship*

- (i) (a) For women who wish to prosecute their studies regularly in schools and colleges preparing themselves for the university examinations I suggest that there ought to be a separate arrangement for instruction with courses of study specially adapted to the characteristic needs of Indian women. For instance a graduated course in domestic economy principles of hygiene child psychology æsthetics fine arts etc. should form a part of the university curricula for women in lieu of certain abstract and abstruse technical and scientific subjects e.g. advanced mathematics technology chemistry geology zoology etc.
- (b) For women living under the *anana* system who owing to special social and economic reasons cannot attend a course of study in schools or colleges affiliated to the University I propose that a special course of instruction suited to their peculiar needs should be inaugurated and for this purpose strictly *pardahna* institutions (like the proposed Tikari College for Women) should be established where such a course could be completed within eight years beginning with their sixth year and ending with their fourteen.
- (iii) I consider the following causes as mainly affecting the higher education of women in India viz —
 - (a) Too early marriage
 - (b) Too early child bearing
 - (c) The *anana* system
 - (d) Depressed economic conditions of the middle class
 - (e) Peculiar social structure and environment
 - (f) Want of strictly *pardahnashin* schools and colleges

BANERJEE SIR GOOROO DASS

- (i) There are three main points in regard to which my answers to the foregoing questions would be different in respect of the needs of men and of women — namely —
 - (a) The subjects to be taught which should include those the study of which will impart knowledge or skill which will be useful to females in playing the part assigned to them by nature in their domestic and social spheres
 - (b) The institutions for teaching which in the case of females should be schools and colleges established exclusively for them
 - (c) Rules relating to the residence of students which in the case of females should be largely relaxed
- (ii) I do not think that any additional or special facilities for higher education are required for females by reason of any peculiarity in their mental constitution which if anything gives them advantage over males. And my limited experience leads me to endorse fully what the Sanskrit poet says —

To gather knowledge men must strive
 And over many volumes pore
 But favoured women all their lore
 With ease through Nature's grace derive

- (iii) The *anana* system and early marriage are institutions which create difficulties in the way of the higher education (as ordinarily understood) of women. But they serve useful purposes in their own way and rightly regulated they have their fair side and help a higher training spiritual if not intellectual which has made the Hindu wife and the Hindu mother when pain and anguish wring the brow the ministering angels that they have been

BANERJEE, Rai KUMUDINI KANTA, Bahadur—BANERJEE, MURALY DHAR—BANERJEE, SASI SEKHAR—BANERJI, The Hon'ble Justice Sir PRAMADA CHARAN

BANERJEE, Rai KUMUDINI KANTA, Bahadur.

- (i) Special subjects for studies, such as music, may be prescribed for female students
- (ii) In the field of teaching, especially in the secondary stage, additional and special facilities should be given. In Bengal female education is more backward, and one of the causes is the dearth of female teachers.
- (iii) Social customs, such as early marriage, affect the higher education of women in India.

BANERJEE, MURALY DHAR.

- (i) My answer to question 13 would be different in respect of women. In the secondary schools in Bengal girls should be taught sanitary science, domestic economy, and cooking in place of physical science, physiography, and geography in the higher classes.
In the colleges lady students should be taught child-psychology as an alternative to logic or science at the intermediate stage and rearing up of children and nursing of the sick as alternatives to an optional subject at the graduate stage
- (ii) In medicine, fine arts, and some branches of technology additional and special facilities for higher education are required for women
- (iii) The peculiar difficulties that affect the higher education for women in India are their early marriage and seclusion. To overcome these difficulties the following arrangements are needed —
 - (a) Besides an arts and science college separate medical, fine arts, and technical colleges for ladies should be established
 - (b) To enable married non-resident students to pursue their studies the lectures should be arranged at convenient hours, e.g., between 12 noon and 3 P.M. so as not to interfere with domestic duties
 - (c) Omnibuses should be provided at a moderate charge for all non-resident students
 - (d) The fees should not be prohibitive and there should be free studentships and stipends for meritorious poor students and widows

BANERJEE, SASI SEKHAR.

- (i) In some respects the needs of men are different from those of women. In regard to women my answer to question 7 should have no application. I do not think that there is any need for women to qualify in technological and applied science. My answer to question 22 would also be slightly different so far as parts (b) and (c) are concerned. The needs and interests of women should be specially considered by the University in its courses of study and in the residential and other arrangements
- (ii) Domestic science and hygiene may be made a special branch of study both at the intermediate and degree stages
- (iii) The *purdah* system and early marriage of girls that prevail in India offer special difficulties. To these may be added the absence of secondary schools for girls outside Calcutta and also the want of an adequate number of women teachers for schools and colleges

BANERJI, The Hon'ble Justice Sir PRAMADA CHARAN.

The chief difficulties in the way of higher education among women are the custom of *purdah*, or seclusion of women and early marriage. The best remedy would be the establishment of separate colleges for women

BARDALOI N C—BASU SATYENDRA NATH—Bengal Landholders Association
Calcutta—Bethune College Calcutta

BARDALOI, N C

I am not a great admirer of higher education of women till our men find sufficient means to feed them. Besides I find that the best traditions of national life are lost by training up Hindu girls on the model of European girls or of girls of other countries the ideals and religions of which are quite different from those of ours.

BASU, SATYENDRA NATH

The needs of men and women are not identical. The training of women should therefore be different from that of men.

Special facilities should be offered to women in the fields of medicine and pedagogy.

In formulating a scheme for the education of women the requirements of their social and domestic life should not be lost sight of.

Bengal Landholders Association, Calcutta

The question of university education for women in Bengal (and in India generally) is not so much an educational as a social question. There are social customs among our people (early marriage *purdah* and so on) which present an insuperable bar in the way of spreading university education among our women. And till these customs have been largely modified the discussion of such questions has hardly any practical bearing. Perhaps much can be done for female education by organising something in the nature of university extension lectures, but we doubt as to how far missionary work of this nature will fall within the scope of the activities of the University.

Bethune College Calcutta

- (1) Girls seeking university education fall into two classes—those who intend to qualify themselves for the teaching profession and those who study only for culture and accomplishment. The case of girls intending to join the medical profession does not arise as they may begin medical studies immediately after matriculation or at any stage of their college career.

Girls colleges accordingly should have two departments—a special department to train in educational theory and practice and a general department. The standards in the special department should be assimilated as far as may be to the university standards for the degree of teaching.

For the general department it is not necessary and is in fact undesirable that there should be the same rigid standards as those which in the circumstances of the country have to be fixed for boys in view of their qualifying themselves for the services or the professions. Each college should be allowed to fix its own courses of study and to grant leaving diplomas to its students. Such of them as may desire to have their attainments appraised by university standards in any subject may at their option present themselves for the university examinations in the subject it being undesirable for them to offer more than one subject at a time. The hustle of the examinations which is only a hard necessity in the case of our boys is good neither for genuine culture nor for physical health. The strain on health that it involves is recognised to be too much in the case of many boys and there can be no excuse for gratuitously exposing the future motherhood of the country to this wasting influence.

Women here should have greater freedom of study especially in subjects which may increase their practical value in life.

Bothuno Collego, Calcutta—*contd*

- (11) The particular needs of the education of women should be specially considered, not necessarily by the University which, however, must look after the interests of those women who follow a university course

Banerjee, Miss Marie There should be a special board consisting mainly, if not entirely, of women. The board should be entrusted with the promotion, guidance, and control of the education of women in general, irrespective of the communities to which they may belong. This board of studies should be independent of the University.

With reference to question 22(a) women's colleges and schools are, according to the present system, not at all represented in the government of the University. This seems a serious omission since men by themselves could not possibly be aware of all the needs and difficulties peculiar to a women's school or college. Institutions for women should be equally represented on the Syndicate and Senate of the University with those of men so that the question of women's education might no longer be subject to the ideas of men who, after all, must have very little knowledge of the special training needed by the women of India to equip themselves for life.

With reference to question 22(b) in university education the courses of study for women should remain mainly the same as that of the men, but among the optional subjects domestic economy, scientific needlework, and drawing might be specially included for women at the intermediate stage.

With reference to question 22(c) there should be no private hostels for women unless those hostels be placed under regularly recognised boards consisting mainly of women. It would be better, however, if there were a sufficient number of hostels or sufficiently large ones attached directly to the recognised colleges for women to meet the need for them. At present there is a great demand for more hostels for the women whose homes are in distant villages and who find it extremely difficult to find accommodation suitable from all points of view. There are even cases when students have had to give up higher education because they were unable to get into desirable hostels.

- (11) The higher education of women in India, as we understand it at present, means university education. This sort of education, however, is not suitable to all the women of India. It may be, in fact it is, necessary for those women of the Christian and Brahmo communities who desire, after completing their course of studies, to take up some career, e.g., medicine, teaching, etc. There are many, however, at present who have no such intention, but who follow a university course simply because there is no other system of education they can take up in order to satisfy their desire to acquire more knowledge than is to be obtained in the present high schools.

A separate system of education, other than university, might be introduced for such students whose numbers will gradually increase with the increase of proper facilities for the education of Hindu and Muslim girls.

Before writing further with regard to this system of education I would like to state that there should be more *pardah* schools for Hindu and Muslim girls where the teachers will be women only. Many Hindu and Muslim girls (and I even know of cases of Christian girls) are at present prevented from studying in certain girls' schools because of the presence of male teachers. And there are many Hindu and Muslim girls who are unable to study at all because there are not enough schools with only women on the staffs. There are also many Hindu girls who are prevented from continuing their studies after marriage for the same reason, though their people would most readily allow them to do so if only the staffs were all women. I know of similar cases with regard to university education. Remarks are often made by Indian men, even by Christian men (who are supposed to be more advanced in this respect than Hindus) against the presence of men in girls' schools and colleges.

Going back to my point with regard to a separate system of education, other than university, I need not emphasise the real want of a proper system of education for the increasing numbers of Hindu and Muslim girls, as well as for those Chris-

Bethune College Calcutta—*contd*

tians and Brahmos who do not intend to take up careers but who will marry sooner or later. It would do them and the future generation a world of good if they were taught how to manage their homes and bring up their children.

The curricula for such students should include a study of the vernacular mathematics English Sanskrit (Persian for Muslims) history geography nature study hygiene first aid domestic economy cooking needlework music and drawing—all according to scientific methods. During the two last years of the course some if not all the following subjects might be retained: vernacular English history cooking needlework music. To these should be added a simple study of the psychology of the child mind and of the training and management of children. The students who follow the above system would be expected to continue their studies until the age of eighteen years by which time the course should be completed for it is doubtful whether there will be more than a very few students for whom the above course is designed who will be allowed to continue studying after that age.

The board of studies for the direction of women's education referred to in question 23 should have directing and perhaps inspecting control over those schools which follow the above system for there should be one superior body to see that the same standard be observed throughout the province.

The board might consist partly of heads of women's institutions partly of women of university standing unconnected with educational institutions and partly of Indian women of position and some though not necessarily university education. These might possibly co-opt a few men to sit on the board.

There need be no public examinations for the women of these institutions. It should be sufficient for the head of every school to give certificates indicating the degree of success attained by the students before leaving school or college if the institutions be styled as such.

- (ii) The women in Calcutta are at present much exercised by the withdrawal of the *Janas* Miss A. L. facilities they have hitherto enjoyed of studying medicine in their own city. It is true that there were only a few women availing themselves of such facilities in the nature of things this was inevitable but the number would have increased.

The present policy seems to be to send all women desiring medical education to Delhi. No policy could be better calculated to kill out the growing desire of women to become qualified as doctors.

Delhi is 900 miles from Calcutta its vernacular is different—its university is naturally different—what fathers of young girls would be likely in this country (or even in England) to send their daughters 900 miles to what on account of the difference in the vernacular may be called almost a different country for the five years necessary to qualify as doctors?

Instead of discouraging like this the young womanhood of Bengal from taking up medicine everything should be done to encourage them to do so. Women doctors are wanted by the women of Bengal.

The present condition of women's education in India is a transitory one—the difficulties are chiefly due to the secluded position to which the women of India have been subjected since the Muslim invasion.

At the present time all will I think agree that the days of seclusion on the old lines are numbered and that the main problem of to-day is to make the transition from the past to the future in such a way as to avoid any disaster or reaction.

No body of men is competent to deal with the manifold problems which such a transition creates—only the women of India can do that. The co-operation of the men will be needed at every step but their contribution must be that of ready sympathy and of a determination to help the women in every way to realise their at present hidden capacities.

Bothune College, Calcutta *contd*

From what I have gathered from my contact with many types of Indian ladies I conclude that the two following distinct types of education are required by them —

- (a) An education for the majority whose mental outlook and capacity does not allow of university standards

For these a full education fitting them for their lives should be available and should be entirely in the hands of women and of such others as they may call into their councils

- (b) An education for the minority (but as years pass a constantly increasing minority) These require an education of the university type, but on much broader, more wholesome lines than is available at present

The solution of the problems connected with this type of education seems to lie in the admission to all the university boards, syndicates, and senates of a number of broadminded, representative women, who would voice the opinions of the women graduates and undergraduates and the general feminine public.

The result should be two-fold —

- (A) In those subjects of study common to men and women the University would be the richer by the greater breadth of view due to the admission of women to its councils
(B) Alternative subjects of study would be introduced into the university scheme, subjects which are at present absent because they appeal only (or more) to women

Each university would in this way be an Alma Mater to its daughters, as well as to its sons, providing each with the means of study in their own peculiar branches of learning and, at the same time, nothing would be labelled as a man's or woman's subject, each individual being free to choose those subjects in which he (or she) feels his (or her) power lies

Such a scheme would, I believe, suit the women of India better than a separate women's university This latter has been considered necessary because of the impossibility experienced so far of obtaining a proper foothold and position for women in the existing universities

It may indeed be necessary in order to develop women's education on the right lines to have some such separate universities and this for the following reasons —

- (1) On account of the early age of marriage which makes higher education impossible to so many girls if on exactly the same lines as men
- (2) On account of the necessity, in order to obtain present university standards at an earlier age, of teaching every subject (except English) in the vernacular

But with the general changes both in social customs and in the men's universities it is possible that the need of separate universities for women will pass away and they will be absorbed into others or will admit other colleges into their fold

It is to be hoped that the separation of men and women students into different universities, if it takes place at all, will not be a permanent one and that, with a saner and broader outlook on life as a whole, on the part of both men and women, it will be possible for them to avoid any such separation of the sexes, as separate universities would entail, during the important undergraduate years—a separation which would only result in making their future co operation in life more difficult

But if one university is to provide a bountiful education for both men and women then it must add to itself all the diversity and breadth which at present is lacking and to do this it must admit to all its councils representative women as well as representative men

Finally, I must state that to answer this question with any degree of practical usefulness it would be necessary to double the size of this report

Bethune College Calcutta—*contd*—Bethune College Calcutta Students of

- I hold most strongly that a commission of women should be at once appointed to deal with the whole of women's and girls' education in India. The need of an ideal of a plan for the whole of such education is the first and the greatest need.
- The Commission should consist of women as representative as possible women imbued with new ideas and aspirations women representing the more conservative forces women well versed in the ideals of India's ancient civilisation women representative of every community. With these should be associated western women who can give of their mature experience both in Europe and in India western women in sympathy with the formation of a real Indian type of womanhood a type founded on and developing from the heroic women of India past the Setas the Savitris the Damayantis than whom no finer women need be sought as models for the future ideal Indian women.
- The Commission would prepare a plan and to do this would study the past its aims and ideals its successes and its failures—the past not of India only but the educational past of other lands—and drawing from these a rich experience would be able to give India a plan that would allow of the moulding of present circumstances which are still quite plastic and of making them subserve the purpose of raising a fair fabric which should be a complete and well balanced structure calculated rather to serve future developments than *only* to deal with present needs.
- As the deliberations of such a commission would necessarily cover a long period no time should be lost in the formation of such a body.
- The result of the work of this commission would be almost unlimited there is no dearth of ideas among Indian women no dearth of energy among them when they feel that their ideas can be made to materialise—not only women's and girls' education in India would benefit from the deliberations of such a body but the world of women would be the richer and both directly and indirectly the education of the other half of mankind would derive much inspiration and assistance.

Bethune College, Calcutta, Students of

- (a) It is not desirable that there should be a separate university for women—
- (i) If there were one the field of competition would be for us women limited to that amongst ourselves only
 - (ii) If the standard were lower than that among men we women could not stand properly by the side of our brothers
 - (iii) We women do not want to lag behind
- (b) There must be a wider scope of subjects —
- (i) Bengali literature should be introduced into the university syllabus as a subject for men and women throughout the B.A. pass honours and M.A. courses
 - (ii) Science should be introduced into the college
 - (iii) Music needlework painting drawing hygiene and first aid should be taught in the college but attendance at these classes should be optional
- There need be no university examination in them but students should have the opportunity of receiving the culture to be had from their study.
- (c) The Bethune College should be fully affiliated up to the honours degree standard in all the following without delay —
- Philosophy economics history mathematics geography botany and in other science subjects such as physics chemistry physiology zoology as soon as the latter can be introduced
- (d) Assamese and Khasi should become university subjects up to the B.A. standard
 - (e) The prescribed courses in history for the I.A. and B.A. examinations are too long. They should be shortened.

Bothune College, Calcutta, Students of—*contd* —BHANDARKAR, Sir R G

- (f) Students (whether men or women) if they have failed at any one examination should, in order to be given a pass in it, be required only to pass in the subjects in which they have failed, provided that they pass in the failed subjects at the next ensuing examination
- (g) M A classes should be opened in the college and students should have opportunities to train for other professions than that of teaching
- (h) A museum should be attached to the college
- (i) Accommodation in the college should be increased in order to allow a greater number of students and a large choice of subjects
- (j) Advanced students should be given facilities to go abroad for further study
- (k) In the mufassal where colleges for men exist women students should be admitted
This would give many girls the opportunity of having a college education who at present cannot find a seat in the Calcutta colleges or whose parents, for a variety of reasons, do not see their way to sending them to colleges in Calcutta
- (l) The number of hostels for women students should be increased
- (m) In hostels for women students each student should have a separate cubicle
- (n) Women students should be given every possible opportunity for games, exercises and outings in the open air. We find we have many fewer opportunities for this than our brothers, mental work should be accompanied by physical exercise
- (o) Women students at college should be given that freedom and responsibility that will fit them to take charge of their pupils if they become teachers or of other young people in their own homes

SUNITI BALA GUPTA, *Fourth year prefect*

CHITRALKHA BANDYAPADHYAY, *Third year prefect*

KAMALA DAS, *Deputy second year prefect*

SUDHA DUTTA, *First year prefect*

TORUBALA SIN GUPTA, *Representative, fourth year*

SHAKUNTALA RAO, *Representative, third year*

HIRAN DE, *Representative, second year*

SUBODHBALA ROY, *Representative, first year*

BHANDARKAR, Sir R G

- (i) My answer to the preceding questions are applicable to the education of men and women generally
- (ii) But I think there ought to be separate high schools and colleges for women with, so far as possible, women teachers and professors, and the course of instruction should include music, drawing, painting, domestic economy, and sanitation. A large scope for the use of the vernaculars should be allowed in these institutions. When there are no separate institutions and women must attend the institutions established for men, they should have a separate building for residence, as well as for messing arrangements
- (iii) The custom of early marriages in the case of girls has prevailed for a very long period, but within the last thirty years the restraints it imposes have been slackening. But still in most cases girls are married before they are sixteen. If they get children between sixteen and twenty-one or twenty-two their education will be greatly hampered. But there are some girls who remain unmarried for life. And there is a large number of young widows in the present condition of our society in which early marriage is still widely prevalent and the practice of widow marriage is looked down upon and greatly discouraged even by highly educated young men who, on the death of their first wife, would marry rather a virgin of thirteen or fourteen than a young widow even below the age of twenty. There

BHANDARKAR SIR R. G.—*contd*—BHATTACHARJEE MOHINI MOHAN—BHATTACHARYA HARIDAS

is nothing to render the higher education of such young widows impracticable and for these and for girls who remain unmarried to a very late age as well as the few who choose a single life such educational institutions as we have got for men should be established for women with the modifications I have noted in my answer to (u) above

BHATTACHARJEE MOHINI MOHAN

- (u) The residential system cannot benefit female students and it cannot be insisted upon in their case for even among Brahmos and Indian Christians few would like to put their girls in hostels or boarding houses. If therefore the University is turned into a residential university female students should be permitted to stay with their friends or even distant relatives. There ought also to be a women's college where instruction should be given in all the ordinary subjects so that it may not be necessary for the students to go to other colleges to attend lectures. In other words inter collegiate co operation need not take place with the women's college. The lecturers there should also be women for in this country girls are accustomed only to talk freely with their own relatives. In the case of Hindu or Muhammadan girls it will very often be necessary to permit them to appear at examinations without attendance at lectures. Special scholarships will have to be established for poor students and a large number of educational appointments ought to be reserved for them. Science students should not be compelled to do practical work. More liberty might be given to medical students. A separate medical college for women may not be possible yet separate arrangements ought to be made as far as practicable.
- (iii) The *pardah* and the system of early marriage are the greatest obstacles to the higher education of Indian women so much so that higher education for women may almost be said to be beyond the scope of practical reform. No Hindu or Muhammadan woman of an orthodox type has ever joined a college or even read up to the higher classes in a school. The girls who receive university education are either Brahmo or Christian. Their number is small but it will slowly increase. All necessary facilities ought to be provided for their training. The time is far distant when the University will be called upon to make arrangements for the higher education of any large or even a decent number of girls in Bengal. At present vigorous attempts ought to be made to spread primary education amongst the girls and culture in the *zanana*.

BHATTACHARYA HARIDAS

- (i) I shall answer this question broadly from my personal experience in teaching ladies up to the M.A. standard. There ought to be a separation of the courses of study for men and women and I have no objection even if the Bethune College be raised to the status of a women's university. The time has not however come when women's education can be left entirely to them selves. The system of education and examination ought to be easier and the courses of study more suited to the needs of their sex. Domestic economy music etc. should be included as optional subjects. There should be facilities in the honours college for teaching ladies and also in the post graduate classes as at present.
- (ii) Ladies ought to be encouraged to study medicine and law and their courses in these subjects ought to be easier and limited to the essentials of these sciences. If women be not allowed to practice in law court they ought to be allowed to appear as juniors in cases where *pardahnaishin* women are plaintiffs or defendants.

BHATTACHARYYA, HARIDAS—*contd*—BHATTACHARYYA, Mahamahopadhyaya KALIPRASANNA—BHOWAL, GOVINDA CHANDRA—BOMPAS, The Hon'ble Mr C H.—BOROOAH, JNANADABHIRAM

- (iii) As it is more difficult for women to leave their homes I should suggest that a system of co education be allowed and encouraged in the mofussil colleges if the present system continues

The hostel arrangements at Calcutta ought to be improved, and boarders ought to receive lessons in music, painting, etc.

BHATTACHARYYA, Mahamahopadhyaya KALIPRASANNA.

- (i) In the curricula for women there ought to be subjects for fine arts, such as music, painting, etc., and in the high schools needle work also
(ii) The *pudah* system and early marriage are the principal drawbacks affecting the higher education of women in Bengal

BHOWAL, GOVINDA CHANDRA

- (i) In scientific, industrial, engineering, and legal education the needs of women will be different from those of men They should be trained in fine arts, such as painting, drawing and other useful arts, and particularly in the art of hygiene, child-rearing, and housekeeping Medical training is absolutely necessary for them.
(ii) For females, female teachers will be necessary
(iii) The manners and customs of the country, particularly the *zanana* system and marriage system prevalent at the present time, are great obstacles in the way of the high education of women In consideration of the functions they have to perform in society and the duties they have to perform in the family a general high education of women is not possible But there should be provision and facilities for the high education of those that can afford to have it and have a high mission in life and high ambitions and aspirations.

As women have begun to come to the front in all spheres of life provision should be reserved for their high education on an equal footing with men

BOMPAS, The Hon'ble Mr C H

The remarkable thing about Bengal is that although the men have taken to western education with greater alacrity than those in any other part of India, the women remain intensely conservative and, except in the small Brahmo community, the demand for the higher education of women is of the very slightest This state of affairs depends on social forces over which we have no control

BOROOAH, JNANADABHIRAM

- (ii) Women should be above everything else good mothers and good wives There should be no objection to their getting any degree—some of them must be prepared to take charge of girls' schools and colleges Female education is one of the most crying needs of this country Their sphere however, is in their homes They must be able to decorate their houses with their own pictures; they must be also good musicians Fine arts should be taught to our women

They make excellent doctors and nurses They are "ministering angels when pain and anguish wring the brow" They should be encouraged to take doctor's degrees

They must be excellent cooks culinary arts should be a part of the curriculum.

BOROOAH JYANADABHIRAM—*contd*—BOSE Rai CHUNILAL Bahadur—BOSE G 'C—
BOSE Miss H B

- (iii) The foremost difficulty in Assam is the lack of a college or even a girls high school. Some of our girls go to Calcutta and Girdih to be educated. If a college were started in Assam we would have more girls going in for higher education. A girls high school in Assam if not a college is most urgently needed.

BOSE, Rai CHUNILAL, Bahadur

- (i) Generally speaking the education of women in this country should be somewhat on a different basis from that for the men. The majority of Indian girls in the present conditions of society cannot devote many years of their life to school education consequently in their case the courses of instruction should be so regulated as to give them the largest amount of useful knowledge within the smallest limit of time. Their education for the most part should be through the medium of the vernaculars and literature arithmetic history geography hygiene and domestic economy should form the main part of their curriculum. They should also be taught to read and write English correctly. A special school certificate granted by the University at the end of such a course would greatly encourage female education in this country.
- As for those girls who would aspire to university degrees I would make no distinction in the courses of study or in the period over which they extend. I would only suggest that special branches as alternative subjects may be prescribed for girls such as music drawing painting sewing embroidery work etc. I would further suggest that girls taking no scientific subjects should be allowed to appear as non collegiate students without going through a regular course in a college.
- (ii) Special facilities should be given to women for medical education.
- (iii) Social customs and usages.

BOSE G C

The number of colleges for women should be increased and their courses of studies specially adapted to their natural requirements.

BOSE Miss H B

- (i) As regards women they require special teaching in domestic economy and music. It would be an advantage if arrangements were made in existing schools for pupils for teaching domestic economy.
- The University of Calcutta ought to have a faculty of music for granting degrees of music. Music should be introduced into the university curriculum from the matriculation stage.
- (ii) Women have not the legal career open to them. They are not allowed to practise in courts of law. Hence they must become teachers inspectresses or doctors. Therefore it is absolutely necessary that additional and special facilities for teachers diplomas or degrees should be provided for them. Government should have teachers training colleges for women.
- The Bethune College ought to have arrangements for I Sc teaching for the study of subjects like physics and chemistry is necessary for medical education.
- (iii) The difficulty is that girls of orthodox Hindu families are withdrawn from schools at a very early age and this seriously affects the education of women in India. As regards needs the question has been already answered in (i).

BOSE, KHUDI RAM—BOSE, MISS MRINALINI—CHAKI, Rai Sahib NRITYA GOPAL—
CHAKRAVARTI, BRAJALAL

BOSE, KHUDI RAM.

- (i) and (ii) Our lady students—under-graduates and graduates—should have larger facilities provided for them in the direction of ethical and æsthetic culture. The study of mathematical and physical sciences even at the matriculation stage should be rendered wholly optional, and the practice of some of the branches of fine arts should be made compulsory in the interest alike of domestic economy, æsthetic culture, and refinement.
- (iii) Abject poverty of Indian households, comparatively early marriages, and delicacies and refinements peculiar to Indian womanhood, constraining them to keep themselves religiously aloof from a crowded medley of young men in higher college forms, impose themselves as so many insuperable barriers to the “higher education” of women in India as conceived in its occidental acceptation.

BOSE, MISS MRINALINI.

- (i) The only existing Government college for women in the Presidency, viz., the Bethune College, should be improved and staffed so that it may compare with any of the first-grade colleges for men affiliated to the Calcutta University. Some good high schools for women may be opened in some of the large mofussil towns.
- (ii) Some of the difficulties are —
 - (a) Early marriage
 - (b) Observation of caste, and the social practice of not sending girls to any boarding institution among the Hindus and Muhammadans
 - (c) *Purdah* system
 - (d) Social prejudices against the higher education of women
 - (e) Want of suitable institutions, with proper arrangements for tuition and residence of those women who observe caste and *purdah*

At least one good high school (for the present) entirely staffed by qualified women teachers where *purdahnashin* Hindu and Muhammadan women may study is needed in Bengal. There should be separate hostel arrangements for Hindus and Muhammadans. Young married women without children may also be admitted as boarders.

CHAKI, Rai Sahib NRITYA GOPAL

- (i) For women English as the medium of instruction should not be made compulsory. Bengali or Urdu ought to be made the medium of instruction.
- (ii) Additional and special facilities for higher education in medicine ought to be given to women.
- (iii) Among orthodox Hindus and Muhammadans the early marriage of girls and the *zanana* system are the two principal peculiar difficulties which affect the higher education of women in India.

CHAKRAVARTI, BRAJALAL.

Women occupy a peculiar position in the domestic and social life of the Hindus, and the traditions of the family are kept up mainly by them. It is strictly enjoined in the religious books of the Hindus that females should not be allowed to come under any influence outside that of the family. For this reason no system of school and college education can be made to suit their requirements. Moreover, the

CHAKRAVARTI BRAJALAL—*contd*—CHANDA The Hon'ble Mr KAMINI KUMAR—
CHATTERJEE RAI LALITMOHAN Bahadur

system for the education of our boys has not as yet been working satisfactorily and cannot be said to have passed beyond the stage of experiments. Under the circumstances we do not venture to undertake any new experiment regarding the education of our girls. I may at the same time point out that women get sufficient moral and practical training in the household and that is far more important than the type of education our schools can give.

CHANDA The Hon'ble Mr KAMINI KUMAR

The Education Department and medical profession are practically the only openings for women and their education should accordingly be regulated.

CHATTERJEE RAI LALITMOHAN Bahadur

- (1) My suggestions with regard to the education of women in India would be entirely different from those I have ventured to offer about the proper education and training of men.

My idea of a college and school for Indian girls is briefly as follows —

A large garden with four or five houses, not very big, home-like and after the modern Indian fashion, more or less. The houses should be big enough to accommodate altogether say a hundred girls. No separate college or school building is necessary. Each house should have one or two sitting rooms which would serve for class-rooms when required. Only a small range of laboratories, simply furnished, would have to be added. There should be no more *purdah* in the school and college than there is in ordinary Indian homes now-a-days. Cooking (as far as caste rules permit), keeping the houses in order, nursing, entertaining guests, keeping accounts, looking after the garden, supervising sanitary arrangements—everything should be done by the girls by turns under the watchful eyes of each house-mistress. The house-mistress should be an elderly Hindu widow of a respectable family, not necessarily one of the teacher, nor even a graduate. The teachers should preferably be women, but competent women teachers are few. There is no harm in having men teachers just to come for the lectures. Male servants may be kept as in Indian households. Women visitors and male relations of the boarders up to the age of ten should be free to come and go. There should be fixed hours for lecture, which should be few. In other matters the girls should enjoy the freedom of home.

Indian music, painting, needlework, hygiene and sanitation should be compulsory for every girl, though not necessarily for examination. Elementary physics, chemistry, botany, and physiology should be compulsory subjects for study at different stages. The curriculum should also include —

- (a) An outline of the history of the world with geography.
- (b) The histories of England and India in greater detail.
- (c) A course of English literature with training in English conversation.
- (d) A course of Bengali literature.
- (e) A short course of Sanskrit literature.
- (f) Elementary mathematics.

These various subjects should be spread out over the whole period of a girl's stay at school and college. The medium of teaching should be Bengali.

Girls should enter school at the age of nine. The preliminary training before that should be given at home. They should cover the school course in four years and the college course in three and reach the leaving stage in seven years, that is at the age of sixteen. During this period there should be no university

CHATTERJEE RAMANANDA—*contd*—CHATTERJEE SATIS CHANDRA—CHAUDHURI The Hon ble Justice Sir ASUTOSH

For some subjects of secondary importance learnt by boys and young men domestic science may be substituted for girls and women

The arrangements for recreation play and refreshments should be for women students the best possible Their class rooms should be very spacious and perfectly well lighted and ventilated Their benches or other seats should be such as not to directly or indirectly cause any physical deformity For physiological reasons the percentage of lectures to be attended by them should be less than in the case of male students

In the Education Department the salaries of women teachers should for the same kind and grade of work be higher than for men teachers. This is necessary because unmarried women of the *bhadralok* class in our country require a female companion or attendant or a male relative, to live with them when working away from home which is not the case with single male teachers. It is also necessary in order to attract distinguished lady graduates to the service and keep them there

Whether my suggestion regarding external degrees be accepted for male students or not it should be accepted for women students. Those girls and women who pass examinations as private external or non collegiate students should be eligible for scholarships if their merit entitles them to the same. The number of scholarships for girls and women should be greatly increased Government ought to spend at least as much for the education of girls and women as for that of boys and men The sums spent for female education at every stage should be separately shown in all provincial and Imperial educational reports. My suggestions in this connection deserve serious consideration as the only practicable means of spreading higher education among women to an adequate extent.

Though at present healthy places like Madhupur Dighar Giridih etc. are beyond the administrative boundaries of Bengal every encouragement ought to be given to the starting of recognised or unrecognised classes or institutions for girls and women in those places and in the hamlet of Santiniketan in Bengal for those Bengali women and girls of the *bhadralok* class can move about freely in the open air which is an essential condition of healthy existence for all and particularly for brain workers.

The vernacular ought to be and may easily be recognised as the medium of instruction and examination for girls and women to a wider extent than for boys and men For most girls and women who receive education do not seek posts in the public services but only want to be literate and cultured

CHATTERJEE SATIS CHANDRA

- (u) In connection with female education it is desirable to have separate colleges and different courses of studies which should be so prescribed as to secure for women the highest training especially in certain household industries in the vernacular the principles of morality of practical hygiene and in child and education psychology These are essentially necessary for the higher education of women in India

CHAUDHURI, The Hon ble Justice Sir ASUTOSH

- (u) I am against Bengali women going through university examinations as now conducted - They suffer in health Girls schools in Bengal have not been progressive Early marriage and the *purdah* system stand in their way A limited class of women wants to go up for university degrees Separate colleges may be founded for them Our efforts should be directed to improve the schools Women who want to go to the University should have the same facilities as men but special facilities for them are not wanted and need not be provided There is scope for work for them in medicine and as teachers

CHAUDHURI, BHUBAN MOHAN—CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Babu KISHORI MOHAN—
CHOUDHURY, Rai YATINDRA NATH—CHOWDHURI, DHIRENDRANATH

CHAUDHURI, BHUBAN MOHAN

- (ii) The education of women should be different from that of men. Their education should be such as will fit them for the duties which they will have to perform in the world. Their text-books and standards of examination should be easier, and they should be placed, as far as possible, under female teachers. The *purdah* system prevalent both among the Hindus and the Muhammadans stands in the way of giving higher education to Indian women. Arrangements should be made for giving their education at home with the help of peripatetic female teachers brought up according to Indian ideals.

CHAUDHURI, The Hon'ble Babu KISHORI MOHAN.

- (ii) The problem of the education of our women is a very complicated one owing to the peculiar customs of our country in matters of caste and marriage. For such of our women as desire higher education, separate colleges should be established and facilities should be given for imparting such special education as may be necessary for girls who marry early. The education of women should be conducted with the object of making them fit partners in life for men and good mothers of future generations, and not the rivals of men in the ordinary works of life. Colleges for women should make special provision for a thorough teaching of such subjects as music, domestic management, and cookery. The subject, however, is of sufficient complexity and importance to justify the appointment of a special committee for its thorough investigation.

CHOUDHURY, Rai YATINDRA NATH

- (ii) The question of the education of our women, especially their higher education, is very difficult and complex. It is doubly so in a country like India. God has by differentiation of the sexes naturally sanctioned practically different sets of duties for men and women. In educating our women we should keep this always in our view. Education practically considered is that which fits us for life and, consequently, that education is the best which fits us most for life. Now the chief concern of our women should be —

- (a) Domestic life
- (b) Rearing up of children
- (c) Participation in the general social life
- (d) Real partnership of our life with a better power for the stimulation of our higher and nobler virtues

Each of these except the third requires separate treatment in the education of women. It is, therefore, necessary that we should have separate colleges and, if possible, separate universities for women with separate curricula. The subject has not received that amount of close attention both from our Government and our countrymen which its supreme gravity requires and eminently deserves. This should form the subject for a separate commission.

CHOWDHURI, DHIRENDRANATH

The peculiar difficulties in the way of higher education of women are two—early marriage and *purdah* system. There is a need of more colleges in the country. From time to time it has been found out that arrangements are not made for the study of all the subjects girls want to take up. Facilities are not always given for the spread of higher

CHOWDHURI DHIRENDRA NATH—contd.—CULLIS Dr C E—DAS Dr KEDARNATH—
DAS GUPTA KARUNA KANTA

education to its utmost extent in the case of women. But to me it appears that money spent on their higher education is money spent for the spread of real education in the country. Our women pursue knowledge for its own sake; they are not aspirants for Government service. Institutions educating our women are not service securing agencies but enlighteners of hearts. Here the University has got an opportunity to give real education. So more attention should be paid to the improvement of the existing ones and the establishment of new ones. But quite the reverse is found to be the case. A veritable step motherly attention is paid to them. Both men and women are human beings. Both possess the same mind to be developed. The Upanishads says—

‘The Soul is neither male nor female’

So in imparting higher education by which intellect is developed, heart is broadened and will is strengthened, there needs be made no distinction between man and woman. Humanity in both of them should be equally developed. Without this no nation can prosper.

But female education has been woefully neglected in the country. If any distinction between men and women is to be made it should be kept in mind that women should not be detached from their home surroundings. If the boarding system is introduced for them it should be as far as possible a substitute for the home. They should not be placed under foreigners. Unfortunately this has been the case in more than one important institution. It can be said without any reflection on the merits of the lady in charge of the Bethune College that she with the best intentions possible cannot prove a mother to the Indian girls under her. She cannot enter into their feelings and they into hers—they are so diversely opposed by early training and surroundings. Instead of being developed their hearts would get a check, their wills instead of being properly trained would get a wrong bent. There must be misunderstandings and misunderstanding is at the root of nine tenths of the evils wrought in human society.

CULLIS Dr C E

- (i) The foregoing answers apply to men students only; university education for women being only possible where the traditional habits of the country have been discarded. The elementary and secondary education of women is specially important because of the influence it would have on that of children, but it is rendered difficult by the early age of marriage and the secluded lives led by women.
- (ii) The higher education of women in medicine would be of special value.
- (iii) There is need for women as teachers and medical advisers.

DAS Dr KEDARNATH

- (ii) Higher education should be conducted under similar conditions both for men and women. Medical education has been imparted to women under the same conditions as men without any inconvenience and with the best of results. Slight modifications may be necessary and can be accomplished without any trouble or inconvenience.

DAS GUPTA KARUNA KANTA

- (i) Girls should have ordinarily nothing to do with the science course except so far as it will help them to study medicine. Domestic economy, cooking and nursing may replace some of the existing courses of study especially geometry. In their case the medium of instruction should be the vernacular throughout their career in school and colleges. The study of English and the existing medium of instruction in English even in schools stand in the way of female education in Bengal.

DATTA, BIRENDRA KUMAR—DR. HAR MOHUN—DR. SATISCHANDRA—DR. LA HEY,
Miss D

DATTA, BIRENDRA KUMAR

- (ii) I am for the establishment of a separate university for women. At least, there should be a separate Director of Public Instruction to look after their education. At present, the education of women has not received that attention from Government which it should owing to the apathy of the public in this respect. There should be established a high English school for girls in each district town and a college for women in each division. There should also be started for women a separate medical college or at least a medical school and greater facilities should be allowed to them to qualify as doctors and midwives.

DR. HAR MOHUN.

- (i) For women whose course of study is other than linguistic vernacular should be the medium of instruction and of examination.
(ii) We have at present but very little higher education for women. It requires great expansion in every direction.
(iii) The questions of *purdah* and early marriage stand in the way of the higher education of women in India. In order to help them the system of education now obtaining in India ought to be thoroughly changed. This can be done by only those who are specially regarded by the country and they ought to be free from any foreign influence, otherwise they are sure to lose the confidence of the people and the whole schedule would come to nothing.

DR. SATISCHANDRA

- (ii) Women—I speak of Hindu women—should be educated, so that they may perform efficiently their legitimate duties in their married state, and so that they may earn their livelihood when they become widows. After such an education their higher intellectual craving should be satisfied. The physical and moral sides of their education should not be ignored.

DR. LA HEY, Miss D

I am not familiar with educational work in Bengal, and can only speak from my experience in Madras, and from my experience of the higher education of the women of this presidency.

- (i) Although girls who seek a university degree must necessarily take the same course as that laid down for men I think an institution something on the lines of Professor Karve's Women's University would be helpful for many girls. Girls often wish to continue beyond their high school course without taking up quite such strenuous and purely literary work as the University demands of them. Such an institution should include music, painting, domestic economy etc., in its curriculum. I do not think it should claim the title of a university, nor perhaps should it even claim to be part of a university. It would, however, be necessary for it to grant some diploma or other if it was to enjoy any popularity.
(ii) In this presidency the most pressing need at this moment is greater facility for girls for the prosecution of higher studies in science subjects. The two colleges for women are both, however, working to meet this need, and, after the war, this difficulty should no longer exist.

The next pressing need is that of a medical college for women. It is beyond doubt that girls in this country make better progress if they can study in institutions.

DE LA HEY Miss D—contd—DEY BARODA PROSAUD—D SOUZA P G—DUTT REBATI RAMAN

specially set apart for them. The Lady Hardinge College at Delhi of course offers this facility but the distance is very great for girls from other parts of India and the courses of the Punjab University do not always coincide with the preparation given for the medical course by other universities.

- (iii) The peculiar difficulties and needs which affect the higher education of women in this presidency are the custom of early marriage and the few facilities for studying apart from men. The custom of early marriage takes girls away from school at an early age and prevents a large number from proceeding to higher education. Both in the high school and college classes girls in the mofussil often have to study with boys and as a rule they seem to get little help and real training in such cases unless they are in small classes e.g. B.A. honours. There is very little in the way of hostel accommodation in Madras for Hindu school girls from the mofussil and though both women's colleges are fully residential in character parents are often reluctant to send their girls away from home at all. It is hard to see how either of these difficulties can be met. The custom of early marriage is not likely to die out quickly. Government or private bodies cannot be expected to put down girls' high schools and women's colleges throughout the country when the demand is comparatively small. Development of one of the Madras high schools into a boarding school for Hindu girls seems a hopeful scheme. The hostel accommodation of the two women's colleges is already well appreciated.

DEY, BARODA PROSAUD

- (i) There would not be any appreciable difference in the answers to the previous questions in respect of the needs of men and of women except in the matter of hostels greater care should be taken in the hostels for women and courses of study may be made a little less rigid in the case of women.
- (ii) Additional and special facilities for higher education should be given to women in the fields of medicine and teaching.
- (iii) Early marriage *purdah* system general poverty and want of a suitable calling after the university career are the peculiar difficulties which affect the higher education of women in India.

D'SOUZA P G

Women are withdrawn from education at a very early age. It is therefore necessary to ensure that a large proportion of female pupils get a maximum of training before they are about fourteen. This can only be done by educating them through the vernacular. English may be a compulsory second language but this is not so necessary as in the case of boys. It is also necessary that the curricula of women's instruction should be different from those of men but there should be no objection in the university stage for women to take up men's courses if they consider them more suitable. At present women may be specially trained for teaching medicine domestic science. A little business training may also be given.

Indian women do not readily take to such occupations as typewriting stenography signalling etc. at present. In the absence of a strong commercial motive for education combined with peculiar social customs and habits progress in female education is bound to be slow.

DUTT REBATI RAMAN

It is unnatural to drill all women to the man's course. Women have their special needs and temperaments and their courses should be particularly suited to them.

DUTT, RABATI RAMAN—*contd* DUTTA, PROMODE CHANDRA DUTTA, RABINDRA MOHAN.

The matriculation course will be the same as for boys with the addition that sewing, tailoring, and the Indian system of domestic machine should particularly be taught to them. Their college course will be over in three years, the intermediate examination taking place one year after the Matriculation and the final course two years after the intermediate course, and the college course will necessarily be simpler than that for boys. Religious instruction should be a part of their daily course and a particular examination should be held on Indian theology though there will be no university test in it. No age restriction should be kept for girls. The girls' college course is likely to be over in this way at the age of eighteen and the present marriageable age for girls has slowly risen to that already and many Hindu fathers in towns may keep their girls in school or college to that age. But the great responsibility for the spread of female education lies on us. We have to accept our girl graduates with all warmth and admiration without regarding them as blue stockings. For no class of beings however able and self-sacrificing will ever choose the most rigorous discipline of maidenhood for the selfish task of teaching our girls. No particular denomination can serve this cause very long. We ourselves have to take up the task of our girls' education, with the natural concerns of our women's life, with our own wives and sisters, and we ourselves have to accept that particular denomination as one of us in grateful warmth for all that it has done. Charity makes us gods of men and Love will wash away the memories of pain.

DUTTA, PROMODE CHANDRA

- (iii) Education on present lines is too denationalising for women, and hence there is a genuine desire to hold aloof from the movement for female education.

Female education must be under the control of the Hindu and Muslim inspectors.

Unless girls' schools are run on more orthodox lines female education cannot make much progress through Government educational agency.

DUTTA, RABINDRA MOHAN

- (i) The educational needs of men and women in India will in all cases be determined by the ideal of life before us. We do not want that women in India should continue to labour under the darkness of ignorance and superstition, or cling unreasonably to fossilised remains of the past out of which every semblance of life has vanished and thus be always in continual conflict and disagreement with their educated husbands, brothers or sons. But we do not want at the same time that women in India should be steadily anglicised importing into our peaceful homes the evils of suffragetteism or the spirit of revolutionary and racialistic iconoclasm, condemning all our ancient institutions that are the outcome of a long past and are a part of our flesh and blood as it were. The object of university education both for men and women ought to be rather a reconstruction of our own past in the light of the changed conditions of the modern world than a total disregard of the past and an attempt to build a new world of our own in a craze for western mimicry. Our past, like the past of every other nation, consists of many good things mixed up inevitably with evil, and the world of modern science is likewise made up of good and evil things most intimately mingled with one another. Under such circumstances our object in university training always ought to be in the first place to enable our students to adapt themselves to the life of to-day, which involves a general knowledge of the past as well as of the present, and in the next place to give a specialised training in particular branches of knowledge.

DUTTA RABINDRA MOHAN—*contd*—GEDDES PATRICK

- (ii) From this standpoint it is necessary that in secondary schools the training given to women should be different from that given to men and in the university stage the method of training women should be different from the method of training men.

The function of secondary schools should be viewed from two different angles of vision. They prepare students for university life; they prepare boys and girls who are unable to prosecute studies in the University for the struggles and needs of worldly life. In the case of women in this country as they marry at a very early age and have to look after domestic affairs as soon as they enter married life they in most cases are unable to complete their course of studies in secondary schools and the secondary schools for girls as they are at present do not prepare them for the duties of domestic life.

- (iii) To refer though from the standpoint of university education the work done in secondary schools need not be different in the case of women from that done in the case of men from the other standpoint indicated above there ought to be a difference. This requires that our girl in their school career should not only have an intellectual equipment that would make them fit companions for their educated relatives but also acquire some knowledge of things that is necessary in domestic management and in the life of maternity which begins very early in life in this country. Their course of studies in secondary schools should therefore not only include Indian history, the geography of the world, arithmetic, books on contemporary Indian national life and citizenship and elementary principles of science but also books on Indian domestic duties on Indian feminine ideal on the laws of health, duties of maternity and practical training in needle work, cooking, etc. A knowledge of the English language will also be necessary for them for the right and proper understanding of their brethren who receive an English education and often express their ideas in English.

In the Brahmō Girls School at Calcutta and the Mahakali Pathshala instruction is given to girls to some extent on the lines suggested by me but much still remains to be done.

Widow life or hostel life for female students in India is not at all desirable at present. It is prolific of nothing but evil consequences on Indian domestic life and unduly anglicises the mind of young female students without any corresponding gain.

- (iv) The university education of females in Bengal if it is really meant to be popular and widespread cannot be effectively advanced by the establishment of colleges like the Bethune College for almost none except Brahmo and Christian ladies who again are an insignificant minority in Bengal will ever attend them. For the spread of university education among female who do not like the Brahmo and Christian ladies come out of the *purdah* the University must employ a number of touring female tutors teach the students at their own homes and supply them with books of reference from a common lending library meant exclusively for them. This system of touring lady tutors should be adopted by secondary schools for the female students of their higher classes. So many of these are married before they finish their course of education in secondary schools after marriage they are not allowed to attend any public school.

The system of touring female tutors tried by Christian missionaries in this province has been found to work effectively whereas the establishment of colleges like the Bethune College or the Ravenshaw Girls College at Cuttack has been useless so far as the majority of the population is concerned.

GEDDES, PATRICK

This peculiarity is a question of the psychology of the sexes even more than of their psychology, and of course of both within their place in social and moral life. As

GEDDES, PATRICK—*contd* —GHOSA, PRATAPCANDRA—GHOSH, BIMAL CHANDRA.

I believe that our curricula demoralise men so I am convinced not merely by statistics, but by lifelong observation, that they sterilise women, and this to a serious extent, in every sense of that word. Again, as but a single illustration of the contrast of studies, a man's view of economics is of "the production, distribution, and consumption of wealth," and a docile parrot-woman learns this, more precisely, and "does well in the examination." But a thinking woman begins with its consumption and comes to family budgets, etc., beyond mere money wages.

Every study is thus bisexual in its perspective, and that universities do not see this is only another example of their present senescence. Yet with this view, I believe all the more in the mutual education of the sexes, as well as in their independent needs and disciplines.

These answers are, however, already so long that I cannot continue this subject nor enter into its details. Enough if I emphasise the above views as suggesting a thorough distrust of those educationists who forget that Apollo and Pallas are not mere sexless ideals of culture.

GHOSA, PRATAPCANDRA

(iii) The paucity of highly educated men

GHOSH, BIMAL CHANDRA

- (i) A greater relaxation as regards attendance at lectures and college examinations is required in the case of ladies. An "*Aegrotat*" degree may be given to such candidates when recommended by the principal and the professors.
- (ii) Special facilities are required for women in—
 - (a) Training as teachers, especially as school teachers
 - (b) Medical education
 - (c) Scientific training
 - (d) Training in music and domestic science
 - (e) Training in certain technological subjects, *e.g.*, embroidery and designing, and agriculture and dairy farming
 - (f) Training in nursing and sanitary science and midwifery

A diploma in nursing, another in sanitary science for health visitors, another in midwifery would go a great deal to make these professions "respectable" and, therefore, popular with educated women of the better classes.

(iii) The difficulties and needs are

- (a) The question of conveyances to and from the college
- (b) The question of residence

These two are best solved by locating ladies' colleges in district towns.

- (c) The question of physical exercise and recreation
- (d) The question of the strain of examinations

Under the present system women do better when they take three years over the usual stages instead of two.

For the adequate and proper discussion of these questions, and for first-hand opinion on all matters pertaining to the education of women, women graduates should be represented on the Senate and the boards of studies and one at least should sit on the Syndicate. A beginning in this direction has been made by including the principals of the Bethune and Diocesan colleges on the post-graduate council in arts. An extension of this proceeding is needed in all the departments of the University.

GHOSH RAJ HARINATH Bahadur—GHOSH JNANCHANDRA—GHOSH RAJ Bahadur NISI KANTA—GOSWAMI BHAGABAT KUMAR Sastri—GOSWAMI RAJ Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN

GHOSH, RAJ HARINATH, Bahadur

- (ii) Doctors and sanitarians
- (iii) The *purdah* system and early marriage constitute special difficulties in the matter of the higher education of women

Poverty is another difficulty. People naturally prefer to educate their boys well knowing that in future they will make them happy and comfortable in their old age and glorify their family whilst the girls after marriage will be at the mercy of others. These difficulties I am afraid all stand seriously in the way of expansion of education high or low among women.

In the matter of the education of girls there is also another important need for more *boarding houses* where girls of school going age can have accommodation. There are many among the richest of this country who are quite capable of bearing the expense of the higher education for their girls and are not believers in early marriages but they do not find places where their girls can be kept and trained in high education or in a sanitary mode of living.

GHOSH JNANCHANDRA

I think there should be a separate university for women. But if that be not feasible their courses of study should be made different from and much simpler than those for men.

GHOSH RAJ Bahadur NISI KANTA

- (i) Some elementary courses should be provided in domestic hygiene domestic economy sanitation cookery and sewing
- (ii) In Medicine

GOSWAMI BHAGABAT KUMAR Sastri

- (ii) Under the customs of the country Indian women do not enjoy the same freedom of movement as western women especially after childhood. Yet in the interests of the whole country and the race they must be educated. Conditions therefore must be brought into being which will make possible wider and wider diffusion of education among women. Starting a large number of new institutions exclusively for the education of women and providing facilities for them apart from boys are certainly necessary. Lower tuition fees and suitable arrangements for conveyance where necessary are some of these facilities.
- The most important step in the training of women however must be taken in the direction of the introduction of a somewhat different curriculum for girls. Along with some general education girls must be taught things which will be of service to them in their womanhood. They should be trained according to their liking in useful arts and handicrafts. This will enable them to earn a living in case of necessity and in any case will provide them with possible sources of income. There should also be facilities for the training of widows in such institutions for obvious reasons. Where necessary they should be trained free of all charges.

GOSWAMI RAJ Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN

- (ii) Such women as study medicine law etc. as the avocation of their life should receive a liberal education and facilities for such education should be afforded to them by starting women's colleges and hostels under the control of qualified lady principals teachers and superintendents.

GOSWAMI, Rai Sahib BIDHUBHUSAN—*contd* —GOSWAMY, HARIDAS—GUHA, JITES
CHANDRA—GUHA, RAJANIKANTA—HAJDAR, Dr HIRALAL

- (iii) The social system of the Hindus and the Muhammadans stands in the way of their women prosecuting studies in public schools beyond a certain standard attainable by them before they are married. Within this limit they should receive such training as would make them thrifty, God-fearing and considerate housewives, faithful wives, loving and noble hearted mothers, and a source of blessing to the houses or families with which their lot may be cast by the irrevocable and sacred ties of marriage.

GOSWAMY, HARIDAS.

- (i) The education that is provided for girls should not be of the same type as that for boys. The existing system does not take note of this fundamental principle and shape the course for girls accordingly with a view to train them for their future position as wives and mothers. It is not wise to implant in them, by means of education, tastes which they would not have an opportunity to gratify in their after-life, and thus to sow the seeds of future discontent and discord. The effect of this indiscriminate imparting of high western education to our girls has had the unfortunate result of unsexing our educated women and of denationalising them,—a result bad enough even in the case of boys, but infinitely worse in the case of future mothers.
- (ii) While, therefore, university education may be provided only for those who are to become teachers and doctors the education of the majority should be such as to prepare them for the duties of wifehood and motherhood.
- Bearing these principles in mind I would confine their education to religious and moral instruction, a thorough literary knowledge of the vernacular, a decent working knowledge of English, a simple scientific education in the laws of sanitation, hygiene, rearing up of children, and first aid, some art, as music, painting, drawing, or needlework to fill the idle hours of life, and plenty of physical exercise.

GUHA, JITES CHANDRA.

There ought to be a women's college in every district in Bengal and two or three such colleges in Calcutta.

GUHA, RAJANIKANTA

- (1) Education for women should be of two types in Bengal. Up to the matriculation standard the courses of study should be identical for all students, male and female. At the university stage there should be a bifurcation. The object of the one type should be to provide for the higher studies of such of the girls as are physically and intellectually capable of profiting by them, and that practically on the same footing with their brothers. As the number of these will not be large there ought to be a second type which will aim at giving the bulk of the female students a training which will enable them to fulfil their legitimate functions in the family and society, and to be good wives and mothers. The curricula for this should include domestic hygiene, physiology, child-psychology, first treatment of diseases and accidents, and other allied subjects, with English as a compulsory subject, and logic, history, philosophy, the classics and economics as optional, and the specialised course should be divided between the I A and B A examinations.

HAJDAR, Dr HIRALAL.

- (1) The courses of study should be the same for both men and women.

HALDAR UMES CHANDRA—HOLLAND REV W E S

HALDAR UMES CHANDRA

- (i) The University should modify its rules and regulations in the case of female students so as to give a great stimulus to the spread of female education. The University should not only meet the requirements of women but it should take the lead in the matter. Hindu women may be educated so that they can perform efficiently their legitimate duties in their married state and so that they can earn their livelihood when they become widows.
- (ii) Educated young men nowadays desire that their brides should be well educated, know music and have some knowledge of domestic affairs. Many guardians who want to give their daughters in marriage to highly educated young men are willing to give their girls higher education at least up to the matriculation stage. In the absence of any better course suitable for girls the boys' course will be not unacceptable. But that course can be so modified as to suit the special requirements of girls. There is a great demand for music. Here as in Europe and America music should be made one of the subjects for the matriculation course. Cutting out and making of garments is a subject which will be highly popular with the pupil, their guardians and the general public. It is also essential for our every day life. Domestic economy should also be included in the curriculum. An additional subject in Bengali containing extracts from the great Hindu and Muhammadan epics and the lives of distinguished Hindu and Muhammadan women will greatly add to the popularity of the course. These subjects may be prescribed instead of additional mathematics and classical languages. The present standard in mathematics for the matriculation course is enough for the girls. In the case of boys the standard should be raised but in the case of girls it should be retained. In the case of girls teaching and examination in all subjects except English must be through the medium of the vernacular even if the same concession be not granted to boys. The present age limit is an insuperable obstacle to the progress of higher education among women. The girls of the upper classes of Hindu society are now generally married between the ages of fourteen and sixteen. It is pretty certain that most of these girls would read up to the standard of the matriculation examination at least if they were permitted to appear at it before their marriage. This privilege should be granted only to *purdahnashin* Hindu and Muhammadan women and not to Brahmo and Christian girls. To prevent any abuse of this concession it may be ruled that no female candidate will be admitted to the college course before she is sixteen. The number of girls' high schools is too small; moreover Hindus are unwilling to send their girls to boarding houses. The senior mistresses of girls' middle English schools who are generally graduates and under graduates are quite competent to coach girls for the matriculation examination. Special permission may therefore be granted when occasion arises to girls to appear at the matriculation examination from such girls' middle English schools without this facility the mere permission to appear as a private student will be of no practical value. The girl will get no instruction for want of a tutor, the guardians being on principle unwilling to have their girls coached by a private male tutor. The examination should be held in the girls' native town or village even if that place be not the centre of examination for male candidates. The examination should be held in the girls' school premises and never in the boys' school. In the absence of a girls' school the examination may be held at the candidate's home under proper supervision.
- (iii) The peculiar difficulties are the *anaia* system, early marriage and caste prejudices. Women need education in domestic economy, hygiene and religion.

HOLLAND REV W E S

- (iii) Early marriage and the *purdah* system interpose very heavy obstacles in the way of the spread of higher education among women.

HOLLAND, Rev W E S—*contd*—HOSSAIN, WAHID

My experience of Indian men induces me to believe that their cordial co-operation in female education will not be secured till the curriculum of girls is of a more practical nature than that at present obtaining. And the deplorable hygienic conditions of Indian female and child-life make education in hygiene doubly necessary.

HOSSAIN, WAHID

(1) In considering this question one cannot shut one's eyes to the requirements of the Indian home. As our females live within *purdah* their education should be practical with reference to the position which they will fill in social life. The life and occupation of Indian ladies are quite different from those of their European sisters. Their education and training should therefore chiefly be considered from the Indian point of view. The question then arises as to whether their education should be the same as that of Indian boys. Having regard to the conditions of the Indian life and oriental manners and customs it seems to me that the system of education for Indian girls should be different from that of Indian boys and that two distinct courses of studies should be framed for our boys and girls respectively. The same sort of education will hardly serve the purpose for which it is intended. While aiming at culture and liberal education the courses of study intended for Indian girls should consist of more good books on domestic economy, hygiene, sanitation, nursing, home treatment, housekeeping, etc., and of less mathematics, trigonometry, physics and other cognate subjects. The practical side of their training should receive prominent attention, and their courses of study should be leavened with religious subjects.

(ii) The following remark made in the report of 1916 in respect of education for the girls of the domiciled European and Anglo-Indian communities are equally, rather more forcibly, applicable to the education of Indian girls—

“The domestic training of the girls of the domiciled European and Anglo-Indian communities has become economically indispensable. The failure to recognise this and a silly tendency to set far too much store on the acquisition of ‘accomplishments’ have been productive of a great deal of mischief and misery. The recognition of the fact that it is an essential part of the function of every girls’ school to equip each of its pupils with at least some elementary knowledge of, and capacity for, household management need not interfere in the least with the intellectual development of the girls.”

Domestic training should be a special feature of a girls’ school. What an Indian home requires is a good housewife and the course of studies should be framed accordingly.

The Government of India in their resolution dated the 21st February 1913 have also recognised the principles which should be adopted in the curriculum for Indian girls. Those principles may be stated as follows—

- (a) The education for girls should be practical with reference to the position which they will fill in social life.
- (b) It should not seek to imitate the education suitable for boys, nor should it be dominated by examinations.
- (c) Special attention should be paid to hygiene and the surroundings of social life.
- (d) Services of women should be more freely enlisted for instruction and inspection.

If Government really desire to extend the benefits of education to Indian girls and to *purdah* women the Education Department should adopt such methods of imparting education as will be acceptable to all classes of people. The education itself should be more lively and more “practical with reference to the position

HOSSAIN WAHED—*contd*—HUNTER MARK—HYDARI M A N—IMAM The Hon ble Justice Sir ALI

which the girls will fill in social life I therefore take this opportunity of making the following suggestions for the consideration of the authorities —

- (A) The education of Indian girls should aim more at domestic training with reference to their home life and the present tendency to acquisition of artificial accomplishments should be discouraged
- (B) A special syllabus for girls should be prepared dealing among others with subject which will give an idea of domestic requirements and impress them with the responsibilities of the Indian home life It should contain subjects of general interest as well as rules of conduct with reference to religious practices daily observed in their homes In the case of schools or *maktabs* meant for girls the policy of religious neutrality should not be allowed to interfere
- (C) The courses of study should be so framed as to enable a girl to go up for university education and examinations and there should be no bar in the way of her choosing the courses of study prescribed for Indian boys as our country requires well trained female doctors teachers midwives etc

HUNTER MARK

- (i) I do not think that any of the foregoing remarks require modification in respect of the needs of women
- (ii) and (iii) I have nothing to say under the e heads which would be other than a superfluous excursion into the obvious A good deal has been done in Madras in recent years for the higher education of women There are in the city of Madras two well staffed and well equipped colleges for women giving instruction up to the degree standard Both are full to overflowing There are two smaller women's colleges in the mofussil No doubt the Commission will visit the two women's colleges when it comes to Madras

HYDARI M A N

- (i) No except that the argument for using the vernacular as a medium of instruction is even stronger in the case of women than of men
- (ii) The profession of teaching medicine and social service
- (iii) The *zanana* system and the necessity for providing conveyances or locating collegiate institutions near the places where the lady students live

IMAM The Hon ble Justice Sir ALI

- (ii) There are various colleges that train up girl students for degrees already existing in Bengal It would be desirable to have a central college for the education of girls alone if the expenses of such an undertaking could be met But the number of girl students at present studying for the higher degrees is so small that the large expenses involved in a separate institution would hardly be justified
- To me the question of women's education seems to be of as great interest as that of men But it also seems to me necessary to bear in mind the position that women occupy in our social system The first need seems to me to make our women better wives and mothers than they are now For affection and devotion to their household duties the women of India could hardly be bettered What they lack is a better knowledge to perform the task that society demands of them For such purposes the *Sewa Sadan* institutions of Mrs Ranade in the Bombay Presidency and the Women's University of Professor Harve of Poona seem to me more useful than a mere degree of the Calcutta University with high honours in hydrostatics To carry on institutions like these successfully would I think, be beyond the strength of our Government universities

Indian Association, Calcutta—Irons, Miss M V

Indian Association, Calcutta.

- (i) The educational needs of women vary. There may be many women who will devote themselves to the ordinary university course for the acquisition of higher knowledge, there may be others again who may have to make a living out of such a study. But to the generality of women who want to make themselves useful at home a different course of education will have to be designed.
- (ii) To this part of the question the recommendations of the Dacca University Committee generally furnish a good answer in principle.

The question of cost is of great importance.

If the additional course recommended by the Dacca University Committee be found too heavy to be taken along with the regular university course students may be allowed to choose their subjects from the university and the additional courses. The result of the examinations in the subjects chosen will entitle the student to certificates of efficiency.

There is no provision for imparting scientific education to women in Bengal.

- (iii) (a) The *purdah* system
 (b) Early marriage
 (c) The end of all education with marriage
 (d) General apathy in the matter of giving higher education to women

But the conditions set forth above are fast changing in favour of education for women in this country.

IRONS, Miss M V

- (iii) There are special difficulties with regard to the higher education of women —
- (a) The *purdah* system, which especially amongst the Muhammadans limits the school life of every girl. This could partly be remedied by encouraging younger children to attend school.
- (b) The universality of the marriage system. The great majority of teachers marry, which means that they undertake dual responsibilities. Amongst school children early marriage again closes their school career.
- (c) The lack of trained teachers, without which the schools cannot improve. This is the crux of the educational problem at present. There are only two training centres for the whole of Eastern Bengal. Of these four students from the Eden Training Class presented themselves for examination this year. Six students from the Kalimpong Training Class, which is exclusively for Hindi-speaking students. There should be secondary training centres attached to the schools at divisional head-quarters and primary training schools attached to the schools at district head-quarters. At present there is a total lack of facilities for the training of teachers.
- (d) Lack of hostel accommodation for the existing teachers. The impossibility of recruiting teachers unless adequate protection is given to them.
- (e) The schools existent will not improve until the inspectorate is strengthened. There is one inspectress and four assistant inspectresses in control of three large divisions comprising Eastern Bengal. There are about 5,559 primary schools, 15 middle schools, and 3 high schools under their control, apart from the numerous *zanana* centres to be visited. The inspectorate should be strengthened by appointing a chief inspectress for each division. At present there is only one inspectress for the Dacca, Chittagong, and Rajshahi divisions, an area comprising some 47,252 square miles. There is no means of rapid communication in a district intersected by many large rivers. There should be at least three assistant inspectresses under each inspectress and a special assistant inspectress to look after the *zanana* work which could be developed were it sufficiently organised.

IRONS Miss M V —*contd*— IYER The Hon ble Mr Justice T V SESHAGIRI—
JALIL ABDUL

- (f) Lastly the problem of primary education needs consideration. The curriculum needs to be more elastic as in such a large area conditions of life are very varied. A number of peripatetic teachers might be trained so as to visit the schools inaccessible at present to the existing inspecting staff.

IYER The Hon ble Mr Justice T V SESHAGIRI

- (i) The course of study for Indian women should be different from that prescribed for Indian boys. Upon one matter my mind is very clear and that is in the case of Indian girls a high degree of knowledge in English should not be insisted on. Their training should be as far as possible in and through the vernaculars. Indian girls of this presidency are not able to attend schools after their twelfth or thirteenth year and their education has to be completed within that period. If therefore we should compel them to study a foreign language and get all their higher knowledge through its medium we would be practically denying them such knowledge altogether. Moreover the sort of education which women of this country stand in need of is not the same as that which boys aim at. Ordinarily Indian girls do not seek employment as a means of livelihood and they are almost all of them married and their comforts and conveniences are looked after by their husbands. What is wanted of Indian girls is the capacity to manage the affairs of the household, to bring up their children, to attend to the sanitary requirements of their homes and to be helpmates to their husbands in the work they have to do. No doubt they should have some knowledge of English in order to enable them to converse with their English sisters and pick up useful information from English books but that is a very secondary matter. The main object that should be kept in mind is to make them useful helpmates to their husbands and a real source of inspiration to their children. No doubt there will be an advantage in co-education in the case of those who aspire to become teachers or devote themselves to social service. But the number of this class of girls would be very limited indeed. For them no special facilities need be provided for. They can take their chance along with the boys. However in regard to one department of knowledge they should I think be given special facilities and that is in regard to medicine.

The lying in hospital and the Medical College should provide special courses of training for Indian girls who are not willing to undergo a regular course of study for the medical degree. A certificate or a diploma from the college authorities testifying to their fitness will enable them to earn an honest livelihood and be of use to their sisters.

JALIL ABDUL

- (ii) In the design of their courses special attention should be paid to their needs and requirements which are —
- (a) General knowledge of the subject
 - (b) The principles of hygiene and household management and practical training in them
 - (c) The several arts suitable for indoor work
- The special conditions prevailing in India demand that while the college and other institutions for men may also be open to women there should be separate college established for the latter.
- (d) Higher female education should be particularly looked after by a committee appointed by the University
 - (e) There should be established more training colleges for women
 - (f) Provision for scholarships should be made

JALIL, ABDUL—*contd* —JOHNSTON, Mrs A B

- (g) The Government and the University should seek more co-operation of the people in the advancement of female education
- (h) Separate hostels, with *purdah* provisions, for women
- (iii) The peculiar difficulties and needs which affect the higher education of women in India are —
 - (a) The *purdah* system, affecting the Muslims in particular and, to a certain extent, other communities in general
 - (b) The custom of early marriage among the Hindus
 - (c) Lower status in society accorded in general to women
 - (d) The prejudices among the men against the education of women on account of the want of education in the former

JOHNSTON, Mrs A B

- (i) The answer is 'Yes,' particularly with regard to —

The callings and professions which are necessary for service to, and the advancement of, India, and for which a high degree of training are required, such as —

- (a) Teaching—particularly in primary schools They can teach better in the vernacular than English women
- (b) Medicine
- (c) Nursing

(Every endeavour should be made to raise the status of doctors and nurses)

It is obviously important that there should be an army of women trained in these three professions to enlighten, help, and succour the many millions of ignorant, suffering and helpless women in *zananas*. Men cannot do the work, and it is no use asking or expecting the women to come out of *purdah* yet. It will be, and wisely so, a slow process.

- (iii) The custom of early marriage creates difficulties in training girls for professions that need long experience before they can do any real good. Nevertheless, good salaries, to induce girls to remain in their professions and in the case of nurses to minimise temptation, and comfortable hostels with bright social life, will help to solve the difficulty.

The University should recognise both degrees and diplomas in domestic science and home arts for women.

A degree should be granted after a four years' course.

A diploma should be granted after a two years' course.

Degrees should be either a *science* degree or an *arts* degree.

If a science degree then only domestic science subjects would be studied.

If an arts degree the domestic science subjects would be substituted for certain subjects in groups A and B of the present syllabus which are often quite useless and most irksome to many girls.

The syllabus in domestic science and home arts is sufficient for an *honours course* if desired. Every effort must be made to kill the idea that domestic science means only cooking (Suggested syllabus herewith). The diploma (two years' course) is intended for girls who want a training for home duties, but not for a professional life.

Suggested syllabus in —

Domestic science and home arts

Science—

Physiology

Hygiene

Nature study

JOHN TON Mrs A B—*contd*—KARVE D K

Child study—including psychology great educational reformers kindergarten methods of teaching child's health and welfare—physical and moral

Eugenics

Citizenship

Study of writers on art—e.g. Ruskin and William Morris

Arts—

Cookery—including food values adulteration and preservation of foods

First aid and sick nursing

Needlework and cutting out

Music

Art—including applied art in needlework house decoration and dress

Housewifery—in this climate girls need not take such a rigorous practical course as in England but they should at least know how things ought to be done by doing for themselves

A domestic science and home arts college should be established as part of the University where girls could attend a certain number of hours per week for an arts degree and receive instruction in their other degree subjects in the residential arts college

Domestic science students should be residential in the domestic science college

Diploma students will probably be home or day students but it should be made possible for them to be residential

There is a great desire on the part of many Indians that Indian women should be educated and an educated Indian woman is usually sought in marriage by an educated Indian—she is in fact in great demand. Nevertheless Indians criticise very severely the kind of education often obtained in English schools. An Indian primarily requires a woman to be domesticated and his complaint is that girls learn extravagance at school and college get lazy want a multitude of unnecessary servants lie on their backs all day and read novels are ignorant of all things domestic (or feign ignorance) because they have had an English education. In addition they get out of touch with their own women and understand them less than a sympathetic Englishwoman.

This is not a protest against the higher education of Indian women but a protest against a false and artificial education unfitting them for living the fullest life. There is a school in Calcutta where the girls think it below their dignity to attend Indian cookery classes and do not wish to learn the subject at all unless English dishes are taught and an English gas stove used! They are equally ignorant and willing to be ignorant on the subject of child welfare education discipline and training. A young married girl came to me the other day to know what clothes she should make and how she should make them—for her first baby. (She had passed her I.A. and was in her fourth year at college when she left to be married.) When I expressed surprise that she did not know how to make a few baby's clothes she said—How can I know I have never seen a baby washed and dressed in my life and I have never made a baby's garment? *I have been at school all my life.* This last remark was intended as an excuse for her ignorance. It really condemns the education we are giving girls in India.

Of course there are schools in England where the same defects are seen but that is no excuse for imposing a bad system on India. Men will be only too ready to educate their women and girls in India if the education they get is on sound lines—and India needs educated women more than educated men—women who understand and have practised domestic economy care and discipline of children hygiene sick nursing first aid and all those things which make home healthy beautiful bright and happy.

KARVE D K

(1) I would make an immediate exception in the case of women as regards the medium of instruction as also the medium of examination in the University for I think a

Some knowledge of English methods of cook would be very useful and desirable particularly in view of the

KARVE, D. K. — *contd.*

majority of Indian ladies want higher education for its cultural value rather than for its Government service value. Granting for argument's sake that greater proficiency in English is acquired by using English as the medium of instruction and that this should be secured even at the colossal sacrifice of the nation's vitality in the case of men, I think that the loss of vital energy ought not to be imposed upon all women desirous of getting secondary and higher education for its cultural value. Those women who wish to acquire greater proficiency at the sacrifice of vital powers will have the men's course open to them. But a department of instructing and examining women in their vernacular with English as a compulsory subject of study should be immediately opened for women. This would lessen the strain of higher education upon ladies which they feel to be crushing. This foreign medium of instruction is the great stumbling block in the advancement of higher education for women. If the option is given to private colleges for ladies can be started in different parts of a province as such colleges would not be very costly.

In this connection I would like to point out that the experiment of the Indian Women's University, though of short duration, is very encouraging. A college for women has been started at Hingne Budruk near Poona and is affiliated to the Indian Women's University and though it has not the advantage of Government sanction and Government support it has attracted six students in the second year class and ten students in the first year class. I am confident that this single college will send out a hundred lady graduates from the Indian Women's University in the next ten years from among Hindu ladies which the Bombay University is not expected to do in the same period.

In the case of women the same facility for medical education should be provided. Here, too, the vernaculars should be made the media of instruction and examination. The Medical College for Women at Delhi is of very little use to Hindu and Muhammadan women. The admission test there is harder than that at the Grant Medical College for men in Bombay. In the latter students are admitted after studying for one year after the Matriculation and passing the arts college examination at the end of that year. While at the Women's Medical College at Delhi to secure admission to the college department proper a student has to pass the arts test held 'at the end of two years' study after the Matriculation. The difficulties and needs of Indian women have not been taken into consideration. There ought to be separate women's colleges for their medical instruction through the media of the vernaculars. There should be a sub assistant surgeon's course and after that a course of higher education in medicine. All medical students in the elementary and higher stages should have enough acquaintance with English so that now and then they may refer to English books when necessary. Students should be admitted after they satisfy the entrance test of the University.

In the field of medicine and pedagogies special facilities should be given to ladies by the institution of scholarships.

The majority of women cannot spare a time sufficient for their education as marriage interrupts their studies. Efforts, therefore, have to be made to shorten the total period of their education. The Indian Women's University has taken this point into consideration and by making the vernaculars the media of instruction in all subjects other than English and English as a compulsory subject of study, the period of secondary education is made five years instead of seven years, and of higher education three years instead of four years without lowering the standard of general knowledge. Thus, if a girl begins her primary education at six she can become a graduate at the age of eighteen or nineteen.

To avoid all difficulties the best way is to have separate examinations and degrees for women in the same university. The exceptional class of women desiring the same degrees as men will take up men's courses of studies.

LAHIRI GOPAL CHANDRA—LATIF Syed ABDUL, Khan Bahadur—MAHATANOBIS
PRASANTA CHANDRA—MAHTAB The Hon'ble Sir BIJAY CHAND

LAHIRI, GOPAL CHANDRA

- (i) The education of women need not and should not be on the same lines as those for men. Female education should aim at producing members useful to society intelligently helpful to their husbands capable of rearing good healthy and God fearing children. They should also be able to take an intelligent interest in the world's affairs and progress. Those that may happen to have higher literary or scientific aspirations may be provided for in the colleges for males.
- (ii) Colleges for women should therefore teach English Bengali Sanskrit Arabic Persian history geography arithmetic algebra geometry hygiene domestic economy chemistry physics and drawing. The standard should be as high as that of the intermediate course. The whole course may be divided into middle English higher and senior stages.
- There should be medical colleges for women at convenient centres. For the present one at Calcutta and another at Dacca may suffice. At these colleges both physicians and nurses should be trained.

LATIF Syed ABDUL, Khan Bahadur

- (iii) I do not think the time is yet ripe for the establishment of a residential university for women. The peculiar social system under which they live does not permit them to attend school or college beyond a certain age. It is only the Christians and Brahmos that allow their womenkind to pursue higher courses of study in the University. The courses of study ought to be different from those prescribed for men. Hygiene literature and fine arts are the subjects in which the girls should be particularly instructed. Different courses of study and separate examinations for female students may be prescribed and for this a separate university is not immediately necessary.

MAHATANOBIS PRASANTA CHANDRA

- (iv) It is necessary to make provision for the study of the higher branches of household science. In addition training in domestic science is also desirable.
- The existing system is pressing too heavily on the physique of our women students. Considerable modifications are necessary and in this connection the fundamental biological differences between the two sexes should not be forgotten.
- The recommendations of Havelock Ellis in *Man and Woman* and in the sixth volume of *Studies in the Psychology of Sex* are generally applicable. For example women should not be required to continue any severe intellectual work during their monthly periods and should be allowed complete rest during these periods. Then again the methods of study should differ in certain cases for the two sexes depending on the sexual psychological differentiations.
- It is also necessary to make suitable provision for the higher education of married women. This may require an altogether new type of institution but it is necessary in view of the prevalent custom of early marriages in Bengal.

MAHTAB, The Hon'ble Sir BIJAY CHAND

- (i) In the case of women agricultural commercial and technological training do not appear to be necessary in India. There is also hardly any field or any great demand for their higher education in the general line. To encourage female education free schools should be established in each district town where primary education will be imparted to the students as well as practical training in domestic industries and arts such as accounts needle work cooking painting and music.

MAITRA, The Hon'ble Sir BIJAY CHAND—*contd.*—MAITRA, HIRAMBACHANDRA—
MALLIK, Dr. D. N.

- (ii) Women who are studying medicine should have a higher training in science. Besides this I do not consider higher education necessary in any other department of knowledge.
- (iii) The *zanana* system, that is almost universally present everywhere in India and the prevailing custom of early marriage, preclude the possibility of higher education amongst women in India at present.

MAITRA, HIRAMBACHANDRA.

While lady students who seek university degrees and diplomas should be required to go through the courses now prescribed by the University, provision should be made for the teaching of special courses adapted to their peculiar needs, though the University should hold no examinations in them.

MALLIK, Dr. D. N.

- (ii) The Calcutta University has accepted the provision of the University of London that its degrees should be conferred on women on the same terms as on men. It is obviously a mistake. The conditions under which Indian ladies have to work are so very different from those of men that, apart from all psychological considerations, it would be an unsound position altogether to impose the same burdens on women as on men.

Subjects like music, drawing, painting, and domestic economy should find a place in the curriculum for women. It should be remembered that the education of women should have in view *culture* more than in the case of men, for in the case of the latter the work should also fit them for the various avenues of employment open to men. In the case of women the only work they will be called upon to do (under our present social conditions), if at all, would be that of teaching.

In the case of women more than in the case of men the peculiar surroundings of towns like Calcutta are highly unsuitable. If colleges and schools could be located in a healthy place, where the pupils could go about freely (places like Giridih, Madhupur, and Baidyanath), half the difficulties connected with their education would be met.

In view of the special requirements of women, it would be desirable to institute separate tests for women. A boy of sixteen has only to attend to his studies and to physical exercise. A girl of sixteen has to attend often, in addition to her studies, to household duties (it is essential that she should learn them). She must also learn some music, etc., she has, moreover, little opportunities for physical exercise, nor can she go about as boys can. To require her to submit exactly to the same tests as boys is a *mistake*. And this is what we have been doing so long. The education that we should provide should be, to quote the words of the late Keshub Chandra Sen

“Specially adapted to the requirements of the female mind and calculated to fit woman for her position in society. It cannot be denied that woman requires special training for the sphere of work and duty which is peculiarly her own. The development of the true type of Indian female character, upon a plan of teaching at once national and rational, should be the primary object sought.”

But I have found from experience that neither girls nor their guardians can be induced to adopt a course of studies, however rational, that departs from that prescribed by the University.

McDOUGALL Miss ELEANOR—MITRA The Hon ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA Bahadur

McDOUGALL Miss ELEANOR

- (1) It seems to me very important that for the present the courses of study and examinations should be the same for men and women. As things stand now a different course for women would inevitably mean an inferior one. The time may come when university trained Indian women may be able to express a corporate opinion on this matter but they are not yet numerous enough nor experienced enough to do this.
- Domestic training should not be given at the University. If the present simplicity of Indian domestic life is to be preserved there is no value in elaborate instruction in the preparation of food, laundry work or dressmaking etc. Simple lessons in hygiene, sick nursing and the care of children are exceedingly valuable but these should be given at school. The great need of Indian women is to acquire habits of systematic clear and persevering thought and to gain a greater acquaintance with the facts of history and science. The present university courses are fairly well adapted for these purposes and no material change in them on behalf of women should be attempted for another ten years at least.
- (ii) Women need a large number of smaller residential colleges in arts and medicine. In the case of arts they should be taught chiefly by women who should share their residence and give a large degree of personal attention to the students. In the case of medicine it is hardly practicable that there should be many residential colleges for women as the cost is prohibitive. In some parts of India they will be obliged to take part or all of their courses in men's colleges of medicine but they should live in hostels managed as far as possible by medical women who should supervise their studies. It is important that the control of the hostels should be closely connected with the teachers of the women students.
- (iii) The great obstacles to the progress of women's education are —
 - (a) Tradition and public opinion which discourage independent action on the part of women.
 - (b) The influence of older women who are conservative in outlook and do not wish the younger ones to differ much from themselves.
 - (c) The custom of early marriage which—
 - (A) Discourages a father from spending money which might be used as a dowry on his daughter's education.
 - (B) Removes promising girls from schools just at the age when their independent mental life is beginning.
 - (C) Cuts off the supply of women teachers at the root.
 - (D) Prevents the growth of a sense of vocation and professional enthusiasm in young women teachers.
 - (E) In many cases produces physical weakness and a nervous excitable temperament in the offspring of such marriages.

MITRA, The Hon ble Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA Bahadur

- (ii) A separate university for women should be established. Itinerant female teachers should be appointed in large numbers for training *pardanashin* women. There should be a separate medical college for them. Colleges and schools should be established for the training of *pardahnashin* ladies. Some industrial arts on a small scale may be taught in schools and colleges for women. With the exception of a few branches of study such as law, engineering, mechanical engineering and some technology the same facilities for higher training should be provided for women as are suggested in the case of men. A university for the education of women shall have no connection with a university for the education of men.

MILKA, RAM CHARAN—MITTER, The Hon'ble Mr PROVASH CHUNDER—MUKERJEE,
Dr. ADITYANATH

MITRA, RAM CHARAN.

- (i) As Indian women have not the same facilities for seeing the outside world as their fellow male students they must lack in their knowledge of human nature and it is necessary that they should make up their deficiencies by the study of history, biography, and other kindred subjects
- (ii) Indian women, when they become mothers (and that is generally at an early age), have to manage their household affairs. To be able efficiently to manage these affairs it is only necessary that they should have some administrative capacities and a knowledge of simple arithmetic. Higher education is not necessary for any such purpose.

But as women may have tastes for learning like men the same facilities should be given to them for higher education whenever they are wanted.

MITTER, The Hon'ble Mr PROVASH CHUNDER.

- (ii) For the higher education of women in India two types should be kept in view —
 - (a) For those who desire to take up a profession in life, such as the medical or the teaching profession, perhaps the type of men's university, with slight modifications, may not be unsuitable.
 - (b) For those whose object is to cultivate their mind, to train their capacities, and perhaps ultimately to occupy the position of a cultured and intelligent housewife the training obviously should be different. For this type the necessities and the social customs of the Hindus and the Muhammadans should be taken into account in framing possible schemes. The *purdah* system, whether it be good or bad, is an existing factor and has to be taken into account. Arrangements for the teaching of grown-up girls in the *zananas*, will have to be made either collectively or individually. But as to actual teaching it will be a question for the public and Government to solve. The University, however, should merely prescribe standardised examinations to be conducted in suitable places and under suitable conditions. The standard prescribed will aim at developing the intelligence and the intellectual capacities of the students. Special stress should be laid upon hygiene, duties incidental to a housewife's position, and the training of children. Music, painting, and other fine arts may be prescribed as optional subjects. A thorough knowledge of the vernacular and a working knowledge of English and mathematics, Indian history, and geography should be insisted upon. For those who desire a higher standard of knowledge, oriental classics and suitable scientific subjects may also be prescribed.

MUKERJEE, Dr ADITYANATH

- (i) As regards intellectual ability and power of grasp, the girls of Bengal are not inferior to the boys (I say this from my personal experience, as I was connected with a ladies' college for some years).
- I would not, therefore, vary the standard in any way in the case of women, except that they may be allowed to take up, as minor optional subjects, drawing, painting, music, hygiene, sanitation, botany, etc.,
- (ii) Greater facilities for women are required in the fields of medicine and teaching as these are the two fields where their services are most urgently needed by the community.

MUKERJEE Dr ADITYAN IYER—*contd*—MUKERJEE RADHAKAMAL

(iii) The difficulties are chiefly —

- (a) The secluded life under the *purdah* system
- (b) The custom of early marriage which necessitates the withdrawal of a girl from school before she has completed even the rudiments of education
- (c) The want of a sufficient number of qualified women teachers

These are among the causes which retard the education of women

MUKERJEE RADHAKAMAL

(ii) The higher education of women in India ought to be adapted to the Indian ideals of womanhood. In India women are the natural guardians of home life of the interests of social purity and domestic hygiene and of the rights of children. Women in India are the natural guardians of the sick, the infirm and the unfortunates. Women here are also the natural guardians of the general regulation of the relations between the sexes which will weed out all forms of corruption, uncleanness, immorality and brutality. Higher education of women in India should be so built up as to develop the characteristic instincts of motherhood that the home will then deepen and expand and reconstruct the whole society on an eugenic basis. It is only a small minority in the Indian population that tends to enforce early marriage and prohibits widow re-marriage and does not permit the occupation of women for livelihood. For the vast majority of the Indian women the so-called backward classes provision should be made for training in the agricultural, commercial and industrial employments which are open to them in the existing economic organisation. Domestic arts and household industries carried on in the home by women coming from the upper classes should receive special attention. Cotton spinning and dress industry, lace work and sewing will receive attention while such skilled industries like *tassar* and *end* rearing and weaving, silk culture and silk industry, artistic embroidery, hand weaving and all the diverse occupations in which women are engaged at present should be taught and the vocational opportunities of our girls and women in our urban and rural communities should be extended and made accessible to those who cannot for want of hereditary training be engaged in these skilled or semi-skilled industries and turn to unskilled labour as that of the *reja* or day labourer for livelihood. For the modern technical and engineering professions women are for the most part barred by instincts and by the nature of the work. But the University should afford special facilities to women for training in medicine, law and theology. Any development in this direction will meet with great response. Such steps as the following will also be welcome —

- (a) The establishment of a special medical college for women
- (b) The establishment of a special college to train women teachers
- (c) The organisation of special courses of popular lectures by university professors for women. Subjects pertaining to preventive medicine, hygiene, sex hygiene and education, sociology and eugenics will receive special emphasis
- (d) A practical system of home education should also be devised for girls who cannot attend schools or colleges after a certain age

Whether in home or in collegiate education the course of studies in the under-graduate stage should be somewhat as follows —

The scholastic branches obligatory for all should be: *Benavali*, arithmetic and elements of book-keeping, hygiene and home sanitation, geography and national history, Indian family songs and romance and Indian domestic and moral economy. Linear drawing and machine drawing should also be required.

MUKERJEE, RADHAKAMAL—*contd*—MUKERJI, SATISH CHANDRA—MUKHERJEE, B

The industrial instruction should consist of the following branches —

Cooking, darning, repairing, washing, and ironing, the performance of daily and periodical domestic-religious duties and ceremonies, ornamental drawing. Courses in handicrafts and artistic industries should be adapted to the needs and opportunities of particular industrial or artistic occupations of women in particular localities. General courses should be given in cutting, sewing, plain and artistic embroidery, and hand and machine weaving.

MUKERJI, SATISH CHANDRA

- (ii) Under the present circumstances of Bengal nothing can be done specially for the college education of women who may join the colleges of men if they want higher education. There should, however, be many more schools for girls where the method of education will be of a suitable nature and quite different from the methods followed in schools for boys. Here I can simply state the general principle that the Hindu girls are to be educated in such a manner that they can afterwards become efficient housewives of Hindu households.

MUKHERJEE, B

- (ii) The University might arrange for examinations in music, sewing, crocheting, etc. All the girls' schools and colleges already provide education in these directions.
- (iii) The peculiar difficulties are —
- (a) Innate conservatism of the majority of the people—most orthodox families now give their girls an elementary education, but at the same time they look almost with horror upon the idea of giving their girls a higher education by which is generally meant education with a view to preparation for the university examinations. The line of demarcation between what education is, and what education is not permissible, in the case of girls is not very sharply drawn in all cases. None of my students at the Diocesan College for Girls belong to *very orthodox* Hindu families. Leaving aside the European and other Christian girls in my classes, there are a certain number of Hindu girls, but they certainly do not belong to very orthodox families for if they did so they would not have been in the college at all.
- (b) Early marriage which is inevitable in orthodox Hindu and Muslim families. A girl must be married at about the age of twelve and as soon as she is married all her education stops. It is a common story which I hear, for instance, at the Diocesan College, that such and such a girl who was one of the best students of the class left the college a few months ago and, on my enquiring as to the reason of it all, the reply which my students generally give me is —“She has married and left the college.”
- (c) *Purdah* system.
- (d) The absence of the vernaculars as the media of instruction in secondary schools.

The work of imparting female education in India may be carried on both in and outside the school-room. As a matter of fact, a good deal of liberal female education is given in Bengal by means other than in schools and colleges. The strict social system which makes the marriage of a girl religiously compulsory at the age of twelve or so also puts an end to all hope of continuing the education of the ordinary Hindu girl beyond the age of marriage. These two customs—*viz*, early marriage and the *purdah* system—practically deny the ordinary Hindu girl all opportunities for a really liberal education. Hence, any practical scheme of female education in India must clearly recognise two facts and provide for them, *viz* —

- (1) The religious and social systems of India make—and will continue to make always in the future the marriage of a girl compulsory at an early age

MUKHERJEE B—contd.

The question of early marriage was exhaustively considered in 1884-85 as a result of the late Mr Malabar's note on the subject submitted to the Government of India in 1884 and it is unnecessary for me to refer to it in detail here

- (2) The *pardah* system makes all schools and colleges practically inaccessible to the vast majority of the Hindu girls who are above six twelve and are married

Such being the dominant facts of the situation with which we have to deal it is necessary to provide means of carrying female education into the *zanana* by means other than in schools and colleges. A well considered and extensive organisation under the control of Government might be established—over and above the existing girls schools and colleges—for the purpose of imparting instruction to the married Hindu girls in the *zanana*. Many private organisations are at present working with that object and I give below a brief account of some of them. But the scope of their work must necessarily be limited. If the State were to undertake some such scheme on a large scale its effectiveness will be increased a thousandfold

- (A) *The All India Women's Association (The Bharat Sree Mahamandal)* It is an association of ladies all over Bengal with a very large membership. Its great object is to organise the education of Indian girls at home in a manner suited to the conditions and circumstances of Indian life. It sends out qualified lady teachers to impart education to girls in the *zanana* who are unable to come out on account of the *pardah* system. By this means it is doing a good deal of silent but useful work not only in Bengal but also in other parts of India where a large number of branches exists.
- (B) *The Mahila Samiti*—First started in 1900 and reorganised in 1911. The Samiti has four departments—educational, social, technical and literary.

The Educational Department's objects are as follows—

- To help poor and deserving school girls with scholarships and school fees
- To provide Indian lady graduates with means to qualify themselves as trained teachers in England or America
- To open a girls' high school on a non denominational basis
- To press upon Government the question of improving female education

The Technical Department aims at organising lessons in music, painting, needlework, typewriting, book keeping, etc.

The Literary Department arranges periodical lectures in subjects of special interest to women and organises a reading room and a circulating library.

These were the objects with which the Samiti started work. Much has been done already towards achieving some of these objects but I cannot enter here into all that the Samiti has or has not done in detail. The Commission might refer to Mrs. Mrinalini Sen who supplied me with much information or to Mrs. A. N. Chaudhury who is one of the secretaries to the Samiti.

- (C) *Indian Women's Education Association*—This is an association in London working in close harmony with the Mahila Samiti in Calcutta mentioned above. The object of the association was to raise sufficient money for training qualified lady teachers from India in England who on their return to India would introduce improved methods of teaching and organisation in Indian schools. The association also hopes ultimately to establish a training college for lady teachers in one or other of the principal towns in India. A beginning was made in 1911 when Miss Mrinalini Chatterjee was sent from India. She joined first Bedford College in London and then Newnham College in Cambridge. I have no recent information as to the subsequent work of the association but Miss S. Bonnerjee, the able secretary to the association in London, who very kindly supplied me with all the above information, would I am sure gladly furnish the Commission with any information that it might desire to have.

MUKHERJEE B.—*contd.* —MUKHERJEE, PANCHANANDAS —NAG, P. N. —NAIK, K. G. —
NANDY, The Hon'ble Maharajah Sir MANINDRA CHANDRA.

- (D) *The National Indian Association* —This also is an association of ladies, but its objects are more social than educational though it does, to some extent, promote indirectly the cause of female education.
- (E) *Victoria Institution* —Besides imparting the ordinary female education in the institution itself it also, some time back, arranged to have a series of extension lectures for the benefit of ladies on a variety of instructive and useful subjects. The lectures were delivered by able men in this city and were found to be eminently useful. I am not aware if the scheme will be revived this year, but I believe its continuance will be widely appreciated.

MUKHERJEE, PANCHANANDAS

- (i) and (ii) *For women who study for the degree examination* —I think there ought to be a somewhat different curriculum for women suited to the part they are to play in Bengali homes. Some course of study specially adapted to the needs of our women (*e.g.*, domestic hygiene and economy, child study, music, painting, sewing, etc.) should be substituted for certain other technical and scientific subjects (*e.g.*, advanced mathematics, zoology, geology, etc.).
- For women of the zanana class* —For women of the *zanana* class who cannot, owing to special social and economic reasons, attend a course of study spread over a long period I would advocate the inauguration of a new system under which such *zanana* women could go through a self-complete course of studies specially suited to their peculiar needs within a period of seven years beginning from the seventh to the fourteenth year. After this course of seven years there should be an examination conducted by the University which should grant certificates, prizes, and medals to the successful candidates. Such *zanana* institutions should be started all over the country.
- (iii) The peculiar difficulties affecting the higher education of Indian women are early marriages, the *purdah* system, depressed economic conditions, and the special and peculiar social structure and environment. It is to avoid these difficulties that I advocate the institution of the above new system.

NAG, P. N.

- (ii) In the fields of medicine and teaching prospects should be offered to induce more women to enter these professions. In medicine the country needs the services of more women doctors.

NAIK, K. G.

- (ii) Women should take up domestic science, music, hygiene, and medicine. We want women doctors.

NANDY, The Hon'ble Maharajah Sir MANINDRA CHANDRA.

- (ii) In the education of women special emphasis should be laid on the training in domestic economy and hygiene. Separate colleges for women for the study of medicine, science, and arts should be established, while for women who cannot attend colleges for social restrictions arrangements should be made for a scheme of education at home under trained women teachers.

NANJUNDAYYA H V—North Bengal Zamindars Association Rangpur—PAL The Hon ble Rai RADHA CHARAN Bahadur—PARANJPYE The Hon ble Mr R P

NANJUNDAYYA, H V

- (i) I think the needs of women must be met as far as possible by providing separate colleges and separate hostels. While those who wish to follow the same courses as the men should not be prevented from doing so separate courses should to some extent be provided for them.
- (ii) In the useful occupations they should have special facilities to qualify for medical and teaching work. There are other branches such as housekeeping etc. which would be useful but I am not sure they would be considered as deserving a place in the university course. Economics and history would be popular branches. Music Sanskrit and painting would be valuable for Hindu women. Music and painting may perhaps take the place of some science subjects. In the case of Indian music the main difficulty would be the settlement of standards and the conduct of examinations so as to make it deserve a place in the university courses. Literature may also be encouraged.
- (iii) With men education of a serious sort is felt a necessity for fitting themselves for a career. Women have no need (I am speaking of Indian society especially) to work for such a purpose and there are very few careers open for them if they desired. They are therefore satisfied with some superficial education that merely serves the purpose of their limited social needs.

Except among the very few who have outgrown the traditional habits of social life the girls begin family life too early to pursue their studies for a sufficient length of time.

North Bengal Zemindars Association Rangpur

- (i) Female education is necessary but not after the university model. The spheres of action of the two sexes must be different in all ages and countries and their education should necessarily differ accordingly. Female education should be made to suit their particular vocation in life which should comprise high moral and religious education and should enable them efficiently to discharge their domestic duties. As religious training is a *sine qua non* of female education there should be different schools for the followers of different religions. These institutions should be under the direct control of the University.

PAL The Hon ble Rai RADHA CHARAN Bahadur

- (i) As regards the education of girls I wish to emphasise the following points —
 - (a) That it should be practical with special reference to the position which the girls will be called upon to fill in social life.
 - (b) It should not seek to imitate the education suitable for boys nor should it be dominated by examinations.
 - (c) Special attention should be paid to hygiene and sanitation.
 - (d) The services of women should be freely enlisted both for instruction as well as inpection.

PARANJPYE The Hon ble Mr R P

- (i) The social conditions of Bengal are so different from those of Bombay that it is hardly possible to say anything which will apply to both. In Bombay those young women that wish to go in for university-education can attend men's colleges quite conveniently especially if there are several in each class. They want only separate hostels superintended by an educated lady who should be a

PARANJPYE, The Hon'ble Mr R P —*contd*—RAY, Dr. BIDHAN CHANDRA—RAY, JOGES CHANDRA

member of the college staff if possible. In these hostels they will have their own social life. In the education of women new experiments can easily be made as in the case of the Indian Women's University where education is to be given through the vernacular, though English is made compulsory for all. As those women who go in for university education are likely to be fairly grown up any special women's subjects like domestic economy need not be introduced into the courses specially for them though, naturally, in some subjects there will be more women students than in others. But this will not present any difficulty if the University offers instruction facilities in all subjects of study. I take it that in Bengal separate colleges for women are essential for the present.

RAY, Dr. BIDHAN CHANDRA.

- (i) (a) If the effects of the examination system on boys be to produce men who may be good or indifferent machines for earning money, though dwarfed in intellect and wrecked in health, these are necessary evils. The girl, on the other hand, with her finer susceptibilities and more delicate constitution, comes out very badly indeed. I would propose that no formal and rigid examination be instituted for them. Let their study in a group of subjects be uniformly followed with certain tests along the course, but no straining of nerves under high tension (such as is often inevitable at our examinations) should be allowed.
- (b) The intermediate examination should, with a greater degree of justification than in the case of boys, though for similar reasons, be omitted altogether in the case of girls.
- (c) The colleges for girls should be placed under a committee mainly composed of women and of men appointed by the Senate who take an interest in female education and this committee should have a fair representation on the Senate. The colleges should have a large degree of freedom from direct control of the University, such control being exercised through the committee.
- (d) As far as possible, girls should be allowed to remain in the family, among relations, until it is possible to found a residential university of their own. Such girls as reside in hostels or boarding houses should remain in charge of a superintendent. The colleges where girls study should be staffed mainly by females and as many of the staff as can reside in the hostels should be encouraged to do so. The girls should be encouraged, as part of their education, to undertake practical lessons in nursing, housekeeping, etc., and the members of the staff who stay in the boarding houses should pay particular attention to the girls getting these practical lessons.
- (ii) The addition of subjects like —,
 - (a) Fine arts music, painting, drawing, sculpture, carving, cooking
 - (b) Nursing and hygiene

These should prove of great value to the students and also relieve them of a great deal of strain in having to go through courses designed and useful for male students only.

RAY, JOGES CHANDRA

- (i) To answer this question requires the consideration of the position of women in society. If the position be the same as of men the answer is obvious, *viz.*, the lines should be parallel. If, on the contrary, the position is complementary, the men and women fulfilling apparently different functions but really convergent, the answers to the foregoing questions should be modified in respect of women.

RAY JOGES CHANDRA—*contd*—RAY Maharajah KSHAUNISH CHANDRA Bahadur—RAY SARAT CHANDRA—REYAZUDDIN SYED Quazi—ROY MUNINDRANATH

- (ii) If by higher education is meant the sort of soulless education as received by our young men there are neither fields nor necessities for additional or special facilities
- (iii) The high and higher education of women in India does not progress mainly because there are no fields for such in Indian society. There is no demand because the women cannot accept service as men can and do and for which the latter seek education. Notwithstanding this Indians would like to see their girls properly educated if there were facilities for receiving it on Indian lines. The question is very large and cannot be dealt with here. Briefly it is the nature of education at present given and the tendencies created by it which are not liked by Indian parents

RAY Maharaja KSHAUNISH CHANDRA Bahadur

- (i) The education of men and women should be a little different after the elementary stage. For the majority of women whose proper place is in their home abstruse subjects should be excluded. Besides a general knowledge of English vernacular geography history of India and simple rules of mathematics the courses should include hygiene domestic economy sewing drawing painting music and the like.
- (ii) Special facilities for women in the sphere of nursing midwifery and medicine should be provided. Women should be given more facilities for joining the teaching profession and for the improvement of the girls' schools which should be staffed entirely by women teachers.
- (iii) Early marriage hampers female education and endeavours should be made to impart higher education through *anana* agencies.

RAY SARAT CHANDRA

- (ii) There is no necessity of making any difference in the education of women. The women should be educated in separate institutions and taught by female teachers. Over and above general education they should be taught household affairs cooking keeping accounts of household expenses and so forth.

REYAZUDDIN SYED Quazi

- (i) They must be different as the women observe some different customs from men and they observe *purdah*.
- (ii) Lady teachers and lady doctors should teach and attend the women respectively.
- (iii) Early marriage and strict *purdah* system.

ROY MUNINDRANATH

- (ii) The curricula of the study for women in secondary schools include —
 - (a) A few books in each subject and the subjects should be few in number. The syllabus should be shorter than in the case of boys.
 - (b) The books prescribed for girls should be proper and useful for girls. Subjects of diverse interest and delightful stories are of no good for them.
 - (c) The examination test for girls should be of a general nature and lenient from that point of view.
 - (d) Practical training in nursing food making for the sick hygiene and sewing in the matriculation curricula.
- A greater freedom of choice should be given to them in taking up subjects in higher studies.

ROY, The Hon'ble Rai SRI NATH, Bahadur—ROY, The Hon'ble Babu SURENDRA NATH—
 RUDRA, S K SAHAY, Rai Bahadur BHAGVATI SAPRU, The Hon'ble Dr TEJ Bahadur,

ROY, The Hon'ble Rai SRI NATH, Bahadur.

- (ii) The present arrangements for education and residence of female students may continue
 Greater facilities should be given to the female students to prosecute their studies in the medical department

ROY, The Hon'ble Babu SURENDRA NATH

- (i) My answers with reference to the other questions would be slightly different in respect to the needs of women so far as the hostel arrangements are concerned. Better and more careful supervision would be necessary in the case of women than of men. In the case of boys attached messes or hostels may be situated at a considerable distance from the college premises, but with regard to attached messes for women they ought to be by the side of the college and, in fact, it ought to form part of it.
- (ii) Medical
- (iii) The peculiar difficulties and needs which affect the higher education of women in India are the *purdah* system, and the marriage of girls at a comparatively young age

RUDRA, S K.

- (i) Teaching, nursing, and medicine are the three professions for which higher education is specially needed for women.
 In the framing of the courses the preliminary courses need not be of the same severity and standard as for men, *e g*, classical languages and mathematics beyond simple arithmetic may be optional.
- (ii) Cultivation of the vernaculars is most important for women, and also of music, drawing, and painting. Some provision should be made for these and also for hygiene and domestic economy.

SAHAY, Rai Bahadur BHAGVATI

- (i) No, in regard to university education men and women should be similarly treated.

SAPRU, The Hon'ble Dr. TEJ BAHADUR

- (ii) In answering this question I desire to say that I am speaking mainly with reference to the United Provinces. Social customs in these provinces have been such that they have not favoured the growth and expansion of the education of our girls on any large scale. For some years past there has been a very strong feeling in favour of the education of girls, but the response on the part of Government has been poor. In big towns private enterprise has led to the establishment of certain schools for the education of girls and, though Government has rendered some assistance, I do not think that it has been substantial or adequate. It is possible to exaggerate the difficulties arising out of our social system, but I know that there has been a steady change in social feeling. Among some sections of the Hindu community the rigour of the *purdah* is being relaxed and the standard of marriageable age has been

SAPRU The Hon'ble Dr. FEJ BAHADUR—*contd.*—SARKAR KATIPADA—SASTRI Rai RAJENDRA CHANDRA Bahadur

rising If any serious attempt for the expansion of the education of girls is to be made in these provinces due regard must be paid to these social conditions—though speaking for myself I am against many of these old social restraints I think that so far as our girls are concerned the expansion of education for many years to come would be more on the literary than on the scientific side I would suggest that the curriculum to be prescribed for girls at least in certain subjects should be lighter I would also suggest that Government should in certain important centres render material financial aid to well conducted schools to enable them to grow into colleges I think it is possible to establish such colleges at Allahabad Benares Lucknow and Dehra Dun It would be necessary to enlist the active support and sympathy of non official Indians such as are really interested in the cause of the education of our girls

I am aware that the main plea which is urged against any demand for expansion is the paucity of lady teachers It is true that it is difficult to get qualified lady teachers in these provinces but I think it is not impossible to get a sufficiently large number of teachers from Bengal Bombay or Madras I have much doubt as to the wisdom of spending so much as is being done by Government over European inspectresses who know so little of our life and many of whom have a very meagre knowledge of our vernaculars In fact having regard to the stage of progress I would have fewer inspectresses and more qualified teachers from other parts of India

SARKAR KATIPADA

- (i) One only viz the curriculum In the case of women the course of studies should differ from those prescribed for men while English should not be a compulsory subject for females
- (ii) Not only higher but also lower secondary and primary education in the case of women require additional and special facilities in the shape of female teachers and special scholarships
- (iii) Here again all forms of education for Indian women are affected by peculiar difficulties and needs They are the social custom—viz *purdah* (seclusion) and early marriage Here I am thinking of the orthodox Hindus and Muhammadans who form the vast majority of the country's population

SASTRI Rai RAJENDRA CHANDRA Bahadur

- (i) There ought to be special facilities for Hindu women of the orthodox section in the matter of higher education Special colleges for orthodox Hindu women staffed entirely by Hindu females and by Hindu males so long as women with suitable qualifications are not forthcoming should be established in important centres of learning The crying need of education for Hindu women of an orthodox type is the absence of a qualified body of teachers who should respect Hindu susceptibilities in the matter of food dress and principles of conduct The Calcutta Bethune College has ceased to be a Hindu institution and orthodox families look upon it with suspicion Missionary control of Hindu female education has proved to be an unmixed evil Institutions like those in Bombay which are run on strictly Hindu principles are badly wanted and all efforts should be directed towards enlisting the sympathy of orthodox classes in establishing and financing such institutions in Calcutta and elsewhere The appointment of European inspectresses of schools to superintend Hindu female education should be discontinued and their place taken by Hindu male inspectors specially selected for the purpose The above remarks also apply *mutatis mutandis* to the education of Muhammadan females

Scottish Churches College Senatus, Calcutta—SEN, BIPINBEHARI—SLN, Rai BOIKUNT NATH, Bahadur—SLN, Rai SATIS CHANDRA, Bahadur.

Scottish Churches College. Senatus, Calcutta.

- (ii) We consider that the system of options could be devised in the curricula of the University suitable for the special needs of women.
- It has been reported that the medical classes for women students under the Calcutta University are to be withdrawn. We are strongly of opinion that this is a most serious mistake. The numbers attending these classes are bound to increase and, knowing the great value of some of the lady doctors who have graduated in medicine in Calcutta, we urge that everything be done to foster those classes instead of removing them.

SEN, BIPINBEHARI.

- (ii) Under the social conditions which still hold in this country the education of females should be on different lines from those of men in certain respects. Most of the Hindu girls (who form the majority of school-going girls in this province) leave school at a comparatively early age to be married and settled in life. The Hindu home and its environment are conducive to the growth of their religious and moral nature, and their education at school should, therefore, be of such a character as to enable them to be wise and useful in the domestic ways of life—to be good mothers and skilful housewives. I, therefore, suggest that they should be well grounded in their knowledge of the vernacular, that they should have a knowledge of the classics in which their sacred books are written, and also a knowledge of arithmetic. English should hold a secondary place in the curriculum. Besides, they should have a knowledge of domestic hygiene, nursing, sewing, knitting, drawing, and music. There are a few secondary schools for girls in Calcutta and mufassal stations, and there should be at least one such school in every district. Such schools need not be affiliated to the University, but should be under the control of boards of competent men who take a genuine interest in female education.
- Those girls, however, who like to enter the University should be given equal opportunities with boys to receive the highest kind of training available in this province. The Bethune College should be fully affiliated in all the important subjects of study recognised by the University so that the services of our female graduates might be utilised as doctors and teachers.

SEN, Rai BOIKUNT NATH, Bahadur.

- (i) Differentiation is necessary in respect of the needs of men and women.
- (ii) Additional and special facilities should be given to women for the study of domestic science and hygiene.
- (iii) The *purdah* system, early marriage, and the difficulty in procuring competent female teachers affect the higher education of women in India. The Brahminika class and the family of gentlemen who have received education outside India, and have returned after completing their academical career, deserve special consideration. They do not labour under the disadvantages which the *purdah* women have and greater facilities can be given to them by making some special arrangements.

SEN, Rai SATIS CHANDRA, Bahadur.

- (ii) In this respect I can only speak with regard to the education of Hindu women. I think that the present system of English education, as imparted by our secondary schools and afterwards by the University, is totally unsuitable to

SEN RAI SATIS CHANDRA Bahadur—*contd*—SEN GUPTA Dr NARES CHANDRA.

the needs of Hindu women. Amongst advanced communities in the West where women are almost on a footing of equality with men and where every woman cannot expect to enter upon married life high education may be a necessity to them. But circumstanced as Hindu society and Hindu women are the western system of education in vogue in this country is not only unsuitable but also demoralising to the women of India. On the one hand it is wholly foreign to and breaks down the ideals and instincts of Indian womanhood. On the other hand high English education in an Indian woman serves no useful purpose in the social environment in which she lives.

I would suggest for Hindu women a system of education in which greater stress should be given to the vernaculars and Sanskrit in which girls should be given instruction as regards their household duties which would make them good wives and mothers. The courses of study would be such as could be finished by the thirteenth or fourteenth year of a girl. The study of English should be given only a very subordinate place and the greatest care should be taken in the selection of text books.

The above remarks apply to orthodox Hindu girls as regards the girls brought up in semi-European environments the present system of high education may be suitable.

SEN GUPTA Dr NARES CHANDRA

- (i) The room for differentiation in courses of instruction in the case of girls lies more in the domain of primary and secondary education than in the sphere of university education. The doors of the highest knowledge in every subject ought to be open to men and women alike and I would have no difference between men and women in the general courses of study in the University.

Education of women as well as of men ought to be directed by reference to their ends in life. Most women in the present state of our society have wifehood and motherhood as the ends of their life. For them the courses of study in the primary and secondary stages ought to be so adapted as to fit them specially for domestic duties. While the gates of knowledge should be thrown open to girls as well as to boys the former must be specially taught the arts of domestic economy sanitation nursing first aid domestic arts such as needlework music and painting. At the same time they must acquire such knowledge as will enable them to profit by private reading.

In the University we would generally expect girls who want to qualify themselves for higher studies in sciences and arts and will often have to choose other careers than those of wives and mothers. For these the education ought to be thorough whatever branch of knowledge is taken up.

Physical development social life of the University and such other matters must be attended to differently in the case of girls and boys. There must for the present at least be a complete separation of boys and girls though I see no reason why they should not attend university lectures with boys.

- (ii) There is a large demand for scientific education by girls. There are no facilities for such education anywhere except by co education which none but the boldest girls or the boldest parents would venture to give. The Bethune College ought to be fully equipped to teach science up to the B Sc pass course and there ought to be some separate accommodation for girls in the University College of Science and the University laboratories.

A women's college should immediately be established at Dacca. Dacca and Mymensingh between them turn out a pretty large number of girl matriculates but their education is often stopped after that. Boarding life for girls is not much liked in this country yet and unless colleges are placed within easy reach of the homes of the girls many will have to be denied higher training.

SEN GUPTA, Dr NARAI CHANDRA—*contd*—Serampore College, Serampore—SHARP, The Hon'ble Mr. H.

There ought to be a large number of girls' high schools in different parts of the presidency, and the courses of study ought to be specially adapted to girls.

A very large number of small industrial schools for girls ought to be established. The development of women's industries would go a great way towards the economic advancement of the country. For women here do not, as a rule, labour beyond doing domestic duties. Industries which would occupy their spare time would be a great help to them. Where such industries exist, as at Dacca, these people are better off than elsewhere.

- (iii) The principal difficulty consists in the social position of women and the system by which grown-up girls are more or less completely segregated from men. The result is that people are averse to sending grown-up girls to schools. This aversion is very slowly wearing down in the educated community, but still there is very considerable apathy.

Girls' schools and colleges in order to be agreeable to people, should, therefore, be completely under women teachers, and the conditions of instruction there should be such as to secure the seclusion of pupils.

There is a great deal of prejudice against the higher education of girls because they are supposed to be denationalised by it and to imbibe habits of life and conduct which go against orthodox ideas. I do not endorse the objection. But, such as it is, it ought to be taken into consideration in regulating the social life and physical training in schools.

Serampore College, Serampore.

- (i) We do not think that the grave criticisms it is possible to make of men's education apply to any appreciable extent to educational arrangements for women. We are emphatic in expressing the opinion that almost the only institutions in Bengal, whether primary, secondary or higher, deserving to a large degree the name 'model', are those conducted by women. We leave to others the formulation of constructive proposals having as their object the furtherance of higher education for women in Bengal. We, however, desire to express our conviction that the advancement of education for women is vitally bound up with the educational problem as it affects men, and is necessary for its solution.

SHARP, The Hon'ble Mr. H.

The difficulties which beset the education of women in India (whether higher or lower education) are social rather than educational. The reasons which retard women's education as a whole render the number of those who seek college education too small to justify the establishment of any large number of special colleges for their instruction, while (save in Bombay) social custom deters them from attending men's colleges.

- (i) The replies given to the other questions would not materially differ in the case of women.
- (ii) Separate college arrangements will, no doubt, continue to be required for women. These should be under women, and the staff should, as far as possible, be women. It is difficult to procure the staff, and the expense of such colleges is great. Though it will probably be long before women's colleges can play any large part in the common social life of a university there will be certain advantages in establishing such colleges as integral parts of local universities which are not strictly uni-collegiate. For, when the staff of women is unable to deal with the full course, the professors of the surrounding colleges would be able to afford assistance. Where women's colleges remain under the affiliating university some relaxation

SHARP The Hon ble Mr H—contd—SHASTRI Dr PRABHU DUTT—SINHA Kumar
MANINDRA CHANDRA—SINHA PANCHANAN

of the conditions of affiliation is necessary and by reason of the small numbers justifiable

I regard the matriculation course as unsuitable for girls. In some respects it is difficult for them in others it is defective. I am not in favour of a mainly domestic course for girls, schools though special institutions might usefully be opened in such subjects. But I should be in favour of giving a more womanly tendency to the course. Accomplishments such as music and painting should find their place, a certain amount of domestic economy and hygiene should be taught, books suitable for women should be preferred and the whole course should be brightened. In colleges this differentiation is probably of less importance since only those girls will generally proceed to college who are bent on higher studies—sometimes for the sake of employment. But here also I should like to see some encouragement given to the study of such subjects.

SHASTRI Dr PRABHU DUTT

- (ii) Among the peculiar difficulties which affect the higher education of women are the observance of the *purdah* system among Hindus and Muhammadans especially in Bengal, early marriage of girls and a lack of well qualified teachers of the same sex. Orthodox Hindu and Muslim communities will not be interested in the higher education of their girls unless the scheme of studies and the whole curriculum are radically changed and at the same time Hindu and Muslim ladies are also trained as teachers and appointed in colleges. A training college for widows and others may be opened and trained teachers may be forthcoming from that institution.

The course of studies for women should not be the same as for men. It should be determined by their special needs and functions. Those subjects whose knowledge is calculated to increase the happiness of their household life should be included in the curriculum. Music, drawing, painting, domestic economy, cookery, eugenics, etc. should find a place in their scheme of studies. English literature need not be compulsory, only a practical knowledge of the language may be insisted upon.

There are also people who will never think of sending their girls to schools or colleges. For the benefit of their girls a number of teachers might be employed who may be required to visit such homes and impart instruction in elementary subjects—beginning with reading, writing and arithmetic. In some of the *mohullas* and lanes *sanana* schools could be started where a number of *purdahnashin* girls could be taught by such teachers.

A large number of scholarships and stipends should be made available to girls during their university course.

SINHA, Kumar MANINDRA CHANDRA

- (ii) The higher education of women is sadly neglected in India and this largely accounts for the backward state of the country. The need of India is mothers. The question of finance again comes in, but nothing should I think stand in the way of giving Indian women an elementary course of instruction and to offer every facility for them to take the highest degrees.

SINHA, PANCHANAN

- (i) Hardly any of the observations made with reference to the other questions can apply in the case of our women. Additional and special facilities must be

SINHA, PANCHANAN *contd.*—SIRCAR, The Hon'ble Sir NILRATAN.

afforded if higher education is to be imparted to the general body of the women of this country. Education should be brought to their homes, if possible, or a *purdah* university should be established because, at least for a long time to come, early marriage and the *purdah* system will continue to present serious obstacles in the way of higher education of women in India

SIRCAR, The Hon'ble Sir NILRATAN

- (1) *Vide* my answer to question 6
 (ii) The professions that educated women may adopt in Bengal are —
 (a) Medicine
 (b) Teaching
 (c) Art and music

Unfortunately, the door of the Calcutta Medical College has been practically closed against women students. Several students were recently refused admission on the ground of their not having passed the I Sc examination, though many of them possessed the I A qualification. It is highly necessary that facilities should be provided in Calcutta for women students to qualify themselves in the I Sc courses for this purpose. I Sc classes in physics, chemistry, botany, and geology should at once be started in the Bethune College.

Another reason why women students are not admitted is the inclination on the part of the authorities to send them to the Lady Hardinge College at Delhi. It is rather hard upon the Bengali women students seeking medical education that they should thus be compelled to go to Delhi. As a matter of fact, two of them went there last year and came back after a short time on account of several difficulties which came in their way there.

The best thing for women students would be to have a separate well-equipped high-grade medical college affiliated to the University for their training. But, as this is largely a question of funds, the facilities that the women students have been enjoying during the last 33 years should not be withdrawn on any account whatsoever.

There is no college of music or of art for women students. This want should be removed.

Further, the number of girls' schools affiliated to the University should be increased by Government efforts. The number of such institutions is extremely small.

- iii) Amongst others, the following difficulties affecting the higher education of women may be mentioned —

- (a) Inadequate number of good higher class schools for girls
 (b) Difficulties in connection with residential arrangements. As a matter of fact no married woman is allowed to reside in hostels for girls.
 (c) Certain social causes, including the early marriage of our girls. In this matter the University is powerless, though circumstances are changing rapidly with the times.
 (d) Inadequate number of women students

I may mention the following needs also —

- (e) A fairly larger number of higher class English schools for girls, say, four in Calcutta and one in each district for the present.
 (f) Provision for teaching scientific subjects in the Bethune College in the I Sc and B Sc stages.
 (g) Provision for the education of married women and widows in special schools or through special organisations.
 (h) Developing the women's class in the Calcutta Medical College or as an alternative starting a women's medical school affiliated to the University.

SORABJI Miss L

SORABJI Miss L

- (ii) It seems to me that greater facilities are needed for the higher education of women in Eastern Bengal. There ought to be a women's college on the plan outlined by the Dacca University Commission in 1912. If present conditions make the carrying out of the scheme impracticable, college classes ought to be opened at one of the girls' high schools in Eastern Bengal with facilities for taking science and botany as well as the ordinary arts course now followed by most of the students at the two women's colleges in Calcutta.

The medical profession as a career for women seems to be unpopular in Bengal. Could not something be done to interest school girls and induce them to think of medicine as a possible career? Some time ago I suggested that lady doctors might visit girls' schools and give lectures on the need for women doctors in India. In places where there are good hospitals for women, school girls might be taken round and told of what is being done to relieve suffering and pain.

- (iii) The difficulties which affect the education of women in India are manifold —

- (a) The system of early marriage among orthodox Hindus and Muhammadans. Apart from the eugenical undesirability of such an arrangement, the lost opportunity to development of character in robbing the individual girl of her right of decision in this important matter is to be deprecated. We find that girls leave school to be married after completing the primary or middle stage. If they enter upon the high school course proper, they are likely to stay on unless inability to cope with the work or ill health prevents. But matters have improved even within the last decade. In 1908 the highest class reached by any orthodox Hindu girl in the Eden School was the sixth; the higher classes containing only Brahmins and Christians, but now the majority in the upper classes are orthodox Hindus.

- (b) Undesirable home influences are a great hindrance to progress. Unpunctuality, sloth, untidiness, carelessness regarding the laws of health and sanitation, untruthfulness, irresponsibility, absence of any code of honour, lack of home discipline are some of the difficulties we have to contend with in our schools.

Character building is what is most needed so that those who are in charge should be picked men and women, those who have had long and varied experience. Graduates fresh from college are sometimes placed at the head of girls' schools, and how is it possible for them to exercise the necessary control or to give the right tone to a school consisting of girls from homes such as exist in Bengal? Now let us consider the staffs of secondary schools. If it is composed entirely of Bengalis who have never been out of Bengal, whose education has been entirely in this province with a university system such as it is, what hope is there of improvement? There might be on the staff of each school a few teachers from other parts of India which would prevent the education being localised and narrowed down to the influences of one province. When I was put in charge of the Eden School and authorised to choose the additional staff, I saw how hopeless it would be to make any improvement were the new teachers a reduplication of the existing staff. I therefore advertised in the leading papers and chose from among the applicants suitable teachers representing Bombay, Madras and the United Provinces. My recommendations were approved and those additional teachers are still on the staff. They have a different outlook and fill up the measure of the local supply to some extent in adding alertness, power to control, thoroughness in detail and tone.

- (c) Another hindrance to progress is the teacher of long standing who has not moved with the times, who objects to innovations and influences the pupils to such an extent that all improvement seems impossible. Such teachers should be instantly removed and allotted other work. I would suggest literary vernacular work, e.g. the translation into Bengali of suitable school books.

SORABJI, Miss L.—*contd.*—SUHRAWARDY, HASSAN—SUHRAWARDY, Begum
KHAJISTA BANO

- (d) Then there is the Home Ruler or extremist whose subtle influence is felt at every turn, who, for instance laughs at the girls for speaking in English out of school hours or for saying "thank you" or "please", which she calls imitating foreign ways and being unpatriotic. More important still is the fact that she sets herself to work against any indication of the spirit of *esprit de corps* and obstructs the growth of the corporate life of the school.
- (e) Orthodox people are deterred from giving their girls higher education, because they connect the education of girls with the adoption of western habits by a community ignorant of the simple relationship which may exist between men and women in a world which has no traditions of the *purdah*. This, of course, is not under the control of the education authorities, but I think that all women teachers should either live with their parents and very near relations, or on the school premises in quarters provided by Government.

SUHRAWARDY, HASSAN.

(iii) Narrow-mindedness, *purdah* system, and early marriage

SUHRAWARDY, Begum KHAJISTA BANO.

Although Muslim female education itself is in its infancy a good deal of progress and a desire to impart education to females is noticeable amongst the Musalmans of Bengal.

Elementary or Primary Education—A number of Government aided primary schools have been established at different centres and places. Besides these there are several *maktabs* and Koran schools which do good work in imparting a knowledge of reading and writing amongst their pupils. These are also in receipt of Government grants. A third means of education is house to house visitation by *zanana* teachers. This system has the merit of extending educational facilities to grown up and married girls who are averse to attending schools and central gatherings. It, however, has the disadvantages of not imparting daily lessons to the pupils as the *zanana* teachers are few in number and can only visit houses by turns giving about three to four lessons to each pupil per week. The method of teaching of these teachers is very defective and their own knowledge very meagre. It is obvious that when the foundation is laid wrong, the superstructure will not be right either. I, therefore suggest that while more teachers should be engaged to ensure frequent visit to pupils, at the same time strenuous efforts should be made to train these teachers. As trained teachers are not available at present, it will be very useful if inspectresses of schools instead of merely finding fault with the work of these *zanana* teachers (which is their legitimate work) also spend some time in imparting a knowledge of teaching by giving practical demonstrations of teaching, say, once every fortnight.

Most of these teachers appear to be more ignorant than they really are and try the patience of the inspecting staff who are in the habit of seeing smart, trained teachers of other communities. The inspecting staff should consider that female education is in its nascent stage amongst the Musalmans and that every encouragement should be given by patient and tactful dealings both with the teachers and pupils. For instance, many of the teachers have just been persuaded to take to teaching as a profession and some of them come from very respectable families and had been in good positions before. They are very sensitive and take to heart the well meant criticisms and rebukes of members of the inspecting staff, sometimes young inexperienced girls fresh from college, and who do not belong to their own community. I, therefore, suggest that great consideration to the feelings of the teachers be shown and much forbearance and tact exercised in dealing with them by the inspecting staff, otherwise a very good cause will be smothered in its infancy. I also think that grant of a special conveyance allowance for peripatetic teachers will encourage better class of women to take to the teaching profession.

Another fact to remember that amongst Muslim girls shyness and what may appear as unnecessary modesty, is encouraged as a virtue and they and their parents resent

SUBHAWARDY Begum KHAJESTA BANO—*contd*

any attempt at interference with this. It is therefore suggested that the inspecting staff should remember these little peculiarities and study the special customs and prejudices of the Muslims and not be dissatisfied if the same smartness is not noticed in Muslim girls as is seen by them in Indian Schools of more advanced communities like the Brahmo Somraj people.

Secondary Education is even more difficult than primary. All institutions are much hampered for want of trained teachers. A Urdu speaking Muslim female trained teacher is a rare commodity. Several fruitless attempts have been made to import Muslim trained teachers from the United Provinces and the Punjab. Indeed it is now difficult even to get non-Muslim Indian Urdu speaking trained teachers having sufficient knowledge and capabilities of being useful in a secondary school. The teachers from Bankipore School appear fit only for primary education. Therefore unless a training school for Muslim teachers is established at Calcutta on the lines of the one for Hindus of which Mrs. Mitter is the principal, education of Muslim girls will remain seriously handicapped.

There is another serious difficulty in the propagation of education amongst the Muslim girls of Bengal which deserves special attention. It is want of adequate conveyance arrangements. The Muslims of Bengal are more orthodox in their views and are clinging to prejudices and customs with a tenacity which is surprising to members of other provinces and communities. For instance while young girls of the same age and from a similarly respectable family from the more enlightened province of the Punjab and the United Provinces will attend schools only with a *burqua* on such a proposal will not be looked at except with great disavour in this province. In Bengal people are just getting over the prejudice of sending their girls to schools for purposes of instruction. It is therefore essential that proper arrangement should be made for omnibuses and conveyances inadequacy of providing which will be a most serious obstacle to the spread of secondary education. It is therefore suggested that Government should make a thorough investigation and make special bus grants to all such schools where none has so far been made or where lack of funds is preventing entertaining conveyances and thus attendance is suffering materially. The Subhawardy Muslim Girls School for instance which has the list of schools given in Mr. Hornell's Fifth Quinquennial Review of Progress of Education in Bengal has not so far received a penny as bus grant although representations have been made from time to time regarding it. Too much stress cannot be put on the encouragement of this most important feature.

Collegiate Education—In collegiate education the *purdah* Muslim girls have no place. In the University of Calcutta there are no special arrangements nor are any special facilities or encouragement given to Muslim *purdah* ladies. It is well known that the Muslims of the better class will not drop the *purdah* and this fact has been mentioned several times in the quinquennial review of the progress of education in Bengal. It is therefore obvious that if we want Muslim female graduates we must give special facilities for *purdah* ladies in the University of Calcutta. My own is a case in point. I passed the Senior Cambridge Local Examination as it was possible to be examined for this under special *purdah* arrangements and without attending a college and putting in a fixed percentage of attendance. The same difficulty to further university education led me to appear at the degree of honour examination which I passed with special distinction. The University of Calcutta vainly failed to show any encouragement to me and permit me to appear at their M.A. examination. Although it is known that the degree of honour is such a searching and difficult examination that its standard is accepted as higher than that of an M.A. of the University inasmuch as the passing of this degree entitles one to be an Examiner in M.A. in that language as is the case with the principal of the Calcutta Madrassah Mr. Harley in Arabic and the Secretary of the Board of Examiners Mr. Jenkins in Persian in this University of Calcutta itself.

An important point to be noted in connection with primary and secondary education is the desirability of modifying the existing curriculum of studies enforced by the Education Department which at least for some time to come is not suited to the requirements of Muslim girls. Too much stress is laid on mathematics and history and geography at the expense of subjects more useful from their point of view.

SUHRWARDY, Z R ZAHID—VACHASPATI, SITI KANTHA—VICTORIA, Sister MARY—
VIDYABHUSAN, RAJENDRANATH, and VIDYABHUSANA, Mahamahopadhyaya Dr. SATIS
CHANDRA

SUHRWARDY, Z. R ZAHID.

- (11) Among the Muhammadans the want of facilities for education, higher and lower, under strict *purdah* is keenly felt. A model institution established by Government, with due regard to the customs and prejudices of the community, will go a great way to satisfy a natural demand among Muhammadan women for education. Fine arts and hygiene should form compulsory subjects for women.

VACHASPATI, SITI KANTHA.

- (11) Women should have a curriculum of studies to fit them for their special vocations and position in family and social life in India.

VICTORIA, Sister MARY.

- (11) There seems to be a proposition current in Calcutta that the University should provide all facilities for the higher education of women. That seems to us an absurd proposition. A very limited number of women needs, or profits from, university education. The women who should pass through the University are —

- (a) Those who intend to become teachers
- (b) Those who intend to enter the medical profession.
- (c) Those who wish to do special work, *e g*, literary or research work

The majority of women should pass through good secondary schools. The leaving age should be between sixteen to eighteen.

The secondary schools should be good. It should be possible for the girls to begin the special study of housewifery, music, or the fine arts in the secondary school. These studies should be continued in special schools.

We need in Calcutta more facility for special study. There should be :—

- (A) A technological college
- (B) A department of the School of Arts open to women only
- (C) More schools of music
- (D) A school of embroidery and needlework

It would be well if, in the secondary school, a special hostel could be opened for students attending special schools. Such hostels should be under very good supervision and should aim at educating a girl for the home and social life.

The real reason that all women students are being forced through a university career is that the University is the only course which gives a girl such a certificate as will enable her to earn her own living.

We need science and technical mistresses, art mistresses, music mistresses, but there are no opportunities for qualification, however well trained a girl may be she cannot command a position, or a salary, because of the lack of official qualification.

VIDYABHUSAN, RAJENDRANATH, and VIDYABHUSANA, Mahamahopadhyaya
Dr SATIS CHANDRA

- (11) Women should have separate curricula of studies to fit them for their special vocation and position in the family and social life of India.

WEBB The Hon'ble Mr C M—WESTERN Miss M P

WEBB The Hon'ble Mr C M

- (i) No any differences in the higher education of men and women should be based on vocation. Women who are entering the same professions and callings as men should follow the same courses. In so far as they are to follow different vocations they would be differently trained.
- (ii) In Burma special and additional facilities for the higher education of women are needed in the fields of teaching, medicine and nursing, also house craft and mother craft.
- (iii) Although women have a peculiarly high position in Burma and although every woman has a chance of receiving a fair elementary education, there is not a very strong demand for higher education by women. The greatest difficulties appear to be inertia, the absence of intellectual curiosity and the absence of any economic pressure forcing women into paid professions.

WESTERN, Miss M P

- (ii) A separate college for women students is needed in each province with hostels for Hindus, Musalmans and Indian Christians. The plan of merely adding I A and B A classes to existing school institutions does not give the change of environment so valuable in affording opportunities of development on college lines. These colleges might include a training department for teachers where there is no satisfactory existing arrangement. The alternative of allowing women students to attend men's classes is obviously unsuitable besides the drawback that no Musalmans can attend non *purdah* lectures. At present there is a great need for Indian women with a thorough knowledge of their subjects supplemented by a practical training which would enable them to act as demonstrators and heads of training classes.

The departments in which this need is especially felt are —

- (a) Persian, Arabic and Sanskrit (oriental degrees)
- (b) Applied hygiene and scientific domestic methods
- (c) Science as preparatory to a medical course
- (d) Modern junior school methods (Montessori and Froebel applications)

The need is not for those who can pass in a book knowledge of these subjects but for women capable of directing the coming generation of girls.

As regards the teaching of the ancient Indian languages (including the Gurmukhi of the Sikh Scriptures) it is almost impossible to find women teachers who get beyond the old teaching by rote with little or no explanation of grammar and no understanding of the discipline of style or appreciation of thought and language. These women teachers have themselves been taught by maulvis and pandits or by women; the reforms needed are in method and must start in the language teaching of schools and training colleges.

Hygiene and domestic training are words used to conjure with at every educational conference but here as elsewhere the carrying into practice of much admirable theory is prevented by the absence of trained teachers.

There are very few English women who have lived in Indian houses and who understand the varying conditions under which their pupils live with the possibilities and the difficulties of reform. This is therefore essentially a work which well educated Indian women must qualify themselves to perform, a work equal in importance to that of the medical profession in its influence on the rising generation.

One well paid Indian domestic economy teacher should be appointed to train others and to help personally in the girls' middle and high schools of every large town.

It is true of course that intimate knowledge of Indian conditions is only one desideratum. Equally important are the qualities and training which go to make a good teacher. There will therefore for some time be need of English domestic economy teachers to help in the training of Indian students and these English

WITNESSES, Miss M. P. — *contd.*

women should be attached to Indian hospitals and schools for a period of at least six months before taking up the work of training.

There are, I believe in Northern India no opportunities for women wanting to take their I A in science before proceeding to a medical college. There are not even simply equipped laboratories suitable for training well educated girls who might enter a fully organised nursing course and thereby raise the status of the nursing profession.

There is also need for teachers able to give simple science instruction in laboratories as a valuable part of a general education for those who stay in school for nine or ten years.

In the end the higher education required for women depends upon the substructure on which it is built. It may be said without any fear of contradiction that at present the foundation is a very bad one.

The chief need is for adequate training in modern methods, and for a more intelligent class of teachers.

These modern methods are not essentially western, but are universal, applications of the psychology of the child which up to the present have been more fully worked out in England and America.

This training would not imply a residence in England or America, which is financially impossible for the majority, but it would depend upon obtaining a highly qualified staff in every Indian training college.

The point cannot be over emphasised, and no financial considerations should be allowed to stand in the way of reform.

When the importance of modern junior school methods is recognised higher education will have something to build upon. At present the most important part of the school work is left to those least capable of directing it.

A more intelligent class of teacher will only come forward when definite courses can be organised on good lines and suitable positions can be assured to well-qualified women.

At present the question of the education of Indian women works round in a vicious circle, the work done in higher education is not being used to the best advantage because there are not sufficient facilities for training, and this means that many Indian girls who are capable of profiting by higher education are being taught on the old mind-destroying methods.

(iii) The following seem to me to be the chief difficulties affecting the higher education of women in India —

(a) *Early marriage* — Very little can be done with children who leave at eleven or twelve years of age, especially as the previous year is filled with preparations for marriage.

(b) *The purdah system* — A great deal which the ordinary girl learns by contact with the world is cut out, physical health suffers from want of fresh air and exercise, and the *purdah* system itself means that very few women are produced who are qualified to teach in the higher classes.

(c) The cooking and other domestic work demanded from girls is a severe tax upon their strength when it is added to all the boys' work in preparing for the matriculation examination. Domestic work is good for girls, and helps to pacify those members of the family, chiefly though not entirely female, who strongly object to education for girls. Parallel courses might be worked out, but this would entail girls settling on their future career early, as a college degree or a medical course would mean the ordinary boys' curriculum.

The great need is for highly qualified women, Indian and English, to work in the training departments of colleges and schools. The scheme would entail scholarships for training and the provision of good posts afterwards, but it would be abundantly worth putting all available educational funds into this department because only through getting the right women to train others can the educational system be revolutionised.

WORDSWORTH The Hon'ble Mr W C—Miss SORABJI Sister RHODA Miss JACKSON and Miss RAYMOND

WORDSWORTH The Hon'ble Mr W C

(u) At present women in Bengal have madequate opportunities for studying science Both the Diocesan College and the Bethune College teach botany and the former teaches geography neither teaches physics or chemistry The advisability of providing these facilities in the Bethune College is under consideration in view of the growing interest in medicine as a career for women

The only women's colleges in Bengal are the above mentioned both in Calcutta The Bethune should I consider be reorganised in two branches a Calcutta branch for day students and a mufassal branch in some quite healthy district with hostels carefully supervised for all non Calcutta students The mafassal branch could have attached to it a model school and a teachers' training class

ORAL EVIDENCE

ASSOCIATION OF UNIVERSITY WOMEN IN INDIA

Representatives

MISS SORABJI Sister RHODA Miss JACKSON and Miss RAYMOND

13th February 1918

Matriculation—Per Miss Jackson The syllabus needs revision English a classical language a vernacular and mathematics should be made compulsory There should be in addition two optional subjects The standard of English is so low that university instruction is almost impossible in the junior college classes Advanced Bengali or advanced Sanskrit should not be permitted as optional subjects The standards in such subjects as might be taken should be the same for women as for men The direct method in teaching English should be employed more extensively The system of private tutors is most regrettable in that the pupils rarely do things for themselves Girls have private tutors engaged for them but probably not to the same extent as boys as these classes are smaller

2 *Improvement of teaching in schools*—There should be more colleges for the training of women teachers but the object of such colleges should not be to compel the memorising by the students of text books on training The L T course after the I A should be retained It has its uses for those students who are not capable of taking the B A but might be excellent teachers in the lower forms of high schools The students should learn the subjects they are going to teach before they attempt a study of the principles of teaching There is need for the development of the Kurseong Training Institution for Anglo Indians The Association has not considered the proposal to attach training classes to high schools

3 *Intermediate science*—There should be much more and much better science teaching than at present and for many reasons In order to gain admission to the Medical College at Delhi more teaching in science at the intermediate stage is necessary If again the teaching of science is to be introduced in schools and taught there properly the teaching of science in women's colleges must first be encouraged

4 *Domestic science*—This subject might include psychology child culture mother craft or some other subject or subjects The course should be planned as far as possible to justify inclusion in a diploma course The chief immediate object however is the recognition of this class of subjects

The Association differed among themselves whether or not a course in domestic science should be included in the B A as a subject In the opinion of some members the recognition of such subjects by the University would improve the value attached to them and

Miss SORABJI, Sister RHODA, Miss JACKSON and Miss RAYMOND—*could*—VICTORIA, Sister MARY

thereby increase their popularity. The tendency in India is to despise and neglect studies which are not given the status of a university degree. The University therefore should employ its influence in favour of the development of these subjects in the way suggested. Domestic science should be taught in the special technical institute advocated by the Association. College students should attend the domestic science classes at the institute. In addition, members would advocate a diploma course and later a full degree course in domestic science and applied arts, the teaching being given entirely in the proposed technical institute. It is hoped that the inclusion of a domestic science subject in the degree course would prepare the way for such specialisation.

Other members of the Association held that domestic science should never be admitted to an academic course partly because practical and academic work cannot be continued and partly because the inadequacy of the ordinary arts college for treating domestic science would result in the students going to the proposed technical institute for such teaching. This divided control will be unfortunate. Under the former proposal the University would for the present both recognise and control directly the courses in domestic science, under the latter proposal the University might recognise, but would not control the course.

A third view was put forward by Sister Rhoda that the technical institute might itself exercise control and issue a diploma.

5 *Attendance at men's lectures*—At present, instruction for women will have to be given separately from that given for men. There would be no objection to *purdah* students going from one women's institution to another. Courses given by men are inadvisable.

6 *Medical education*—Miss Sorabji (the other representatives agreeing) advocated separate colleges for men and women for Bengal. This distinction is noted because in Bombay men and women attend the same college classes without disastrous results, and quite efficient women practitioners are trained in the Bombay colleges. Conditions are different in Bengal.

In response to a question about Delhi, it was stated that Bengali girls had recently protested strongly against the attempt to induce them to attend the Women's Medical College there. Bengali women particularly dislike leaving their province, and the present group of students in residence in Calcutta declared that they preferred attendance at a men's college in Calcutta to being sent to a women's college outside Bengal.

This attitude was stated as a fact, it was added that it might not be impossible to alter it and the Dufferin Hospital committees had been asked to do what they could in this direction.

In answer to a question whether it was dangerous for Bengali women to practise medicine, Miss Sorabji said that it was both dangerous and undesirable for ladies to go about alone as doctors, teachers, nurses, etc. It was necessary therefore to protect and chaperone them for many years to come.

Two things were necessary—

- (a) A better class of women should be trained,
- (b) More protection and support should be given to women leaving their homes for professional purposes.

Speaking of the attitude in India generally towards women who undertake professional work, the Association thought that the University might help in changing public opinion, and that it should take the chief part in the professional education of women.

VICTORIA, Sister MARY

13th February 1918

Organisation of women's university education—There are at present no women on the Senate or the Syndicate. It would be advisable therefore to constitute a small committee of men and women for the supervision and organisation of higher education for women. This committee should be linked up in some way with the University and be under the aegis of the University. Care should be taken to prevent fruitless discussion of impractical ideals by such a committee. The composition of such a committee therefore is important.

VICTORIA SISTER MARY—*contd*

2 *Demand for education*—The demand for opportunities of professional and liberal education has increased among girls somewhat rapidly in recent years. The increased number of girls in colleges is due in some respects to the lowering of the matriculation standard. There has also been a gradual change in social conditions so that girls are now able to remain longer at school and college than in the past. This progress does not mean necessarily that there has been a sudden break on the part of these girls from orthodox Hinduism. The girls still observe the orthodox ways of life diet etc. Plans therefore should be laid to meet an increase in the number of girls who wish to become teachers and who desire a liberal education. The medical profession is not popular with Indian girls. The difficulties confronting Indian lady doctors and teachers are very great. They cannot live alone. Some supervision and hostel accommodation are essential. These difficulties however are not insuperable. The desire for a liberal education is such that there are now a comparatively large number of girls desirous of attending lectures which have no bearing on the university degrees and examinations.

The number of girls in the collegiate school whose parents desire a liberal education and who do not desire examination is increasing rapidly.

The examination ideal is dying out amongst the most cultured Bengalis.

3 *Secondary schools*—The condition of the high schools for girls is very unsatisfactory. Many of the high schools are of so low a standard that it would be better if they became upper primary schools. The course of a secondary school is also unsuitable for girls. This is due to the domination of the Matriculation which has a harmful effect on girls' school education and especially on the ordinary mission high schools for girls whose pupils are often of a very poor calibre. The witness referred to the improvements in the Matriculation suggested by her in her written memorandum. The standards should be higher than at present and should be kept the same as those for boys. There should be a wide selection of text books in English. Any two of the optional subjects from the list could be taken. Science and history should be optional subjects but the witness would make these subjects compulsory in her own school. It was impossible to make these subjects compulsory in all schools as many schools were as yet insufficiently equipped and staffed to teach the subjects.

4 *Training of teachers*—There should be a Government elementary and a secondary training college for girls. Matriculates intermediates and graduates would be admitted to the latter but matriculates would only be admitted if their knowledge of English were adequate. Stipends are essential Rs 15 for elementary and Rs 30 for secondary teachers. The students would sign an agreement to teach for four years after the completion of training. The colleges need not be residential and certainly not at the start.

In the elementary college students should* not be drawn from the primary schools.

5 *Art music etc*—The witness was anxious to see developments in the teaching of art and of Indian music. Teaching in the former might be given at the School of Art and for the latter visiting masters from the School of Music might be employed. There is a strong desire for the teaching of Indian music. There should also be language certificates for the encouragement in particular of better teaching in Bengali.

6 *Primary schools upper grade schools and secondary schools* should be complete in themselves. There should also be *sanana* schools which would be classified as secondary schools. The course should be such as to fit the girls more for *sanana* life and would not lead to the University. There would be no regulations. Students would be conveyed each day to the schools. There would only be lady teachers.

* They should not be drawn from primary but from upper grade schools. The girls of the Government Elementary College should be resident.

CALCUTTA
SUPERINTENDENT GOVERNMENT PRINTING, INDIA
8, HASTINGS STREET

